

codex alimentarius commission



FOOD AND AGRICULTURE
ORGANIZATION
OF THE UNITED NATIONS

WORLD
HEALTH
ORGANIZATION



JOINT OFFICE: Viale delle Terme di Caracalla 00153 ROME Tel: 39 06 57051 www.codexalimentarius.net Email: codex@fao.org Facsimile: 39 06 5705 4593

Agenda Item 5(a)

CX/FA 08/40/5 Add.2

April 2008

(Original language only)

JOINT FAO/WHO FOOD STANDARDS PROGRAMME

CODEX COMMITTEE ON FOOD ADDITIVES

Fortieth Session

Beijing, China, 21-25 April 2008

REPORT OF THE ELECTRONIC WORKING GROUP ON THE GSFA

COMMENTS

The following comments have been received from China, European Community, Norway and IADSA

China

We would like to thank the USA for chairing this electronic Working Group and for the hard work in drafting this document and we are pleased to provide the comments as follows:

Miscellaneous:

General comments:

China suggests that to agree on a clear definition and the scope of the word “plain” which appears in various food categories. Whether sweeteners and other food additives are needed in “plain” food products? For example, the eWG recommends that to adopt Polysorbates in 01.4.1 Pasteurized cream (plain), but discontinue DATEM, which has the same function (emulsifier), to be used in the 01.4.1 Pasteurized cream (plain). It is necessary to make a consistent opinion to the different food additive provisions with same functions.

Specific comments:

China suggests the following food additive provisions can be discussed in GSFA.

Food Additive	Food Cat no. & Category	Max level	Comments from eWG	Justification from eWG	Comments from China
DATEM, INS 472(e)	01.4 Cream (plain) and the like	5000 mg/kg	discontinue at step 6	Sub category 01.4.1 (pasteurized cream (plain)) would not be expected to need an emulsifier	adopted, China approved its use as GMP in Cream.
Polysorbates, INS 432, 433, 435, 436	06.8 soybean products	50 mg/kg (level calculated based on per 1kg soyaben)	No provision in GSFA		Add the provision in GSFA for further discussion. China approved its use as an emulsifier to minimize sedimentation and improve the texture
Polysorbates, INS 432, 433, 435, 436	14.1.2 Fruit and vegetable juice 14.1.3 Fruit and vegetable nectars	750 mg/kg	No provision in GSFA		Add the provision in GSFA for further discussion. China approved its use as an emulsifier in the liquid phase to minimize sedimentation

Aluminium containing additives:

Regarding the inclusion of maximum levels for aluminium containing additives in the General Standard for Food Additives, we are pleased to provide the comments as follows:

We agree that when establishing the maximum levels for aluminium containing additives, technological needs of these additives should be taken into account. Since Joint FAO/WHO Expert Committee on Food Additives (JECFA) has established a new provisional tolerable weekly intake (PTWI) for aluminium at 1 mg/kg bw, for the sake of public health, we agree that the maximum use levels for aluminium containing additives limited by good manufacturing practice (GMP) should be reconsidered and all aluminium containing additives should be expressed in numerical values.

Aluminium containing additives have been widely used in many foods. In general, foods containing the highest concentration of aluminium are those that contain aluminium additives. According to the sixty-seventh meeting of JECFA report, estimated range of mean exposure of the adult population to aluminium from overall diet, including additives is about 14-280 mg/week, which accounted for 20-500% PTWI in a 60-kg adult. It is therefore important to limit and reduce the use of various aluminium containing additives as far as possible. The use of other alternatives, if available, e.g. aluminium free baking powder and anti-caking agent, should be encouraged, and the uses of aluminium containing additives should be limited to those food categories without available alternatives.

Apart from technological needs, the frequency and the amount of food with aluminium containing additives being consumed by the general population should also be considered when establishing the maximum levels. For example, if the maximum level of an aluminium containing additive is set at 10000 mg/kg (as aluminium) for various bakery products, the intake of aluminium for a 60-kg adult consuming only 0.857 g of such products with maximum level of additive daily will reach the PTWI. Hence, maximum levels for aluminium containing additives should be set at low levels in foods which are consumed in considerable amount by the population frequently. In some cases, if the technological need could not be achieved at the proposed levels, it is advised to use other alternatives.

As a number of aluminium containing additives can be used in food with different technological functions, the maximum levels for various aluminium containing additives should be considered as a whole and expressed as total aluminium, disregard their technological functions.

Sweeteners:

For sweeteners, China suggests add the following provisions to related additives:

Food Additive	Food Cat no. & Category	Max level	Comments from eWG	Justification from eWG	Comments from China
Acesulfame Potassium (INS: 950)	01.1.2 Dairy-based drinks, flavoured and/or fermented (e.g., chocolate milk, cocoa, eggnog, drinking yoghurt, whey-based drinks) 14.1.2 Fruit and vegetable juices 14.1.4 Water-based flavoured drinks, including "sport", "energy", or "electrolyte" drinks and particulated drinks 14.1.5 Coffee, coffee substitutes, tea, herbal infusions, and other hot cereal and grain beverages, excluding cocoa	500mg/kg			Justification: Owing to its good stability in liquids and during pasteurization acesulfame K is widely used in beverages of all types in Chinese market, ready-to-drink as well as concentrates. An ML of 500mg/kg is technologically needed.)
Aspartame (INS:951)	01.1.2 Dairy-based drinks, flavoured and/or fermented (e.g., chocolate milk, cocoa, eggnog, drinking yoghurt, whey-based drinks) 01.7 Dairy-based desserts (e.g., pudding, fruit or flavoured yoghurt) 14.1.2 Fruit and vegetable juices 14.1.4 Water-based flavoured drinks, including "sport", "energy", or "electrolyte" drinks and particulated drinks 14.1.5 Coffee, coffee substitutes, tea, herbal infusions, and other hot cereal and grain beverages, excluding	2000mg/kg			(Justification: Owing to its good stability in liquids and during pasteurization aspartame is widely used in beverages of all types in Chinese market, ready-to-drink as well as concentrates. An ML of 2000mg/kg is technologically needed.)

Cyclamic Acid, (and Na, K, Ca salts) (INS:952)	cocoa 01.1.2 Dairy-based drinks, flavoured and/or fermented (e.g., chocolate milk, cocoa, eggnog, drinking yoghurt, whey-based drinks) 14.1.2 Fruit and vegetable juices 14.1.4 Water-based flavoured drinks, including "sport", "energy", or "electrolyte" drinks and particulated drinks 14.1.5 Coffee, coffee substitutes, tea, herbal infusions, and other hot cereal and grain beverages, excluding cocoa	650mg/kg			(Justification: Owing to its good stability in liquids and during pasteurization cyclamic acid (and Na, K, Ca salts) is widely used in beverages of all types in Chinese market, ready-to-drink as well as concentrates. An ML of 650mg/kg is technologically needed.)
Sucralose (INS:955)	01.1.2 Dairy-based drinks, flavoured and/or fermented (e.g., chocolate milk, cocoa, eggnog, drinking yoghurt, whey-based drinks) 14.1.2 Fruit and vegetable juices 14.1.4 Water-based flavoured drinks, including "sport", "energy", or "electrolyte" drinks and particulated drinks 14.1.5 Coffee, coffee substitutes, tea, herbal infusions, and other hot cereal and grain beverages, excluding cocoa	300mg/kg			Owing to its good stability in liquids and during pasteurization sucralose is widely used in beverages of all types in Chinese market, ready-to-drink as well as concentrates. An ML of 300mg/kg is technologically needed.
Neotame (INS:961)	14.1.4 Water-based flavoured drinks, including "sport", "energy", or "electrolyte" drinks and particulated drinks	30mg/kg			Owing to its good stability in liquids and during pasteurization neotame is used in water-based flavoured drinks in Chinese market. An ML of 30mg/kg is technologically needed.

Colours:

For the provisions of colors, China gives the following comments:

1.

Recommendation 1 – Sunset Yellow FCF, INS 110 The eWG recommends that the 40 th CCFA discontinue further work on the following food additive provisions for sunset yellow FCF in the GSFA.						
05.1.4	Cocoa and chocolate products	400	mg/kg		6	

Chocolate products may need sunset yellow to achieve desired color. A lower ML: 100mg/kg which is justified to achieve the intended technological need is suggested.

2.

Recommendation 3 - Sunset Yellow FCF, INS 110 The eWG recommends that the 40 th CCFA discuss further the following food additive provisions for sunset yellow FCF in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max	Level	Comments	Step	Justification provided to eWG
05.1.5	Imitation chocolate, chocolate substitute products	300	mg/kg		6	Suggestion to lower ML to 50 mg/kg for intake considerations

ML of 50 mg/kg is not enough to achieve the intended technological need. ML of 100mg/kg is more reasonable and feasible for technical considerations.

3.

Recommendation 2 – Ponceau 4R (Cochineal Red A), INS 124
The eWG recommends that the 40th CCFA **discontinue** further work on the following food additive provisions for ponceau 4R in the GSFA.

05.1.4	Cocoa and chocolate products	150	mg/kg		6	
--------	------------------------------	-----	-------	--	---	--

Chocolate products may need ponceau 4R to achieve desired color. A lower ML: 100mg/kg which is justified to achieve the intended technological need is suggested.

4.

Recommendation 2 – Allura Red AC, INS 129						
The eWG recommends that the 40 th CCFA discontinue further work on the following food additive provisions for allura red AC in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification provided to eWG
01.1.2	Dairy-based drinks, flavoured and/or fermented (e.g., chocolate milk, cocoa, eggnog, drinking yoghurt, whey-based drinks)	300	mg/kg		6	

Allura Red AC is widely used as a colouring agent in beverages, candy, cereals, confectionaries, deserts, ice cream. It is technically needed for the organoleptic quality of flavoured dairy-based drinks. (e.g. Strawberry flavoured milk drinks)

European Community

The European Community would like to thank the United States for the huge piece of work undertaken which is a crucial preliminary step for the revision of the GSFA. The EC would also like to express its support to the horizontal approach for the discussion of the provisions for the use of sweeteners and colours. However, the EC does not agree in all cases with the recommendations of this report and would like to offer the following comments

GENERAL COMMENT ABOUT THE CATEGORY 16:

The EC notes that a number of proposals for adoption have been included for food additives in this food category. The EC does not support these provisions. If provisions are proposed for category 16 the products must be fully defined and the food additive uses restricted to these products. In the vast majority of cases products can be covered by other food categories or as composite products (and therefore subject to carry over provisions).

ANNATTO EXTRACTS, BIXIN-BASED (INS 160b(i))

EC POSITION : The EC notes that these additives are proposed for a number of categories in which the use of colours has not been generally recognised as necessary (appendix II)

Food Cat No.	EC comments	Food Category	Max Level		Comments
01.1.2		Dairy-based drinks, flavoured and/or fermented (e.g., chocolate milk, cocoa, eggnog, drinking yoghurt, whey-based drinks)	50	mg/kg	Note 8 ¹
01.3.2	EC questions need	Beverage whiteners	50	mg/kg	Note 8
01.4.4		Cream analogues	100	mg/kg	Note 8
01.5.2		milk and cream powder analogues	100	mg/kg	Note 8
01.6.1		Unripened cheese	60	mg/kg	Note 8
01.6.2.1		Ripened cheese, incl. rind	100	mg/kg	Note 8
01.6.2.2	Level proposed seems very high	Rind of ripened cheese	100	mg/kg	Note 8
01.6.2.3		Cheese powder (for reconstitution; e.g., for cheese sauces)	50	mg/kg	Note 8
01.6.3		Whey cheese	50	mg/kg	Note 8
01.6.4.1		Plain processed cheese	80	mg/kg	Note 8
01.6.4.2		Flavoured processed cheese	100	mg/kg	Note 8
01.6.5		Cheese analogues	50	mg/kg	Note 8
01.6.6		Whey protein cheese	50	mg/kg	Note 8
01.7	Maximum level seems excessive	Dairy-based desserts (e.g., pudding, fruit or flavoured yoghurt and ice cream)	500	mg/kg	Note 8
01.8.1		Liquid whey and whey products, excluding whey cheeses	20	mg/kg	Note 8
01.8.2		Dried whey and whey products excluding whey cheeses	20	mg/kg	Note 8
02.1.1	Oppose. The use of colours in such products is unnecessary and potentially misleading to the consumer.	Butter oil, anhydrous milk fat, ghee	100	mg/kg	Note 8

¹ Note 8: As bixin.

Food Cat No.	EC comments	Food Category	Max Level		Comments
02.1.2	Oppose. The use of colours in such products is unnecessary and potentially misleading to the consumer.	Vegetable oils and fats	10	mg/kg	Note 8
02.1.3	Oppose. The use of colours in such products is unnecessary and potentially misleading to the consumer.	Lard, tallow, fish oil, and other animal fats	10	mg/kg	Note 8
02.2.1.1 ²	EC does not permit the use of annatto in butter.	butter and concentrated butter	30	mg/kg	Note 8
02.2.1.2	Maximum level seems excessive	Margarine and similar products	100	mg/kg	Note 8
02.2.1.3	EC does not permit the use of annatto in butter. Carryover from margarine	Blends of butter and margarine	10	mg/kg	Note 8
02.2.2		Emulsions containing less than 80% fat	30	mg/kg	Note 8
02.3	Maximum level seems excessive	Fat emulsions mainly of type oil-in-water, including mixed and/or flavoured products based on fat emulsions	100	mg/kg	Note 8
02.4		Fat-based desserts excluding dairy-based dessert products of food category 01.7	30	mg/kg	Note 8
03.0		Edible ices, including sherbet and sorbet	20	mg/kg	Note 8
04.1.2.3		fruit in vinegar, oil, or brine (e.g. pickled fruits)	20	mg/kg	Note 8
04.1.2.4	Need questioned use could mislead the consumer	Canned or bottled (pasteurized) fruit	20	mg/kg	Note 8
04.1.2.5		Jams, jellies, marmalades	20	mg/kg	Note 8
04.1.2.6		Fruit based spreads (e.g. Chutney) excluding products of food categories 04.1.2.5	20	mg/kg	Note 8
04.1.2.7		Candied fruit	20	mg/kg	Note 8
04.1.2.8	Need questioned use could mislead the consumer	Fruit preparation, including pulp, purees, fruit toppings and coconut milk	100	mg/kg	Note 8
04.1.2.9		Fruit-based desserts, including fruit-flavoured water-based desserts	30	mg/kg	Note 8
04.1.2.11		Fruit fillings for pastries (e.g. cherry pie filling)	50	mg/kg	Note 8
04.2.2.3		vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and seaweeds in vinegar, oil, brine, or soy sauce	20	mg/kg	Note 8
04.2.2.5		vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed purees and spreads (e.g., peanut butter)	100	mg/kg	Note 8
04.2.2.6		vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed pulps and preparations (e.g., vegetable desserts and sauces, candied vegetables) other than food category 04.2.2.5	20	mg/kg	Note 8
04.2.2.7		fermented vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweed products, excluding fermented soybean products of food category 12.10	20	mg/kg	Note 8
04.2.2.8		Cooked or fried vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and seaweeds	100	mg/kg	Note 8
05.1.1	Oppose the use of colours in such products is unnecessary and potentially misleading to consumers	Cocoa mixes (powders) and cocoa mass/cake	50	mg/kg	Note 8
05.1.2	Oppose the use of colours in such products is unnecessary and potentially misleading to	Cocoa mixes (syrups)	50	mg/kg	Note 8

² CX/FA 08/40/6 proposes to revise the GSFA food category system. If endorsed by the CCFA, food categories 02.2.1.1, 02.2.1.2 and 02.2.1.3 would be deleted.

Food Cat No.	EC comments	Food Category	Max Level		Comments
	consumers				
05.1.3	Oppose the use of colours in such products is unnecessary and potentially misleading to consumers	Cocoa-based spreads, including fillings	50	mg/kg	Note 8
05.1.4	Oppose the use of colours in such products is unnecessary and potentially misleading to consumers	Cocoa and chocolate products	25	mg/kg	Note 8
05.1.5		imitation chocolate, chocolate substitute products	25	mg/kg	Note 8
05.2.1	Level proposed seem high	Hard Candy	200	mg/kg	Note 8
05.2.2	Level proposed seem high	Soft candy	200	mg/kg	Note 8
05.2.3		Nougats and marzipans	100	mg/kg	Note 8
05.3	Level proposed seem high	Chewing gum	500	mg/kg	Note 8
05.4		Decorations (e.g. for fine bakery wares) and sweet sauces	50	mg/kg	Note 8
06.1	Oppose This is a basic foodstuff and therefore it is neither appropriate nor necessary to use colours which could also mislead consumers.	Whole, broken, or flaked grain, including rice	500	mg/kg	Note 8
06.3		Breakfast cereals, including rolled oats	75	mg/kg	Note 8
06.4.2	Oppose The addition of colours to pasta is not necessary,	Dried pastas and noodles and like products	20	mg/kg	Note 8
06.4.3	Oppose The addition of colours to pasta is not necessary, Limit to instant noodles only	Pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products	20	mg/kg	Note 8
06.5		cereal and starch based desserts (e.g., rice pudding, tapioca pudding)	30	mg/kg	Note 8
06.6		Batters (e.g., for breading or batters for fish or poultry)	100	mg/kg	Note 8
07.1.1	Oppose	Breads and rolls	200	mg/kg	Note 8
07.1.2	oppose	Crackers, excluding sweet crackers	200	mg/kg	Note 8
07.1.4	oppose	Bread-type products, including bread stuffing and bread crumbs	200	mg/kg	Note 8
07.1.5	Oppose	Steamed breads and buns	200	mg/kg	Note 8
07.1.6	Oppose	Mixes for breads and ordinary bakery wares	200	mg/kg	Note 8
07.2.1		Cakes, cookies and pies (e.g. fruit filled or custard types)- sweet types	50	mg/kg	Note 8
07.2.2		Other fine bakery products (e.g. doughnuts, sweet rolls, scones, and muffins)	50	mg/kg	Note 8
07.2.3		Mixes for fine bakery wares (e.g. cakes, pancakes)	25	mg/kg	Note 8
08.1.2	Limit to use on glazes/coatings only. Maximum level seems very high	Fresh meat, poultry and game, comminuted	100 0	mg/kg	Note 8 & B ³
08.2.2		Heat-treated processed meat, poultry, and game products in whole pieces or cut	100	mg/kg	Note 8
08.3.1.1	Level proposed is excessive	Cured (including salted) non-heat treated products	100 0	mg/kg	Note 8
08.3.1.2		Cured (including salted) and dried non-heat treated products	100	mg/kg	Note 8
08.3.1.3		Fermented non-heat treated products	100	mg/kg	Note 8
08.3.2		Heat-treated processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	50	mg/kg	Note 8
08.3.3		Frozen processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products as in 8.3.1 and 8.3.2	25	mg/kg	Note 8
08.4	Level seems high	Edible casings (e.g. sausage casings)	100 0	mg/kg	Note 8 & C ⁴

³ **Note B:** For use in loganiza (fresh, uncured sausages) only.

Food Cat No.	EC comments	Food Category	Max Level	Comments
9.1	Oppose The use of colours in fresh fish is not necessary and could mislead the consumer	Fresh fish and fish products, including molluscs, crustaceans, and echinoderms	25 mg/kg	Note 8
09.2.1	The use of colours in unprocessed frozen fish is not necessary and could mislead the consumer	Frozen fish, fish fillets, and fish products, including molluscs, crustaceans, and echinoderms	25 mg/kg	Note 8
09.2.2	In batter portion only	Frozen battered fish, fish fillets and fish products, including molluscs, crustaceans, and echinoderms	50 mg/kg	Note 8
09.2.3		Frozen minced and creamed fish products, including mollusks	50 mg/kg	Note 8
09.2.4		Cooked and/or fried fish and fish products, including molluscs, crustaceans, and echinoderms	50 mg/kg	Note 8
09.2.5		Smoked, dried, fermented, and/or salted fish and fish products, including molluscs, crustaceans, and echinoderms	15 mg/kg	Note 8
09.3.1		Fish and fish products, including molluscs, crustaceans, and echinoderms, marinated and/or in jelly	25 mg/kg	Note 8
09.3.2		Fish and fish products, including molluscs, crustaceans, and echinoderms, pickled and/or in brine	25 mg/kg	Note 8
09.3.3		Salmon substitutes, caviar and other fish roe products	50 mg/kg	Note 8
09.3.4		Semi-preserved fish and fish products, including molluscs, crustaceans, and echinoderms (e.g., fish paste), excluding products of food categories 09.3.1 - 09.3.3	30 mg/kg	Note 8
09.4		Fully preserved including canned or fermented fish and fish products	25 mg/kg	Note 8
10.4		Egg-based desserts	25 mg/kg	Note 8
11.3	Oppose technological need is questioned	Sugar solutions and syrups, also (partially) inverted, including treacle and molasses, excluding products of food category 11.1.3	25 mg/kg	Note 8
11.4	Oppose technological need is questioned	Other sugars and syrups (e.g., xylose, maple syrup, sugar toppings)	25 mg/kg	Note 8
12.2	Oppose in broader category	Herbs, spices, seasonings, and condiments (e.g., seasoning for instant noodles)	50 mg/kg	Note 8
12.2.2		Seasonings and Condiments	200 mg/kg	Note 8
12.4		mustards	50 mg/kg	Note 8
12.5		Soups and broths	50 mg/kg	Note 8
12.6.1		Emulsified sauces (e.g. mayonnaise, and salad dressing)	100 mg/kg	Note 8
12.6.2		Non-emulsified sauces (e.g., ketchup, cheese sauce, cream sauce, brown gravy)	100 mg/kg	Note 8
12.6.3		Mixes for sauces and gravies	100 mg/kg	Note 8
12.6.4	Level proposed seems high	Clear sauces (e.g. fish sauce)	400 mg/kg	Note 8
12.7		salads (e.g., macaroni salad, potato salad) and sandwich spreads excluding cocoa- and nut-based spreads of food categories 04.2.2.5 and 05.1.3	50 mg/kg	Note 8
12.9.1.1		Soybean beverages	15 mg/kg	Note 8
12.9.3.2		Deep fried semi-dehydrated bean curd	10 mg/kg	Note 8
12.9.5		Other protein products	50 mg/kg	Note 8
13.3		Dietetic foods for special medical purposes	20 mg/kg	Note 8
13.4		Dietetic formulae for slimming purposes and weight reduction	20 mg/kg	Note 8
13.5		Dietetic foods (e.g., supplementary foods for dietary use) excluding products of food categories 13.1- 13.4 and 13.6	20 mg/kg	Note 8
13.6		food supplements	60 mg/kg	Note 8
14.1.4		Water-based flavoured drinks, including "sport," "energy," or "electrolyte" drinks and particulated drinks	50 mg/kg	Note 8
14.2.3.2	oppose	Sparkling and semi-sparkling grape wines	10 mg/kg	Note 8
14.2.3.3	oppose	Fortified grape wine, grape liquor wine, and sweet grape wine	20 mg/kg	Note 8

⁴ **Note C:** Use level in sausage casings; residue in sausage prepared with such casings should not exceed 100 mg/kg.

Food Cat No.	EC comments	Food Category	Max Level		Comments
14.2.4		wines (other than grape)	20	mg/kg	Note 8
14.2.6		distilled spirituous beverages containing more than 15% alcohol	30	mg/kg	Note 8
14.2.7		aromatized alcoholic beverages (e.g., beer, wine and spirituous cooler-type beverages, low alcoholic refreshers)	30	mg/kg	Note 8
15.1		Snacks - potato, cereal, flour or starch based (from roots and tubers, pulses and legumes)	50	mg/kg	Note 8
15.2		Processed nuts, including coated nuts and nut mixtures (with e.g., dried fruit)	30	mg/kg	Note 8
15.3		Snacks - fish based	20	mg/kg	Note 8
16.0	Oppose Products should fit within category system or be adequately defined	composite foods - foods that could not be placed in categories 01 - 15	200	mg/kg	Note 8

ANNATTO EXTRACTS, NORBIXIN-BASED (INS 160b(ii))

EC POSITION: Bearing in mind the very low numerical ADI (0-0.6 ppm) for Annatto-norbixin based recently established at the 67th JECFA and considering the large number of uses and MLs proposed hereafter, the EC is concerned about a potential exceedance of the ADI. The EC therefore recommends that all the proposed uses and MLs should be reviewed in order to address this potential intake issue.

EC general comment: The EC notes that these additives are proposed for a number of categories in which the use of colours has not been generally recognised as necessary (appendix II)

Food Cat No.	EC comments	Food Category	Max Level		Comments
01.1.2		Dairy-based drinks, flavoured and/or fermented (e.g., chocolate milk, cocoa, eggnog, drinking yoghurt, whey-based drinks)	25	mg/kg	Note X ⁵
01.4.4	Level seems high	Cream analogues	300	mg/kg	Note X
01.5.2		milk and cream powder analogues	55	mg/kg	Note X
01.6.1		Unripened cheese	60	mg/kg	Note X
01.6.2.1		Ripened cheese, incl. rind	100	mg/kg	Note X
01.6.2.2		Rind of ripened cheese	50	mg/kg	Note X
01.6.2.3		Cheese powder (for reconstitution; e.g., for cheese sauces)	50	mg/kg	Note X
01.6.3		Whey cheese	10	mg/kg	Note X
01.6.4		Processed cheese	100	mg/kg	Note X
01.6.6		Whey protein cheese	10	mg/kg	Note X
01.7		Dairy-based desserts (e.g., pudding, fruit or flavoured yoghurt and ice cream)	20	mg/kg	Note X
01.8.1		Liquid whey and whey products, excluding whey cheeses	20	mg/kg	Note X
01.8.2		Dried whey and whey products excluding whey cheeses	20	mg/kg	Note X
02.2.1.1 ⁶	EC does not permit the use of annatto in butter	butter and concentrated butter	30	mg/kg	Note X
02.2.2		Emulsions containing less than 80% fat	10	mg/kg	Note X
02.3		Fat emulsions mainly of type oil-in-water, including mixed and/or flavoured products based on fat emulsions	10	mg/kg	Note X
02.4		Fat-based desserts excluding dairy-based dessert products of food category 01.7	10	mg/kg	Note X
03.0	Maximum level seems high	Edible ices, including sherbet and sorbet	200	mg/kg	Note X
04.1.1.2		Surface-treated fresh fruit	20	mg/kg	Note X
04.1.2.4	Need questioned use could mislead the consumer	Canned or bottled (pasteurized) fruit	200	mg/kg	Note X
04.1.2.5		Jams, jellies, marmalades	20	mg/kg	Note X
04.1.2.6		Fruit based spreads (e.g. Chutney) excluding products of food categories 04.1.2.5	20	mg/kg	Note X
04.1.2.7		Candied fruit	20	mg/kg	Note X
04.1.2.8	Need questioned use could mislead the	Fruit preparation, including pulp, purees, fruit toppings and coconut milk	20	mg/kg	Notes A ⁴ & X

⁵ **Note X:** As norbixin.

⁶ CX/FA 08/40/6 proposes to revise the GSFA food category system. If endorsed by the CCFA, food categories 02.2.1.1, 02.2.1.2 and 02.2.1.3 would be deleted.

Food Cat No.	EC comments	Food Category	Max Level		Comments
	consumer				
04.1.2.9	Maximum level seems high	Fruit-based desserts, including fruit-flavoured water-based desserts	150	mg/kg	Notes B ⁸ & X
04.1.2.10	Maximum level seems high	Fermented fruit products	200	mg/kg	Note X
04.1.2.11	Maximum level seems high	Fruit fillings for pastries (e.g. cherry pie filling)	200	mg/kg	Note X
04.1.2.12	Need questioned use could mislead the consumer	Cooked fruit	20	mg/kg	Note X
04.2.2.3	Maximum levels seems high	vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and seaweeds in vinegar, oil, brine, or soy sauce	300	mg/kg	Note X
04.2.2.4	Oppose use could mislead consumer	canned or bottled (pasteurized) or retort pouch vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and seaweeds	10	mg/kg	Note X
04.2.2.5	Maximum levels seems high	vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed purees and spreads (e.g., peanut butter)	100	mg/kg	Note X
04.2.2.6		vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed pulps and preparations (e.g., vegetable desserts and sauces, candied vegetables) other than food category 04.2.2.5	10	mg/kg	Note X
04.2.2.7	Maximum levels seems high	fermented vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweed products, excluding fermented soybean products of food category 12.10	200	mg/kg	Note X
04.2.2.8	Maximum level seems high	Cooked or fried vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and seaweeds	100	mg/kg	Note X
05.1.1	Oppose the use of colours in such products is unnecessary and potentially misleading to consumers	Cocoa mixes (powders) and cocoa mass/cake	50	mg/kg	Note X
05.1.2	Oppose the use of colours in such products is unnecessary and potentially misleading to consumers	Cocoa mixes (syrups)	50	mg/kg	Note X
05.1.3	Oppose the use of colours in such products is unnecessary and potentially misleading to consumers	Cocoa-based spreads, including fillings	50	mg/kg	Note X
05.1.5		imitation chocolate, chocolate substitute products	25	mg/kg	Note X
05.2	Level proposed seems high	Confectionary including hard and soft candy, nougat, etc. other than food categories 05.1, 05.3 and 05.4	200	mg/kg	Note X
05.3	Level proposed seems very high	Chewing gum	500	mg/kg	Note X
05.4		Decorations (e.g. for fine bakery wares) and sweet sauces	1000	mg/kg	Note X
06.1	Oppose This is a basic foodstuff and therefore it is neither appropriate nor necessary to use colours which could also mislead consumers.	Whole, broken, or flaked grain, including rice	500	mg/kg	Note X
06.3		Breakfast cereals, including rolled oats	75	mg/kg	Note X
06.4.2	Oppose The addition of colours to pasta is not	Dried pastas and noodles and like products	100	mg/kg	Note X

⁷ **Note A:** Except for use in fruit sauces, fruit toppings, coconut cream, coconut milk and “fruit bars” at 50 mg/kg.

⁸ **Note B:** Except for use in jelly-type fruit-based desserts at 200 mg/kg.

Food Cat No.	EC comments	Food Category	Max Level		Comments
	necessary,				
06.4.3	Oppose The addition of colours to pasta is not necessary, Limit to instant noodles only	Pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products	100	mg/kg	Note X
06.5		cereal and starch based desserts (e.g., rice pudding, tapioca pudding)	40	mg/kg	Notes C ⁹ & X
06.6		Batters (e.g., for breading or batters for fish or poultry)	100	mg/kg	Note X
06.7	Level seems high	Pre-cooked or processed rice products, including rice cakes (Oriental type only)	500	mg/kg	Note X
06.8		Soybean products (excluding soybean products of food category 12.9 and fermented products of food category 12.10)	100	mg/kg	Note X
07.1.1	oppose	Breads and rolls	200	mg/kg	Note X
07.1.2	oppose	Crackers, excluding sweet crackers	200	mg/kg	Note X
07.1.4	oppose	Bread-type products, including bread stuffing and bread crumbs	200	mg/kg	Note X
07.1.5	oppose	Steamed breads and buns	200	mg/kg	Note X
07.1.6	oppose	Mixes for breads and ordinary bakery wares	200	mg/kg	Note X
07.2.1		Cakes, cookies and pies (e.g. fruit filled or custard types)- sweet types	50	mg/kg	Note X
07.2.2		Other fine bakery products (e.g. doughnuts, sweet rolls, scones, and muffins)	50	mg/kg	Note X
07.2.3		Mixes for fine bakery wares (e.g. cakes, pancakes)	25	mg/kg	Note X
08.1.2	Limit to sue on glazes/coatings only. Maximum level seems very high	Fresh meat, poultry and game, comminuted	1000	mg/kg	Notes D & X
08.2.2		Heat-treated processed meat, poultry, and game products in whole pieces or cut	100	mg/kg	Note X
08.3.1.1	Level is excessive	Cured (including salted) non-heat treated products	1000	mg/kg	Note X
08.3.1.2		Cured (including salted) and dried non-heat treated products	100	mg/kg	Note X
08.3.1.3		Fermented non-heat treated products	100	mg/kg	Note X
08.3.2		Heat-treated processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	50	mg/kg	Note X
08.3.3		Frozen processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products as in 8.3.1 and 8.3.2	20	mg/kg	Note X
08.4		Edible casings (e.g. sausage casings)	20	mg/kg	Notes E & X
09.2	Oppose. The use of colours in unprocessed fish is not necessary	processed fish and fish products, including molluscs, crustaceans, and echinoderms	100	mg/kg	Note X
09.3.1		Fish and fish products, including molluscs, crustaceans, and echinoderms, marinated and/or in jelly	100	mg/kg	Note X
09.3.2		Fish and fish products, including molluscs, crustaceans, and echinoderms, pickled and/or in brine	100	mg/kg	Note X
09.3.3		Salmon substitutes, caviar and other fish roe products	50	mg/kg	Notes X and F
09.3.4		Semi-preserved fish and fish products, including molluscs, crustaceans, and echinoderms (e.g., fish paste), excluding products of food categories 09.3.1 - 09.3.3	30	mg/kg	Note X
09.4		Fully preserved including canned or fermented fish and fish products	10	mg/kg	Note X
10.4		Egg-based desserts	25	mg/kg	Note X
11.3	Oppose technological need is questioned	Sugar solutions and syrups, also (partially) inverted, including treacle and molasses, excluding products of food category 11.1.3	100	mg/kg	Note X
11.4	Oppose technological need is questioned	Other sugars and syrups (e.g., xylose, maple syrup, sugar toppings)	60	mg/kg	Note X
12.2	Oppose in broader category	Herbs, spices, seasonings, and condiments (e.g., seasoning for instant noodles)	50	mg/kg	Note X
12.4		mustards	140	mg/kg	Note X
12.5	Level proposed seems high	Soups and broths	150	mg/kg	Note X
12.6.1		Emulsified sauces (e.g. mayonnaise, and salad dressing)	100	mg/kg	Note X

⁹ Note C: Except for use in cereal-based puddings at 500 mg/kg.

