

# codex alimentarius commission E



FOOD AND AGRICULTURE  
ORGANIZATION  
OF THE UNITED NATIONS

WORLD  
HEALTH  
ORGANIZATION



JOINT OFFICE: Viale delle Terme di Caracalla 00153 ROME Tel: 39 06 57051 www.codexalimentarius.net Email: codex@fao.org Facsimile: 39 06 5705 4593

Agenda Item 5(b)

CX/FA 08/40/6  
November 2007

## JOINT FAO/WHO FOOD STANDARDS PROGRAMME

### CODEX COMMITTEE ON FOOD ADDITIVES

#### Fortieth Session

Beijing, China, 21-25 April 2008

### PROPOSED DRAFT REVISION OF THE FOOD CATEGORY SYSTEM OF THE GENERAL STANDARD FOR FOOD ADDITIVES

(N11-2007)

At Step 3

(prepared by Indonesia, with the assistance of Brazil, Canada, China, the European Community, India, Japan, Malaysia, Republic of Korea, Philippines, the United States of America and IDF)

Governments and international organizations in Observer status with the Codex Alimentarius Commission wishing to submit comments at Step 3 on the proposed draft revision of the Food Category System of the General Standard for Food Additives to do so **no later than 31 January 2008** as follows: Secretariat, Codex Committee on Food Additives, National Institute of Nutrition and Food Safety, China CDC, 7 Panjiayuan Nanli, Chaoyang District, Beijing 100021, China (Telefax: + 86 10 67711813, E-mail: [secretariat@ccfa.cc](mailto:secretariat@ccfa.cc) *preferably*), with a copy to the Secretary, Codex Alimentarius Commission, Joint FAO/WHO Food Standards Programme, Viale delle Terme di Caracalla, 00153 Rome, Italy (Telefax: +39 06 5705 4593; E-mail: [Codex@fao.org](mailto:Codex@fao.org) - *preferably*).

## INTRODUCTION

1. The 39<sup>th</sup> Session of Codex Committee on Food Additives (CCFA) agreed to forward a project document proposing new work on the revision of the food category system of the Codex General Standard for Food Additives (GSFA) to the 59<sup>th</sup> session of the Executive Committee for critical review and for approval by the 30<sup>th</sup> session of the Codex Alimentarius Commission (CAC). The Committee also agreed that, subject to the approval of new work by the Commission, an electronic working group led by Indonesia, working in English, would prepare a proposed draft revision of the Food Category System of the GSFA, with a view to its circulation for comments at Step 3 and its consideration at Step 4 at the 40<sup>th</sup> Session of the CCFA (ALINORM 07/30/12, para. 118). Brazil, Canada, China, the European Community, India, Japan, Malaysia, Republic of Korea, Philippines and United States of America expressed their willingness to participate in the electronic Working Group.

2. At the 30<sup>th</sup> Session of Codex Alimentarius Commission, the Commission approved as new work the Proposed Draft for the Revision of the Food Category System (FCS) of the Codex General Standard for Food Additives (GSFA) (N11-2007; ALINORM 07/30/REP, Appendix VII).

3. The purpose of this new work is twofold: 1) To consider revising the food category system of the GSFA so that the current food categories that include soybean-based food products (06.8, Soybean products (excluding soybean products of food category 12.9 and fermented soybean products of food category 12.10), 12.9 (Protein products), and 12.10 (Fermented soybean products)) would be reassigned to more appropriate food sub-categories of soybean-based foods within the hierarchy of the food category system. 2) To clarify the implications for food category 02.2.1.2 (Margarine and similar products) in light of the revocation of the Codex standards for margarine (CODEX STAN 32-1981) and for minarine (CODEX STAN 135-1981) and the adoption of the draft standard for fat spreads and blended spreads by the 30<sup>th</sup> CAC (ALINORM 07/30/REP, para. 203 and Appendices IV (Part 1) and VI).

4. There are four parts to this document that address this charge:

- Part I: Food Category System – Revision to Titles and Descriptors
- Part II : Consequential Revision of the Annex to Table 3 of the GSFA
- Part III: Consequential Changes to Codex Commodity Standards
- Part IV: Consequential Changes to the GSFA

### **General Overview of Comments Received**

5. The GSFA Preamble (Section 5 CODEX-STAN 192-1995) states that “[T]he food category descriptors are not to be legal product designations nor are they intended for labelling purposes.” However, the 39<sup>th</sup> CCFA noted an unresolved issue concerning the use of the terms “milk” and “cheese” in the titles and descriptors of food categories 06.8.1, 06.8.2, 06.8.3, and 06.8.7 for soybean-based foods, as these terms are inconsistent with the terms used in the relevant Codex standards (ALINORM 07/30/12, para. 115), while the terms “milk” and “cheese” are commonly associated with foods covered by these food categories. The use of terms “milk” and “cheese” is based on their historical and common usage similar to the use of term “milk” in “coconut milk” and the term “butter” in “cocoa butter”.

6. Brazil and Malaysia expressed their concern regarding the absence of a food category for products composed primarily of protein that are derived from soybeans. A new food category, **06.8.8. Other soybean protein products**, has been created to include these products.

