CODEX ALIMENTARIUS COMMISSION E

Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations

World Health Organization

Viale delle Terme di Caracalla, 00153 Rome, Italy - Tel: (+39) 06 57051 - Fax: (+39) 06 5705 4593 - E-mail: codex@fao.org - www.codexalimentarius.net

Agenda Item 5(b) **CX/FA 11/43/8**

November 2010

JOINT FAO/WHO FOOD STANDARDS PROGRAMME

CODEX COMMITTEE ON FOOD ADDITIVES

Forty-third Session

Xiamen (Fujian Province), China, 14-18 March 2011

PROPOSED DRAFT FOOD ADDITIVE PROVISIONS (NEW AND REVISED) OF THE GSFA

(Prepared by the United States of America with the assistance of Costa Rica, European Union, Indonesia, Japan, Malaysia, Norway, Paraguay, Switzerland, Thailand, United Kingdom, United States of America, CEFS, CIAA, ICBA, ICGMA, IFAC, IFU and ISA)

Governments and international organizations in Observer status with the Codex Alimentarius Commission wishing to submit comments at Step 3 on provision listed in Appendix 1 to this document are invited to do so **no later than 31 January 2011** as follows: Secretariat, Codex Committee on Food Additives, National Institute of Nutrition and Food Safety, China CDC, 7 Panjiayuan Nanli, Chaoyang District, Beijing 100021, China (Telefax: + 86 10 67711813, E-mail: secretariat@ccfa.cc ***preferably***), with a copy to the Secretary, Codex Alimentarius Commission, Joint FAO/WHO Food Standards Programme, Viale delle Terme di Caracalla, 00153 Rome, Italy (Telefax: +39.06.5705.4593; E-mail: Codex@fao.org - ***preferably***).

1. The 42nd Session of the Codex Committee on Food Additives (CCFA) agreed to establish an electronic Working Group (eWG) on the General Standards of Food Additives (GSFA), to be led by the United States of America (USA) open to all Members and Observers, and working in English, to prepare a report containing recommendations on provisions for the following food additives: a) lauric arginate ethyl ester (INS 243), b) steviol glycosides (INS 960), c) sulfites (INS 220-225, 227, 228, 539); and d) erythrosine (INS 127)[1] for circulation for comments and consideration at its next session,

2. The eWG was tasked to prepare:

   a. Proposed draft provisions for lauric arginate ethyl ester (INS 243) and steviol glycosides (INS 960) based on the written comments submitted in response to CL 2009/7-FA, Part B, Point 6 and the compilation attached to the report of the Physical Working Group (WG) (CRD 2, Appendices 5 and 6, respectively) for circulation and comment at Step 3.[2]

   b. Proposals for the revision of the maximum levels of sulfites (INS 220-225, 227, 228, 539) in the GSFA based on written comments submitted in response to CL 2009-7/FA, Part B, Point 6, and the compilation attached to the Report of the Physical WG (CRD 2, Appendix 7), paying particular attention to reducing the maximum use levels of sulfites in those food categories that are major contributors to the exposure in certain subpopulations, and taking into account the outcome of the 69th Session of the Joint FAO/WHO Expert Committee on Food Additives (JECFA) exposure assessment, and should not consider any new uses. The proposals will be circulated for comment at Step 3.[3]

[1] ALINORM 10/33/12 paras. 104 and 146
[2] ALINORM 10/33/12, paras. 65 – 67
[3] ALINORM 10/33/12, paras. 68 and 69.

c. Recommendations for all provisions of erythrosine (INS 127) in the Step process, including those that were returned to the CCFA by the 32nd Session of the Commission, taking into account the latest JECFA exposure assessment, and information submitted in reply to CL 2009/7-FA, Part B, Point 9 for consideration by the Physical WG prior to the 43rd Session.[4]

3. The provisions for each food additive in this report are grouped by the recommendations of the eWG in an Appendix format for consideration by the CCFA. These recommendations are based on comments submitted by the participants of the eWG. The recommendations do not necessarily reflect a unanimous opinion of the eWG members. Rather, the recommendations reflect an attempt to reach consensus to facilitate the Committee's discussion. The eWG considered comments on a "weight of evidence" approach; that is, comments containing justifications with supporting evidence were given more weight than comments with no supporting justification.

