



**Food and Agriculture  
Organization of  
the United Nations**



**World Health  
Organization**

Viale delle Terme di Caracalla, 00153 Rome, Italy - Tel: (+39) 06 57051 - Fax: (+39) 06 5705 4593 - E-mail: codex@fao.org - www.codexalimentarius.net

**Agenda Item 5(a)**

**CX/FA 11/43/7**

**November 2010**

## JOINT FAO/WHO FOOD STANDARDS PROGRAMME

### CODEX COMMITTEE ON FOOD ADDITIVES

#### Forty-third Session

**Xiamen (Fujian Province), China, 14-18 March 2011**

### DRAFT AND PROPOSED DRAFT FOOD ADDITIVE PROVISIONS OF THE GSFA

(Prepared by the Codex Secretariat)

## BACKGROUND

The present document compiles the proposals included in document CX/FA 10/42/5 that were not considered by the 42<sup>nd</sup> CCFA<sup>1</sup>. These proposals will be considered by the physical Working Group on the GSFA, established by the 42<sup>nd</sup> CCFA, taking into consideration written comments submitted at the 42<sup>nd</sup> CCFA<sup>2</sup>.

### *Please Note*

The following changes have been made to the proposals included in the original document to reflect decisions of a horizontal nature made at the 42<sup>nd</sup> CCFA.

- Note 180 (Expressed as beta-carotene), which is associated with the provisions for carotenoids (INS 160a(i, iii), 160e, 160f) and for carotenes, beta-, (vegetable) (INS 160a(ii)), has been deleted from those provisions<sup>3</sup>;
- Note CC (Expressed as beta-carotene) has been deleted from the provision for carotenoids (INS 160a(i, iii), 160e, 160f) in food category 09.2.4.3, as it had the same text as the deleted Note 180;
- Sucralose (INS 955) was revised to sucralose (trichlorogalactosucrose); and
- The text of Note 119 (see footnote 12) was amended to correct an error.

To help the reader, the text of all of the Notes that appear in the tables has been moved to the end of the document (before the Appendix).

## PART I – COLOUR ADDITIVES

### GENERAL CONSIDERATIONS

1. Outstanding recommendations for provisions for the use of colour additives include the following:

INS	Food additive	INS	Food Additive
124	Ponceau 4R (Cochineal Red A)	160a (i, iii), 160e, 160f	Carotenoids
129	Allura red AC	160a (ii)	<i>beta</i> -Carotenes, vegetable
133	Brilliant blue FCF	161 (g)	Canthaxanthin
150 (c)	Caramel III – ammonia process	163 (ii)	Grape Skin Extract
150 (d)	Caramel IV – ammonia sulfite process	172 (i, ii, iii)	Iron Oxides

2. The outstanding recommendations on the provisions in *Part I – Colour Additives* of this document were developed based on comments submitted by participants of the eWGs of the 40<sup>th</sup> and 41<sup>st</sup> CCFA as well

<sup>1</sup> ALINORM 10/33/12, para. 105

<sup>2</sup> CX/FA 10/42/5 Add.1 Part I and part II, CX/FA 10/42/5 Add.3; CRD 8; CRD 18

<sup>3</sup> ALINORM 10/33/12, para. 61

as comments submitted directly to the CCFA by CCFA Members and Observers (CRD 9 of the 40<sup>th</sup> CCFA, CXFA 08/40/05 Add 1, Add 2, and CRD 9 of the 41<sup>st</sup> CCFA).

3. The 38<sup>th</sup> CCFAC agreed that the eWG should take a “horizontal” approach to its discussion of the GSFA provisions for colour additives. The eWG reached general consensus on a positive list of food categories in which the use of one or more colour additives is technologically justified (see Appendix). These food categories are highlighted in grey in the tables below.

#### PONCEAU 4R (INS 124)

4. The 26<sup>th</sup> JECFA (1982) assigned an ADI of 4 mg/kg bw/d for ponceau 4R.

<b>Ponceau 4R (cochineal red A), INS 124</b>						
The following provision was included in the GSFA at Step 3 by the 41 <sup>st</sup> CCFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification/Comment
06.8.1	Soybean-based beverages	50	mg/kg		3	Proposed maximum use level necessary to function as a colour

#### ALLURA RED AC (INS 129)

5. The 25<sup>th</sup> JECFA (1981) assigned an ADI of 7 mg/kg bw/d for allura red AC.

<b>Recommendation 1 - Allura Red AC, INS 129</b>						
The eWG for the 40 <sup>th</sup> CCFA recommended the <u>adoption</u> of the following food additive provision for allura red AC in the GSFA ; however, the 41 <sup>st</sup> CCFA agreed to hold decisions on food additive provisions in food category 16.0 until the Committee clarifies the need for this category.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification/Comment provided to eWG
16.0	Composite foods - foods that could not be placed in categories 01 - 15	300	mg/kg		6	<b>Justification</b> Potentially used for complex foods

#### BRILLIANT BLUE FCF (INS 133)

6. The 13<sup>th</sup> JECFA (1969) assigned an ADI of 12.5 mg/kg bw/d for brilliant blue FCF.

<b>Recommendation 1 – Brilliant Blue FCF, INS 133</b>						
The eWG for the 40 <sup>th</sup> CCFA recommended further discussion of the following food additive provision for brilliant blue FCF in the GSFA; however, the 41 <sup>st</sup> CCFA agreed to hold decisions on food additive provisions in food category 16.0 until the Committee clarifies the need for this category..						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification/Comment
16.0	Composite foods - foods that could not be placed in categories 01 - 15	100	mg/kg	Note 2	6	<b>Justifications</b> 1) Used to colour bean-paste; maximum levels achieve the intended technological need 2) If provisions are proposed for category 16, the products must be fully defined and the additive uses restricted to these products. In the vast majority of cases products can be covered by other food categories or as composite products (and therefore subject to carry over provisions) <b>Comment</b> Justification should be provided why the carry over wouldn't be sufficient

#### CARAMEL III — AMMONIA PROCESS (INS 150(c))

7. The 29<sup>th</sup> JECFA (1985) assigned an ADI of 200 mg/kg bw/d for caramel III – ammonia process.

8. The 41<sup>st</sup> CCFA agreed to hold any decision on food additive provisions in food category 16.0 until the Committee clarifies the need for this food category (ALINORM 09/32/12, para 86).

9. The following are the outstanding recommendations for caramel III – ammonia process from the report of the eWG to the 40<sup>th</sup> CCFA.

<b>Recommendation 1 - Caramel III – Ammonia Process, INS 150c</b>						
The eWG of the 40 <sup>th</sup> CCFA recommended <u>further discussion</u> of the following food additive provisions for caramel III – ammonia process in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification/Comment
05.0	Confectionery	50000	mg/kg		3	<b>Justification</b> Recommendation for broader food category 5.0 will have
05.1.3	Cocoa-based spreads, including fillings		GMP		Adopted	

<b>Recommendation 1 - Caramel III – Ammonia Process, INS 150c</b>						
The eWG of the 40 <sup>th</sup> CCFA recommended <b>further discussion</b> of the following food additive provisions for caramel III – ammonia process in the GSFA.						
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>Step</b>	<b>Justification/Comment</b>
05.2	Confectionery including hard and soft candy, nougat, etc. other than food categories 05.1, 05.3 and 05.4		GMP		Adopted	consequential effects on adopted provisions in subcategories 05.1.3, 05.2, 05.3, and 05.4
05.3	Chewing gum	20000	mg/kg		Adopted	<b>1)</b> There are no non-standardized foods in subcategory 05.1.1 <b>2)</b> The relevant commodity standards (CX STAN 105 (Codex Standards for Cocoa powders and dry mixtures of cocoa and sugar) & CX STAN 141 (Codex Standard for cocoa mass (cocoa/chocolate liquor) and cocoa cake)) do not contain any provisions for the use of colours. <b>3)</b> Used to colour rice biscuits and biscuits. <b>4)</b> To provide colour (other colours are permitted) <b>5)</b> To improve organoleptic properties of food <b>6)</b> Caramel colour is one of the most widely used colourants in foods. It is used in soft drinks, baked goods, candy, ice cream, gravies and meats to impart a brown colour. See recommendation for food category 05.0; revise accordingly
05.4	Decorations (e.g., for fine bakery wares), toppings (non-fruit) and sweet sauces		GMP		Adopted	
16.0	Composite foods - foods that could not be placed in categories 01 - 15	20000	mg/kg		<b>3</b>	<b>Justification</b> Consequential effects on adopted provision for food category 16.0, currently adopted at ML of 1000 mg/kg.
16.0	Composite foods - foods that could not be placed in categories 01 - 15		GMP		Adopted	<b>1)</b> Used to colour bean-paste. <b>2)</b> To improve organoleptic properties of food. <b>3)</b> maximum levels are enough to achieve the intended technological need ) <b>Comment</b> <b>1)</b> Technological need is questioned. Justification should be provided why the carry over wouldn't be sufficient. <b>2)</b> If provisions are proposed for category 16, the products must be fully defined and the additive uses restricted to these products. In the vast majority of cases products can be covered by other food categories or as composite products (and therefore subject to carry over provisions)

<b>Caramel III – Ammonia Process, INS 150(c)</b>						
The following provisions were included in the GSFA at Step 3 by the 41 <sup>st</sup> CCFA.						
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>Step</b>	<b>Justification/Comment</b>
12.9.2.1	Fermented soybean sauce	20000	mg/kg		3	To colour the products to adjust the tones of the products
12.9.2.2	Non-fermented soybean sauce	1500	mg/kg		3	Proposed use level to function as colour
12.9.2.3	Other soybean sauce	7500	mg/kg		3	Proposed use level to function as colour

**CAMEL IV — SULPHITE AMMONIA PROCESS (INS 150(d))**

10. The 29<sup>th</sup> JECFA (1985) assigned an ADI of 200 mg/kg bw/d for caramel IV – sulphite ammonia process.

11. The following are the outstanding recommendations for caramel IV – sulphite ammonia process from the report of the eWG to the 40<sup>th</sup> CCFA:

<b>Recommendation 1 – Caramel IV – Ammonia Sulphite Process, INS 150(d)</b>						
The eWG of the 40 <sup>th</sup> CCFA recommended the <b>discontinuation</b> of further work on the following food additive provision for caramel IV – sulphite ammonia process in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification provided to eWG
14.2	Alcoholic beverages, including alcohol-free and low-alcoholic counterparts	50000	mg/kg		3	<b>Justification</b> <b>1)</b> Currently used in distilled spirits and other alcoholic beverages <b>2)</b> Prevents batch variation in colour <b>3)</b> Protects flavour profile (e.g. 14.2.1) of beverages in clear glass.  See comment supporting revision of adopted provisions in subcategories 14.2.1, 14.2.3.3., 14.2.6, and 14.2.7 from ML of GMP to ML of 50 000 mg/kg

<b>Recommendation 2 - Caramel IV – Ammonia Sulphite Process, INS 150(d)</b>						
The eWG of the 40 <sup>th</sup> CCFA recommended the <b>adoption</b> of the following food additive provisions for caramel IV – sulphite ammonia process in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification/Comment
01.1.2	Dairy-based drinks, flavoured and/or fermented (e.g., chocolate milk, cocoa, eggnog, drinking yoghurt, whey-based drinks)	50000	mg/kg	Note 52 <sup>4</sup>	3	<b>Justification</b> Consequential effect is to revoke adopted provision 01.1.2 at 150 mg/kg
01.1.2	Dairy-based drinks, flavoured and/or fermented (e.g., chocolate milk, cocoa, eggnog, drinking yoghurt, whey-based drinks)	150	mg/kg	Note 52	Adopted	
01.6.1	Unripened cheese	50000	mg/kg		3	<b>Justification</b> Consequential effect is to revoke adopted provision 01.6.1 Revision: Provides numeric ML to replace adopted GMP limit <b>1)</b> These colours may be used to provide a distinguishing colour to various speciality cheeses eg fruit cheese. These permissions should be retained in the GSFA <b>2)</b> Used for unripened cheeses, <b>3)</b> These colours may be used to provide a distinguishing colour to various speciality cheeses eg fruit cheese
01.6.1	Unripened cheese		GMP		Adopted	
01.6.2	Ripened cheese	50000	mg/kg		3	<b>Justification</b> Consequential effect is to revoke adopted provision in subcategory 01.6.2.2 Revision: Provides numeric ML to replace adopted GMP limit <b>1)</b> These colours may be used to provide a distinguishing colour to various speciality cheeses eg fruit cheese. These permissions should be retained in the GSFA <b>2)</b> Used to colour the surface of smoked, ripened cheeses. <b>3)</b> These colours may be used to provide a distinguishing colour to various speciality cheeses eg fruit cheese
01.6.2.2	Rind of ripened cheese		GMP		Adopted	

<sup>4</sup> **Note 52:** Excluding chocolate milk.

<b>Recommendation 2 - Caramel IV – Ammonia Sulphite Process, INS 150(d)</b>						
The eWG of the 40 <sup>th</sup> CCFA recommended the <b>adoption</b> of the following food additive provisions for caramel IV – sulphite ammonia process in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification/Comment
						<b>Comment:</b> Too broad of a food category.
01.6.4	Processed cheese	50000	mg/kg		3	<b>Justification</b> Consequential effect is to revoke adopted provision 01.6.4 and s to discontinue provisions in subcategories 01.6.4.1 and 01.6.4.2 <b>1)</b> These colours may be used to provide a distinguishing colour to various specialty cheeses eg fruit cheese. These permissions should be retained in the GSFA <b>2)</b> Used for coloured cheese spreads. <b>3)</b> These colours may be used to provide a distinguishing colour to various speciality cheeses eg fruit cheese
01.6.4	Processed cheese	100	mg/kg		Adopted	
01.6.4.1	Plain processed cheese		GMP		6	
01.6.4.2	Flavoured processed cheese, including containing fruit, vegetables, meat, etc.	100	mg/kg	Notes 5 & 72	6	
01.6.5	Cheese analogues	50000	mg/kg		3	<b>Justification</b> Consequential effect is to revoke adopted provision 01.6.5 Revision: Provides numeric ML to replace adopted GMP limit <b>1)</b> These colours may be used to provide a distinguishing colour to various specialty cheeses eg fruit cheese. These permissions should be retained in the GSFA <b>2)</b> Used to colour imitation cheese. <b>3)</b> These colours may be used to provide a distinguishing colour to various speciality cheeses eg fruit cheese
01.6.5	Cheese analogues		GMP		Adopted	
01.7	Dairy-based desserts (e.g., pudding, fruit or flavoured yoghurt)	50000	mg/kg		3	<b>Justification</b> Consequential effect is to revoke adopted provision 01.7 at 2000 mg/kg
01.7	Dairy-based desserts (e.g., pudding, fruit or flavoured yoghurt)	2000	mg/kg		Adopted	
03.0	Edible ices, including sherbet and sorbet	30000	mg/kg		3	<b>Justification</b> Consequential effect is to revoke adopted provision 03.0 at 1000 mg/kg
03.0	Edible ices, including sherbet and sorbet	1000	mg/kg		Adopted	
04.1.2	Processed fruit	80000	mg/kg	<b>Note 161</b>	3	<b>Justification</b> Consequential effect is to revoke adopted provisions in subcategories 04.1.2.3, 04.1.2.4, 04.1.2.5, 04.1.2.6, 04.1.2.7, 04.1.2.8, 04.1.2.9, and 04.1.2.11 <b>1)</b> Used to colour processed fruit; <b>2)</b> Maximum levels are enough to achieve the intended technological need <b>Comment</b> 04.1.2.5 - STAN 79 limits caramel colours to 200 mg/kg singly or in combo
04.1.2.3	Fruit in vinegar, oil, or brine		GMP		Adopted	
04.1.2.4	Canned or bottled (pasteurized) fruit		GMP		Adopted	
04.1.2.5	Jams, jellies, marmelades	1500	mg/kg		Adopted	
04.1.2.6	Fruit-based spreads (e.g., chutney) excluding products of food category 04.1.2.5	500	mg/kg		Adopted	
04.1.2.7	Candied fruit		GMP		Adopted	
04.1.2.8	Fruit preparations, including pulp, purees, fruit toppings and coconut milk	7500	mg/kg		Adopted	
04.1.2.9	Fruit-based desserts, incl. fruit-flavoured water-based desserts		GMP		Adopted	
04.1.2.11	Fruit fillings for pastries	7500	mg/kg		Adopted	
05.1.2	Cocoa mixes (syrups)	<b>50000</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		6	<b>Justification</b> <b>1)</b> Used to colour cocoa mixes (syrups); <b>2)</b> Maximum levels are enough to achieve the intended technological need ) <b>3)</b> Consistent with proposed use levels in other food categories; current use level of 5000 mg/kg in some cocoa mixes (syrups) in the US.

<b>Recommendation 2 - Caramel IV – Ammonia Sulphite Process, INS 150(d)</b>						
The eWG of the 40 <sup>th</sup> CCFA recommended the <b>adoption</b> of the following food additive provisions for caramel IV – sulphite ammonia process in the GSFA.						
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>Step</b>	<b>Justification/Comment</b>
05.1.3	Cocoa-based spreads, including fillings	<b>50000</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note 161</b>		<b>Justification</b> Consequential effect is to revoke adopted provision 05.1.3 Revision: provides numeric ML to replace adopted GMP limit.
05.1.3	Cocoa-based spreads, including fillings		GMP		Adopted	<b>1)</b> Used to colour cocoa-based spreads; <b>2)</b> Maximum levels are enough to achieve the intended technological need <b>3)</b> Consistent with proposed use levels in other food categories; current use level of 2000 to 5000 mg/kg in some fillings for chocolates in the US.
05.1.4	Cocoa and chocolate products	<b>50000</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Note 183	6	<b>Justification</b> Revision: provides numeric ML to replace GMP limit <b>1)</b> Used to colour cocoa, chocolates <b>2)</b> To improve organoleptic properties of food <b>3)</b> maximum levels are enough to achieve the intended technological need <b>4)</b> Consistent with proposed levels in other food categories. <b>5)</b> Caramel IV is approved for use in candies within Food Category 5.2 (Hard and Soft Candy, Marzipan and Nougat) at GMP levels. The candies within Category 5.2 fall into category 5.1.4 when they are covered with chocolate. Therefore the use levels for categories 5.1.4 and 5.2 should be considered at the same time. <b>6)</b> Caramel IV use in candies including liquorice can be 10,000 mg/kg <b>Comments:</b> <b>1)</b> Use may mislead consumer. <b>2)</b> Inconsistencies between non-standardized chocolate product among 05.1.4 & 05.2, 05.4 - recommends CCFA ensure provisions for use of colour additive in non-standardized chocolate products are consistent with approach for use of colours in other confections without compromising colour limitations in Codex Standard for Chocolate and chocolate products. <b>3)</b> Request that no actions be taken to limit level of colours in 5.1.4 or create disparity with 5.2 but also do not effect chocolate meeting Codex Standard 87.
05.1.5	Imitation chocolate, chocolate substitute products	<b>50000</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		6	<b>Justification</b> Revision: provides numeric ML to replace GMP limit
06.3	Breakfast cereals, including rolled oats	50000	mg/kg	<b>Note AA</b>	3	<b>Justification</b> Consequential effect is to revoke adopted provision 06.3 at 2500 mg/kg
06.3	Breakfast cereals, including rolled oats	2500	mg/kg		Adopted	
06.4.2	Dried pastas and noodles and like products	50000	mg/kg		3	<b>Justification</b> <b>1)</b> Consistency with the adoption of caramel class III for the same food category

