# codex alimentarius commission 



JOINT OFFICE: Viale delle Terme di Caracalla 00100 ROME Tel: 390657051 www.codexalimentarius.net Email: codex@fao.org Facsimile: 390657054593

# PROPOSED DRAFT STANDARD FOR CHOCOLATE AND CHOCOLATE PRODUCTS AT STEP 4 

Government Comments at Step 3 On the
Proposed draft Standard for Chocolate and Chocolate Products (Circular Letter 1998/43-CPC)

## Governments and international organizations:

Brazil, Cuba, Japan, Mexico, Spain, Thailand, United Kingdom of Great Britain CAOBISCO (Association of Chocolate, Biscuits and Confectionery Industries of the European Union)

## GENERAL REFLECTIONS ON THE STANDARD ITSELF

Japan
Japan has three basic comments on the proposed draft standard to make it simpler and more inclusive.

1. It is unreasonable for just one standard to cover both chocolate and chocolate products. The standard should cover only chocolate, and chocolate products regulations be left up to the discretion of each country.
2. The category for chocolate can be much simpler.
3. Only the essential composition factors of chocolate should be regulated by a basic universal standard. The additional ingredients should be optional.
For above reasons we propose the amendments as below.

# PROPOSED DRAFT STANDARD FOR CHOCOLATE AND CHOCOLATE PRODUCTS (App. V of ALINORM 99/14) 

## Cuba

Basically we agree with the document, we would like to make the comments below.

## TITLE

Japan
"AND CHOCOLATE PRODUCTS" to be deleted.

## 1. SCOPE

The standard applies to all chocolate and chocolate products for sale to consumers. These products must contain, in their formulations, minimum quantities of cocoa and cocoa materials with the addition of a range of wholesome foodstuffs such as sugars, sweeteners, milk products, flavouring substances and other food ingredients in order to modify, in a characteristic manner, the organoleptic properties of the final product.

Japan
"all chocolate and chocolate products" to be changed to "chocolate".
Spain
In the third line, the phrase: "...wholesome foodstuffs such as sugars, ...", should be replaced by: "...foodstuffs such as sugars,..." .

## 2. DESCRIPTION AND ESSENTIAL COMPOSITION FACTORS

### 2.1 Chocolate Types

Chocolate is the generic name for the homogenous products complying with the descriptions below and summarised in the Table. It is obtained by an adequate manufacturing process from cocoa materials which may be combined with milk products, sugars and/or sweeteners, emulsifiers and/or flavours. Other edible foodstuffs, excluding added flour and starch (except for products in 2.4.3 of this Standard) and animal fats other than milk fat, may be added to form various chocolate products. The additions shall be limited to $40 \%$ of the total weight of the finished product, subject to the labelling provisions under Section 6.
[The addition of vegetable fats other than cocoa butter shall not exceed 5\% of the finished product, after deduction of the total weight of any other added edible foodstuffs, without reducing the minimum contents of cocoa materials.]

## Brazil

We suggest to eliminate the text in square brackets.

## Cuba

In 2.1, delete the paragraph enclosed in square brackets.

## Japan

1. Title 2.1 "Chocolate types": title to be changed to "chocolate".
2. "and/or flavours" (line 3) to be changed to "flavours and/or other edible foodstuffs" and the sentences after "Other edible foodstuffs" including the content of square bracket to be deleted.
3. To make chocolate standard simple we propose only one compositional requirement of chocolate as follows:
"Chocolate shall contain, on a dry matter basis, not less than $35 \%$ total cocoa solids, of which not less than $18 \%$ shall be cocoa butter. Cocoa solids can be replaced by milk solids on the condition that total cocoa solids is not less than $21 \%$, of which not less than $18 \%$ is cocoa butter, and total of cocoa and milk solids is not less than $35 \%$, of which not less than $3 \%$ is milk fat".
4. Above mentioned standard can cover all chocolates. But to clarify details we propose three subcategories.

### 2.1.1 Unsweetened Chocolate

Unsweetened Chocolate is a chocolate made with no added sugars or sweeteners and shall contain, on a dry matter basis, not less than $50 \%$ and not more than $60 \%$ cocoa butter.

### 2.1.2 Milk Chocolate

Milk Chocolate shall contain, on a dry matter basis, not less than $14 \%$ milk solids (including a minimum of $3 \%$ milk fat).

### 2.1.3 Cocoa Butter Confectionery/White Chocolate

Cocoa Butter Confectionery/White Chocolate shall contain, on a dry matter basis, not less than $21 \%$ shall be cocoa butter and not less than $14 \%$ milk solids (including a minimum of $3 \%$ milk fat).

## Mexico

We agree with the removal of the square brackets in section 2.1 , clarifying that in the list of ingredients, the presence of vegetable fats other than cocoa butter is stated to ensure that the information is clear to the consumer.

## Spain

As we are in agreement with the content of the second paragraph of section 2.1 , we propose removing the square brackets.
Thailand
We agree with $5 \%$ vegetable fat other than cocoa butter in order to:

- prevent melting and to keep constant properties that suitable to the climate with high temperature in tropical zone's country
- prevent fat bloom


## United Kingdom

Removal of the [] square brackets in the second paragraph to permit the use of 5\% maximum of vegetable fats in chocolate. At the end of the sentence, add a further sentence:
"The vegetable fats used must be compatible with the physical properties of cocoa butter, and are obtained only by the physical processes of refining and/or fractionation."

