Project Evaluation Series

Evaluation of the project "Improved Land Tenancy in Sindh Province"

Project code: GCP/PAK/137/EC

Annex 3. ILTS activity status and explanations, February 2022

Activity no.	Activity description	Unit of measure	Target	Achievement	Links to other outcomes/ activities
	gal, institutional and administrative framework for responsible land and water governance	, including enviro	nmental asp	ects, is implement	ted by considering local
requirements		T	1	T	
Activity 1.1	Ensuring the progressive realization of the rights of vulnerable and marginalized people such as peasant farmers and <i>haris</i> to adequate nutritious food, poverty reduction, sustainable livelihoods, rural development, environmental protection and sustainable social and economic development.				
sub activity 1.1.1	5.2.3. Review regulatory framework of Sindh Tenancy Act	study	1	1	Outcome 2: Activities 2.3.3, 2.8.1 Outcome 3, Activities 3.1.2, 3.6.1
sub activity 1.1.2	5.2.4. Review current landlord/hari sharecropping arrangements	study	1	1	Outcome 2: Activities 2.3.3, 2.8.1 Outcome 3, Activities 3.1.2, 3.6.1
sub activity 1.1.3	5.4.1. Review and endorsement of studies' findings and recommendations	workshop	8	8	Outcome 2: Activities 2.3.3, 2.8.1 Outcome 3: Activities 3.1.2, 3.6.1
Activity 1.2	Strategy to support enhanced Land Tenancy governance	paper	1	1	Outcome 2: Activities 2.3.3, 2.8.1 Outcome 3: Activities 3.1.2, 3.6.1
	hanced capacity of stakeholders in land management from Sindh Province and targeted o	istricts in order to	promote V	GGT and improve	landholding tenure security
	men peasant farmers and <i>haris</i>		_		
Activity 2.1	Develop and implement VGGT strategy to suggest amendments (where appropriate) and support enforcement of STA "to regulate relationships between landowners and sharecroppers, their sharecropping arrangements and establish the rights and obligations of each party" while ensuring the progressive realization of the rights of vulnerable and marginalized people such as peasant farmers and <i>haris</i> to adequate nutritious food, poverty reduction, sustainable livelihoods, rural development, environmental protection.				
Activity 2.1.1	5.2.1. District rapid rural appraisals (RRAs)	District	8	8	Support to Outcome 3
Activity 2.2	Prepare socio-economic and bio-physical profiles of 80 selected villages in order to describe and map natural resources, land use, farming systems, farm size distribution, land tenure arrangements, demographic patterns, food and nutrition security, income sources and poverty levels, productive and physical infrastructure, local administrative				

Activity no.	Activity description	Unit of measure	Target	Achievement	Links to other outcomes/ activities
	structures and ethnicity, vulnerability to natural hazards and coping mechanisms, livelihood opportunities.				
Activity 2.2.1	5.2.2. Village baseline surveys/village profiles	Village	80	80	Support to Outcome 3
Activity 2.3	Train more than 700 officials, practitioners, academics and researchers of concerned provincial government ministries, boards and district line departments (e.g. revenue, agriculture, livestock, irrigation, forestry and women's development), research centres and academic institutions (e.g. Sindh Arid Zone Research Institute (Umerkot) and Sindh Agriculture University, Tando Jam) and NGOs (e.g. NRSP, SRSO, TRDP and SEARCH) in the principles and applications of VGGT and their application in strengthening the relationships between landlords and peasant farmers/haris through implementation of the abovementioned "VGGT strategy".				
Activity 2.3.1	6.7. Exposure visits to project sites for policy and law makers	visit ¹	27	10	Outcome 1
Activity 2.3.2	6.5. Train officials, academics, researchers in VGGT principles	workshop	1	1	Outcome 1
Activity 2.3.3	6.6. Train land management practitioners in VGGT applications	workshop ²	10	7	Outcome 1
Activity 2.4	Train relevant government and NGO sector service providers (e.g. district, taluka and union council-level men and women revenue and agriculture extension workers and NGO social mobilizers) in participatory mapping processes – using FAO's "solutions for open land administration (SOLA)" software, GPS position fixing and map editing tool. ³			Dropped	
Activity 2.4.1	6.8. Train extensionists/mobilizers in participatory village mapping	workshop ⁴	2	Dropped	
Activity 2.5	Building on the data/information generated from the baseline studies and village profiles of Activities 2.1 and 2.2, ground-truth/validate digitized cadastral maps of 80 target villages (prepared by the Government of Sindh's Revenue Department with technical support from ADB (Section 3.2)) through participatory mapping of landholdings (including field boundaries, water availability, water quality, soil salinity and GIS mapping systems in order to identify the operator for each parcel of land/plot survey number (with special reference to gender perspectives) – highlighting any disputed/contentious tenancy agreements for follow-up action.				
Activity 2.5.1	3.4.3. FAO/SOLA software	software	1_	Dropped	