<b>Recommendation 2 - Caramel IV – Ammonia Sulphite Process, INS 150(d)</b>						
The eWG of the 40 <sup>th</sup> CCFA recommended the <b>adoption</b> of the following food additive provisions for caramel IV – sulphite ammonia process in the GSFA.						
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>Step</b>	<b>Justification/Comment</b>
						<b>2)</b> Used to colour Chinese noodle <b>3)</b> maximum levels are enough to achieve the intended technological need
06.4.3	Pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products	50000	mg/kg	Note 153	3	<b>Justification</b> Consistent with the Codex Standard for instant noodles (CX STAN 249)
06.5	Cereal and starch based desserts (e.g., rice pudding, tapioca pudding)	50000	mg/kg		3	<b>Justification</b> Consequential effect is to revoke adopted provision 06.5 Revision provides numeric ML to replace adopted GMP limit
06.5	Cereal and starch based desserts (e.g., rice pudding, tapioca pudding)		GMP		Adopted	
06.6	Batters (e.g., for breading or batters for fish or poultry)	50000	mg/kg		3	
06.7	Pre-cooked or processed rice products, including rice cakes (Oriental type only)	50000	mg/kg		3	
07.1.4	Bread-type products, including bread stuffing and bread crumbs	50000	mg/kg	<b>Note 161</b>	3	<b>Justification</b> <b>1)</b> Consistency with the adoption of caramel class III for the same food category <b>2)</b> Used to colour croutons <b>3)</b> Maximum levels are enough to achieve the intended technological need
07.1.5	Steamed breads and buns	50000	mg/kg	<b>Note 161</b>	3	<b>Justification</b> Consistency with the adoption of caramel class III for the same food category
07.1.6	Mixes for breads and ordinary bakery wares	50000	mg/kg	<b>Note 161</b>	3	<b>Justification</b> To improve organoleptic properties of food
07.2	Fine bakery wares (sweet, salty, savoury) and mixes	50000	mg/kg	<b>Note 161</b>	3	<b>Justification</b> Consequential effect is to discontinue provision in subcategory 07.2.2 and to revoke adopted provisions 07.2.1 and 07.2.3
07.2.1	Cakes, cookies and pies (e.g., fruit-filled or custard types)		GMP		Adopted	
07.2.2	Other fine bakery products (e.g., doughnuts, sweet rolls, scones, and muffins)	1200	mg/kg		Adopted	
07.2.3	Mixes for fine bakery wares (e.g., cakes, pancakes)		GMP		Adopted	
11.4	Other sugars and syrups (e.g., xylose, maple syrup, sugar toppings)	50000	mg/kg		3	<b>Justification</b> <b>1)</b> Used to colour toppings for cakes <b>2)</b> Maximum levels are enough to achieve the intended technological need
12.3	Vinegars	100000	mg/kg		3	<b>Justification</b> Consequential effect is to revoke adopted provision 12.3 Provides numeric ML to replace adopted GMP limit
12.3	Vinegars		GMP		Adopted	
12.4	Mustards	100000	mg/kg		3	<b>Justification</b> Consequential effect is to revoke adopted provision 12.4 Provides numeric ML to replace adopted GMP limit
12.4	Mustards		GMP		Adopted	
12.5	Soups and broths	100000	mg/kg		3	<b>Justification</b> Consequential effect is to revoke adopted provisions in subcategories 12.5.1 and 12.5.2
12.5.1	Ready-to-eat soups and broths, including canned, bottled, and frozen	3000	mg/kg		Adopted	
12.5.2	Mixes for soups and broths		GMP		Adopted	
12.6	Sauces and like products	100000	mg/kg		3	<b>Justification</b> Consequential effect is to revoke adopted provision 12.6 at 1500 mg/kg
12.6	Sauces and like products	1500	mg/kg		Adopted	
12.7	Salads (e.g., macaroni salad, potato salad) and sandwich	100000	mg/kg		3	<b>Justification</b> Consequential effect is to revoke

<b>Recommendation 2 - Caramel IV – Ammonia Sulphite Process, INS 150(d)</b>						
The eWG of the 40 <sup>th</sup> CCFA recommended the <b>adoption</b> of the following food additive provisions for caramel IV – sulphite ammonia process in the GSFA.						
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>Step</b>	<b>Justification/Comment</b>
	spreads excluding cocoa- and nut-based spreads of food categories 04.2.2.5 and 05.1.3					adopted provision 12.7 Provides numeric ML to replace adopted GMP limit
12.7	Salads (e.g., macaroni salad, potato salad) and sandwich spreads excluding cocoa- and nut-based spreads of food categories 04.2.2.5 and 05.1.3		GMP		Adopted	
14.1.2.2	Vegetable juice	50000	mg/kg		3	<b>Justification</b> 1) Used to colour vegetable juice 2) Maximum levels are enough to achieve the intended technological need <b>Comments:</b> No technological need/justification. These are similar to fruit juice, in which colours are not justified
14.1.2.4	Concentrates for vegetable juice	50000	mg/kg		3	<b>Justification</b> 1) Used to colour concentrates for vegetable juice 2) Maximum levels are enough to achieve the intended technological need <b>Comments:</b> No technological need/justification. These are similar to fruit juice, in which colours are not justified
14.1.3.2	Vegetable nectar	50000	mg/kg		3	<b>Justification</b> Consequential effect is to revoke adopted provision 14.1.3.2 to replace adopted GMP limit
14.1.3.2	Vegetable nectar		GMP		Adopted	1) Used to colour vegetable nectar 2) Maximum levels are enough to achieve the intended technological need <b>Comment</b> Discontinue on basis of no technological need/justification. These are similar to fruit nectars, in which colours are not justified
14.1.3.4	Concentrates for vegetable nectar	50000	mg/kg		3	<b>Justification</b> Consequential effect is to revoke adopted provision 14.1.3.4
14.1.3.4	Concentrates for vegetable nectar		GMP		Adopted	Provides numeric ML to replace adopted GMP limit 1) Colouring for concentrates for vegetable nectar 2) Maximum levels are enough to achieve the intended technological need <b>Comment:</b> No technological need/justification. These are similar to fruit nectars, in which colours are not justified
14.2.1	Beer and malt beverages	<b>50,000</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>			<b>Justification</b> Consequential effect is to revoke adopted provision 14.2.1
14.2.1	Beer and malt beverages		GMP		Adopted	Revise adopted maximum level of GMP to 50,000 mg/kg <b>Comment:</b> recommend adopt at 50 000 mg/kg in subcategories 14.2.1, 14.2.3.3, 14.2.6, and 14.2.7
14.2.3.3	Fortified grape wine, grape liquor wine, and sweet grape wine	<b>50,000</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>			<b>Justification</b> Consequential effect is to revoke adopted provision 14.2.3.3
14.2.3.3	Fortified grape wine, grape liquor wine, and sweet grape		GMP		Adopted	Revise adopted maximum level of GMP to 50,000 mg/kg



<b>Recommendation 2 - Caramel IV – Ammonia Sulphite Process, INS 150(d)</b>						
The eWG of the 40 <sup>th</sup> CCFA recommended the <u>adoption</u> of the following food additive provisions for caramel IV – sulphite ammonia process in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification/Comment
	wine					
14.2.6	Distilled spirituous beverages containing more than 15% alcohol	50,000	mg/kg			<b>Justification</b> Consequential effect is to revoke adopted provision 14.2.6
14.2.6	Distilled spirituous beverages containing more than 15% alcohol		GMP		Adopted	Revise adopted maximum level of GMP to 50,000 mg/kg
16.0	Composite foods - foods that could not be placed in categories 01 - 15	20000	mg/kg		3	<b>Justification</b> Consequential effect is to revoke adopted provision 16.0 at 1000 mg/kg
16.0	Composite foods - foods that could not be placed in categories 01 - 15		GMP		Adopted	<b>1)</b> Used to colour bean-pastes <b>2)</b> To improve organoleptic properties of food

<b>Recommendation 3 - Caramel IV – Ammonia Sulphite Process, INS 150(d)</b>						
The eWG of the 40 <sup>th</sup> CCFA recommended <u>further discussion</u> of the following food additive provisions for caramel IV – sulphite ammonia process in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification/Comment
05.0	Confectionery	50000	mg/kg		3	<b>Justification</b> <b>1)</b> No non-standardized foods in sub-category 05.1.1 <b>2)</b> There are no provisions for colours in Codex Standards for Cocoa powders and dry mixtures of cocoa and sugar (Std. 105-1981, rev. 1-2001) or in the Codex Standard for cocoa mass (cocoa/chocolate liquor) and cocoa cake (Std. 141-1983, rev. 1-2001).
11.6	Table-top sweeteners, including those containing high-intensity sweeteners	50000	mg/kg		3	<b>Justification</b> <b>1)</b> The technological need is questioned. <b>2)</b> Caramel colour, class IV, is stable in acidic conditions and thus is well suited for applications in table-top sweeteners, for consumer appealing colouring. The maximum use level as listed (50000 mg/kg) is adequate. It is requested to maintain this entry for cat. 11.6. <b>3)</b> there isn't a consumer expectation to have this product coloured <b>4)</b> there is a suggestion to add a subcategory for flavoured table-top sweeteners, which could be coloured
14.1.5	Coffee, coffee substitutes, tea, herbal infusions, and other hot cereal and grain beverages, excluding cocoa	100000	mg/kg	Note 160	3	<b>Justification</b> <b>1)</b> Used to colour coffee-like drinks <b>2)</b> Maximum levels are enough to achieve the intended technological need <b>3)</b> Suggestion that caramel IV should not be allowed in all foods in food category. Suggested Notes: - Note 142 and excluding herbal infusions - Excluding tea, coffee, and coffee substitutes - Note 160

<b>Caramel IV – Ammonia Sulphite Process, INS 150(d)</b>						
The following provisions were included in the GSFA at Step 3 by the 41 <sup>st</sup> CCFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification /Comment
02.2.2	Fat spreads, dairy fat spreads and blended spreads	500	mg/kg		3	Consistent with Codex Standards for Dairy Fat Spreads (Codex Stan 253-2006) and Fat Spreads and Blended Spreads (Codex Stan 256-2006)
12.9.2.1	Fermented soybean sauce	20000	mg/kg		3	To colour the products to adjust the tones of the products

**CAROTENOIDS ((INS 160a(i), 160a(iii), 160e, 160f)**

12. The 18<sup>th</sup> JECFA (1974) assigned a group ADI of 5 mg/kg bw/d for  $\beta$ -Apo-8-carotenal (160e), synthetic  $\beta$ -Carotene (160ai), and  $\beta$ -Apo-8-carotenoic acid, methyl or ethyl ester (160f). The 57<sup>th</sup> JECFA (2001) assigned  $\beta$ -Carotene from *Blakeslea trispora* (160a(ii)) to the group ADI for synthetic  $\beta$ -carotenes. These substances are collectively referred to in the GSFA as carotenoids.

13. The following are the outstanding recommendations for carotenoids from the report of the eWG to the 40<sup>th</sup> CCFA.

<b>Recommendation 1 - Carotenoids, INS 160a(i), 160a(iii), 160e, 160f</b>						
The eWG of the 40 <sup>th</sup> CCFA recommended <b>adoption</b> of the following food additive provisions for carotenoids in the GSFA.						
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>Step</b>	<b>Justification/Comment</b>
01.3.2	Beverage whiteners	<b>100</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note 180</b>	3	<b>Justification</b> 1) Permitted in food category 1.5.2 - milk and cream powder analogues so provision in this food category should be retained. 2) <i>Carotenes, Natural Extracts, (Vegetable) 160a(ii)</i> are already permitted at 1000 mg/kg since 2005. Other carotenes perform the same function and should be listed at the same level in the GSFA. 3) Emulsified colour preparations are used in beverages. 4) Permitted in food category 1.5.2 - milk and cream powder analogues so provision in this food category should be retained and provides appropriate colour to the food. 5) <i>Carotenes, Natural Extracts, (Vegetable) 160a(ii)</i> are already permitted at 1000 mg/kg since 2005. Other carotenes perform the same function and should be listed at the same level in the GSFA
01.4	Cream (plain) and the like	<b>20</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note 180</b>	3	<b>Justification</b> 1) Carotenoids are routinely used as colorant in 1.4.2 - cream products and 1.4.4 - cream analogues as a preferred alternative to artificial colouring agents. Continuation of this provision is strongly supported. 2) Colour for cream. 3) Carotenoids are routinely used as colourant in 1.4.2 - cream products and 1.4.4 - cream analogues as a preferred alternative to artificial colouring agents in order to standardise the colour of these products 4) Colours are used to standardise the colour.
01.5.2	Milk and cream powder analogues	<b>100</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note 180</b>	3	<b>Justification</b> Colours are used to standardise the colour
01.6.1	Unripened cheese	<b>100</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note 180</b>	6	<b>Justification</b> 1) Colours are used to standardise the colour 2) Standardized cheeses subject to this category provide for the use of carotenoids

<b>Recommendation 1 - Carotenoids, INS 160a(i), 160a(iii), 160e, 160f</b>						
The eWG of the 40 <sup>th</sup> CCFA recommended <b>adoption</b> of the following food additive provisions for carotenoids in the GSFA.						
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>Step</b>	<b>Justification/Comment</b>
02.1.2	Vegetable oils and fats	250	mg/kg	<b>Note 180</b>	6	<b>Justification</b> 1) Used for vegetable oils and fats in Japan, Korea, Singapore, Malaysia and others. 2) ML expressed on beta-carotene level should be 250 mg/kg
02.1.3	Lard, tallow, fish oil, and other animal fats	250	mg/kg	<b>Note 180</b>	6	<b>Justification</b> 1) Used to colour edible lard; maximum levels are enough to achieve the intended technological need. 2) Potentially by using the fat emulsion colour preparation. 3) CX Stan 19 contains already provisions for colours and GSFA adopted provisions in this category. <b>Comment</b> Support for level of 250 mg/kg
05.1.2	Cocoa mixes (syrops)	100	mg/kg	<b>Note 180</b>	6	<b>Justification</b> 1) Potentially used in cocoa mixtures 2) Colour supports the various flavour and types of products. <b>Comment:</b> doesn't support, mislead consumer
07.1.1	Breads and rolls	35	mg/kg	<b>Note 161 &amp; 180</b>	6	<b>Justification</b> 1) Used to colour bread; maximum levels are enough to achieve the intended technological need. 2) Colour the speciality breads e.g. carrot containing bread. 3) Already adopted provision for colour in this category in the GSFA. <b>Comment:</b> Technological need questioned
07.1.3	Other ordinary bakery products (e.g., bagels, pita, English muffins)	1000	mg/kg	<b>Note 161</b>	3	<b>Justification</b> 1) Used to colour brown sugar breads; maximum levels are enough to achieve the intended technological need. 2) Used to colour lemon/orange flavoured sugar breads. 3) To improve organoleptic properties of food. 4) 100 mg/kg as beta-carotene is needed to achieve the colour <b>Comment:</b> Technological need questioned
07.1.4	Bread-type products, including bread stuffing and bread crumbs	1000	mg/kg	Notes 116 & 161	3	<b>Justification</b> 1) Used to colour croutons; maximum levels are enough to achieve the intended technological need. 2) 200 mg/kg as beta-carotene is needed to achieve the colour <b>Comment:</b> Technological need questioned

<b>Recommendation 1 - Carotenoids, INS 160a(i), 160a(iii), 160e, 160f</b>						
The eWG of the 40 <sup>th</sup> CCFA recommended <b>adoption</b> of the following food additive provisions for carotenoids in the GSFA.						
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>Step</b>	<b>Justification/Comment</b>
07.1.5	Steamed breads and buns	1000	mg/kg	<b>Note 161</b>	3	<b>Justification</b> 1) Used to colour brown sugar steamed breads; maximum levels are enough to achieve the intended technological need). 2) Used to colour lemon/orange flavoured sugar breads 3) 100 mg/kg as beta-carotene is needed to achieve the colour <b>Comment:</b> Technological need questioned
07.1.6	Mixes for breads and ordinary bakery wares	<b>1000</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note 161</b>	6	<b>Justification</b> 1) Used to colour hot cake (pancake) mix; maximum levels are enough to achieve the intended technological need). 2) Used to colour cake mixes e.g. lemon cake. 3) To improve organoleptic properties of food. 4) Allowed in lots of countries like Philippines, India, Korea and others. 5) The amount needed for this colouration is 1000 mg/kg <b>Comment:</b> Technological need questioned
09.1.1	Fresh fish	300	mg/kg	<b>Notes 4, 16, &amp; 50</b>	6	<b>Comment:</b> Colours in fresh foods might be used as adulterants, mislead consumer
09.2	Processed fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	<b>100</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Notes 95 &amp; 180</b>	3	<b>Justification</b> Consequential effect is to discontinue provisions in subcategories 09.2.1, 09.2.2, 09.2.4.1, 09.2.4.2, and 09.2.5 <b>Comment:</b> Revise 09.2.4.1, add Note 95
09.2.1	Frozen fish, fish fillets, and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	500	mg/kg	Note 95	6	
09.2.2	Frozen battered fish, fish fillets, and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	100	mg/kg	Note 41	6	
09.2.4.1	Cooked fish and fish products	500	mg/kg		6	
09.2.4.2	Cooked mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	250	mg/kg		6	
09.2.5	Smoked, dried, fermented, and/or salted fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	500	mg/kg	Note 22	6	
09.3	Semi-preserved fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	<b>100</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Notes 95 &amp; 180</b>	3	
09.3.3	Salmon substitutes, caviar, and other fish roe products	500	mg/kg		6	
09.3.4	Semi-preserved fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms (e.g., fish paste), excluding products of food categories 09.3.1 - 09.3.3	500	mg/kg		6	
10.1	Fresh eggs	1000	mg/kg	Note 4	3	<b>Comment:</b> Colours in fresh foods might be used as adulterants, mislead consumer
10.2	Egg products	1000	mg/kg		3	<b>Justification</b> Used for egg products
14.1.3.2	Vegetable nectar	100	mg/kg	<b>Note 180</b>	6	<b>Justification</b>

<b>Recommendation 1 - Carotenoids, INS 160a(i), 160a(iii), 160e, 160f</b>						
The eWG of the 40 <sup>th</sup> CCFA recommended <b>adoption</b> of the following food additive provisions for carotenoids in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification/Comment
						Used for vegetable nectars <b>Comments:</b> No technological need / justification. These are similar to fruit nectars, in which colours are not justified
14.1.3.4	Concentrates for vegetable nectar	100	mg/kg	<b>Notes 127 &amp; 180</b>	6	<b>Justification</b> Used for vegetable nectar concentrates <b>Comments:</b> No technological need/justification. These are similar to fruit nectars, in which colours are not justified

<b>Recommendation 2 - Carotenoids, INS 160a(i), 160a(iii), 160e, 160f</b>						
The eWG of the 40 <sup>th</sup> CCFA recommended <b>further discussion</b> of the following food additive provisions for carotenoids in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification provided to eWG
08.1.2	Fresh meat, poultry, and game, comminuted	100	mg/kg	Notes 4, 16, & 117	6	<b>Justification</b> <b>1)</b> Used to make the colour uniform raw meat for utilized in processed products of the categories 08.1.2, 08.2 and 08.3, such as hamburger, meat balls, fresh sausage, and pâtés. Therefore, the Notes 4 and 16 should not be applied to these products. <b>2)</b> Adopted provisions for other colours
16.0	Composite foods - foods that could not be placed in categories 01 - 15	500	mg/kg		6	<b>Justification</b> <b>1)</b> Used to colour bean-paste; maximum levels are enough to achieve the intended technological need. <b>2)</b> Used for complex foods which are not covered by the other categories. <b>3)</b> Colour used to improve the organoleptic properties of food <b>4)</b> If provisions are proposed for category 16, the products must be fully defined and the additive uses restricted to these products. In the vast majority of cases products can be covered by other food categories or as composite products (and therefore subject to carry over provisions).

<b>Carotenoids, INS 160a(i), 160a(iii), 160e, 160f</b>						
The 41 <sup>st</sup> CCFA agreed to <b>circulate for comments at Step 3</b> the following food additive provisions for carotenoids in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification/Comment
08.4	Edible casings (e.g., sausage casings)	100	mg/kg	<b>Note 180</b>	3	<b>Justification</b> <b>1)</b> Used to colour casings; maximum levels are enough to achieve the intended technological need. <b>2)</b> Colour for giving pleasant palatable appearance. <b>3)</b> For use in glaze, coatings or decorations for fruit, vegetables, meat or fish (Note 16). <b>4)</b> 100 mg/kg as beta-carotene is needed to achieve the colour
09.1.2	Fresh mollusks, crustaceans and echinoderms	100	mg/kg	Notes 4 & 16 & <b>180</b>	3	<b>Justification</b> <b>1)</b> Coloration purpose. <b>2)</b> Already adopted provisions for colours in the GSFA <b>Comment:</b> <b>1)</b> Colours in fresh foods might be used as adulterants, mislead consumer <b>2)</b> Support for 100 mg/kg as beta-carotene
09.2.4.3	Fried fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	100	mg/kg		3	The eWG recommends adoption of a maximum level of 100 mg/kg in food category 09.2 with Notes 95 and <del>CC</del> .
11.4	Other sugars and syrups (e.g., xylose, maple syrup, sugar toppings)	50	mg/kg	<b>Note 180</b>	3	<b>Justification</b> <b>1)</b> Used for topping syrups; maximum levels are enough to achieve the intended technological need. <b>2)</b> Used for colouring syrups. <b>3)</b> supports max

<b>Carotenoids, INS 160a(i), 160a(iii), 160e, 160f</b>						
The 41 <sup>st</sup> CCFA agreed to <b>circulate for comments at Step 3</b> the following food additive provisions for carotenoids in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification/Comment
						use of 50 mg/kg beta-carotene, same as for Carotenes vegetable which is already permitted 11.4
11.6	Table-top sweeteners, including those containing high-intensity sweeteners	300	mg/kg		3	<b>Justification</b> 1) Used table sweeteners; maximum levels are enough to achieve the intended technological need). 2) Appealing colour to consumers when used in home cooking and baking
14.2.1	Beer and malt beverages	200	mg/kg	<b>Note 180</b>	3	<b>Justification</b> 1) To colour the alcoholic beverages. 2) Vegetable carotenes have adopted provision at 600 mg/kg in this category. <b>Comment</b> Support for max use of 200 mg/kg as beta-carotene

### CAROTENES, BETA (VEGETABLE) (INS 160a(ii))

14. The 41<sup>st</sup> JECFA (1993) determined vegetable carotenes to be acceptable for use as a colour, provided the level of use does not exceed the level normally found in vegetables.