Food Cat No.	EC comments	Food Category	Max Level		Comments
12.6.2		Non-emulsified sauces (e.g., ketchup, cheese sauce, cream sauce, brown gravy)	100	mg/kg	Note X
12.6.3		Mixes for sauces and gravies	100	mg/kg	Note X
12.6.4	Level proposed seems high	Clear sauces (e.g. fish sauce)	400	mg/kg	Note X
12.7		salads (e.g., macaroni salad, potato salad) and sandwich spreads excluding cocoa- and nut-based spreads of food categories 04.2.2.5 and 05.1.3	50	mg/kg	Note X
12.9.1.1		Soybean beverages	15	mg/kg	Note X
12.9.1.2		Soybean milk film	10	mg/kg	Note X
12.9.1.3		Other soybean protein products (including non-fermented soy sauce)	10	mg/kg	Note X
12.9.2		Fresh bean curd (tofu)	10	mg/kg	Note X
12.9.3		Semi-dehydrated bean curd	10	mg/kg	Note X
12.9.5		Other protein products	50	mg/kg	Note X
12.10		Fermented soybean products	10	mg/kg	Note X
13.3		Dietetic foods for special medical purposes	10	mg/kg	Note X
13.4		Dietetic formulae for slimming purposes and weight reduction	10	mg/kg	Note X
13.5		Dietetic foods (e.g., supplementary foods for dietary use) excluding products of food categories 13.1- 13.4 and 13.6	10	mg/kg	Note X
13.6		food supplements	100	mg/kg	Note X
14.1.4		Water-based flavoured drinks, including "sport," "energy," or "electrolyte" drinks and particulated drinks	50	mg/kg	Note X
14.2.2		Cider and perry	10	mg/kg	Note X
14.2.3.1	oppose	Still grape wine	10	mg/kg	Note X
14.2.3.2	oppose	Sparkling and semi-sparkling grape wines	10	mg/kg	Note X
14.2.3.3	oppose	Fortified grape wine, grape liquor wine, and sweet grape wine	15	mg/kg	Note X
14.2.6		distilled spirituous beverages containing more than 15% alcohol	10	mg/kg	Note X
14.2.7		aromatized alcoholic beverages (e.g., beer, wine and spirituous cooler-type beverages, low alcoholic refreshers)	10	mg/kg	Note X
15.1		Snacks - potato, cereal, flour or starch based (from roots and tubers, pulses and legumes)	50	mg/kg	Note X
15.2		Processed nuts, including coated nuts and nut mixtures (with e.g., dried fruit)	30	mg/kg	Note X
15.3		Snacks - fish based	20	mg/kg	Note X
16.0	Oppose Products should fit within category system or be adequately defined	composite foods - foods that could not be placed in categories 01 - 15	200	mg/kg	Note X

LYCOPENE, SYNTHETIC LYCOPENE (INS 160d(i)) AND LYCOPENE FROM *BLAKESLEA TRISPORA* (INS 160d(iii))

1. The 67th JECFA (2006) established a “group” ADI of 0-0.5 mg/kg for INS 160d(i) and INS 160d(iii).

GENERAL EC COMMENT: The EC notes the relatively low ADI established for this additive by the JECFA. To this end the EC finds that many of the levels proposed in the recommendations below do not respect this low ADI and ignore the potential exceedance of the ADI which such levels could allow.

The EC considers that all the uses and levels proposed should be revised to reflect levels which are technologically necessary and also are acceptable with regard to the low ADI. In particular the EC notes that levels of 1000 mg/kg and 2000 mg/kg are extremely excessive for the technological need

As an example the recommendations below propose levels up to 1000 mg/kg for some desserts and drinks. With such levels a child of 15kg would only need to consume 7.5g of product to reach the ADI, and this would be without taking into account potential intake from more than one source. In addition to the concern of potentially exceeding the ADI the EC also considers that many of the use levels proposed are far in exceedance of those necessary to achieve the desired technological effect.

The EC notes that these additives are proposed for a number of categories in which the use of colours has not been generally recognised as necessary (Appendix II)

Recommendations – Lycopene, INS 160d(i), 160(ii)

The eWG recommends that the 40th CCFA include at Step 3 the following food additive provisions for lycopene in the GSFA.

Food Cat No.	EC comments	Food Category	Max Level		Comments
01.1.2		Dairy-based drinks, flavoured and/or fermented (e.g., chocolate milk, cocoa, eggnog, drinking yoghurt, whey-based drinks)	1000	mg/kg	
01.3.2	Need questioned	Beverage whiteners	100	mg/kg	
01.4.4		Cream analogues	1000	mg/kg	
01.5.2		milk and cream powder analogues	100	mg/kg	
01.6.1		Unripened cheese	100	mg/kg	
01.6.2.1		Ripened cheese, incl. rind	1000	mg/kg	
01.6.2.2		Rind of ripened cheese	1000	mg/kg	
01.6.2.3		Cheese powder (for reconstitution; e.g., for cheese sauces)	100	mg/kg	
01.6.3		Whey cheese	1000	mg/kg	
01.6.4.1		Plain processed cheese	100	mg/kg	
01.6.4.2		Flavoured processed cheese	2000	mg/kg	
01.6.5		Cheese analogues	1000	mg/kg	
01.6.6		Whey protein cheese	1000	mg/kg	
01.7		Dairy-based desserts (e.g., pudding, fruit or flavoured yoghurt and ice cream)	1000	mg/kg	
01.8		01.8 Whey and whey products, excluding whey cheeses	100	mg/kg	
02.1.1	oppose	Butter oil, anhydrous milkfat, ghee	100	mg/kg	
02.1.2	Oppose use of colours in such products is not necessary and could mislead the consumer.	Vegetable oils and fats	10	mg/kg	
02.1.3	Oppose use of colours in such products is not necessary and could mislead the consumer.	Lard, tallow, fish oil, and other animal fats	10	mg/kg	
02.2.1		Emulsions containing at least 80% fat	100	mg/kg	
02.2.2		Emulsions containing less than 80% fat	100	mg/kg	
02.3		Fat emulsions mainly of type oil-in-water, including mixed and/or flavoured products based on fat emulsions	100	mg/kg	
02.4		Fat-based desserts excluding dairy-based dessert products of food category 01.7	100	mg/kg	
03.0		Edible ices, including sherbet and sorbet	1000	mg/kg	
04.1.2.3		fruit in vinegar, oil, or brine (e.g. pickled fruits)	1000	mg/kg	
04.1.2.4	Oppose use could mislead consumer	Canned or bottled (pasteurized) fruit	100	mg/kg	
04.1.2.5		Jams, jellies, marmalades	1000	mg/kg	
04.1.2.6		Fruit based spreads (e.g. Chutney) excluding products of food categories 04.1.2.5	1000	mg/kg	
04.1.2.7		Candied fruit	200	mg/kg	
04.1.2.8		Fruit preparation, including pulp, purees, fruit toppings and coconut milk	100	mg/kg	
04.1.2.9		Fruit-based desserts, including fruit-flavoured water-based desserts	1000	mg/kg	
04.1.2.10		Fermented fruit products	1000	mg/kg	
04.1.2.11		Fruit fillings for pastries (e.g. cherry pie filling)	1000	mg/kg	
04.2.2.3		vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and seaweeds in vinegar, oil, brine, or soy sauce	100	mg/kg	
04.2.2.4		canned or bottled (pasteurized) or retort pouch vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and seaweeds	100	mg/kg	
04.2.2.5		vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed purees and spreads (e.g., peanut butter)	100	mg/kg	
04.2.2.6		vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed pulps and preparations (e.g., vegetable desserts and sauces, candied vegetables) other than food category 04.2.2.5	100	mg/kg	
04.2.2.7		fermented vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweed products, excluding fermented soybean products of food category 12.10	200	mg/kg	

Recommendations – Lycopene, INS 160d(i), 160(ii)					
The eWG recommends that the 40 th CCFA include at Step 3 the following food additive provisions for lycopene in the GSFA.					
Food Cat No.	EC comments	Food Category	Max Level		Comments
04.2.2.8		Cooked or fried vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and seaweeds	100	mg/kg	
05.1.4		Imitation chocolate, chocolate substitute products	1000	mg/kg	
05.1.5		imitation chocolate, chocolate substitute products	1000	mg/kg	
05.2		Confectionary including hard and soft candies, etc.	1000	mg/kg	
05.3		Chewing gum	1000	mg/kg	
05.4		Decorations (e.g. for fine bakery wares) and sweet sauces	1000	mg/kg	
06.1	oppose	Whole, broken, or flaked grain, including rice	1000	mg/kg	
06.3		Breakfast cereals, including rolled oats	1000	mg/kg	
06.4.2	Oppose	Dried pastas and noodles and like products	1000	mg/kg	
06.4.3	oppose	Pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products	1000	mg/kg	
06.5	Note A¹⁰	cereal and starch based desserts (e.g., rice pudding, tapioca pudding)	150	mg/kg	Note A ¹¹
06.6		Batters (e.g., for breading or batters for fish or poultry)	1000	mg/kg	
06.7		Pre-cooked or processed rice products, including rice cakes (Oriental type only)	1000	mg/kg	
06.8		Soybean products (excluding soybean products of food category 12.9 and fermented products of food category 12.10)	1000	mg/kg	
07.1.1	Oppose	Breads and rolls	1000	mg/kg	
07.1.2		Crackers, excluding sweet crackers	1000	mg/kg	
07.1.4	oppose	Bread-type products, including bread stuffing and bread crumbs	1000	mg/kg	
07.1.5	oppose	Steamed breads and buns	1000	mg/kg	
07.1.6	Oppose except for mixes for 07.1.2	Mixes for breads and ordinary bakery wares	1000	mg/kg	
7.2		Fine bakery wares (sweet, salty, savoury) and mixes	1000	mg/kg	
08.2.2		Heat-treated processed meat, poultry, and game products in whole pieces or cut	1000	mg/kg	
08.3		Processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	1000	mg/kg	
08.4		Edible casings (e.g. sausage casings)	1000	mg/kg	
09.2.2	In coating only	Frozen battered fish, fish fillets and fish products, including molluscs, crustaceans, and echinoderms	1000	mg/kg	
09.2.3		Frozen minced and creamed fish products, including mollusks	1000	mg/kg	
09.2.4		Cooked and/or fried fish and fish products, including molluscs, crustaceans, and echinoderms	1000	mg/kg	
09.2.5		Smoked, dried, fermented, and/or salted fish and fish products, including molluscs, crustaceans, and echinoderms	100	mg/kg	
09.3.1		Fish and fish products, including molluscs, crustaceans, and echinoderms, marinated and/or in jelly	1000	mg/kg	
09.3.3		Salmon substitutes, caviar and other fish roe products	1000	mg/kg	
09.3.4		Semi-preserved fish and fish products, including molluscs, crustaceans, and echinoderms (e.g., fish paste), excluding products of food categories 09.3.1 - 09.3.3	100	mg/kg	
09.4	Justification relates to restoring the colour in sauce, this should be treated as a carryover from the sauce and is therefore not necessary in this category.	Fully preserved including canned or fermented fish and fish products	30	mg/kg	Note B ¹²
10.4		Egg-based desserts	1000	mg/kg	
11.4	Oppose Question need in these products	Other sugars and syrups (e.g., xylose, maple syrup, sugar toppings)	1000	mg/kg	

¹⁰ **Note A:** Except for use in cereal-based puddings at 1000 mg/kg.

¹¹ **Note A:** Except for use in cereal-based puddings at 1000 mg/kg.

¹² **Note B:** For use in tomato-based sauces only.

Recommendations – Lycopene, INS 160d(i), 160(ii)					
The eWG recommends that the 40 th CCFA include at Step 3 the following food additive provisions for lycopene in the GSFA.					
Food Cat No.	EC comments	Food Category	Max Level		Comments
12.2	Oppose in broader category Excessive level	Herbs, spices, seasonings, and condiments (e.g., seasoning for instant noodles)	1000	mg/kg	
12.4		mustards	300	mg/kg	
12.5		soups and broths	1000	mg/kg	
12.6		Sauces and like products	1000	mg/kg	
12.7		salads (e.g., macaroni salad, potato salad) and sandwich spreads excluding cocoa- and nut-based spreads of food categories 04.2.2.5 and 05.1.3	1000	mg/kg	
12.9.1		Soybean protein products	1000	mg/kg	
12.9.2		Fresh bean curd (tofu)	1000	mg/kg	
12.9.3		Semi-dehydrated bean curd	1000	mg/kg	
12.9.5		Other protein products	1000	mg/kg	
12.10		Fermented soybean products	1000	mg/kg	
13.3		Dietetic foods for special medical purposes	1000	mg/kg	
13.4		Dietetic formulae for slimming purposes and weight reduction	1000	mg/kg	
13.5		Dietetic foods (e.g., supplementary foods for dietary use) excluding products of food categories 13.1- 13.4 and 13.6	1000	mg/kg	
13.6	Very excessive level	food supplements	50000	mg/kg	
14.1.2	Oppose Potential to mislead the consumer	Fruit and vegetable juices	1000	mg/kg	Note 127 ¹³
14.1.3.1	Oppose Potential to mislead the consumer	Canned or bottled (pasteurized) fruit nectar	1000	mg/kg	
14.1.3.2	Oppose Potential to mislead the consumer	Canned or bottled vegetable nectar	1000	mg/kg	
14.1.3.3	Oppose Potential to mislead the consumer	Concentrate (liquid or solid) for fruit nectar	1000	mg/kg	Note 127
14.1.3.4	Oppose Potential to mislead the consumer	Concentrate (liquid or solid) for vegetable nectar	1000	mg/kg	Note 127
14.1.4		Water-based flavoured drinks, including "sport," "energy," or "electrolyte" drinks and particulated drinks	1000	mg/kg	
14.1.5	Oppose Use of colours in basic products such as coffee and tea is in appropriate. Potential to restrict use to ready to drink products	Coffee, coffee substitutes, tea, herbal infusions, and other hot cereal and grain beverages, excluding cocoa	1000	mg/kg	
14.2.2		cider and perry	200	mg/kg	
14.2.4		wines (other than grape)	1000	mg/kg	
14.2.5		Mead	1000	mg/kg	
14.2.6		distilled spirituous beverages containing more than 15% alcohol	1000	mg/kg	
14.2.7		aromatized alcoholic beverages (e.g., beer, wine and spirituous cooler-type beverages, low alcoholic refreshers)	1000	mg/kg	
15.0		Ready-to-eat savouries	1000	mg/kg	
16.0	Oppose Products should fit within category system or be adequately defined should recourse to category 16 be required	composite foods - foods that could not be placed in categories 01 - 15	1000	mg/kg	

GUM ARABIC (ACACIA GUM) (INS 414)

2. The 35th JECFA (1989) established an ADI of “not specified” for INS 414.

Food Cat No.	EC comments	Food Category	Max Level		Comments
01.2	Opposed the EC considers that no additives are necessary in such	Fermented and renneted milk products (plain), excluding food		GMP	

¹³ **Note 127:** As served to the consumer.

Food Cat No.	EC comments	Food Category	Max Level	Comments
	products which are unflavoured and not heat treated	category 01.1.2 (dairy-based drinks)		
01.4.1	Opposed only a limited number of additives are necessary in plain cream [MS to reflect]	Pasteurized cream (plain)	GMP	
01.4.2	EC agrees	Sterilized and UHT creams, whipping and whipped creams, and reduced fat creams (plain)	GMP	
02.2.1.1 ¹⁴	Opposed butter is a simple food product to which additives are not necessary. Use could mislead the consumer in relation to a quality product such as butter.	Butter and concentrated butter	GMP	
06.4.1	Opposed This additive is not technologically necessary in fresh pasta	Fresh pastas and noodles and like products	GMP	
06.4.2	Only in instant noodles. Not necessary in pasta	Dried pastas and noodles and like products	GMP	
08.1.2	Opposed the use of additives in such unprocessed foods could mislead consumers	Fresh meat, poultry and game, comminuted	GMP	
11.5	Opposed. Honey is a natural product, addition of additives is not necessary. Use could mislead the consumer in relation to a quality product such as honey.	Honey	GMP	
12.2.1	EC agrees	Herbs and spices	GMP	Note 151
13.1	Oppose Direct relationship with commodity standard (which has only recently been revised)	Infant formulae, follow-up formulae, and formulae for special medical purposes for infants	GMP	
13.2	Should be aligned with the relevant commodity standard (processed cereal based foods where numerical level is given)	Complementary foods for infants and young children	GMP	
14.1.2	Opposed Use could mislead the consumer in relation to a quality product such as fruit juice.	Fruit and vegetable juices	GMP	
14.1.3	Opposed	Fruit and vegetable nectars	GMP	
14.1.5	This additive is not necessary in basic tea and coffee (if maintained add footnote only in ready to drink /overly processed products)	Coffee, coffee substitutes, tea, herbal infusions, and other hot cereal and grain beverages, excluding cocoa	GMP	
14.2.3	Opposed	Grape wines	GMP	

FOOD ADDITIVES CONTAINING ALUMINIUM (ALUMINIUM AMMONIUM SULFATE (INS 523), SODIUM ALUMINIUM PHOSPHATES (541(i), 541(ii)), SODIUM ALUMINOSILICATE (INS 554), CALCIUM ALUMINIUM SILICATE (INS 556), AND ALUMINIUM SILICATE (INS 559))

3. The 67th JECFA (2006) established a new provisional tolerable weekly intake (PTWI) of 1 mg/kg for aluminum from all sources, including food additives.

EC POSITION: The European Community can not take a definite position on the revision of uses of the above mentioned Aluminium-based food additives at this stage, as a re-evaluation of all aluminium-based food additives is currently being performed by the European Food Safety Agency (EFSA). However, the EC considers that the proposed levels in the draft recommendations could lead to an exceedance in the newly recommended PTWI for aluminium established at the 67th JECFA meeting and this needs to be actively reflected upon by the CCFA.

SULPHITES (INS 220, 221, 222, 223, 224, 225, 227, 228, 539)

4. The 28th CAC has adopted several provisions in the GSFA for the use of sulfites.

¹⁴ CX/FA 08/40/6 proposes to revise the GSFA food category system. If endorsed by the CCFA, food categories 02.2.1.1, 02.2.1.2 and 02.2.1.3 would be deleted.

5. The 22nd JECFA (1978) assigned a group ADI of 0.7 mg/kg bw/d for sulfites (Sulfur Dioxide (220), Sodium Sulfite (221), Sodium Hydrogen Sulfite (222), Sodium Metabisulfite (223), Potassium Metabisulfite (224), Potassium Sulfite (225), Calcium Hydrogen Sulfite (227), Potassium Hydrogen Sulfite (228), and Sodium Thiosulfate (539).

6. The 29th CCFAC requested that JECFA perform intake estimates for sulfites based on the pending levels of maximum use in the GSFA. The 51st JECFA (1998) concluded that the mean intake calculated using the maximum levels of use in the GSFA and national food consumption data exceeded the ADI of 0-0.7 mg/kg bw for the three Members that submitted such data. In national data submitted by six Members, estimates of mean intake of sulfites did not exceed the ADI. The potential exists for consumers of high levels of sulfites to exceed the ADI, but the available data were insufficient to estimate the number of such consumers or the magnitude and duration of intake above the ADI.

Recommendation 1 - Sulphites, INS 220, 221, 222, 223, 224, 225, 227, 228, 539						
The eWG recommends that the 40 th CCFA adopt the following food additive provisions for sulphites in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level	Units	Comments	Step	EC COMMENTS
04.1.2.5	jams, jellies and marmelades	100	mg/kg	Note 44	6	EC agrees.
04.1.2.10	fermented fruit products	100	mg/kg	Note 44	3	

Recommendation 2 – Sulphites, INS 220, 221, 222, 223, 224, 225, 227, 228, 539						
The eWG recommends that the 40 th CCFA further discuss the following food additive provisions for sulphites in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level	Units	Comments	Step	EC COMMENTS
04.1.2.9	fruit-based desserts, including fruit-flavoured water-based desserts	750	mg/kg	Note 44 ¹⁵	6	The European Community supports a level of 100 mg/kg which is sufficient for the technological purpose

CALCIUM DISODIUM ETHYLENE DIAMINE TETRA-ACETATE & DISODIUM ETHYLENE DIAMINE TETRA-ACETATE (EDTAs), (INS 385 AND 386)

7. The 17th JECFA (1973) assigned a group ADI of 2.5 mg/kg bw for calcium disodium ethylene diamine tetraacetate (385) and disodium ethylene diamine tetra acetate (386) with a note stating “As calcium disodium EDTA; no excess disodium EDTA to remain in foods.”

Recommendation - EDTAs, INS 385,386						
The eWG recommends that the 40 th CCFA adopt the following food additive provisions for EDTAs in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max	Level	Comments	Step	EC COMMENTS
04.1.2.3	Fruit in vinegar, oil, or brine	250	mg/kg	Note 21 ¹⁶	3	EC opposes
04.1.2.10	Fermented fruit products	250	mg/kg	Note 21	3	EC opposes

EC POSITION: The European Community supports discontinuing the work on this provision. EDTA is assigned a low ADI and therefore, the use should be restricted. The European Community questions the technological need.

POLYSORBATES (INS 432, 433, 434, 435, 436)

8. The 28th CAC has adopted several provisions in the GSFA for the use of polysorbates.

9. The 17th JECFA (1973) assigned a group ADI for polysorbates (Polyoxyethylene (20) Sorbitan Monolaurate (432), Polyoxyethylene (20) Sorbitan Monooleate (433), Polyoxyethylene (20) Sorbitan Monopalmitate (434), Polyoxyethylene (20) Sorbitan Monostearate (435), and Polyoxyethylene (20) Sorbitan Tristearate (436)) of 25 mg/kg bw/d.

Recommendation 1 – Polysorbates, INS 432, 433, 434, 435, 436						
The eWG recommends that the 40 th CCFA discontinue further work on the following food additive provisions for polysorbates in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max	Level	Comments	Step	Justification
04.2.2.3	Vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and seaweeds in vinegar, oil, brine, or soy sauce	500	mg/kg		6	No new information received
04.2.2.4	Canned or bottled (pasteurized) or retort pouch vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and	30	mg/kg	Note 7 ¹⁷ & 100 ¹⁸	6	No new information received

¹⁵ Note 44 As residual SO₂.

¹⁶ Note 21: As anhydrous calcium disodium EDTA.

Recommendation 1 – Polysorbates, INS 432, 433, 434, 435, 436						
The eWG recommends that the 40 th CCFA discontinue further work on the following food additive provisions for polysorbates in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max	Level	Comments	Step	Justification
16.0	aloe vera), and seaweeds Composite foods - foods that could not be placed in categories 01 - 15	1000	mg/kg		6	No new information received

EC POSITION: The European Community supports recommendation 1.

Recommendation 2 - Polysorbates, INS 432, 433, 434, 435, 436						
The eWG recommends that the 40 th CCFA adopt the following food additive provisions for polysorbates in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max	Level	Comments	Step	EC COMMENTS
01.1.2	Dairy-based drinks, flavoured and/or fermented (e.g., chocolate milk, cocoa, eggnog, drinking yoghurt, whey-based drinks)	5000	mg/kg		6	EC opposes. The technological need is questioned.
01.4.1	Pasteurized cream (plain)	1000	mg/kg		3	EC opposes this additive is not needed in such basic food products.
01.4.2	Sterilized and UHT creams, whipping and whipped creams, and reduced fat creams (plain)	1000	mg/kg		3	EC opposes
01.4.3	Clotted cream (plain)	1000	mg/kg		3	EC opposes this additive is not needed in such basic food products.
01.6.1	Unripened cheese	80	mg/kg	Note 38 ¹⁹	6	EC opposes
06.4.2	Dried pastas and noodles and like products	5000	mg/kg		3	EC opposes EC questions the technological need of this additive in dried pastas and does not support this use.
07.1.1	Breads and rolls	3000	mg/kg		6	<u>Technological need is questioned in such basic food product except as carry over from fat constituent. Level therefore seems high</u>
07.1.2	Crackers, excluding sweet crackers	5000	mg/kg	Note 11 ²⁰	6	
07.1.3	Other ordinary bakery products (e.g., bagels, pita, English muffins)	3000	mg/kg	Note 11	6	
07.1.4	Bread-type products, including bread stuffing and bread crumbs	3000	mg/kg	Note 11	6	
07.1.5	Steamed breads and buns	3000	mg/kg	Note 11	6	
07.1.6	Mixes for breads and ordinary bakery wares	3000	mg/kg	Note 11	6	
07.2	Fine bakery wares (sweet, salty, savoury) and mixes	3000	mg/kg		6	
12.2.1	Herbs and spices	2000	mg/kg		6	

DIACETYLTARTARIC AND FATTY ACID ESTERS OF GLYCEROL (DATEM) (INS 472(E))

10. The 61st JECFA (2003) assigned an ADI of 50 mg/kg for INS 472(e).

Recommendations – Diacetyltartaric and Fatty Acid Esters of Glycerol (DATEM), INS 472(e)						
The eWG recommends that the 40 th CCFA discontinue further work on the following food additive provisions for DATEM in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level	Units	Comments	Step	EC COMMENTS
01.4	Cream (plain) and the like	5000	mg/kg		6	EC supports discontinuation

Recommendation 2 - Diacetyltartaric and Fatty Acid Esters of Glycerol (DATEM), INS 472(e)						
The eWG recommends that the 40 th CCFA adopt the following food additive provisions for DATEM in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level	Units	Comments	Step	EC COMMENTS
06.2	Flours and starches (including soybean powder)	3000	mg/kg		6	Technological need questioned Levels seem very high EC does not support the use of DATEM in unprocessed food. Does the emulsifier function in the

¹⁷ **Note 7:** Use level not in finished food.

¹⁸ **Note 100:** For use as a dispersing agent in dill oil used in the final food.

¹⁹ **Note 38:** Level in creaming mixture.

²⁰ **Note 11:** Flour basis.

Recommendation 2 - Diacetyltartaric and Fatty Acid Esters of Glycerol (DATEM), INS 472(e) The eWG recommends that the 40 th CCFA adopt the following food additive provisions for DATEM in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	EC COMMENTS
						flour or is it intended to be functional in the final product in which the flour is destined to be used?
06.4.2	Dried pastas and noodles and like products	5000	mg/kg		6	EC does not support the use of DATEM in this basic food. Technological need questioned for pastas. . Note 153 should be mentioned

POLYDIMETHYLSILOXANE (INS 900(a))

11. The 23rd JECFA (1979) assigned an ADI of 1.5 mg/kg bw for polydimethylsiloxane.

Recommendation - Polydimethylsiloxane, INS 900(a) The eWG recommends that the 40 th CCFA adopt the following food additive provisions for polydimethylsiloxane in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level	Units	Comments	Step	EC Comments
04.1.2.10	Fermented fruit products	10	mg/kg		3	EC does not support the use of INS 900(a) in this category.
04.2.2.7	Fermented vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweed products, excluding fermented soybean products of food category 12.10	10	mg/kg		3	EC does not support the use of INS 900(a) in this category.

PART II - SWEETENERS

12. The 38th CCFAC agreed that the eWG should take a “horizontal” approach to its discussion of the GSFA provisions for sweeteners. The 39th CCFA reached general consensus on a positive list of food categories in which the use of one or more food additive sweeteners were technologically justified (see Appendix I). It was understood that the listing of sweetener additives in other food categories, while not excluded, would be considered on a case by case basis. The CCFA may wish to consider this list of food categories as work on the GSFA progresses.

EC POSITION: The European Community reiterates its position that its approach is to restrict the use of sweeteners, where necessary, to energy reduced foods (ER), foods which are energy reduced or with no added sugar (ERONAS) or foods with no added sugars (NAS). Such an approach ensures that consumers have a tangible benefit from the use of these additives.

Sweeteners are an important class of food additives within the EU, however in addition to the need to control the intake of these additives the use of sweeteners is also limited as a result of the potential to mislead the consumer. The general criteria for the use of sweeteners are: to replace sugar for the production of energy reduced foods, non-cariogenic foods, or foods with no added sugars.

ACESULFAME POTASSIUM (INS 950)

13. The 37th JECFA (1990) assigned an ADI of 15 mg/kg bw/d for acesulfame potassium..

Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max	Level	Comments	Step
01.2	Fermented and renneted milk products (plain), excluding food category 01.1.2 (dairy-based drinks)	500	mg/kg		3

EC Comments: The European Community agrees with recommendation 1

Food Cat No.	EC COMMENTS	Food Category	Max	Level	Comments	Step
01.3.2	EC does not support	Beverage whiteners	2000	mg/kg		3
01.4.4	EC does not support	Cream analogues	1000	mg/kg		3
01.5.2	EC does not support.	Milk and cream powder analogues	1000	mg/kg		3
01.6.5	EC does not support	Cheese analogues	350	mg/kg		3
02.3	EC does not support	Fat emulsions mainly of type oil-in- water, including mixed and/or flavoured products	1000	mg/kg		3

Food Cat No.	EC COMMENTS	Food Category	Max	Level	Comments	Step
		based on fat emulsions				
04.1.2.1	EC does not support	Frozen fruit	500	mg/kg		6
04.1.2.2	EC does not support Technological need questioned	Dried fruit	500	mg/kg		6
04.1.2.12	EC does not support	Cooked fruit	500	mg/kg		6
04.2.2.4	EC does not support	Canned or bottled (pasteurized) or retort pouch vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds	350	mg/kg		6
04.2.2.5	EC agrees with note 138 ML should be lowered to 350 mg/kg	Vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed purees and spreads (e.g., peanut butter)	1000	mg/kg		6
04.2.2.7	EC agrees in sweet sour preserves. ML should be lowered at 200 mg/kg	Fermented vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweed products, excluding fermented soybean products of food category 12.10	1000	mg/kg		3
07.1	EC does not support the provision Extending the use to bread could possibly lead to high sweetener consumption and ADI being exceeded	Bread and ordinary bakery wares	1000	mg/kg		3
09.2		Processed fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	200	mg/kg	Note 144 ²¹	3
12.2	EC does not support the provision Technological need questioned.	Herbs, spices, seasonings and condiments (e.g., seasoning for instant noodles)	2000	mg/kg		3
12.3	The EC does not support the provision. technological need questioned. Couldn't the acidity be balanced by dilution	Vinegars	2000	mg/kg		3
14.1.3.2		Vegetable nectar	350	mg/kg	Note 161 ²²	3
16.0	EC opposes	Composite foods - foods that could be placed in categories 01 - 15	350	mg/kg		3

ASPARTAME (INS 951)

14. The 25th JECFA (1981) assigned an ADI of 40 mg/kg bw/d for aspartame.

Food Cat No.	EC COMMENTS	Food Category	Max	Level	Comments	Step
01.2	EC supports discontinuation	Fermented and renneted milk products (plain), excluding food category 01.1.2 (dairy based drinks)	2000	mg/kg		6
01.4.2	EC supports discontinuation	Sterilized and UHT creams, whipping and whipped creams, and reduced fat creams (plain)	6000	mg/kg		3
01.5.1	EC supports discontinuation	Milk powder and cream powder (plain)	5000	mg/kg		3
08.2	EC supports discontinuation	Processed meat, poultry, and game products in whole pieces or cuts	300	mg/kg		6

²¹ **Note 144** For use in sweet and sour products only.