This will ensure that tropical fats are used as highlighted in the meeting report.

### 2.1.1 Chocolate

Chocolate shall contain, on a dry matter basis, not less than $35 \%$ total cocoa solids, of which not less than $18 \%$ shall be cocoa butter and not less than $14 \%$ fat-free cocoa solids.

### 2.1.2 Unsweetened Chocolate

Unsweetened Chocolate is a chocolate made with no added sugars or other sweeteners and shall contain, on a dry matter basis, not less than $50 \%$ and not more than $60 \%$ cocoa butter.

## Mexico

In section 2.1.2., we suggest that for the cocoa butter content of unsweetened chocolate, it should say: "and not less than $50 \%$ cocoa butter"
Spain
In the first line, the phrase: "...is a chocolate made with no added sugars..." should be replaced by: "...is a chocolate made with no added sugars or other sweeteners and...".
In the third line, the phrase: "...not less than $50 \%$ and not more than $58 \% \ldots$., should be replaced by: "...not less than $50 \%$ and not more than $60 \%$...".

### 2.1.3 Sweet (Plain) Chocolate

Sweet (Plain) Chocolate shall contain, on a dry matter basis, not less than $30 \%$ total cocoa solids, of which at least $18 \%$ shall be cocoa butter and at least $12 \%$ fat-free cocoa solids.

## Mexico

In section 2.1.3, we suggest replacing the term "plain" with "simple".

## Spain

We propose replacing the term "sweet (plain) chocolate" with "family chocolate".

## [2.1.4 Couverture Chocolate

Couverture Chocolate shall contain, on a dry matter basis, not less than $35 \%$ total cocoa solids of which not less than $31 \%$ shall be cocoa butter and not less than $2.5 \%$ of fat-free cocoa solids.]

## Mexico

In section 2.1.4, we suggest that the fat-free cocoa solids content should be at least $4.5 \%$.

## Spain

We propose replacing the term "Couverture chocolate" (Chocolate de cobertura) with "Chocolate covering" (chocolate de recubrimiento).
As we agree with the content of the definition in section 2.1.4., we propose removing the square brackets.

### 2.1.5 Milk Chocolate

### 2.1.5.1 MILK CHOCOLATE

Milk Chocolate shall contain, on a dry matter basis, not less than $25 \%$ cocoa solids (including a minimum of $2.5 \%$ fat-free cocoa solids) and not less than $14 \%$ milk solids (including a minimum of $2.5 \%$ milk fat).

Brazil
We suggest the reduction of the percentage of milk solids from $14 \%$ to $12 \%$.
Justification: This percentage has already being practiced internationally. This value is perfectly technologically viable for the chocolate production. The reduction of milk solids is not compulsory however it makes possible the production of a chocolate a little more "bitter", besides developing such interesting variations as bigger amount of cocoa ("dark chocolate").

Spain
We propose replacing the content of $\underline{2.5 \%}$ milk fat with $3.5 \%$ dairy fat.
Thailand
The requirement of minimum milk fat in section 2.1.5.1 Milk Chocolate $=2,5 \%$ is not concerning with 2.2.2 Milk Chocolate Vermicelli/Flakes $=3 \%$ and 2.2.3 Cocoa Butter Confectionery Vermicelli $=3,5 \%$ although with the same objective of using.

### 2.1.5.2 [MILK CHOCOLATE WITH HIGH MILK CONTENT]

[Milk Chocolate with High Milk Content] shall contain, on a dry matter basis, not less than $20 \%$ cocoa solids (including a minimum of $2.5 \%$ fat-free cocoa solids) and not less than $20 \%$ milk solids (including a minimum of $5 \%$ milk fat).

## Cuba

In accordance with what is in square brackets.
Spain
We propose replacing the term "Milk chocolate with high milk content" (Chocolate con leche de alto contenido lácteo) with "Family milk chocolate" (Chocolate familiar con leche).

## United Kingdom

Remove [] square brackets and replace "milk chocolate with high milk content" by "family milk chocolate".
Although this name is less informative than the original name it is more closely aligned to the French and Spanish versions.

## [2.1.5.3MILK COUVERTURE CHOCOLATE]

[text to be developed]

## Spain

We propose modifying the term "Milk couverture chocolate" (Chocolate de cobertura con leche) by replacing it with "Milk chocolate covering" (Chocolate con leche de recubrimiento).

We propose the following definition: "Shall contain not less than $31 \%$ total fat (cocoa butter and dairy fat)".

### 2.1.6 Skimmed Milk Chocolate

Skimmed Milk Chocolate shall contain, on a dry matter basis, not less than $25 \%$ cocoa solids (including a minimum of $2.5 \%$ fat-free cocoa solids) and not less than $14 \%$ milk solids (including a maximum of $0.5 \%$ milk fat).

## Mexico

In section 2.1.6 of the Spanish text, we suggest replacing the term "skimmed" (desnatada) by "skimmed" (descremada).

Spain
We propose replacing the $\underline{0.5 \%}$ "milk fat" with $\underline{1 \%}$ "dairy fat".