15. The following are the outstanding recommendations for vegetable carotenes from the report of the eWG to the 40<sup>th</sup> CCFA.

<b>Recommendation 1 - Carotenes, Beta-, (Vegetable), INS 160a(ii)</b>						
The eWG of the 40 <sup>th</sup> CCFA recommended <b>adoption</b> of the following food additive provisions for vegetable beta-carotenes in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification/Comment
04.1.1.2	Surface-treated fresh fruit		GMP	Notes 4 & 16	6	<b>Comment:</b> Colours in fresh foods might be used as adulterants, mislead consumer
04.1.2.8	Fruit preparations, including pulp, purees, fruit toppings and coconut milk	100	mg/kg	<b>Notes 180 &amp; 182</b>	6	<b>Comment:</b> Use may mislead consumer
04.2.2.2	Dried vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds	200	mg/kg		3	<b>Justification</b> 1) Used to colour sunflower seeds; levels are enough to achieve the intended technological need. 2) Fruits and vegetables discolour during processing and storage. Therefore use as restoration of colour which was destroyed during heat processing. 3) CX Stan 79 and 80 contains provisions for colours and GSFA adopted provisions in this category. <b>Comment:</b> Only in dried potato granules and flakes as other uses may mislead consumer
04.2.2.3	Vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and seaweeds in vinegar, oil, brine, or soy sauce	1320	mg/kg		3	<b>Justification</b> 1) Used to colour pickles; levels are enough to achieve the intended technological need 2) Restoration of colour which was destroyed during production; 3) To provide colour ; 4) Potentially used for e.g. root stalks; 5) To improve organoleptic properties of food. 50 mg/kg as beta-carotene is needed to achieve the colour <b>Comment:</b> Use may mislead consumer

<b>Recommendation 1 - Carotenes, Beta-, (Vegetable), INS 160a(ii)</b>						
The eWG of the 40 <sup>th</sup> CCFA recommended <b>adoption</b> of the following food additive provisions for vegetable beta-carotenes in the GSFA.						
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>Step</b>	<b>Justification/Comment</b>
04.2.2.4	Canned or bottled (pasteurized) or retort pouch vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds	200	mg/kg		3	<b>Justification</b> <b>1)</b> Used to colour pulses and legumes; levels are enough to achieve the intended technological need <b>2)</b> Restoration of colour which was destroyed during production.; <b>3)</b> To provide colour - CX Stan 55, 58, 81 and 115 contains provisions for colours and GSFA has adopted provisions in this category; <b>4)</b> Potentially used for e.g. root stalks; and <b>5)</b> To improve organoleptic properties of food. 50 mg/kg as beta-carotene is needed to achieve the colour <b>Comment:</b> Use may mislead consumer
05.1.3	Cocoa-based spreads, including fillings	100	mg/kg	<del>Note 180</del>	3	<b>Comment:</b> Use may mislead consumer
05.1.4	Cocoa and chocolate products	100	mg/kg	<del>Notes 180 &amp; 183</del>	6	Adopt 100 mg/kg with Note 180 <b>Comments:</b> <b>1)</b> Use may mislead consumer. <b>2)</b> Inconsistencies between non-standardized chocolate product between 05.1.4 & 05.2, 05.4 - recommends CCFA ensure provisions for use of colour additive in non-standardized chocolate products are consistent with approach for use of colours in other confections without compromising colour limitations in Codex Standard for Chocolate and chocolate products. <b>3)</b> Request that no actions be taken to limit level of colours in 5.1.4 or create disparity with 5.2 but also do not effect chocolate meeting Codex Standard 87.
05.1.4	Cocoa and chocolate products	1000	mg/kg	Note 183	3	
06.4.2	Dried pastas and noodles and like products	1000	mg/kg		3	<b>Justification</b> <b>1)</b> The use of other colours, as caramel class III, is being adopted in this food category <b>2)</b> Used to colour Chinese noodle; levels are enough to achieve the intended technological need) <b>3)</b> Beta-carotene provides colour and supports the various flavour and types of products.
07.1.6	Mixes for breads and ordinary bakery wares	100	mg/kg	<del>Note 180</del>	3	<b>Justification</b> <b>1)</b> Used to colour hot cake (pancake) mix; levels are enough to achieve the intended technological need <b>2)</b> Used to colour cake mixes e.g. lemon cake; <b>3)</b> To improve organoleptic properties of food; <b>4)</b> Allowed in lots of countries like Philippines, India, Korea and others

<b>Recommendation 1 - Carotenes, Beta-, (Vegetable), INS 160a(ii)</b>						
The eWG of the 40 <sup>th</sup> CCFA recommended <b>adoption</b> of the following food additive provisions for vegetable beta-carotenes in the GSFA.						
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>Step</b>	<b>Justification/Comment</b>
						<b>5)</b> Used for innovative biscuit products
12.2	Herbs, spices, seasonings, and condiments (e.g., seasoning for instant noodles)	500	mg/kg		3	<b>Justification</b> Adopt in subcategory 12.2.2 only.
<b>12.2.2</b>	<b>Seasoning and condiments</b>	<b>500</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>			Consequential effect is to discontinue provision in broader food category 12.2
14.1.2.2	Vegetable juice	2000	mg/kg		3	<b>Justification</b> <b>1)</b> Potentially used as a colour for vegetable juice. <b>2)</b> To improve organoleptic properties of food, preferred to synthetic colorants <b>Comments:</b> No technological need/justification. These are similar to fruit juices, in which colours are not justified
14.1.2.4	Concentrates for vegetable juice	2000	mg/kg	<b>Note 127</b>	3	<b>Justification</b> <b>1)</b> Potentially used as a colour for vegetable <b>2)</b> To improve organoleptic properties of food, preferred to synthetic colourants <b>Comments:</b> No technological need / justification. These are similar to fruit juices, in which colours are not justified
14.1.3.2	Vegetable nectar	<b>100</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note 180</b>	3	<b>Justification</b> <b>1)</b> Used for vegetable nectars; levels are enough to achieve the intended technological need) <b>2)</b> Vegetables discolour during processing and storage. Therefore use as restoration of colour which was destroyed during heat processing. <b>Comments:</b> No technological need / justification. These are similar to fruit nectars, in which colours are not justified
14.1.3.4	Concentrates for vegetable nectar	<b>100</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Notes 127 &amp; 180</b>	3	<b>Justification</b> <b>1)</b> Used for concentrates for vegetable nectars; levels are enough to achieve the intended technological need) <b>2)</b> Vegetables discolour during processing and storage. Therefore use as restoration of colour which was destroyed during heat processing. <b>Comments:</b> No technological need / justification. These are similar to fruit nectars, in which colours are not justified
15.2	Processed nuts, including covered nuts and nut mixtures (with e.g., dried fruit)	20000	mg/kg		3	<b>Justification</b> Colour to coat <b>Comment:</b> tech need for high ML requested
16.0	Composite foods - foods that could not be placed in categories 01 - 15	1000	mg/kg		3	<b>Justification</b> Used for complex foods.



<b>Recommendation 2 – Carotenes, Beta-, (Vegetable), INS 160a(ii)</b>						
The eWG of the 40 <sup>th</sup> CCFA recommended <b>further discussion</b> of the following food additive provisions for vegetable beta-carotenes in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification/Comments
08.1.2	Fresh meat, poultry, and game, comminuted	20	mg/kg	Notes 4, 16 & 117	6	<b>Justification</b> 1) Used to uniform the colour of raw meat utilized in processed products of the categories 08.1.2, 08.2 and 08.3, such as hamburger, meat balls, fresh sausage, and pâtés. Therefore, the Notes 4 and 16 should not be applied to these products. 2) Suggestion to increase level to 100 mg/kg colouring substance as for carotenoids <b>Comment</b> 1) Support for inclusion of Notes 4 and 16; 2) Support for exclusion of Notes 4 and 16

<b>Carotenes, Beta-, (Vegetable), INS 160a(ii)</b>						
The 41 <sup>st</sup> CCFA agreed to <b>circulate for comment at Step 3</b> the following food additive provisions for vegetable beta-carotene in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification
01.4.4	Cream analogues	20	mg/kg	Note 180	3	<b>Justification</b> 1) Used to colour cream-like products; levels are enough to achieve the intended technological need 2) Cream substitute are consisting of a vegetable fat-water emulsion that are coloured. Colours are used to standardise the colour. A wide range of colours is equally justified and should be equally permitted. 3) Expressed as beta-carotene.
05.1.2	Cocoa mixes (syrops)	100	mg/kg	Note 180	3	<b>Justification</b> 1) Used to colour cocoa mixes (syrops); levels are enough to achieve the intended technological need <b>Comment:</b> Technological need questioned, mislead consumer

### CANTHAXANTHIN (INS 161G)

16. The 28<sup>th</sup> CAC has adopted one provision for the use of canthaxanthin in the GSFA.

17. The JECFA (1995) assigned an ADI of 0.03 mg/kg bw/d for canthaxanthin.

18. The 30<sup>th</sup> CCFAC requested that JECFA perform intake estimates for canthaxanthin based on the pending levels of maximum use in the GSFA and national food consumption data. The 53<sup>rd</sup> JECFA (1999) evaluated national intake assessments of canthaxanthin, which were based on data on poundage (disappearance), model diets, and individual dietary records. Intake estimates based on national regulatory or measured data, and combined with mean food intakes, did not exceed the ADI of 0-0.03 mg/kg bw. JECFA noted that the estimates of intake based on the assumption that canthaxanthin is used directly in all foods at the maximum levels proposed in the draft GSFA greatly exceed the ADI; however, JECFA also recognized that indirect exposure to canthaxanthin from its use as a colourant in animal feeds is the major source of canthaxanthin in food. Taking into account the conservative nature of the estimate using draft maximum GSFA levels as well as the knowledge that the draft GSFA proposed much broader use in food than occurs in countries in which canthaxanthin is used, JECFA concluded that use of canthaxanthin will not result in long-term intake that exceeds the ADI.

19. The following are the outstanding recommendations of the report of the eWG to the 40<sup>th</sup> CCFA.

<b>Recommendation 1 -- Canthaxanthin, INS 161g</b>						
The eWG to the 40 <sup>th</sup> CCFA recommended the <b>adoption</b> of the following food additive provisions for canthaxanthin in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification/Comments
01.1.2	Dairy-based drinks, flavoured and/or fermented (e.g., chocolate milk, cocoa, eggnog, drinking yoghurt, whey-based drinks)	15	mg/kg	Note 52	6	
01.6.1	Unripened cheese	15	mg/kg		6	
01.6.2	Ripened cheese	15	mg/kg		6	
01.6.4	Processed cheese	15	mg/kg		6	

<b>Recommendation 1 -- Canthaxanthin, INS 161g</b>						
The eWG to the 40 <sup>th</sup> CCFA recommended the <b>adoption</b> of the following food additive provisions for canthaxanthin in the GSFA.						
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>Step</b>	<b>Justification/Comments</b>
01.6.5	Cheese analogues	15	mg/kg		6	
01.7	Dairy-based desserts (e.g., pudding, fruit or flavoured yoghurt)	15	mg/kg		6	
02.2.2	Emulsions containing less than 80% fat	15	mg/kg		6	
02.3	Fat emulsions mainly of type oil-in-water, including mixed and/or flavoured products based on fat emulsions	15	mg/kg		6	
02.4	Fat-based desserts excluding dairy-based dessert products of food category 01.7	15	mg/kg		6	
04.1.2.5	Jams, jellies and marmelades	200	mg/kg		6	
04.1.2.6	Fruit-based spreads (e.g., chutney) excluding products of food category 04.1.2.5	15	mg/kg		6	
04.1.2.9	Fruit-based desserts, including fruit-flavoured water-based desserts	15	mg/kg		6	
04.1.2.11	Fruit fillings for pastries	15	mg/kg		6	
04.2.2.2	Dried vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds	10	mg/kg		6	
05.2	Confectionery including hard and soft candy, nougat, etc. other than food categories 05.1, 05.3 and 05.4	15	mg/kg		6	
05.4	Decorations (e.g., for fine bakery wares), toppings (non-fruit) and sweet sauces	15	mg/kg		6	
06.3	Breakfast cereals, including rolled oats	15	mg/kg		6	Adopt 15 mg/kg
06.3	Breakfast cereals, including rolled oats	50	mg/kg		3	
06.4.2	Dried pastas and noodles and like products	15	mg/kg		6	<b>Justification</b> Used in foods in category 06.4.2
06.4.3	Pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products	15	mg/kg	Note 153	6	
06.5	Cereal and starch based desserts (e.g., rice pudding, tapioca pudding)	15	mg/kg		6	
07.0	Bakery wares	15	mg/kg		6	
08.3.1.1	Cured (including salted) non-heat treated processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	100	mg/kg	Note 118		
09.2.1	Frozen fish, fish fillets, and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	35	mg/kg	<b>Note 95</b>	6	
09.2.4.1	Cooked fish and fish products	100	mg/kg		6	<b>Justification</b> Needed to correct / improve / enhance the colour of tomato based sauce used in products that will not affect the fish-meat colour in a high temperature process
09.2.5	Smoked, dried, fermented, and/or salted fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	15	mg/kg	Note 22	6	
09.3.3	Salmon substitutes, caviar, and other fish roe products	15	mg/kg		6	
09.4	Fully preserved, including canned or fermented fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	15	mg/kg		6	
10.4	Egg-based desserts (e.g., custard)	15	mg/kg		6	
11.3	Sugar solutions and syrups, also (partially) inverted, including treacle and molasses, excluding products of food category 11.1.3	15	mg/kg		6	<b>Comment:</b> No technological need. Such use is already permitted in 11.4
11.4	Other sugars and syrups (e.g., xylose, maple syrup, sugar toppings)	15	mg/kg		6	
12.2.2	Seasonings and condiments	20	mg/kg		6	
12.5.2	Mixes for soups and broths	30	mg/kg	<b>Note 127</b>	6	
12.6	Sauces and like products	100	mg/kg		6	
14.1.4.2	Non-carbonated water-based flavoured drinks, including punches and ades	5	mg/kg		6	<b>Justification</b> Canthaxanthin is in limited use in some juice drinks since it provides a different shade in the spectrum yellow-orange-red that is

<b>Recommendation 1 -- Canthaxanthin, INS 161g</b>						
The eWG to the 40 <sup>th</sup> CCFA recommended the <b>adoption</b> of the following food additive provisions for canthaxanthin in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification/Comments
						usually quite different from other carotenes. We believe that 5 mg/kg represents the current use levels in some juice drinks
14.1.4.3	Concentrates (liquid or solid) for water-based flavoured drinks	5	mg/kg	Note 127	6	<b>Justification</b> 1) Colour to improve organoleptic properties of food 2) Max limit in Brazil, Argentina, Uruguay and Paraguay legislation is 35 mg/kg. Used to stabilize nature identical colour
14.2.6	Distilled spirituous beverages containing more than 15% alcohol	5	mg/kg		6	<b>Justification</b> Stable colourant for alcoholic beverages
14.2.7	Aromatized alcoholic beverages (e.g., beer, wine and spirituous cooler-type beverages, low alcoholic refreshers)	5	mg/kg		3	
15.1	Snacks - potato, cereal, flour or starch based (from roots and tubers, pulses and legumes)	45	mg/kg		6	<b>Justification</b> Stable, nature-identical colour
16.0	Composite foods - foods that could not be placed in categories 01 - 15	80	mg/kg	Note 2	6	

<b>Recommendation 2 — Canthaxanthin, INS 161g</b>						
The eWG of the 40 <sup>th</sup> CCFA recommended <b>further discussion</b> of the following food additive provision for canthaxanthin in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification /Comments
05.3	Chewing gum	15	mg/kg		6	<b>Justification</b> 1) Canthaxanthin, as per other food colours used in chewing gum, belongs to a wide range of colouring agents which allow to adapt the colour to the best taste of consumer 2) Canthaxanthin is not used in a wide range of chewing gum products. Therefore, it is not consumed by a wide range of the population. Assuming a maximum level of use of 30 mg/kg, and a consumption of 3g per day and that during chewing 100% of the contained canthaxanthin is ingested; it would correspond to only 5% of the ADI. 3) Canthaxanthin is assigned a very low ADI and is only permitted for use in french sausage in EC.

### GRAPE SKIN EXTRACT (INS 163(ii))

20. The 26<sup>th</sup> JECFA (1982) assigned an ADI of 2.5 mg/kg bw/d for grape skin extract.

21. The following are the outstanding recommendations of the report of the eWG to the 40<sup>th</sup> CCFA.

<b>Recommendation 1 – Grape Skin Extracts, INS 163(ii)</b>						
The eWG of the 40 <sup>th</sup> CCFA recommended <b>discontinuation</b> of further work on the following food additive provisions for grape skin extracts in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max	Level	Comments	Step	Justification/Comment
01.6.1	Unripened cheese	1000	mg/kg		3	<b>Justification</b> No Technological Justification

<b>Recommendation 2 - Grape Skin Extracts, INS 163(ii)</b>						
The eWG of the 40 <sup>th</sup> CCFA recommended <b>adoption</b> of the following food additive provisions for grape skin extracts in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification/Comments
01.4	Cream (plain) and the like	1500	mg/kg		3	<b>Justification</b> Adopt in subcategory 01.4.4 only. Consequential effect is to discontinue provision in broader food category 01.4 1) Colours are used to standardize the colour 2) Used to colour cream-like
01.4.4	Cream analogues	150	mg/kg	Note 181		

<b>Recommendation 2 - Grape Skin Extracts, INS 163(ii)</b>						
The eWG of the 40 <sup>th</sup> CCFA recommended <b>adoption</b> of the following food additive provisions for grape skin extracts in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification/Comments
						products; maximum level is enough to achieve the technological need <b>3)</b> Use in cream/milk substitutes consisting of a vegetable fat-water emulsion that are coloured. <b>6)</b> Already adopted colours for this category. <b>Comment:</b> <b>1)</b> Doesn't support in either 01.4 or subcategory 01.4.4; mislead consumer, tech need questioned. <b>2)</b> Supports maximum use of 150 mg/kg pigment which is needed.
01.5.2	Milk and cream powder analogues	150	mg/kg	Note 181	3	<b>Justification</b> <b>1)</b> Used as a colour for milk-like products e.g. strawberry milk; maximum level is enough to achieve the technological need <b>2)</b> Use in Cream/milk substitutes consisting of a vegetable fat-water emulsion that are coloured. <b>3)</b> Colours are used to standardize the colour. <b>4)</b> Already adopted colours for this category. <b>Comment:</b> Use may mislead consumer, technological need questioned
03.0	Edible ices, including sherbet and sorbet	1000	mg/kg		3	Adopt 100 mg/kg with Note 181 <b>Justification</b>
03.0	Edible ices, including sherbet and sorbet	100	mg/kg	Note 181	6	<b>1)</b> To provide colour (other colours are permitted) <b>2)</b> Used for sherbets <b>3)</b> 200 mg/kg pigment is needed to support the various flavour and types of products. A wide range of colours is equally justified and should be equally permitted <b>Comment:</b> ML high, child of 15 kg bw exceed ADI by consuming 37.5 g of edible ice
04.1.1.2	Surface-treated fresh fruit		GMP	Notes 4 & 16	6	<b>Comment:</b> Colours in fresh foods might be used as adulterants, mislead consumer
04.1.2.4	Canned or bottled (pasteurized) fruit	1500	mg/kg		3	<b>Justification</b> <b>1)</b> Used to colour bottled fruit; maximum level is enough to achieve the technological need) <b>2)</b> Fruits discolour during processing and storage. Therefore use as restoration of colour which was destroyed during heat processing.
04.1.2.8	Fruit preparations, including pulp, purees, fruit toppings and coconut milk	500	mg/kg	Notes 181 & 182	3	<b>Justification</b> 500 mg/kg pigment is needed to support the various flavour and types of products. A wide range of colours is equally justified and should be equally permitted <b>Comment:</b> Use may mislead consumer
04.2.2.3	Vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and seaweeds in vinegar, oil, brine, or soy sauce	100	mg/kg	Note 181	6	<b>Justification</b> To provide colour (other colours are permitted) <b>Comment:</b> Use may mislead consumer
04.2.2.5	Vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed purees and spreads (e.g., peanut butter)	100	mg/kg	Note 181	3	<b>Justification</b> <b>1)</b> Used for vegetable purees. <b>2)</b> To provide colour (other colours are permitted) <b>3)</b> To improve organoleptic properties of food <b>Comment:</b>

