

Project Evaluation Series

09/2022

Evaluation of the project “Improved Land Tenancy in Sindh Province”

Project code: GCP/PAK/137/EC

Follow-up report

Evaluation of the project "Improved Land Tenancy in Sindh Province" – Follow-up report					01/2024
Evaluation recommendation	Management response Accepted, Partially accepted or Rejected	Management plan			
		Actions to be taken, and/or comments about partial acceptance or rejection	Description of actions actually taken, or reasons for actions not taken	MAR Score	Impact of, or changes resulted from taken actions
<p>Recommendation 1.</p> <p><i>To FAO:</i></p> <p>Establish a system of M&E and supporting outsourced studies that meets international standards and could also serve as an example for future projects, including a potential future phase of ILTS (conclusions 1, 3 and 5).</p> <p>The project needs to streamline the logical framework by aligning it with international good practices for results-based management:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> i. Add outputs or categories of outputs to complete the results chain and ensure regular reporting on outputs and the indicators of outcomes and the Specific Objective. ii. Re-phrase the statements of outcome and objectives that include nested results and need to be unpacked (for example, Outcome 2). iii. Provide operational definitions for terms that could have different interpretations in implementation and M&E (including "governance", "implemented", "smallholders", "the poor", "the vulnerable" and "youth"). It is understood that an operational definition of "small farmer" could vary across districts. iv. Elaborate or simplify the indicators that include multiple indicators (for example, Indicator 2 of the Specific Objective) and add indicators for specific target groups. 	Accepted	Monitoring, Evaluation, Accountability and Learning Plan has improved and operationalized.	<p>The FAO MEAL unit has developed a comprehensive MEAL plan for the project to prioritize documentation, monitoring, and generating evidence to capture the results as well as demonstrate the impact of the project. It was made operationalized during the no cost extension phase of the project from the March 2022 to February 2023.</p> <p>The FAO M&E team with support of project team defined the key terms in project log frame and improved the column for "source of information".</p> <p>The FAO outsourced and commissioned the impact study titled "Socio economic impact of the tenancy agreements between tenants and the land owners". The objectives included assessing the improvements in landowners-tenant relationships, assessing the improvements in landowner-tenant relationships, land tenure security, and the impact of tenants' capacity development on agricultural knowledge and resilience. Additionally, the study captured the project's impacts on women farmers, livelihoods, agricultural productivity, food security, livelihood sustainability, and tenants' financial situation, particularly indebtedness and bonded labor.</p> <p>The tenancy agreement database reviewed, completed and updated. It provided used as a sample frame for the impact study.</p>	Good	<p>The improved LFM and MEAL plan operationalized during the no-cost extension period.</p> <p>The study commissioned and findings were shared and discussed with stakeholders during the learning workshop. The learnings were adopted.</p> <p>The database was improved and used as a sample frame for the impact study.</p>

Evaluation of the project "Improved Land Tenancy in Sindh Province" – Follow-up report					01/2024
Evaluation recommendation	Management response Accepted, Partially accepted or Rejected	Management plan			Impact of, or changes resulted from taken actions
		Actions to be taken, and/or comments about partial acceptance or rejection	Description of actions actually taken, or reasons for actions not taken	MAR Score	
v. Add source of information as required and change the sources of information that do not correspond to the indicators in the present logical framework. vi. Provide the technical and financial resources to: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Complete and update the project database on tenancy agreements and ensure that there are no discrepancies in it. Analyse the database and relevant project information (including information available with project staff) to bring out the strengths, limitations and lessons learned from the project's implementation of the tenancy agreements intervention. • Scope out, procure and implement at least two outsourced studies for collecting and analyzing the quantitative and qualitative data required for outcome or impact assessment aligned with the revised logical framework that meet international standards in the development (rather than academic) sector. These could be based on quantitative, qualitative or mixed-methods research. 					