¹ The target was revised from 27 to 10 at the time of the No-Cost-Extension (NCE), which has been achieved.

² Preparatory measures have been completed for the remaining three workshops (i.e. nomination of a trainer by Secretary Board of Revenue and nomination of participants by the Deputy Commissioners of 8 Districts), but actual workshops couldn't materialize due to delays on responses from Deputy Commissioners to fix the dates due to COVID-19 restrictions.

³ FAO tried to take on board the technical expert and the SOLA software which was a prerequisite for FAO. However, efforts remained unsuccessful and this activity could not be arranged as planned. As a result, it was dropped at the time of the no-cost extension.

⁴ The explanation provided in an earlier footnote about the non-availability of the relevant expert and software "solutions for open land administration" also applies to this activity.

Activity no.	Activity description	Unit of measure	Target	Achievement	Links to other outcomes/ activities
Activity 2.5.2	3.4.2. Tablets for participatory village mapping	village⁵	80	Dropped	
Activity 2.5.3	3.4.1. Procure digitized cadastral maps	village ⁶	80	Dropped	
Activity 2.6	Raise awareness of landlords and peasant farmers/haris to the benefits of: (i) respecting landholding boundaries, and (ii) the sustainable management of natural resources – both undertaken as part of the participatory mapping process.				
Activity 2.6.1	5.4.2. Awareness raising on landholding boundaries	meeting ⁷	160	Dropped	
Activity 2.7	Establish (with consensus), guide and further strengthen 80 village-level grievance redressal committees to resolve any conflicts and disputes between landlords and peasant farmers/haris.				
Activity 2.7.1	6.9. Form, guide and strengthen village grievance redressal committees	committees	80	80	Outcome 1
Activity 2.8	Facilitate "bi-party land hearings" and preparation, signing and registration of 4 800 informal tenancy agreements between landlords and peasant farmers/haris through dialogue and mediation, with special reference to gender perspectives (in conjunction with the implementation of FFSs (Activity 3.6) – and organization of public hearings of village committees, peasant organizations, community leaders and their members to resolve any disputes.				
Activity 2.8.1	6.2. Preparation, signing and registration of tenancy agreements	agreement ⁸	4 800	4 396	Complemented by Activity 2.15.1 and Outcome 1
Activity 2.9	Document legal and institutional reviews, "VGGT strategy paper", participatory maps and success stories/lessons learned within the eight target districts – for replication and up-scaling in other districts of Sindh Province and Pakistan as a whole; prepare and disseminate policy briefs, pamphlets, brochures, posters, atlases, videos and other information, education and communication materials; and organize briefings of national, provincial and district-level decision makers and media events.				
Activity 2.9.1	5.1. Publications	lumpsum ⁹	11	9	Outcome 1
Activity 2.10	Further to the baseline studies of Activity 2.1, identify 504 groups of men and women per and improved CSA technologies and practices through FFSs/LFFSs/WOSs.		illing to test a	and demonstrate \	/GGT applications and new
Activity 2.10.1	5.4.3. Identify community organizations to participate in FFSs	community	80	80	Outcome 3: Activity 3.1.2, 3.6.1

⁻

⁵ The explanation provided in an earlier footnote about the non-availability of the relevant expert and software "solutions for open land administration" also applies to this activity.

⁶ The explanation provided in an earlier footnote about the non-availability of the relevant expert and software "solutions for open land administration" also applies to this activity.