<b>Recommendation 2 - Grape Skin Extracts, INS 163(ii)</b>						
The eWG of the 40 <sup>th</sup> CCFA recommended <b>adoption</b> of the following food additive provisions for grape skin extracts in the GSFA.						
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>Step</b>	<b>Justification/Comments</b>
						Use may mislead consumer
04.2.2.6	Vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed pulps and preparations (e.g., vegetable desserts and sauces, candied vegetables) other than food category 04.2.2.5	100	mg/kg	Notes 92 & 181	3	<b>Justification</b> 1) Used in vegetable origin desserts and sweet pickled vegetables. 2) To provide colour (other colours are permitted) 3) To improve organoleptic properties of food <b>Comment:</b> Excluding tomato-based sauces
05.2	Confectionery including hard and soft candy, nougat, etc. other than food categories 05.1, 05.3 and 05.4	500	mg/kg	Note 181	3	<b>Justification</b> Colour supports the various flavour and types of products. A wide range of colours is equally justified and should be equally permitted.
06.5	Cereal and starch based desserts (e.g., rice pudding, tapioca pudding)	200	mg/kg	Note 181	3	<b>Comment:</b> ADI may be exceeded
07.0	Bakery wares	1500	mg/kg		3	<b>Justification</b>
07.1.2	Crackers, excluding sweet crackers	200	mg/kg	Note 181	3	Adopt in subcategories 07.1.2 and 07.1.4 only.
07.1.4	Bread-type products, including bread stuffing and bread crumbs	200	mg/kg	Note 181	3	Consequential effect is to discontinue provision in broader food category 07.0 1) Bakery products using coloured grapes are sold; maximum level is enough to achieve the technological need) 2) Colours required for to identify flavour. <b>07.1.2 –</b> 1) Used for cracker products; maximum level is enough to achieve the technological need. 2) Colours required for to identify flavour. To provide colour. 3) 200 mg/kg pigment is needed <b>07.1.4 –</b> 1) Used to colour croutons; maximum level is enough to achieve the technological need. 2) Colours required to identify flavour. 3) 200 mg/kg pigment is needed <b>Comment:</b> discontinue 07.0, 07.1.2, and 07.1.4, intake consideration, could exceed ADI
08.1.1	Fresh meat, poultry, and game, whole pieces or cuts	5000	mg/kg	Notes 4 & 16	3	<b>Justification</b> Food category in which use of one or more colours is justified <b>Comment:</b> 1) ML seems high 2) Colours in fresh foods might be used as adulterants, mislead consumer
08.2	Processed meat, poultry, and game products in whole pieces or cuts	5000	mg/kg		3	<b>Justification</b> 1) To provide colour (other colours are permitted) 2) To improve organoleptic properties of food <b>Comment:</b> Add Note 16
08.3.1.1	Cured (including salted) non-heat treated processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	5000	mg/kg		3	<b>Justification</b> 1) To provide colour (other colours are permitted) 2) To improve organoleptic properties of food <b>Comment:</b> Add Note 16
08.3.1.2	Cured (including salted) and dried non-heat treated processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	5000	mg/kg	Note 16	3	<b>Justification</b> Colour required to give a pleasant palatable appearance to a product <b>Comment:</b> Add Note 16

<b>Recommendation 2 - Grape Skin Extracts, INS 163(ii)</b>						
The eWG of the 40 <sup>th</sup> CCFA recommended <b>adoption</b> of the following food additive provisions for grape skin extracts in the GSFA.						
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>Step</b>	<b>Justification/Comments</b>
08.3.1.3	Fermented non-heat treated processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	5000	mg/kg	Note 16	3	<b>Justification</b> Colour required to give a pleasant palatable appearance to a product <b>Comment:</b> Add Note 16
08.3.2	Heat-treated processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	5000	mg/kg	Note 16	3	<b>Justification</b> Colour required to give a pleasant palatable appearance to a product <b>Comment:</b> Add Note 16
08.3.3	Frozen processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	5000	mg/kg	Note 16	3	<b>Justification</b> Colour required to give a pleasant palatable appearance to a product <b>Comment:</b> Add Note 16
09.2.2	Frozen battered fish, fish fillets, and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	500	mg/kg	<b>Note 16</b>	3	<b>Justification</b> Potentially used for fish products <b>Comment:</b> Use may mislead consumer
14.1.3.2	Vegetable nectar	1500	mg/kg		3	<b>Justification</b> <b>1)</b> Used for vegetable nectars; maximum level is enough to achieve the technological need <b>2)</b> Vegetables discolour during processing and storage. Therefore use as restoration of colour which was destroyed during heat processing. <b>3)</b> Support for max use of 150 mg/kg pigment which is needed <b>4)</b> If the use is safe and the product is labelled in a truthful and non-misleading manner, this is sufficient to ensure consumer protection. 5) The US has established safe conditions of use for grape skin extract in still and carbonated drinks and ades, beverage bases, and alcoholic beverages. <b>Comment:</b> No technological need
14.1.3.4	concentrates for vegetable nectar	1500	mg/kg	<b>Note 127</b>	3	<b>Justification</b> <b>1)</b> Used for vegetable nectar concentrates; maximum level is enough to achieve the technological need. <b>2)</b> Vegetables discolour during processing and storage. Therefore use as restoration of colour which was destroyed during heat processing. <b>3)</b> Support for max use of 150 mg/kg pigment which is needed <b>4)</b> If the use is safe and the product is labelled in a truthful and non-misleading manner, this is sufficient to ensure consumer protection. The US has established safe conditions of use for grape skin extract in still and carbonated drinks and ades, beverage bases, and alcoholic beverages. <b>Comment:</b> No technological need
14.2.1	Beer and malt beverages	<b>300</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note 181</b>	3	
14.2.3.2	Sparkling and semi-sparkling grape wines	1500	mg/kg		3	<b>Justification</b> <b>1)</b> Used for sparkling grape wines; maximum level is enough to achieve the technological need); <b>2)</b> Colour is used to provide colour. <b>3)</b> support for max use of 300 mg/kg pigment which is needed); <b>4)</b> If the use is safe and the product

<b>Recommendation 2 - Grape Skin Extracts, INS 163(ii)</b>						
The eWG of the 40 <sup>th</sup> CCFA recommended <u>adoption</u> of the following food additive provisions for grape skin extracts in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification/Comments
						<p>is labeled in a truthful and non-misleading manner, this is sufficient to ensure consumer protection. The US has established safe conditions of use for grape skin extract in still and carbonated drinks and ades, beverage bases, and alcoholic beverages.</p> <p><b>5)</b> In the OIV standard on Oenological Practices, no colours may be used in grape wines (category 14.2.3). Their inclusion in these categories does not seem technologically justified and could mislead consumers. If we consider the proposal listed in CL 2007/28-FA (page14), grape skin extract is considered as an enocyanin, only referenced by the INS number (INS 163ii). Nevertheless, in the wine making process, the grape skin extract is permitted for tannin effect purposes, but not as a colouring agent.</p>
14.2.3.3	Fortified grape wine, grape liquor wine, and sweet grape wine	1500	mg/kg		3	<p><b>Justification</b></p> <p><b>1)</b> Used for sweet grape wine; maximum level is enough to achieve the technological need</p> <p><b>2)</b> Support for max use of 300 mg/kg pigment which is needed);</p> <p><b>3)</b> If the use is safe and the product is labelled in a truthful and non-misleading manner, this is sufficient to ensure consumer protection. The US has established safe conditions of use for grape skin extract in still and carbonated drinks and ades, beverage bases, and alcoholic beverages.</p> <p><b>4)</b> In the OIV standard on Oenological Practices, no colours may be used in grape wines (category 14.2.3). Their inclusion in these categories does not seem technologically justified and could mislead consumers. If we consider the proposal listed in CL 2007/28-FA (page14), grape skin extract is considered as an enocyanin, only referenced by the INS number (INS 163ii). Nevertheless, in the wine making process, the grape skin extract is permitted for tannin effect purposes, but not as a colouring agent.</p>

<b>Recommendation 3 - Grape Skin Extracts, INS 163(ii)</b>						
The eWG of the 40 <sup>th</sup> CCFA recommended <u>further discussion</u> of the following food additive provisions for grape skin extract in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification/Comments
04.1.2.7	Candied fruit	1500	mg/kg		3	<p><b>Comment</b></p> <p>ML 1500 mg/kg seems high – consumption by children might exceed ADI</p>
09.2.4.2	Cooked mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	1000	mg/kg		3	<p><b>Comment</b></p> <p>1) ML 1000 mg/kg seems high – consumption by children might exceed</p> <p>2) Technological need for high ML questioned, (child of 15 kg would exceed ADI by consuming 37 g of</p>

<b>Recommendation 3 - Grape Skin Extracts, INS 163(ii)</b>						
The eWG of the 40 <sup>th</sup> CCFA recommended <b>further discussion</b> of the following food additive provisions for grape skin extract in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification/Comments
						mollusc/crustacean)
16.0	Composite foods - foods that could not be placed in categories 01 - 15	1500	mg/kg		3	<b>Comment</b> 1) Used for composite food; maximum level is enough to achieve the technological need. 2) Used for complex food which are not covered by the other categories. 3) Colour used to improve the organoleptic properties of food 4) If provisions are proposed for category 16, the products must be fully defined and the additive uses restricted to these products. In the vast majority of cases products can be covered by other food categories or as composite products (and therefore subject to carry over provisions)
16.0	Composite foods - foods that could not be placed in categories 01 - 15	10	mg/kg		6	

<b>Grape Skin Extracts, INS 163(ii)</b>						
The 41 <sup>st</sup> CCFA agreed to <b>circulate for comment at Step 3</b> the following food additive provisions for grape skin extracts in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification
05.1.2	Cocoa mixes (syrups)	200	mg/kg	Note 181	3	<b>Justification</b> 1) Used for cocoa mixtures; maximum level is enough to achieve the technological need 2) Colour supports the various flavour and types of products. A wide range of colours is equally justified and should be equally permitted. 3) Support for max use of 200 mg/kg pigment. <b>Comment:</b> Use may mislead consumer
05.1.3	Cocoa-based spreads, incl. fillings	200	mg/kg	Note 181	3	<b>Justification</b> 1) Used for fillings; maximum level is enough to achieve the technological need 2) Colour supports the various flavour and types of products. A wide range of colours is equally justified and should be equally permitted. 3) Support for max use of 200 mg/kg pigment. <b>Comment:</b> Use may mislead consumer
05.1.4	Cocoa and chocolate products	200	mg/kg	Note 181 & 183	3	<b>Justification</b> 1) Used for chocolate products; maximum level is enough to achieve the technological need 2) Colour supports the various flavour and types of products. A wide range of colours is equally justified and should be equally permitted. 3) Support for max use of 200 mg/kg pigment. 4) The current eWG recommendation is to adopt 500 mg/kg for Category 5.2 (Hard and Soft Candy, Marzipan and Nougats). The candies under 5.2 would fall into category 5.1.4 when covered with chocolate. Examples of these products include chocolate covered mints (e.g. Dark Chocolate Covered Altoids), chocolate covered gummy bears, chocolate covered marzipan, chocolate covered nougat, etc. Therefore, the same use level of grape skin extract that is allowed in 5.2 should be permitted for candies under 5.1.4 Cocoa and Chocolate. <b>Comments:</b> 1) Use may mislead consumer. 2) Inconsistencies between non-standardized chocolate product among 05.1.4 & 05.2, 05.4 - recommends CCFA ensure provisions for use of colour additive in non-standardized chocolate products are consistent with approach for use of colours in other confections without compromising colour



<b>Grape Skin Extracts, INS 163(ii)</b>						
The 41st CCFA agreed to <b>circulate for comment at Step 3</b> the following food additive provisions for grape skin extracts in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification
						limitations in Codex Standard for Chocolate and chocolate products. <b>3)</b> Request that no actions be taken to limit level of colours in 5.1.4 or create disparity with 5.2 but also do not effect chocolate meeting Codex Standard 87.
15.3	Snacks - fish based	500	mg/kg		3	<b>Justification</b> <b>1)</b> Used to colour snacks; maximum level is enough to achieve the technological need. <b>2)</b> Us to restore colour which was destroyed during production.

### IRON OXIDES (INS 172(i), 172(ii), 172(iii))

22. The 28<sup>th</sup> CAC has adopted several provisions in the GSFA for the use of iron oxides.

23. The 23<sup>rd</sup> JECFA (1979) assigned an ADI of 0.5 mg/kg bw/d for iron oxides (172(i), 172(ii), 172(iii)).

24. The 30<sup>th</sup> CCFA requested that JECFA perform intake assessments for iron oxides based on the pending levels of use in the GSFA and national food consumption data. The 53<sup>rd</sup> JECFA (1999) concluded that it is unlikely that intake of iron oxides would exceed the ADI of 0-0.5 mg/kg bw.

The following are the outstanding recommendations of the report of the eWG to the 40<sup>th</sup> CCFA.

<b>Recommendation 1 - Iron Oxides, INS 172(i), 172(ii), 172(iii)</b>						
The eWG of the 40 <sup>th</sup> CCFA recommended the <b>adoption</b> the following food additive provisions for iron oxides in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification/Comments
01.6.1	Unripened cheese		GMP		6	<b>Justification</b> Codex Stan 221 contains provisions for other colours <b>Comment:</b> Rind not expected on unripened cheese, intake concerns.
04.2.2.6	Vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed pulps and preparations (e.g., vegetable desserts and sauces, candied vegetables) other than food category 04.2.2.5	300	mg/kg	Note 92	6	<b>Justification</b> To improve organoleptic properties of food <b>Comment:</b> Excluding tomato-based sauce
14.1.3.2	Vegetable nectar	100	mg/kg		6	<b>Justification</b> To improve organoleptic properties of food <b>Comment:</b> No technological need/justification. These are similar to fruit nectars, in which colours are not justified
14.1.3.4	Concentrates for vegetable nectar	100	mg/kg	Note 127	6	<b>Justification</b> To improve organoleptic properties of food <b>Comment</b> No technological need/justification. These are similar to fruit nectars, in which colours are not justified

<b>Recommendation 2 - Iron Oxides, INS 172(i), 172(ii), 172(iii)</b>						
The eWG of the 40 <sup>th</sup> CCFA recommended <b>further discussion</b> of the following food additive provisions for iron oxides in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification/Comments
05.1.3	Cocoa-based spreads, including fillings		GMP		6	<b>Justification</b> <b>1)</b> Food category in which use of one or more colours is justified <b>2)</b> Provision requires a numeric level of use instead of level consistent with good manufacturing practice (GMP), because of a numerical ADI <b>Comment</b> Additional information; numerical level needed to achieve technological effect and justification

## PART II – MISCELLANEOUS

## GENERAL CONSIDERATIONS

25. Outstanding recommendations for provisions for the use of food additives include the following:

INS	Food additive	INS	Food Additive
200 – 203	Sorbates	459	<i>beta</i> -Cyclodextrin
214, 218	<i>para</i> -Hydroxybenzoates	474	Sucroglycerides
234	Nisin	484	Stearyl citrate
304, 305	Ascorbyl esters	954(i)-(iv)	Saccharins
310	Propyl gallate	955	Sucralose (Trichlorogalactosucrose)
338, 339i-iii, 340i-iii, 341i-iii, 342i-ii, 343i-ii, 450i-iii, 450v-vii, 451i-ii, 452i-v, 542	Phosphates	962	Aspartame-acesulfame salt
442	Ammonium salts of phosphatidic acid		

## SORBATES (INS 200-203)

26. The 29<sup>th</sup> JECFA (1985) assigned a group ADI of 25 mg/kg bw for sorbates.

27. The Codex Class Names and International Numbering System for Food Additives (CAC/GL 36-1989) associates the technological purpose preservative with sorbates.

<b>Recommendation 1 – Sorbates, INS 200-203</b>						
The eWG of the 41 <sup>st</sup> CCFA recommended <b>adoption</b> of the following food additive provisions for sorbates in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification/Comments
01.1.2	Dairy-based drinks, flavoured and/or fermented (e.g., chocolate milk, cocoa, eggnog, drinking yoghurt, whey-based drinks)	300	mg/kg	Note 42	6	
01.2.2	Renneted milk (plain)	1,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	
03.0	Edible ices, including sherbet and sorbet	1,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	<b>Comment</b> No need of preservatives in frozen technology
04.1.2.1	Frozen Fruit	1,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	<b>Comment</b> 1) Freezing provides adequate preservation, no need for chemical preservatives
04.1.2.7	Candied fruit	1,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	<b>Justification</b> Used in glazed fruit to top Gammon and in cake mix.
04.1.2.9	Fruit-based desserts, including fruit-flavoured waterbased desserts	1,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	
04.2.2.7	Fermented vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and seaweed products, excluding fermented soybean products of food categories 06.8.6, 06.8.7, 12.9.1, 12.9.2.1 and 12.9.2.3	1,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	<b>Comment</b> Industry in Canada has indicated a technological need for use of sorbates in this Category at 1000 mg/kg
04.2.2.8	Cooked or fried vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds	2,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	<b>Comment</b> Use should only be in potato dough and pre-fried potato slices
05.1.1	Cocoa mixes (powders) and cocoa mass/cake	1,500	mg/kg	Note 42	6	
05.1.2	Cocoa mixes (syrups)	1,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	
05.1.3	Cocoa-based spreads, including fillings	1,500	mg/kg	Note 42	6	
05.4	Decorations (e.g., for fine bakery wares), toppings (non-fruit) and sweet sauces	1,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	<b>Comment</b> Recommend a level of 1,500 mg/kg. Micro stability of low acid toppings is not achieved at 1,000 mg/kg.
06.2	Flours and starches (including soybean powder)	1,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	<b>Comment</b> No technological justification, use level would result in high intake in a basic foodstuff

<b>Recommendation 1 – Sorbates, INS 200-203</b>						
The eWG of the 41 <sup>st</sup> CCFA recommended <b>adoption</b> of the following food additive provisions for sorbates in the GSFA.						
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>Step</b>	<b>Justification/Comments</b>
06.5	Cereal and starch based desserts (e.g., rice pudding, tapioca pudding)	1,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	
08.4	Edible casings (e.g., sausage casings)	GMP		Note 42	6	<b>Justification</b> For use in collagen based casings with a water activity greater than 0.6
13.6	Food supplements	2,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	<b>Comment</b> Only support for use in food supplements supplied in liquid form
14.1.2.2	Vegetable juice	1,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	<b>Justification</b> Adopt based on corresponding levels established for fruit juices and nectars; add notes 91 and 122 for consistency with notes for fruit juices and nectars.
14.1.2.4	Concentrates for vegetable juice	1,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	<b>Justification</b> Adopt based on corresponding levels established for fruit juices and nectars; add notes 91, 122 and 127 for consistency with notes for fruit juices and nectars.
14.1.3.2	Vegetable nectar	1,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	<b>Justification</b> Adopt based on corresponding levels established for fruit juices and nectars; add notes 91 and 122 for consistency with notes for fruit juices and nectars
14.1.3.4	Concentrates for vegetable nectar	1,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	<b>Justification</b> Adopt based on corresponding levels established for fruit juices and nectars; add notes 91, 122 and 127 for consistency with notes for fruit juices and nectars.
14.2.6	Distilled spirituous beverages containing more than 15% alcohol	600	mg/kg	Note 42	6	

<b>Recommendation 3 – Sorbates, INS 200-203</b>						
The eWG of the 41 <sup>st</sup> CCFA recommended <b>further discussion</b> of the following food additive provisions for sorbates in the GSFA.						
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>Step</b>	<b>Justification/Comments</b>
01.6.1	Unripened cheese	3,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	<b>Comment</b> 1) Industry in Canada has indicated a technological need for sorbates at 3000 mg/kg. However, in the Codex Standard 221-2001, for Unripened Cheese including Fresh Cheese there is a provision for 1000 mg/k 2) Support use level of 3,000 mg/kg which is needed to prevent mould growth.
01.6.2	Ripened cheese	3,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	<b>Comment</b> 1) Industry in Canada has indicated a technological need for sorbates at 3000 mg/kg. However, in the Codex Standard A-6-1978, amended in 2006, Cheese, there is a provision for 1000 mg/kg 2) suggest adding Note 3: surface treatment only 3) ML is 1000 mg/kg in CODEX STAN 283