²² **Note 161** Subject to national legislation of the importing country aimed, in particular, at consistency with Section 3.2 of the preamble

Food Cat No.	EC COMMENTS	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step
08.3	EC supports discontinuation	Processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	300	mg/kg		6
12.3	EC supports discontinuation	Vinegars		GMP		3

Food Cat No.	EC Comments	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step
01.3.2	EC does not support the provision Consumer could be misled	Beverage whiteners	6000	mg/kg		3
01.4.4	EC does not support the provision Consumer could be misled	Cream analogues	1000	mg/kg		6
01.6.1	EC does not support the provision Consumer could be misled	Unripened cheese	1000	mg/kg		3
01.6.5	EC does not support the provision Consumer could be misled	Cheese analogues	1000	mg/kg		6
02.3	EC does not support the provision Consumer could be misled	Fat emulsions mainly of type oil-in-water, including mixed and/or flavoured products based on fat emulsions	1000	mg/kg		3
04.1.2.1	EC does not support the provision Consumer could be misled	Frozen fruit	2000	mg/kg		3
04.1.2.2	EC does not support the provision Technological need questioned	Dried fruit	2000	mg/kg		6
04.2.2.1	EC does not support the provision Consumer could be misled	Frozen vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds	1000	mg/kg		6
04.2.2.2	EC does not support the provision Consumer could be misled	Dried vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds	1000	mg/kg		6
04.2.2.5	EC agrees in ER The ML should be lowered to 1000 mg/kg	Vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed purees and spreads (e.g., peanut butter)	3000	mg/kg	Note 161	6
04.2.2.6	EC agrees	Vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed pulps and preparations (e.g., vegetable desserts and sauces, candied vegetables) other than food category 04.2.2.5	1000	mg/kg	Note 161 ²³	6
04.2.2.7	EC agrees in sweet sour preserves. ML should be lowered to 300 mg/kg	Fermented vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweed products, excluding fermented soybean products of food category 12.10	2500	mg/kg	Note 161	6
05.2.1	Only in ERONAS products and lower the ML to 1000 mg/kg	Hard candy	2000	mg/kg	Notes 161 & ZZ ²⁴	6
05.2.2	Only in ERONAS products and lower the ML to 1000 mg/kg	Soft candy	3000	mg/kg		6

²³ Note 161 Subject to national legislation of the importing country aimed, in particular, at consistency with Section 3.2 of the preamble

²⁴ Note ZZ For use in microsweets and breath freshening mints at 10,000 mg/kg

Food Cat No.	EC Comments	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step
05.2.3	Only in ERONAS products and lower the ML to 1000 mg/kg	Nougats and marzipans	3000	mg/kg		6
07.1	EC does not support the provision Use of aspartame in bread could possibly lead to a high sweetener consumption and ADI could be exceeded	Bread and ordinary bakery wares	4000	mg/kg		6
12.2.2	EC does not support the provision	Seasonings and condiments	2000	mg/kg		6
12.5	Only in ER products and lower the ML to 110 mg/kg	Soups and broths	600	mg/kg		6
15.0	In certain flavours of ready to eat savouries	Ready-to-eat savouries	500	mg/kg		6

Recommendation 3 - Aspartame, INS 951

The eWG recommends that the 40th Codex Committee on Food Additives **further discuss** the following food additive provisions for aspartame in the GSFA.

Food Cat No.	EC Comments	Food Category	Max Level	Units	Comments	Step
04.2.2.4	EC does not support the provision	Canned or bottled (pasteurized) or retort pouch vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds	1000	mg/kg		6
04.2.2.8	Lower to 300 mg/kg	Cooked or fried vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds	1000	mg/kg		6
05.1.3	Only in ERONAS products and lower the ML to 1000 mg/kg	Cocoa-based spreads, including fillings	3000	mg/kg		6
05.1.5	Only in ERONAS products and lower the ML to 2000 mg/kg	Imitation chocolate, chocolate substitute products	3000	mg/kg		6
05.1.4	Only in ERONAS products and lower the ML to 2000 mg/kg	Cocoa and chocolate products	2500	mg/kg		6

ASPARTAME-ACESULFAME, (INS 962)

15. The 55th JECFA (2000) concluded that the aspartame and acesulfame moieties of the salt would be covered by the ADI for aspartame (40 mg/kg bw) and acesulfame potassium (15 mg/kg bw).

16. The Codex guideline for Class Names and the International Numbering System for Food Additives (CAC/GL 36-1989) associates the technical function sweetener with aspartame-acesulfame salt.

17. The report of the eWG²⁵ to the 39th CCFA noted that the proposed draft acceptable maximum use levels for aspartame-acesulfame salt are currently expressed in the GSFA in terms of aspartame-acesulfame salt. Expressing the use levels in terms of the salt is scientifically valid because the levels can easily be converted to their corresponding aspartame or acesulfame-K equivalents. Because JECFA concluded that the aspartame and acesulfame moieties in aspartame-acesulfame salt are included within the ADI established for aspartame and acesulfame-K, any combined use of the individual sweeteners and the equivalent level of the sweetener from the double salt should not exceed the maximum use level for the individual sweetener. Based on these concepts, the eWG recommended that the CCFA agree to the following approach for expressing the acceptable maximum use levels for aspartame-acesulfame salt.

Recommendation 1 - Aspartame-Acesulfame, INS 962

The acceptable maximum use levels will be expressed on the following:

- Aspartame-acesulfame salt basis.
- Singly or in combination with aspartame or acesulfame-potassium.
- Replace the current notes 113²⁶ and 119²⁷ associated with the proposed draft provisions for aspartame-acesulfame with the following note:

Use levels are expressed as mg of aspartame-acesulfame salt per kg of food. When used as a mixture with aspartame or acesulfame-K: 1) Combined use of aspartame and aspartame-acesulfame salt (expressed as aspartame equivalents by

²⁵ CX/FA 07/39/9

²⁶ **Note 113:** Use level reported as acesulfame potassium equivalents.

²⁷ **Note 119:** Use level reported as aspartame equivalents.

- multiplying the aspartame-acesulfame use level by 0.44) should not exceed the maximum use level for aspartame; 2) Combined use of acesulfame-K and aspartame-acesulfame salt (expressed as acesulfame-K equivalents by multiplying the use level for aspartame-acesulfame salt by 0.64) should not exceed the maximum use level for acesulfame-K.
- d. Add the following note to all of the provisions for acesulfame-K
Not to exceed the maximum use level for acesulfame-K (INS 950) singly or in combination with aspartame-acesulfame salt (INS 952) expressed in the form of acesulfame-K equivalents (acesulfame-K equivalent level for aspartame-acesulfame salt calculated by multiplying aspartame-acesulfame salt use level by 0.44).
- e. Add the following note to all of the provisions for aspartame:
Not to exceed the maximum use level for aspartame (INS 951) singly or in combination with aspartame-acesulfame salt (INS 952) expressed as aspartame equivalents (aspartame-equivalent level for aspartame-acesulfame salt calculated by multiplying aspartame-acesulfame salt use level by 0.64).

EC POSITION: The European Community does not agree with recommendation 1. The EC feels that the maximum usable doses for the salt of aspartame-acesulfame should be based upon from the maximum usable doses for its constituent parts, aspartame and acesulfame K. The maximum usable doses for both aspartame and acesulfame-K should not to be exceeded by use of the salt of Aspartame-acesulfame, either alone or in combination with Aspartame or Acesulfame-K. Limits should be expressed either as (a) acesulfame-K equivalent or (b) aspartame equivalents. Once this salt is added to foods it rapidly dissociates and can only be detected as aspartame and acesulfame K additionally the ADI for this additive is based upon its constituent parts. The EC therefore considers setting the levels with reference to the constituent parts is more relevant for enforcement authorities and consumers.

Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level	Comments	Step
01.2	Fermented and renneted milk products (plain), excluding food category 01.1.2 (dairy-based drinks)	1130 mg/kg	Note 113	3

EC Comments : the European Community agrees with recommendation 2

Food Cat No.	EC Comments	Food Category	Max Level	Comments	Step
01.1.2	Lower to 350 mg/l	Dairy-based drinks, flavoured and/or fermented (e.g., chocolate milk, cocoa, eggnog, drinking yoghurt, whey-based drinks)	800 mg/kg	Notes 113 & 161	3
01.3.2	EC does not support the provision. The use could mislead the consumer	Beverage whiteners	4550 mg/kg	Note 113	3
01.4.4	EC does not support the provision. Consumers could be misled	Cream analogues	1550 mg/kg	Note 119	3
01.5.2	EC does not support the provision. The use could mislead the consumer	Milk and cream powder analogues	3100 mg/kg	Note 119	3
01.6.5	EC does not support the provision. Technological need questioned. Use could mislead the consumer	Cheese analogues	800 mg/kg	Note 113	3
01.7	Lower to 350 mg/l	Dairy-based desserts (e.g., pudding, fruit or flavoured yoghurt)	1150 mg/kg	Notes 113 & 161	3
02.3	EC does not support the provision. The use could mislead the consumer	Fat emulsions mainly of type oil-in-water, including mixed and/or flavoured products based on fat emulsions	1550 mg/kg	Note 119	3
02.4	Lower to 350 mg/kg	Fat-based desserts excluding dairy-based dessert products of food category 01.7	1150 mg/kg	Notes 113 & 161	3
03.0	Lower to 800 mg/kg	Edible ices, including sherbet and sorbet	1550 mg/kg	Notes 119 & 161	3
04.1.2.1	Technological need is questioned. Use could mislead the consumer	Frozen fruit	1150 mg/kg	Note 113	3
04.1.2.2	Technological need is requested. Use could mislead the consumer	Dried fruit	1150 mg/kg	Note 113	3
04.1.2.3	Lower to 200 mg/kg	Fruit in vinegar, oil, or brine	1150 mg/kg	Notes 113 & 161	3
04.1.2.4	Lower to 350 mg/kg	Canned or bottled (pasteurized) fruit	450 mg/kg	Notes 113 & 161	3
04.1.2.5		Jams, jellies and marmelades	550 mg/kg	Notes 119 & 161	3
04.1.2.6		Fruit-based spreads (e.g.,	2250 mg/kg	Notes 113 & 161	3

Food Cat No.	EC Comments	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step
		chutney) excluding products of food category 04.1.2.5				
04.1.2.7	Lower to 500 mg/kg	Candied fruit	1150	mg/kg	Note 113	3
04.1.2.8	Lower to 350 mg/kg	Fruit preparations, including pulp, purees, fruit toppings, and coconut milk	800	mg/kg	Notes 113 & 161	3
04.1.2.9	Lower to 350 mg/kg	Fruit-based desserts, incl. fruit-flavoured water-based desserts	800	mg/kg	Notes 113 & 161	3
04.1.2.10	Lower to 350 mg/kg	Fermented fruit products	800	mg/kg	Note 113	3
04.1.2.11	Lower to 350 mg/kg	Fruit fillings for pastries	800	mg/kg	Note 113	3
04.1.2.12	EC does not support	Cooked fruit	1150	mg/kg	Note 113	3
04.2.2.3	Lower to 300 mg/kg	Vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and seaweeds in vinegar, oil, brine, or soy sauce	450	mg/kg	Note 119 & 161	3
04.2.2.4	Technological need is requested. Use could mislead the consumers	Canned or bottles (pasteurized) or retort pouch vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and seaweeds	800	mg/kg	Note 113	3
04.2.2.5	Lower to 350 mg/kg as acesulfame –K equivalents Add note 138	Vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed purees and spreads (e.g., peanut butter)	4650	mg/kg	Note 119	3
04.2.2.6	Lower to 350 mg/kg	Vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed pulps and preparations (e.g., vegetable desserts and sauces, candied vegetables) other than food category 04.2.2.5	800	mg/kg	Notes 113 & 161	3
04.2.2.7	Lower to 1000 mg/kg	Fermented vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed products, excluding fermented soybean products of food category 12.10	2250	mg/kg	Note 113	3
05.1.2	Lower to 350 mg/kg	Cocoa mixes (syrops)	1150	mg/kg	Note 113	3
05.1.3	Lower to 1000 mg/kg	Cocoa-based spreads, incl. fillings	4550	mg/kg	Notes 113 & 161	3
05.1.4	Lower to 500 mg/kg	Cocoa and chocolate products	2250	mg/kg	Notes 113 & 161	3
05.1.5	Lower to 500 mg/kg	Imitation chocolate, chocolate substitute products	2250	mg/kg	Notes 113 & 161	3
05.4	Lower to 500 mg/kg	Decorations (e.g., for fine bakery wares), toppings (non-fruit) and sweet sauces	1150	mg/kg	Note 113	3
06.3	Lower to 1000 mg/kg	Breakfast cereals, including rolled oats	1550	mg/kg	Notes 119 & 161	3
06.5	Lower to 350 mg/kg	Cereal and starch based desserts (e.g., rice pudding, tapioca pudding)	800	mg/kg	Notes 113 & 161	3
07.1	EC does not support the provision Extending the use to bread could possibly lead to high sweetener consumption and	Bread and ordinary bakery wares	2250	mg/kg	Note 113	3

Food Cat No.	EC Comments	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step
	ADI could be exceeded					
07.2	Lower to 1000 mg/kg	Fine bakery wares (sweet, salty, savoury) and mixes	2250	mg/kg	Notes 77 ²⁸ & 113	3
09.3	Lower to 200 mg/kg	Semi-preserved fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	450	mg/kg	Note 113	3
09.4	Lower to 200 mg/kg	Fully preserved, including canned or fermented fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	450	mg/kg	Note 113	3
10.4	Lower to 350 mg/kg	Egg-based desserts (e.g., custard)	800	mg/kg	Notes 113 & 161	3
11.4	EC does not support. Use could mislead the consumers	Other sugars and syrups (e.g., xylose, maple syrup, sugar toppings)	2250	mg/kg	Note 113	3
11.6		Table-top sweeteners, including those containing high-intensity sweeteners		GMP	Note 113	3
12.2.2	EC does not support. Use could mislead the consumers	Seasonings and condiments	3100	mg/kg	Note 113	3
12.3	EC does not support. Use could mislead the consumers	Vinegars	4550	mg/kg	Note 113	3
12.4	Lower to 350 mg/kg	Mustards	550	mg/kg	Note 119	3
12.5	Lower to 110 mg/kg	Soups and broths	250	mg/kg	Notes 113 & 161	3
12.7	Lower to 350 mg/kg	Salads (e.g., macaroni salad, potato salad), and sandwich spreads excluding coco-a dn nut-based spreads of food categories 04.2.2.5 and 05.1.3	1550	mg/kg	Notes 113 & 161	3
13.3	Lower to 450 mg/kg	Dietetic foods intended for special medical purposes (excluding products of food category 13.1)	1000	mg/kg	Note 113	3
13.4	Lower to 450 mg/kg	Dietetic formulae for slimming purposes and weight reduction	1000	mg/kg	Note 113	3
13.5	Lower to 450 mg/kg	Dietetic foods (e.g., supplementary foods for dietary use) excluding products of food categories 13.1 - 13.4 and 13.6	1000	mg/kg	Note 113	3
13.6	Lower to 350 mg/kg	Food supplements	2000	mg/kg	Note 113	3
14.1.2.2	Lower to 350 mg/kg	Vegetable juice	1350	mg/kg	Note 113	3
14.1.2.4	Lower to 350 mg/kg	Concentrates for vegetable juice	1350	mg/kg	Notes 113 & 127 ²⁹	3
14.1.3.4	Lower to 350 mg/kg	Concentrates for vegetable nectar	1350	mg/kg	Notes 113 & 127	3
14.1.4	Lower to 600 mg/kg	Water-based flavoured drinks, including "sport," "energy," or "electrolyte" drinks and particulated drinks	950	mg/kg	Notes 119 & 161	3
14.1.5	EC does not support. Use could mislead the consumers	Coffee, coffee substitutes, tea, herbal infusions, and other hot cereal and grain beverages, excluding cocoa	1350	mg/kg	Note 119	3
14.2.1	Lower to 350 mg/kg with NOTE H	Beer and malt beverages	800	mg/kg	Notes 113 & 161	3
14.2.2	Lower to 350 mg/kg	Cider and perry	800	mg/kg	Note 113	3
14.2.4	EC does not support. Technological need is requested	Wines (other than grape)	1200	mg/kg	Note 113	3
14.2.7	Lower to 600 mg/kg	Aromatized alcoholic beverages (e.g., beer, wine and spirituous cooler-type beverages, low alcoholic refreshers)	950	mg/kg	Note 119	3
15.0	Lower to 350 mg/kg	Ready-to-eat savouries	750	mg/kg	Notes 113 & 161	3

²⁸ **Note 77:** For special nutritional uses only.

²⁹ **Note 127:** As served to the consumer.

Food Cat No.	EC Comments	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step
05.3	Lower ML to 2000 mg/kg	Chewing gum	4550	mg/kg	Notes 113 & 161	3

CYCLAMIC ACID, (AND Na, K, Ca SALTS) (INS 952)

18. The 26th JECFA (1982) assigned a group ADI of 11 mg/kg bw/d for calcium cyclamate, cyclohexylsulfamic acid, and sodium cyclamate all expressed as cyclamic acid.

Food Cat No.	EC comments	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step
14.1.4.3	Only for ERONAS products. Note category name is incorrect.	Concentrates for fruit juice Concentrates (liquid or solid) for water based flavoured drinks	1000	mg/kg		

Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step
01.2	Fermented and renneted milk products (plain), excluding food category 01.1.2 (dairy-based drinks)		GMP	Note 17 ³⁰	6

EC Comments : the European Community agrees with recommendation 2

Food Cat No.	EC comments	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step
04.2.2.6	Only to ERONAS products	Vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed pulps and preparations (e.g., vegetable desserts and sauces, candied vegetables) other than food category 04.2.2.5	250	mg/kg	Notes 17 and 161	6
12.6.1	EC does not support extending the use of INS 952 in this category.	Emulsified sauces (e.g., mayonnaise, salad dressing)	500	mg/kg	Note 17	6
12.7	EC does not support extending the use of INS 952 in this category.	Salads (e.g., macaroni salad, potato salad) and sandwich spreads excluding cocoa- and nut-based spreads of food categories 04.2.2.5 and 05.1.3	500	mg/kg	Note 17	6

Food Cat No.	EC Comments	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step
14.1.4.1	ML is excessively high ; a child of 15kg could easily exceed the ADI by consuming less than 150 ml of drink	Carbonated water-based flavoured drinks	1500	mg/kg	Note 17	6

SACCHARIN (INS 954)

19. The 41st JECFA (1993) assigned a group ADI of 5 mg/kg bw/d for calcium saccharin, potassium saccharin, sodium saccharin and saccharin.

Food Cat No.	EC comments	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step
01.2.1	EC supports discontinuation	Fermented milks (plain)	200	mg/kg		6
01.2.2	EC supports discontinuation	Renneted milk (plain)	100	mg/kg		6
07.1.3	EC supports discontinuation	Other ordinary bakery products (e.g., bagels, pita, English muffins)	15	mg/kg		6
09.2.5	EC supports discontinuation	Smoked, dried, fermented, and/or salted fish and fish products,	1200	mg/kg		6

³⁰ Note 17: As cyclamic acid

Food Cat No.	EC comments	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step
		including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms				
09.3.3	EC supports discontinuation	Salmon substitutes, caviar, and other fish roe products	160	mg/kg		6

Food Cat No.	EC comments	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step
01.6.5	EC does not support this provision	Cheese analogues	100	mg/kg		3
04.1.2.7	EC does not support this provision The ML is considered too high and ADI could be exceeded by children	Candied fruit	2000	mg/kg	Note 161 ³¹	3
04.1.2.10	EC agrees	Fermented fruit products	160	mg/kg		3
04.2.2.1	EC does not support this provision Technological need questioned in basic frozen vegetables	Frozen vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds	500	mg/kg		6
04.2.2.2	EC does not support this provision Possible intake concern	Dried vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds	500	mg/kg		6
04.2.2.4	Only used in sweet sour products at 160 mg/kg	Canned or bottled (pasteurized) or retort pouch vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds	160	mg/kg	Note 144 ³²	6
04.2.2.5	EC agrees	Vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed purees and spreads (e.g., peanut butter)	160	mg/kg		6
04.2.2.6	EC agrees	Vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed pulps and preparations (e.g., vegetable desserts and sauces, candied vegetables) other than food category 04.2.2.5	200	mg/kg	Note 161	6
04.2.2.7	EC agrees	Fermented vegetable (including	200	mg/kg	Note 161	6

³¹ **Note 161:** Subject to national legislation of the importing country aimed, in particular, at consistency with Section 3.2 of the preamble.

³² **Note 144:** For use in sweet and sour products only.

Food Cat No.	EC comments	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step
		mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweed products, excluding fermented soybean products of food category 12.10				
04.2.2.8	Only used in sweet sour products at 160 mg/kg	Cooked or fried vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds	160	mg/kg	Notes 144 & 161	6
05.1.1	ERONAS only	Cocoa mixes (powders) and cocoa mass/cake	100	mg/kg	Note 97 ³³	3
06.3	EC agrees	Breakfast cereals, including rolled oats	100	mg/kg	Note 161	6
08.2.2	EC does not support the use	Heat-treated processed meat, poultry, and game products in whole pieces or cuts	500	mg/kg		6
08.3.2	EC does not support the use	Heat-treated processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	500	mg/kg		6
09.2.4.1	EC does not support the use	Cooked fish and fish products	500	mg/kg		6
11.4	EC does not support the use	Other sugars and syrups (e.g., xylose, maple syrup, sugar toppings)	300	mg/kg	Note 159 ³⁴	6
12.2.2	EC does not support the use	Seasonings and condiments	1500	mg/kg		6
12.3		Vinegars	300	mg/kg		6
12.7	ERONAS	Salads (e.g., macaroni salad, potato salad) and sandwich spreads excluding cocoa- and nut-based spreads of food categories 04.2.2.5 and 05.1.3	200	mg/kg	Note 161 & 166 ³⁵	6
12.10.3	EC agrees	Fermented soybean paste (miso)	200	mg/kg		3
14.1.3.2	EC agrees	Vegetable nectars	80	mg/kg	Note 161	3
14.1.3.4	EC agrees	Concentrates for vegetable nectar	80	mg/kg	Note 127 ³⁶ & 161	6
14.1.4.1	Only to ERONAS products at a ML of 80 mg/l	Carbonated water-based flavoured drinks	300	mg/kg	Note 161	6
14.1.4.2	Only to ERONAS products at a ML of 80 mg/l	Non-carbonated water-based flavoured drinks, including punches and ades	300	mg/kg	Note 161	6
14.1.4.3	Only to ERONAS products at a ML of 400	Concentrates	300	mg/kg	Notes 127 &	6

³³ **Note 97:** In the finished product/final cocoa and chocolate products.

³⁴ **Note 159:** For use in pancake syrup and maple syrup.

³⁵ **Note 166:** For milk-based sandwich spreads only.

³⁶ **Note 127:** As served to the consumer.

Food Cat No.	EC comments	Food Category	Max Level	Comments	Step
	mg/l on a basis of a dilution factor of 5	(liquid or solid) for water-based flavoured drinks		161	

SUCRALOSE (INS 955)

20. The 37th JECFA (1990) assigned a group ADI of 15 mg/kg bw/d for sucralose.

Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level	Comments
01.5.2	Milk and cream powder analogues	400 mg/kg	

EC POSITION: The European Community does not support recommendation 1. The technological need is questioned and the use could mislead the consumer.

Food Cat No.	EC comments	Food Category	Max Level	Comments	Step
01.2.1	EC supports discontinuation	Fermented milks (plain)	400 mg/kg		3
01.2.1.2	EC supports discontinuation	Fermented milks (plain), heat-treated after fermentation	250 mg/kg		6
01.2.2	EC supports discontinuation	Renneted milk (plain)	GMP		6

Food Cat No.	EC comments	Food Category	Max Level	Comments	Step
01.3.2	EC does not support the use	Beverage whiteners	580 mg/kg		3
01.4	EC does not support the use	Cream (plain) and the like	580 mg/kg		3
01.6.5	EC does not support the use	Cheese analogues	500 mg/kg		6
04.1.2.1	EC does not support the use	Frozen fruit	400 mg/kg		3
04.1.2.2	EC does not support the use	Dried fruit	1500 mg/kg		3
04.1.2.12	EC does not support the use	Cooked fruit	150 mg/kg		6
04.2.2.1	EC does not support the use	Frozen vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds	150 mg/kg		6
04.2.2.2	EC does not support the use	Dried vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds	500 mg/kg		6
04.2.2.4	In ERONAS only	Canned or bottled (pasteurized) or retort pouch vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds	580 mg/kg		6
04.2.2.7	Only for use in sweet sour products	Fermented vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweed products, excluding fermented soybean products of food category 12.10	580 mg/kg		6
04.2.2.8	Only for use in sweet sour products	Cooked or fried vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds	150 mg/kg	Note 144 ³⁷	6
05.2	EC considers level for microsweets and breath freshening mint is very high and the ML for such products should be lowered to 2400 mg/kg	Confectionery including hard and soft candy, nougat, etc. other than food categories 05.1, 05.3 and 05.4	1800 mg/kg	Note 161 ³⁸ & 164 ³⁹	3
05.4	EC agrees	Decorations (e.g., for fine bakery wares), toppings (non-fruit) and sweet sauces	1000 mg/kg	Note 161	6
06.3	EC agrees but the ML is considered high. 400 mg/kg is sufficient to reach the technological purpose	Breakfast cereals, including rolled oats	1000 mg/kg	Note 161	6
07.1	EC does not support the use of	Bread and ordinary bakery wares	650 mg/kg		6

³⁷ **Note 144:** For use in sweet and sour products only

³⁸ **Note 161:** Subject to national legislation of the importing country aimed, in particular, at consistency with Section 3.2 of the preamble.

³⁹ **Note 164:** For use in microsweets and breath freshening mints at 12,000 mg/kg.

Food Cat No.	EC comments	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step
	sucralose in this category Extending the use to this basic foodstuff could possibly lead to high sweetener consumption and ADI could be exceeded					
07.2	In ERONAS products only. A ML of 700 mg/kg seems high to achieve the technological effect. 400 mg/kg seems sufficient.	Fine bakery wares (sweet, salty, savoury) and mixes	700	mg/kg	Note 165 ⁴⁰	6
11.4	EC does not support the use of sucralose in this category Technological need questioned	Other sugars and syrups (e.g., xylose, maple syrup, sugar toppings)	1500	mg/kg	Note 159 ⁴¹	6
12.2.1	EC does not support the use of sucralose in this category	Herbs and spices	400	mg/kg		3
12.2.2	EC does not support the use of sucralose in this category	Seasonings and condiments	700	mg/kg		6
12.3	EC does not support the use of sucralose in this category	Vinegars	400	mg/kg		3
12.5	In ER products only at ML of 45 mg/kg	Soups and broths	600	mg/kg	Note 161	6
14.2.7	At ML of 250 mg/kg	Aromatized alcoholic beverages (e.g., beer, wine and spirituous cooler-type beverages, low-alcoholic refreshers)	700	mg/kg		6
15.0	EC considers the ML of 200 mg/kg adequate	Ready-to-eat savouries	1000	mg/kg		6

ALITAME (INS 956)

21. The 46th JECFA (1996) assigned an ADI of 1 mg/kg bw/d for alitame .

Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step
01.2	Fermented and renneted milk products (plain), excluding food category 01.1.2 (dairy-based drinks)	60	mg/kg		6
01.4.4	Cream analogues	100	mg/kg		3
07.1	Bread and ordinary bakery wares	200	mg/kg		6
12.2	Herbs, spices, seasonings, and condiments (e.g., seasoning for instant noodles)	100	mg/kg		6

EC comments : The European Community agrees with recommendation 1

NEOTAME (INS 961)

22. The 61st JECFA (2003) assigned an ADI of 2 mg/kg bw/d for neotame.

EC comments: The EC Notes that Neotame is not currently permitted in the EC

Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step
01.2	Fermented and renneted milk products (plain), excluding food category 01.1.2 (dairy based drinks)	65	mg/kg		3

EC Comments : the European Community agrees with recommendation 1

Food Cat No.	EC comments	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step
01.3.2	EC does not support the use of Neotame in this category	Beverage whiteners	65	mg/kg		3
01.4.4	EC does not support the use of Neotame in this category	Cream analogues	33	mg/kg		3
01.5.2	EC does not support the use of Neotame in this category. Technological need is requested	Milk and cream powder analogues	65	mg/kg		3
01.6.5	EC does not support the use of Neotame in this category.	Cheese analogues	33	mg/kg		3

⁴⁰ **Note 165:** For use in products for special nutritional purposes only.

⁴¹ **Note 159:** For use in pancake syrup and maple syrup.

Food Cat No.	EC comments	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step
	Technological need is requested					
02.3	EC does not support the use of Neotame in this category. Technological need is requested	Fat emulsions mainly of type oil-in-water, including mixed and/or flavoured products based on fat emulsions	10	mg/kg		3
04.1.2.1	EC does not support the use of Neotame in this category. Technological need is requested	Frozen fruit	100	mg/kg		3
04.1.2.2	EC does not support the use of Neotame in this category. Technological need is requested	Dried fruit	100	mg/kg		3
04.2.2.1	EC does not support the use of Neotame in this category. There is no technological need to use vinegar in the frozen process of vegetables	Frozen vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds	33	mg/kg		3
04.2.2.2	EC does not support the use of Neotame in this category There is no technological need as these products covered by the sub category 04.2.2.2 are dried and do not contain vinegar	Dried vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds	33	mg/kg		3
04.2.2.4	EC does not support the use of Neotame in this category Technological need still requested	Canned or bottled (pasteurized) or retort pouch vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds	33	mg/kg		3
04.2.2.5	For ER products only	Vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed purees and spreads (e.g., peanut butter)	33	mg/kg	Note 161	3
04.2.2.8	EC does not support the use of Neotame in this category	Cooked or fried vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds	33	mg/kg		3
07.1	EC does not support the use of Neotame in this category	Bread and ordinary bakery wares	70	mg/kg		3
09.3	EC does not support the use of Neotame in this category	Semi-preserved fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	10	mg/kg		3
09.4	EC does not support the use of Neotame in this category	Fully preserved, including canned or fermented fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	10	mg/kg		3
12.2	EC does not support the use of Neotame in this category	Herbs, spices, seasonings, and condiments (e.g., seasoning for instant noodles)	32	mg/kg		3
12.3	EC does not support the use of Neotame in this category	Vinegars	12	mg/kg		3

PART III – COLOURS

23. The 38th CCFA agreed that the eWG should take a “horizontal” approach to its discussion of the GSFA provisions for colors. The eWG reached general consensus on a positive list of food categories in which the use of one or more colors is technologically justified (see Appendix II). The CCFA may wish to consider this list of food categories as work on the GSFA progresses.

24. There was general consensus among the eWG that Note 4⁴² and Note 16⁴³ should, in principle, be associated with all color provisions in food categories that relate to fresh fruits (04.1.1), fresh vegetables (04.2.1), fresh meat (08.1) and fresh fish (09.1).

The previous recommendations of the eWG (CX/FA 07/39/9 Parts 1 and 2) were not fully considered by the 39th CCFA. Those recommendations were reconsidered by the current eWG.