7. Brazil, Canada, and the United States of America expressed their concern regarding the use of the term "milk" in the titles and descriptors of food categories 06.8.1, 06.8.2, and 06.8.3, and the use of the term “cheese” in the title of food category 06.8.7. The use of such terms, as discussed in the 39<sup>th</sup> Session of CCFA would not be consistent with the Codex General Standard on the Use of Dairy Terms (CODEX STAN 206-1999). Although national legislation may permit reference to "soybean milk" and “soybean cheese,” the Food Category System is intended for global use and therefore, terms such as "soybean beverage" and "fermented soybean curd," with the help of Annex B - Part II (Food category descriptors), are sufficiently clear for use with the GSFA and would not result in confusion regarding the types of food products intended to fit each category.

### **PART I: FOOD CATEGORY SYSTEM – REVISION TO TITLES AND DESCRIPTORS**

8. Proposals for the revision of the titles and descriptors for fat emulsions mainly of type water-in-oil and for the food categories for soybean-based food products are provided below.

9. The proposals regarding the fat emulsion categories under 02.2. (Fat emulsions mainly of type water-in-oil) are intended to account for the following:

- the revocation of the Codex Standards for Margarine (CODEX STAN 32-1981) and for Minarine (CODEX STAN 135-1981);
- the final adoption of the Codex Standard for Fat Spreads and Blended Fat Spreads (CODEX STAN 256-2007; food category 02.2.2);
- the Codex Standard for Dairy Fat Spreads (CODEX STAN 253-2006); and
- the Codex Standard for Butter (CODEX STAN A-1-1971).

10. The proposals regarding the soybean-based foods are derived from those provided in CX/FA 07/39/11.

11. The revocations of the Codex Standards for Margarine and for Minarine were a direct consequence of the adoption of the Codex Standard for Fat Spreads and Blended Fat Spreads. Foods conforming to these revoked standards are now covered by the new standard. In addition, the scopes of the food products conforming to the Codex Standards for Dairy Fat Spreads and for Fat Spreads and Blended Fat Spreads are very similar, differing primarily in their fat source, dairy vs. non-dairy, respectively. The Codex Standard for Fat Spreads and Blended Fat Spreads also includes products whose fat content is partially derived from milkfat. Thus, if implemented the proposal would simplify the food categories under 02.2 by having only two subcategories: Butter (02.2.1) and Fat Spreads (02.2.2).

12. Only those food categories regarding fat emulsions and soybean-based foods for which revision to the food category title or to the descriptor of the food category are being proposed are provided below. The proposed revisions are shown as follows. For the food category titles and descriptors, proposed deletions are noted in ~~strikethrough~~ text, and proposed amendments are noted in **bold** text. Due to the length and complexity of the descriptors of the food categories, the proposed descriptors for the newly reassigned food categories under 06.8, 12.9 and 12.10 are shown in **bold** text only; these descriptors, as they currently appear, are *not* shown in strikethrough text. Finally, the footnote numbers have been revised, as appropriate.

### Revision of Food Category Titles

#### 02.2 Fat emulsions mainly of type water-in-oil

##### 02.2.1 ~~Emulsions containing at least 80% fat~~ **Butter**

###### 02.2.1.1 ~~Butter and concentrated butter~~

###### 02.2.1.2 ~~Margarine and similar products~~

###### 02.2.1.3 ~~Blends of butter and margarine~~

##### 02.2.2 ~~Emulsions containing less than 80% fat~~ **Fat spreads**

#### 04.2.2.3 Vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and laoe vera), and seaweeds in vinegar, oil, brine, or soybean sauce

#### 04.2.2.7 Fermented vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and seaweed products, excluding fermented soybean products of food ~~category 12.10~~ **categories 06.8.6, 06.8.7, 12.9.1, 12.9.2.1 and 12.9.2.3**

#### 06.8 Soybean products (excluding soybean-based seasonings and condiments of food category 12.9) ~~and fermented soybean products of food category 12.10~~

##### **06.8.1 Soybean-based beverages**

##### **06.8.2 Soybean-based beverage film**

##### **06.8.3 Soybean curd (tofu)**

##### **06.8.4 Semi-dehydrated soybean curd**

###### **06.8.4.1 Thick gravy-stewed semi-dehydrated soybean curd**

###### **06.8.4.2 Deep fried semi-dehydrated soybean curd**

###### **06.8.4.3 Semi-dehydrated soybean curd, other than food categories 06.8.4.1 and 06.8.4.2**

##### **06.8.5 Dehydrated soybean curd (kori tofu)**

##### **06.8.6 Fermented soybeans (e.g., natto, tempe)**

##### **06.8.7 Fermented soybean curd**

##### **06.8.8 Other soybean protein products**

#### 12.0 Salts, spices, soups, sauces, salads, protein products ~~(including soybean protein products) and fermented soybean products)~~

##### **12.9 Soybean-based seasonings and condiments**

###### **12.9.1 Fermented soybean paste (e.g., miso)**

**12.9.2 Soybean sauce****12.9.2.1 Fermented soybean sauce****12.9.2.2 Non-fermented soybean sauce****12.9.2.3 Other soybean sauce**~~12.9~~ **12.10 Protein products other than from soybeans**~~12.9.1 Soybean protein products~~~~12.9.1.1 Soybean beverage~~~~12.9.1.2 Soybean beverage film~~~~12.9.1.3 Other soybean protein products (including non-fermented soy sauce)~~~~12.9.2 Fresh bean curd (tofu)~~~~12.9.3 Semi-dehydrated bean curd~~~~12.9.3.1 Thick gravy stewed semi-dehydrated bean curd~~~~12.9.3.2 Deep fried semi-dehydrated bean curd~~~~12.9.3.3 Semi-dehydrated bean curd, other than food categories 12.9.3.1 and 12.9.3.2~~~~12.9.4 Dehydrated bean curd (kori tofu)~~~~12.9.5 Other protein products~~~~12.10~~ — Fermented soybean products~~12.10.1 Fermented soybeans (e.g., natto)~~~~12.10.2 Fermented soybean curd (soybean cheese)~~~~12.10.3 Fermented soybean paste (e.g., miso)~~~~12.10.4 Fermented soy sauce~~**Revision of Food Category Descriptors**02.2 Fat emulsions mainly of type water-in-oil:

Include all emulsified products excluding fat-based counterparts of dairy products and dairy desserts.