<b>Recommendation 3 – Sorbates, INS 200-203</b>						
The eWG of the 41 <sup>st</sup> CCFA recommended <b>further discussion</b> of the following food additive provisions for sorbates in the GSFA.						
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>Step</b>	<b>Justification/Comments</b>
01.6.4	Processed cheese	3,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	<b>Comment</b> 1) Consistent with the Codex Standard A-8(b)-1978 for Processed Cheese, also in Canada industry has indicated a technological need for sorbates at this level of use. 2) ML 3,000 mg/kg is necessary as anti-moulding agent for higher pH products
01.7	Dairy-based desserts (e.g., pudding, fruit or flavoured yoghurt)	1,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	<b>Comments</b> 1) Not necessary in heat treated products as the heat treatment provides adequate preservation. Add note "Only for non-heat treated dairy based desserts" 2) ML 1000 mg/kg necessary in dairy based desserts independent of heat treatment; suggest adding a note: "use only allowed in heat treated flavoured fermented milk" (STAN 243)
04.1.2.2	Dried fruit	2,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	<b>Comment</b> 1) ML seems high. A ML of 1000 mg/kg seems sufficient to achieve the technological function 2) Necessary in rehydrated/soft fruit, but not in standard fruit
04.1.2.5	Jams, jellies, marmelades	1,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	<b>Comment</b> 1) In the past, industry in Canada has indicated a technological need for use of sorbates in this Category at 1000 mg/kg 2) Add note "only in low-sugar jams" 3) Used at ML of 1000 mg/kg in all jams.
04.1.2.8	Fruit preparations, including pulp, purees, fruit toppings and coconut milk	1,500	mg/kg	Note 42	6	<b>Comment</b> 1) ML seems high. A ML of 1000 mg/kg sufficient to achieve the technological function 2) This additive functions as preservative and the level is necessary to achieve the intended technical need.
04.2.2.3	Vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds in vinegar, oil, brine, or soybean sauce	2,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	<b>Comment</b> Industry in Canada has indicated a technological need for use of sorbates in this Category at 1000 mg/kg
04.2.2.5	Vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed purees and spreads (e.g., peanut butter)	2,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	<b>Comment</b> Industry in Canada has indicated a technological need for use of sorbates in this Category at 1000 mg/kg
04.2.2.6	Vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed pulps and preparations (e.g., vegetable desserts and sauces, candied vegetables) other than food category 04.2.2.5	2,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	<b>Comment</b> Industry in Canada has indicated a technological need for use of sorbates in this Category at 1000 mg/kg
05.1.4	Cocoa and chocolate products	1,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	<b>Comment</b> Sorbates are not allowed in standardized cocoa or chocolate products (as per the Codex Standard)

<b>Recommendation 3 – Sorbates, INS 200-203</b>						
The eWG of the 41 <sup>st</sup> CCFA recommended <b>further discussion</b> of the following food additive provisions for sorbates in the GSFA.						
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>Step</b>	<b>Justification/Comments</b>
05.2	Confectionery including hard and soft candy, nougats, etc. other than food categories 05.1, 05.3 and 05.4	2,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	<b>Comment</b> 1) ML seems high. A ML of 1500 mg/kg seems sufficient to achieve the technological function 2) 1500 mg/kg is required for technical application in products
06.4.2	Dried pastas and noodles and like products	2,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	<b>Justification</b> Consistent with Codex Standard for Noodles <b>Comment</b> No additives are necessary in dried pasta
06.4.3	Pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products	2,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	<b>Justification</b> Consistent with Codex Standard for Noodles <b>Comment</b> Add note "only in noodles"
07.0	Bakery wares	2,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	<b>Comment</b> 1) industry in Canada has indicated a technological need for use of sorbates in this Category at 1000 mg/kg 2) Add note "Only pre-packed sliced bread and rye bread and partially cooked bakery wares and energy reduced bakery wares"
08.2	Processed meat, poultry, and game products in whole pieces or cuts	2,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	<b>Comment</b> 1) Add note "for surface treatment of dried meat products" 2) Used in Biltong snapsticks
08.3	Processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	2,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	<b>Comment</b> Add note "for surface treatment of dried meat products"
09.2.5	Smoked, dried, fermented, and/or salted fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	2,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	<b>Comment</b> Industry in Canada has indicated a technological need for use of sorbates in this Category at 1000 mg/kg
09.3	Semi-preserved fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	2,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	<b>Comment</b> Industry in Canada has indicated a technological need for use of sorbates in this Category at 1000 mg/kg
12.4	Mustards	1,500	mg/kg	Note 42	6	<b>Comment</b> 1) ML seems high. A ML of 1000 mg/kg seems sufficient to achieve the technological function 2) Technological purpose questioned
12.5	Soups and broths	1,500	mg/kg	Note 42	6	<b>Comment</b> 1) Codex Standard for Bouillons and Consommés allows maximum 500 mg/kg 2) ML seems high. A ML of 500 mg/kg seems sufficient to achieve the technological function
12.6.1	Emulsified sauces (e.g., mayonnaise, salad dressing)	3,350	mg/kg	Note 42	6	<b>Comment</b> 1) Industry in Canada has indicated a technological need for use of sorbates in this Category at 3,350 mg/kg 2) ML seems high. A ML of 2000 mg/kg seems sufficient to achieve the technological function 3) Used in Snoek pate at 3350 mg/kg

<b>Recommendation 3 – Sorbates, INS 200-203</b>						
The eWG of the 41 <sup>st</sup> CCFA recommended <b>further discussion</b> of the following food additive provisions for sorbates in the GSFA.						
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>Step</b>	<b>Justification/Comments</b>
12.6.2	Non-emulsified sauces (e.g., ketchup, cheese sauce, cream sauce, brown gravy)	2,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	<b>Comment</b> 1) ML seems high. A ML of 1000 mg/kg seems sufficient to achieve the technological function 2) The Additive functions as a preservative and the maximum use level of 1000mg/kg is safe and necessary to achieve the intended purpose.
12.6.3	Mixes for sauces and gravies	2,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	<b>Comment</b> ML seems high. A ML of 1000 mg/kg seems sufficient to achieve the technological function
12.6.4	Clear sauces (e.g., fish sauce)	2,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	<b>Comment</b> 1) ML seems high. A ML of 1000 mg/kg seems sufficient to achieve the technological function 2) The Additive functions as a preservative and the maximum use level of 1000 mg/kg is safe and necessary to achieve the intended purpose.
13.5	Dietetic foods (e.g., supplementary foods for dietary use) excluding products of food categories 13.1 - 13.4 and 13.6	2,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	ML seems high. A ML of 1500 mg/kg seems sufficient to achieve the technological function
14.1.4.1	Carbonated water-based flavoured drinks	1,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	<b>Comment</b> 1) Industry in Canada has indicated a technological need for use of sorbates in this Category at 1000 mg/kg 2) ML seems high. A ML of 300 mg/kg sufficient to achieve the technological function 3) Suggest collapsing the subcategories into 14.1.4. Although 1000 mg/kg is permitted in some countries, the current use levels typically do not exceed 500 mg/kg as sorbic acid due to inadequate solubility and sensory concerns at higher use levels.
14.1.4.2	Non-carbonated water-based flavoured drinks, including punches and ades	1,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	<b>Comment</b> 1) Industry in Canada has indicated a technological need for use of sorbates in this Category at 1000 mg/kg 2) ML seems high. A ML of 300 mg/kg sufficient to achieve the technological function 3) Collapse into 14.1.4
14.1.4.3	Concentrates (liquid or solid) for water-based flavoured drinks	1,500	mg/kg	Note 42	6	<b>Comment</b> 1) ML seems high. A ML of 300 mg/kg sufficient to achieve the technological function, add note 127. 2) Collapse into 14.1.4. If CCFA decides to continue to maintain the subcategories, we suggest including Note 127 (As served to the consumer) in 14.1.4.3.

<b>Recommendation 3 – Sorbates, INS 200-203</b>						
The eWG of the 41 <sup>st</sup> CCFA recommended <b>further discussion</b> of the following food additive provisions for sorbates in the GSFA.						
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>Step</b>	<b>Justification/Comments</b>
14.1.5	Coffee, coffee substitutes, tea, herbal infusions, and other hot cereal and grain beverages, excluding cocoa	1,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	<b>Comment</b> 1) Set ML to 600 mg/kg. Add note "Only in liquid tea concentrates and liquid fruit and herbal infusion concentrates" 2) Set ML to 500 mg/kg due to solubility concerns at higher use levels. 3) Add Note 160 (For use in ready-to-drink products and premixes for ready-to-drink products only)
14.2.2	Cider and perry	1,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	<b>Comment</b> 1) Industry in Canada has indicated that 500 mg/kg is technologically sufficient for these foods 2) ML seems high. A ML of 300 mg/kg sufficient to achieve the technological function
14.2.3	Grape wines	2,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	<b>Comment</b> 1) Industry in Canada has indicated that 500 mg/kg is technologically sufficient for these foods 2) ML seems high. A ML of 200 mg/kg sufficient to achieve the technological function
14.2.4	Wines (other than grape)	1,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	<b>Comment</b> 1) Industry in Canada has indicated that 500 mg/kg is technologically sufficient for these foods 2) 200 mg/kg adequate for tech need
14.2.5	Mead	1,000	mg/kg	Note 42	6	<b>Comment</b> ML seems high. A ML of 200 mg/kg seems sufficient to achieve the technological function
14.2.7	Aromatized alcoholic beverages (e.g., beer, wine and spirituous cooler-type beverages, low alcoholic refreshers)	500	mg/kg	Note 42	6	<b>Comment</b> 1) Industry in Canada has indicated a technological need for use of sorbates in this Category at 500 mg/kg 2) Level of 200 mg/kg adequate

### HYDROXYBENZOATES, PARA- (INS 214, 218)

28. The 17<sup>th</sup> JECFA (1973) assigned a group ADI of 10 mg/kg bw for para-hydroxybenzoates.

29. The Codex Class Names and International Numbering System for Food Additives (CAC/GL 36-1989) associates the technological purpose preservative with para-hydroxybenzoates.

<b>Recommendation 1 – Hydroxybenzoates, para-, INS 214, 218</b>						
The eWG of the 41 <sup>st</sup> CCFA recommended <b>adoption</b> of the following food additive provisions for para-hydroxybenzoates in the GSFA.						
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>Step</b>	<b>Justification/Comment</b>
01.6.4	Processed cheese	300	mg/kg	Note 27	6	
01.7	Dairy-based desserts (e.g., pudding, fruit or flavoured yoghurt)	120	mg/kg	Note 27	6	<b>Comment</b> Only allowed in flavoured fermented milks heat treated after fermentation per CODEX STAN 243.
02.2.2	Fat spreads, dairy fat spreads and blended spreads	300	mg/kg	Note 27	6	
02.3	Fat emulsions mainly of type oil-in-water, including mixed and/or flavoured products based on fat emulsions	300	mg/kg	Note 27	6	

<b>Recommendation 1 – Hydroxybenzoates, para-, INS 214, 218</b>						
The eWG of the 41 <sup>st</sup> CCFA recommended <b>adoption</b> of the following food additive provisions for para-hydroxybenzoates in the GSFA.						
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>Step</b>	<b>Justification/Comment</b>
03.0	Edible ices, including sherbet and sorbet	1000	mg/kg	Note 27	6	<b>Comment</b> No need of preservatives and antioxidants in frozen technology.
04.1.2.3	Fruit in vinegar, oil, or brine	800	mg/kg	Note 27	6	
04.1.2.6	Fruit-based spreads (e.g., chutney) excluding products of food category 04.1.2.5	1000	mg/kg	Note 27	6	
04.1.2.9	Fruit-based desserts, including fruit-flavoured water-based desserts	800	mg/kg	Note 27	6	
04.2.1.2	Surface-treated fresh vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds	12	mg/kg	Note 27	6	<b>Comment</b> Request technological need, seems too low for efficacy
04.2.1.3	Peeled, cut or shredded fresh vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds	12	mg/kg	Note 27	6	<b>Comment</b> Request technological need, seems too low for efficacy
04.2.2.7	Fermented vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and seaweed products, excluding fermented soybean products of food categories 06.8.6, 06.8.7, 12.9.1, 12.9.2.1 and 12.9.2.3	300	mg/kg	Note 27	6	
05.1.1	Cocoa mixes (powders) and cocoa mass/cake	700	mg/kg	Note 27	6	
05.1.3	Cocoa-based spreads, including fillings	300	mg/kg	Note 27	6	
05.2	Confectionery including hard and soft candy, nougats, etc. other than food categories 05.1, 05.3 and 05.4	<b>1000</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Note 27	6	<b>Comment</b> 1000 mg/kg is sufficient for technical application in products
11.4	Other sugars and syrups (e.g., xylose, maple syrup, sugar toppings)	100	mg/kg	Note 27	6	
12.3	Vinegars	100	mg/kg	Note 27	6	<b>Comment</b> Preservative not required in products with minimum 5% acetic acid.
14.1.5	Coffee, coffee substitutes, tea, herbal infusions, and other hot cereal and grain beverages, excluding cocoa	450	mg/kg	Notes 27 & 160	6	
14.2.1	Beer and malt beverages	200	mg/kg	Note 27	6	
14.2.3	Grape wines	50	mg/kg	Note 27	6	
14.2.4	Wines (other than grape)	200	mg/kg	Note 27	6	
14.2.7	Aromatized alcoholic beverages (e.g., beer, wine and spirituous cooler-type beverages, low alcoholic refreshers)	1000	mg/kg	Note 27	6	

<b>Recommendation 2 – Hydroxybenzoates, para-, INS 214, 218</b>						
The eWG of the 41 <sup>st</sup> CCFA recommended <b>further discussion</b> of the following food additive provisions for para-hydroxybenzoates in the GSFA.						
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>Step</b>	<b>Justification/Comment</b>
04.1.2.5	Jams, jellies, marmelades	1000	mg/kg	Note 27	6	<b>Comments</b> Except for low-sugar jams, there is no technological justification to add p-hydroxybenzoate as the sugar ensures the preservative function



**NISIN (INS 234)**

30. The 12<sup>th</sup> JECFA (1968) assigned an ADI of 33,000 U/kg bw for nisin.

31. The Codex Class Names and International Numbering System for Food Additives (CAC/GL 36-1989) associates the technological purpose preservative with nisin.

32. Nisin preparation is the commercially-available form of nisin. At the 68<sup>th</sup> JECFA (2007), the name of the additive “nisin” was changed to “nisin preparation” to clarify that the preparation also includes sodium chloride and several different types of nisin (WHO TRS 947 (2007) pp. 54-55). One gram of nisin preparation contains 1,000,000 International Units (IU) of nisin (see specifications in JECFA Monographs 4 (2007)). Available information indicates that a typical nisin preparation contains 2.5 % nisin. As there is 0.025 µg nisin per IU, nisin preparation also contains 0.025 µg nisin per IU (i.e., (2.5 g nisin/100 g nisin preparation) x (1 g nisin preparation/1,000,000 IU)). The JECFA ADI of 33,000 IU/kg bw refers to nisin (WHO TRS 430 (1969), pp. 33-35). Therefore, to compare this ADI with the use levels in the GSFA, which are reported as nisin, the ADI should be converted to the mg/kg bw basis. The GSFA (Note 28) provides this calculation: (33,000 IU nisin/kg bw) x (0.025 µg nisin/IU) x (1 mg/1 000 µg) = 0.825 mg/kg bw. Therefore, both the JECFA ADI and use levels in the GSFA are on the “nisin” reporting basis.

33. Since the JECFA ADI and the use levels in the GSFA are on the “nisin” reporting basis, it is **proposed** that the current Note 28 be revised **to clarify this**:

**Revised Note 28:** As Nisin. Nisin preparation (as defined in the JECFA specifications monograph for “Nisin Preparation”) typically contains 2.5 percent nisin. The maximum use level “as nisin” can be converted to a maximum use level for nisin preparation by dividing by 0.025. The ADI of 33,000 IU nisin/kg bw is equivalent to 0.825 mg/kg bw [(33,000 IU nisin/kg bw) x (0.025 µg nisin /IU) x (1 mg/1 000 µg)].

<b>Recommendation 1 – Nisin, INS 234</b>						
The eWG of the 41 <sup>st</sup> CCFA recommended <b>discontinuation</b> of the following food additive provisions for nisin in the GSFA.						
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>Step</b>	<b>Justification/Comment</b>
01.1	Milk and dairy-based drinks	500	mg/kg	Note 28	3	<b>Comment</b> Should not be discontinued – approved in milk products in certain Middle eastern countries at GMP and in China at 500 mg/kg as salt.
01.4	Cream (plain) and the like	500	mg/kg	Note 28	3	<b>Comment</b> 1) There is no technological need. 2) Permitted in 01.4.2 at 10 mg/kg as nisin in ANZ, EU and other countries.
01.6.2	Ripened cheese	500	mg/kg	Note 28	3	<b>Comment</b> The level of 12.5 mg/kg is technologically adequate. With a ML of 500 mg/kg, a child who would eat a portion of 25 g would reach the ADI
01.6.4	Processed cheese	500	mg/kg	Note 28	3	<b>Comment</b> The ML is far too high. Level of 12.5 mg/kg is technologically adequate
01.7	Dairy-based desserts (e.g., pudding, fruit or flavoured yoghurt)	500	mg/kg	Note 28	3	
04.2.2.4	Canned or bottled (pasteurized) or retort pouch vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds		GMP	Note 28	6	<b>Comment</b> 1) There is no technological need 2) Nisin controls outgrowth of heat resistant bacterial spores. Many of these vegetable products cannot be processed under full heat sterilization regimes without destroying their organoleptic and nutritive qualities
07.2	Fine bakery wares (sweet, salty, savoury) and mixes	250	mg/kg	Note 28	6	<b>Comment</b> Suggest revision; 6.25 mg/kg as nisin required to produce desired preservative effect. Use permitted in several countries at 6.25 mg/kg.

<b>Recommendation 1 – Nisin, INS 234</b>						
The eWG of the 41 <sup>st</sup> CCFA recommended <b>discontinuation</b> of the following food additive provisions for nisin in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification/Comment
12.5.1	Ready-to-eat soups and broths, including canned, bottled, and frozen		GMP	Note 28	6	<b>Comment</b> Used in minimally processed, refrigerated soups to prevent spoilage of products that cannot be processed under full heat sterilization regimes without destroying their organoleptic and nutritive qualities.

<b>Recommendation 2 – Nisin, INS 234</b>						
The eWG of the 41 <sup>st</sup> CCFA recommended <b>adoption</b> of the following food additive provisions for nisin in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification/Comment
01.6.1	Unripened cheese	12.5	mg/kg	Note 28	6	<b>Comment</b> Broadly used in the manufacturing of cheese: inhibits spore germination and growth of clostridium, bacillus or listeria. For the latter, no alternative method allowed to reach the same level of safety

<b>Recommendation 3 – Nisin, INS 234</b>						
The eWG of the 41 <sup>st</sup> CCFA recommended <b>further discussion</b> of the following food additive provisions for nisin in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification/Comment
01.6.4	Processed cheese	250	mg/kg	Note 28	6	<b>Comment</b> 1) The ML is far too high. Level of 12.5 mg/kg is technologically adequate 2) National legislation exists for use as an antimicrobial in pasteurized process cheese spreads (including those containing fruits, vegetables or meats) at a level of 250 mg/kg
08.0	Meat and meat products, including poultry and game	500	mg/kg	Note 28	3	<b>Comment</b> 1) More information needed on the use of nisin in the general Category 8.0 "Meat and meat products" because the adoption of the provision would allow the use of a preservative in fresh meat products. 2) Revise to subcategory provisions 08.1.2, 08.2 and 08.3
10.2.1	Liquid egg products		GMP	Note 28	3	

### ASCORBYL ESTERS (INS 304, 305)

34. The 17<sup>th</sup> JECFA (1973) assigned a group ADI of 1.25 mg/kg bw for ascorbyl esters.

35. The Codex Class Names and International Numbering System for Food Additives (CAC/GL 36-1989) associates the technological purpose antioxidant with ascorbyl esters.

<b>Recommendation 1 – Ascorbyl Esters, INS 304, 305</b>						
The eWG of the 41 <sup>st</sup> CCFA recommended <b>adoption</b> of the following food additive provisions for ascorbyl esters in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification/Comment
01.6.1	Unripened cheese	500	mg/kg	Note 10	3	

<b>Recommendation 2 – Ascorbyl Esters, INS 304, 305</b>						
The eWG of the 41 <sup>st</sup> CCFA recommended <b>further discussion</b> of the following food additive provisions for ascorbyl esters in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification/Comment
06.4.3	Pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products	500	mg/kg	Note 10	3	<b>Comment</b> 1) Consistent with the Standard

<b>Recommendation 2 – Ascorbyl Esters, INS 304, 305</b>						
The eWG of the 41 <sup>st</sup> CCFA recommended <b>further discussion</b> of the following food additive provisions for ascorbyl esters in the GSFA.						
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>Step</b>	<b>Justification/Comment</b>
06.4.3	Pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products	20	mg/kg	Note 10	Adopted	249-2006 (Instant Noodles) as antioxidants at a maximum level of 500 mg/kg singly or in combination as ascorbyl stearate. <b>2)</b> Only in noodle but not in pre-cooked pasta <b>3)</b> Do not support “only in noodle” as fried, pre-cooked pasta may have tech need for antioxidant

### PROPYL GALLATE (INS 310)

36. The 46<sup>th</sup> JECFA (1996) assigned an ADI of 1.4 mg/kg bw for propyl gallate.

37. The Codex Class Names and International Numbering System for Food Additives (CAC/GL 36-1989) associates the technological purpose antioxidant with propyl gallate.