4. The appendices to this report are as follows

a. **Appendix 1**: Provisions for lauric ethyl arginate ester (INS 243), steviol glycosides (INS 960), sulfites (INS 220-225, 227, 228, 539) and erythrosine (INS 127) **circulated for comment at Step 3**.

b. **Appendix 2**: Provisions for lauric ethyl arginate ester (INS 243), steviol glycosides (INS 960) sulfites (INS 220-225, 227, 228, 539) and erythrosine (INS 127) for which the eWG could not reach consensus and for which the eWG recommends that the Physical WG of the 43rd CCFA **discuss further**.

c. **Appendix 3**: Provisions for steviol glycosides (INS 960), sulfites (INS 220-225, 227, 228, 539) and erythrosine (INS 127) for which the eWG recommends that the Committee **stop further work, revocation or discontinuation**.

5. The justifications considered by the eWG to reach consensus for the recommendations for each food additive provision are summarized in the "Justification/Comment" column in the tables in the Appendices for each food additive provision.

[4] ALINORM 10/33/12, para. 146.

Appendix 1

PROPOSED DRAFT FOOD ADDITIVE PROVISIONS (NEW AND REVISED) OF THE GSFA

For comments at Step 3

Based on the deliberations of the eWG, the following food additive provisions for lauric arginate ethyl ester (INS 243) and steviol glycosides (INS 960), sulfites (INS 220-225, 227, 228, 539) and erythrosine (INS 127) **are circulated for comment at Step 3**.

Please Note:

The proposals for sulfites are for the revision of the maximum use levels of sulfites (all adopted) in the GSFA; the proposals are aimed at reducing the maximum use levels of sulfites in those food categories that are major contributors to the exposure in certain subpopulations.

The proposals for erythrosine are for the revision of the maximum use levels of erythrosine (in the Step process) in the GSFA.

Lauric arginate ethyl ester (INS 243)					
Food Cat No	**Food Category**	**Max Level**	**Comments**	**Source of Max Level**	**Justification/Comment**
01.6.1	Unripened cheese	200 mg/kg		USA	Enter Step 3 based on technological need. Lauric arginate ethyl ester (LAEE) has been demonstrated to restrain the growth of microorganisms and guarantee the safety of the shelf life of the product at this level.
01.6.2.1	Ripened cheese, includes rind	200 mg/kg		USA	Enter Step 3 based on technological need. Presence of LAEE has been shown to prevent growth of pathogenic microorganisms during ripening of cheese at this level.
01.6.3	Whey cheese	200 mg/kg		USA	Enter Step 3 based on technological need.
01.6.4	Processed cheese	200 mg/kg		USA	Enter Step 3 based on technological need. LAEE has been shown to have good sporicidal activity in contrast to other preservatives at this level.
01.6.5	Cheese analogues	200 mg/kg		USA	Enter Step 3 based on technological need.
01.7	Dairy-based desserts (e.g., pudding, fruit or flavoured yoghurt)	200 mg/kg		USA	Enter Step 3 based on technological need. The use of LAEE in dairy-based products like creams improves product shelf-life at this level
02.2.2	Fat spreads, dairy fat spreads and blended spreads	200 mg/kg		USA	Enter Step 3 based on technological need.
04.1.2.2	Dried fruit	200 mg/kg		USA	Enter Step 3 based on technological need.
04.1.2.11	Fruit fillings for pastries	200 mg/kg		USA	Enter Step 3 based on technological need.