⁷ The explanation provided in an earlier footnote about the non-availability of the relevant expert and software "solutions for open land administration" also applies to this activity.

⁸ 4 396 agreements were signed including 115 renewed/ re-signed after expiry time period. Still, 404 agreements are remaining from the target which are in process.

⁹ Training material and publications were developed related to: success stories, crop production technology, and vegetable charts; booklets on VGGT strategy were printed.

Activity no.	Activity description	Unit of measure	Target	Achievement	Links to other outcomes/ activities	
Activity 2.10.2	5.4.4. Identify groups of farmers to participate in FFSs	farmer groups ¹⁰	504	496	Outcome 3: Activity 3.1.2, 3.6.1	
Activity 2.11	In collaboration with District Agriculture and Livestock Offices and selected COs, domen and women <i>haris</i> , peasant farmers and progressive landlords to test, demonst and practices.					
Activity 2.11.1	5.4.5. Design of annual district FFS programmes	workshop ¹¹	32	24	Activity 2.12.1	
Activity 2.12	Develop appropriate curricula for training master trainers and FFS/LFFS/WOS Facilitators; and prepare agricultural extension and training materials.					
Activity 2.12.1	5.4.8. Training materials for master trainers and FFS facilitators	workshop	1	1	Activity 2.11.1, 2.15.1 - FFS implementation	
ŕ	Identify relevant provincial and district-level government and NGO agricultural sup matter specialists/master trainers in applied research and participatory extension a development activities with the establishment of CSA demonstration plots at the S matter specialists/master trainers and FFS/LFFS/WOS Facilitators but awareness rai	pproaches for the pro indh Agriculture Unive	motion of VG ersity (Tando .	GT, CSA and PHM	1; further supporting capacity	
Activity 2.13.1	6.10. Train CSA subject matter specialists/master trainers	course ¹²	3	0	Outcome 2	
Activity 2.14	Identify and train 120 local FFS/LFFS/WOS Facilitators (selected from local government extension workers, NGO social mobilizers/technicians, new graduates of agricultural universities and lead/champion farmers of "graduated" FFSs) in community and farm-level VGGT, appropriate CSA technologies and practices and FFS/WOS methodologies for adaptive research and participatory learning.					
	5.4.7. Identify local FFS Facilitators		120	120		
Activity 2.14.1	5.4.7. Identify local FFS Facilitators	meeting	120	120	Activities 2.11.1, 2.15.1, 2.12.1	
Activity 2.14.1 Activity 2.14.2	6.11. Train FFS Facilitators across one production cycle	course ¹³	17	6		
	·	course ¹³	17 nd progressiv	6 e landlords) to tes	2.12.1 Activities 2.11.1, 2.15.1, 2.12.1 st, demonstrate and replicate	

¹⁰ 496 groups were identified and targeted, and additional 66 groups are identified (i.e. the Producer Marketing Groups). There is plan to implement one round of FFS on Farm Business School concept during the anticipated second no-cost-extension.

 $^{^{\}rm 11}$ The required number of workshops were organized. No further workshops were required.

¹² This activity was connected with the finalization/endorsement of the CSA profile that FAO developed for the Sindh Province with the technical support of CIAT. The activity could not be implemented due to delays in the endorsement of the CSA profile by the Government of Sindh.

¹³ The actual required training of trainers was organized, and there was no further need as the team was already aware of the FFS methodology.

¹⁴ 496 FFS have been implemented (the last batch of 80 Livestock Farmer Field Schools will end on 27 February 2022).