General EC comments: The European Community is of the opinion that there are a significant number of food categories to which colours are proposed to be used.

In some cases the European Community questions the need for the use of colours and in some cases the use could mislead the consumer. Therefore in these cases the European Community suggests a more restricted use of food colours. In particular, the European Community questions the use of colours in basic foods, such as Bread-type products, pasta etc. which are widely consumed and therefore could contribute significantly to the intake of colours.

In particular, the following food additives Brown HT, Ponceau 4R, Carmoisine and Sunset yellow, have been assigned low ADIs. In consequence, these food additives have been specifically allocated low Maximum limits in the EU legislation for safety reasons.

Recommendation 1 - Food Categories in Which the Use of Colors is Technologically Justified

The eWG recommends that the CCFA discuss the list of food categories for which the use of colors is justified (Appendix II), with a view toward reaching consensus and using the list as a working document in its future discussion of food additive sweeteners.

Recommendation 2 - Food Categories in Which the Use of Colors is Technologically Justified

The eWG recommends that the CCFA establish as a principle that all provisions for the use of colors in GSFA food categories 04.1.1, 04.2.1, 08.1, 09.1 et. seq. should include Notes 4 and 16.

EC AGREES

RIBOFLAVINS (INS 101(i), 101(ii))

25. The 51st JECFA assigned a group ADI for synthetic riboflavin (101(i)) and riboflavin-5'-phosphate (101(ii)) of 0.5 mg/kg bw/d.

Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step
04.1.2.3	fruit in vinegar, oil, or brine	300	mg/kg		3
04.2.2.2	dried vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds	10	mg/kg		6
04.2.2.4	canned or bottled (pasteurized) or retort pouch vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds	300	mg/kg		3
06.4.2	dried pastas and noodles and like products	300	mg/kg		3
07.1	bread and ordinary bakery wares	300	mg/kg		3
16.0	composite foods - foods that could not be placed in categories 01 - 15	300	mg/kg		3

EC comments : The European Community agrees with recommendation 1.

Food Cat No.	EC comments	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step
02.3	EC agrees	fat emulsions mainly of type oil-in-water, including mixed and/or flavoured products based on fat emulsions	300	mg/kg		3
04.1.2.10	EC agrees	Fermented fruit products	500	mg/kg		3
04.2.2.6	EC agrees	vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed pulps and preparations (e.g., vegetable desserts and sauces, candied vegetables) other than food category 04.2.2.5	300	mg/kg	Note 92 ⁴⁴	3
04.2.2.7	EC agrees	Fermented vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweed products, excluding	500	mg/kg		3

⁴² Note 4 For decoration, stamping, marking or branding the product.

⁴³ Note 16 For use in glaze, coatings or decorations for fruit, vegetables, meat or fish.

⁴⁴ Note 92: Excluding tomato-based sauces

Food Cat No.	EC comments	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step
		fermented soybean products of food category 12.10				
08.0	EC agrees with limitation to 8.2, 8.3 and 8.4 only	meat and meat products, including poultry and game	1000	mg/kg		6
08.2	AC agrees with Note 16	Processed meat, poultry, and game products in whole pieces or cuts	1000	mg/kg		6
08.3	EC agrees with Note 16	Processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	1000	mg/kg		6
08.4	EC agrees with Note 16	Edible casings (e.g., sausage casings)	1000	mg/kg		6
09.2.1	Only in fish roe and Surimi only	frozen fish, fish fillets, and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	1000	mg/kg	Note 95 ⁴⁵	6
09.2.4.1	EC agrees	cooked fish and fish products	300	mg/kg	Note 95	3
09.2.4.2	EC agrees	cooked mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	300	mg/kg		3
09.4	EC agrees	fully preserved, including canned or fermented fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	500	mg/kg	Note 95	6
14.1.3.2	EC does not agree. Technological need is questioned	vegetable nectar	300	mg/kg		3
14.1.3.4	EC does not agree. Technological need is questioned	concentrates for vegetable nectar	300	mg/kg	Note 127 ⁴⁶	3

SUNSET YELLOW FCF (INS 110)

26. The 26th JECFA (1982) assigned a group ADI of 2.5 mg/kg bw/d for sunset yellow FCF.

Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max	Level	Comments	Step
02.2.1.2	margarine and similar products		GMP		6
04.1.1.2	surface-treated fresh fruit	500	mg/kg	Note 16 ⁴⁷	6
04.1.2.2	dried fruit	50	mg/kg		6
04.1.2.4	canned or bottled (pasteurized) fruit	200	mg/kg		6
04.2.2.2	dried vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds	300	mg/kg	Note 76 ⁴⁸	6
04.2.2.3	vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and seaweeds in vinegar, oil, brine, or soy sauce	500	mg/kg		6
04.2.2.4	canned or bottled (pasteurized) or retort pouch vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds	200	mg/kg		6
04.2.2.5	vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed purees and spreads (e.g., peanut butter)	100	mg/kg		6
05.1.1	cocoa mixes (powders) and cocoa mass/cake	50	mg/kg		6
05.1.2	cocoa mixes (syrops)	50	mg/kg		6
05.1.3	cocoa-based spreads, including fillings	100	mg/kg		6
05.1.4	cocoa and chocolate products	400	mg/kg		6
06.4.2	dried pastas and noodles and like products	300	mg/kg		6
11.3	sugar solutions and syrups, also (partially) inverted, including treacle and molasses, excluding products of food category 11.1.3	300	mg/kg		6
11.4	other sugars and syrups (e.g., xylose, maple syrup, sugar toppings)	300	mg/kg		6
11.6	table-top sweeteners, including those containing high-intensity sweeteners	300	mg/kg		6
12.2.1	herbs and spices	300	mg/kg		6
14.1.2.2	vegetable juice		GMP		6
14.1.5	coffee, coffee substitutes, tea, herbal infusions, and other hot cereal and grain beverages, excluding cocoa	70	mg/kg		3
15.2	processed nuts, including covered nuts and nut mixtures (with e.g., dried fruit)	100	mg/kg		6

EC comments: The European Community agrees with recommendation 1.

⁴⁵ **Note 95:** For use in surimi and fish roe products only.

⁴⁶ **Note 127:** As served to the consumer

⁴⁷ **Note 16:** For use in glaze, coatings or decorations for fruit, vegetables, meat or fish.

⁴⁸ **Note 76:** Use in potatoes only.

Food Cat No.	EC comments	Food Category	Max	Level	Comments	Step
01.1.2	EC agrees with Note 50	dairy-based drinks, flavoured and/or fermented (e.g., chocolate milk, cocoa, eggnog, drinking yoghurt, whey-based drinks)	50	mg/kg	Note 52 ⁴⁹	6
01.6.1	EC does not support	unripened cheese	300	mg/kg	Note 3 ⁵⁰	6
01.6.2.2	EC agrees	rind of ripened cheese	100	mg/kg		6
01.6.4	EC agrees only in 01.6.4.2	processed cheese	200	mg/kg		6
01.6.4.1	EC does not support the use of INS 110 in this sub category Sunset yellow is allocated a very low ADI and therefore the use should be restricted to a limited number of use	Plain processed cheese	200	mg/kg		6
01.6.4.2	EC agrees	Flavoured processed cheese, including containing fruit, vegetables, meat etc	100	mg/kg		6
01.6.5	EC agrees	cheese analogues	300	mg/kg	Note 3	6
01.7	EC agrees	dairy-based desserts (e.g., pudding, fruit or flavoured yoghurt)	50	mg/kg		6
02.1.3	EC does not support the use of INS 110 in this sub category	lard, tallow, fish oil, and other animal fats	300	mg/kg		6
02.4	EC agrees	fat-based desserts excluding dairy-based dessert products of food category 01.7	50	mg/kg		6
03.0	EC agrees	edible ices, including sherbet and sorbet	50	mg/kg		6
04.1.2.5	EC supports a level of 100 mg/kg	jams, jellies and marmelades	300	mg/kg		6
04.1.2.6	EC agrees	fruit-based spreads (e.g., chutney) excluding products of food category 04.1.2.5	300	mg/kg		6
04.1.2.7	EC agrees	candied fruit	200	mg/kg		6
04.1.2.8	EC does not support the use of INS 110 in this sub category The use could mislead the consumer and the ML is considered very high. A child of 15kg could exceed the ADI with the consumption of 125 g of fruit preparation.	fruit preparations, including pulp, purees, fruit toppings and coconut milk	300	mg/kg		6
04.1.2.9	EC agrees	fruit-based desserts, including fruit-flavoured water-based desserts	50	mg/kg		6
04.1.2.11	EC considers 200 mg/kg is sufficient to achieve the technological need.	fruit fillings for pastries	300	mg/kg		6
04.2.1.2	EC agrees	surface-treated fresh vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds	300	mg/kg	Note 4 ⁵¹ & 16	6
04.2.2.6	EC agrees except tomato-based sauces	vegetable (including mushrooms and	50	mg/kg		6

⁴⁹ **Note 52:** Excluding chocolate milk

⁵⁰ **Note 3:** Surface treatment.

⁵¹ **Note 4:** For decoration, stamping, marking or branding the product.

Food Cat No.	EC comments	Food Category	Max	Level	Comments	Step
		fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed pulps and preparations (e.g., vegetable desserts and sauces, candied vegetables) other than food category 04.2.2.5				
04.2.2.7	EC agrees	fermented vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweed products, excluding fermented soybean products of food category 12.10	200	mg/kg	Note 92 ⁵²	6
05.2	EC agrees but the ML is considered very high to achieve the technological need. EC supports the use of Sunset yellow in this sub-category at a ML of 50 mg/kg	confectionery including hard and soft candy, nougat, etc. other than food categories 05.1, 05.3 and 05.4	300	mg/kg		6
05.3	EC agrees	chewing gum	300	mg/kg		6
05.4	EC agrees	decorations (e.g., for fine bakery wares), toppings (non-fruit) and sweet sauces	300	mg/kg		6
06.3	EC strongly opposes. The use of INS 110 in this basic food with wide consumption would increase the intake and possibly may lead to an exceedance of ADI for children	breakfast cereals, including rolled oats	300	mg/kg		6
06.4.3	EC does not support except for instant noodle	pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products	300	mg/kg		6
06.5	EC agrees	cereal and starch based desserts (e.g., rice pudding, tapioca pudding)	50	mg/kg		6
07.0	EC strongly opposes. The use of INS 110 in this basic food with wide consumption would increase the intake and possibly may lead to an exceedance of the ADI	bakery wares	200	mg/kg		6
08.1	EC agrees	fresh meat, poultry, and game	300	mg/kg	Notes 4 & 16 ⁵³	6
08.2	EC agrees only in glaze and coatings	processed meat, poultry, and game products in whole pieces or cuts	300	mg/kg	Note 16	6
08.3.1.1	EC agrees	cured (including salted) non-heat treated processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	300	mg/kg	Note 16	6
08.3.1.2	EC agrees only in glaze and coatings	cured (including salted) and dried non-heat treated processed comminuted meat,	135	mg/kg		6

⁵² **Note 92:** Excluding tomato-based products

⁵³ **Note 16:** For use in glaze, coatings or decorations for fruit, vegetables, meat or fish.

Food Cat No.	EC comments	Food Category	Max	Level	Comments	Step
		poultry, and game products				
08.3.1.3	EC agrees	fermented non-heat treated processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	300	mg/kg	Note 16	6
08.3.2	EC agrees only in glaze and coatings	heat-treated processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	300	mg/kg	Note 16	6
08.3.3	EC agrees	frozen processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	300	mg/kg	Note 16	6
08.4	EC agrees	edible casings (e.g., sausage casings)	300	mg/kg	Note 16	6
09.1.1	EC agrees	fresh fish	300	mg/kg	Notes 4, 16 & 50 ⁵⁴	6
09.1.2	EC agrees only in glaze and coatings	fresh mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	300	mg/kg	Notes 4 & 16	6
09.2.1	EC agrees	frozen fish, fish fillets, and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	300	mg/kg	Note 95 ⁵⁵	6
09.2.2	EC agrees	frozen battered fish, fish fillets, and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	300	mg/kg	Note 16	6
09.2.3	EC agrees	frozen minced and creamed fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	300	mg/kg	Note 16 & 95	6
09.2.4.1	EC agrees	cooked fish and fish products	300	mg/kg	Note 95	6
09.2.4.2	EC does not support the use of Sunset yellow in this sub category	cooked mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	250	mg/kg		6
09.2.4.3	EC agrees	fried fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	300	mg/kg	Note 16	6
09.2.5	EC agrees	smoked, dried, fermented, and/or salted fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	100	mg/kg	Note 22 ⁵⁶	6
09.3.1	EC agrees	fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms, marinated and/or in jelly	300	mg/kg	Note 16	6
09.3.2	EC agrees	fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and	300	mg/kg	Note 16	6

⁵⁴ **Note 50:** For use in fish roe only.

⁵⁵ **Note 95:** For use in surimi and fish roe products only.

⁵⁶ **Note 22:** For use in smoked fish products only.

Food Cat No.	EC comments	Food Category	Max	Level	Comments	Step
		echinoderms, pickled and/or in brine				
09.3.3	EC does not support the use of Sunset yellow in this sub category	salmon substitutes, caviar, and other fish roe products	300	mg/kg		6
09.3.4	EC supports lowering the ML at 100 mg/kg which is sufficient to achieve the need	semi-preserved fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms (e.g., fish paste), excluding products of food categories 09.3.1 - 09.3.3	300	mg/kg		6
09.4	EC agrees	fully preserved, including canned or fermented fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	300	mg/kg	Note 95	6
10.1	EC agrees	fresh eggs		GMP	Note 4 ⁵⁷	6
10.4	EC agrees	egg-based desserts (e.g., custard)	50	mg/kg		6
12.2.2	EC agrees	seasonings and condiments	300	mg/kg		6
12.4	EC agrees	mustards	300	mg/kg		6
12.5	EC agrees	soups and broths	50	mg/kg		6
12.6	EC agrees except for tomato-based sauces	sauces and like products	300	mg/kg		6
12.9.5	EC agrees but supports lowering the ML to 100 mg/kg	other protein products	200	mg/kg		6
13.3	EC agrees	dietetic foods intended for special medical purposes (excluding products of food category 13.1)	50	mg/kg		6
13.4	EC agrees	dietetic formulae for slimming purposes and weight reduction	50	mg/kg		6
13.5	EC agrees	dietetic foods (e.g., supplementary foods for dietary use) excluding products of food categories 13.1 - 13.4 and 13.6	300	mg/kg		6
13.6	EC agrees	food supplements	300	mg/kg		6
14.1.4		Water-based flavoured drinks, including "sport," "energy," or "electrolyte" drinks and particulated drinks	100	mg/kg	Note 127 and 161	
14.1.4.1	EC agrees	carbonated water-based flavoured drinks	100	mg/kg		6
14.1.4.2	EC agrees	non-carbonated water-based flavoured drinks, including punches and ades	100	mg/kg		6
14.1.4.3	EC agrees	concentrates (liquid or solid) for water-based flavoured drinks	100	mg/kg		6
14.2.2	EC agrees	cider and perry	200	mg/kg		6
14.2.4	EC agrees	wines (other than	200	mg/kg		6

⁵⁷ **Note 4:** For decoration, stamping, marking or branding the product.

Food Cat No.	EC comments	Food Category	Max	Level	Comments	Step
		grape)				
14.2.6	EC agrees	distilled spirituous beverages containing more than 15% alcohol	200	mg/kg		6
14.2.7	EC agrees	aromatized alcoholic beverages (e.g., beer, wine and spirituous cooler-type beverages, low alcoholic refreshers)	200	mg/kg		6
15.1	EC agrees	snacks - potato, cereal, flour or starch based (from roots and tubers, pulses and legumes)	200	mg/kg		3

Food Cat No.	EC comments	Food Category	Max	Level	Comments	Step
05.1.5	EC supports lowering the ML to 50 mg/kg for intake consideration	imitation chocolate, chocolate substitute products	300	mg/kg		6
16.0	EC strongly opposes Foodstuffs should always be clearly defined	composite foods - foods that could not be placed in categories 01 - 15	500	mg/kg		6

CARMINES (INS 120)

27. At the 55th meeting of the JECFA, (2000), the 1982 ADI of 0-5 mg/kg bw/d for carmines, as ammonium carmine or the equivalent of calcium, potassium and sodium salts was maintained.

Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level	Comments
15.3	Snacks – fish based	200 mg/kg	Note BB

EC comments: The European Community agrees with recommendation 1.

Food Cat No.	EC COMMENTS	Food Category	Max Level	Comments	Step
01.6.5	EC agrees	cheese analogues	100 mg/kg	Note 3 ⁵⁸ , & BB ⁵⁹	6
02.2.1.3 ⁶⁰	EC does not support the use of carmine in this sub-category	blends of butter and margarine	500 mg/kg	Note BB	3
02.2.2	EC does not agree	emulsions containing less than 80% fat	500 mg/kg	Note BB	3
02.3	EC does not agree	fat emulsions mainly of type oil-in-water, including mixed and/or flavoured products based on fat emulsions	500 mg/kg	Note BB	6
04.2.2.3	EC does not agree	vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and seaweeds in vinegar, oil, brine, or soy sauce	500 mg/kg	Note BB	6
05.3	EC agrees	chewing gum	500 mg/kg	Note BB	6
06.4.2	In instant noodles only . If no other interest EC does not support	dried pastas and noodles and like products	100 mg/kg		3
06.4.3	In instant noodles only. If no other interest EC does not support	pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products	100 mg/kg		3
07.1	EC strongly opposes the use of carmine in this basic foodstuff (no technological need). In addition, this foodstuff is widelyconsumed which could lead to	bread and ordinary bakery wares	500 mg/kg		6

⁵⁸ Note 3: Surface treatment.

⁵⁹ Note BB: Expressed as carminic acid.

⁶⁰ CX/FA 08/40/6 proposes to revise the GSFA food category system. If endorsed by the CCFA, food categories 02.2.1.1, 02.2.1.2 and 02.2.1.3 would be deleted.

Food Cat No.	EC COMMENTS	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step
	an exceedance of the ADI.					
07.1.1	EC does not support	Breads and rolls	500	mg/kg		6
07.1.2	EC does not support	Crackers, excluding sweet crackers	200	mg/kg	Note BB	6
07.1.4	EC does not support for	bread-type products, including bread stuffing and bread crumbs	500	mg/kg	Note BB	3
09.2.1	EC agrees	frozen fish, fish fillets, and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	100	mg/kg	Note 85 ⁶¹ Note 95 ⁶²	3
09.2.2	EC agrees	frozen battered fish, fish fillets, and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	500	mg/kg	Note 16 ⁶³ & 95	6
09.2.2	EC does not support without Notes 16 and 95	frozen battered fish, fish fillets, and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	100	mg/kg		3
09.2.4.3	EC agrees	fried fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	500	mg/kg	Note 16 & 95	6
09.2.4.3	EC agrees	fried fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	150	mg/kg		3
14.1.4	EC agrees	water-based flavoured drinks, including "sport," "energy," or "electrolyte" drinks and particulated drinks	100	mg/kg	Note BB	6
14.2.7	EC agrees	aromatized alcoholic beverages (e.g., beer, wine and spirituous cooler-type beverages, low alcoholic refreshers)	200	mg/kg	Note BB	6
14.2.7		aromatized alcoholic beverages (e.g., beer, wine and spirituous cooler-type beverages, low alcoholic refreshers)	500	mg/kg		3

PONCEAU 4R (COCHINEAL RED A) (INS 124)

28. The 26th JECFA (1982) assigned an ADI of 4 mg/kg bw/d for ponceau 4R.

Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments
07.2.1	Cakes, cookies and pies (e.g., fruit-filled or custard types)	50	mg/kg	
07.2.2	Other fine bakery products (e.g., doughnuts, sweet rolls, scones, and muffins)	50	mg/kg	
07.2.3	Mixes for fine bakery wares (e.g., cakes, pancakes)	50	mg/kg	

EC comments : The EC supports recommendation 1

Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max	Level	Comments	Step
04.1.1.2	surface-treated fresh fruit	500	mg/kg	Note 16 ⁶⁴	6
04.2.1.2	surface-treated fresh vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds	500	mg/kg	Note 16	6
04.2.2.3	vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and seaweeds in vinegar, oil, brine, or soy sauce	500	mg/kg		6
04.2.2.4	canned or bottled (pasteurized) or retort pouch vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds	200	mg/kg		6
04.2.2.5	vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed purees and spreads (e.g., peanut butter)	100	mg/kg		6
04.2.2.6	vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed pulps and preparations (e.g., vegetable desserts and sauces, candied vegetables) other than food category 04.2.2.5	200	mg/kg		6
05.1.1	cocoa mixes (powders) and cocoa mass/cake	50	mg/kg		6
05.1.2	cocoa mixes (syrops)	50	mg/kg		6

⁶¹ Note 85: Excluding use in surimi and fish roe products at 500 mg/kg.

⁶² Note 95: For use in surimi and fish roe products only.

⁶³ Note 16: For use in glaze, coatings or decorations for fruit, vegetables, meat or fish.

⁶⁴ Note 16: For use in glaze, coatings or decorations for fruit, vegetables, meat or fish.

Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max	Level	Comments	Step
05.1.3	cocoa-based spreads, including fillings	100	mg/kg		6
05.1.4	cocoa and chocolate products	150	mg/kg		6
06.3	breakfast cereals, including rolled oats	200	mg/kg		6
08.1	fresh meat, poultry, and game	500	mg/kg	Note 16	6
08.2	processed meat, poultry, and game products in whole pieces or cuts	30	mg/kg		6
08.3.1.1	cured (including salted) non-heat treated processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	250	mg/kg		6
08.3.1.2	cured (including salted) and dried non-heat treated processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	200	mg/kg		6
08.3.1.3	fermented non-heat treated processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	30	mg/kg		6
08.3.2	heat-treated processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	200	mg/kg		6
08.3.3	frozen processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	200	mg/kg		6
09.1.1	fresh fish	300	mg/kg	Note 50 ⁶⁵	6
09.1.2	fresh mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	500	mg/kg	Notes 4 ⁶⁶ & 16	6
09.2.1	frozen fish, fish fillets, and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	500	mg/kg		6
09.2.4.3	fried fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	500	mg/kg	Note 16	6
09.3.1	fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms, marinated and/or in jelly	500	mg/kg	Note 16	6
09.3.2	fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms, pickled and/or in brine	500	mg/kg	Note 16	6

EC comments : The European Community agrees with recommendation 2

Food Cat No.	EC COMMENTS	Food Category	Max	Level	Comments	Step
01.1.2	EC considers 50 mg/kg sufficient to achieve the need	dairy-based drinks, flavoured and/or fermented (e.g., chocolate milk, cocoa, eggnog, drinking yoghurt, whey-based drinks)	150	mg/kg		6
01.6.1	EC opposes the use of ponceau 4R in this basic foodstuff	unripened cheese	100	mg/kg	Note 3 ⁶⁷	
01.6.2.2	EC agrees	rind of ripened cheese	100	mg/kg		6
01.6.4	EC opposes in broader category	processed cheese	200	mg/kg		6
01.6.4.2	EC agrees	Flavoured processed cheese, including containing fruit, vegetables, meat, etc.	100	mg/kg		6
01.6.5	EC agrees	cheese analogues	100	mg/kg	Note 3	3
01.7	EC agrees	dairy-based desserts (e.g., pudding, fruit or flavoured yoghurt)	50	mg/kg		6
02.4	EC agrees	fat-based desserts excluding dairy-based dessert products of food category 01.7	50	mg/kg		6
03.0	EC agrees	edible ices, including sherbet and sorbet	50	mg/kg		6
04.1.2.4	EC opposes this use had the potential to mislead the consumer	canned or bottled (pasteurized) fruit	300	mg/kg		6
04.1.2.5	EC agrees	jams, jellies and marmelades	100	mg/kg		6
04.1.2.6	EC agrees	fruit-based spreads (e.g., chutney) excluding products of food category 04.1.2.5	500	mg/kg		6
04.1.2.7	EC agrees	candied fruit	200	mg/kg		6
04.1.2.8	EC opposes the use of ponceau 4R in this basic foodstuff	fruit preparations, including pulp, purees, fruit toppings and coconut milk	50	mg/kg		6
04.1.2.9	EC agrees	fruit-based desserts, including fruit-flavoured water-based desserts	50	mg/kg		6
04.1.2.11	EC agrees	fruit fillings for pastries	50	mg/kg		6
04.2.2.7	EC opposes	fermented vegetable (including	500	mg/kg		3

⁶⁵ **Note 50:** For use in fish roe only.

⁶⁶ **Note 4:** For decoration, stamping, marking or branding the product.

⁶⁷ **Note 3:** Surface treatment.

Food Cat No.	EC COMMENTS	Food Category	Max	Level	Comments	Step
	Technological need requested	mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweed products, excluding fermented soybean products of food category 12.10				
05.1.5	EC agrees	imitation chocolate, chocolate substitute products	50	mg/kg		6
05.2	EC agrees	confectionery including hard and soft candy, nougat, etc. other than food categories 05.1, 05.3 and 05.4	50	mg/kg		6
05.3	EC considers the ML of 300 mg/kg very high and supports lowering the ML to 50 mg/kg which is sufficient to achieve the need.	chewing gum	300	mg/kg		6
05.4	EC agrees	decorations (e.g., for fine bakery wares), toppings (non-fruit) and sweet sauces	50	mg/kg		6
06.5	EC agrees	cereal and starch based desserts (e.g., rice pudding, tapioca pudding)	50	mg/kg		6
08.4	EC agrees	edible casings (e.g., sausage casings)	500	mg/kg	Note 16 ⁶⁸	6
09.2.2	EC agrees with Note 95	frozen battered fish, fish fillets, and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	500	mg/kg	Note 16	6
09.2.3	EC agrees	frozen minced and creamed fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	500	mg/kg	Note 16 & 95 ⁶⁹	6
09.2.4.1	EC agrees	cooked fish and fish products	500	mg/kg	Note 95	6
09.2.4.2	EC agrees	cooked mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	250	mg/kg		6
09.2.5	EC agrees	smoked, dried, fermented, and/or salted fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	100	mg/kg	Note 22 ⁷⁰	6
09.3.3	EC agrees	salmon substitutes, caviar, and other fish roe products	500	mg/kg		6
09.3.4	EC agrees	semi-preserved fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms (e.g., fish paste), excluding products of food categories 09.3.1 - 09.3.3	100	mg/kg		6
09.4	EC agrees	fully preserved, including canned or fermented fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	500	mg/kg		6
10.1	EC agrees	fresh eggs	500	mg/kg	Note 4	3
10.4	EC agrees	egg-based desserts (e.g., custard)	50	mg/kg		6
11.4	EC opposes The use could mislead the consumers	other sugars and syrups (e.g., xylose, maple syrup, sugar toppings)	300	mg/kg		6
12.2.2	EC agrees	seasonings and condiments	500	mg/kg		6
12.4	EC agrees	mustards	300	mg/kg		6
12.5	EC agrees	soups and broths	50	mg/kg		6
12.6	EC agrees	sauces and like products	50	mg/kg		6
12.7	EC agrees	salads (e.g., macaroni salad, potato salad) and sandwich spreads excluding cocoa- and nut-based spreads of food categories 04.2.2.5 and 05.1.3	200	mg/kg		6
12.9.5	EC agrees	other protein products	100	mg/kg		6

⁶⁸ **Note 16:** For use in glaze, coatings or decorations for fruit, vegetables, meat or fish.

⁶⁹ **Note 95:** For use in surimi and fish roe products only

⁷⁰ **Note 22:** For use in smoked fish products only.

Food Cat No.	EC COMMENTS	Food Category	Max	Level	Comments	Step
13.3	EC agrees	dietetic foods intended for special medical purposes (excluding products of food category 13.1)	50	mg/kg		6
13.4	EC agrees	dietetic formulae for slimming purposes and weight reduction	50	mg/kg		6
13.5	EC agrees	dietetic foods (e.g., supplementary foods for dietary use) excluding products of food categories 13.1 - 13.4 and 13.6	300	mg/kg		6
13.6	EC agrees	food supplements	300	mg/kg		6
14.1.4	EC agrees	water-based flavoured drinks, including "sport," "energy," or "electrolyte" drinks and particulated drinks	50	mg/kg		6
14.2.2	EC agrees	cider and perry	200	mg/kg		6
14.2.4	EC agrees	wines (other than grape)	200	mg/kg		6
14.2.6	EC agrees	distilled spirituous beverages containing more than 15% alcohol	200	mg/kg		6
14.2.7	EC agrees	aromatized alcoholic beverages (e.g., beer, wine and spirituous cooler-type beverages, low alcoholic refreshers)	200	mg/kg		6
15.1	EC agrees	snacks - potato, cereal, flour or starch based (from roots and tubers, pulses and legumes)	200	mg/kg		6
15.2	EC agrees	processed nuts, including covered nuts and nut mixtures (with e.g., dried fruit)	100	mg/kg		6

Food Cat No.	EC Comments	Food Category	Max	Level	Comments	Step
07.0	EC strongly opposes the use of ponceau 4R in this basic foodstuff with wide consumption which would lead to an increase of the ADI and a possible exceedance of the ADI. Ponceau 4R, has been assigned a low ADI and its use should be strictly restricted	bakery wares	200	mg/kg		6
11.6	EC questions the need of colours in this food category st	table-top sweeteners, including those containing high-intensity sweeteners	200	mg/kg		6
16.0	EC strongly opposes Foodstuffs should always be clearly defined	composite foods - foods that could not be placed in categories 01 - 15	500	mg/kg		6

ERYTHROSINE (INS 127)

EC general comments: The European Community supports recommendation 1 but does not support recommendations 2 and 3. Due to the very low ADI, the EC restricts the use of erythrosine are restricted to cocktail cherries and candied cherries. Therefore, for intake reasons, the European Community supports discontinuation of the work on all specific provisions for this food additive.

ALLURA RED AC (INS 129)

29. The 25th JECFA (1981) assigned an ADI of 7 mg/kg bw/d for allura red AC.

Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level	Comments
14.1.5	Coffee, coffee substitutes, tea, herbal infusions, and other hot cereal and grain	100 mg/kg	

Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level	Comments
	beverages, excluding cocoa		

EC comments: The European Community does not support recommendation 1 as technological need is not justified in basic foods and has the potential to mislead the consumer.

Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level	Comments	Step
01.1.2	dairy-based drinks, flavoured and/or fermented (e.g., chocolate milk, cocoa, eggnog, drinking yoghurt, whey-based drinks)	300 mg/kg		6
02.2.1.2	margarine and similar products	300 mg/kg		3
08.1.1	fresh meat, poultry, and game, whole pieces or cuts	500 mg/kg	Note 16	6
08.1.1	fresh meat, poultry, and game, whole pieces or cuts	GMP	Note 4	3
08.1.2	fresh meat, poultry, and game, comminuted	25 mg/kg		6
08.4	edible casings (e.g., sausage casings)	GMP		3
09.1.1	fresh fish	300 mg/kg	Note 50	6

EC comments: the European Community supports recommendation 2

Food Cat No.	EC Comments	Food Category	Max Level	Comments	Step
01.6.1	EC does not support the use of Allura Red in this -category	unripened cheese	200 mg/kg	Note 3 ⁷¹	3
01.6.2.2	EC agrees	rind of ripened cheese	100 mg/kg		6
01.6.4	EC considers the ML of 200 mg/kg as too high and supports lowering it to 100 mg/kg which is sufficient to achieve the need	processed cheese	200 mg/kg		6
01.6.5	EC agrees at a ML of 100 mg/kg (and when rind is expected to be formed)	cheese analogues	300 mg/kg	Note 3	3
01.7	EC considers the ML of 300 mg/kg as too high and supports lowering it to 150 mg/kg which is sufficient to achieve the need	dairy-based desserts (e.g., pudding, fruit or flavoured yoghurt)	300 mg/kg		6
02.3	EC opposes, such use could mislead the consumer	fat emulsions mainly of type oil-in-water, including mixed and/or flavoured products based on fat emulsions	300 mg/kg		6
02.4	EC considers the ML of 300 mg/kg as too high and supports lowering it to 150 mg/kg which is sufficient to achieve the need	fat-based desserts excluding dairy-based dessert products of food category 01.7	300 mg/kg		6
03.0	EC considers the ML of 300 mg/kg as too high and supports lowering it to 150 mg/kg which is sufficient to achieve the need	edible ices, including sherbet and sorbet	300 mg/kg		6
04.1.2.4	EC does not support the use of Allura Red in this basic foodstuff	canned or bottled (pasteurized) fruit	200 mg/kg		6
04.1.2.5	EC does not support the use of Allura Red	jams, jellies and marmelades	300 mg/kg		6
04.1.2.7	EC considers the ML of 300 mg/kg as too high and supports lowering it to 200 mg/kg which is sufficient to achieve the need	candied fruit	300 mg/kg		6
04.1.2.8	EC does not support the use of Allura Red	fruit preparations, including pulp, purees, fruit toppings and coconut milk	300 mg/kg		6
04.1.2.9	EC considers the ML of 300 mg/kg as too high and supports lowering it to 150 mg/kg which is sufficient to achieve the need	fruit-based desserts, including fruit-flavoured water-based desserts	300 mg/kg		6

⁷¹ **Note 3:** Surface treatment.