~~02.2.1 Emulsions containing at least 80% fat :~~

~~Include all full-fat products. Their fat-reduced counterparts are found in 02.2.2.~~

**02.2.1 Butter:**

Butter is a fatty product consisting of a primarily water-in-oil emulsion derived exclusively from milk and/or products obtained from milk.<sup>1</sup>

~~02.2.1.2 Margarine and similar products:~~

~~Margarine is a spreadable or fluid water-in-oil emulsion produced mainly from edible fats and oils.<sup>2</sup>~~

~~02.2.1.3 Blends of butter and margarine:~~

~~Butter-margarine blends are mixtures of butter (milkfat) and margarine (edible fats and oils).~~

<sup>1</sup> Codex Standard for Butter (CODEX STAN A-01-1971).

<sup>2</sup> Codex Standard for Margarine (CODEX STAN 032-1981).

#### 02.2.2 Emulsions containing less than 80% fat Fat spreads:

Includes **fat spreads (emulsions principally of the type water and edible fats and oils), dairy fat spreads (emulsions principally of the type water-in-milkfat), and blended spreads (fat spreads blended with higher amounts of milkfat).**<sup>3</sup> ~~reduced-fat counterparts of butter, margarine, and their mixtures. Includes~~ **Examples include margarine (a spreadable or fluid water-in-oil emulsion produced mainly from edible fats and oils);** products derived from butter (e.g., “butterine,” a spreadable butter blend with vegetable oils)<sup>4</sup>; **blends of butter and margarine; and** ~~includes~~ **minarine; (a spreadable water-in-oil emulsion produced principally from water and edible fats and oils that are not solely derived from milk<sup>5</sup>).** Also includes ~~dairy spreads (reduced fat-based products derived from dairy fat (e.g., milkfat)), and other reduced-fat spreads derived or~~ **from animal or vegetable fats, including reduced-fat counterparts of butter, margarine, and their mixtures** (e.g., three-quarter fat butter, three-quarter fat margarine, or three-quarter fat butter-margarine blends).

#### 04.2.2.3 Vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and seaweeds in vinegar, oil, brine, or soybean sauce:

Products prepared by treating raw vegetables with salt solution excluding fermented soybean products. Fermented vegetables, which are a type of pickled product, are classified in 04.2.2.7. Fermented soybean products are classified in ~~12.10~~ **06.8.6, 06.8.7, 12.9.1, 12.9.2.1 and 12.9.2.3**. Examples include: pickled cabbage, pickled cucumber, olives, pickled onions, mushrooms in oil, marinated artichoke hearts, achar, and **piccalilli**. Examples of Oriental-style pickled vegetables include: *tsukemono* such as rice bran pickled vegetables (*nuka-zuke*), *koji*-pickled vegetables (*koji-zuke*), sake lees-pickled vegetables (*kasu-zuke*), *miso*-pickled vegetables (*miso-zuke*), soybean sauce-pickled vegetables (*shoyu-zuke*), vinegar-pickled vegetables (*su-zuke*) and brine-pickled vegetables (*shio-zuke*). Other examples include: pickled ginger, pickled garlic, and chili pickles.

#### 04.2.2.7 Fermented vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and seaweed products, excluding fermented soybean products of food category ~~12.10~~ **06.8.6, 06.8.7, 12.9.1, 12.9.2.1 and 12.9.2.3:**

Fermented vegetables are a type of pickled product, formed by the action of lactic acid bacteria, usually in the presence of salt.<sup>6</sup> Traditional Oriental fermented vegetable products are prepared by air-drying vegetables and exposing them to ambient temperatures so as to allow the microorganisms to flourish; the vegetables are then sealed in an anaerobic environment and salt (to generate lactic acid), spices and seasonings are added.<sup>7</sup> Examples include: red pepper paste, fermented vegetable products (some *tsukemono* other than category 04.2.2.3), *kimchi* (fermented Chinese cabbage and vegetable preparation), and sauerkraut (fermented cabbage). Excludes fermented soybean products (e.g., *natto*, soybean cheese, *miso*, and fermented soy sauce), which are found in food category ~~12.10~~ **that are found in food categories 06.8.6 (Fermented soybeans (e.g., *natto* and *tempe*)), 06.8.7 (Fermented soybean curd), 12.9.1 (Fermented soybean paste e.g., *miso*)), 12.9.2.1 (Fermented soybean sauce), and 12.9.2.3 (Other soybean sauce).**

#### 06.8 Soybean products (excluding soybean-based seasonings and condiments of food category 12.9) and fermented soybean products of food category ~~12.10~~:

Includes ~~frozen and dried, soybeans, cooked, or fried,~~ **or fermented soybeans products, and soybean curd products, etc.**

<sup>3</sup> Codex Standard for Dairy Fat Spreads (CODEX STAN 253-2006); and Codex Standard for Fat Spreads and Blended Spreads (CODEX STAN 256-2007).