### 2.1.7 Cream Chocolate

Cream Chocolate shall contain, on a dry matter basis, not less than $35 \%$ total cocoa and milk solids combined, of which at least $25 \%$ shall be cocoa solids (including a minimum of $2.5 \%$ fat-free cocoa solids) and at least $10 \%$ and not more than $21 \%$ shall be milk solids (including a minimum of $7 \%$ of milk fat.

## Spain

We propose replacing the term "cream chocolate" (chocolate con crema) with "chocolate with cream" (chocolate con nata).
We propose replacing the $7 \%$ "milk fat" with $5.5 \%$ "dairy fat".

### 2.1.8 Cocoa Butter Confectionery / White Chocolate

Cocoa Butter Confectionery / White Chocolate shall contain, on a dry matter basis, not less than $20 \%$ shall be cocoa butter and not less than $14 \%$ milk solids (including a minimum of $3 \%$ milk fat).

## Spain

We propose replacing the $3 \%$ "milk fat" with $3.5 \%$ "dairy fat".

## Thailand

Appendix V, ALINORM 99/14, section 2.1.7 Cocoa Butter Confectionery amend to 2.1.8 Cocoa Butter Confectonery ( $\rightarrow$ error in the English standard's text).
Also under section 6.1.3 amend "Product described under Section 2.1.7" to " Product described under Section 2.1.8".

### 2.2 Vermicelli and Flakes

Vermicelli and Flakes are cocoa products obtained by a mixing, extrusion and hardening technique which gives unique, crisp textural properties to the products. Vermicelli are presented in the form of short, cylindrical grains and flakes in the form of small flat pieces.

## Brazil

We suggest the inclusion of the word "drops" in the title of the text.
Japan
This section to be deleted.

## Mexico

In section 2.2, where it says: "... mixing, extrusion and hardening technique...", we suggest that it should say: "... mixing, hardening and/or extrusion technique...".

In section 2.2 , where it says: "..in the form of small flat pieces...", we suggest that it should say: "...in the form of flat pieces...".

Spain
We propose replacing the term "Vermicelli and Flakes..." (Chocolate en grano y chocolate en escamas" with: "Vermicelli and chocolate flakes/shavings..." (Fideos de chocolate y chocolate en escamas/copos).
In the third line, the phrase: "Vermicelli are presented in the form of short, cylindrical grains and flakes in the form of small flat pieces" (El chocolate en grano se presenta en forma de granos cilindricos cortos y el chocolate en escamas en forma de piezas pequeñas y planas) should be replaced by:"Vermicelli are presented in the form of small cylinders and flakes/shavings in the form of small pieces" (Los fideos de chocolate se presentan en forma de pequenos cilindros y el chocolate en escamas/copos en forma de piezas pequenas).

### 2.2.1 Chocolate Vermicelli / Flakes

Chocolate Vermicelli / Flakes shall contain, on a dry matter basis, not less than $32 \%$ total cocoa solids, of which at least $12 \%$ shall be cocoa butter and $14 \%$ fat-free cocoa solids.

## Brazil

We suggest the inclusion of the word "drops" in the title of the text and the reduction of the following percentages: cocoa solids from $32 \%$ to $29 \%$ and from $14 \%$ to $10 \%$ of the dry extract of cocoa without fat.
Justification: It is considered that these percentages are appropriated to produce a chocolate with good quality and this production is technologically viable.
Spain
We propose replacing the term "Chocolate vermicelli / flakes" (Chocolate en grano/escamas) with "Vermicelli and chocolate flakes/shavings" (Fideos de chocolate y chocolate en escamas/copos).

### 2.2.2 Milk Chocolate Vermicelli / Flakes

Milk Chocolate Vermicelli / Flakes shall contain, on a dry matter basis, not less than $20 \%$ cocoa solids (including a minimum of $2.5 \%$ fat-free cocoa solids) and not less than $12 \%$ milk solids (including a minimum of $3 \%$ milk fat).

## Brazil

We suggest the inclusion of the word "drops" in the title of the text.

## Spain

We propose replacing the term "Milk chocolate vermicelli / flakes " (Chocolate con leche en grano/en escamas) with "Milk chocolate vermicelli and milk chocolate flakes/shavings" (Fideos de chocolate con leche y chocolate con leche en escamas/copos.

### 2.2.3 Cocoa Butter Confectionery Vermicelli / Flakes // White Chocolate Vermicelli / Flakes <br> Cocoa Butter Confectionery Vermicelli / Flakes // White Chocolate Vermicelli / Flakes shall contain, on a dry matter basis, not less than $20 \%$ cocoa butter and not less than $14 \%$ milk solids (including a minimum of $3.5 \%$ milk fat).

## Brazil

We suggest the inclusion of the word "drops" in the title of the text and the reduction of the percentage of milk solids from $14 \%$ to $12 \%$.

### 2.3 Filled Chocolate

Filled Chocolate is a product covered by a coating of one or more of the Chocolates defined in Section 2.1 or 2.4 , with exception of chocolate a la taza of this Standard, the centre of which is clearly distinct through its composition from the external coating. Filled Chocolate does not include Flour Confectionery, Pastry, Biscuit or Ice Cream products. The chocolate part of the coating must make up at least $25 \%$ of the total weight of the product concerned.
If the centre part of the product is made up of a component or components for which a separate Codex Standard exists, then the component(s) must comply with this applicable standard.