Food Cat No.	EC Comments	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step
04.1.2.11	EC considers the ML of 300 mg/kg as too high and supports lowering it to 200 mg/kg which is sufficient to achieve the need	fruit fillings for pastries	300	mg/kg		6
04.2.2.3	EC does not support the use of Allura Red in this sub-category of wide consumption which would lead to an increase of the ADI and a possible exceedance of the ADI. Allura Red is allocated a low ADI and its use should be restricted In addition, the technological need is questioned	vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and seaweeds in vinegar, oil, brine, or soy sauce	300	mg/kg		6
04.2.2.4	EC does not support the use of Allura red in this sub-category. The Codex Standard on this category contains no use of colours. Technological need is questioned	canned or bottled (pasteurized) or retort pouch vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds	200	mg/kg		6
04.2.2.6	EC supports with the exception of tomato-paste and tomato-based sauces	vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed pulps and preparations (e.g., vegetable desserts and sauces, candied vegetables) other than food category 04.2.2.5	200	mg/kg		6
05.1.3	EC does not support this use. The Codex standard on this category contains no use of colours Additionally technological need is questioned.	cocoa-based spreads, including fillings	300	mg/kg		6
05.1.4	EC does not support this use. The Codex standard on this category contains no use of colours Additionally technological need is questioned.	cocoa and chocolate products	300	mg/kg		6
05.1.5	EC agrees	imitation chocolate, chocolate substitute products	300	mg/kg		6
05.2	EC agrees	confectionery including hard and soft candy, nougat, etc. other than food categories 05.1, 05.3 and 05.4	300	mg/kg		6
05.3	EC agrees	chewing gum	300	mg/kg		6
05.4	EC agrees	decorations (e.g., for fine bakery wares), toppings (non-fruit) and sweet sauces	300	mg/kg		6
06.2	EC opposes The use in this category is not compatible with several Codex standards (on flours (e.g. wheat flour, whole maize (corn) meal, pearl millet flour,	flours and starches (including soybean	300	mg/kg		6

Food Cat No.	EC Comments	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step
	sorghum flour) which do not contain any use of colours	powder)				
06.3	EC does not support the use of Allura Red in this sub-category of wide consumption which would lead to an increase of the ADI and a possible exceedance of the ADI for children Allura Red is allocated a low ADI and its use should be restricted	breakfast cereals, including rolled oats	300	mg/kg		6
06.5	EC considers the ML is too high and support lowering to 150 mg/kg which is sufficient to achieve the need	cereal and starch based desserts (e.g., rice pudding, tapioca pudding)	300	mg/kg		6
07.1.2	EC does not support the use of Allura Red	crackers, excluding sweet crackers	300	mg/kg		6
07.1.3	EC does not support the use of Allura Red in this sub-category of wide consumption which would lead to an increase of the ADI and a possible exceedance of the ADI	other ordinary bakery products (e.g., bagels, pita, English muffins)	300	mg/kg		6
07.2	EC considers that the ML is too high and support lowering to 200 mg/kg which is sufficient to achieve the need	fine bakery wares (sweet, salty, savoury) and mixes	300	mg/kg		
07.2.1	EC considers that the ML is too high and support lowering to 200 mg/kg which is sufficient to achieve the need	cakes, cookies and pies (e.g., fruit-filled or custard types)	300	mg/kg		6
07.2.2	EC considers that the ML is too high and support lowering to 200 mg/kg which is sufficient to achieve the need	other fine bakery products (e.g., doughnuts, sweet rolls, scones, and muffins)	300	mg/kg		6
07.2.3	EC considers that the ML is too high and support lowering to 200 mg/kg which is sufficient to achieve the need	mixes for fine bakery wares (e.g., cakes, pancakes)	300	mg/kg		6
08.3.2	EC agrees but only in luncheon meat	heat-treated processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	25	mg/kg		6
08.4	EC agrees	edible casings (e.g., sausage casings)	300	mg/kg	Note 16	6
09.2.1	EC agrees	frozen fish, fish fillets, and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	300	mg/kg	Note 95	6
09.2.4.1	EC agrees buty with Note 95 only	cooked fish and fish products	300	mg/kg		6
09.2.4.2	EC agrees on pre-cooked crustaceans	cooked mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	250	mg/kg		6
09.2.5	EC considers the ML as too high and supports lowering it to 100 mg/kg which is sufficient to achieve the need	smoked, dried, fermented, and/or salted fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	300	mg/kg	Note 22	6

Food Cat No.	EC Comments	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step
09.3.3	EC agrees	salmon substitutes, caviar, and other fish roe products	300	mg/kg		6
09.3.4	EC considers the ML as too high and supports lowering it to 100 mg/kg which is sufficient to achieve the need	semi-preserved fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms (e.g., fish paste), excluding products of food categories 09.3.1 - 09.3.3	300	mg/kg		6
10.1	EC agrees	fresh eggs	100	mg/kg	Note 4	3
10.4	EC considers the ML as too high and supports lowering it to 150 mg/kg which is sufficient to achieve the need	egg-based desserts (e.g., custard)	300	mg/kg		6
11.4	EC does not support the use of Allura Red in this sub category The use could mislead the consumer	other sugars and syrups (e.g., xylose, maple syrup, sugar toppings)	300	mg/kg		6
12.2.2	EC agrees	seasonings and condiments	300	mg/kg		6
12.4	EC agrees	mustards	300	mg/kg		6
12.5	EC considers the ML as too high and supports lowering it to 50 mg/kg which is sufficient to achieve the need	soups and broths	300	mg/kg		6
12.6	EC agrees with the exception of tomato-based sauce	sauces and like products	300	mg/kg		6
12.9.5	EC agrees	other protein products	100	mg/kg		6
13.3	EC agrees	dietetic foods intended for special medical purposes (excluding products of food category 13.1)	50	mg/kg		6
13.4	EC agrees	dietetic formulae for slimming purposes and weight reduction	50	mg/kg		6
13.5	EC agrees	dietetic foods (e.g., supplementary foods for dietary use) excluding products of food categories 13.1 - 13.4 and 13.6	300	mg/kg		6
13.6	EC agrees	food supplements	300	mg/kg		6
14.1.4	EC agrees	Water-based flavoured drinks, including "sport," "energy," or "electrolyte" drinks and particulated drinks	300	mg/kg	Note 127 ⁷²	
14.1.4.1	EC agrees	carbonated water-based flavoured drinks	300	mg/kg		6
14.1.4.2	EC agrees	non-carbonated	300	mg/kg		6

⁷² Note 127: As served to the consumer

Food Cat No.	EC Comments	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step
		water-based flavoured drinks, including punches and ades				
14.1.4.3	EC considers the ML as very high and supports lowering it	concentrates (liquid or solid) for water-based flavoured drinks	1572	mg/kg		6
14.2.2	EC agrees	cider and perry	200	mg/kg		6
14.2.4	EC agrees	wines (other than grape)	200	mg/kg		6
14.2.6	EC agrees	distilled spirituous beverages containing more than 15% alcohol	300	mg/kg		6
14.2.7	EC agrees	aromatized alcoholic beverages (e.g., beer, wine and spirituous cooler-type beverages, low alcoholic refreshers)	200	mg/kg		6
15.1	EC considers the ML as high and supports lowering it to 100 mg/kg for intake concern	snacks - potato, cereal, flour or starch based (from roots and tubers, pulses and legumes)	200	mg/kg		6
15.2	EC agrees	processed nuts, including covered nuts and nut mixtures (with e.g., dried fruit)	100	mg/kg		6
16.0	EC strongly opposes Foodstuffs should always be clearly defined	composite foods - foods that could not be placed in categories 01 - 15	300	mg/kg		6

INDIGOTINE (INDIGO CARMINE) (INS 132)

30. The 18th JECFA (1974) assigned an ADI of 5 mg/kg bw/d for indigotine.

Recommendation 1 – Indigotine (Indigo Carmine), INS 132						
The eWG recommends that the 40 th CCFA include at Step 3 the following food additive provisions for indigotine, in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max	Level	Comments	Justification provided to eWG	
01.6.4.2	Flavoured processed cheese, including containing fruit, vegetables, meat, etc.	100	mg/kg			

EC comments: the European Community supports recommendation 1

Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max	Level	Comments	Step
01.6.1	unripened cheese	200	mg/kg	Note 3 ⁷³	3
02.2.1.2	margarine and similar products	200	mg/kg		3
04.1.2.4	canned or bottled (pasteurized) fruit	200	mg/kg		6
04.2.2.4	canned or bottled (pasteurized) or retort pouch vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds	200	mg/kg		6
05.1.3	cocoa-based spreads, including fillings	100	mg/kg		6
06.3	breakfast cereals, including rolled oats	300	mg/kg		6
12.2.1	herbs and spices	300	mg/kg		6

EC comments: the European Community supports recommendation 2

⁷³ Note 3: Surface treatment.

Food Cat No.	EC comments	Food Category	Max	Level	Comments	Step
01.1.2	EC considers the ML as high and supports lowering it to 100 mg/kg	dairy-based drinks, flavoured and/or fermented (e.g., chocolate milk, cocoa, eggnog, drinking yoghurt, whey-based drinks)	300	mg/kg	Note 52 ⁷⁴	6
01.6.2.2	EC agrees	rind of ripened cheese	100	mg/kg		6
01.6.5	EC considers the ML as high and supports lowering it to 100 mg/kg	cheese analogues	200	mg/kg	Note 3	3
01.7	EC agrees]	dairy-based desserts (e.g., pudding, fruit or flavoured yoghurt)	150	mg/kg		6
02.1.3	Discontinue Technological need questioned Use could mislead the consumer	lard, tallow, fish oil, and other animal fats	300	mg/kg		3
02.3	Discontinue Technological need questioned	fat emulsions mainly of type oil-in-water, including mixed and/or flavoured products based on fat emulsions	300	mg/kg		6
02.4	EC agrees	fat-based desserts excluding dairy-based dessert products of food category 01.7	150	mg/kg		6
03.0	EC agrees	edible ices, including sherbet and sorbet	150	mg/kg		6
04.1.2.5	EC does not support	jams, jellies and marmelades	300	mg/kg		6
04.1.2.6	EC agrees	fruit-based spreads (e.g., chutney) excluding products of food category 04.1.2.5	300	mg/kg		6
04.1.2.7	EC agrees	candied fruit	200	mg/kg		6
04.1.2.8	EC does not support for intake concern Indigotine is allocated a low ADI and its use should be restricted.	fruit preparations, including pulp, purees, fruit toppings and coconut milk	150	mg/kg		6
04.1.2.9	EC agrees	fruit-based desserts, including fruit-flavoured water-based desserts	150	mg/kg		6
04.1.2.11	EC agrees	fruit fillings for pastries	150	mg/kg		6
04.2.2.3	EC does not support the use of Indigotine in this basic sub-category	vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and seaweeds in vinegar, oil, brine, or soy sauce	150	mg/kg		6
04.2.2.6	EC agrees	vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed pulps and preparations (e.g., vegetable desserts and sauces, candied vegetables) other than food category 04.2.2.5	200	mg/kg	Note 92 ⁷⁵	6
04.2.2.7	EC agrees	fermented vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweed products, excluding fermented soybean products of food category 12.10	300	mg/kg		3

⁷⁴ **Note 52:** Excluding chocolate milk

⁷⁵ **Note 92:** Excluding tomato-based products

Food Cat No.	EC comments	Food Category	Max	Level	Comments	Step
05.1.5	EC agrees	imitation chocolate, chocolate substitute products	300	mg/kg		6
05.2	EC agrees	confectionery including hard and soft candy, nougat, etc. other than food categories 05.1, 05.3 and 05.4	300	mg/kg		6
05.3	EC agrees	chewing gum	300	mg/kg		6
05.4	EC agrees	decorations (e.g., for fine bakery wares), toppings (non-fruit) and sweet sauces	300	mg/kg		6
06.5	EC agrees	cereal and starch based desserts (e.g., rice pudding, tapioca pudding)	150	mg/kg		6
07.0	EC does not support the use of Indigotine in this sub-category of wide consumption which would lead to an increase of the ADI and a possible exceedance of the ADI	bakery wares	300	mg/kg		6
07.2	EC agrees	Fine bakery wares (sweet, salty, savoury) and mixes	200	mg/kg		6
09.1.1	EC agrees	fresh fish	300	mg/kg	Note 50 ⁷⁶ & 16 ⁷⁷	6
09.2.1	EC agrees	frozen fish, fish fillets, and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	300	mg/kg	Note 95 ⁷⁸	6
09.2.4.1	EC agrees	cooked fish and fish products	300	mg/kg	Note 95	6
09.2.4.2	EC agrees	cooked mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	250	mg/kg	Note 16	6
09.2.5	EC considers the ML too high and supports lowering it to 100 mg/kg	smoked, dried, fermented, and/or salted fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	300	mg/kg	Note 22 ⁷⁹	6
09.3.3	EC agrees	salmon substitutes, caviar, and other fish roe products	300	mg/kg		6
09.3.4	EC considers the ML too high and supports lowering it to 100 mg/kg The use should be restricted by Note 95	semi-preserved fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms (e.g., fish paste), excluding products of food categories 09.3.1 - 09.3.3	300	mg/kg		6
09.4	Note 95 should be added	fully preserved, including canned or fermented fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	300	mg/kg		6
10.1	EC agrees	fresh eggs	300	mg/kg	Note 4 ⁸⁰	3
10.4	EC considers the ML too high and supports lowering it to 150 mg/kg The use should be restricted by Note 95	egg-based desserts (e.g., custard)	300	mg/kg		6
11.4	EC does not support The use could mislead the consumer	other sugars and syrups (e.g., xylose, maple syrup, sugar toppings)	300	mg/kg		6
11.6	EC does not support The use could mislead the consumer	table-top sweeteners, including those containing high-intensity sweeteners	300	mg/kg		6
12.2.2	EC agrees	seasonings and	300	mg/kg		6

⁷⁶ **Note 50:** For use in fish roe only.

⁷⁷ **Note 16** For use in glaze, coatings or decorations for fruit, vegetables, mat or fish.

⁷⁸ **Note 95:** For use in surimi and fish roe products only.

⁷⁹ **Note 22:** For use in smoked fish products only.

⁸⁰ **Note 4:** For decoration, stamping, marking or branding the product.

Food Cat No.	EC comments	Food Category	Max	Level	Comments	Step
		condiments				
12.4	EC agrees	mustards	300	mg/kg		6
12.5	EC agrees	soups and broths	50	mg/kg		6
12.6	EC agrees	sauces and like products	300	mg/kg		6
12.9.5	EC agrees	other protein products	100	mg/kg		6
13.3	EC agrees	dietetic foods intended for special medical purposes (excluding products of food category 13.1)	50	mg/kg		6
13.4	EC agrees	dietetic formulae for slimming purposes and weight reduction	50	mg/kg		6
13.5	EC agrees	dietetic foods (e.g., supplementary foods for dietary use) excluding products of food categories 13.1-13.4 and 13.6	300	mg/kg		6
13.6	EC agrees	food supplements	300	mg/kg		6
14.1.4	EC agrees	water-based flavoured drinks, including "sport," "energy," or "electrolyte" drinks and particulated drinks	100	mg/kg		6
14.2.2	EC agrees	cider and perry	200	mg/kg		6
14.2.4	EC agrees	wines (other than grape)	200	mg/kg		6
14.2.6	EC agrees	distilled spirituous beverages containing more than 15% alcohol	300	mg/kg		6
14.2.7	EC agrees	aromatized alcoholic beverages (e.g., beer, wine and spirituous cooler-type beverages, low alcoholic refreshers)	200	mg/kg		6
15.1	EC agrees	snacks - potato, cereal, flour or starch based (from roots and tubers, pulses and legumes)	200	mg/kg		6
15.2	EC agrees	processed nuts, including covered nuts and nut mixtures (with e.g., dried fruit)	100	mg/kg		6

Food Cat No.	EC comments	Food Category	Max	Level	Comments	Step
05.1.4	EC does not support and questions the technological need	cocoa and chocolate products	450	mg/kg		6
11.3	EC does not support. The use could mislead the consumer	sugar solutions and syrups, also (partially) inverted, including treacle and molasses, excluding products of food category 11.1.3	300	mg/kg		6

BRILLIANT BLUE FCF (INS 133)

31. The 28th CAC has adopted several provisions in the GSFA for the use of brilliant blue FCF.

32. The 13th JECFA (1969) assigned an ADI of 12.5 mg/kg bw/d for brilliant blue FCF.

Recommendation 1 – Brilliant Blue FCF, INS 133						
The eWG recommends that the 40 th CCFA <u>discontinue</u> further work on the following food additive provisions for brilliant blue FCF in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level	Comments	Step	Justification provided to eWG	
04.1.1.2	surface-treated fresh fruit	500 mg/kg	Note 16 ⁸¹	6		

EC comments: the European Community supports recommendation 1

Food Cat No.	EC comments	Food Category	Max Level	Comments	Step

⁸¹ Note 16: For use in glaze, coatings or decorations for fruit, vegetables, meat or fish.

Food Cat No.	EC comments	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step
01.6.5	EC agrees	cheese analogues	100	mg/kg	Note 3	3
04.1.2.4	EC does not support	canned or bottled (pasteurized) fruit	200	mg/kg		6
04.1.2.6	EC agrees	fruit-based spreads (e.g., chutney) excluding products of food category 04.1.2.5	100	mg/kg		6
04.1.2.7	EC agrees	candied fruit	100	mg/kg		6
04.1.2.8	EC does not support The use could mislead the consumer In addition the technological need is questioned.	fruit preparations, including pulp, purees, fruit toppings and coconut milk	100	mg/kg		6
04.2.2.3	EC does not support for intake consideration	vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and seaweeds in vinegar, oil, brine, or soy sauce	500	mg/kg		6
04.2.2.4	EC does not support for intake consideration	canned or bottled (pasteurized) or retort pouch vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds	200	mg/kg		6
04.2.2.6	EC agrees with the exception of tomato-based sauce	vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed pulps and preparations (e.g., vegetable desserts and sauces, candied vegetables) other than food category 04.2.2.5	100	mg/kg		6
04.2.2.7	EC agrees	fermented vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweed products, excluding fermented soybean products of food category 12.10	100	mg/kg	Note 92 ⁸²	3
05.1.3	EC does not support	cocoa-based spreads, including fillings	100	mg/kg		6
05.1.4	EC does not support	cocoa and chocolate products	100	mg/kg		6
05.1.5	EC agrees	imitation chocolate, chocolate substitute products	100	mg/kg		6
07.1	EC strongly opposes extending the use of brilliant blue in this sub-category with wide consumption which may lead to a possible exceedance of the ADI Technological need is questioned	bread and ordinary bakery wares	100	mg/kg		6
07.2	EC agrees	Fine bakery wares (sweet, salty, savoury) and mixes	200	mg/kg		6
08.0	EC agrees	meat and meat products, including poultry and game	100	mg/kg	Notes 4 ⁸³ & 16	6
09.2.4.1	EC agrees	cooked fish and fish	100	mg/kg	Note 95 ⁸⁴ ,	6

⁸² **Note 92:** Excluding tomato-based sauces

⁸³ **Note 4:** For decoration, stamping, marking or branding the product.

Food Cat No.	EC comments	Food Category	Max Level	Comments	Step
		products			
09.2.4.2	EC agrees	cooked mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	100 mg/kg		6
09.2.5	EC agrees	smoked, dried, fermented, and/or salted fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	100 mg/kg	Note 22 ⁸⁵	6
12.2.2	EC agrees	seasonings and condiments	100 mg/kg		6
12.4	EC agrees	mustards	100 mg/kg		6
12.5	EC agrees	soups and broths	50 mg/kg		6
12.6	EC agrees	sauces and like products	100 mg/kg		6
12.9.5	EC agrees	other protein products	100 mg/kg		6

Food Cat No.	EC comments	Food Category	Max Level	Comments	Step
01.6.1	EC does not support the use of brilliant blue in this basic foodstuff for intake consideration	unripened cheese	200 mg/kg	Note 3 ⁸⁶	3
04.1.2.5	EC does not support the use of brilliant blue in this sub-category	jams, jellies and marmelades	500 mg/kg		6
16.0	EC strongly opposes Foodstuffs should always be clearly defined	composite foods - foods that could not be placed in categories 01 - 15	100 mg/kg	Note 2 ⁸⁷	6

CHLOROPHYLLS, COPPER (INS 141(i) & 141(ii))

33. The 28th CAC has adopted several provisions in the GSFA for the use of chlorophylls, copper.

34. The 13th JECFA (1969) assigned an ADI of 15 mg/kg bw/d for chlorophylls, copper (141(i) & 141(ii)).

Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max	Level	Comments	Step
15.3	Snacks –fish based	350	mg/kg		

EC comments: the European Community supports recommendation 1

Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max	Level	Comments	Step
02.1.2	vegetable oils and fats		GMP		6
02.1.3	lard, tallow, fish oil, and other animal fats		GMP		6
02.2.1.3	blends of butter and margarine		GMP		6
02.2.2	emulsions containing less than 80% fat		GMP		6
02.3	fat emulsions mainly of type oil-in-water, including mixed and/or flavoured products based on fat emulsions		GMP		6
04.1.1.2	surface-treated fresh fruit		GMP	Note 16 ⁸⁸	6
04.2.2.2	dried vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds	100	mg/kg	Notes 62 & 89 ⁸⁹	6
04.2.2.3	vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and seaweeds in vinegar, oil, brine, or soy sauce	500	mg/kg		6
04.2.2.4	canned or bottled (pasteurized) or retort pouch vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds	100	mg/kg	Note 62	6
06.3	breakfast cereals, including rolled oats	100	mg/kg		3
06.4.2	dried pastas and noodles and like products		GMP		6
09.2.1	frozen fish, fish fillets, and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms		GMP	Note 95 ⁹⁰	6
09.2.5	smoked, dried, fermented, and/or salted fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	40	mg/kg	Note 62	6

⁸⁴ Note 95: For use in surimi and fish roe products only

⁸⁵ Note 22: For use in smoked fish products only.

⁸⁶ Note 3: Surface treatment.

⁸⁷ Note 2: On dry ingredient, dry weight, dry mix or concentrate basis.

⁸⁸ Note 16: For use in glaze, coatings or decorations for fruit, vegetables, meat or fish.

⁸⁹ Note 89: Except for use in dried tangle (KONBU) at 150 mg/kg.

⁹⁰ Note 95: For use in surimi and fish roe products only.

EC comments: the European Community supports recommendation 2

Food Cat No.	EC comments	Food Category	Max	Level	Comments	Step
01.1.2	EC agrees	dairy-based drinks, flavoured and/or fermented (e.g., chocolate milk, cocoa, eggnog, drinking yoghurt, whey-based drinks)	50	mg/kg	Note 52⁹¹	3
01.6.1	EC opposes	unripened cheese	50	mg/kg		3
01.6.2.1	EC agrees	ripened cheese, includes rind	50	mg/kg		3
01.6.2.1		ripened cheese, includes rind	15	mg/kg		6
01.6.2.2	EC agrees	rind of ripened cheese	75	mg/kg		3
01.6.2.3	EC agrees	cheese powder (for reconstitution; e.g., for cheese sauces)	50	mg/kg		3
01.6.4	Discontinue	processed cheese	50	mg/kg		3
01.6.4.2	EC agrees	Flavoured processed cheese, including containing fruit, vegetables, meat, etc.	50	mg/kg		3
01.6.5	EC agrees	cheese analogues	50	mg/kg		3
01.7	EC agrees	dairy-based desserts (e.g., pudding, fruit or flavoured yoghurt)	200	mg/kg		6
01.7		dairy-based desserts (e.g., pudding, fruit or flavoured yoghurt)	500	mg/kg		3
02.4	EC agrees	fat-based desserts excluding dairy-based dessert products of food category 01.7	500	mg/kg		3
02.4		fat-based desserts excluding dairy-based dessert products of food category 01.7		GMP		6
03.0	EC agrees	edible ices, including sherbet and sorbet	500	mg/kg		3
04.1.2.5	EC agrees	jams, jellies and marmelades	200	mg/kg		6
04.1.2.6	EC agrees	fruit-based spreads (e.g., chutney) excluding products of food category 04.1.2.5	150	mg/kg		6
04.1.2.7	EC agrees	candied fruit	250	mg/kg		3
04.1.2.9	EC agrees	fruit-based desserts, including fruit-flavoured water-based desserts	150	mg/kg	Note 62⁹²	6
05.1.2	EC opposes	cocoa mixes (syrups)	6.4	mg/kg	Note 62	3
05.1.3	EC opposes	cocoa-based spreads, including fillings	6.4	mg/kg	Note 62	3
05.1.4	EC opposes	cocoa and chocolate products	700	mg/kg		6
05.1.5	EC agrees	imitation chocolate, chocolate substitute products	700	mg/kg		6
05.2.1	EC agrees	hard candy	700	mg/kg		6
05.2.2	EC agrees	soft candy	100	mg/kg		6
05.2.3	EC agrees	nougats and marzipans	100	mg/kg		6
05.3	EC agrees	chewing gum	700	mg/kg		6
05.4	EC agrees	decorations (e.g., for fine bakery wares), toppings (non-fruit) and sweet sauces	100	mg/kg		3
06.4.3	EC does not support Only in instant noodles	pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products	100	mg/kg		3
06.4.3	EC does not support	pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products		GMP		6
06.5	EC does not support	cereal and starch based desserts (e.g., rice pudding, tapioca pudding)	6.4	mg/kg	Note 62	6
06.5	EC agrees	cereal and starch based desserts (e.g., rice pudding, tapioca pudding)	75	mg/kg		3
07.1.4	EC opposed in this basic foodstuff	bread-type products, including bread stuffing and bread crumbs	6.4	mg/kg	Note 62	3
07.2	EC agrees	fine bakery wares (sweet, salty, savoury) and mixes	75	mg/kg		3
09.2.3	EC agrees	frozen minced and creamed fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	40	mg/kg	Note 95⁹³	3
09.2.4.1	EC agrees	cooked fish and fish products	30	mg/kg	Note 62 & 95	6
09.2.4.3	EC agrees	fried fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	40	mg/kg	Note 62 & 95	6
09.2.5	EC does not support this provision	smoked, dried, fermented, and/or salted fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	200	mg/kg		3

⁹¹ **Note 52:** Excluding chocolate milk⁹² **Note 62:** As copper.⁹³ **Note 95:** For use in surimi and fish roe products only.

Food Cat No.	EC comments	Food Category	Max	Level	Comments	Step
09.3.1	EC agrees	fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms, marinated and/or in jelly	40	mg/kg	Note 16	3
09.3.2	EC agrees	fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms, pickled and/or in brine	40	mg/kg	Note 16	3
09.3.3	EC agrees	salmon substitutes, caviar, and other fish roe products	200	mg/kg		3
09.3.4	EC agrees	semi-preserved fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms (e.g., fish paste), excluding products of food categories 09.3.1 - 09.3.3	75	mg/kg	Note 95	3
09.4	EC agrees	fully preserved, including canned or fermented fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	500	mg/kg	Note 95	6
10.4	EC agrees	egg-based desserts (e.g., custard)	300	mg/kg	Note 2 ⁹⁴	3
12.2.2	EC agrees	seasonings and condiments	500	mg/kg		3
12.4	EC agrees	mustards	500	mg/kg		6
12.5	EC agrees	soups and broths	400	mg/kg	Note 127 ⁹⁵	
12.6	EC agrees	sauces and like products	100	mg/kg		3
13.6	EC agrees	food supplements	500	mg/kg	Note 3 ⁹⁶	6
14.1.4	EC agrees	water-based flavoured drinks, including "sport," "energy," or "electrolyte" drinks and particulated drinks	300	mg/kg		6
15.1	EC agrees	snacks - potato, cereal, flour or starch based (from roots and tubers, pulses and legumes)	350	mg/kg		3
15.2	EC agrees	processed nuts, including covered nuts and nut mixtures (with e.g., dried fruit)	100	mg/kg		3

FAST GREEN FCF (INS 143)

35. The 30th JECFA (1986) assigned an ADI of 25 mg/kg bw/d for fast green FCF.

General EC comment: The European Community notes that this food additive is not currently permitted in the EU.

Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level	Comments	Step
09.2.1	frozen fish, fish fillets, and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	100 mg/kg		6
09.2.4.3	fried fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	100 mg/kg		6

EC comments: the European Community supports recommendation 1

Food Cat No.	EC comments	Food Category	Max Level	Comments	Step
02.4	EC agrees	fat-based desserts excluding dairy-based dessert products of food category 01.7	100 mg/kg		6
04.1.2.6	EC agrees	fruit-based spreads (e.g., chutney) excluding products of food category 04.1.2.5	100 mg/kg		6
04.1.2.7	EC agrees	candied fruit	100 mg/kg		6
04.1.2.8	EC agrees	fruit preparations, including pulp, purees, fruit toppings and coconut milk	100 mg/kg		6
04.1.2.9	EC agrees	fruit-based desserts, including fruit-flavoured water-based desserts	100 mg/kg		6
04.1.2.11	EC agrees	fruit fillings for pastries	100 mg/kg		6
04.2.2.7	EC agrees	fermented vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweed products, excluding fermented soybean products of food category 12.10	100 mg/kg		3
05.2	EC agrees	confectionery including hard and soft candy, nougat, etc. other than food categories 05.1, 05.3 and 05.4	100 mg/kg		6
05.4	EC agrees	decorations (e.g., for fine bakery wares), toppings (non-fruit) and sweet sauces	100 mg/kg		6
06.4.2	EC does not support	dried pastas and noodles and like products	100 mg/kg		6
06.4.3	EC does not support	pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like	100 mg/kg		6

⁹⁴ Note 2: On dry ingredient, dry weight, dry mix or concentrate basis.

⁹⁵ Note 127 As served to the consumer.

⁹⁶ Note 3: Surface treatment

Food Cat No.	EC comments	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step
	support	products				
06.4.3	EC does not support	pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products	300	mg/kg		3
06.5	EC does not support	cereal and starch based desserts (e.g., rice pudding, tapioca pudding)	100	mg/kg		6
07.0	EC strongly opposed	bakery wares	100	mg/kg		6
07.1.1	EC strongly opposed	bread and rolls	100	mg/kg		Adopted
07.2	EC agrees	fine bakery wares (sweet, salty, savoury) and mixes	100	mg/kg		Adopted
08.1	EC agrees	fresh meat, poultry, and game	100	mg/kg	Notes 3 ⁹⁷ , 4 ⁹⁸ , & 16 ⁹⁹	3
08.2	EC agrees	processed meat, poultry, and game products in whole pieces or cuts	100	mg/kg	Notes 3 & 4	3
08.4	EC agrees	edible casings (e.g., sausage casings)	100	mg/kg	Notes 3 & 4	3
09.4	EC agrees	fully preserved, including canned or fermented fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	100	mg/kg	Note 95 ¹⁰⁰	6
10.4	EC agrees	egg-based desserts (e.g., custard)	100	mg/kg		6
12.2.2	EC agrees	seasonings and condiments	100	mg/kg		6
12.6.1	EC agrees	emulsified sauces (e.g., mayonnaise, salad dressing)	100	mg/kg		6
13.6	EC agrees	food supplements	600	mg/kg		6

CARAMEL III – AMMONIA PROCESS (INS 150(c))

36. The 29th JECFA (1985) assigned an ADI of 200 mg/kg bw/d for caramel III – ammonia process.

EC GENERAL POSITION : the EC is of the opinion that some of the maximum levels proposed are excessive, not justified from a technological point of view, and could lead to an exceedance of the ADI.