<sup>4</sup> *Food Chemistry*, H.-D. Belitz & W. Grosch, Springer-Verlag, Heidelberg, 1987, p. 395.

<sup>5</sup> ~~Codex Standard for Minarine (CODEX STAN 135-1981).~~

<sup>6</sup> *Food Chemistry*, H.-D. Belitz & W. Grosch, Springer-Verlag, Heidelberg, 1987, pp. 572-576.

<sup>7</sup> *Asian Foods: Science and Technology*, C.Y.W. Ang, K.S. Liu, & Y.-W. Huang, Eds., Chapter 11: Vegetable Products, S.L. Wang, Technomic Publishing Co., Lancaster PA 1999, pp. 320-323.

### **06.8.1 Soybean-based beverages**

Products prepared from dried soybeans that are soaked in water, pureed, ~~diluted with water~~, boiled and strained, or prepared from soybean flour, soybean concentrate, or soybean isolate. Soybean-based beverages may be consumed as is, or used to prepare other soybean products, such as those in food categories 06.8.2 (Soybean-based beverage film), 06.8.3 (Soybean curd (tofu)), 06.8.4 (Semi-dehydrated soybean curd), and 06.8.5 (Dehydrated soybean curd (kori tofu)).<sup>8, 9, 10</sup> Also includes soybean protein, such as soybean-based beverage powder, which is sold as is, for reconstitution, or as a mix containing a coagulant that can be reconstituted by the consumer for preparation of home-made soft tofu.<sup>8, 11</sup>

### **06.8.2 Soybean-based beverage film:**

Film formed on the surface of boiling soybean-based beverage that is dried. It may be deep-fried or softened in water prior to use in soups or poached food. Also known as *fuzhu* or *yuba*.<sup>11, 12, 13</sup>

### **06.8.3 Soybean curd (tofu):**

Soybean curd is prepared from dried soybeans that are soaked in water, pureed, and strained to produce soybean-based beverage, which is then made into a curd with a coagulant, ~~separated from the whey~~, and placed in a mold. ~~, and lightly pressed. When the tofu is set, it is immersed in water and cut.~~ Soybean curds may be of a variety of textures (e.g., soft, semi-firm, firm).<sup>8, 9</sup>

### **06.8.4 Semi-dehydrated soybean curd:**

Soybean curd that has been pressed while being molded into blocks so that some moisture has been removed, but so that it is not completely dried (see food category 06.8.5). Semi-dehydrated soybean curd typically contains 62% water, and has a chewy texture.<sup>8</sup>

#### **06.8.4.1 Thick gravy-stewed semi-dehydrated soybean curd:**

Partially dehydrated soybean curd that is cooked (stewed) with a thick sauce (e.g., miso sauce). The partially dehydrated soybean curd typically absorbs the sauce, and so regains its original texture.<sup>8</sup>

#### **06.8.4.2 Deep fried semi-dehydrated soybean curd:**

Partially dehydrated soybean curd that is deep-fried. It may be consumed as such, or cooked (e.g., stewed in sauce) after frying.<sup>8, 14</sup>

#### **06.8.4.3 Semi-dehydrated soybean curd, other than food categories 06.8.4.1 and 06.8.4.2:**

Partially dehydrated soybean curd prepared other than by stewing in thick (e.g., miso) sauce or by deep-frying. Includes grilled products and mashed products that may be combined with other ingredients (e.g., to make a patty or a loaf).<sup>8</sup>

### **06.8.5 Dehydrated soybean curd (kori tofu):**

Soybean curd from which all moisture has been removed through the process of freezing, aging, and dehydrating. It may be reconstituted with water or sauce for consumption, or is used directly in prepared dishes. It may also be deep-fried or simmered in sauce.<sup>8</sup>

### **06.8.6 Fermented soybeans (e.g., natto, tempe):**

The product is prepared from soybeans that have been steamed and fermented with certain fungi or bacteria (starter). The soft, whole beans have a distinctive aroma and taste. It includes products such as *dou chi* (China), *natto* (Japan), and *tempe* (Indonesia).

<sup>8</sup> *The Joy of Japanese Cooking*, K. Takahashi, Shufunomoto Col., Ltd., Japan, 1996, pp. 17-18 and 123-131.

<sup>9</sup> *Taste of Japan*, D. Richie, Kodansha International, Tokyo, Japan, 1992, pp. 34-35.

<sup>10</sup> *Ibid.*, pp.141-153.

<sup>11</sup> *World Food Japan*, Lonely Planet, 2002, p. 35.

<sup>12</sup> *Taste of Japan*, D. Richie, Kodansha International, Tokyo, Japan, 1992, pp. 168-169.

<sup>13</sup> *The Joy of Japanese Cooking*, K. Takahashi, Shufunomoto Col., Ltd., Japan, 1996, p. 31.

<sup>14</sup> *Asian Foods: Science and Technology*, C.Y.W. Ang, K.S. Liu, & Y.-W. Huang, Eds., Chapter 6: Oriental Soy Foods, K.S. Liu, Technomic Publishing Co., Lancaster PA 1999, pp. 162-163.

**06.8.7 Fermented soybean curd:**

The product is prepared by forming soybean curd into a loaf during the fermentation process. It is a soft, flavoured product, either in red, rice-yellow, or grey-green.