<b>Recommendation 1 – Propyl Gallate, INS 310</b>						
The eWG of the 41 <sup>st</sup> CCFA recommended <b>revocation</b> of the following food additive provision for propyl gallate in the GSFA.						
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>Step</b>	<b>Justification provided to eWG</b>
06.4.3	Pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products	100	mg/kg	Notes 15 & 130	Adopted	<b>Justification</b> Consequential effect of recommendation to adopt provision in food category 06.4.3 at Step 3.

<b>Recommendation 2 – Propyl Gallate, INS 310</b>						
The eWG of the 41 <sup>st</sup> CCFA recommended <b>adoption</b> of the following food additive provision for propyl gallate in the GSFA.						
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>Step</b>	<b>Justification/Comment</b>
06.4.3	Pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products	200	mg/kg	Notes 15 & 130	3	<b>Justification</b> Consistent with Codex STAN 249-2006 (Instant Noodles): provision for the use of propyl gallate as an antioxidant at a maximum level of 200 mg/kg singly or in combination with TBHQ, BHA, or BHT. <b>Comment</b> No technological justification for use in pre-cooked pastas.

<b>Recommendation 3 – Propyl Gallate, INS 310</b>						
The eWG of the 41 <sup>st</sup> CCFA recommended <b>further discussion</b> of the following food additive provisions for propyl gallate in the GSFA.						
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>Step</b>	<b>Justification/Comment</b>
12.5	Soups and broths	200	mg/kg	Notes 15 & 130	3	<b>Justification</b> Consistent with Codex STAN 117-1981 (Bouillons and Consommés): provision for the use of propyl gallate as an antioxidant at a maximum level of 200 mg/kg singly or in combination with TBHQ, BHA, or BHT. <b>Comment</b> This additive is not technologically necessary in all soups, its antioxidant function is only needed in powdered and dehydrated products covered by category 12.5.2.
12.5.2	Mixes for soups and broths	200	mg/kg	Notes 15 & 130	Adopted	

**PHOSPHATES (INS 338, 339i-iii, 340i-iii, 341i-iii, 342i-ii, 343i-ii, 450i-iii, 450v-vii, 451i-ii, 452i-v, 542)**

38. The 29<sup>th</sup> JECFA (1985) assigned a group MTDI (maximum tolerable daily intake) of 70 mg/kg bw, as phosphorus, for phosphates.

39. The Codex Class Names and International Numbering System for Food Additives (CAC/GL 36-1989) associates the technological purposes acidity regulator, sequestrant, emulsifier, texturizing agent, stabilizer, and moisture-retention agent with phosphates.

<b>Recommendation 1 – Phosphates, INS 338, 339i-iii, 340i-iii, 341i-iii, 342i-ii, 343i-ii, 450i-iii, 450v-vii, 451i-ii, 452i-v, 542</b> The eWG of the 41 <sup>st</sup> CCFA recommended <b>discontinuation</b> of the following food additive provision for phosphates in the GSFA.						
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>Step</b>	<b>Justification provided to eWG</b>
09.1.1	Fresh Fish	GMP		Note 33	6	<b>Comment</b> Not needed in fresh fish (only necessary when fish is frozen to prevent drip loss)

<b>Recommendation 2 – Phosphates, INS 338, 339i-iii, 340i-iii, 341i-iii, 342i-ii, 343i-ii, 450i-iii, 450v-vii, 451i-ii, 452i-v, 542</b> The eWG of the 41 <sup>st</sup> CCFA recommended <b>adoption</b> of the following food additive provisions for phosphates in the GSFA.						
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>Step</b>	<b>Justification/Comment</b>
01.1.2	Dairy-based drinks, flavoured and/or fermented (e.g., chocolate milk, cocoa, eggnog, drinking yoghurt, whey-based drinks)	1,320	mg/kg	Notes 33 & 88	6	<b>Comment</b> 2500 mg/kg necessary to stabilize the protein matrix in whey-based products
01.3.1	Condensed milk (plain)	880	mg/kg	Notes 33, 34, & 88	6	
01.3.2	Beverage whiteners	22,000	mg/kg	Notes 33 & 88	6	
01.5.1	Milk powder and cream powder (plain)	4,400	mg/kg	Notes 33 & 88	6	
01.6.4	Processed cheese	14,050	mg/kg	Note 33	6	
01.6.5	Cheese analogues	13,200	mg/kg	Note 33	6	
02.1.2	Vegetable oils and fats	220	mg/kg	Notes 33 & 88	6	
02.1.3	Lard, tallow, fish oil, and other animal fats	220	mg/kg	Notes 33 & 88	6	
04.1.2.3	Fruit in vinegar, oil, or brine	2,200	mg/kg	Note 33	3	
04.2.2.2	Dried vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds	5,000	mg/kg	Notes 33 & 76 <sup>5</sup>	6	
04.2.2.3	Vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds in vinegar, oil, brine, or soybean sauce	2,200	mg/kg	Note 33	6	
04.2.2.5	Vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed purees and spreads (e.g., peanut butter)	2,200	mg/kg	Notes 33 & 76	6	
04.2.2.6	Vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed pulps and preparations (e.g., vegetable desserts and sauces, candied vegetables) other than food category 04.2.2.5	2,200	mg/kg	Notes 33	6	
04.2.2.8	Cooked or fried vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds	2,200	mg/kg	Notes 33 & 76	6	<b>Comment</b> Only for processed potato products
05.1.3	Cocoa-based spreads, including fillings	<b>2,200</b>	mg/kg	Notes 33 & 88	6	

<sup>5</sup> **Note 76:** Use in potatoes only.

<b>Recommendation 2 – Phosphates, INS 338, 339i-iii, 340i-iii, 341i-iii, 342i-ii, 343i-ii, 450i-iii, 450v-vii, 451i-ii, 452i-v, 542</b> The eWG of the 41 <sup>st</sup> CCFA recommended <b>adoption</b> of the following food additive provisions for phosphates in the GSFA.						
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>Step</b>	<b>Justification/Comment</b>
05.3	Chewing gum	44,000	mg/kg	Note 33	6	<b>Comment</b> The use of phosphates in chewing gum does not raise safety concerns as phosphates are part of the nutrient source of Phosphorous to human bodies. Phosphates play an important role in a wide range of chewing gum and they are also specifically used with calcium in specialized chewing gum.
06.2.1	Flours	11,900	mg/kg	Note 33	6	<b>Comment</b> 1) Revise ML to 2500 mg/kg (except in self-raising flour) 2) Used as raising agent in self raising flour, and various cakes
06.6	Batters (e.g., for breading or batters for fish or poultry)	5,600	mg/kg	Note 33	3	
08.2.2	Heat-treated processed meat, poultry, and game products in whole pieces or cuts	3,100	mg/kg	Note 33	6	
09.3.1	Fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms, marinated and/or in Jelly	2,200	mg/kg	Note 33	3	
09.3.2	Fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms, pickled and/or in brine	2,200	mg/kg	Note 33	6	
09.3.3	Salmon substitutes, caviar, and other fish roe products	2,200	mg/kg	Note 33	6	
10.3	Preserved eggs, including alkaline, salted, and canned eggs	1,000	mg/kg	Note 33	6	
12.1.2	Salt Substitutes	4,400	mg/kg	Note 33	6	
12.2.2	Seasonings and condiments	4,400	mg/kg	Note 33	3	
12.4	Mustards	1,320	mg/kg	Note 33	6	
12.5.1	Ready-to-eat soups and broths, including canned, bottled, and frozen	1,320	mg/kg	Note 33	6	
12.5.2	Mixes for soups and broths	6,600	mg/kg	Note 33	6	<b>Comment</b> Revise ML to 10 000 mg/kg; is tech needed for dry soups that are high in fat, protein, dairy (cream/cream/whey) content and reconstituted by the addition of milk and water. Product is cooked up and fat must remain stable after cooking
14.2.1	Beer and malt beverages	440	mg/kg	Notes 33 & 88	6	Question use of note 88
14.2.4	Wines (other than grape)	440	mg/kg	Notes 33 & 88	6	

<b>Recommendation 3 – Phosphates, INS 338, 339i-iii, 340i-iii, 341i-iii, 342i-ii, 343i-ii, 450i-iii, 450v-vii, 451i-ii, 452i-v, 542</b> The eWG of the 41 <sup>st</sup> CCFA recommended <b>further discussion</b> of the following food additive provisions for phosphates in the GSFA.						
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>Step</b>	<b>Justification/Comment</b>
01.1.1	Milk and buttermilk (plain)	1,500	mg/kg	Notes 33 & 88	3	<b>Comment</b> 1) In the past, industry in Canada has indicated that the use of monoammonium phosphate in uncultured buttermilk at 270 ppm expressed as phosphorus is technologically sufficient. 2) Only in UHT and sterilised milk. In addition the ML should be lowered to 400 mg/kg which is sufficient to achieve the technological function. 3) Question use of note 88 4) support ML of 1500 mg/kg for UHT goat milk to stabilize calcium due to higher

<b>Recommendation 3 – Phosphates, INS 338, 339i-iii, 340i-iii, 341i-iii, 342i-ii, 343i-ii, 450i-iii, 450v-vii, 451i-ii, 452i-v, 542</b> The eWG of the 41 <sup>st</sup> CCFA recommended <b>further discussion</b> of the following food additive provisions for phosphates in the GSFA.						
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>Step</b>	<b>Justification/Comment</b>
						temperatures
01.4	Cream (plain) and the like	2,200	mg/kg	Notes 33 & 88	6	<b>Comment</b> 1) A value of 1100 mg /kg (as P) has been proposed by the ALINORM 08/31/11 Appendix V for creams and prepared creams 2) Used to stabilize prepared cream in products such as chocolate mousse. 3) ML of 2000 mg/kg as phosphate (880 mg/kd as phosphorus) in CODEX STAN 288 for Cream
01.6.1	Unripened cheese	10,000	mg/kg	Note 33	6	<b>Comment</b> 1) 1000 mg/kg (as P) seems sufficient to achieve the technological function (Stan 273-1968; STAN 275-1973). 2) Reduce maximum level to 3500 mg/kg, as referenced in the Codex Standard 221 (2001) for Unripened Cheese-
01.7	Dairy-based desserts (e.g., pudding, fruit or flavoured yoghurt)	10,500	mg/kg	Note 33	3	<b>Comment</b> 1) A ML of 1500 mg/kg (as P) seems sufficient to achieve the technological function 2) Used to stabilize prepared cream (chocolate mousse) 3) Add note stating "a level of 1000 mg/kg as phosphorus for flavoured fermented milks (CODEX STAN 243)
01.8.1	Liquid whey and whey products, excluding whey cheeses	880	mg/kg	Note 33	6	<b>Comment</b> 1) Industry in Canada has indicated a technological need for use of calcium phosphate, tribasic, in liquid whey, as a carrier for benzoyl peroxide but at lower levels than that proposed here. 2) ML of 1320 necessary to stabilize higher protein liquid whey used for further processing into whey protein concentrates
02.4	Fat-based desserts excluding dairy-based dessert products of food category 01.7	7,000	mg/kg	Note 33	6	<b>Comment</b> A ML of 1500 mg/kg (as P) seems sufficient to achieve the technological function
03.0	Edible ices, including sherbet and sorbet	12,000	mg/kg	Note 33	6	<b>Comment</b> 1) A ML of 500 mg/kg (as P) seems sufficient to achieve the technological function 2) Recommends reducing the maximum value to 7500
04.1.2.1	Frozen fruit	200	mg/kg	Note 33	6	<b>Comment</b> 1) Technological need is not recognized in such products 2) Maximum level be raised to 350 mg/kg, as such a limit is needed to get proper water activation and stabilize the colour throughout the shelf-life of such foods.
04.1.2.2	Dried fruit	10	mg/kg	Note 33	6	<b>Comment</b> 1) Technological need is not recognized in such products 2) Maximum level be raised to 500 mg/kg, as such a limit is needed to get proper water activation and stabilize the colour throughout the shelf-life of such foods.

<b>Recommendation 3 – Phosphates, INS 338, 339i-iii, 340i-iii, 341i-iii, 342i-ii, 343i-ii, 450i-iii, 450v-vii, 451i-ii, 452i-v, 542</b> The eWG of the 41 <sup>st</sup> CCFA recommended <b>further discussion</b> of the following food additive provisions for phosphates in the GSFA.						
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>Step</b>	<b>Justification/Comment</b>
04.1.2.4	Canned or bottled (pasteurized) fruit	200	mg/kg	Note 33	6	<b>Comment</b> Questions the technological need.
04.1.2.5	Jams, jellies, marmalades	530	mg/kg	Note 33	6	<b>Comment</b> Questions the technological need.
04.1.2.7	Candied fruit	10	mg/kg	Note 33	6	<b>Comment</b> Revise maximum level to 350 mg/kg, such a limit is needed to get proper water activation and stabilize the colour throughout the shelf-life of such foods.
04.1.2.8	Fruit preparations, including pulp, purees, fruit toppings and coconut milk	7,000	mg/kg	Note 33	6	<b>Comment</b> ML of 400 mg/kg (as P) seems sufficient to achieve the technological function
04.1.2.9	Fruit-based desserts, including fruit-flavoured waterbased desserts	7,000	mg/kg	Note 33	6	<b>Comment</b> ML of 1500 mg/kg (as P) seems sufficient to achieve the technological function
04.1.2.11	Fruit fillings for pastries	7,000	mg/kg	Note 33	6	<b>Comment</b> ML seems excessive-
04.2.1.3	Peeled, cut or shredded fresh vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds	5,600	mg/kg	Notes 33 & 76	6	<b>Comment</b> Add note "only in processed potato products"
04.2.2.1	Frozen vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds	5,000	mg/kg	Notes 33 & 76	6	<b>Comment</b> Add note "only in processed potato products"
04.2.2.4	Canned or bottled (pasteurized) or retort pouch vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds	2,200	mg/kg	Note 33	6	<b>Comment</b> Technological need questioned as Phosphates are primarily used as water-retention agents-
05.1.1	Cocoa mixes (powders) and cocoa mass/cake	6,000	mg/kg	Notes 33 & 88	6	<b>Comment</b> 1) Not permitted in the Commodity standard on cocoa powder Stan 105- 1981 2) questions use of note 88
05.1.4	Cocoa and chocolate products	2,200	mg/kg	Note 33	6	<b>Comment</b> 1) Phosphates have technological function as emulsifier and the level is necessary to achieve the intended use. 2) Not permitted in the Commodity standard on chocolate products Stan 87-1981
05.2	Confectionery including hard and soft candy, nougats, etc. other than food categories 05.1, 05.3 and 05.4	2,200	mg/kg	Note 33	6	<b>Comment</b> 10,000 mg/kg is required for technical application in hard and soft candy products.
05.4	Decorations (e.g., for fine bakery wares), toppings (non-fruit) and sweet sauces	7,000	mg/kg	Note 33	6	<b>Comment</b> ML of 1500 mg/kg (as P) seems sufficient to achieve the technological function
06.1	Whole, broken, or flaked grain, including rice	440	mg/kg	Note 33	6	<b>Comment</b> 1) Technological need questioned in this basic product 2) For Anti- Caking Aid, higher levels of approximately 4000 mg/kg may be required
06.2.2	Starches	6,200	mg/kg	Note 33	3	<b>Comment</b> More information requested
06.4.1	Fresh pastas and noodles and like products	2,000	mg/kg	Note 33	3	<b>Comment</b> Need in fresh pasta not recognized
06.4.2	Dried pastas and noodles and like products	2,200	mg/kg	Note 33	3	<b>Comment</b> Need in dried pasta not

<b>Recommendation 3 – Phosphates, INS 338, 339i-iii, 340i-iii, 341i-iii, 342i-ii, 343i-ii, 450i-iii, 450v-vii, 451i-ii, 452i-v, 542</b> The eWG of the 41 <sup>st</sup> CCFA recommended <b>further discussion</b> of the following food additive provisions for phosphates in the GSFA.						
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>Step</b>	<b>Justification/Comment</b>
						recognized
06.4.3	Pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products	2,200	mg/kg	Note 33	3	<b>Comment</b> 1) Technological need as emulsifier and the maximum level is necessary to achieve the intended function. 2) Add note “only in noodles”
06.5	Cereal and starch based desserts (e.g., rice pudding, tapioca pudding)	7,000	mg/kg	Note 33	6	<b>Comment</b> ML of 1500 mg/kg (as P) seems sufficient to achieve the technological function
07.0	Bakery wares	9,300	mg/kg	Note 33	6	<b>Comment</b> 1) Basic foodstuff highly consumed. Technological need questioned for all products within this category 2) Used as raising agent in self-raising flour
08.2.1	Non-heat treated processed meat, poultry, and game products in whole pieces or cuts	2,200	mg/kg	Note 33	6	<b>Comment</b> 1) This additive is not needed in unprocessed fresh meat 2) Used in processed meats, even when not heat treated (e.g., marinated meat)
09.2.1	Frozen fish, fish fillets, and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	2,200	mg/kg	Note 33	6	<b>Comment</b> 1) Add note “excluding fish products” 2) Only in unprocessed fish, frozen and deep frozen
09.2.2	Frozen battered fish, fish fillets, and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	2,200	mg/kg	Note 33	6	<b>Comment</b> Add note “excluding fish products”
09.2.3	Frozen minced and creamed fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	2,200	mg/kg	Note 33	6	<b>Comment</b> Add note “only in frozen mollusk and crustacean”
09.2.4.1	Cooked fish and fish products	2,200	mg/kg	Note 33	6	<b>Comment</b> Add note “only in surimi, fish and crustacean paste”
09.2.4.2	Cooked mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	2,200	mg/kg	Note 33	6	<b>Comment</b> Add note “only in frozen mollusk and crustacean”
09.2.5	Smoked, dried, fermented, and/or salted fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	2,200	mg/kg	Note 33	3	<b>Comment</b> Add note “only in fish paste”
09.4	Fully preserved, including canned or fermented fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	2,200	mg/kg	Note 33	6	<b>Comment</b> Reduce ML to 400 mg/kg and add note “only in surimi and canned crustacean products”-
10.4	Egg-based desserts (e.g., custard)	7,000	mg/kg	Note 33	6	<b>Comment</b> ML of 1000 mg/kg (as P) seems sufficient to achieve the technological function
12.2.1	Herbs and spices		GMP	Note 33	6	<b>Comment</b> Replace GMP by a numerical level of use
12.6	Sauces and like products	8,000	mg/kg	Note 33	6	<b>Comment</b> 1) Level seems higher then technologically necessary 2) ML of 50 000 is technologically needed for dry sauces that are high in fat, protein, dairy (cream / creamer / whey) content and reconstituted by the addition of milk and water. Product are either instant or is cooked up and must remain stable after cooking and storing in a fridge.