Lauric arginate ethyl ester (INS 243)					
Food Cat No	**Food Category**	**Max Level**	**Comments**	**Source of Max Level**	**Justification/Comment**
04.2.1.2	Surface-treated fresh vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds and nuts and seeds	200 mg/kg		USA	Enter Step 3 based on technological need.
04.2.1.3	Peeled, cut or shredded fresh vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds and nuts and seeds	200 mg/kg		USA	Enter Step 3 based on technological need.
04.2.2.3	Vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds in vinegar, oil, brine, or soybean sauce	200 mg/kg		USA	Enter Step 3 based on technological need.
05.1.3	Cocoa-based spreads, including fillings	200 mg/kg		USA	Enter Step 3 based on technological need.
05.3	Chewing gum	225 mg/kg		ICGMA	Enter Step 3 based on technological need.
06.5	Cereal and starch based desserts (e.g., rice pudding, tapioca pudding)	200 mg/kg		USA	Enter Step 3 based on technological need.
10.2	Egg products	200 mg/kg		USA	Enter Step 3 based on technological need. Efficacy studies performed by LAMIRSA have shown effectiveness of LAEE against *Salmonella typhymurium* in egg products.
10.4	Egg-based desserts (e.g., custards)	200 mg/kg		USA	Enter Step 3 based on technological need. Efficacy studies performed by LAMIRSA have shown effectiveness of LAEE against *Salmonella typhymurium* in egg products.
12.2.2	Seasonings and condiments	200 mg/kg		USA	
12.5.1	Ready-to-eat soups and broths, including canned, bottled and frozen	200 mg/kg		USA	Enter Step 3 based on technological need. Microbial growth may be prevented by adding LAEE as an effective inhibitor of the growth of microorganisms.
12.5.2	Mixes for soups and broths	200 mg/kg	Note 127[5]	USA	

[5] **Note 127**: As served to the consumer.

Lauric arginate ethyl ester (INS 243)					
Food Cat No	**Food Category**	**Max Level**	**Comments**	**Source of Max Level**	**Justification/Comment**
12.6.1	Emulsified sauces (e.g., mayonnaise, salad dressings)	200 mg/kg		USA	Enter Step 3 based on technological need. Microbial growth may be prevented by adding LAEE as an effective inhibitor of the growth of microorganisms.
12.6.2	Non-emulsified sauces (e.g., ketchup, cheese sauce, cream sauce, brown gravy)	200 mg/kg		USA	Enter Step 3 based on technological need. Microbial growth may be prevented by adding LAEE as an effective inhibitor of the growth of microorganisms.
12.7	Salads (e.g., macaroni salad, potato) and sandwich spreads excluding cocoa-and nut-based spreads of food categories 04.2.2.5 and 05.1.3	200 mg/kg		USA	Enter Step 3 based on technological need.
14.1.4.1	Carbonated water-based flavoured drinks	50 mg/kg		USA	Enter Step 3 based on technological need.
14.1.4.2	Non-carbonated water-based flavoured drinks, including punches and ades	50 mg/kg		USA	Enter Step 3 based on technological need.
14.1.4.3	Concentrates (liquid or solid) for water-based flavoured drinks (Comment: Note 127)	50 mg/kg	Note 127	USA	Enter Step 3 based on technological need.
14.1.2.2	Vegetable juice	200 mg/kg		USA	USA notes that the GSFA already includes provision for the use of sulfites in category 14.1.2.2. In this respect, the principle of the use of antimicrobials in this food category has already been accepted by Codex.
14.1.2.3	Concentrates for fruit juice	200 mg/kg		USA	USA notes that the GSFA already includes provision for the use of benzoates, sorbates and sulfites in category 14.1.2.3. In this respect, the principle of the use of antimicrobials in this food y category has already been accepted by Codex.