Activity no.	Activity description	Unit of measure	Target	Achievement	Links to other outcomes/ activities	
Activity 2.15.2	3.4.5. Agric. inputs, small cash transfers for adaptive research	FFS ¹⁵			Complemented by Activity 2.15.1	
Activity 2.15.2.1	COVID-19 response: agriculture inputs subsidy package for Kharif 2021 to 2000 HHs.	crop subsidy	2 000	2 000	Complemented by Activity 2.15.1	
Activity 2.15.2.2	COVID-19 response: agriculture inputs subsidy for Rabi season 2020	crop subsidy ¹⁶	4 000	2 709	Complemented by Activity 2.15.1	
Activity 2.15.2.3	COVID-19 response: vegetable seeds subsidy package to 2 000 women members of women open schools	crop subsidy package ¹⁷	2 000	0		
Activity 2.15.2.4	COVID-19 response: agriculture inputs subsidy for fodder cultivation to 2 000 farmers	fodder subsidy ¹⁸	2 000	0		
Activity 2.15.2.5	COVID-19 response: animal health support (i.e. PPR [Peste des petits ruminants]) vaccination and de-worming of small ruminants in 80 project targeted villages)	animals ¹⁹	200 000	24 969	Complemented by Activity 2.15.1	
Activity 2.16	Participatory monitoring of FFSs/WOSs by specialist agricultural support service provided provincial-level farmers' congresses to review lessons learned.	ers; and organization	on of annual	district-level grad	duation ceremonies and	
Activity 2.16.1	6.13. Self-monitoring of FFS implementation	year	5	4		
Activity 2.16.2	6.14. District FFS graduation ceremonies	event ²⁰	24	0	Activity 2.15.1	
Activity 2.16.3	5.4.9. Annual provincial farmers' congresses	event ²¹	3	Dropped	Activity 2.15.1	
Activity 2.17	Identify 1 200 more entrepreneurial hari and peasant farm families (particularly "women home-based workers [HBWs]") and progressive landlords from completed/graduated FFSs, LFFSs and WOSs (Activity 3.6) and assess their needs to improve PHM practices and willingness to develop their home and group-based agri-business skills and participate/form and invest in PMGs.					
Activity 2.17.1	6.15. Needs assessment for PHM and small agri-business development	RRA ²²	24	0	Activities 2.18.1, 2.19.1, 2.19.3, 2.20.1, 2.20.2	

¹⁵ As a whole, 4 709 beneficiaries received the COVID-19 package (out of which 2 000 have received the full package and the remaining 2 709 received only fertilizer). FAO is requesting for another no-cost extension to cover all the remaining targets of the COVID-19 package distribution to the remaining beneficiaries.

¹⁶ 496 FFS have been implemented (the last batch of 80 Livestock Farmer Field Schools will end on 27 February 2022).

¹⁷ 496 FFS have been implemented (the last batch of 80 Livestock Farmer Field Schools will end on 27 February 2022).

¹⁸ 496 FFS have been implemented (the last batch of 80 Livestock Farmer Field Schools will end on 27 February 2022).

¹⁹ 496 FFS have been implemented (the last batch of 80 Livestock Farmer Field Schools will end on 27 February 2022).

²⁰ The larger events had to be avoided due to COVID-related restrictions.

²¹ The larger events had to be avoided due to COVID-related restrictions.

²² Instead of outsourcing this activity and signing an agreement with the Sindh Agriculture University, FAO decided to utilize its own human resources (technical experts) and conduct this activity. All 80 villages were covered under this activity.

Activity no.	Activity description	Unit of measure	Target	Achievement	Links to other outcomes/ activities		
Activity 2.17.2	3.4.6. PHM (Post Harvest Management) equipment, materials, storage.	PMG ²³	80	0	Complemented by Activity 2.15.1		
Activity 2.18	Prepare joint feasibility studies/value chain analyses and undertake participatory d PMGs (i.e. collective processing and/or marketing of quality fresh fruits and vegetaflour, fruit and vegetable pickles, dairy products).						
Activity 2.18.1	5.2.5. Undertake value chain analyses and feasibility studies of PMGs	study	80	80	Complemented by Activities 2.17.1, 2.18.1, 2.19.1, 2.19.3, 2.20.1, 2.20.2		
Activity 2.18.2	5.2.6. Prepare business plans for PMGs	study ²⁴	80	0			
Activity 2.18.3	6.3. Develop public-private-community partnerships/value chains	event ²⁵	250	0			
Activity 2.19	Establish and support 80 informal PMGs (ensuring equitable membership of women members in group administration and small business management; provision of s (through agreed cost-sharing and/or revolving fund mechanisms); training of groum aintenance of equipment and/or facilities; and development/strengthening of pull and establish informative market information systems with private sector traders, reaforementioned business plans.	small processing, storac up representatives and, ublic-private-communi	ge and marke or men and ty ty partnership	ting equipment, r women village tec os to broker suppl	naterials and/or facilities hnicians in the operation and y and marketing contracts		
Activity 2.19.1	5.4.6. Identify agricultural support service providers	meeting ²⁶	9	0			
Activity 2.19.2	5.4.10. Establish and strengthen PMGs	PMGs ²⁷	80	66			
Activity 2.19.3	6.16. Train village technicians in agroprocessing	event ²⁸	80	0			
Activity 2.20	Organize PMG members (particularly women HBWs) into savings and micro-credit groups; train them in business management and micro-finance systems; identify existing micro-finance schemes capable of supporting PMGs; and facilitate micro-finance products such as savings, credit and insurance through linkages to the appropriate partner micro-finance providers.						
	appropriate partiter intere intance providers.						
Activity 2.20.1	5.4.11. Support PMG savings/loans initiatives	PMGs ²⁹	80	0			