Evaluation of the project “Improved Land Tenancy in Sindh Province” – Follow-up report					01/2024
Evaluation recommendation	Management response Accepted, Partially accepted or Rejected	Management plan			
		Actions to be taken, and/or comments about partial acceptance or rejection	Description of actions actually taken, or reasons for actions not taken	MAR Score	Impact of, or changes resulted from taken actions
<p>Recommendation 2.</p> <p><i>To FAO:</i></p> <p>Enhance the security afforded to the beneficiaries by the tenancy agreements and ensure that a certain proportion of them (say, 20–30 percent) are from poor and vulnerable households (conclusion 4).</p> <p>A complete and accurate database on tenancy agreements, as recommended above, would help the project to identify agreements that need to be renewed before the end of the present phase of the project in 2021. Building on its achievements so far, the project needs to ensure that all the beneficiaries have agreements that last at least two years beyond 2022. Two years is the duration of 94 percent of the agreements, according to the ILTS database.</p> <p>In addition, the project could consult the beneficiaries and the Board of Revenue on the usefulness and feasibility of registering the informal agreements, and determine whether it is desirable and possible to register a certain number of agreements during the remainder of the project duration. If it is, registration could be carried out in selected villages and districts where it appears most feasible in view of beneficiary interest and the administrative resources available for the purpose.</p> <p>In cooperation with the Rural Support Programmes working in the eight districts, the project could use the poverty score card to identify the poor</p>	<p>Partially accepted</p> <p>A complete and accurate database on tenancy agreements will be updated.</p> <p>Registration of beneficiaries with Board of Revenue could not be possible at the moment because of the legal concerns.</p>	<p>Update database on tenancy agreement</p>	<p>The tenancy agreement database reviewed, completed and updated.</p> <p>It provided used as a sample frame for the impact study.</p>	<p>Good</p>	<p>The database was improved and used as a sample frame for the impact study.</p>

Evaluation of the project "Improved Land Tenancy in Sindh Province" – Follow-up report					01/2024
Evaluation recommendation	Management response Accepted, Partially accepted or Rejected	Management plan			Impact of, or changes resulted from taken actions
		Actions to be taken, and/or comments about partial acceptance or rejection	Description of actions actually taken, or reasons for actions not taken	MAR Score	
households among the beneficiaries and non-beneficiaries of tenancy agreements. In addition, it could use an operational definition of vulnerable households for a similar exercise to identify the vulnerable among the beneficiaries. If feasible, additional agreements could be facilitated so as to increase the proportion of the poor and vulnerable among the beneficiaries.					
<p>Recommendation 3.</p> <p><i>To FAO:</i></p> <p>Develop and implement productivity-enhancing CSA interventions for small farmers, rural youth and landless households (conclusion 4).</p> <p>The project already has a large number of interventions for enhancing crop productivity, including several that are evidently profitable because they are being used by farmers in the project districts. It also has activities and expertise for post-harvest management, various marketing activities, value chain development and livestock development. Based on the operational definitions it would adopt (as in Recommendation 2), the project needs to identify or develop interventions that could be readily adopted by small farmers, youth and the landless, and ensure the inclusion of these groups in ongoing or new programmes.</p>	Accepted	<p>FAO accepts the recommendation and has already adopted the strategy to prioritize the youth and poor tenants in the project interventions for no-cost-extension period (i.e. from March 2022 to February 2023. Below is the plan to implement the recommendation</p> <p>1. ILTS project has identified youth to be part of the project activity, they will get detailed Community Livestock Extension Workers (CLEWs) Course of 14 days and will be part of the Producer Market Groups.</p> <p>2. ILTS project</p>	<p>The FAO targeted the youth and get detailed Community Livestock Extension Workers (CLEWs) Course of 14 days. The youth were the part of the Producer Market Groups (PMGs).</p> <p>The 66 formed and project has prioritized the poor tenants, majority women in order to support them in skills enhancement in the area of value addition and market linkages.</p>	Good	<p>The youth engaged in project and increased their level of knowledge.</p> <p>The few PMGs linked with market and few merged under the FAOs ongoing GRASP project for market linkages</p>