In particular, the EC is of the opinion that the highest maximum levels proposed in the various uses hereafter should be lowered, except if additional data can be provided to demonstrate that such high levels proposed are really needed from a technological point of view.

Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step
02.2.1.2	margarine and similar products	20000	mg/kg		3
05.1.1	cocoa mixes (powders) and cocoa mass/cake		GMP		6
08.0	meat and meat products, including poultry and game	200000	mg/kg	Note 16 ¹⁰¹	3
12.2	herbs, spices, seasonings, and condiments (e.g., seasoning for instant noodles)	100000	mg/kg		3
14.1.2.2	vegetable juice	50000	mg/kg		3
14.1.2.4	concentrates for vegetable juice	50000	mg/kg		3

EC comments: the European Community supports recommendation 1

Recommendation 2 - Caramel III – Ammonia Process, INS 150(c)					
The eWG recommends that the 40 th CCFA revoke the following adopted food additive provisions for caramel III – ammonia process in the GSFA.					
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Justification provided to eWG
01.2.1	fermented milks (plain)	150	mg/kg	Note 12 ¹⁰²	
01.2.2	renneted milk (plain)		GMP		

EC comments: the European Community supports recommendation 2

Food Cat No.	EC comments	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step
01.1.2	The ML seems too high	dairy-based drinks, flavoured and/or fermented (e.g., chocolate milk, cocoa, eggnog, drinking yoghurt, whey-based drinks)	50000	mg/kg	Note 52 ¹⁰³	3
01.3.2	EC does not support	beverage whiteners	1000	mg/kg		3

⁹⁷ Note 3: Surface treatment.

⁹⁸ Note 4: For decoration, stamping, marking or branding the product.

⁹⁹ Note 16: For use in glaze, coatings or decorations for fruit, vegetables, meat or fish.

¹⁰⁰ Note 95: For use in surimi and fish roe products only.

¹⁰¹ Note 16: For use in glaze, coatings or decorations for fruit, vegetables, meat or fish.

¹⁰² Note 12: Carryover from flavouring substances.

¹⁰³ Note 52: Excluding chocolate milk

Food Cat No.	EC comments	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step
	Need questioned					
01.4.3	EC does not support Need questioned. Clotted cream is a product with an expected natural colour, the use of additional colour could mislead the consumer	clotted cream (plain)	5000	mg/kg		3
01.4.4	EC does not support Need questioned	cream analogues	5000	mg/kg		3
01.5.2	EC does not support Need questioned	milk and cream powder analogues	5000	mg/kg		3
01.6.1	EC does not support Need questioned as rind is not expected to be formed in unripened cheese	unripened cheese	50000	mg/kg		3
01.6.2	EC does not support the provision in the broad category	ripened cheese	50000	mg/kg		3
01.6.2.2	EC agrees	rind of ripened cheese		GMP		Adopted
01.6.4	EC considers the ML very high	processed cheese	50000	mg/kg		3
01.6.5	EC considers the ML very high	cheese analogues	50000	mg/kg		3
01.7	EC considers the ML very high	dairy-based desserts (e.g., pudding, fruit or flavoured yoghurt)	50000	mg/kg		3
01.8.1	EC considers the ML too high (a child of 20 kg bw would reach the ADI by consuming 100 g of the product Moreover the technological need is questioned	whey and whey products, excluding whey cheeses	50000	mg/kg		3
02.1.2	EC does not agree with this provision because CX STAN 19 prohibits the use of colors in vegetable oils	vegetable oils and fats	20000	mg/kg		3
02.1.3	EC does not support. The use could mislead the consumer	lard, tallow, fish oil, and other animal fats	20000	mg/kg		3
02.2.1.3 ¹⁰⁴	EC does not support	blends of butter and margarine	20000	mg/kg		3
02.2.2	EC does not support	emulsions containing less than 80% fat	500	mg/kg		3
02.3	EC does not support	fat emulsions mainly of type oil-in-water, including mixed and/or flavoured products based on fat emulsions	20000	mg/kg		3
02.4	EC considers the ML high	fat-based desserts excluding dairy-based dessert products of food category 01.7	20000	mg/kg		3
03.0	EC considers the ML high	edible ices, including sherbet and sorbet	30000	mg/kg		3
04.1.2	The EC does not agree because some sub-categories (as 04.1.2.1) are not expected to contain colours. Moreover the ML seems to be high	processed fruit	50,000	mg/kg		3
04.1.2.3	EC agrees	fruit in vinegar, oil, or brine		GMP		Adopted
04.1.2.4	EC opposes	canned or bottled (pasteurized) fruit		GMP		Adopted
04.1.2.5	EC agrees	jams, jellies and marmelades		GMP		Adopted
04.1.2.6	EC agrees	fruit-based spreads (e.g., chutney) excluding products of food category 04.1.2.5	500	mg/kg		Adopted
04.1.2.7	EC agrees	candied fruit		GMP		Adopted
04.1.2.8	EC does not support this use. Consumer may be misled	fruit preparations, including pulp, purees, fruit toppings and coconut milk	7500	mg/kg		Adopted
04.1.2.9		fruit-based desserts, including fruit-flavoured water-based desserts		GMP		Adopted
04.1.2.11		fruit fillings for pastries	7500	mg/kg		Adopted
04.2.2	EC does not support this use.	processed vegetables	50,000	mg/kg		3

¹⁰⁴ CX/FA 08/40/6 proposes to revise the GSFA food category system. If endorsed by the CCFA, food categories 02.2.1.1, 02.2.1.2 and 02.2.1.3 would be deleted.

Food Cat No.	EC comments	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step
	Consumer may be misled	(including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds				
04.2.2.2	EC does not support	dried vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds		GMP	Note 76 ¹⁰⁵	6
04.2.2.3	EC agrees	vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and seaweeds in vinegar, oil, brine, or soy sauce	500	mg/kg		Adopted
04.2.2.4		canned or bottled (pasteurized) or retort pouch vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds		GMP		Adopted
04.2.2.5		vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed purees and spreads (e.g., peanut butter)		GMP		Adopted
04.2.2.6		vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed pulps and preparations (e.g., vegetable desserts and sauces, candied vegetables) other than food category 04.2.2.5		GMP		Adopted
04.2.2.7	EC agrees	fermented vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweed products, excluding fermented soybean products of food category 12.10		GMP		6
04.2.2.8	EC does not support this use.	cooked or fried vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds		GMP		6
05.1.2	EC opposes	cocoa mixes (syrups)	50000	mg/kg		6
05.1.4	EC opposes	cocoa and chocolate products	50000	mg/kg		6
05.1.5	EC agrees	imitation chocolate, chocolate substitute products	50000	mg/kg		
06.3		breakfast cereals, including rolled oats	50000	mg/kg	Note AA ¹⁰⁶	3
06.4.2	EC opposes	dried pastas and noodles and like products	50000	mg/kg		3
06.4.3	EC opposes	pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products	50000	mg/kg		3
06.5		cereal and starch based desserts (e.g., rice pudding, tapioca pudding)	50000	mg/kg		3
06.6		batters (e.g., for breading or batters for fish or poultry)	50000	mg/kg		3
06.7		pre-cooked or processed rice products, including rice cakes	50000	mg/kg		3

¹⁰⁵ **Note 76:** Use in potatoes only.

¹⁰⁶ **Note AA:** Excluding rolled oats.

Food Cat No.	EC comments	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step
		(Oriental type only)				
07.1.2		crackers, excluding sweet crackers	50000	mg/kg		3
07.1.3		other ordinary bakery products (e.g., bagels, pita, English muffins)	50000	mg/kg		3
07.1.4		bread-type products, including bread stuffing and bread crumbs	50000	mg/kg		3
07.1.5		steamed breads and buns	50000	mg/kg		3
07.1.6	EC opposes for mixes for category 7.1.1	mixes for breads and ordinary bakery wares	50000	mg/kg		3
07.2		fine bakery wares (sweet, salty, savoury) and mixes	50000	mg/kg		3
08.0		meat and meat products, including poultry and game		GMP	Note 3 ¹⁰⁷ Note 4 ¹⁰⁸ 16 ¹⁰⁹	
09.1		fresh fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	30000	mg/kg	Note 4 & 16	3
09.1.1		fresh fish		GMP	Notes 3 & 50	6
09.2		processed fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	30000	mg/kg		3
09.2.1		frozen fish, fish fillets, and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms		GMP	Note 50	6
09.2.4.1		cooked fish and fish products		GMP	Note 50	6
09.2.5		smoked, dried, fermented, and/or salted fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms		GMP	Note 50	6
09.3	EC agrees with Note 95	semi-preserved fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	30000	mg/kg		3
09.3.3		salmon substitutes, caviar, and other fish roe products		GMP	Note 50	Adopted
09.4		fully preserved, including canned or fermented fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	30000	mg/kg	Note 95 ¹¹⁰	3
10.1		fresh eggs	20000	mg/kg	Note 4 ¹¹¹	3
10.2	EC does not agree, the use could mislead the consumer	egg products	20000	mg/kg		3
10.3	EC agrees with Note 4	dried and/or heat coagulated egg products	20000	mg/kg		3
10.4	The technological need for such a high ML is questioned	egg-based desserts (e.g., custard)	20000	mg/kg		3
11.4	EC does not support	other sugars and syrups (e.g., xylose, maple syrup, sugar toppings)	50000	mg/kg		3
11.6	Technological need is questioned	table-top sweeteners, including those containing high-intensity sweeteners	50000	mg/kg		3
12.2.2	The technological need for such a high ML is questioned	seasonings and condiments	50000	mg/kg		
12.3	The technological need for such a high ML is questioned	vinegars	100000	mg/kg		3
12.4	The technological need for such a high ML is questioned	mustards	100000	mg/kg		
12.5	The technological need for such	soups and broths	100000	mg/kg		3

¹⁰⁷ **Note 3:** Surface treatment.

¹⁰⁸ **Note 4:** For decoration, stamping, marking or branding the product.

¹⁰⁹ **Note 16:** For use in glaze, coatings or decorations for fruit, vegetables, meat or fish.

¹¹⁰ **Note 95:** For use in surimi and fish roe products only.

¹¹¹ **Note 4:** For decoration, stamping, marking or branding the product.

Food Cat No.	EC comments	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step
	a high ML is questioned					
12.6	The technological need for such a high ML is questioned	sauces and like products	100000	mg/kg		3
12.7	The technological need for such a high ML is questioned	salads (e.g., macaroni salad, potato salad) and sandwich spreads excluding cocoa- and nut-based spreads of food categories 04.2.2.5 and 05.1.3	100000	mg/kg		3
12.9.1	The technological need for such a high ML is questioned	soybean protein products	100000	mg/kg		3
12.9.3		semi-dehydrated bean curd	80000	mg/kg		3
12.9.5	The technological need for such a high ML is questioned	other protein products	100000	mg/kg		3
12.10	The technological need for such a high ML is questioned	fermented soybean products	100000	mg/kg		3
13.3	EC considers the ML to be high and questions the technological need for such high ML	dietetic foods intended for special medical purposes (excluding products of food category 13.1)	20000	mg/kg		3
13.4	EC considers the ML to be high and questions the technological need for such high ML	dietetic formulae for slimming purposes and weight reduction	20000	mg/kg		3
13.5	EC considers the ML to be high and questions the technological need for such high ML	dietetic foods (e.g., supplementary foods for dietary use) excluding products of food categories 13.1 - 13.4 and 13.6	20000	mg/kg		3
13.6	EC considers the ML to be high and questions the technological need for such high ML	food supplements	20000	mg/kg		3
14.1.3.2	EC considers that these products are very similar to fruit nectars and does not support this provision	vegetable nectar	50000	mg/kg		3
14.1.3.4	EC considers that these products are very similar to fruit nectars and does not support this provision	concentrates for vegetable nectar	50000	mg/kg	Note 127 ¹¹²	3
14.1.4	The ML seems to be high for a drink. A child of 20 kg bw would reach the ADI by consuming 100 ml of the product	water-based flavoured drinks, including "sport," "energy" or "electrolyte" drinks and particulated drinks	50000	mg/kg		3
14.1.5	Technological need in coffee substitute, tea, herbal infusions is questioned. The use of this colour in coffee and tea could mislead the consumer, and mask a lower quality product.. Moreover the technological need of this ML is also questioned	coffee, coffee substitutes, tea, herbal infusions, and other hot cereal and grain beverages, excluding cocoa	100000	mg/kg		3
14.2.2		cider and perry	1000	mg/kg		
14.2.4		wines (other than grape)	1000	mg/kg		
14.2.5		mead	1000	mg/kg		6
15.0		ready-to-eat savouries	10000	mg/kg		3

Food Cat No.	EC comments	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step
05.0	EC agrees	confectionery	50000	mg/kg		3
05.1.3	EC does not support	Cocoa-based spreads, including fillings		GMP		Adopted
05.2	EC agrees	Confectionery including hard and soft candy, nougat, etc. other than food categories 05.1, 05.3 and 05.4		GMP		Adopted
05.3	EC agrees	Chewing gum	20000	mg/kg		Adopted
05.4	EC agrees	Decorations (e.g., for fine bakery wares), toppings (non-fruit) and sweet sauces		GMP		Adopted
14.2	EC does not support	alcoholic beverages, including alcohol-free and low-alcoholic counterparts	50000	mg/kg		3
14.2.1		Beer and malt beverages		GMP		Adopted
14.2.3.3		Fortified grape wine, grape liquor wine, and sweet grape wine		GMP		Adopted

¹¹² **Note 127:** As served to the consumer.

Food Cat No.	EC comments	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step
14.2.6		Distilled spirituous beverages containing more than 15% alcohol		GMP		Adopted
14.2.7		Aromatized alcoholic beverages (e.g., beer, wine and spirituous cooler-type beverages, low-alcoholic refreshers)		GMP		Adopted
16.0	EC does not support	composite foods - foods that could not be placed in categories 01 - 15	20000	mg/kg		3
16.0		Composite foods - foods that could not be placed in categories 01 - 15	1000	mg/kg		Adopted

CARAMEL IV – SULPHITE AMMONIA PROCESS (INS 150(d))

37. The 29th JECFA (1985) assigned an ADI of 200 mg/kg bw/d for caramel IV – sulphite ammonia process.

EC GENERAL POSITION : the EC is of the opinion that some of the maximum levels proposed are excessive, not justified from a technological point of view, and could lead to an exceedance of the ADI.

Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step
01.4.3	clotted cream (plain)	5000	mg/kg		3
01.8.1	liquid whey and whey products, excluding whey cheeses	50000	mg/kg		3
02.1.2	vegetable oils and fats	20000	mg/kg		3
02.1.3	lard, tallow, fish oil, and other animal fats	20000	mg/kg		3
02.2.1.2	margarine and similar products	20000	mg/kg		3
02.2.1.3	blends of butter and margarine	20000	mg/kg		3
02.2.2	emulsions containing less than 80% fat	20000	mg/kg		3
02.3	fat emulsions mainly of type oil-in-water, including mixed and/or flavoured products based on fat emulsions	20000	mg/kg		3
05.1.1	cocoa mixes (powders) and cocoa mass/cake		GMP		6
09.1	fresh fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	30000	mg/kg	Note 16	3
09.1.1	fresh fish		GMP	Notes 3 & 50	6
14.2	alcoholic beverages, including alcohol-free and low-alcoholic counterparts	50000	mg/kg		3

EC comments: the European Community supports recommendation 1

Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step
01.4.3	clotted cream (plain)		GMP		Foods covered by this category would not be expected to contain added colors
09.1	fresh fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms		GMP	Notes 3 ¹¹³ & 50 ¹¹⁴	

EC comments: the European Community supports recommendation 2

Food Cat No.	EC comments	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step
01.1.2		dairy-based drinks, flavoured and/or fermented (e.g., chocolate milk, cocoa, eggnog, drinking yoghurt, whey-based drinks)	50000	mg/kg	Note 52¹¹⁵	3
01.3.2		beverage whiteners	1000	mg/kg		3
01.4.4		cream analogues	5000	mg/kg		3
01.5.2		milk and cream powder analogues	5000	mg/kg		3
01.6.1	EC does not support the provision	unripened cheese	50000	mg/kg		3
01.6.2	The EC does not support the provision for the broad category	ripened cheese	50000	mg/kg		3
01.6.2.2		rind of ripened cheese		GMP		Adopted

¹¹³ **Note 3:** Surface treatment.

¹¹⁴ **Note 50:** For use in fish roe only.

¹¹⁵ **Note 52:** Excluding chocolate milk

Food Cat No.	EC comments	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step
01.6.4		processed cheese	50000	mg/kg		3
01.6.4.1		plain processed cheese		GMP		6
01.6.4.2		flavoured processed cheese, including containing fruit, vegetables, meat, etc.	100	mg/kg	Notes 5 ¹¹⁶ & 72 ¹¹⁷	6
01.6.5		cheese analogues	50000	mg/kg		3
01.7		dairy-based desserts (e.g., pudding, fruit or flavoured yoghurt)	50000	mg/kg		3
02.4		fat-based desserts excluding dairy-based dessert products of food category 01.7	20000	mg/kg		3
03.0		edible ices, including sherbet and sorbet	30000	mg/kg		3
04.1.2		processed fruit	80000	mg/kg		3
04.1.2.3		Fruit in vinegar, oil, or brine		GMP		Adopted
04.1.2.4		Canned or bottled (pasteurized) fruit		GMP		Adopted
04.1.2.5		Jams, jellies, marmelades	1500	mg/kg		Adopted
04.1.2.6		Fruit-based spreads (e.g., chutney) excluding products of food category 04.1.2.5	500	mg/kg		Adopted
04.1.2.7		Candied fruit		GMP		Adopted
04.1.2.8		Fruit preparations, including pulp, purees, fruit toppings and coconut milk	7500	mg/kg		Adopted
04.1.2.9		Fruit-based desserts, incl. fruit-flavoured water-based desserts		GMP		Adopted
04.1.2.11		Fruit fillings for pastries	7500	mg/kg		Adopted
04.2.2		processed vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds	50,000	mg/kg	Note 92 ¹¹⁸	3
04.2.2.2		dried vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds		GMP	Note 76 ¹¹⁹	6
04.2.2.3		vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and seaweeds in vinegar, oil, brine, or soy sauce	500	mg/kg		
04.2.2.4		canned or bottled (pasteurized) or retort pouch vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds		GMP		Adopted
04.2.2.5		vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed purees and spreads (e.g., peanut butter)		GMP		Adopted
04.2.2.6		vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed pulps and preparations (e.g., vegetable desserts and sauces, candied vegetables) other than food category 04.2.2.5		GMP		Adopted
04.2.2.7		fermented vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweed products, excluding fermented soybean products of food category 12.10		GMP		6
04.2.2.8		cooked or fried vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds		GMP		6
05.1.2	EC opposes	cocoa mixes (syrups)	50000	mg/kg		6
05.1.3	EC opposes	cocoa-based spreads, including fillings	50000	mg/kg		6
05.1.4	EC opposes	cocoa and chocolate products	50000	mg/kg		6

¹¹⁶ **Note 5:** Used in raw materials for manufacture of the finished food.

¹¹⁷ **Note 72:** Ready-to-eat basis.

¹¹⁸ **Note 92:** Excluding tomato-based sauces

¹¹⁹ **Note 76:** Use in potatoes only.

Food Cat No.	EC comments	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step
05.1.5		imitation chocolate, chocolate substitute products	50,000	mg/kg		6
06.3		breakfast cereals, including rolled oats	50000	mg/kg	Note AA ¹²⁰	3
06.4.2	EC opposes	dried pastas and noodles and like products	50000	mg/kg		3
06.4.3	EC opposes	pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products	50000	mg/kg		3
06.5		cereal and starch based desserts (e.g., rice pudding, tapioca pudding)	50000	mg/kg		3
06.6		batters (e.g., for breading or batters for fish or poultry)	50000	mg/kg		3
06.7		pre-cooked or processed rice products, including rice cakes (Oriental type only)	50000	mg/kg		3
07.1.2		crackers, excluding sweet crackers	50000	mg/kg		3
07.1.3		other ordinary bakery products (e.g., bagels, pita, English muffins)	50000	mg/kg		3
07.1.4		bread-type products, including bread stuffing and bread crumbs	50000	mg/kg		3
07.1.5		steamed breads and buns	50000	mg/kg		3
07.1.6		mixes for breads and ordinary bakery wares	50000	mg/kg		3
07.2		fine bakery wares (sweet, salty, savoury) and mixes	50000	mg/kg		3
07.2.1		cakes, cookies and pies (e.g., fruit-filled or custard types)		GMP		
07.2.2		other fine bakery products (e.g., doughnuts, sweet rolls, scones, and muffins)	1200	mg/kg		
07.2.3		mixes for fine bakery wares (e.g., cakes, pancakes)		GMP		
08.0		meat and meat products, including poultry and game		GMP	Notes 3 ¹²¹ 4 ¹²² & 16 ¹²³	8
09.2		processed fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	30000	mg/kg	Note 95 ¹²⁴	3
09.2.1		frozen fish, fish fillets, and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms		GMP	Note 50	6
09.2.4.1		cooked fish and fish products		GMP	Note 50	6
09.2.5		smoked, dried, fermented, and/or salted fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms		GMP	Note 50	6
09.3		semi-preserved fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	30000	mg/kg	Note 95	3
09.3.3		salmon substitutes, caviar, and other fish roe products		GMP	Note 50	
09.4		fully preserved, including canned or fermented fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	30000	mg/kg	Note 95	3
10.1		fresh eggs	20000	mg/kg	Note 4 ¹²⁵	3
10.2		egg products	20000	mg/kg		3
10.3		dried and/or heat coagulated egg products	20000	mg/kg		3
10.4		egg-based desserts (e.g., custard)	20000	mg/kg		3
11.4		other sugars and syrups (e.g., xylose, maple syrup, sugar toppings)	50000	mg/kg		3
12.2		herbs, spices, seasonings, and condiments (e.g., seasoning for instant noodles)	100000	mg/kg		3
12.2.2		seasonings and condiments		GMP		Adopted
12.3		vinegars	100000	mg/kg		3
12.4		mustards	100000	mg/kg		3

¹²⁰ **Note AA:** Excluding rolled oats.

¹²¹ **Note 3:** Surface treatment.

¹²² **Note 4:** For decoration, stamping, marking or branding the product.

¹²³ **Note 16:** For use in glaze, coatings or decorations for fruit, vegetables, meat or fish.

¹²⁴ **Note 95:** For use in surimi and fish roe products only.

¹²⁵ **Note 4:** For decoration, stamping, marking or branding the product.

Food Cat No.	EC comments	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step
12.5		soups and broths	100000	mg/kg		3
12.5.1		ready-to-eat soups and broths, including canned, bottled, and frozen	3000	mg/kg		Adopted
12.5.2		mixes for soups and broths		GMP		Adopted
12.6		sauces and like products	100000	mg/kg		3
12.7		salads (e.g., macaroni salad, potato salad) and sandwich spreads excluding cocoa- and nut-based spreads of food categories 04.2.2.5 and 05.1.3	100000	mg/kg		3
12.9.1		soybean protein products	100000	mg/kg		3
12.9.3		semi-dehydrated bean curd	80000	mg/kg		3
12.9.5		other protein products	100000	mg/kg		3
12.10		fermented soybean products	100000	mg/kg		3
13.3		dietetic foods intended for special medical purposes (excluding products of food category 13.1)	20000	mg/kg		3
13.4		dietetic formulae for slimming purposes and weight reduction	20000	mg/kg		3
13.5		dietetic foods (e.g., supplementary foods for dietary use) excluding products of food categories 13.1 - 13.4 and 13.6	20000	mg/kg		3
13.6		food supplements	20000	mg/kg		3
14.1.2.2		vegetable juice	50000	mg/kg		3
14.1.2.4		concentrates for vegetable juice	50000	mg/kg		3
14.1.3.2		vegetable nectar	50000	mg/kg		3
14.1.3.4		concentrates for vegetable nectar	50000	mg/kg		3
14.1.4		water-based flavoured drinks, including "sport," "energy" or "electrolyte" drinks and particulated drinks	50000	mg/kg		3
14.2.1		beer and malt beverages	50,000	mg/kg		Adopted
14.2.2		cider and perry	1000	mg/kg		Adopted
14.2.3.3		Fortified grape wine, grape liquor wine, and sweet grape wine	50,000	mg/kg		Adopted
14.2.4		wines (other than grape)	1000	mg/kg		Adopted
14.2.5		mead	1000	mg/kg		6
14.2.6		distilled spirituous beverages containing more than 15% alcohol	50,000	mg/kg		Adopted
15.0		ready-to-eat savouries	10,000	mg/kg		3
16.0	EC opposes	composite foods - foods that could not be placed in categories 01 - 15	20000	mg/kg		3

Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step
05.0	confectionery	50000	mg/kg		3
11.6	table-top sweeteners, including those containing high-intensity sweeteners	50000	mg/kg		3
14.1.5	coffee, coffee substitutes, tea, herbal infusions, and other hot cereal and grain beverages, excluding cocoa	100000	mg/kg		3

CAROTENOIDS ((INS 160a(i), 160a(iii), 160e, 160f)

38. The 18th JECFA (1974) assigned a group ADI of 50 mg/kg bw/d for β -Apo-8-carotenal (160e), synthetic β -Carotene (160ai), and β -Apo-8-carotenoic acid, methyl or ethyl ester (160f). The 57th JECFA (2001) assigned β -Carotene from *Blakeslea trispora* (160a(ii)) to the group ADI for synthetic β -carotenes. These substances are collectively referred to in the GSFA as carotenoids.

Food Cat No.	EC comments	Food Category	Max Level		Comments
08.4	EC agrees	Edible casings (e.g., sausage casings)	100	mg/kg	Note CC
09.1.2	EC does not support	Fresh mollusks, crustaceans and echinoderms	100	mg/kg	Note 4, 16 & CC
09.2.4.3	Discontinue	Fried fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	100	mg/kg	
11.3	Discontinue	Sugar solutions and syrups, also (partially) inverted, including treacle and molasses, excluding products of food category 11.1.3	50	mg/kg	
11.4	Discontinue	Other sugars and syrups (e.g., xylose, maple syrup, sugar toppings)	50	mg/kg	Note CC
11.6	Discontinue	table-top sweeteners, including those containing high-intensity sweeteners	300	mg/kg	
14.2.1	Discontinue	Beer and malt beverages	200	mg/kg	Note CC

Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level	Comments	Step
05.1.1	cocoa mixes (powders) and cocoa mass/cake	300 mg/kg		6

EC comments: the European Community supports recommendation 2

Food Cat No.	EC comments	Food Category	Max Level	Comments	Step
01.1.2	EC agrees	dairy-based drinks, flavoured and/or fermented (e.g., chocolate milk, cocoa, eggnog, drinking yoghurt, whey-based drinks)	150 mg/kg	Note 52 ¹²⁶	6
01.3.2	EC does not support	beverage whiteners	100 mg/kg	Note CC ¹²⁷	3
01.4	EC does not support	cream (plain) and the like	20 mg/kg	Note CC	3
01.5.2	EC does not support	milk and cream powder analogues	100 mg/kg	Note CC	3
01.6.1	EC does not support	unripened cheese	100 mg/kg	Note CC	6
01.6.2.1	EC agrees	ripened cheese, includes rind	100 mg/kg	Note CC	6
01.6.2.2	EC agrees	rind of ripened cheese	500 mg/kg	Note CC	3
01.6.2.3	EC agrees	cheese powder (for reconstitution; e.g., for cheese sauces)	100 mg/kg	Note CC	3
01.6.4	EC agrees	processed cheese	100 mg/kg	Note CC	6
01.6.5	EC agrees	cheese analogues	200 mg/kg	Note CC	3
01.7	EC agrees	dairy-based desserts (e.g., pudding, fruit or flavoured yoghurt)	50 mg/kg	Note CC	6
02.1.2	EC does not support	vegetable oils and fats	250 mg/kg	Note CC	6
02.1.3	EC does not support	lard, tallow, fish oil, and other animal fats	250 mg/kg	Note CC	6
02.2.1.2 ¹²⁸	EC agrees	margarine and similar products	1000 mg/kg		6
02.2.1.2	EC agrees	margarine and similar products	25 mg/kg	Note CC	3
02.2.1.3 ¹²⁹	EC agrees	blends of butter and margarine	100 mg/kg	Note CC	6
02.2.2	EC agrees	emulsions containing less than 80% fat	25 mg/kg	Note CC	6
02.3	EC agrees	fat emulsions mainly of type oil-in-water, including mixed and/or flavoured products based on fat emulsions	200 mg/kg	Note CC	6
02.4	EC agrees	fat-based desserts excluding dairy-based dessert products of food category 01.7	150 mg/kg	Note CC	6
03.0	EC agrees	edible ices, including sherbet and sorbet	200 mg/kg	Note CC	6
04.1.2.3	EC agrees	fruit in vinegar, oil, or brine	1000 mg/kg		3
04.1.2.4	EC does not support	canned or bottled (pasteurized) fruit	200 mg/kg		6
04.1.2.5	EC agrees	jams, jellies and marmelades	200 mg/kg		6
04.1.2.6	EC agrees	fruit-based spreads (e.g., chutney) excluding products of food category 04.1.2.5	500 mg/kg		6
04.1.2.7	EC agrees	candied fruit	200 mg/kg		6
04.1.2.8	EC agrees	fruit preparations, including pulp, purees, fruit toppings and coconut milk	100 mg/kg	Note CC	6
04.1.2.9	EC agrees	fruit-based desserts, including fruit-flavoured water-based desserts	150 mg/kg		6
04.1.2.10	EC agrees	fermented fruit products	500 mg/kg		3
04.1.2.11	EC agrees	fruit fillings for pastries	100 mg/kg	Note CC	6
04.2.1.2	EC agrees	surface-treated fresh vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds	500 mg/kg	Note 4 ¹³⁰ , & 16 ¹³¹	6
04.2.2.2	EC agrees	dried vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds	1000 mg/kg		3
04.2.2.3	EC does not support for intake considerations	vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and seaweeds in vinegar, oil, brine, or soy sauce	50 mg/kg	Note CC	6
04.2.2.4	EC does not	canned or bottled (pasteurized) or retort pouch	50 mg/kg	Note CC	6

¹²⁶ Note 52: Excluding chocolate milk

¹²⁷ Note CC: Expressed as beta-carotene.

¹²⁸ CX/FA 08/40/6 proposes to revise the GSFA food category system. If endorsed by the CCFA, food categories 02.2.1.1, 02.2.1.2 and 02.2.1.3 would be deleted.

¹²⁹ CX/FA 08/40/6 proposes to revise the GSFA food category system. If endorsed by the CCFA, food categories 02.2.1.1, 02.2.1.2 and 02.2.1.3 would be deleted.

¹³⁰ Note 4: For decoration, stamping, marking or branding the product.

¹³¹ Note 16: For use in glaze, coatings or decorations for fruit, vegetables, meat or fish.