⁻

²³ The PMGs were supposed to be formed after completion of the FFS programme. The formation process was completed during the NCE period and inputs/equipment were identified but the procurement process was not completed during the NCE period.

²⁴ The initial orientation training of the PMGs was completed but it was then decided to organize business plans development activity separately.

²⁵ The feasibility study, formation of PMGs and finalization of procurement packages for them took more than expected time, and this activity was delayed as a result. Potential market actors for partnership with 33 PMGs have been identified and connected with the PMGs, but formal agreements are in process

²⁶ This activity could not be undertaken during the project period due to the time required for the formation and orientation of the PMGs.

 $^{^{\}rm 27}$ Potential 66 PMGs were identified and formed during the NCE period.

²⁸ This activity could not be undertaken during the project period due to the time required for the formation and orientation of the PMGs. FAO has hired required human resource and training packages are under development. ILTS is anticipating another NCE to complete this target.

²⁹ This activity is supposed to start once formation and operationalization of PMGs takes place.

 $^{^{\}rm 30}$ Initiatives have been started to link 33 PMGs with potential market actors.

Activity no.	Activity description	Unit of measure	Target	Achievement	Links to other outcomes/ activities	
Outcome 3. En community-bas	hanced capacity of district authorities, local institutions, FOs, and CSOs to promote and coed DRR)	ontribute to transp	parent and ri	ghts-based land o	governance (VGGT and	
Activity 3.1	Further to the baseline studies of Activity 2.1, identify 160 peasant organizations, eight for Result Nos. 1 and 2), and assess their needs for institutional strengthening; and further a promote VGGT, NRM and DRM.					
Activity 3.1.1	5.4.12. Identify peasant/farmers' organizations (P/FOs) and WUAs	district	8	8	Guided by Activity 3.4.1	
Activity 3.1.2	6.18. Train peasant and farmers' organizations in VGGT applications	course ³¹	16	13	Clubbed with Activity 3.6.1	
Activity 3.2	Based on the institutional assessment of Activity 4.1, train representatives of eight district principles and application of VGGT, NRM and DRM through culturally sensitive and local perspectives.	lly proven particip	atory appro	aches, with specia	l reference to gender	
Activity 3.2.1	6.20. Develop community-based VGGT-related DRR packages	event ³²	16	13	Guided by Activity 3.4.1	
Activity 3.2.2	3.4.7. Materials for community-based DRR demonstrations	village ³³	80	0	Guided by Activity 3.4.1	
Activity 3.2.2.1	COVID-19 response: Lining/improvement of Farmer-Managed Water Courses (FMWCs)	watercourse ³⁴	40	0		
Activity 3.3	Develop eight district-level "farmers' organization information management systems" fo well as irrigation water balancing and quality.	r disseminating a	nd exchangii	ng information or	VGGT, NRM and DRM as	
Activity 3.3.1	6.4. Develop farmers' organizations' information management system	district ³⁵	8	Dropped		
Activity 3.4	Strengthen capacity of FOs and 80 WUAs in water governance through the demonstration and extension of equitable water delivery systems and water conservation/saving techniques, with special reference to landlord/hari relationships and gender perspectives – leading to more equitable sharing of irrigation water, improved skills in on-farm water management and increases in the number of water applications in a particular cropping season.					
Activity 3.4.1	5.2.7. Undertake institutional assessment of P/FOs and WUAs	study	1	1	Activities 3.6.1 and 3.1.2	
Activity 3.4.2	5.2.9. Assess P/FOs' and COs' DRR and safety nets related to food and land	study	1	1	Activity 3.2	
Activity 3.4.3	5.2.10 Studies, capitalization and dissemination of Action's results.	TCP ³⁶	1	2		
Activity 3.5	Test water quality for "multiple use water services" (particularly for the use of groundwate WUA members of any implications – again, with special reference to landlord/hari relations.		_	_	and advising respective	