## Brazil

We suggest the exclusion of the phrases: "... with exception of chocolate a la taza,..." and "Filled Chocolate does not include Flour Confectionery, Pastry, Biscuit or Ice Cream products".
Justification: We understand that since these products can be used as filling or stuffing it is not fair to mention them. The proposed text would harm products existing in Brazilian market including products
that are imported. Example is cookies containing ovened products which are very differents from chocolate coated products.

Japan
This section to be deleted.

## Mexico

In section 2.3 we suggest modifying the phrase: "...in Section 2.1 or 2.4 , with the exception of chocolate a la taza,...", to read: "...in Sections 2.1 and 2.4 , with the exception of chocolate a la taza and of chocolate para mesa...". Note: Mexico proposes the inclusion of chocolate para mesa, the definition of which would appear in section 2.4.4.

Spain
In the third and fourth lines, we propose replacing the word "coating" (revistimiento) with "covering" (recubrimiento).

In the third line of the Spanish, the phrase: "Filled chocolate does not include flour confectionery, pastry, biscuit or ice cream products" (El chocolate relleno no incluye dulces de harina, ni productos de repostería, bizcochos o helados) should be replaced by: "Filled chocolate does not include flour confectionery, pastry, biscuit or ice cream products" (El chocolate relleno no incluye confiteria de harina, ni productos de repostería, galletas o helados...").

### 2.4 Other Chocolate Products

Other chocolate products are the additional commercially available products that rely for their essential character either totally or extensively on cocoa materials.

## Japan

This section to be deleted.

### 2.4.1 A Chocolate

A Chocolate designates the product in a single mouthful size, where the amount of the chocolate component shall not be less than $25 \%$ of the total weight of the product. The product shall consist of either filled chocolate or a single or combination of the chocolates as defined under Sections 2.1 and 2.4, with exception of chocolate a la taza.

## Mexico

In section 2.4.1, we suggest the phrase "with exception of chocolate a la taza" (salvo el chocolate a la taza) should be replaced by "with exception of chocolate a la taza and chocolate para mesa" (salvo el chocolate a la taza y el chocolate para mesa).

### 2.4.2 Gianduja Chocolate

### 2.4.2.1 GIANDUJA CHOCOLATE

Gianduja chocolate is the product obtained, firstly, from chocolate having a minimum total dry cocoa solids content of $32 \%$, including a minimum dry non-fat cocoa solids content of $8 \%$, and, secondly, from finely ground hazelnuts, in such quantities that 100 grams of the products contain not less than 20 grams of hazelnuts.

Brazil
We suggest the reduction of the percentage of cocoa dry extract from $32 \%$ to $29 \%$, as well as the modification of the amount of hazelnuts in 100 g of the product from 20 g for a value between 15 and 40 grams.

Justification: The Brazilian market uses sweet chocolate, as defined in item 2.1.3 of this Draft, for the production of this chocolate, differently from other countries that use the bitter / bitter middle chocolate,
defined in the item 2.1.1. However, it used the same reduction of cocoa solids of $3 \%$, as a way of enhancing the hazelnut flavour.

Spain
In the third line of the Spanish text, we propose replacing the phrase "finely ground hazelnuts" (sémola fina de avellana) with "finely ground hazelnuts" (avellana finamente molida...).

### 2.4.2.2 MILK GIANDUJA CHOCOLATE

Milk Gianduja chocolate is the product obtained, firstly, from milk chocolate having a minimum dry milk solids content of $10 \%$ and, secondly, from finely ground hazelnuts such that 100 grams of product contain not less than 15 grams of hazelnuts.

## Brazil

We suggest the reduction of the percentile of cocoa dry extract from $32 \%$ to $29 \%$, as well as the modification of the amount of hazelnuts in 100 g of the product from 20 g for a value between 15 and 40 grams.

## Spain

In the second line of the Spanish text, the phrase: "...having a minimum dry milk solids content of $10 \%$ and,..." (...con un contenído mínimo de total de extracto seco de cacao del $10 \%$ y...) should be replaced by: "having a minimum dry milk solids content of $10 \%$ and,..." (...con un contenido mínimo de extracto seco de leche del $10 \%$ y...)

In the third line of the Spanish text, we propose replacing the term "finely ground hazelnuts" (sémola fina de avellana) with "finely ground hazelnuts". (avellana finamente molida).

### 2.4.3 Chocolate a la taza

2.4.3.1 Chocolate a la taza is the product described under Section 2.1.1 of this Standard and containing a maximum of $8 \% \mathrm{~m} / \mathrm{m}$ flour and/or starch.

No comments
2.4.3.2 Chocolate familiar a la taza is the product described under Section 2.1.3 of this Standard and a maximum of $18 \% \mathrm{~m} / \mathrm{m}$ flour and/or starch.

## Spain

In the Spanish version, the maximum content of flour and/or starch should be "of $18 \% \mathrm{~m} / \mathrm{m}$ ", as in the English and French versions.

## Mexico

We request that chocolate para mesa be included in the chocolate composition table with the following definition and composition:
2.4.4 Chocolate para mesa, is unrefined chocolate which has a content of not less than $20 \%$ total cocoa solids and where the granulometry of the natural sweetener is greater than 70 micras.