Steviol glycosides (INS 960)					
Food Cat No	**Food Category**	**Max Level**	**Comments**	**Source of Max Level**	**Justification/Comment**
01.1	Milk and dairy based drinks	200 mg/kg	Note X[6]	ICGMA	Enter GSFA at Step 3 at 200 mg/kg as steviol equivalent based on technological need
01.1.2	Dairy-based drinks, flavoured and/or fermented (e.g., chocolate milk, cocoa, eggnog, drinking yoghurt, whey-based drinks)	200 mg/kg	Note X	Costa Rica, ICBA, IDF, IFAC, Malaysia, USA	Enter GSFA at Step 3 at 200 mg/kg as steviol equivalent based on technological need
01.2	Fermented and renneted milk products (plain) excluding food category 01.1.2 (dairy-based drinks)	200 mg/kg	Note X	ICGMA	Enter GSFA at Step 3 at 200 mg/kg as steviol equivalent based on technological need
01.2.1	Fermented milks (plain)	330 mg/kg	Note X	USA	Enter GSFA at Step 3 at 330 mg/kg as steviol equivalent based on technological need
01.5.2	Milk and cream powder analogues	330 mg/kg	Note X	Philippines	Enter GSFA at Step 3 at 330 mg/kg as steviol equivalent based on technological need
01.7	Dairy-based desserts (e.g., pudding, fruit or flavoured yoghurt)	330 mg/kg	Note X	ICGMA, IFAC, USA	Enter GSFA at Step 3 at 330 mg/kg as steviol equivalent based on technological need
02.4	Fat-based desserts excluding dairy-based dessert products of food category 01.7	330 mg/kg	Note X	ICGMA, IFAC, USA	Enter GSFA at Step 3 at 330 mg/kg as steviol equivalent based on technological need
03.0	Edible ices, including sherbet and sorbet	270 mg/kg	Note X	ICGMA, IFAC, USA, Philippines	Enter GSFA at Step 3 at 270 mg/kg as steviol equivalent based on technological need
04.1.2.1	Frozen Fruit	40 mg/kg	Notes X & 161[7]	Australia	Enter GSFA at Step 3 at 40 mg/kg as steviol equivalent with addition of Note 161 based on technological need
04.1.2.2	Dried fruit	40 mg/kg	Notes X & 161	Australia	Enter GSFA at Step 3 at 40mg/kg as steviol equivalent with the addition of Note 161 based on technological need
04.1.2.3	Fruit in vinegar, oil, or brine	100 mg/kg	Notes X & 161	ICGMA, IFAC	Enter GSFA at Step 3 at 100 mg/kg as steviol equivalent with the addition of Note 161 based on technological need
04.1.2.4	Canned or bottled (pasteurized) fruit	330 mg/kg	Note X	ICGMA, IFAC, USA	Enter GSFA at Step 3 at 330 mg/kg as steviol equivalent based on technological need

[6] **Note X:** As steviol equivalents.
[7] **Note 161:** Subject to national legislation of the importing country aimed, in particular, at consistency with Section 3.2 of the Preamble.

Steviol glycosides (INS 960)					
Food Cat No	**Food Category**	**Max Level**	**Comments**	**Source of Max Level**	**Justification/Comment**
04.1.2.5	Jams, jellies, marmelades	360 mg/kg	Note X	ICGMA, IFAC, USA, Philippines	Use level revised. Enter GSFA at Step 3 at 360 mg/kg as steviol equivalent based on technological need
04.1.2.6	Fruit-based spreads (e.g., chutney) excluding products of food category 04.1.2.5	330 mg/kg	Note X	IFAC, USA, Philippines	Enter GSFA at Step 3 at 330 mg/kg as steviol equivalent based on technological need
04.1.2.7	Candied fruit	40 mg/kg	Note X	Australia	Enter GSFA at Step 3 at 40 mg/kg as steviol equivalent based on technological need
04.1.2.8	Fruit preparations, including pulp, purees, fruit toppings and coconut milk	330 mg/kg	Note X	ICGMA, IFAC, USA	Enter GSFA at Step 3 at 330 mg/kg as steviol equivalent based on technological need
04.1.2.9	Fruit-based desserts, incl. fruit-flavoured water-based desserts	350 mg/kg	Note X	ICGMA, IFAC, USA	Use level revised. Enter GSFA at Step 3 at 350 mg/kg as steviol equivalent based on technological need
04.1.2.10	Fermented fruit products	115 mg/kg	Note X	Philippines	Enter GSFA at Step 3 at 115 mg/kg as steviol equivalent based on technological need
04.1.2.11	Fruit fillings for pastries	330 mg/kg	Note X	ICGMA, IFAC, USA	Enter GSFA at Step 3 at 330 mg/kg as steviol equivalent based on technological need
04.1.2.12	Cooked fruit	40 mg/kg	Note X	Australia	Enter GSFA at Step 3 at 40 mg/kg steviol equivalent based on technological need
04.2.2	Processed vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds	40 mg/kg	Note X	Australia	Enter GSFA at Step 3 at 40 mg/kg steviol equivalent based on technological need
04.2.2.1	Frozen vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds	40 mg/kg	Note X	Australia	Enter GSFA at Step 3 at 40 mg/kg steviol equivalent based on technological need
04.2.2.2	Dried vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds	40 mg/kg	Note X	Australia	Enter GSFA at Step 3 at 40 mg/kg steviol equivalent based on technological need

