

Project Evaluation Series

Final evaluation of Pursuing Pastoralist Resilience through Improved Animal Health Service Delivery in Pastoralist Areas of Ethiopia

Project code: GCP/ETH/083/EC

Annex 5. Guide question lists for semi-structured interviews

Questions for FAO Project staff

1. Relevance and changes in priority – is the Government of Ethiopia still keen to control PPR/SGP/TADs (still a priority?)
2. Do you have reflections on the project approach (including project structures and systems)?
3. Challenges in management and implementation
4. Were the decision-making structures & mechanisms clear & efficient; did partners know their mandates & duties?
5. Was there a FAO project task force, and were the members able to support the project on technical issues? (e.g. backstopping from SFE, RAF, FAO HQ?)
6. Thoughts and data on performance of the project?
7. In case of not achieving the results, what are the causes, what can be learnt from the experiences?
8. Was an Exit Strategy prepared and rolled out?
9. Stakeholder collaboration:
10. Relationships with the donors? Federal Ministry of Agriculture? Regional Bureaus? Implementing partners (NGOs)? NVI? Regional labs?
11. Government extension staff - are there any difficulties? e.g. did they get out to the field enough? Capacity?
12. Private sector engagement? – Public-private partnerships – private vets? Their engagement in the project activities?
13. Other partners/actors on PPR/TADs in Ethiopia – relationship with OIE? Other donors?
14. How did you ensure gender inclusion - both within the staff recruitment and behavior, and when working with farmers and in training?
15. How did the project target vulnerable groups? Minorities?
16. How were beneficiaries selected?
17. Was the training and extension approach chosen by the project technically and financially effective/efficient and sustainable?
18. What were the capacity building needs (individual, institutional/organizational, technical, enabling environment) of the project staff and the different camp/district/etc. leaders?
 - i. How are they taken into account in the project, and coordinated with other agricultural projects?
 - ii. Was there a capacity needs assessment conducted at the start of the project?

19. Project Financial arrangements
 - i. Was the budget adequate to achieve the planned results?
 - ii. Was the cash flow adequate? Any delays in payments? Were there any serious delays in provision of funds that have affected the implementation?
20. Changes/modifications in project activities from the original plan in the project document, reasons & consequences
21. What is the long term plan for PPR/TAD control in Ethiopia?
22. To what extent is the private sector involved and continuing beyond the project?

Interview questions - Government

Relevance

1. How relevant was the project design to the needs? Aligned with government priorities, policies, strategies?
2. For BCO: What is the structure of your office? How was it established? Relationship between the BCO and the Regional Bureau? How does the institutional environment support or hinder your activities (e.g. regional and federal links?)
3. What are the main needs for your ministry, in terms of training and capacity development? In terms of equipment and institutional set-up for TAD/PPR detection and control?
4. Project approach (are they satisfied with the project implementation approach?)
 - i. Tell us about how the logistics of the project worked, how were the activities financed?
 - ii. How were CAHWS involved? What was the added value of working with CAHWS? What was their role?
5. Experiences of the capacity building and the materials provided –
 - i. who provided training?
6. Did the project provide any training on gender?
7. Any differences in the needs of women and men? Has anything been done differently?
8. Did the project target women producers separately?
9. Assumptions taken, Risks foreseen and changes/ realization, current situation
10. Changes/modifications in project activities? Were any changes effectively communicated to you?

11. How were target communities/livestock owners identified? Did the project target the most relevant groups, in your view? Was particular attention paid to targeting vulnerable groups? Or groups most at risk? (e.g. people living near national borders?)