Chocolate para mesa may also be called bitter or semi-bitter chocolate para mesa, where the minimum total cocoa solids are $30 \%$ and $40 \%$ respectively.

## TABLE : SUMMARY TABLE OF COMPOSITIONAL REQUIREMENTS OF SECTION 2

(\% calculated on the dry matter in the product and after deduction of the weight of the other edible foodstuffs authorized under Section 2.1)

| Constituents Product | Cocoa Butter | Fat-free Cocoa Solids | Total Cocoa Solids | Milk Fat | Total Milk Solids | Combined Cocoa and Milk Solids |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 2.1 CHOCOLATE |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2.1.1 CHOCOLATE | $\geq 18$ | $\geq 14$ | $\geq 35$ |  |  |  |
| 2.1.2 UNSWEETENED CHOCOLATE | $\geq 50-\leq 58$ | $\geq 14$ |  |  |  |  |
| 2.1.3 SWEET (PLAIN) CHOCOLATE | $\geq 18$ | $\geq 12$ | $\geq 30$ |  |  |  |
| 2.1.4 COUVERTURE CHOCOLATE |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2.1.5 MILK CHOCOLATE |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2.1.5.1 MILK CHOCOLATE |  | $\geq 2.5$ | $\geq 25$ | $\geq 2.5$ | $\geq 14$ |  |
| 2.1.5.2 [MILK CHOCOLATE WITH HIGH MILK CONTENT] |  | $\geq 2.5$ | $\geq 20$ | $\geq 5$ | $\geq 20$ |  |
| [2.1.5.3 MILK COUVERTURE CHOCOLATE |  |  |  |  |  | ] |
| 2.1.6 SKIMMED MILK CHOCOLATE |  | $\geq 2.5$ | $\geq 25$ | $\leq 0.5$ | $\geq 14$ |  |
| 2.1.7 CREAM CHOCOLATE |  | $\geq 2.5$ | $\geq 25$ | $\geq 7$ | $\geq 10-\leq 21$ | $\geq 35$ |
| 2.1.8 COCOA BUTTER CONFECTIONERY / WHITE CHOCOLATE <br> VERMICELLI / FLAKES | $\geq 20$ |  |  | $\geq 3.5$ | $\geq 14$ |  |
| 2.2 VERMICELLI and FLAKES |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2.2.1 CHOCOLATE VERMICELLI / FLAKES | $\geq 12$ | $\geq 14$ | $\geq 32$ |  |  |  |
| 2.2.2 MILK CHOCOLATE VERMICELLI / FLAKES |  | $\geq 2.5$ | $\geq 20$ | $\geq 3$ | $\geq 12$ |  |
| 2.2.3 COCOA BUTTER CONFECTIONERY VERMICELLI / FLAKES // WHITE CHOCOLATE VERMICELLI / FLAKES | $\geq 20$ |  |  | $\geq 3.5$ | $\geq 14$ |  |
| 2.3 FILLED CHOCOLATE (See Section 2.3) |  |  |  |  |  |  |

Spain
The modifications proposed for milk fat content in points 2.1.5.1. ( $\geq 3,5$ ), 2.1.6. $(\geq 1), 2.1 .7$. ( $\geq 5,5$ ) should be included, as should the terms corresponding to 2.1.3., 2.1.4., 2.1.5.2., 2.1.5.3., 2.1.7., 2.2., 2.2.1. and 2.2.2.

TABLE : SUMMARY TABLE OF COMPOSITIONAL REQUIREMENTS OF SECTION 2
(\% calculated on the dry matter in the product and after deduction of the weight of the other edible foodstuffs authorized under Section 2.1)

| Constituents Product | Cocoa Butter | Fat-free Cocoa Solids | Total Cocoa Solids | Milk Fat | Total Milk Solids | Combined Cocoa and Milk Solids |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 2.4 OTHER CHOCOLATE PRODUCTS |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2.4.1 A CHOCOLATE (See Section 2.4.1) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2.4.2 GIANDUJA CHOCOLATE |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2.4.2.1 GIANDUJA CHOCOLATE <br> (See Section 2.4.2.1) |  | $\geq 8$ | $\geq 32$ |  |  |  |
| 2.4.2.1 MILK GIANDUJA CHOCOLATE (See Section 2.4.2.2) |  |  |  |  | $\geq 10$ |  |
| 2.4.3 CHOCOLATE A LA TAZA |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2.4.3.1 CHOCOLATE A LA TAZA <br> (See Section 2.4.3.1) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2.4.3.2 CHOCOLATE FAMILIAR A LA TAZA <br> (See Section 2.4.3.2) |  |  |  |  |  |  |

Mexico
We request the inclusion of chocolate para mesa in the chocolate composition table (see section 2.4.4)

|  | Cocoa <br> Butter | Fat-free Cocoa <br> Solids | Total Cocoa <br> Solids |  |
| :--- | :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 2.4.4 | CHOCOLATE PARA MESA |  |  |  |
| 2.4.4.1 | Chocolate para mesa | $>11$ | $>9.4$ | $>20$ |
| 2.4.4.2 | Semi-bitter chocolate para mesa | $>16.5$ | $>14$ | $>30$ |
| 2.4.4.3 | Bitter chocolate para mesa | $>22$ | $>18$ | $>40$ |

## 3. FOOD ADDITIVES

Only those food additives listed below may be used and only within the limits specified.
Japan

1. We do not think each commodity CODEX standards need the lists of food additives. But if we need them we recommend the attached food additives list for chocolate. (See pt. 3.2, 3.4, 3.6, 3.7 and 3.8).
2. This proposed draft includes chocolate products in it. It is not clear for us whether or not these food additives list can apply to total chocolate products which may contain various foodstuffs.
3.1 Alkalizing and neutralizing agents carried over as a result of processing cocoa materials in proportion to the maximum quantity as provided for.