Evaluation of the project “Improved Land Tenancy in Sindh Province” – Follow-up report					01/2024
Evaluation recommendation	Management response Accepted, Partially accepted or Rejected	Management plan			Impact of, or changes resulted from taken actions
		Actions to be taken, and/or comments about partial acceptance or rejection	Description of actions actually taken, or reasons for actions not taken	MAR Score	
		has prioritized the poor tenants, majority women, to be part of the 66 Producer Market Groups in order to support them in skills enhancement in the area of value addition and market linkages.			
<p>Recommendation 4.</p> <p><i>To FAO:</i></p> <p>Optimize engagement with the government and other stakeholders in view of project experiences (conclusions 1 and 2).</p> <p>No value is being added to project objectives by its generalized awareness-raising activities among a diffuse audience of elected representatives, academics, researchers, non-governmental organizations and government officials from various departments. Moreover, the training in which the project has engaged the Board of Revenue for land administration based on VGGT principles no longer has the implementation-driven rationale for which it was intended. These activities need to be stopped.</p> <p>If required, the project could approach the Rural Support Programmes and the Directorate of Livestock Extension and Research to implement interventions for the poor, the landless and youth. In addition, the project needs to engage interested</p>	Accepted	<p>FAO accepts this recommendation. FAO has already concluded that the interventions related to promoting VGGT strategy recommendations could not be fruitful in the context where Sindh Government has filed the appeal in the Honorable Supreme Court in response to a decision made by Honorable Sindh High Court. Sindh government has also shared in written that such activities could not be initiated until the decision is not concluded at Honorable</p>	<p>The FAO engaged the government and relevant stakeholders to promoting and advocating for the adoption of VGGT strategy. An effort was made to roll out the revised Tenancy Agreement format but could not done because the agreement needed to be legally vetted that process was not completed by Sindh Board of Revenue.</p> <p>FAO has engaged Livestock Extension and Research department in the project activities. The Department engaged in the training of youth on CLEWs training.</p> <p>FAO arranged a learning workshop to share the best practices and experiences on working for the land governance in Sindh. Various stakeholders that included the government departments, Rural Support Programmes organizations, I/NGOs, progressive farmers, academia participated in workshop.</p>	Good	

Evaluation of the project "Improved Land Tenancy in Sindh Province" – Follow-up report					01/2024
Evaluation recommendation	Management response Accepted, Partially accepted or Rejected	Management plan			Impact of, or changes resulted from taken actions
		Actions to be taken, and/or comments about partial acceptance or rejection	Description of actions actually taken, or reasons for actions not taken	MAR Score	
members of the project steering committee and other senior officials to understand how the government might be engaged effectively in a project such as ILTS.		<p>Supreme Court of Pakistan. FAO has decided below actions in response to the subjected recommendation.</p> <p>i. The activities related to promoting and advocating for the adoption of VGGT strategy have been stopped. The same has been approved by the resource partner in the no-cost-extension for 2022-23.</p> <p>ii. An effort will be made if revised Tenancy Agreement format is legally vetted and rolled out by Sindh Board of Revenue. Sindh Board of Revenue (the custodian of the land revenue and tenancy related matters)</p>			

Evaluation of the project "Improved Land Tenancy in Sindh Province" – Follow-up report					01/2024
Evaluation recommendation	Management response Accepted, Partially accepted or Rejected	Management plan			Impact of, or changes resulted from taken actions
		Actions to be taken, and/or comments about partial acceptance or rejection	Description of actions actually taken, or reasons for actions not taken	MAR Score	
		<p>has showed a positive gesture but still legal vetting is proposed. FAO will take up this matter in the Project Steering Committee meeting to explore if this could be initiated. In other case, FAO will continue with the informal tenancy agreements which has shown some positive impacts in terms of building trusting culture between the tenant and the landlords.</p> <p>iii. FAO has already engaged Livestock Extension and Research department in the project activities. The Department will be engaged in the training of</p>			

Evaluation of the project "Improved Land Tenancy in Sindh Province" – Follow-up report					01/2024
Evaluation recommendation	Management response Accepted, Partially accepted or Rejected	Management plan			Impact of, or changes resulted from taken actions
		Actions to be taken, and/or comments about partial acceptance or rejection	Description of actions actually taken, or reasons for actions not taken	MAR Score	
		youth on CLEWs training. iv. FAO will arrange a learning workshop to share the best practices and experiences on working for the land governance in Sindh. The Rural Support Programmes will be part of the learning workshop.			

Office of Evaluation
evaluation@fao.org
www.fao.org/evaluation

Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations
Rome, Italy