**06.8.8 Other soybean protein products**

Other products from soybeans composed mainly of soybean protein such as extruded, textured, concentrated, and isolated soybean protein.

**12.0 Salts, spices, soups, sauces, salads, protein products (including soybean protein products) and fermented soybean products):**

This is a broad category that includes substances added to food to enhance its aroma and taste (12.1 – Salt and salt substitutes; 12.2 – Herbs, spices, seasonings and condiments (e.g., seasoning for instant noodles) ; 12.3 – Vinegars; and 12.4 - Mustards), certain prepared foods (12.5 – Soups and broths; 12.6 – Sauces and like products; and 12.7 – Salads (e.g., macaroni salad, potato salad) and sandwich spreads, excluding cocoa- and nut-based spreads of food categories 04.2.2.5 and 05.1.3)), and products composed primarily of protein that are derived from soybeans or from other sources (e.g., milk, cereal, or vegetables) (12.9 - Soybean-based seasonings and condiments; and 12.10 – Protein products other than from soybeans), and fermented soybean products that are used as condiments (12.10 – fermented soybean products).

**12.9 Soybean-based seasonings and condiments**

Includes products that are derived from soybeans and other ingredients intended for use as seasonings and condiments, such as fermented soybean paste and soybean sauces.

**12.9.1 Fermented soybean paste (e.g., miso):**

The product is made of soybeans, salt, water, and other ingredients, using the process of fermentation. The product includes *dou jiang* (China), *doenjang* (Republic of Korea), or *miso* (Japan), which may be used in the preparation of soups or dressings, or as a seasoning.<sup>8, 15</sup>

**12.9.2 Soybean sauce:**

A liquid seasoning obtained by fermentation of soybeans, non-fermentation (e.g., hydrolysis) of soybeans, or by hydrolysis of vegetable protein.

**12.9.2.1 Fermented soybean sauce:**

A clear, non-emulsified sauce made of soybeans, cereal, salt, and water by the fermentation process.

**12.9.2.2 Non-fermented soybean sauce:**

Non-fermented soybean sauce, which is also known as non-brewed soybean sauce, may be produced from vegetable proteins, such as defatted soybeans that are acid-hydrolyzed (e.g., with hydrochloric acid), neutralized (e.g., with sodium carbonate), and filtered.<sup>16</sup>

**12.9.2.3 Other soybean sauce:**

Non-emulsified sauce made from fermented soybean sauce, with or without sugar, with or without caramelization process.

**12.9 12.10 Protein products other than from soybeans:**

Includes, for example, milk protein, cereal protein and vegetable protein analogues or substitutes for standard products, such as meat, fish or milk. Examples include: vegetable protein analogues, *fu* (a mixture of gluten (vegetable protein) and flour that is sold dried (baked) or raw, and is used as an ingredient, e.g., in miso soup), *paneer* (milk protein coagulated by the addition of citric acid from lemon or lime juice or of lactic acid from whey, that is strained into a solid mass, and is used in vegetarian versions of, e.g., hamburgers), proteinaceous meat and fish substitutes.

<sup>15</sup> *Ibid.*, pp. 173-181.

<sup>16</sup> *Ibid.*, pp. 181-187.

## **PART II: CONSEQUENTIAL REVISION OF THE ANNEX TO TABLE 3 OF THE GSFA**

13. The Annex to Table 3 of the GSFA, revised by the 38<sup>th</sup> CCFAC (ALINORM 06/29/12, Appendix VIII), was adopted by the 27<sup>th</sup> CAC at Step 8 (ALINORM 06/29/41, Appendix IV). The 39<sup>th</sup> CCFA proposed, and the 30<sup>th</sup> CAC agreed, to deletion of food category 02.2.1.2 (margarine and like products) from the Annex to Table 3 in view of the revocation of the Codex standard for margarine, which had covered products that are now included in the newly-adopted Codex standard for fat spreads and blended fat spreads (ALINORM 07/30/12 para. 71, ALINORM 07/30/REP para. 203).

14. As a result of the proposal to revise the FCS of the GSFA (Part I, above), the Annex to Table 3 of the GSFA should be amended to reflect: (i) the revision of the number and title for the food category for butter; and (ii) the newly-proposed title of food category 04.2.2.7. These revisions are shown below, with deletions in ~~strike through~~ text, and amendments in **bold** text.

### **Annex to Table 3**

#### **Food Categories or Individual Food Items Excluded from the General Conditions of Table Three**

The use of additives listed in Table Three in the following foods is governed by the provisions in Tables One and Two.

<u>Category Number</u>	<u>Food Category</u>
02.2.1- <del>1</del>	Butter <del>and concentrated butter</del>
04.2.2.7	Fermented vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweed products, excluding fermented soybean products of food category <del>12.10</del> <b>categories 06.8.6, 06.8.7, 12.9.1, 12.9.2.1 and 12.9.2.3</b>

## **PART III: CONSEQUENTIAL CHANGES TO CODEX COMMODITY STANDARDS**

15. The food additives section of the Codex Standard for Butter (CODEX STAN A-1-1971) contains a reference to the food additive provisions in food category 02.2.1.1 of the GSFA. In view of the revision of the food category number and title for butter to “02.2.1 Butter” (see Part I), the following **revision to Section 4 of the Codex standard for butter** is necessary:

### **4. FOOD ADDITIVES**

Food additives listed in Tables 1 and 2 of the Codex General Standard for Food Additives (CODEX STAN 192-1995) in Food Category 02.2.1-~~1~~ (Butter ~~and concentrated butter~~) may be used in foods subject to this standard.