No comments
3.2 Emulsifiers

471 Mono- and di-glycerides of fatty acids
322 Lecithins
422 Glycerol
442 Ammonium salts of phosphatidic acids
476 Polyglycerol esters interesterified recinoleic acid
491 Sorbitan monostearate
492 Sorbitan tristearate
435 Polyoxyethylene (20) sorbitan monostearate

| Maximum Level | Products |
| :--- | :--- |
| Limited by GMP |  |
| Limited by GMP |  |
| Limited by GMP |  |
| $10 \mathrm{~g} / \mathrm{kg}$ |  |
| $5 \mathrm{~g} / \mathrm{kg}$ |  |
| $10 \mathrm{~g} / \mathrm{kg}$ | $15 \mathrm{~g} / \mathrm{kg}$ in |
| $10 \mathrm{~g} / \mathrm{kg}$ | combination |$\quad$| Products described |
| :--- |
| $10 \mathrm{~g} / \mathrm{kg}$ |

## Cuba

In Cuba, we use soya lecithin as an emulsifier and vanillin as a flavouring agent.
Japan
Japan proposes to add:
473 Sucrose esters of fatty acids
3.3 FLAVOURING AGENTS

| 3.3.1 | Natural flavours as defined in the Codex <br> Alimentarius, and their synthetic <br> equivalents, except those which would <br> imitate natural chocolate or milk | Limited by GMP |  |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| flavours |  | Products described <br> under 2.1 to 2.4 |  |
| 3.3.2 | Vanillin | Limited by GMP |  |
| 3.3.3 | Ethyl vanillin | Limited by GMP |  |

## Cuba

In Cuba, we use soya lecithin as an emulsifier and vanillin as a flavouring agent.

### 3.4 SWEETENERS

950 Acesulfame K
951 Aspartame
952 Cyclamic acid and its Na and Ca salts
954 Saccharin and its Na and Ca salts
957 Thaumatin
420 Sorbitol
421 Mannitol
953 Isomalt
965 Maltitol
966 Lactitol
967 Xylitol
959 Neohesperidine dihydrochalcone
$500 \mathrm{mg} / \mathrm{kg}$
$2000 \mathrm{mg} / \mathrm{kg}$
$500 \mathrm{mg} / \mathrm{kg}$
$500 \mathrm{mg} / \mathrm{kg}$
Limited by GMP
Limited by GMP
Limited by GMP
Limited by GMP
Limited by GMP
Limited by GMP
Limited by GMP
$100 \mathrm{mg} / \mathrm{kg}$

Products described under 2.1 to 2.4

Japan
Japan proposes to add:
955 Sucralose
Spain
These should not be used in all products from 2.1 to 2.4 . If they are added, it would be to "reduced energy value" or "no added sugar" products.

## Thailand

Codex should recommend JECFA to evaluate ADI for Food Additives as follows:
3.4 Sweeteners:

959 Neohesperidine dihydrochalcone
Prohibition of cyclamic acid and its salts was regulated according to Thai Food Law.

### 3.5 GLAZING AGENTS

414 Gum Arabic (Acacia gum)
440 Pectin
901 Beeswax, white and yellow
902 Candelilla wax
903 Carnauba wax
904 Shellac

Limited by GMP
Limited by GMP
Limited by GMP
Limited by GMP
Limited by GMP
Limited by GMP

Products described under 2.1 to 2.4

No comments

## [3.6 Antioxidants

304 Ascorbyl palmitate
319 Tertiary butylhydroquine
320 Butylated hydroxyanisole
321 Butylated hydroxytoluene
310 Propylgallate
$307 \alpha$-Tocopherol
$200 \mathrm{mg} / \mathrm{kg}$
$200 \mathrm{mg} / \mathrm{kg}$
$200 \mathrm{mg} / \mathrm{kg}$
$200 \mathrm{mg} / \mathrm{kg}$
$200 \mathrm{mg} / \mathrm{kg}$
$750 \mathrm{mg} / \mathrm{kg}$

Products described under 2.1.7]

Japan
Japan proposes to add:
300 Ascorbic acid
301 Sodium ascorbate

305 Ascorbyl stearate
306 Mixed Tocopherols concentrate
307 Alpha-Tocopharols

## Mexico

We agree with the removal of the square brackets in section 3.6. As well as including the mixed tocopherols with a maximum fat level of $300 \mathrm{mg} / \mathrm{kg}$.