Effectiveness and impact

12. Achievements (what in their view has worked well in the project)
13. Challenges (what could be done differently)
14. Failures and not so successful practices, underlying causes and consequences
15. Are there resources available for Ministry staff to travel to the field?
16. How were beneficiaries selected? By FAO or by Ministry of agriculture?
17. Were there any unintended outcomes of the project?
18. Vaccination programme: How did government monitor the vaccination programme? Did the project provide sufficient support and training? Did extension staff have sufficient resources to monitor the vaccination programmes?
- i. What was the process of administering the vaccine? Who administered the vaccine? How was the campaign planned?
 - ii. How were CAHWs involved? Who supervised? –
 - iii. How did government/BCO monitor the vaccination programme? Did the project provide sufficient support and training? Did extension staff have sufficient resources to monitor the vaccination programmes?
 - iv. What happened to the used vials? Was there a system in place to prevent misuse/selling?
 - v. How are CAHWS paid for their services? And who pays them?
 - vi. How were the vehicles used? What will happen to the vehicles following the closure of the project?
19. How effective was the training methodology used by the project? Farmer field school? Participatory disease surveillance ToT?
20. What was your experience with DOVAR and ADNIS?

Efficiency and project management

21. How is the work coordinated at the province/district/village level? How was serum-sample collection conducted, and why?

22. What do they understand their role to be in the project? (For BCO: what is your relationship with NADIC?)
23. Have there been any gaps or delays in implementation? If so, why and what was done to overcome the problem?
24. Have you been involved in the monitoring exercises of the project (surveys etc.) – did you ever receive monitoring reports or progress reports about the project?
 - i. Was there a baseline conducted?
25. Have you received feedback from NADIC, or other partners?
26. Have you provided feedback to woreda staff and experts working on the project activities?
27. What is your relationship with implementing partners (e.g. NGOs)?

Sustainability

28. Sustainability of the project activities? Does your office/unit have the resources and capacity to continue with similar activities after the project ends? (Government allocations per annum?)
29. For 2019/2020, will the government continue with the vaccination programme? Plans to up-scale to other areas? Or repeat vaccination in the same districts?
30. Does Ministry have plans to continue broadcasting radio messages, using SMS services, etc., after the closure of the project? Was this an effective media for raising awareness?
31. How will BCO continue after the closure of the project?

(More targeted technical questions needed for laboratory staff)

Interview Questions - EU donors

1. Impressions of the project (positive or otherwise...) As a donor, what are the positive achievements of the project? Delays, etc. ,and how have these been dealt with?
2. Challenges?
3. Partnering engagement strategy – NGOs, government, implementing partners – How were partners selected for the project?
4. How is this PPR harmonise with other EU programmes? How does the project fit into the overall resilience agenda of the EU?
5. Sustainability of PPR project? Will the EU continue funding on PPR?

6. TADs as a priority for EU? Future programming under the EDF? How will they ensure future programmes build on the results of the PPR project?
7. Transboundary collaboration - how effective was this collaboration? Is there any sustainability to this coordination, outside of the project support?
8. FAO's positioning in this regard? Comparative advantage? Technically?
9. Linkage between federal and regional government – technical and administrative – related to Livestock health – How did PPR engage or support or facilitate this linkage?

GCP /ETH/083/EC

Interview questions NGO implementing partners

1. What was your role in the project?
2. What is the main priority for your organisation? How does the PPR project fit into your other resilience activities?
3. Were you involved in the vaccination campaign?
 - a. How did you select/target beneficiaries for the vaccination programme?
 - b. Did you face challenges ensuring a cold chain was maintained to keep the vaccine?
 - c. Did you encounter resistance amongst community members?
4. Did you receive training from the FAO PPR project?
 - a. Where? When? In what?
 - b. Was the training adequate?
 - c. What was the main lesson?
 - d. Did you share the learnings with your colleagues?
5. Have you collected data on the vaccination programme? Was this data shared with FAO? Did you conduct any analysis of the data?
6. Did you or your staff receive guidance from the Ministry or the Bureau of Agriculture? Did the Bureau of Agriculture monitor your activities during the vaccination programme?
7. How is the work coordinated at the province/district/village level? – How was serum-sample collection conducted, and why?
8. How does your organisation engage with communities? And is there any formal feedback mechanisms to communities?

9. Have you or your organisation been involved in previous vaccination campaigns? How does this campaign compare?
10. How effective was project Coordination? Communication? Partnering with FAO?
11. How was the partnering arrangement with FAO? The LoA? Was this an effective means of partnering?
12. Any delays? Efficiency? Delays receiving vaccines/? Delays receiving payment?
13. Have you been involved in the monitoring exercises of the project (surveys etc.) – did you ever receive monitoring reports or progress reports about the project?
 - i. Was there a baseline conducted?
14. Capacity of Regional Bureau to monitor the programme? Sustainability of the intervention – does government have capacity to continue a similar campaign without FAO support?
15. How did your organisation ensure the involvement of women? How was gender considered in the intervention?
16. How will your organisation sustain some of the project activities following the closure of the project?