## **PART IV: CONSEQUENTIAL CHANGES TO THE GSFA**

16. As a consequence of revising the sub-categories under food category 02.2 and several food categories to account for the soy-based products, the following adopted, draft (Steps 6 or 7) and proposed draft (Steps 3 or 4) food additive provisions in Tables 1 and 2 must be revised as follows:

- Adopted food additive provisions in the current food category will be revoked.
- Draft (Steps 6 or 7) and proposed draft (Steps 3 or 4) provisions in the current food category will be discontinued.

### **Food Category No. 02.2.1.2 (Margarine and like products)**

17. The following adopted provisions will be revoked.

<b>Adopted food additive provisions in food category 02.2.1.2 to be revoked</b>				
<b>Additive</b>	<b>INS</b>	<b>Max</b>	<b>Level</b>	<b>Comments</b>
Ascorbyl esters	304, 305	500	mg/kg	Note 10
Benzoates	210-213	1,000	mg/kg	Note 13
Butylated hydroxyanisole	320	200	mg/kg	Notes 15 & 130
Butylated hydroxytoluene	321	200	mg/kg	Notes 15 & 130



<b>Adopted food additive provisions in food category 02.2.1.2 to be revoked</b>				
<b>Additive</b>	<b>INS</b>	<b>Max</b>	<b>Level</b>	<b>Comments</b>
Carotenes, beta- (vegetable)	160a <sup>ii</sup>	25	mg/kg	
Diacetyltartaric and fatty acid esters of glycerol	472e	10,000	mg/kg	
EDTAs	385, 386	75	mg/kg	Note 21
Isopropyl citrates	384	200	mg/kg	
Polydimethylsiloxane	900a	10	mg/kg	
Propyl gallate	310	200	mg/kg	Notes 15 & 130
Propylene glycol esters of fatty acids	477	20,000	mg/kg	
Stearyl citrate	484	100	mg/kg	Note 15
Tertiary butylhydroquinone	319	200	mg/kg	Notes 15 & 130
Thermally oxidized soya bean oil with mono- and di-glycerides of fatty acids	479	5,000	mg/kg	
Thiodipropionates	388, 389	200	mg/kg	Note 46

18. The following proposed draft and draft provisions will be discontinued.

<b>Draft (Step 6/7) and proposed draft (Step 3/4) food additive provisions in food category 02.2.1.2 to be discontinued</b>					
<b>Additive</b>	<b>INS</b>	<b>Step</b>	<b>Max</b>	<b>Level</b>	<b>Comments</b>
Allura red AC	129	3	300	mg/kg	
Caramel III – ammonia process	150c	3	20,000	mg/kg	
Caramel IV – sulphite ammonia process	150d	3	20,000	mg/kg	
Carotenes, beta- (vegetable)	160a <sup>ii</sup>	3	1,000	mg/kg	
Carotenoids	160a <sup>i</sup> , a <sup>iii</sup> , e, f	6	1,000	mg/kg	
Carotenoids	160a <sup>i</sup> , a <sup>iii</sup> , e, f	3	25	mg/kg	
Indigotine (indigo carmine)	132	3	200	mg/kg	
Polyglycerol esters of fatty acids	475	7	5,000	mg/kg	
Sorbates	200-203	7	1,000	mg/kg	Note 42
Sorbitan esters of fatty acids	491-495	7	10,000	mg/kg	
Sucroglycerides	474	7	10,000	mg/kg	
Sucrose esters of fatty acids	473	7	10,000	mg/kg	
Sunset yellow FCF	110	6		GMP	
Tartrates	334; 335 <sup>i,ii</sup> ; 336 <sup>i,ii</sup> ; 337	7		GMP	Note 45

#### **Food Category No. 02.2.1.3 (Blends of butter and margarine)**

19. The following adopted provisions will be revoked.

<b>Adopted food additive provisions in food category 02.2.1.3 to be revoked</b>				
<b>Additive</b>	<b>INS</b>	<b>Max</b>	<b>Level</b>	<b>Comments</b>
Ascorbyl esters	304, 305	500	mg/kg	Note 10
Butylated hydroxyanisole	320	200	mg/kg	Notes 15 & 130
Butylated hydroxytoluene	321	200	mg/kg	Notes 15 & 130
Diacetyltartaric and fatty acid esters of glycerol	472e	10,000	mg/kg	
Guaiac resin	314	1,000	mg/kg	
Polysorbates	432-436	5,000	mg/kg	Note 102
Propyl gallate	310	200	mg/kg	Notes 15 & 130
Propylene glycol esters of fatty acids	477	10,000	mg/kg	Note 134
Riboflavins	101 <sup>i,ii</sup>	300	mg/kg	

<b>Adopted food additive provisions in food category 02.2.1.3 to be revoked</b>				
<b>Additive</b>	<b>INS</b>	<b>Max</b>	<b>Level</b>	<b>Comments</b>
Tertiary butylhydroquinone	319	200	mg/kg	Notes 15 & 130