## Spain

Their use is not justified in technological terms in the products described in 2.1.7. The IDA of butylated hydroxytoluene, butylated hydroxyanisole and tertiary butylhydroquine is very low and the proposed doses are high. In any case, they should be expressed in terms of the fat content of the product.
3.7 COLOURS (for decoration purpose only)

| 175 | Gold | Limited by GMP <br> Limited by GMP | Products described <br> under 2.1 to 2.4 |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |

Japan
Especially we need a lot of colours for white chocolate. Please make reference to our recommended list. We propose to add:
100 Curcumins
101(i) Riboflavin
101(ii) Riboflavin 5'-phosphate, sodium
102 Tartrazine
110 Sunset Yellow
120 Cochineal (Carmines)
127 Erythrosine
140 Chlorophills
150a-d Caramel
160a Carotenes
160b Annato extracts
160c Paprika oleoresins
162 Beet red
163 Antocyanins
Thailand
Codex should recommend JECFA to evaluate ADI for Food Additives as follows:

### 3.7 Colours:

175 Gold
174 Silver

### 3.8 Bulking agents

1200 Polydextrose $\quad$ Limited by GMP Products described under 2.1 to 2.4

Japan
Japan proposes to add:
Inulin

Spain
The use of Polydextrose is not justified in technological terms in the products described in 2.1 and 2.4. They should only be used in "reduced energy value" or "no added sugar" products.


## Spain

Section 4.3: The maximum level of Lead should be the same for all products, i.e., $1 \mathrm{mg} / \mathrm{kg}$. The exception for sugar-free products is not justified.

## 5. HYGIENE

5.1 It is recommended that the products covered by the provisions of this standard be prepared and handled in accordance with the appropriate sections of the Recommended International Code of Practice - General Principles of Food Hygiene (CAC/RCP 1-1969, Rev.3-1997, Codex Alimentarius Volume 1B), and other Codes of Practice recommended by the Codex Alimentarius Commission which are relevant to these products.
5.2 To the extent possible in good manufacturing practice, the products shall be free from objectionable matter.
5.3 When tested by appropriate methods of sampling and examination, the product :
a) shall be free from microorganisms in amounts which may represent a hazard to health;
b) shall be free from parasites which represent a hazard to health; and
c) shall not contain any substance originating from microorganisms in amount which represent a hazard to health.

No comments
Secretariat's Note: The Committee is invited to use the new wording adopted by the Commission (see CX/CPC 00/2, A.4)

## 6. LABELLING

In addition to the General Standard for the Labelling of Prepackaged Foods (CODEX STAN 1-1985 (Rev. 1-1991), Codex Alimentarius, Volume 1A), the following declarations shall be made:

## Mexico

We request that the Codex Alimentarius Commission evaluates the feasibility of using precautionary labelling when the products covered by this document contain ethyl alcohol or alcoholic beverages.

### 6.1 NAME OF THE FOOD

6.1.1 Products described under Sections 2.1 to 2.4 of this Standard and complying with the appropriate requirements of the relevant section shall be designated according to the name listed in Section 2 under subsequent section and subject to the provisions under Section 6 of this Standard.
No comments
[6.1.2 If the amount of any edible foodstuff added in accordance with the Section 2.1 of this Standard is equal or higher than $5 \% \mathrm{~m} / \mathrm{m}$ of the weight of the product, a reference to these foodstuff or foodstuffs shall be included in the designation of the chocolate.
When sugar is fully substituted with sweeteners, an appropriate declaration should be included in the designation of the chocolate.

Example: X chocolate sweetened with aspartame.]

## Cuba

In 6.1.2, we feel that the declaration of sweeteners used instead of sugar is correct.

## Mexico

We agree with the removal of the square brackets in section 6.1.2., and we suggest the use of a general provision with regard to the use of precautionary labelling when sweeteners are used.
Spain
We propose adding a new paragraph to section 6.1.2. "In chocolate products containing vegetable fats other than cocoa butter, the following mention should appear on its labelling in visible and clearly legible script: 'Contains vegetable fats as well as cocoa butter'. This message should appear in the same visual field as the list of ingredients, clearly differentiated from said list, in script of at least the same size, in bold print and close to the selling name; despite this requirement, the selling name may also appear elsewhere."
The word sweetened should always be included when sugar is completely or partially substituted in chocolate.
Likewise, the words "reduced energy value" or "no added sugar" should appear for all products containing intensive sweeteners or Polyols.

## United Kingdom

6.1.2 - declaration of edible substances, the wording should be changed for additions higher (rather equal to or higher than) than $5 \%$.

### 6.1.3 Cocoa Butter Confectionery / White Chocolate

Product described under Section 2.1.7 of this Standard and complying with the appropriate requirements of this Section shall be designated "Cocoa Butter Confectionery". In those countries where the name "White Chocolate" is widely used, the use of this name is permitted.

## Spain

In the first line, the phrase: "...Section 2.1.7...", should be replaced by: "...Section 2.1.8...",

## Thailand

Under section 6.1.3 amend "Product described under Section 2.1.7" to " Product described under Section 2.1.8" (see Section 2.1.7 $\rightarrow$ error in the English standard's text).

### 6.1.4 Filled Chocolate

6.1.4.1 Products described under Section 2.3. shall be designated "X Filled Chocolate", "Chocolate with X Filling" or "Chocolate with $X$ centre" where " $X$ " is descriptive of the nature of the filling.
6.1.4.2 The type of chocolate used in the external coating may be specified, whereby the designations used shall be the same as stated under Section 6.1.1 of this Standard.
6.1.4.3 An appropriate statement shall inform the consumer about the nature of the centre.