Steviol glycosides (INS 960)					
Food Cat No	**Food Category**	**Max Level**	**Comments**	**Source of Max Level**	**Justification/Comment**
04.2.2.3	Vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds in vinegar, oil, brine, or soybean sauce	330 mg/kg	Note X	USA	Enter GSFA at Step 3 at 330 mg/kg as steviol equivalent based on technological need
04.2.2.4	Canned or bottled (pasteurized) or retort pouch vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds	70 mg/kg	Note X	USA, Philippines	Enter GSFA at Step 3 at 70 mg/kg steviol equivalent based on technological need
04.2.2.5	Vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed purees and spreads (e.g., peanut butter)	330 mg/kg	Note X	ICGMA, IFAC, USA, Philippines	Enter GSFA at Step 3 at 330 mg/kg as steviol equivalent based on technological need
04.2.2.6	Vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed pulps and preparations (e.g., vegetable desserts and sauces, candied vegetables) other than food category 04.2.2.5	165 mg/kg	Note X	USA	Enter GSFA at Step 3 at 165 mg/kg as steviol equivalent based on technological need
04.2.2.7	Fermented vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweed products, excluding fermented soybean products of food categories 06.8.6, 06.8.7, 12.9.1, 12.9.2.1 and 12.9.2.3	200 mg/kg	Note X	Japan	Enter GSFA at Step 3 at 200 mg/kg as steviol equivalent based on technological need
04.2.2.8	Cooked or fried vegetables ((including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds	40 mg/kg	Note X	Australia	Enter GSFA at Step 3 at 40 mg/kg as steviol equivalent based on technological need

Steviol glycosides (INS 960)					
Food Cat No	**Food Category**	**Max Level**	**Comments**	**Source of Max Level**	**Justification/Comment**
05.1.1	Cocoa mixes (powders) and cocoa mass/cake	350 mg/kg	Note X	ICGMA, IFAC, USA	Use level revised. Enter GSFA at Step 3 at 350 mg/kg as steviol equivalent based on technological need
05.1.2	Cocoa mixes (syrups)	350 mg/kg	Note X	ICGMA, IFAC, USA	Use level revised. Enter GSFA at Step 3 at 350 mg/kg as steviol equivalent based on technological need
05.1.3	Cocoa-based spreads, including fillings	350 mg/kg	Note X	ICGMA, IFAC, USA	Use level revised. Enter GSFA at Step 3 at 350 mg/kg as steviol equivalent based on technological need
05.1.4	Cocoa and chocolate products	350 mg/kg	Note X	ICGMA, IFAC, USA	Use level revised. Enter GSFA at Step 3 at 350 mg/kg as steviol equivalent based on technological need
05.1.5	Imitation chocolate, chocolate substitute products	350 mg/kg	Note X	ICGMA, IFAC	Use level revised. Enter GSFA at Step 3 at 350 mg/kg as steviol equivalent based on technological need
05.3	Chewing gum	3500 mg/kg	Note X	IFAC	Enter GSFA at Step 3 at 3500 mg/kg as steviol equivalent based on technological need
05.4	Decorations (e.g., for fine bakery wares), toppings (non-fruit), and sweet sauces	330 mg/kg	Note X	ICGMA, IFAC, USA	Enter GSFA at Step 3 at 330 mg/kg as steviol equivalent based on technological need
06.3	Breakfast cereals, including rolled oats)	350 mg/kg	Note X	ICGMA, IFAC, USA, Philippines	Use level revised. Enter GSFA at Step 3 at 350 mg/kg as steviol equivalent based on technological need
06.4.1	Fresh pastas and noodles and like products	80 mg/kg	Note X	Australia	Enter GSFA at Step 3 at 80 mg/kg as steviol equivalent based on technological need
06.4.2	Dried pastas and noodles and like products	200 mg/kg	Note X	Japan	Enter GSFA at Step 3 at 200 mg/kg as steviol equivalent based on technological need
06.4.3	Pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products	80 mg/kg	Note X	Australia	Enter GSFA at Step 3 at 80 mg/kg as steviol equivalent based on technological need
06.5	Cereal and starch based desserts (e.g., rice pudding, tapioca pudding)	165 mg/kg	Note X	USA	Enter GSFA at Step 3 at 165 mg/kg as steviol equivalent based on technological need
06.7	Pre-cooked or processed rice products, including rice cakes (Oriental type only)	80 mg/kg	Note X	Australia	Enter GSFA at Step 3 at 80 mg/kg as steviol equivalent based on technological need