Food Cat No.	EC comments	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step
	support for intake considerations	vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds				
04.2.2.5	EC does not support for intake considerations	vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed purees and spreads (e.g., peanut butter)	50	mg/kg	Note CC	3
04.2.2.6	EC agrees except tomato-based sauces	vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed pulps and preparations (e.g., vegetable desserts and sauces, candied vegetables) other than food category 04.2.2.5	50	mg/kg	Note CC & 92	6
04.2.2.7	EC agrees	fermented vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweed products, excluding fermented soybean products of food category 12.10	50	mg/kg	Note CC	3
05.1.2	EC does not support Use could mislead the consumer	cocoa mixes (syrups)	100	mg/kg	Note CC	6
05.1.3	EC does not support	cocoa-based spreads, including fillings	100	mg/kg	Note CC	6
05.1.4	EC does not support The use could mislead the consumer	cocoa and chocolate products	100	mg/kg	Note CC	6
05.1.5	EC agrees	imitation chocolate, chocolate substitute products	100	mg/kg	Note CC	6
05.2	EC agrees	confectionery including hard and soft candy, nougat, etc. other than food categories 05.1, 05.3 and 05.4	100	mg/kg	Note CC	6
05.3	EC agrees	chewing gum	100	mg/kg	Note CC	6
05.4	EC agrees	decorations (e.g., for fine bakery wares), toppings (non-fruit) and sweet sauces	100	mg/kg	Note CC	6
06.3	EC agrees	breakfast cereals, including rolled oats	200	mg/kg		6
06.4.3	EC agrees only if the use is limited to instant noodles	pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products	1200	mg/kg	Note CC	3
06.5	EC agrees	cereal and starch based desserts (e.g., rice pudding, tapioca pudding)	150	mg/kg	Note CC	6
06.6	EC agrees	batters (e.g., for breading or batters for fish or poultry)	500	mg/kg		6
07.1.1	EC do not support the use of a color in this basic foodstuff with wide consumption. Technological need questioned	breads and rolls	35	mg/kg	Note CC	6
07.1.2	EC agrees	crackers, excluding sweet crackers	1000	mg/kg		3
07.1.3	EC do not support the use of a color in this basic foodstuff with wide consumption. Technological need questioned	other ordinary bakery products (e.g., bagels, pita, English muffins)	1000	mg/kg		3
07.1.4	EC do not support the use of a color in this basic foodstuff with wide consumption. Technological need questioned	bread-type products, including bread stuffing and bread crumbs	1000	mg/kg	Note 116 ¹³²	3
07.1.5	EC do not support the use of a color in this	steamed breads and buns	1000	mg/kg		3

¹³² Note 116: For use in doughs only.

Food Cat No.	EC comments	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step
	basic foodstuff with wide consumption. Technological need questioned					
07.1.6	EC does not support the use of a color in this basic foodstuff with wide consumption. Technological need questioned	mixes for breads and ordinary bakery wares	1000	mg/kg		6
07.2	EC agrees	fine bakery wares (sweet, salty, savoury) and mixes	100	mg/kg	Note CC	6
08.3.1.1	EC agrees with the addition of Note 16	cured (including salted) non-heat treated processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	100	mg/kg	Note 118 ¹³³	6
08.3.1.2	EC agrees with the addition of Note 16	cured (including salted) and dried non-heat treated processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	20	mg/kg		6
08.3.1.3	EC agrees with the addition of Note 16	fermented non-heat treated processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	20	mg/kg		6
08.3.2	EC agrees with the addition of Note 16	heat-treated processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	20	mg/kg		6
09.1.1	EC agrees	Fresh fish	300	mg/kg	Notes 50 ¹³⁴	6
09.2	EC agrees	processed fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	100	mg/kg	Note 95 ¹³⁵ & CC	3
09.2.1	EC agrees	frozen fish, fish fillets, and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	500	mg/kg	Note 95 ¹³⁶	6
09.2.2	EC does not support	frozen battered fish, fish fillets, and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	100	mg/kg	Note 41 ¹³⁷	6
09.2.4.1	EC agrees with the addition of Note 95	cooked fish and fish products	500	mg/kg		6
09.2.4.2	EC agrees	cooked mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	250	mg/kg		6
09.2.5		smoked, dried, fermented, and/or salted fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	500	mg/kg	Note 22 ¹³⁸	6
09.3	EC agrees	semi-preserved fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	100	mg/kg	Note 95, & CC	3
09.3.3	EC agrees	salmon substitutes, caviar, and other fish roe products	500	mg/kg		6
09.3.4	Only with Note 95	semi-preserved fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms (e.g., fish paste), excluding products of food categories 09.3.1 - 09.3.3	500	mg/kg		6
09.4	EC agrees	Fully preserved, including canned or fermented fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	100	mg/kg	Notes 95	6
10.1	EC agrees	Fresh eggs	1000	mg/kg	Note 4	3
10.2	EC does not support	egg products	1000	mg/kg		3
10.4	EC agrees	egg-based desserts (e.g., custard)	150	mg/kg		6
12.2.2	EC agrees	seasonings and condiments	500	mg/kg		6
12.4	EC agrees	mustards	300	mg/kg		6
12.5	EC agrees	soups and broths	300	mg/kg		6
12.6	EC agrees	sauces and like products	500	mg/kg		6
12.7	EC agrees	salads (e.g., macaroni salad, potato salad) and sandwich spreads excluding cocoa- and nut-based spreads of food categories 04.2.2.5 and 05.1.3	50	mg/kg	Note CC	3
12.9.5	EC agrees	other protein products	100	mg/kg		6

¹³³ Note 118: Except for use in tocino (fresh, cured sausage) at 1000 mg/kg.

¹³⁴ Note 50: For use in fish roe only

¹³⁵ Note 95: For use in surimi and fish roe products only.

¹³⁶ Note 95: For use in surimi and fish roe products only.

¹³⁷ Note 41: Use in breading or batter coatings only.

¹³⁸ Note 22: For use in smoked fish products only.

Food Cat No.	EC comments	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step
13.3	EC agrees	dietetic foods intended for special medical purposes (excluding products of food category 13.1)	50	mg/kg	Note CC	6
13.4	EC agrees	dietetic formulae for slimming purposes and weight reduction	50	mg/kg	Note CC	6
13.5	EC agrees	dietetic foods (e.g., supplementary foods for dietary use) excluding products of food categories 13.1 - 13.4 and 13.6	300	mg/kg	Note CC	6
13.6	EC agrees	food supplements	300	mg/kg	Note CC	6
14.1.3.2	EC does not support	vegetable nectar	100	mg/kg	Note CC	6
14.1.3.4	EC does not support	concentrates for vegetable nectar	100	mg/kg	Note CC & 127 ¹³⁹	6
14.1.4	EC agrees	water-based flavoured drinks, including "sport," "energy," or "electrolyte" drinks and particulated drinks	100	mg/kg		6
14.2.2	EC agrees	cider and perry	200	mg/kg	Note CC	6
14.2.4	EC agrees	wines (other than grape)	200	mg/kg		6
14.2.6	EC agrees	distilled spirituous beverages containing more than 15% alcohol	200	mg/kg		6
14.2.7	EC agrees	aromatized alcoholic beverages (e.g., beer, wine and spirituous cooler-type beverages, low alcoholic refreshers)	200	mg/kg		6
15.1	EC does not support, as the ML is considered too high	snacks - potato, cereal, flour or starch based (from roots and tubers, pulses and legumes)	400	mg/kg		3
15.1	EC agrees	snacks - potato, cereal, flour or starch based (from roots and tubers, pulses and legumes)	100	mg/kg	Note CC	6
15.2	EC agrees	processed nuts, including covered nuts and nut mixtures (with e.g., dried fruit)	100	mg/kg	Note CC	6

Food Cat No.	EC comments	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step
08.1.2	EC agrees	fresh meat, poultry, and game, comminuted	100	mg/kg	Note 117 ¹⁴⁰ & 4 ¹⁴¹ , 16 ¹⁴²	6
16.0	EC strongly opposes Foodstuffs should always be clearly defined	composite foods - foods that could not be placed in categories 01 - 15	500	mg/kg		6

CAROTENES, VEGETABLE (INS 160a(ii))

39. The 28th CAC has adopted several provisions in the GSFA for the use of vegetable carotenes.

40. The 41st JECFA (1993) determined vegetable carotenes to be acceptable for use as a colour, provided the level of use does not exceed the level normally found in vegetables.

Food Cat No.	EC comments	Food Category	Max Level		Comments
01.4.4	EC does not agree	Cream analogues	20	mg/kg	Note CC
05.1.2	Technological need questioned ; the use could mislead the consumer	Cocoa mixes (syrops)	100	mg/kg	Note CC
05.1.5	EC agrees	Imitation chocolate, chocolate substitute products	100	mg/kg	Note CC
11.3	EC does not agree Technological need questioned	Sugar solutions and syrups, also (partially) inverted, including treacle and molasses, excluding products of food category 11.1.3	50	mg/kg	Note CC
15.3	EC agrees	Snacks - fish based	100	mg/kg	

Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level	Comments	Step
09.1.2	fresh mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	GMP	Note 16 ¹⁴³	6
09.2.1	frozen fish, fish fillets, and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	GMP	Note 95 ¹⁴⁴	6

¹³⁹ Note 127: As served to the consumer

¹⁴⁰ Note 117: Except for use in loganiza (fresh, uncured sausage) at 1000 mg/kg.

¹⁴¹ Note 4: For decoration, stamping, marking or branding the product.

¹⁴² Note 16: For use in glaze, coatings or decorations for fruit, vegetables, meat or fish.

¹⁴³ Note 16: For use in glaze, coatings or decorations for fruit, vegetables, meat or fish.

¹⁴⁴ Note 95: For use in surimi and fish roe products only.

EC comments: The European Community support recommendation 2

Food Cat No.	EC comments	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step
02.2.1.2 ¹⁴⁵	EC agrees	margarine and similar products	30	mg/kg	Note CC ¹⁴⁶	3
04.1.1.2	EC does not support	surface-treated fresh fruit		GMP	Note 16 ¹⁴⁷	6
04.1.2.8	EC does not support The use could mislead the consumer	fruit preparations, including pulp, purees, fruit toppings and coconut milk	100	mg/kg	Note CC	6
04.1.2.11	EC agrees	fruit fillings for pastries	100	mg/kg	Note CC	6
04.2.2.2	EC does not agree except dried potato granules and flakes The use could mislead the consumer	dried vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds	200	mg/kg		3
04.2.2.3	EC does not support. The use could mislead the consumer	vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and seaweeds in vinegar, oil, brine, or soy sauce	1320	mg/kg		3
04.2.2.4	EC does not support. The use could mislead the consumer	canned or bottled (pasteurized) or retort pouch vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds	200	mg/kg		3
05.1.3	EC does not agree The use could mislead the consumer	cocoa-based spreads, including fillings	100	mg/kg	Note CC	3
05.1.4	EC does not agree The use could mislead the consumer	cocoa and chocolate products	100	mg/kg	Note CC	6
05.1.4	EC does not agree The use could mislead the consumer	cocoa and chocolate products	1000	mg/kg		3
06.4.2	EC does not support	dried pastas and noodles and like products	1000	mg/kg		3
06.4.3	EC does not support	pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products	1000	mg/kg		3
07.1.6	EC does not support	mixes for breads and ordinary bakery wares	100	mg/kg	Note CC	3
09.1.1	EC agrees	fresh fish	100	mg/kg	Note 4 ¹⁴⁸ , 16 ¹⁴⁹ , 50 ¹⁵⁰ Note CC	6
09.2.4.1	EC agrees	cooked fish and fish products	1000	mg/kg	Note 95	3
12.2	EC does not support	herbs, spices, seasonings, and condiments (e.g., seasoning for instant noodles)	500	mg/kg		3
12.10.3	If no other interest, EC does not support	fermented soybean paste (e.g., miso)	1000	mg/kg		6
14.1.2.2	EC does not support The use could mislead the consumer Technological is questioned	vegetable juice	2000	mg/kg		3
14.1.2.4	EC does not support The use could mislead the consumer Technological is questioned	concentrates for vegetable juice	2000	mg/kg	Note 127¹⁵¹	3
14.1.3.2	EC does not support The use could mislead the consumer Technological is questioned	vegetable nectar	100	mg/kg	Note CC	3

¹⁴⁵ CX/FA 08/40/6 proposes to revise the GSFA food category system. If endorsed by the CCFA, food categories 02.2.1.1, 02.2.1.2 and 02.2.1.3 would be deleted.

¹⁴⁶ **Note CC:** Expressed as beta-carotene.

¹⁴⁷ **Note 16:** For use in glaze, coatings or decorations for fruit, vegetables, meat or fish.

¹⁴⁸ **Note 4:** For decoration, stamping, marking or branding the product.

¹⁴⁹ **Note 16:** For use in glaze, coatings or decorations for fruit, vegetables, meat or fish.

¹⁵⁰ **Note 50:** For use in fish roe only.

¹⁵¹ **Note 127:** As served to the consumer

Food Cat No.	EC comments	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step
14.1.3.4	EC does not support The use could mislead the consumer Technological is questioned	concentrates for vegetable nectar	100	mg/kg	Note 127 & CC	3
15.1	EC agrees	snacks - potato, cereal, flour or starch based (from roots and tubers, pulses and legumes)	25	mg/kg		6
15.1	EC agrees	snacks - potato, cereal, flour or starch based (from roots and tubers, pulses and legumes)	100	mg/kg	Note CC	3
15.2	EC agrees. Nevertheless, the ML seems to be high. Technological need for such a high level is requested.	processed nuts, including covered nuts and nut mixtures (with e.g., dried fruit)	20000	mg/kg		3
16.0	EC strongly opposes Foodstuffs should always be clearly defined	composite foods - foods that could not be placed in categories 01 - 15	1000	mg/kg		3

Food Cat No.	EC comments	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step
08.1.2	EC agrees	fresh meat, poultry, and game, comminuted	20	mg/kg	Note 4 ¹⁵² , 16 ¹⁵³ & 117 ¹⁵⁴	6

CANTHAXANTHIN (INS 161g)

41. The 28th CAC has adopted one provision for the use of canthaxanthin in the GSFA.

42. The JECFA (1995) assigned an ADI of 0.03 mg/kg bw/d for canthaxanthin.

The 30th CCFAC requested that JECFA perform intake estimates for canthaxanthin based on the pending levels of maximum use in the GSFA and national food consumption data. The 53rd JECFA (1999) concluded that the dietary intake of canthaxanthin exceeded the ADI of 0-0.03 mg/kg bw. Indirect exposure through the use of canthaxanthin as a colourant in animal feeds is the major source of canthaxanthin in food. However, JECFA concluded that long-term intake of canthaxanthin is unlikely to exceed the ADI.

GENERAL EC POSITION: The European Community is of the opinion that canthaxanthin should be more restricted due to its very low ADI (0.03 mg/kg bw). Due to its safety concern, the European Community support discontinuation of the work on all specific provisions.

GRAPE SKIN EXTRACT (INS 163(ii))

43. The 26th JECFA (1982) assigned an ADI of 2.5 mg/kg bw/d for grape skin extract.

Food Cat No.	EC comments	Food Category	Max Level		Comments
05.1.2	EC does not support The use could mislead the consumer	Cocoa mixes (syrops)	200	mg/kg	Note DD
05.1.3	EC does not support The use could mislead the consumer	Cocoa-based spreads, incl. fillings	200	mg/kg	Note DD
05.1.4	EC does not support The use could mislead the consumer	Cocoa and chocolate products	200	mg/kg	Note DD
15.3	EC agrees	Snacks - fish based	500	mg/kg	

Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max	Level	Comments	Step
01.3.2	beverage whiteners	1500	mg/kg		3
01.6.1	unripened cheese	1000	mg/kg		3
01.6.2.1	ripened cheese, includes rind	125	mg/kg		6
04.2.1.2	surface-treated fresh vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds		GMP	Note 16	6
12.2	herbs, spices, seasonings, and condiments (e.g., seasoning for instant noodles)	1500	mg/kg		3

EC comments: The European Community supports recommendation 2

Food Cat No.	EC comments	Food Category	Max Level	Comments	Step
--------------	-------------	---------------	-----------	----------	------

¹⁵² Note 4: For decoration, stamping, marking or branding the product.

¹⁵³ Note 16: For use in glaze, coatings or decorations for fruit, vegetables, meat or fish.

¹⁵⁴ Note 117: Except for use in loganiza (fresh, uncured sausage) at 1000 mg/kg.

Food Cat No.	EC comments	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step
01.1.2	EC agrees	dairy-based drinks, flavoured and/or fermented (e.g., chocolate milk, cocoa, eggnog, drinking yoghurt, whey-based drinks)	150	mg/kg	Note 52 ¹⁵⁵ , & DD ¹⁵⁶	3
01.4	EC does not support Technological need questioned The use could mislead the consumer	cream (plain) and the like	1500	mg/kg		3
01.4.4	EC does not support Technological need questioned The use could mislead the consumer	Cream analogues	150	mg/kg	Note DD	
01.5.2	EC does not support Technological need questioned The use could mislead the consumer	milk and cream powder analogues	150	mg/kg	Note DD	3
01.6.2.2	EC agrees	rind of ripened cheese	1000	mg/kg		3
01.6.4.2	EC agrees	flavoured processed cheese, including containing fruit, vegetables, meat, etc.	1000	mg/kg		3
01.6.5	EC agrees	cheese analogues	1000	mg/kg		3
01.7	EC agrees	dairy-based desserts (e.g., pudding, fruit or flavoured yoghurt)	200	mg/kg	Note DD	6
02.4	EC agrees	fat-based desserts excluding dairy-based dessert products of food category 01.7	200	mg/kg	Note DD	3
03.0	EC considers the ML very high A child of 15 kg bw would exceed the ADI by consuming 37.5 g of edible ice	edible ices, including sherbet and sorbet	1000	mg/kg		3
03.0	EC agrees	edible ices, including sherbet and sorbet	100	mg/kg	Note DD	6
04.1.1.2	EC agrees	surface-treated fresh fruit		GMP	Notes 4 ¹⁵⁷ & 16 ¹⁵⁸	6
04.1.2.3	EC agrees	fruit in vinegar, oil, or brine	1500	mg/kg		3
04.1.2.4	EC does not support	canned or bottled (pasteurized) fruit	1500	mg/kg		3
04.1.2.5	EC agrees	jams, jellies and marmelades	500	mg/kg	Note DD	3
04.1.2.6	EC agrees	fruit-based spreads (e.g., chutney) excluding products of food category 04.1.2.5	500	mg/kg	Note DD	6
04.1.2.8	EC does not support The use could mislead the consumer	fruit preparations, including pulp, purees, fruit toppings and coconut milk	500	mg/kg	Note DD	3
04.1.2.9	EC agrees	fruit-based desserts, including fruit-flavoured water-based desserts	500	mg/kg	Note DD	3
04.1.2.10	EC agrees	fermented fruit products	500	mg/kg	Note DD	3
04.1.2.11	EC agrees	fruit fillings for pastries	500	mg/kg	Note DD	3
04.2.2.3	EC does not support The use could mislead the consumer	vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and seaweeds in vinegar, oil, brine, or soy sauce	100	mg/kg	Note DD	6
04.2.2.5	EC does not support The use could mislead the consumer	vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed purees and spreads (e.g., peanut butter)	100	mg/kg	Note DD	3
04.2.2.6	EC agrees with the exception of tomato-based sauces	vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed pulps and preparations (e.g., vegetable desserts and sauces, candied vegetables) other than food category 04.2.2.5	100	mg/kg	Note DD	3
04.2.2.7	EC agrees	fermented vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweed	100	mg/kg	Note DD	3

¹⁵⁵ Note 52: Excluding chocolate milk

¹⁵⁶ Note DD: Expressed as anthocyanin.

¹⁵⁷ Note 4: For decoration, stamping, marking or branding the product.

¹⁵⁸ Note 16: For use in glaze, coatings or decorations for fruit, vegetables, meat or fish.

Food Cat No.	EC comments	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step
		products, excluding fermented soybean products of food category 12.10				
05.1.5	EC agrees	imitation chocolate, chocolate substitute products	200	mg/kg	Note DD	3
05.2	EC agrees	confectionery including hard and soft candy, nougat, etc. other than food categories 05.1, 05.3 and 05.4	500	mg/kg	Note DD	3
05.3	EC agrees	chewing gum	500	mg/kg	Note DD	6
05.4	EC agrees	decorations (e.g., for fine bakery wares), toppings (non-fruit) and sweet sauces	500	mg/kg	Note DD	3
06.3	EC strongly oppose for intake considerations	breakfast cereals, including rolled oats	200	mg/kg		6
06.5	EC strongly oppose for intake considerations	cereal and starch based desserts (e.g., rice pudding, tapioca pudding)	200	mg/kg	Note DD	3
07.0	EC strongly oppose for intake considerations Grape skin extract has been allocated a very low ADI The use of this food additive in this basic foodstuff would possibly lead to an exceedance of the ADI	bakery wares	1500	mg/kg		3
07.1.2	EC strongly oppose for intake considerations Grape skin extract has been allocated a very low ADI The use of this food additive in this basic foodstuff would possibly lead to an exceedance of the ADI	Crackers, excluding sweet crackers	200	mg/kg	Note DD	
07.1.4	EC strongly oppose for intake considerations Grape skin extract has been allocated a very low ADI The use of this food additive in this basic foodstuff would possibly lead to an exceedance of the ADI	Bread-type products, including bread stuffing and bread crumbs	200	mg/kg	Note DD	
08.1.1	EC agrees The ML seems very high.	Fresh meat, poultry, and game, whole pieces or cuts	5000	mg/kg	Note 16	3
08.1.2	EC agrees	fresh meat, poultry, and game, comminuted	1000	mg/kg	Notes 4, 16 94 ¹⁵⁹	6
08.2	EC agrees with Note 16	processed meat, poultry, and game products in whole pieces or cuts	5000	mg/kg		3
08.3.1.1	EC agrees with Note 16	cured (including salted) non-heat treated processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	5000	mg/kg		3
08.3.1.2	EC agrees with Note 16	cured (including salted) and dried non-heat treated processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	5000	mg/kg	Note 16	3
08.3.1.3	EC agrees with Note 16	fermented non-heat treated processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	5000	mg/kg	Note 16	3
08.3.2	EC agrees with Note 16	heat-treated processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	5000	mg/kg	Note 16	3
08.3.3	EC agrees with Note 16	frozen processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	5000	mg/kg	Note 16	3
08.4	EC agrees	edible casings (e.g., sausage casings)	5000	mg/kg		3
09.2.2	EC does not support. The use could mislead the consumer	frozen battered fish, fish fillets, and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	500	mg/kg	Note 16	3
09.2.3	EC agrees	frozen minced and creamed fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms		GMP	Note 16 & 95 ¹⁶⁰	6
09.2.4.1	EC agrees	cooked fish and fish products	500	mg/kg	Note 95	3

¹⁵⁹ Note 94: For use in loganiza (fresh, uncured sausage) only.

¹⁶⁰ Note 95: For use in surimi and fish roe products only.

Food Cat No.	EC comments	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step
09.2.4.3	EC agrees	fried fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	1000	mg/kg	Note 16 & 95	3
09.2.5	EC agrees	smoked, dried, fermented, and/or salted fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	1000	mg/kg	Note 22 ¹⁶¹	3
09.3.1	EC agrees	fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms, marinated and/or in jelly	500	mg/kg	Note 16	3
09.3.2	EC agrees	fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms, pickled and/or in brine	1500	mg/kg	Note 16	3
09.3.3	EC agrees	salmon substitutes, caviar, and other fish roe products	1500	mg/kg		3
09.3.4	EC agrees	semi-preserved fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms (e.g., fish paste), excluding products of food categories 09.3.1 - 09.3.3	1500	mg/kg	Note 16	3
09.4	EC agrees	fully preserved, including canned or fermented fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	1500	mg/kg	Note 16	3
10.1	EC agrees	fresh eggs	1500	mg/kg	Note 4 ¹⁶²	3
10.4	EC agrees	egg-based desserts (e.g., custard)	200	mg/kg	Note DD	3
12.2	EC agrees	herbs, spices, seasonings, and condiments (e.g., seasoning for instant noodles)	1500	mg/kg		3
12.2.2	EC agrees	Seasonings and condiments	1500	mg/kg		
12.4	EC agrees	mustards	200	mg/kg	Note DD	3
12.5	EC agrees	soups and broths	500	mg/kg	Note DD	3
12.6.1	EC agrees	emulsified sauces (e.g., mayonnaise, salad dressing)	300	mg/kg	Note DD	3
12.6.2	EC agrees	non-emulsified sauces (e.g., ketchup, cheese sauce, cream sauce, brown gravy)	300	mg/kg	Note DD	3
12.6.3	EC agrees	mixes for sauces and gravies	300	mg/kg	Note DD	3
12.7	EC agrees	salads (e.g., macaroni salad, potato salad) and sandwich spreads excluding cocoa- and nut-based spreads of food categories 04.2.2.5 and 05.1.3	1500	mg/kg		3
12.9.5	EC agrees	other protein products	500	mg/kg		3
13.3	EC agrees	dietetic foods intended for special medical purposes (excluding products of food category 13.1)	250	mg/kg	Note DD	3
13.4	EC agrees	dietetic formulae for slimming purposes and weight reduction	250	mg/kg	Note DD	3
13.5	EC agrees	dietetic foods (e.g., supplementary foods for dietary use) excluding products of food categories 13.1 - 13.4 and 13.6	250	mg/kg	Note DD	3
13.6	EC agrees	food supplements	250	mg/kg	Note DD	3
14.1.3.2	EC does not support	vegetable nectar	1500	mg/kg		3
14.1.3.4	EC does not support	concentrates for vegetable nectar	1500	mg/kg	Note 127	3
14.1.4	EC agrees	water-based flavoured drinks, including "sport," "energy," or "electrolyte" drinks and particulated drinks	300	mg/kg	Note DD	6
14.2.1	EC does not support	beer and malt beverages	300	mg/kg	Note DD	3
14.2.2	EC agrees	cider and perry	300	mg/kg	Note DD	3
14.2.3.2	EC does not support	sparkling and semi-sparkling grape wines	1500	mg/kg		3
14.2.3.3	EC does not support	fortified grape wine, grape liquor wine, and sweet grape wine	1500	mg/kg		3
14.2.4	EC agrees	wines (other than grape)	300	mg/kg	Note DD	3
14.2.6	EC does not support	distilled spirituous beverages containing more than 15% alcohol	300	mg/kg	Note DD	3
14.2.7	EC agrees	aromatized alcoholic beverages (e.g., beer, wine and spirituous cooler-type beverages, low alcoholic refreshers)	300	mg/kg	Note DD	3
15.1	EC agrees	snacks - potato, cereal, flour or starch based (from roots and tubers, pulses and legumes)	500	mg/kg	Note DD	3
15.2	EC agrees	processed nuts, including covered nuts and nut mixtures (with e.g., dried fruit)	300	mg/kg	Note DD	3

Food Cat No.	EC comments	Food Category	Max Level	Comments	Step
--------------	-------------	---------------	-----------	----------	------

¹⁶¹ Note 22: For use in smoked fish products only.

¹⁶² Note 4: For decoration, stamping, marking or branding the product.

Food Cat No.	EC comments	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step
04.1.2.7	EC agrees	candied fruit	1500	mg/kg		3
09.2.4.2	The EC considers the ML as very high. A child of 15 kg bw would exceed the ADI by consuming 37 g of mollusc/crustacean Technological need questioned for such a high ML	cooked mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	1000	mg/kg		3
16.0	EC strongly opposes Foodstuffs should always be clearly defined	composite foods - foods that could not be placed in categories 01 - 15	1500	mg/kg		3
16.0	EC strongly opposes Foodstuffs should always be clearly defined	composite foods - foods that could not be placed in categories 01 - 15	10	mg/kg		6

IRON OXIDES (INS 172(i), 172(ii), 172(iii))

44. The 28th CAC has adopted several provisions in the GSFA for the use of iron oxides.

45. The 23rd JECFA (1979) assigned an ADI of 0.5 mg/kg bw/d for iron oxides (172(i), 172(ii), 172(iii)).

46. The 30th CCFAC requested that JECFA perform intake assessments for iron oxides based on the pending levels of use in the GSFA and national food consumption data. The 53rd JECFA (1999) concluded that it is unlikely that intake of iron oxides would exceed the ADI of 0-0.5 mg/kg bw.

Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step
01.4	cream (plain) and the like		GMP		6
04.2.2.3	vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and seaweeds in vinegar, oil, brine, or soy sauce	500	mg/kg		6
04.2.2.4	canned or bottled (pasteurized) or retort pouch vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds	75	mg/kg		3
08.1.2	fresh meat, poultry, and game, comminuted	1000	mg/kg	Note 94 ¹⁶³	6
08.3.1.1	cured (including salted) non-heat treated processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	1000	mg/kg	Note 78 ¹⁶⁴	6
08.3.1.3	fermented non-heat treated processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products		GMP	Note 16 ¹⁶⁵	6
08.3.2	heat-treated processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products		GMP	Note 16	6
08.3.3	frozen processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products		GMP	Note 16	6
09.1.1	fresh fish		GMP	Note 50 ¹⁶⁶	6
09.2.1	frozen fish, fish fillets, and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms		GMP	Note 95 ¹⁶⁷	6
09.2.4.2	cooked mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms		GMP		6
14.2.2	cider and perry		GMP		6
14.2.3.2	sparkling and semi-sparkling grape wines		GMP		6
14.2.4	wines (other than grape)		GMP		6
14.2.6	distilled spirituous beverages containing more than 15% alcohol		GMP		6
14.2.7	aromatized alcoholic beverages (e.g., beer, wine and spirituous cooler-type beverages, low alcoholic refreshers)		GMP		6

EC comments: the European Community supports recommendation 1

Food Cat No.	Ec comments	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step
01.6.1	EC does not support Rind is not expected to be formed in unripened cheese Intake concerns	unripened cheese		GMP		6
04.2.2.6	EC Agree with the exception of tomato-based sauce	vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed pulps and preparations (e.g., vegetable desserts and sauces, candied vegetables)	300	mg/kg	Note 92 ¹⁶⁸	6

¹⁶³ **Note 94:** For use in loganiza (fresh, uncured sausage) only.

¹⁶⁴ **Note 78:** For use in tocino (fresh, cured sausage) only.

¹⁶⁵ **Note 16:** For use in glaze, coatings or decorations for fruit, vegetables, meat or fish.

¹⁶⁶ **Note 50:** For use in fish roe only.

¹⁶⁷ **Note 95:** For use in surimi and fish roe products only.

Food Cat No.	Ec comments	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step
		other than food category 04.2.2.5				
05.3		chewing gum	10.000	mg/kg		6
09.3.4	Only with Note 95	semi-preserved fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms (e.g., fish paste), excluding products of food categories 09.3.1 - 09.3.3	50	mg/kg		3
09.4	Only with Note 95	fully preserved, including canned or fermented fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	50	mg/kg		6
13.6	EC agrees	food supplements	7500	mg/kg	Note 3¹⁶⁹	6
14.1.3.2	EC does not support	vegetable nectar	100	mg/kg		6
14.1.3.4	EC does not support	concentrates for vegetable nectar	100	mg/kg	Note 127¹⁷⁰	6

Food Cat No.	EC comments	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step
05.1.3	EC does not support	cocoa-based spreads, including fillings		GMP		6
10.4	EC agrees	egg-based desserts (e.g., custard)		GMP		6
12.4	EC agrees	mustards		GMP		6
12.7	EC agrees	salads (e.g., macaroni salad, potato salad) and sandwich spreads excluding cocoa- and nut-based spreads of food categories 04.2.2.5 and 05.1.3		GMP		6
12.9.5	EC agrees	other protein products		GMP		6
13.3	EC agrees	dietetic foods intended for special medical purposes (excluding products of food category 13.1)		GMP		6
13.4	EC agrees	dietetic formulae for slimming purposes and weight reduction		GMP		6
13.5	EC agrees	dietetic foods (e.g., supplementary foods for dietary use) excluding products of food categories 13.1 - 13.4 and 13.6		GMP		6

Appendix I

Appendix I			
Food Categories in which the Use of Sweeteners is Technologically Justified			
Food Cat. No.	EC Comments	Food Category Title	Justification Provided to eWG
01.1.2	ERONAS ONLY	Dairy-based drinks, flavoured and/or fermented (e.g., chocolate milk, cocoa, eggnog, drinking yoghurt, whey-based drinks)	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission.
01.3.2	Technological need requested The use could mislead the consumers	Beverage whiteners	1) Use of sweeteners is not technologically justified. 2) Food products in this category containing intense sweeteners are already on the market. Analogues are processed foods and therefore sweeteners should be allowed to be included here. (e.g., coffee creamers).
01.4.4	Technological need requested	Cream analogues	1) Use of sweeteners is not technologically justified. 2) Food products in this category containing intense sweeteners are already on the market. Analogues are processed foods and therefore sweeteners should be allowed to be included here. (e.g., coffee creamers).
01.5.2	Technological need requested	Milk and cream powder analogues	1) Use of sweeteners is not technologically justified. 2) Food products in this category containing intense sweeteners are already on the market. Analogues are processed foods and therefore

¹⁶⁸ **Note 92:** Excluding tomato-based sauces

¹⁶⁹ **Note 3:** Surface treatment

¹⁷⁰ **Note 127:** As served to the consumer.