-

³¹ One potential peasant organization was identified in Sindh during the NCE that is active in generating "status of peasants rights in Sindh" report annually. A one-day workshop was arranged for this organization to introduce the tenancy agreement and the recommendations of the VGGT.

³² Consultations were held with SUCCESS partners and the academia to confirm the appropriate DRR packages for implementation.

³³ Two potential DRR packages have been finalized for implementation after consultation with stakeholders. All 80 villages will receive DRR packages during the anticipated second NCE (i.e. agroforestry trees and grain storage bins).

³⁴ The FAO engineer has finalized the technical evaluation of the proposed sites of the communities and started working on the cost estimates. Consultations were also started with the On Farm Water Management Department to take the lead. The activity could not be implemented during the NCE period.

³⁵ The explanation provided in an earlier footnote about the non-availability of the relevant expert and software "solutions for open land administration" also applies to this activity.

³⁶ The project team represented ILTS in the international capitalization workshop during years 4 and 5. The capitalization workshops were organized by FAO headquarters under the "European Union - Transversal" project.

Activity no.	Activity description	Unit of measure	Target	Achievement	Links to other outcomes/ activities		
Activity 3.5.1	5.2.8. Test quality of groundwater in salinity-prone areas	study	1	1	Outcome 2, FFS implementation		
Activity 3.6	Undertake provincial, district and local consultations, focus group discussions and a tech effectiveness of existing community and household-based safety net and DRR practices and gender perspectives.		-		he performance and		
Activity 3.6.1	6.19. Train WUAs in VGGT, water saving.	course	8	5	Activity 3.1.2		
Activity 3.7	As follow-up to participatory mapping of landholdings (Activity 2.5) and implementation of FFS/WOS (Activity 3.6), test and demonstrate 16 new and improved community-based and land, water and forestry-focused DRR measures appropriate to the target communities, landlords and <i>haris</i> , with special reference to gender perspectives (e.g. safe storage of seeds, grains and fodder and establishment of farm forests, windbreaks and farm boundary markers, soil and water conservation and flood, stream-bank and irrigation channel protection measures and multi-purpose raised platforms).						
Activity 3.7.1	6.1. Participatory mapping of landholdings	village ³⁷	80	Dropped			
Activity 3.7.2	3.4.4. Printing materials for village maps	lumpsum ³⁸	1	Dropped			
	Printing of tenancy agreements	agreement ³⁹	4 800	4 800	Outcome 2		
Activity A	5.5. Visibility actions/ Major Activity A, Project visibility activities	items			Outcome 1, Outcome 2		
Activity B	Evaluation	study	1	0	Ongoing		
Activity B.1	5.3.1. Technical and specialized implementation support	days ⁴⁰	301	301			
Activity B.2	5.3.2. Project impact evaluation	evaluation ⁴¹	1	0			
Activity B.3	5.3.3. Project reporting costs	lumpsum ⁴²	1	0			

³⁷ The explanation provided in footnote 3 also applies to this activity.

³⁸ The explanation provided in footnote 3 also applies to this activity.

³⁹ 4 800 agreements in Sindhi language were printed.

⁴⁰ The lead Technical Officer provided days/time to the project.

⁴¹ The evaluation is ongoing.

⁴² ILTS submitted annual interim reports. In total, four interim reports have been submitted to the European Union and the last one is due.

Office of Evaluation evaluation@fao.org www.fao.org/evaluation

Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations Rome, Italy