Steviol glycosides (INS 960)					
Food Cat No	**Food Category**	**Max Level**	**Comments**	**Source of Max Level**	**Justification/Comment**
06.8.1	Soybean-based beverages	200 mg/kg	Note X	USA	Enter GSFA at Step 3 at 200 mg/kg as steviol equivalent based on technological need. Soybean-based beverages have been considered by JECFA in its dietary exposure considerations for steviol glycosides.
07.1	Bread and ordinary bakery wares and mixes	50 mg/kg	Note X	Mexico	Enter GSFA at Step 3 at 50 mg/kg as steviol equivalent based on technological need
07.2	Fine bakery wares (sweet, salty, savoury) and mixes	350 mg/kg	Note X	ICGMA, IFAC	Use level revised. Enter GSFA at Step 3 at 350 mg/kg as steviol equivalent based on technological need
08.3.1	Non-heated processed comminuted meat, poultry and game products	80 mg/kg	Note X	Australia	Enter GSFA at Step 3 at 80 mg/kg as steviol equivalent based on technological need
08.3.2	Heat-treated processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	100 mg/kg	Note X	Japan	Enter GSFA at Step 3 at 100 mg/kg as steviol equivalent based on tech need
08.3.3	Frozen processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	80 mg/kg	Note X	Australia	Enter GSFA at Step 3 at 80 mg/kg as steviol equivalent based on technological need
09.2.4.1	Cooked fish and fish products	70 mg/kg	Note X	Japan	Enter GSFA at Step 3 at 70 mg/kg as steviol equivalent based on technological need
09.2.4.2	Cooked molluscs, crustaceans, and echinoderms	165 mg/kg	Note X	Japan	Enter GSFA at Step 3 at 165 mg/kg as steviol equivalent based on technological need
09.2.5	Smoked, dried, fermented, and/or salted fish and fish products, including molluscs, crustaceans, and echinoderms	165 mg/kg	Note X	Japan	Enter GSFA at Step 3 at 165 mg/kg as steviol equivalent based on technological need
09.3.1	Fish and fish products including mollusks, crustaceans and echinoderms, marinated and/or in jelly	100 mg/kg	Note X	ICGMA, IFAC	Enter GSFA at Step 3 at 100 mg/kg as steviol equivalent based on technological need
09.3.2	Fish and fish products, including molluscs, crustaceans and echinoderms, pickled and/or in brine	165 mg/kg	Note X	Japan	Enter GSFA at Step 3 at 165 mg/kg as steviol equivalent based on technological need

Steviol glycosides (INS 960)					
Food Cat No	**Food Category**	**Max Level**	**Comments**	**Source of Max Level**	**Justification/Comment**
09.3.3	Salmon substitutes, caviar and other fish roe products	100 mg/kg	Note X	ICGMA, IFAC	Enter GSFA at Step 3 at 100 mg/kg as steviol equivalent based on technological need
09.4	Fully preserved, including canned or fermented fish and fish products, including molluscs, crustaceans, and echinoderms	100 mg/kg	Note X	Japan	Enter GSFA at Step 3 at 100 mg/kg as steviol equivalent based on technological need
10.4	Egg-based desserts (e.g., custard)	330 mg/kg	Note X	ICGMA, IFAC, USA	Enter GSFA at Step 3 at 330 mg/kg as steviol equivalent based on technological .need
11.6	Table-top sweeteners, including those containing high-intensity sweeteners	GMP	Note X	Australia, Mexico, ICGMA, IFAC	Enter GSFA at Step 3 as GMP as steviol equivalents based on technological need
12.2.2	Seasonings and condiments	30 mg/kg	Note X	Japan	Enter GSFA at Step 3 at 30 mg/kg as steviol equivalent based on technological need
12.4	Mustards	130 mg/kg	Note X	ICGMA, IFAC, USA, Philippines	Enter GSFA at Step 3 at 130 mg/kg as steviol equivalent based on technological need
12.5	Soups and broths	50 mg/kg	Note X	ICGMA, IFAC, Philippines	Enter GSFA at Step 3 at 50 mg/kg as steviol equivalent based on technological need
12.6.1	Emulsified sauces (e.g., mayonnaise, salad dressings)	350 mg/kg	Note X	USA	Use level revised. Enter GSFA at Step 3 at 350 mg/kg as steviol equivalent based on technological need
12.6.2	Non-emulsified sauces (e.g., ketchup, cheese sauce, cream sauce, brown gravy)	350 mg/kg	Note X	USA	Use level revised. Enter GSFA at Step 3 at 350 mg/kg as steviol equivalent based on technological need
12.6.3	Mixes for sauces and gravies	350 mg/kg	Notes X & 127[8]	USA	Use level revised. Enter GSFA at Step 3 at 350 mg/kg as steviol equivalent based on technological need
12.6.4	Clear sauces (e.g., fish sauce)	350 mg/kg	Note X	USA	Use level revised. Enter GSFA at Step 3 at 350 mg/kg as steviol equivalent based on technological need
12.7	Salads (e.g., macaroni salad, potato salad) and sandwich spreads, excluding cocoa- and nut-based spreads of food categories 04.2.2.5 and 05.1.3	115 mg/kg	Note X	ICGMA	Enter GSFA at Step 3 at 115 mg/kg as steviol equivalent based on technological need