<b>Recommendation 3 – Phosphates, INS 338, 339i-iii, 340i-iii, 341i-iii, 342i-ii, 343i-ii, 450i-iii, 450v-vii, 451i-ii, 452i-v, 542</b> The eWG of the 41 <sup>st</sup> CCFA recommended <b>further discussion</b> of the following food additive provisions for phosphates in the GSFA.						
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>Step</b>	<b>Justification/Comment</b>
13.2	Complementary foods for infants and young children	2,200	mg/kg	Note 33	6	<b>Comment</b> 1) INS 339) is used as an acidity regulator and its use is consistent with the criteria in Section 3.2 of the GSFA Preamble. 2) If this provision is to be consistent with the Codex Standard 074-1981, rev. 2006, Processed Cereal-Based Foods for Infants and Young Children, the proposed level would be higher since 4400 mg/kg as phosphorus is stipulated in the Standard
14.1.2.2	Vegetable juice	<b>2,500</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Notes 33 & 88	<b>6</b>	<b>Comment</b> 1) Suggests harmonizing with the permitted level of 1000 mg/kg in fruit juices and nectars 2) reduce level to 1000 mg/kg and add notes 40 and 122 for consistency with provisions for fruit juices and nectars
14.1.2.4	Concentrates for vegetable juice	2,500	mg/kg	Notes 33 & 88	6	<b>Comment</b> 1) Suggests 1000 mg/kg 2) reduce level to 1000 mg/kg and add notes 40, 122 and 127 for consistency with provisions for fruit juices and nectars
14.1.3.2	Vegetable nectar	2,500	mg/kg	Notes 33 & 88	6	<b>Comment</b> Reduce level to 1000 mg/kg and add notes 40 and 122 for consistency with provisions for fruit juices and nectars
14.1.3.4	Concentrates for vegetable nectar	2,500	mg/kg	Notes 33 & 88	6	<b>Comment</b> Reduce level to 1000 mg/kg and add notes 40, 122 and 127 for consistency with provisions for fruit juices and nectars-
14.1.4	Water-based flavoured drinks, including "sport," "energy," or "electrolyte" drinks and particulated drinks	12,000	mg/kg	Note 33	6	<b>Comment</b> 1) ML seems very excessive. A ML of 500 mg/kg (as P) seems sufficient to achieve the technological function 2) We believe that the proposed ML is based on phosphates and not expressed as phosphorus (P, Note 33). Suggest adopting 3000 mg/kg as phosphorus (Note 33) based on the technological need of INS 452i. For all other phosphates, a maximum level of 1000 mg/kg as P would be sufficient 3) Maximum level should be changed to GMP, to meet the nutritional requirements of a particular country/region.
14.1.5	Coffee, coffee substitutes, tea, herbal infusions, and other hot cereal and grain beverages, excluding cocoa	880	mg/kg	Note 33	6	<b>Comment</b> Add note: "Only for coffee based drinks for vending machine, instant tea and instant herbal infusions"
14.2.7	Aromatized alcoholic beverages (e.g., beer, wine and spirituous cooler-type beverages, low alcoholic refreshers)	12,000	mg/kg	Notes 33 & 88	6	<b>Justification</b> This level, 12000 mg/kg, of phosphates is needed due to specific yeast growing conditions of the aromatized alcoholic beverage.
16.0	Composite foods - foods that could not be placed in categories 01 - 15	2,000	mg/kg	Note 33	6	<b>Comment</b> 1) Foodstuffs should be clearly defined 2) The amount of phosphate

<b>Recommendation 3 – Phosphates, INS 338, 339i-iii, 340i-iii, 341i-iii, 342i-ii, 343i-ii, 450i-iii, 450v-vii, 451i-ii, 452i-v, 542</b> The eWG of the 41 <sup>st</sup> CCFA recommended <b>further discussion</b> of the following food additive provisions for phosphates in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification/Comment
						needed depends on the specific food application. The maximum level should be changed to GMP, to meet the nutritional requirements of the particular country/region. 3) INS 341iii at ML 4366 mg/kg as anticaking agent for dehydrated composite foods

<b>Phosphates, INS 338, 339i-iii, 340i-iii, 341i-iii, 342i-ii, 343i-ii, 450i-iii, 450v-vii, 451i-ii, 452i-v, 542</b> The following provisions were included in the GSFA at Step 3 by the 41 <sup>st</sup> CCFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification/Comment
06.8.1	Soybean-based beverages	1,300	mg/kg	Note 33 <sup>6</sup>	3	
06.8.2	Soybean-based beverage film	35,000	mg/kg	Note 33	3	
06.8.3	Soybean curd (tofu)	35,000	mg/kg	<b>Note 33</b>	3	
06.8.4	Semi-dehydrated soybean curd	35,000	mg/kg	<b>Note 33</b>	3	
06.8.5	Dehydrated soybean curd (kori tofu)	35,000	mg/kg	<b>Note 33</b>	3	
06.8.6	Fermented soybeans (e.g., natto, tempe)	35,000	mg/kg	<b>Note 33</b>	3	
06.8.7	Fermented soybean curd	35,000	mg/kg	<b>Note 33</b>	3	
08.1.2	Fresh meat, poultry, and game, comminuted	2,200	mg/kg	Note 33	6	
12.9	Soybean-based seasonings and condiments	35,000	mg/kg	Note 33	3	
12.10	Protein products other than from soybeans	35,000	mg/kg	<b>Note 33</b>	3	

#### AMMONIUM SALTS OF PHOSPHATIDIC ACID (INS 442)

40. The 18<sup>th</sup> JECFA (1974) assigned an ADI of 30 mg/kg bw for ammonium salts of phosphatidic acid.

41. The Codex Class Names and International Numbering System for Food Additives (CAC/GL 36-1989) associates the technological purpose emulsifier with ammonium salts of phosphatidic acid.

<b>Recommendation 1 – Ammonium Salts of Phosphatidic Acid, INS 442</b> The eWG of the 41 <sup>st</sup> CCFA recommended <b>adoption</b> of the following food additive provisions for ammonium salts of phosphatidic acid in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification/Comment
01.7	Dairy-based desserts (e.g., pudding, fruit or flavoured yoghurt)	5000	mg/kg		6	<b>Justification</b> Consistent with Codex STAN 243-2003 (Fermented Milks (Flavoured, Heat Treated and Non-heat Treated): the use of additives belonging to the class "emulsifiers" is technologically justified in flavoured fermented milks and flavoured fermented milks heat treated after fermentation. Use is justified in the dairy portion. <b>Comment</b> Suggest adding note: INS 442 is not listed in Section 4 of CODEX STAN 243- Fermented Milks
03.0	Edible ices, including sherbet and sorbet	7500	mg/kg		6	

<sup>6</sup> Note 33: As phosphorus.

**CYCLODEXTRIN, BETA- (INS 459)**

42. The 44<sup>th</sup> JECFA (1995) assigned an ADI of 5 mg/kg bw for beta-cyclodextrin.

43. The Codex Class Names and International Numbering System for Food Additives (CAC/GL 36-1989) associates the technological purposes stabilizer, binder, and carrier with beta-cyclodextrin.

<b>Recommendation 1 – Cyclodextrin, beta-, INS 459</b> The eWG of the 41 <sup>st</sup> CCFA recommended <b>adoption</b> of the following food additive provisions for beta-cyclodextrin in the GSFA.						
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>Step</b>	<b>Justification/Comment</b>
06.4.3	Pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products	1000	mg/kg	<b>Note 153</b>	3	<b>Justification</b> Consistent with the Codex Standard 249-2006, Instant Noodles <b>Comment</b> For use in noodles only, not needed in pasta

**SUCROGLYCERIDES (INS 474)**

44. The 49<sup>th</sup> JECFA (1997) assigned an ADI of 30 mg/kg bw for sucroglycerides.

45. The Codex Class Names and International Numbering System for Food Additives (CAC/GL 36-1989) associates the technological purpose emulsifier with sucroglycerides.

<b>Recommendation 1 – Sucroglycerides, INS 474</b> The eWG for the 41 <sup>st</sup> CCFA recommended <b>adoption</b> of the following food additive provisions for sucroglycerides in the GSFA.						
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>Step</b>	<b>Justification/Comment</b>
13.6	Food supplements		GMP		6	
14.1.4	Water-based flavoured drinks, including "sport," "energy," or "electrolyte" drinks and particulated drinks	5000	mg/kg	<b>Note A</b>	6	<b>Comment</b> 1) Sucroglycerides are permitted for use at 5000 mg/kg in many countries, such as the ECMS, in non-alcoholic coconut, almond and aniseed-based drinks. At lower use levels in soft drinks (200 mg/kg), they also can be used as 1) alternate stabilisers, 2) to provide cloudiness in citrus drinks and 3) as substitutes or extenders of gum arabic. 2) Revise with Note "Only in non-alcoholic aniseed-based, coconut and almond drinks."
14.2.7	Aromatized alcoholic beverages (e.g., beer, wine and spirituous cooler-type beverages, low alcoholic refreshers)	5000	mg/kg		6	

**STEARYL CITRATE (INS 484)**

46. The 17<sup>th</sup> JECFA (1973) assigned an ADI of 50 mg/kg bw for stearyl citrate.

47. The Codex Class Names and International Numbering System for Food Additives (CAC/GL 36-1989) associates the technological purposes emulsifier and sequestrant with stearyl citrate.

<b>Recommendation 1 - Stearyl Citrate, INS 484</b> The eWG for the 41 <sup>st</sup> CCFA recommended <b>adoption</b> of the following food additive provisions for stearyl citrate in the GSFA.						
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>Step</b>	<b>Justification/Comment</b>
02.2.2	Fat spreads, dairy fat spreads and blended spreads	100	mg/kg	Note 15	3	<b>Comment</b> 1) Industry in Canada has indicated a technological need for this additive in margarine at this level of use 2) Not listed in CODEX STAN 253-2006, Dairy fat spreads

**SACCHARINS (INS 954 i - iv)**

48. The 41<sup>st</sup> JECFA (1993) assigned an ADI of 5 mg/kg bw for saccharins.

49. The Codex Class Names and International Numbering System for Food Additives (CAC/GL 36-1989) associates the technological purpose sweetener with saccharins.

<b>Recommendation 1 - Saccharins, INS 954 i-iv</b>						
The following food additive provisions for saccharins in the GSFA were recommended for <b>adoption</b> by the eWG of the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA (CX/FA 07/39/09 part 1) and were listed in FA/40 INF 01. However, these two provisions were unintentionally omitted from the report of the eWG of the 40 <sup>th</sup> CCFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification/Comments
14.1.3.4	Concentrates for vegetable nectar	300	mg/kg	Notes 127 & 161	6	

<b>Saccharins, INS 954 i-iv</b>						
The following provisions were included in the GSFA at Step 3 by the 41 <sup>st</sup> CCFA						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification/Comments
12.9.1	Fermented soybean paste (e.g., miso)	200	mg/kg		3	
12.9.2.1	Fermented soybean sauce	500	mg/kg		3	

**SUCRALOSE (TRICHLOROGALACTOSUCROSE) (INS 955)**

50. The 37<sup>st</sup> JECFA (1990) assigned an ADI of 15 mg/kg bw for sucralose.

51. The Codex Class Names and International Numbering System for Food Additives (CAC/GL 36-1989) associates the technological purpose sweetener with sucralose.

<b>Sucralose (Trichlorogalactosucrose), INS 955</b>						
The 41 <sup>st</sup> CCFA agreed to circulate for comment at Step 3 the following food additive provisions for sucralose in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification/Comments
01.5.2	Milk and cream powder analogues	400	mg/kg		3	

<b>Sucralose (Trichlorogalactosucrose), INS 955</b>						
The following provisions were included in the GSFA at Step 3 by the 41 <sup>st</sup> CCFA						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification/Comments
06.8.1	Soybean-based beverages	400	mg/kg		3	<b>Justification</b> To sweeten soybean-based beverages. This level is needed to sweeten the products which are consumed as is.

**ASPARTAME-ACESULFAME SALT (INS 962)**

52. The 55<sup>th</sup> JECFA (2000) concluded that the aspartame and acesulfame moieties are covered by the ADIs for aspartame (40 mg/kg bw) and acesulfame potassium (acesulfame K) (15 mg/kg bw).

53. The Codex Class Names and International Numbering System for Food Additives (CAC/GL 36-1989) associates the technological purpose sweetener with aspartame-acesulfame salt.

54. The report of the eWG to the 39<sup>th</sup> CCFA noted that the proposed draft acceptable maximum use levels for these provisions are currently expressed in the GSFA in terms of aspartame-acesulfame salt or equivalents of aspartame or acesulfame K.<sup>7</sup> Because JECFA concluded that the aspartame and acesulfame moieties in aspartame-acesulfame salt are included in the ADIs established for aspartame (INS 951) and acesulfame K (INS 950), the equivalent level of aspartame and acesulfame K from the use of the double salt should not exceed the individual maximum use level for aspartame or for acesulfame K.

55. The *ad hoc* Working Group on the GSFA to the 40<sup>th</sup> CCFA recommended, and the Committee agreed, to examine the provisions for the aspartame-acesulfame salt in order to ensure that these provisions are consistent with those for aspartame and for acesulfame K and are reported on a consistent basis.<sup>8</sup> As part of its mandate, the eWG established by the 40<sup>th</sup> CCFA was requested to develop recommendations for ensuring

<sup>7</sup> CX/FA 07/39/9.

<sup>8</sup> ALINORM 08/31/12, para 72.

consistency between the provisions for aspartame-acesulfame salt and those for aspartame and for acesulfame K.<sup>9</sup>

56. The eWG to the 41<sup>st</sup> CCFA considered an Options Paper that contained four approaches to resolve the issue of the reporting basis for aspartame-acesulfame salt.<sup>10</sup> Based upon the comments to the Options Paper, the eWG to the 41<sup>st</sup> CCFA recommended that the CCFA agree to the approach presented in para. 29 of CX/FA 09/41/6, namely: (i) to revise the text of Notes 113<sup>11</sup> and 119<sup>12</sup> as recommended, and (ii) to add new notes (i.e., Notes 188<sup>13</sup> and 191<sup>14</sup>) to all of the provisions for acesulfame K and aspartame, in order to ensure that combined use of aspartame-acesulfame salt and aspartame or acesulfame K would not lead to exceeding the maximum levels established for these sweeteners.<sup>15</sup> The 41<sup>st</sup> CCFA agreed with these recommendations.<sup>16</sup>

57. The 41<sup>st</sup> CCFA put forward a total of 16 aspartame-acesulfame salt provisions for adoption.

58. The following are the remaining proposed draft (Step 3) food additive provisions for aspartame-acesulfame salt presented in CX/FA 09/41/6. The provisions have been updated to correct errors to maximum use levels and notes that were not consistent with the approach outlined in the box above.

59. The *ad hoc* Working Group on the GSFA to the 39<sup>th</sup> CCFA agreed that sweeteners are technologically justified in the food categories<sup>17</sup> that are highlighted in gray.

<b>Recommendation 1 – Aspartame-Acesulfame Salt, INS 962</b>						
The eWG for the 41 <sup>st</sup> CCFA recommended that the following food additive provisions for aspartame-acesulfame salt be <b>included in the GSFA at Step 3</b> .						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification
14.1.3.1	Fruit nectar	350	mg/kg	Note 113		Both aspartame and acesulfame K have established maximum levels in this category in the GSFA. If the key components of the salt are permitted in a food category, there should be no reason to prevent the use of the salt of them
14.1.3.3	Concentrates for fruit nectar	350	mg/kg	Note 113 & Note 127		

<b>Recommendation 2 - Aspartame-Acesulfame Salt, INS 962</b>						
The eWG for the 41 <sup>st</sup> CCFA recommended <b>adoption</b> of the following food additive provisions for aspartame-acesulfame salt in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification provided to eWG
03.0	Edible ices, including sherbet and sorbet	1,000	mg/kg	Note 119 & Note 161	3	
04.1.2.6	Fruit-based spreads (e.g., chutney) excluding products of food category 04.1.2.5	1,000	mg/kg	Note 119 & Note 161	3	
06.3	Breakfast cereals, including rolled oats	1,000	mg/kg	Note 119 & Note 161	3	
10.4	Egg-based desserts (e.g., custard)	350	mg/kg	Note 113	3	

<sup>9</sup> ALINORM 08/31/12, para 78.

<sup>10</sup> The Options Paper was made available to all members of the eWG on the electronic forum and is not included in this report.

<sup>11</sup> **Note 113:** Use level reported as acesulfame potassium equivalents (the reported maximum level can be converted to an aspartame-acesulfame salt basis by dividing by 0.44). Combined use of aspartame-acesulfame salt with individual acesulfame potassium or aspartame should not exceed the individual maximum levels for acesulfame potassium or aspartame (the reported maximum level can be converted to aspartame equivalents by dividing by 0.68).

<sup>12</sup> **Note 119:** Use level reported as aspartame equivalents (the reported maximum level can be converted to an aspartame-acesulfame salt basis by dividing by 0.64). Combined use of aspartame-acesulfame salt with individual aspartame or acesulfame potassium should not exceed the individual maximum levels for aspartame or acesulfame potassium (the reported maximum level can be converted to ~~aspartame-acesulfame potassium~~ equivalents by ~~dividing~~ multiplying by 0.68).

<sup>13</sup> **Note 188:** Not to exceed the maximum use level for acesulfame potassium (INS 950) singly or in combination with aspartame-acesulfame salt (INS 962).

<sup>14</sup> **Note 191:** Not to exceed the maximum use level for aspartame (INS 951) singly or in combination with aspartame-acesulfame salt (INS 962).

<sup>15</sup> **N.B.:** Notes 188 and 191, which the 41<sup>st</sup> CCFA agreed to add to all provisions for acesulfame potassium and aspartame respectively, are relevant only in food categories that also contain provisions for the aspartame-acesulfame salt. It is therefore suggested that the Committee consider removing Notes 188 and 191 from acesulfame potassium and aspartame provisions in the GSFA which do not have a corresponding aspartame-acesulfame salt provision.

<sup>16</sup> ALINORM 09/32/12, para 95.

<sup>17</sup> 39<sup>th</sup> CCFA, CRD 1 App. V.

<b>Recommendation 2 - Aspartame-Acesulfame Salt, INS 962</b>						
The eWG for the 41 <sup>st</sup> CCFA recommended <b>adoption</b> of the following food additive provisions for aspartame-acesulfame salt in the GSFA.						
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>Step</b>	<b>Justification provided to eWG</b>
11.6	Table-top sweeteners, including those containing high-intensity sweeteners	GMP			3	
12.4	Mustards	350	mg/kg	Note 119 & Note 161	3	
12.5	Soups and broths	110	mg/kg	Note 113 & Note 161	3	
12.7	Salads (e.g., macaroni salad, potato salad) and sandwich spreads excluding cocoa- and nut-based spreads of food categories 04.2.2.5 and 05.1.3	350	mg/kg	Note 119 & Note 161	3	
13.3	Dietetic foods intended for special medical purposes (excluding products of food category 13.1)	500	mg/kg	Note 113	3	
13.6	Food supplements	2000	mg/kg	Note 113	3	
14.1.4	Water-based flavoured drinks, including "sport," "energy," or "electrolyte" drinks and particulated drinks	600	mg/kg	Note 119 & Note 161		
15.0	Ready-to-eat savouries	500	mg/kg	Note 119 & Note 161	3	

<b>Recommendation 4 – Aspartame-Acesulfame Salt, INS 962</b>						
The eWG for the 41 <sup>st</sup> CCFA recommended <b>further discussion</b> of the following food additive provisions for aspartame-acesulfame salt in the GSFA.						
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>Step</b>	<b>Justification/Comment</b>
01.3.2	Beverage whiteners	2,000	mg/kg	Note 113	3	<b>Comment</b> The use could mislead the consumer
01.4.4	Cream analogues	1,000	mg/kg	Note 119	3	<b>Comment</b> The use could mislead the consumer
01.5.2	Milk and cream powder analogues	1,000	mg/kg	Note 113	3	<b>Comment</b> The use could mislead the consumer
01.6.5	Cheese analogues	350	mg/kg	Note 113	3	<b>Comment</b> The use could mislead the consumer
02.3	Fat emulsions mainly of type oil-in-water, including mixed and/or flavoured products based on fat emulsions	1,000	mg/kg	Note 119	3	<b>Comment</b> The use could mislead the consumer, add note 161.
04.1.2.1	Frozen fruit	500	mg/kg	Note 113	3	<b>Comment</b> The use could mislead the consumer, add note 161,
04.1.2.2	Dried fruit	500	mg/kg	Note 113	3	<b>Comment</b> 1) There are existing provisions in the GSFA for the use of aspartame and acesulfame K in Food Category 04.1.2.2. Proposes revising the proposed ML to 500 mg/kg with the inclusion of Note 113 to reflect the ML for Acesulfame K in this Food Category. 2) The use could mislead the consumer
04.1.2.3	Fruit in vinegar, oil, or brine	200	mg/kg	Note 113 & Note 161	3	<b>Comment</b> The use could mislead the consumer
04.1.2.7	Candied fruit	500	mg/kg	Note 113	3	<b>Comment</b> Add Note 116
04.1.2.10	Fermented fruit products	350	mg/kg	Note 113	3	<b>Comment</b> Add Note 116

<b>Recommendation 4 – Aspartame-Acesulfame Salt, INS 962</b>						
The eWG for the 41 <sup>st</sup> CCFA recommended <b>further discussion</b> of the following food additive provisions for aspartame-acesulfame salt in the GSFA.						
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>Step</b>	<b>Justification/Comment</b>
04.1.2.11	Fruit fillings for pastries	350	mg/kg	Note 113	3	<b>Comment</b> 1) Industry in Canada has indicated a technological need for ace-K in this Category at a maximum level of 1000 mg/kg. Revise ML to 1000 mg/kg, consistent with Cat. 4.1.25 and 4.1.2.6, Jams and spreads 2) Add Note 116
04.1.2.12	Cooked fruit	500	mg/kg	Note 113	3	<b>Comment</b> Technical need questioned
04.2.2.4	Canned or bottled (pasteurized) or retort pouch vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds	350	mg/kg	Note 113	3	<b>Comment</b> Technical need questioned
04.2.2.5	Vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed purees and spreads (e.g., peanut butter)	1,000	mg/kg	Note 119	3	<b>Comment</b> 1) Industry in Canada has Indicated a technological need for aspartame at 2000 mg/kg in this Category. It is noted that there is provision at step 6 in the GSFA for aspartame with a ML of 3000 mg/kg in this food category. 2) Add note 161
04.2.2.7	Fermented vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and seaweed products, excluding fermented soybean products of food categories 06.8.6, 06.8.7, 12.9.1, 12.9.2.1 and 12.9.2.3	1,000	mg/kg	Note 113	3	<b>Comment</b> Add note 161
05.1.2	Cocoa mixes (syrops)	350	mg/kg	Note 113	3	<b>Comment</b> Add notes 97 and 161 for consistency with acesulfame potassium provision.
05.1.3	Cocoa-based spreads, including fillings	1,000	mg/kg	Note 113 & Note 161	3	<b>Comment</b> Industry in Canada has indicated a technological need for ace-K at 2500 mg/kg in confectionery.
05.1.4	Cocoa and chocolate products	500	mg/kg	Note 113 & Note 161	3	<b>Comment</b> Industry in Canada has indicated a technological need for ace-K at 2500 mg/kg in confectionery.
05.3	Chewing gum	5,000	mg/kg	Note 113 & Note 161	3	<b>Comment</b> The technological justification for such a high level is requested. A ML of 2000 mg/kg expressed as Acesulfame K should be sufficient to reach the desired effect.
05.4	Decorations (e.g., for fine bakery wares), toppings (non-fruit) and sweet sauces	500	mg/kg	Note 113	3	<b>Comment</b> Industry in Canada has indicated a technological need for ace-K at 1000 mg/kg in this Category.
06.5	Cereal and starch based desserts (e.g., rice pudding, tapioca pudding)	350	mg/kg	Note 113 & Note 161	3	<b>Comment</b> Industry in Canada has indicated a technological need for ace-K at 1000 mg/kg in desserts in general
07.1	Bread and ordinary bakery wares	1,000	mg/kg	Note 113	3	<b>Comment</b> 1) Possible intake will exceed ADI due to high consumption of such basic foodstuffs 2) Industry in Canada has indicated a technological need for ace-K in this Category.