GCP /ETH/083/EC (PPR)

Questions for Livestock owners

1. What is your main livelihood activity? (Encourage discussion on pastoralism in general)
2. Speak about opportunities and threats to their livelihood. What are the main threats to your livelihood? Main challenges?
3. Opportunities for pastoralists in education and outside pastoralism – alternative livelihoods?
4. How many animals do you have? Which species and why they are kept? – (e.g. ranking of different species, uses and functions – PRA matrix rating)
5. What diseases most affect your animals? On livestock health (general health, calendars, diseases/syndromes, rankings, outbreaks, control options).
6. Who, what, where re advice, treatment options? (local experts?)
7. What do you know about SPG? About PPR? (specifically when it comes up) description, identification, when last seen, knowledge/experience of vaccination
8. When did you first hear about PPR? Other diseases?
9. Have you received training on PPR identification and symptoms?

- i. Who delivered the training?
 - ii. Was the training useful/interesting?
 - iii. How was the training delivered? Farmer field school? Big group?
 - iv. What did you learn?
 - v. Who attended the training? (women? Men? Youth?)
 - vi. From your household, who attended the training?
 - vii. Did you share the lessons with your family? Spouse?
10. Have your animals been vaccinated?
- i. When did the vaccinations take place?
 - ii. Where? And who administered the vaccines?
 - iii. Did they vaccinate the entire herd?
11. Have you noticed a difference since the animals were vaccinated?
12. Have you told others about the vaccination programme?
- i. Are other livestock owners interested in having their animals vaccinated too?
13. Where do you sell your animals?
- i. Have you seen awareness campaigns at live animal markets (for PPR)?
14. Have you heard radio programmes about PPR?
- i. If so, did you find the radio shows informative? Was the information useful? Easy to understand? Correct language? Could you get signal?
 - ii. What time of day did you listen to the radio shows/messages? Was the timing of the radio shows appropriate?
 - iii. What radio stations do you listen to? Can you receive?
15. Do you own a television? Do you watch television regularly? (Would you be interested in watching TV programmes to learn about PPR and other TADs?)
16. Have you received training on PPR identification and symptoms?
- i. Who delivered the training?
 - ii. Was the training useful/interesting?
 - iii. How was the training delivered? Farmer field school? Big group?

- iv. What did you learn?
 - v. Who attended the training? (women? Men? Youth?)
 - vi. From your household, who attended the training?
 - vii. Did you share the lessons with your family? Spouse?
 - viii. Where was the training conducted? Was the location and timing of the training suitable?
 - ix. Have you applied the knowledge you received during the training? Example? Have you changed any practices since you received the training?
17. Have you seen or have you received information leaflets, flyers about PPR, other diseases?
- i. Were they useful?
 - ii. Was the information clear? Understandable?
18. Are you aware of why you were selected to participate in this project?
19. What incentives did you have to participate in the training? (What motivated you to participate?)
20. Where do you normally seek assistance/information on animal health?
- i. Do you have regular contact with the Government extension staff?
 - ii. Do you have regular contact with vets?
 - iii. CAHWs?
21. Have you been involved in other projects or programmes by other NGOs or donors?
22. How did you benefit from the project? What have been the main changes (good or bad) you have observed over the past few years?
- i. Income?
 - ii. Drought?
 - iii. El Nino?
 - iv. Conflict?
23. Have you shared the knowledge you learned through the training with other livestock owners, community or family members?
24. What are the specific roles of women, men and children in your household?
25. Within your household, who is mostly responsible for:

- i. Milking?
- ii. Minding baby animals?
- iii. Selling animals at market?

26. Where do you migrate with your animals? Do you cross borders?

Women

1. Who is mostly responsible for caring for animals in your household?
2. What are the main challenges you face?