Japan
We propose to delete sections from "6.1.4. Filled Chocolate" to "6.1.6. Assorted Chocolate" consistent with our earlier recommendations (see under "General reflections on the standard itself).
Spain
Section 6.1.4.1.: We propose replacing the phrase "Chocolate with $X$ " (Chocolate con X) with "Chocolate with X centre"(Chocolate con interior de X) where $X$ is a description of the nature of the filling.

Section 6.1.4.2.: In the first line, we propose replacing the word "coating" (revestimiento) with "covering" (recubrimiento).

### 6.1.5 A chocolate

Products in a single mouthful size described under Section 2.4.1 of this Standard shall be designated " $\mathbf{A}$
Chocolate" or "Praline".
No comments

### 6.1.6 Assorted Chocolates

Where the products described under Section 2.1, 2.2, 2.3 or 2.4 , with exception of chocolate a la taza, are sold in assortments, the product name may be replaced by the words "Assorted Chocolates" or "Assorted filled Chocolates", "Assorted Vermicelli", etc. In that case, there shall be a single list of ingredients for all the products in the assortment or alternatively lists of ingredients by products.
Spain
We propose modifying the term "Assorted Vermicelli" (Chocolates en grano surtidos) with "Assorted Vermicelli" (Fideos de chocolate surtidos).

### 6.1.7 Other Information Required

6.1.7.1 Any characterizing flavour, other than chocolate flavour shall be in the designation of the product.
6.1.7.2 Ingredients which are especially aromatic and characterize the product shall form part of the name of the product (e.g. Mocca Chocolate).

No comments

### 6.1.8 Use of the Term Chocolate

Products not defined under this Standard, and where the taste is derived from non-fat cocoa solids, can carry the term "chocolate" in their designations in accordance with custom and this to designate other products which cannot be confused with those defined in this Standard.

Brazil
We suggest to eliminate the brackets, maintaining the text.

## Cuba

In accordance with the use of the term chocolate as expressed here.

## Mexico

We agree with the removal of the square brackets in section 6.1.8. provided those products using the word chocolate, and which do not comply with the composition established in section 2, insert the word "flavoured" ("sabor a/de") after the word chocolate to read "chocolate flavoured" ("sabor a/de chocolate").

Spain
As we are in agreement with the content of section 6.1.8., we propose removing the square brackets.

## United Kingdom

Insert new section 6.1.9:
6.1.9 Where vegetable fats have been added in accordance with Section 2.1 to the chocolate products in Sections 2.1, 2.2 and 2.4.2.1 and 2.4.2.2, the shall bear a clearly visible statement "contains vegetable fats other than cocoa butter".

### 6.2 Declaration of Minimum Cocoa Content

Products described under Section 2.1 of this Standard shall carry a declaration of cocoa solids except that governments of countries in which different names are used to differentiate the products may allow for no declaration. For the purpose of this declaration, the percentages declared shall be made after the deduction of the other permitted edible foodstuffs.

## Japan

We propose to delete this section.
Spain
The provision whereby governments may allow for non-declaration of the cocoa solids content should be deleted. Therefore, we propose the deletion of the following phrase: "...except that governments of countries in which different names are used to differentiate the products may allow for no declaration."

### 6.3 Net Contents

Small units of up to 50 g may be exempted from a declaration of net weight on the label.
Spain
We do not agree with the content of this section, therefore we propose it should be deleted.

### 6.4 Labelling of Non-Retail Containers

Information required in Section 6 of this Standard and Section 4 of the Codex General Standard for the Labelling of Prepackaged Foods shall be given either on the container or in accompanying documents, except that the name of the product, lot identification, and the name and address of the manufacturer or packer shall appear on the container. However, lot identification, and the name and address of the manufacturer or packer may be replaced by an identification mark provided that such a mark is clearly identifiable with the accompanying documents.

No comments

## 7. METHODS OF ANALYSIS

### 7.1 DETERMINATION OF ARSENIC

According to AOAC 952.13 (Codex general method).

### 7.2 Determination of Centre and Coating in Composite and Filled Chocolate

All methods approved for the chocolate type used for the coating and those approved for the type of centre concerned.

### 7.3 Determination of Cocoa Butter

According to AOAC 963.15 or IOCCC 14-1972.

### 7.4 Determination of Copper

According to AOAC 971.20 (Codex general method) or AOAC 960.40 (Codex general method).

### 7.5 Determination of Fat-Free Cocoa Solid

According to AOAC 931.05.

### 7.6 Determination of Fat-Free Milk Solids

According to IOCCC 17-1973 or AOAC 939.02.

### 7.7 DETERMINATION OF LEAD

According to AOAC 986.15 (Codex general method).

### 7.8 Determination of Milk Fat

According to IOCCC 8 i (1962) or AOAC 945.34, 925.41B, 920.80.

### 7.9 Determination of Moisture

According to IOCCC 26-1988 or AOAC 977.04. (Karl Fischer method); or AOAC 931.04 or IOCCC 11952 (gravimetry).
7.10 Determination of Sugars

According to AOAC 980.13.

### 7.11 Determination of Total Ash

According to AOAC 972.15.

### 7.12 Determination of Total Fat

According to AOAC 963.15.
No comments