<b>Recommendation 4 – Aspartame-Acesulfame Salt, INS 962</b>						
The eWG for the 41 <sup>st</sup> CCFA recommended <b>further discussion</b> of the following food additive provisions for aspartame-acesulfame salt in the GSFA.						
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>Step</b>	<b>Justification/Comment</b>
12.2.2	Seasonings and condiments	<b>2,000</b>	mg/kg	<b>Note 119</b>	3	<b>Comment</b> 1) Industry in Canada has indicated a technological need for aspartame at 2000 mg/kg , not ace-K, in condiments. 2) No technological need. The use could mislead the consumer 3) Add note 161
14.1.3.4	Concentrates for vegetable nectar	<b>350</b>	mg/kg	<b>Note 113 &amp; Note 127</b>	3	<b>Comment</b> Add note 161
14.1.5	Coffee, coffee substitutes, tea, herbal infusions, and other hot cereal and grain beverages, excluding cocoa	<b>600</b>	mg/kg	<b>Note 119</b>	3	<b>Comment</b> Use could mislead the consumer
14.2.1	Beer and malt beverages	790	mg/kg	<b>Note 113 &amp; Note 161</b>	3	<b>Comment</b> 1) The ML is too high. A ML of 350 mg/kg (as expressed as AcK) should be sufficient to reach the desire effect 2) There are no existing provisions in the GSFA for the use of aspartame or acesulfame K in food Category 14.2.1, the provision should be discontinued

## Notes

**Note 2:** On dry ingredient, dry weight, dry mix or concentrate basis.

**Note 4:** For decoration, stamping, marking or branding the product.

**Note 5:** Used in raw materials for manufacture of the finished food.

**Note 10:** As ascorbyl stearate.

**Note 15:** Fat or oil basis.

**Note 16:** For use in glaze, coatings or decorations for fruit, vegetables, meat or fish.

**Note 22:** For use in smoked fish products only.

**Note 27:** As para-hydroxybenzoic acid.

**Note 28:** ADI conversion: if a typical preparation contains 0.025 µg/U, then the ADI of 33 000 U/kg bw becomes:  $[(33\ 000\ \text{U/kg bw}) \times (0.025\ \mu\text{g/U}) \times (1\ \text{mg}/1\ 000\ \mu\text{g})] = 0.825\ \text{mg/kg bw}$ .

**Note 33:** As phosphorus.

**Note 34:** Anhydrous basis.

**Note 41:** Use in breading or batter coatings only.

**Note 42:** As sorbic acid.

**Note 50:** For use in fish roe only

**Note 52:** Excluding chocolate milk.

**Note 72:** Ready-to-eat basis.

**Note 76:** Use in potatoes only.

**Note 88:** Carryover from the ingredient.

**Note 92:** Excluding tomato-based sauces.

**Note 95:** For use in surimi and fish roe products only.

**Note 113:** Use level reported as acesulfame potassium equivalents (the reported maximum level can be converted to an aspartame-acesulfame salt basis by dividing by 0.44). Combined use of aspartame-acesulfame salt with individual acesulfame potassium or aspartame should not exceed the individual maximum levels for acesulfame potassium or aspartame (the reported maximum level can be converted to aspartame equivalents by dividing by 0.68).

**Note 116:** For use in doughs only.

**Note 117:** Except for use in loganiza (fresh, uncured sausage) at 1 000 mg/kg.



**Note 118:** Except for use in tocino (fresh, cured sausage) at 1 000 mg/kg.

**Note 119:** Use level reported as aspartame equivalents (the reported maximum level can be converted to an aspartame-acesulfame salt basis by dividing by 0.64). Combined use of aspartame-acesulfame salt with individual aspartame or acesulfame potassium should not exceed the individual maximum levels for aspartame or acesulfame potassium (the reported maximum level can be converted to acesulfame potassium equivalents by multiplying by 0.68).

**Note 127:** As served to the consumer.

**Note 130:** Singly or in combination: butylated hydroxyanisole (INS 320), butylated hydroxytoluene (INS 321), tertiary butylated hydroquinone (INS 319), and propyl gallate (INS 310).

**Note 153:** For use in instant noodles only.

**Note 160:** For use in ready-to-drink products and pre-mixes for ready-to-drink products only.

**Note 161:** Subject to national legislation of the importing country aimed, in particular, at consistency with Section 3.2 of the Preamble.

**Note 181:** Expressed as anthocyanin.

**Note 182:** Except for use in coconut milk.

**Note 183:** Products conforming to the Standard for chocolate and chocolate products [CODEX STAN 87-1981] may only use colours for surface decoration.

**Note 184:** For use in nutrient coated rice grains only.

**Note 188:** Not to exceed the maximum use level for acesulfame potassium (INS 950) singly or in combination with aspartame-acesulfame salt (INS 962).

**Note 191:** Not to exceed the maximum use level for aspartame (INS 951) singly or in combination with aspartame-acesulfame salt (INS 962).

**Note A: For use in non-alcoholic aniseed-based, coconut and almond drinks only.**

**Note AA: Excluding rolled oats.**

## APPENDIX

The use of colours in the food categories listed in the table below is technologically justified. The use of colours in other food categories should be considered on a case-by-case basis. The list of food categories in this Appendix is intended to be used as a working document during the CCFA's discussions of food additive colours.

<b>Appendix</b>		
<b>GSFA Categories in which the use of one or more colours is technologically justified</b>		
<b>FCS No.</b>	<b>Title</b>	<b>Justification</b>
01.1.2	Dairy-based drinks, flavoured and/or fermented (e.g., chocolate milk, cocoa, eggnog, drinking yoghurt, whey-based drinks)	Include because the CCMMP is revising the standard for fermented milk drinks that will likely contain provisions for colours.
01.3.2	Beverage whiteners	Include because there are adopted provisions for colours in these GSFA food categories
01.4.4	Cream analogues	
01.5.2	Milk and cream powder analogues	
01.6.1	Unripened cheese	
01.6.2	Ripened cheese	Include because CODEX STANs 275-1973, A-6-1978, 221-2001 and the draft mozzarella standard contain provisions for colours
01.6.2.1	Ripened cheese, includes rind	
01.6.2.2	Rind of ripened cheese	
01.6.2.3	Cheese powder (for reconstitution; e.g., for cheese sauces)	
01.6.4	Processed cheese	Include because CODEX STANs A-8(a)-1978, A-8(b)-1978 and A-8(c)-1978 contains provisions for colours that apply to these food categories
01.6.4.1	Plain processed cheese	
01.6.4.2	Flavoured processed cheese, including containing fruit, vegetables, meat, etc.	
01.6.5	Cheese analogues	
01.7	Dairy-based desserts (e.g., pudding, fruit or flavoured yoghurt)	Include because there are provisions for colours adopted for this GSFA food category
02.1.3	Lard, tallow, fish oil, and other animal fats	Include because CODEX STAN 19-1978 contains provisions for colours that apply to this food category
02.2.1	Emulsions containing at least 80% fat	Add at request of European Commission
02.2.1.1 <sup>18</sup>	Butter and concentrated butter	Include because CODEX STAN 1-1985 contains provisions for colours that apply to this food category
02.2.1.2	Margarine and similar products	
02.2.1.3	Blends of butter and margarine	
02.2.2	Emulsions containing less than 80% fat	
02.3	Fat emulsions mainly of type oil-in-water, including mixed and/or flavoured products based on fat emulsions	
02.4	Fat-based desserts excluding dairy-based dessert products of food category 01.7	
03.0	Edible ices, including sherbet and sorbet	Include with Notes 4 <sup>19</sup> and 16 <sup>20</sup>
04.1.1.2	Surface-treated fresh fruit	
04.1.2.2	Dried fruit	Include because of the following justification: due to the effect of temperature during processing and storage affecting the discolouration of the dried fruit. Dried fruit will lose original natural flesh colour in processing and aging
04.1.2.3	Fruit in vinegar, oil, or brine	Include because there are adopted provisions for colours in this GSFA food category
04.1.2.4	Canned or bottled (pasteurized) fruit	Include because CODEX STANs 60-1981, 61-1985, 78-1981, 99-1981, 159-1987, and 242-2003 all contain provisions for colours that apply to this food category
04.1.2.5	Jams, jellies, marmalades	Include because CODEX STANs 79-1981 and 80-1981 contain provisions for colours and there are adopted provisions for colours in these GSFA food categories
04.1.2.6	Fruit-based spreads (e.g., chutney) excluding products of food category 04.1.2.5	
04.1.2.7	Candied fruit	
04.1.2.8	Fruit preparations, including pulp, purees, fruit toppings and coconut milk	
04.1.2.9	Fruit-based desserts, incl. fruit-flavoured water-based desserts	
04.1.2.10	Fermented fruit products	
04.1.2.11	Fruit fillings for pastries	
04.1.2.12	Cooked fruit	

<sup>18</sup> CX/FA 08/40/6 proposes to revise the GSFA food category system. If endorsed by the CCFA, food categories 02.2.1.1, 02.2.1.2 and 02.2.1.3 would be deleted.

<sup>19</sup> **Note 4:** For decoration, stamping, marking or branding the product.

<sup>20</sup> **Note 16:** for use in glaze, coatings or decorations for fruit, vegetables, meat or fish.

Appendix		
GSFA Categories in which the use of one or more colours is technologically justified		
FCS No.	Title	Justification
04.2.1.2	Surface-treated fresh vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds	Include with Notes 4 and 16
04.2.2.2	Dried vegetables, (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds	Include because of the following justification: due to the effect of temperature during processing and storage affecting the discolouration of the dried fruit. Dried fruit will lose original natural flesh colour in processing and aging
04.2.2.3	Vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds in vinegar, oil, brine, or soy sauce	Include because CODEX STANs 55-1981, 58-1981, 81-1981, and 115-1981 contain provisions for colours and there are adopted provisions for colours in these GSFA food categories
04.2.2.4	Canned or bottled (pasteurized) or retort pouch vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds	
04.2.2.5	Vegetable, (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed purees and spreads (e.g., peanut butter)	
04.2.2.6	Vegetable, (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed pulps and preparations (e.g., vegetable desserts and sauces, candied vegetables) other than food category 04.2.2.5	
04.2.2.7	Fermented vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and seaweed products, excluding fermented soybean products of food category 12.10	
04.2.2.8	Cooked or fried vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds	
05.1.2	Cocoa mixes (syrups)	
05.1.3	Cocoa-based spreads, incl. fillings	
05.1.4	Cocoa and chocolate products	
05.1.5	Imitation chocolate, chocolate substitute products	
05.2	Confectionery including hard and soft candy, nougats, etc. other than food categories 05.1, 05.3, and 05.4	
05.2.1	Hard candy	
05.2.2	Soft candy	
05.2.3	Nougats and marzipans	
05.3	Chewing gum	
05.4	Decorations (e.g., for fine bakery wares), toppings (non-fruit), and sweet sauces	
06.1	Whole, broken, or flaked grain, including rice	Include with Note 184 <sup>21</sup>
06.3	Breakfast cereals, including rolled oats	Include because CODEX STANs 55-1981, 58-1981, 81-1981, and 115-1981 contain provisions for colours and there are adopted provisions for colours in these GSFA food categories
06.4.3	Pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products	Include because CODEX STAN 249-206 (Instant Noodles) contains colour provisions
06.5	Cereal and starch based desserts (e.g., rice pudding, tapioca pudding)	Include because there are adopted provisions for colours in these GSFA food categories
06.6	Batters (e.g., for breading or batters for fish or poultry)	
06.7	Pre-cooked or processed rice products, including rice cakes (Oriental type only)	
06.8	Soybean products (excluding soybean products of food category 12.9 and fermented soybean products of food category 12.10)	
07.1.2	Crackers, excluding sweet crackers	Include because there are adopted provisions for colours in these GSFA food categories
07.1.4	Bread-type products, including bread stuffing and bread crumbs	
07.2	Fine bakery wares (sweet, salty, savoury) and mixes	
07.2.1	Cakes, cookies and pies (e.g., fruit-filled or custard types)	
07.2.2	Other fine bakery products (e.g., doughnuts, sweet rolls, scones, and muffins)	
07.2.3	Mixes for fine bakery wares (e.g., cakes, pancakes)	
08.1	Fresh meat, poultry and game	Include with Notes 4 & 16
08.1.1	Fresh meat, poultry and game, whole pieces or cuts	
08.1.2	Fresh meat, poultry and game, comminuted	

<sup>21</sup> **Note 184:** For use in nutrient coated rice grains only.

<b>Appendix</b>		
<b>GSFA Categories in which the use of one or more colours is technologically justified</b>		
<b>FCS No.</b>	<b>Title</b>	<b>Justification</b>
08.2	Processed meat, poultry, and game products in whole pieces or cuts	Include with Note 16
08.2.1	Non-heat treated processed meat, poultry, and game products in whole pieces or cuts	
08.2.1.1	Cured (including salted) non-heat treated processed meat, poultry, and game products in whole pieces or cuts	
08.2.1.2	Cured (including salted) and dried non-heat treated processed meat, poultry, and game products in whole pieces or cuts	
08.2.1.3	Fermented non-heat treated processed meat, poultry, and game products in whole pieces or cuts	
08.2.2	Heat-treated processed meat, poultry, and game products in whole pieces or cuts	
08.2.3	Frozen processed meat, poultry, and game products in whole pieces or cuts	
08.3	Processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	
08.3.1	Non-heat treated processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	
08.3.1.1	Cured (including salted) non-heat treated processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	
08.3.1.2	Cured (including salted) and dried non-heat treated processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	
08.3.1.3	Fermented non-heat treated processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	
08.3.2	Heat-treated processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	
08.3.3	Frozen processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	
08.4	Edible casings (e.g., sausage casings)	
09.1	Fresh fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	Include with Notes 4 & 16
09.1.1	Fresh fish	
09.1.2	Fresh mollusks, crustaceans and echinoderms	
09.2	Processed fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	Include because there are adopted provisions for colours in this GSFA food category
09.2.1	Frozen fish, fish fillets, and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	Include with Note 95 <sup>22</sup>
09.2.2	Frozen battered fish, fish fillets and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	Include with Note 16
09.2.3	Frozen minced and creamed fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	Include with Note 95
09.2.4	Cooked and/or fried fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	Include because there are adopted provisions for colours in this GSFA food category
09.2.4.1	Cooked fish and fish products	Include with Note 95
09.2.4.2	Cooked mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	Include because there are adopted provisions for colours in this GSFA food category
09.2.4.3	Fried fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	Include with Note 16
09.2.5	Smoked, dried, fermented, and/or salted fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	Include because there are adopted provisions for colours in these GSFA food categories
09.3	Semi-preserved fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	Include with Note 16
09.3.1	Fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms, marinated and/or in jelly	
09.3.2	Fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms, pickled and/or in brine	
09.3.3	Salmon substitutes, caviar, and other fish roe products	Include because there are adopted provisions for colours in this GSFA food category
09.3.4	Semi-preserved fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms (e.g., fish paste), excluding products of food categories 09.3.1 - 09.3.3	Include because there are adopted provisions for colours in this GSFA food category
09.4	Fully preserved, including canned or fermented fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	Include with Note 95
10.1	Fresh eggs	Include with Note 4
10.3	Preserved eggs, including alkaline, salted, and canned eggs	Include with Note 4 (For decoration stamping, marking or branding the product)
10.4	Egg-based desserts (e.g., custard)	Include because there are adopted provisions for colours in this GSFA food category
11.4	Other sugars and syrups (e.g., xylose, maple syrup, sugar toppings)	

<sup>22</sup> **Note 95:** For use in surimi and fish roe products only.

Appendix			
GSFA Categories in which the use of one or more colours is technologically justified			
FCS No.	Title	Justification	
12.2.2	Seasonings and condiments	Include because CODEX STAN 117-1981 contains provisions for colours and there are adopted provisions for colours in this GSFA food category	
12.3	Vinegars		
12.4	Mustards		
12.5	Soups and broths		
12.5.1	Ready-to-eat soups and broths, including canned, bottled, and frozen		
12.5.2	Mixes for soups and broths		
12.6	Sauces and like products		
12.6.1	Emulsified sauces (e.g., mayonnaise, salad dressing)		
12.6.2	Non-emulsified sauces (e.g., ketchup, cheese sauce, cream sauce, brown gravy)		
12.6.3	Mixes for sauces and gravies		
12.6.4	Clear sauces (e.g., fish sauce)		
12.7	Salads (e.g., macaroni salad, potato salad) and sandwich spreads excluding cocoa-and nut-based spreads of food categories 04.2.2.5 and 05.1.3		
12.9	Protein products		Include because there are adopted provisions for colours in this GSFA food category
12.9.1	Soybean protein products		
12.9.1.1	Soybean beverage		
12.9.1.2	Soybean beverage film		
12.9.1.3	Other soybean protein products (including non-fermented soy sauce)		
12.9.2	Fresh bean curd (tofu)		
12.9.3	Semi-dehydrated bean curd		
12.9.3.1	Thick gravy-stewed semi-dehydrated bean curd		
12.9.3.2	Deep fried semi-dehydrated bean curd		
12.9.3.3	Semi-dehydrated bean curd, other than food categories 12.9.3.1 and 12.9.3.2		
12.9.4	Dehydrated bean curd (kori tofu)		
12.9.5	Other protein products		
12.10	Fermented soybean products		
12.10.1	Fermented soybeans (e.g., natto)		
12.10.2	Fermented soybean curd (soybean cheese)		
12.10.3	Fermented soybean paste (e.g., miso)		
12.10.4	Fermented soy sauce		
13.3	Dietetic foods intended for special medical purposes (excluding products of food category 13.1)	Include because there are adopted provisions for colours in this GSFA food category	
13.4	Dietetic formulae for slimming purposes and weight reduction		
13.5	Dietetic foods (e.g., supplementary foods for dietary use) excluding products of food categories 13.1- 13.4 and 13.6		
13.6	Food supplements		
14.1.4	Water-based flavoured drinks, including "sport," "energy," or "electrolyte" drinks and particulated drinks		
14.1.4.1	Carbonated water-based flavoured drinks		
14.1.4.2	Non-carbonated water-based flavoured drinks, including punches and ades		
14.1.4.3	Concentrates (liquid or solid) for water-based flavoured drinks		
14.1.5	Coffee, coffee substitutes, tea, herbal infusions, and other hot cereal and grain beverages, excluding cocoa		Include based on the following justifications. 1) Caramel colour, flavours and caffeine are dried on maltodextrin, which is added to dried coffee, in order to make an extended mix which is used as a coffee substitute in Russia (e.g. by the Russian military). 2) This category includes canned coffees that are served hot. The use of caramel colour is technologically justified in such products due to a specific manufacturing method (retort sterilization) that may change the colour during processing. Caramel colour is added to provide a consistent colour of the product that is expected by consumers. Such coffees are widely marketed in Japan. Include with Note 160 <sup>23</sup>
14.2.1	Beer and malt beverages		Include because there are adopted provisions for colours in this GSFA food category
14.2.2	Cider and perry		

<sup>23</sup> **Note 160:** For use in ready-to-drink products and pre-mixes for ready-to-drink products only.

<b>Appendix</b>		
<b>GSFA Categories in which the use of one or more colours is technologically justified</b>		
<b>FCS No.</b>	<b>Title</b>	<b>Justification</b>
14.2.3.3	Fortified grape wine, grape liquor wine, and sweet grape wine	
14.2.4	Wines (other than grape)	
14.2.6	Distilled spirituous beverages containing more than 15% alcohol	
14.2.7	Aromatized alcoholic beverages (e.g., beer, wine and spirituous cooler-type beverages, low-alcoholic refreshers)	
15.0	Ready-to-eat savouries	
15.1	Snacks - potato, cereal, flour or starch based (from roots and tubers, pulses and legumes)	
15.2	Processed nuts, including coated nuts and nut mixtures (with e.g., dried fruit)	
15.3	Snacks - fish based	