Appendix I			
Food Categories in which the Use of Sweeteners is Technologically Justified			
Food Cat. No.	EC Comments	Food Category Title	Justification Provided to eWG
			sweeteners should be allowed to be included here.
01.6.5	Technological need requested The use could mislead the consumers	Cheese analogues	1) Use of sweeteners is not technologically justified. 2) Food products in this category containing intense sweeteners are already on the market. Analogues are processed foods and therefore sweeteners should be allowed to be included here.
01.7	ERONAS	Dairy-based desserts (e.g., pudding, fruit or flavoured yoghurt)	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission.
02.3	Technological need requested The use could mislead the consumers	Fat emulsions mainly of type oil-in-water, including mixed and/or flavoured products based on fat emulsions	1) Use of sweeteners is not technologically justified. 2) Use of intense sweeteners in fat emulsions allows for the manufacture of pre-sweetened, flavoured products, as this category includes products with added flavours. They have the same technological requirements as their dairy-based counterparts.
02.4	ERONAS	Fat-based desserts excluding dairy-based dessert products of food category 01.7	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission.
3.0	ERONAS	Edible ices, including sherbet and sorbet	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission.
04.1.2.3	For use in sweet sour preserves only	Fruit in vinegar, oil, or brine	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission.
04.1.2.4	ERONAS	Canned or bottled (pasteurized) fruit	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission.
04.1.2.5	ER	Jams, jellies, marmelades	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission.
04.1.2.6	ER	Fruit-based spreads (e.g., chutney) excluding products of food category 04.1.2.5	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission.
04.1.2.7	ER	Candied fruit	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission.
04.1.2.8	ER	Fruit preparations, including pulp, purees, fruit toppings and coconut milk	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission.
04.1.2.9	ERONAS	Fruit-based desserts, incl. fruit-flavoured water-based desserts	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission.
04.1.2.10	ER If no other interests EC does not support	Fermented fruit products	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission.
04.1.2.11	ER	Fruit fillings for pastries	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission.
04.1.2.12	ER If no other interests EC does not support	Cooked fruit	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission.
04.2.2.3	For use in sweet sour preserves only	Vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds in vinegar, oil, brine, or soy sauce	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission.
04.2.2.5	ER	Vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed purees and spreads (e.g., peanut butter)	1) Use of sweeteners is <u>not</u> technologically justified 2) Use of sweeteners is technologically justified
04.2.2.6	ERONAS	Vegetable, (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed pulps and preparations (e.g., vegetable desserts and sauces, candied vegetables) other than food category 04.2.2.5	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission.
04.2.2.7	ER	Fermented vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and seaweed products, excluding fermented soybean	Examples are requested

Appendix I			
Food Categories in which the Use of Sweeteners is Technologically Justified			
Food Cat. No.	EC Comments	Food Category Title	Justification Provided to eWG
		products of food category 12.10	
05.1.2	ERONAS	Cocoa mixes (syrups)	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission.
05.1.3	ERONAS	Cocoa-based spreads, incl. fillings	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission.
05.1.4	ERONAS	Cocoa and chocolate products	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission.
05.1.5	ERONAS	Imitation chocolate, chocolate substitute products	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission.
05.2	ERONAS	Confectionery including hard and soft candy, nougats, etc. other than food categories 05.1, 05.3 and 05.4	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission.
05.2.1	ERONAS	Hard candy	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission.
05.2.2	ERONAS	Soft candy	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission.
05.2.3	ERONAS	Nougats and marzipans	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission.
05.3	NAS	Chewing gum	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission.
05.4	ERONAS	Decorations (e.g., for fine bakery wares), toppings (non-fruit), and sweet sauces	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission.
06.3	ERONAS. For use in breakfast cereals with a determined fibre content.	Breakfast cereals, including rolled oats	1) Use of sweeteners is <u>not</u> technologically justified 2) Use of sweeteners is technologically justified
06.5	ERONAS	Cereal and starch based desserts (e.g., rice pudding, tapioca pudding)	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission.
06.7	ERONAS	Pre-cooked or processed rice products, including rice cakes (Oriental type only)	1) Use of sweeteners is <u>not</u> technologically justified 2) Use of sweeteners is technologically justified
07.1	Technological need questioned. Basic food with wide consumption that would increase the intake.	Bread and ordinary bakery wares	
07.2	If technological need demonstrated, for use in products for special nutritional purpose only	Fine bakery wares (sweet, salty, savoury) and mixes	1) Use of sweeteners is <u>not</u> technologically justified 2) Use of sweeteners is technologically justified
09.3	For use in sweet sour preserves only	Semi-preserved fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	Examples are requested
09.4	For use in sweet sour preserves only	Fully preserved, including canned or fermented fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	Examples are requested
10.4	ERONAS	Egg-based desserts (e.g., custard)	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission.
11.4	Technological need questioned	Other sugars and syrups, xylose, maple sugar, sugar toppings	Examples are requested
11.6	Agree	Table-top sweeteners, including those containing high-intensity sweeteners	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission.
12.2	Technological need questioned.	Herbs, spices, seasonings and condiments (e.g., seasoning for instant noodles)	1) Use of sweeteners is <u>not</u> technologically justified 2) Use of sweeteners is technologically justified
12.3	Technological need questioned. The use could mislead the consumer	Vinegars	1) Use of sweeteners is <u>not</u> technologically justified. 2) Vinegar is rounded and mellowed by addition of sweet-tasting, flavour-enhancing products. Intense sweeteners balance acidity well.
12.4	Agree	Mustards	1) Include at the request of the European Commission. 2) Clarification is requested on whether this is a sweetener or flavor enhancer use?
12.5	ER	Soups and broths	1) Include at the request of the European Commission. 2) Clarification is requested on whether this is a sweetener or flavor enhancer use?

Appendix I			
Food Categories in which the Use of Sweeteners is Technologically Justified			
Food Cat. No.	EC Comments	Food Category Title	Justification Provided to eWG
12.6	Agree	Sauces and like products	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission.
12.7	ERONAS for the milk based sandwich spreads	Salads (e.g., macaroni salad, potato salad) and sandwich spreads excluding cocoa-and nut-based spreads of food categories 04.2.2.5 and 05.1.3	1) Include at the request of the European Commission. 2) Clarification is requested on whether this is a sweetener or flavor enhancer use?
13.3	Agree	Dietetic foods intended for special medical purposes (excluding products of food category 13.1)	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission.
13.4	Agree	Dietetic formulae for slimming purposes and weight reduction	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission.
13.5	Agree	Dietetic foods (e.g., supplementary foods for dietary use) excluding products of food categories 13.1-13.4 and 13.6	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission.
13.6	Agree	Food supplements	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission.
14.1.2.2	ERONAS	Vegetable juice	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission.
14.1.2.4	ERONAS	Concentrates for vegetable juice	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission.
14.1.3.1	ERONAS	Fruit nectar	1) Include at the request of Brasil, EC, ICBA and IFAC. 2) Sweeteners are permitted for use in fruit nectars in many countries and adopted provisions for sweeteners exist in the Codex General Standard for Food Additives.
14.1.3.2	ERONAS	Vegetable nectar	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission.
14.1.3.3	ERONAS	Concentrates for fruit nectar	1) Include at the request of Brazil. 2) Sweeteners are permitted for use in fruit nectars in many countries and adopted provisions for sweeteners exist in the Codex General Standard for Food Additives.
14.1.3.4	ERONAS	Concentrates for vegetable nectar	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission.
14.1.4	ERONAS	Water-based flavoured drinks, including "sport," "energy," or "electrolyte" drinks and particulated drinks	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission.
14.1.5	Should be limited to milk-based malted beverages	Coffee, coffee substitutes, tea, herbal infusions, and other hot cereal and grain beverages, excluding cocoa	Intense sweeteners are widely used in these beverages (ready-to-drink as well as concentrates), owing to their relative stability in liquids. Sweeteners are already used in this category in Japan and several other countries in water and milk-based malted beverages.
14.2.1	For use in energy reduced and alcohol-free beer	Beer and malt beverages	1) Use of sweeteners is <u>not</u> technologically justified 2) Use of sweeteners is technologically justified
14.2.2	Agree	Cider and perry	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission
14.2.4	Technological need questioned	Wines (other than grapes)	1) Use of sweeteners is <u>not</u> technologically justified 2) Use of sweeteners is technologically justified
14.2.7	Agree	Aromatized alcoholic beverages (e.g., beer, wine and spirituous cooler-type beverages, low-alcoholic refreshers)	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission
15.0	Agree for certain flavours only and coated nuts	Ready-to-eat savouries	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission

Appendix II			
GSFA Categories in which the use of one or more colors is technologically justified			
FCS No.	EC comments	Title	Justification
01.1.2	Support the recommendation, but excluding chocolate milk. Need for chocolate milk is questioned; This use could mislead the consumer.	Dairy-based drinks, flavoured and/or fermented (e.g., chocolate milk, cocoa, eggnog, drinking yoghurt, whey-based drinks)	Include because the CCMMMP is revising the standard for fermented milk drinks that will likely contain provisions for colors.
01.3.2	Need questioned	Beverage whiteners	

Appendix II			
GSFA Categories in which the use of one or more colors is technologically justified			
FCS No.	EC comments	Title	Justification
01.4.4	Need questioned	Cream analogues	Include because there are adopted provisions for colors in these GSFA food categories
01.5.2	Need questioned	Milk and cream powder analogues	
01.6.1	Need questioned in particular because rind is not expected to be formed in unripened cheese	Unripened cheese	Include because CX STANs C-31, A6, 221 and the draft mozzarella standard contain provisions for colors
01.6.2	The use of colours in ripened cheese should be limited to a few colours only and for specific types of ripened cheese e.g. INS 120 for red marbled cheese	Ripened cheese	
01.6.2.1	The use of colours in ripened cheese should be limited to a few colours only and for specific types of ripened cheese e.g. INS 120 for red marbled cheese	Ripened cheese, includes rind	
01.6.2.2	Agree	Rind of ripened cheese	
01.6.2.3	Agree	Cheese powder (for reconstitution; e.g., for cheese sauces)	Include because there are adopted provisions for colors in this GSFA food category
01.6.4		Processed cheese	Include because CX STANs A8a, b & c contains provisions for colors that apply to these food categories
01.6.4.1	Agree with limited use of colours	Plain processed cheese	
01.6.4.2	Agree	Flavoured processed cheese, including containing fruit, vegetables, meat, etc.	
01.6.5	Agree	Cheese analogues	
01.7	Agree	Dairy-based desserts (e.g., pudding, fruit or flavoured yoghurt)	Include because there are provisions for colors adopted for this GSFA food category
02.1.3	Technological need questioned. This use could mislead the consumer.	Lard, tallow, fish oil, and other animal fats	Include because CX STAN 19 contains provisions for colors that apply to this food category
02.2.1	Only limited use to vegetable carotenes (INS 160aii) of the proposed colours above	Emulsions containing at least 80% fat	Add at request of European Commission
02.2.1.1 ¹⁷¹	Only limited use to vegetable carotenes (INS 160aii) of the proposed colours above	Butter and concentrated butter	Include because CX Stan 01 contains provisions for colors that apply to this food category
02.2.1.2	Only limited use to vegetable carotenes (INS 160aii) of the proposed colours above	Margarine and similar products	Include because CX STAN 32 contains provisions for colors and there are adopted provisions for colors in these GSFA food categories
02.2.1.3	Only limited use to vegetable carotenes (INS 160aii) of the proposed colours above	Blends of butter and margarine	
02.2.2	Only limited use to vegetable carotenes (INS 160aii) of the proposed colours above	Emulsions containing less than 80% fat	
02.3	Only limited use to vegetable carotenes (INS 160aii) of the proposed colours above	Fat emulsions mainly of type oil-in-water, including mixed and/or flavoured products based on fat emulsions	
02.4	Agree	Fat-based desserts excluding dairy-based dessert products of food category 01.7	
03.0	Agree	Edible ices, including sherbet and sorbet	
04.1.1.2	Technological need questioned. This use could mislead the consumer. If the surface treatment is a sauce/syrup this should be treated as a compound food with the colour permitted in the sauce.	Surface-treated fresh fruit	Include with Note 4 ¹⁷² and 16 ¹⁷³

¹⁷¹ CX/FA 08/40/6 proposes to revise the GSFA food category system. If endorsed by the CCFA, food categories 02.2.1.1, 02.2.1.2 and 02.2.1.3 would be deleted.

¹⁷² **Note 4** For decoration, stamping, marking or branding the product.

¹⁷³ **Note 16** For use in glaze, coatings or decorations for fruit, vegetables, meat or fish.

Appendix II			
GSFA Categories in which the use of one or more colors is technologically justified			
FCS No.	EC comments	Title	Justification
04.1.2.2	Technological need questioned as well the justification provided. SO₂ is already permitted on dried fruit and can stabilise colours. Adding colours to such products could mislead the consumer	Dried fruit	Include because of the following justification: due to the effect of temperature during processing and storage affecting the discoloration of the dried fruit. Dried fruit will lose original natural flesh color in processing and aging
04.1.2.3	Agree	Fruit in vinegar, oil, or brine	Include because there are adopted provisions for colors in this GSFA food category
04.1.2.4	Need questioned. This use could mislead the consumer.	Canned or bottled (pasteurized) fruit	Include because CX STANs 60, 61, 61, 78, 99, 159, 242 all contain provisions for colors that apply to this food category
04.1.2.5	Agree, but only certain colours	Jams, jellies, marmelades	Include because CX STANs 79 and 80 contain provisions for colors and there are adopted provisions for colors in these GSFA food categories
04.1.2.6	Agree	Fruit-based spreads (e.g., chutney) excluding products of food category 04.1.2.5	
04.1.2.7	Agree	Candied fruit	
04.1.2.8	Need questioned. This use could mislead the consumer	Fruit preparations, including pulp, purees, fruit toppings and coconut milk	
04.1.2.9	Agree	Fruit-based desserts, incl. fruit-flavoured water-based desserts	
04.1.2.10	Agree	Fermented fruit products	
04.1.2.11	Agree	Fruit fillings for pastries	
04.1.2.12	Technological need questioned.	Cooked fruit	
04.2.1.2	Question the practical application of this on these vegetables. The use should be limited to the coating for vegetables only	Surface-treated fresh vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds	Include with Note 4 and 16
04.2.2.2	Only dried potato granules and flakes Question the justification provided, many of these are basic foods, and some are already permitted SO₂ on them, which can stabilise the colour.	Dried vegetables, (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds	Include because of the following justification: due to the effect of temperature during processing and storage affecting the discoloration of the dried fruit. Dried fruit will lose original natural flesh color in processing and aging
04.2.2.3	Agree, but certain colours only	Vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds in vinegar, oil, brine, or soy sauce	Include because CX STANs 55, 58, 81, and 115 contains provisions for colors and here are adopted provisions for colors in these GSFA food categories
04.2.2.4	Agree for processed mushy and garden peas (canned only)	Canned or bottled (pasteurized) or retort pouch vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds	
04.2.2.5	Technological need questioned.	Vegetable, (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed purees and spreads (e.g., peanut butter)	
04.2.2.6	Agree with the exception of tomato paste and tomato-based sauces (see also codex standard for processed tomato concentrates codex STAN 57-1981)	Vegetable, (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed pulps and preparations (e.g., vegetable desserts and sauces, candied vegetables) other than food category 04.2.2.5	
04.2.2.7	Agree	Fermented vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and seaweed products, excluding fermented soybean products of food category 12.10	

Appendix II			
GSFA Categories in which the use of one or more colors is technologically justified			
FCS No.	EC comments	Title	Justification
04.2.2.8	Technological need questioned. The use could mislead the consumer.	Cooked or fried vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds	
05.1.2	Technological need questioned. The use could mislead the consumer.	Cocoa mixes (syrups)	
05.1.3	Technological need questioned. The use could mislead the consumer.	Cocoa-based spreads, incl. fillings	
05.1.4	Technological need questioned. The use could mislead the consumer.	Cocoa and chocolate products	
05.1.5	Agree	Imitation chocolate, chocolate substitute products	
05.2	Agree	Confectionery including hard and soft candy, nougats, etc. other than food categories 05.1, 05.3, and 05.4	
05.2.1	Agree	Hard candy	
05.2.2	Agree	Soft candy	
05.2.3	Agree	Nougats and marzipans	
05.3	Agree	Chewing gum	
05.4	Agree	Decorations (e.g., for fine bakery wares), toppings (non-fruit), and sweet sauces	
06.3	Rolled oats are a basic food. Technological need questioned. Basic food with wide consumption that would increase intake of colours	Breakfast cereals, including rolled oats	
06.4.3	EC does not agree with the use of colours in pre-cooked pastas. However, could agree with the use <u>in instant noodles only</u>, if this is in accordance with CODEX STAN 249-2006	Pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products	Include because CX STAN 249 (Instant Noodles) contains color provisions
06.5	Agree	Cereal and starch based desserts (e.g., rice pudding, tapioca pudding)	Include because there are adopted provisions for colors in these GSFA food categories
06.6	Agree	Batters (e.g., for breading or batters for fish or poultry)	
06.7	If no other interest, EC does not support	Pre-cooked or processed rice products, including rice cakes (Oriental type only)	
06.8	If no other interest, EC does not support	Soybean products (excluding soybean products of food category 12.9 and fermented soybean products of food category 12.10)	Include at request of the European Commission
07.1.2	Technological need questioned. Basic food with wide consumption that would increase intake of colours	Crackers, excluding sweet crackers	
07.1.4	Technological need questioned. Basic food with wide consumption that would increase intake of colours	Bread-type products, including bread stuffing and bread crumbs	
07.2	Agree	Fine bakery wares (sweet, salty, savoury) and mixes	Include because there are adopted provisions for colors in these GSFA food categories
07.2.1	Agree	Cakes, cookies and pies (e.g., fruit-filled or custard types)	
07.2.2	Agree	Other fine bakery products (e.g., doughnuts, sweet rolls, scones, and muffins)	
07.2.3	Agree	Mixes for fine bakery wares (e.g., cakes, pancakes)	
08.1	The use should be limited in glaze, coatings or decorations or surface treatment only	Fresh meat, poultry and game	Include with Note 4

Appendix II			
GSFA Categories in which the use of one or more colors is technologically justified			
FCS No.	EC comments	Title	Justification
08.1.1	The use should be limited in glaze, coatings or decorations or surface treatment only	Fresh meat, poultry and game, whole pieces or cuts	Include with Note 4
08.1.2	The use should be limited in glaze, coatings or decorations or surface treatment only	Fresh meat, poultry and game, comminuted	Include with Note 16
08.2	The use should be limited in glaze, coatings or decorations or surface treatment only	Processed meat, poultry, and game products in whole pieces or cuts	Include with Note 16
08.2.1	The use should be limited in glaze, coatings or decorations or surface treatment only	Non-heat treated processed meat, poultry, and game products in whole pieces or cuts	Include with Note 16
08.2.1.1	The use should be limited in glaze, coatings or decorations or surface treatment only	Cured (including salted) non-heat treated processed meat, poultry, and game products in whole pieces or cuts	Include with Note 16
08.2.1.2	The use should be limited in glaze, coatings or decorations or surface treatment only	Cured (including salted) and dried non-heat treated processed meat, poultry, and game products in whole pieces or cuts	Include with Note 16
08.2.1.3	The use should be limited in glaze, coatings or decorations or surface treatment only	Fermented non-heat treated processed meat, poultry, and game products in whole pieces or cuts	Include with Note 16
08.2.2	The use should be limited in glaze, coatings or decorations or surface treatment only	Heat-treated processed meat, poultry, and game products in whole pieces or cuts	Include with Note 16
08.2.3	The use should be limited in glaze, coatings or decorations or surface treatment only	Frozen processed meat, poultry, and game products in whole pieces or cuts	Include with Note 16
08.3	Agree, but only certain colours	Processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	Include with Note 16
08.3.1	Agree, but only certain colours	Non-heat treated processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	Include with Note 16
08.3.1.1	Agree, but only certain colours	Cured (including salted) non-heat treated processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	Include with Note 16
08.3.1.2	Agree, but only certain colours	Cured (including salted) and dried non-heat treated processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	Include with Note 16
08.3.1.3	Agree, but only certain colours	Fermented non-heat treated processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	Include with Note 16
08.3.2	Agree, but only certain colours	Heat-treated processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	Include with Note 16
08.3.3	Agree, but only certain colours	Frozen processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	Include with Note 16
08.4	Agree, but only certain colours	Edible casings (e.g., sausage casings)	Include with Note 16
09.1	Technological need questioned for the broad food category of fresh untreated fish. Such use could mislead the consumer. It should therefore be limited as specified in the sub-categories below.	Fresh fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	Include with Note 16
09.1.1	The use should be limited to "fish roe only"	Fresh fish	Include with Note 16
09.1.2	Technological need questioned for these products. The use could mislead the consumer.	Fresh mollusks, crustaceans and echinoderms	Include with Note 16
09.2	The use should be limited to certain products only as specified in the subcategories below	Processed fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	Include because there are adopted provisions for colors in this GSFA food category

Appendix II			
GSFA Categories in which the use of one or more colors is technologically justified			
FCS No.	EC comments	Title	Justification
09.2.1	Agree	Frozen fish, fish fillets, and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	Include with Note 95 ¹⁷⁴
09.2.2	The use should be limited to batter/coating only and to certain colours only. Codex Standard CX/STAN 166-1989 also provides for limited use of colours	Frozen battered fish, fish fillets and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	Include with Note 16
09.2.3	The use should be limited to “fish roe” and “Surimi” only.	Frozen minced and creamed fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	Include with Note X ¹⁷⁵
09.2.4	Agree, but for limited use in certain products only	Cooked and/or fried fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	Include because there are adopted provisions for colors in this GSFA food category
09.2.4.1	Agree	Cooked fish and fish products	Include with Note 95
09.2.4.2	Agree	Cooked mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	Include because there are adopted provisions for colors in this GSFA food category
09.2.4.3	The use should be limited to “fish roe” and “Surimi” only.	Fried fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	Include with Note 16
09.2.5	Agree	Smoked, dried, fermented, and/or salted fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	Include because there are adopted provisions for colors in these GSFA food categories
09.3	The use should be limited to certain products only (see below)	Semi-preserved fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	
09.3.1	The use should be limited in glaze and coatings.	Fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms, marinated and/or in jelly	Include with Note 16
09.3.2	The use should be limited in glaze and coatings.	Fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms, pickled and/or in brine	
09.3.3	Agree	Salmon substitutes, caviar, and other fish roe products	Include because there are adopted provisions for colors in this GSFA food category
09.3.4	Agree	Semi-preserved fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms (e.g., fish paste), excluding products of food categories 09.3.1 - 09.3.3	Include because there are adopted provisions for colors in this GSFA food category
09.4	Agree	Fully preserved, including canned or fermented fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	Include with Note 95
10.1	Agree	Fresh eggs	Include with Note 4
10.2	These are basic foods. Technological need questioned	Egg products	
10.2.1	These are basic foods. Technological need questioned	Liquid egg products	
10.2.2	These are basic foods. Technological need questioned.	Frozen egg products	Include because there are adopted provisions for colors in these GSFA food categories
10.2.3	These are basic foods. Technological need questioned.	Dried and/or heat coagulated egg products	
10.3	Agree	Preserved eggs, including alkaline, salted, and canned eggs	Include with Note 4 (For decoration stamping, marking or branding the product)
10.4	Agree	Egg-based desserts (e.g., custard)	Include because there are adopted provisions for colors in this GSFA food category
11.3	Technological need questioned.	Sugar solutions and syrups, also (partially) inverted, including treacle and molasses, excluding products of food category 11.1.3	

¹⁷⁴ **Note 95** For use in surimi and fish roe products only

¹⁷⁵ **Note X** For use in surimi only.

Appendix II				
GSFA Categories in which the use of one or more colors is technologically justified				
FCS No.	EC comments	Title	Justification	
11.4	Technological need questioned.	Other sugars and syrups (e.g., xylose, maple syrup, sugar toppings)		
12.2.2	Agree	Seasonings and condiments	Include because CS STAN 117 contains provisions for colors and there are adopted provisions for colors in this GSFA food category	
12.3	Agree, but certain colours only	Vinegars		
12.4	Agree	Mustards		
12.5	Agree	Soups and broths		
12.5.1	Agree	Ready-to-eat soups and broths, including canned, bottled, and frozen		
12.5.2	Agree	Mixes for soups and broths		
12.6	Agree	Sauces and like products		
12.6.1	Agree	Emulsified sauces (e.g., mayonnaise, salad dressing)		
12.6.2	Agree	Non-emulsified sauces (e.g., ketchup, cheese sauce, cream sauce, brown gravy)		
12.6.3	Agree	Mixes for sauces and gravies		
12.6.4	Agree	Clear sauces (e.g., fish sauce)		
12.7	Agree	Salads (e.g., macaroni salad, potato salad) and sandwich spreads excluding cocoa-and nut-based spreads of food categories 04.2.2.5 and 05.1.3		
12.9	If no other interest, EC does not support	Protein products		Include upon request of European Commission and New Zealand
12.9.1	If no other interest, EC does not support	Soybean protein products		
12.9.1.1	If no other interest, EC does not support	Soybean beverage		
12.9.1.2	If no other interest, EC does not support	Soybean milk film		
12.9.1.3	If no other interest, EC does not support	Other soybean protein products (including non-fermented soy sauce)		
12.9.2	If no other interest, EC does not support	Fresh bean curd (tofu)		
12.9.3	If no other interest, EC does not support	Semi-dehydrated bean curd		
12.9.3.1	If no other interest, EC does not support	Thick gravy-stewed semi-dehydrated bean curd		
12.9.3.2	If no other interest, EC does not support	Deep fried semi-dehydrated bean curd		
12.9.3.3	If no other interest, EC does not support	Semi-dehydrated bean curd, other than food categories 12.9.3.1 and 12.9.3.2		
12.9.4	If no other interest, EC does not support	Dehydrated bean curd (kori tofu)		
12.9.5	If no other interest, EC does not support	Other protein products		
12.10	If no other interest, EC does not support	Fermented soybean products		
12.10.1	If no other interest, EC does not support	Fermented soybeans (e.g., natto)		
12.10.2	If no other interest, EC does not support	Fermented soybean curd (soybean cheese)		
12.10.3	If no other interest, EC does not support	Fermented soybean paste (e.g., miso)		
12.10.4	If no other interest, EC does not support	Fermented soy sauce		
13.3	Agree	Dietetic foods intended for special medical purposes (excluding products of food category 13.1)	Include because there are adopted provisions for colors in this GSFA food category	
13.4	Agree	Dietetic formulae for slimming purposes and weight reduction		
13.5	Agree	Dietetic foods (e.g., supplementary foods for dietary use) excluding products of food categories 13.1-13.4 and 13.6		
13.6	Agree	Food supplements		

Appendix II			
GSFA Categories in which the use of one or more colors is technologically justified			
FCS No.	EC comments	Title	Justification
14.1.4	Agree	Water-based flavoured drinks, including "sport," "energy," or "electrolyte" drinks and particulated drinks	
14.1.4.1	Agree	Carbonated water-based flavoured drinks	
14.1.4.2	Agree	Non-carbonated water-based flavoured drinks, including punches and ades	
14.1.4.3	Agree	Concentrates (liquid or solid) for water-based flavoured drinks	
14.1.5	Only for coffee substitutes.	Coffee, coffee substitutes, tea, herbal infusions, and other hot cereal and grain beverages, excluding cocoa	Include based on the following justifications. 1) Caramel colour, flavours and caffeine are dried on maltodextrin, which is added to dried coffee, in order to make an extended mix which is used as a coffee substitute in Russia (e.g. by the Russian military). 2) This category includes canned coffees that are served hot. The use of caramel color is technologically justified in such products due to a specific manufacturing method (retort sterilization) that may change the color during processing. Caramel color is added to provide a consistent color of the product that is expected by consumers. Such coffees are widely marketed in Japan.
14.2.1	Agree, but certain colours only	Beer and malt beverages	Include because there are adopted provisions for colors in this GSFA food category
14.2.2	Agree, but certain colours only	Cider and perry	
14.2.3.3	The technological need is questioned. The use could mislead the consumer	Fortified grape wine, grape liquor wine, and sweet grape wine	
14.2.4	Agree	Wines (other than grape)	
14.2.6	Agree	Distilled spirituous beverages containing more than 15% alcohol	
14.2.7	Agree	Aromatized alcoholic beverages (e.g., beer, wine and spirituous cooler-type beverages, low-alcoholic refreshers)	
15.0	Agree	Ready-to-eat savouries	
15.1	Agree	Snacks - potato, cereal, flour or starch based (from roots and tubers, pulses and legumes)	
15.2	Agree	Processed nuts, including coated nuts and nut mixtures (with e.g., dried fruit)	
15.3	Agree	Snacks - fish based	
16.0	The technological need is questioned. Justification should be provided why the carry over wouldn't be sufficient	Composite foods - foods that could not be placed in categories 01 - 15	

Norway

Norway would like to thank the electronic Working Group and especially the US delegation for the extensive work on the GSFA.

Our comments are organized by substance as organized in CX/FA 08/40/5. For simplicity we do not comment when we agree with the Working Groups proposal to delete, discontinue or adopt the said maximum level.

Erythrosine INS 127

Norway refers to the intake assessment performed by JECFA that stated that the intake of erythrosine could exceed the ADI if the maximum limits proposed in the draft GSFA are widely adopted at a national level. The object of the GSFA is to provide guidance on safe use of food additives. It is therefore necessary to restrict the maximum limits of erythrosine in the GSFA.

Norway supports none of the proposed use levels as these are too high compared to ADI. Erythrosine should only be allowed in products with a low intake.

Food additives containing aluminium

Norway questions the proposed limits in general as they do not seem to be in compliance with the safety assessment performed by JECFA which sets an PTWI of 1 mg/kg for aluminium from all sources, including food additives. All the proposed limits will lead to an unacceptable high intake of aluminium. Norway proposes that discussion on the use levels for food additives containing aluminium is postponed to the next meeting of the CCFA and that the request for use levels are repeated.

Sulphites

Norway supports the proposed levels of 100 mg/kg in jams, jellies and marmalades (04.1.2.5) as well as in fermented fruit products (04.1.2.10).

Norway further supports a level of 100 mg/kg in fruit-based desserts, including fruit-flavoured water based desserts (04.1.2.9).

IADSA (International Alliance of Dietary/Food Supplement Associations)

IADSA welcomes the results of the work of the electronic Working Group on the General Standard for Food Additives (GSFA) and therefore Parts 1 (miscellaneous food additives and sweeteners) and 2 (colours) of the Report of the electronic Working Group on the GSFA concerning food additives widely used in food supplements, Food category 13.6.

Sufficient information on their use in food supplements has been provided to the electronic Working Group and the levels proposed by the working group are technologically justified.

IADSA would therefore like to express its support for the adoption of the food additive provisions as recommended by the eWG in relation to the following additives for category 13.6 – food supplements:

SWEETENERS

- **Aspartame – Acesulfame Salt**

COLOURS

- **Lycopene**
- **Sunset Yellow FCF**
- **Ponceau 4R**
- **Erythrosine**
- **Allura Red AC**
- **Indigotine**
- **Chlorophylls, Copper Complexes of Chlorophylls**
- **Fast Green FCF**
- **Caramel Colour Class III**
- **Caramel Colour Class IV**
- **Carotenoids**
- **Grape Skin Extracts**
- **Iron Oxides**