20. The following proposed draft and draft provisions will be discontinued.

<b>Draft (Step 6/7) and proposed draft (Step 3/4) food additive provisions in food category 02.2.1.3 to be discontinued</b>					
<b>Additive</b>	<b>INS</b>	<b>Step</b>	<b>Max</b>	<b>Level</b>	<b>Comments</b>
Canthaxanthin	161g	6		GMP	
Caramel II - caustic sulphite process	150b	4	20,000	mg/kg	
Caramel III – ammonia process	150c	3	20,000	mg/kg	
Caramel IV – sulphite ammonia process	150d	3	20,000	mg/kg	
Carmine	120	3	500	mg/kg	
Carotenoids	160ai, aiii, e, f	6		GMP	
Chlorophylls, copper	141i,ii	6		GMP	
Curcumin	100i	7		GMP	
Phosphates	338; 339i-iii; 340i-iii; 341i-iii; 342i,ii; 343i-iii; 450i-iii,v-vii; 451i,ii; 452i-v; 542	7		GMP	Note 33
Polyglycerol esters of fatty acids	475	7	20,000	mg/kg	
Polyglycerol esters of interesterified ricinoleic acid	476	7	10,000	mg/kg	
Propylene glycol alginate	405	7	3,000	mg/kg	
Sodium diacetate	262ii	7		GMP	
Sorbates	200-203	7	1,000	mg/kg	Note 42
Sorbitan esters of fatty acids	491-495	7	20,000	mg/kg	
Stearoyl-2-lactylates	481i, 482i	7	10,000	mg/kg	
Sucroglycerides	474	7	10,000	mg/kg	
Sucrose esters of fatty acids	473	7	10,000	mg/kg	
Tartrates	334; 335i,ii; 336i,ii; 337	7		GMP	Note 45
Tocopherols	307a, b, c	7		GMP	

#### **Food Category No. 02.2.2 (Fat spreads)**

21. The current adopted, draft (Step 6 or 7), and proposed draft (Step 3 or 4) food additive provisions in food category 02.2.2 in Tables 1 and 2 of the GSFA will be maintained.

#### **Food Category No. 12.9 (Protein products)**

22. The following proposed draft provision will be discontinued.

<b>Proposed Draft (Step 4) food additive provisions in food category 12.9 to be discontinued</b>					
<b>Additive</b>	<b>INS</b>	<b>Step</b>	<b>Max</b>	<b>Level</b>	<b>Comments</b>
Zeaxanthin (synthetic)	161hi	4	100	mg/kg	

**Food Category No. 12.9.1 (Soybean protein products)**

23. The following proposed draft provisions will be discontinued.

<b>Proposed Draft (Step 3/4) food additive provisions in food category 12.9.1 to be discontinued</b>						
<b>Additive</b>	<b>INS</b>	<b>Step</b>	<b>Max</b>	<b>Level</b>	<b>Comments</b>	
Caramel II – caustic sulphite process	150b	4	10,000	mg/kg		
Caramel III – ammonia process	150c	3	10,000	mg/kg		
Caramel IV – sulphite ammonia process	150d	3	10,000	mg/kg		

**Food Category No. 12.9.1.3 (Soybean protein products)**

24. The following adopted provisions will be revoked.

<b>Adopted food additive provisions in food category 12.9.1.3 to be revoked</b>				
<b>Additive</b>	<b>INS</b>	<b>Max</b>	<b>Level</b>	<b>Comments</b>
Benzoates	210-213	1,000	mg/kg	Note 13
Polydimethylsiloxane	900a	10	mg/kg	

25. The following draft provisions will be discontinued.

<b>Draft (Step 7) food additive provisions in food category 12.9.1.3 to be discontinued</b>					
<b>Additive</b>	<b>INS</b>	<b>Step</b>	<b>Max</b>	<b>Level</b>	<b>Comments</b>
Hydroxybenzoates, p-	214, 218	7	250	mg/kg	Note 27
Sorbates	200-203	7	1,000	mg/kg	Note 42

**Food Category No. 12.9.2 (Fresh bean curd (tofu))**

26. The following proposed draft provision will be discontinued.

<b>Proposed Draft (Step 4) food additive provisions in food category 12.9.2 to be discontinued</b>					
<b>Additive</b>	<b>INS</b>	<b>Step</b>	<b>Max</b>	<b>Level</b>	<b>Comments</b>
Aluminium ammonium sulphate	523	4		GMP	Note 6

**Food Category No. 12.9.3 (Semi-dehydrated bean curd)**

27. The following proposed draft provisions will be discontinued.

<b>Proposed Draft (Step 3/4) food additive provisions in food category 12.9.3 to be discontinued</b>						
<b>Additive</b>	<b>INS</b>	<b>Step</b>	<b>Max</b>	<b>Level</b>	<b>Comments</b>	
Caramel II – caustic sulphite process	150b	4	80,000	mg/kg		
Caramel III – ammonia process	150c	3	80,000	mg/kg		
Caramel IV – sulphite ammonia process	150d	3	80,000	mg/kg		

**Food Category No. 12.9.5 (Other protein products)**

28. The following adopted provisions will be revoked.

<b>Adopted food additive provisions in food category 12.9.5 to be revoked</b>				
<b>Additive</b>	<b>INS</b>	<b>Max</b>	<b>Level</b>	<b>Comments</b>
Caramel III – ammonia process	150c		GMP	
Caramel IV – sulphite ammonia process	150d		GMP	
Carmines	120	100	mg/kg	
Carotenes, beta- (vegetable)	160a(ii)	1,000	mg/kg	
Diacetyltartaric and fatty acid esters of glycerol	472e	10,000	mg/kg	
Polysorbates	432-436	4,000	mg/kg	Note 15
Riboflavins	101i, ii	300	mg/kg	

29. The following proposed draft and draft provisions will be discontinued.

<b>Proposed Draft (Step 3/4) and Draft (Step 6/7) food additive provisions in food category 12.9.5 to be discontinued</b>					
<b>Additive</b>	<b>INS</b>	<b>Step</b>	<b>Max</b>	<b>Level</b>	<b>Comments</b>
Allura red AC	129	6	100	mg/kg	
Azorubine (carmoisine)	122	7	100	mg/kg	
Brilliant black (black PN)	151	7	100	mg/kg	
Brilliant blue FCF	133	6	100	mg/kg	
Brown HT	155	7	100	mg/kg	
Caramel II – caustic sulphite process	150b	4	100,000	mg/kg	
Caramel III – ammonia process	150c	3	100,000	mg/kg	
Caramel IV – sulphite ammonia process	150d	3	100,000	mg/kg	
Carotenoids	160ai, aiii, e, f	6	100	mg/kg	
Curcumin	100i	7	100	mg/kg	
Grape skin extract	163ii	3	500	mg/kg	
Indigotine (indigo carmine)	132	6	100	mg/kg	
Iron oxides	172i-iii	6		GMP	
Lutein from <i>Tagetes erecta</i>	161bi	4	100	mg/kg	
Nisin	234	4	200	mg/kg	Note 28
Phosphates	338; 339i-iii; 340i-iii; 341i-iii; 342i,ii; 343i-iii; 450i-iii,v-vii; 451i,ii; 452i-v; 542	7	8,800	mg/kg	Note 33
Ponceau 4R (cochineal red A)	124	6	100	mg/kg	
Quinoline yellow	104	7	100	mg/kg	
Sunset yellow FCF	110	6	200	mg/kg	
Tartrazine	102	7	100	mg/kg	

#### **Food Category No. 12.10 (Fermented soybean products)**

30. The following proposed draft provisions will be discontinued.

<b>Proposed Draft (Step 3/4) food additive provisions in food category 12.10 to be discontinued</b>					
<b>Additive</b>	<b>INS</b>	<b>Step</b>	<b>Max</b>	<b>Level</b>	<b>Comments</b>
Caramel II – caustic sulphite process	150b	4	100,000	mg/kg	
Caramel III – ammonia process	150c	3	100,000	mg/kg	
Caramel IV – sulphite ammonia process	150d	3	100,000	mg/kg	

#### **Food Category No. 12.10.2 (Fermented soybean curd (soybean cheese))**

31. The following proposed draft provision will be discontinued.

<b>Proposed Draft (Step 4) food additive provisions in food category 12.10.2 to be discontinued</b>					
<b>Additive</b>	<b>INS</b>	<b>Step</b>	<b>Max</b>	<b>Level</b>	<b>Comments</b>
Aluminium ammonium sulphate	523	4		GMP	Note 6

**Food Category No. 12.10.3 (Fermented soybean paste (e.g., miso))**

32. The following proposed draft and draft provisions will be discontinued.

<b>Proposed Draft (Step 3/4) and Draft (Step 6/7) food additive provisions in food category 12.10.3 to be discontinued</b>					
<b>Additive</b>	<b>INS</b>	<b>Step</b>	<b>Max</b>	<b>Level</b>	<b>Comments</b>
Aluminium ammonium sulphate	523	4		GMP	Note 6
Carotenes, beta- (vegetable)	160aii	6		GMP	
Saccharin (and Na, K, Ca salts)	954	3	200	mg/kg	
Sorbates	200-203	7	1,000	mg/kg	Note 42

**Notes to the Food Category Tables**

- Note 6** : As aluminium.
- Note 10** : As ascorbyl stearate.
- Note 13** : As benzoic acid.
- Note 15** : Fat or oil basis.
- Note 21** : As anhydrous calcium disodium EDTA.
- Note 27** : As p-hydroxybenzoic acid.
- Note 28** : ADI conversion: if a typical preparation contains 0.025 µg/U, then the ADI of 33,000 U/kg bw becomes:  $[(33000 \text{ U/kg bw}) \times (0.025 \text{ µg/U}) \times (1 \text{ mg}/1000 \text{ µg})] = 0.825 \text{ mg/kg bw}$
- Note 33** : As phosphorus.
- Note 42** : As sorbic acid
- Note 45** : As tartaric acid.
- Note 46** : As thiodipropionic acid.
- Note 102** : For use in fat emulsions for baking purposes only.
- Note 130** : Singly or in combination: Butylated Hydroxyanisole (BHA, INS 320), Butylated Hydroxytoluene (BHT, INS 321), Tertiary Butylated Hydroquinone (TBHQ, INS 319), and Propyl Gallate (INS 310).
- Note 134** : For baking purposes only.

**RECOMMENDATIONS**

- i) The CCFA should endorse the proposed revisions to the food category titles and descriptors for food category 02.2 *et seq.* and the consequential revisions (revocation and discontinuation) to the food additive provisions in Tables 1 and 2, the revision of the Annex to Table 3, and the revision of the Food Additive section of the Codex Standard for Butter.
- ii) The CCFA should endorse the proposed revisions to the food category titles and descriptors for food category 04.2.2.7, 06.8 *et seq.* and 12.0 *et seq.* and the consequential revisions (revocation and discontinuation) to the food additive provisions in Tables 1 and 2, and the revision of the Annex to Table 3.