[8] **Note 127:** As served to the consumer.

Steviol glycosides (INS 960)					
Food Cat No	**Food Category**	**Max Level**	**Comments**	**Source of Max Level**	**Justification/Comment**
12.9.2.1	Fermented soybean sauce	30 mg/kg	Note X	Japan	Enter GSFA at Step 3 at 30 mg/kg as steviol equivalent based on technological need
12.9.2.2	Non-fermented soybean sauce	165 mg/kg	Note X	Japan	Enter GSFA at Step 3 at 165 mg/kg as steviol equivalent based on technological need
12.9.2.3	Other soybean sauce	165 mg/kg	Note X	Japan	Enter GSFA at Step 3 at 165 mg/kg as steviol equivalent
13.3	Dietetic foods intended for special medical purposes (excluding products of food category 13.1)	350 mg/kg	Note X	ICGMA, IFAC	Use level revised. Enter GSFA at Step 3 at 350 mg/kg as steviol equivalent based on technological need
13.4	Dietetic formulae for slimming purposes and weight reduction	270 mg/kg	Note X	USA, ICGMA, IFAC	Enter GSFA at Step 3 at 270 mg/kg as steviol equivalent based on technological need
13.5	Dietetic foods (e.g., supplementary foods for dietary use) excluding products of food categories 13.1-13.4 and 13.6	660 mg/kg	Notes B[9] & X	USA, ICGMA, IFAC	Enter GSFA at Step 3 at 660 mg/kg as steviol equivalent based on technological need
13.6	Food supplements	1820 mg/kg	Note X	ICGMA, IFAC	Enter GSFA at Step 3 at 1820 mg/kg as steviol equivalent based on technological need
14.1.3	Fruit and vegetable nectars	200 mg/kg	Note X	ICGMA	Enter GSFA at Step 3 at 200 mg/kg as steviol equivalent based on technological need
14.1.4	Water-based flavoured drinks, including “sport,” “energy,” or “electrolyte” drinks and particulated drinks	200 mg/kg	Note X	ICGMA, Philippines, Costa Rica, ICBA, IFAC, Malaysia	Enter GSFA at Step 3 at 200 mg/kg as steviol equivalent based on technological need
14.1.5	Coffee, coffee substitutes, tea, herbal infusions, and other hot cereal and grain beverages, excluding cocoa	200 mg/kg	Notes 160[10] & X	ICGMA, Philippines, Costa Rica, ICBA, IFAC, Malaysia	Enter GSFA at Step 3 at 200 mg/kg as steviol equivalent based on technological need
14.2.1	Beer and malt beverages	50 mg/kg	Note X	China	Revise and enter GSFA at Step 3 at 50 mg/kg as steviol equivalent based on technological need
14.2.2	Cider and perry	50 mg/kg	Note X	China	Revise and enter GSFA at Step 3 at 50 mg/kg as steviol equivalent based on technological need

[9] **Note B**: Use level for solid products (e.g., energy, meal replacement or fortified bars); 600 mg/kg as steviol equivalents for use in liquid products.

[10] **Note 160:** For use in ready-to-drink products and pre-mixes for ready-to-drink products only.

Steviol glycosides (INS 960)					
Food Cat No	**Food Category**	**Max Level**	**Comments**	**Source of Max Level**	**Justification/Comment**
14.2.3	Grape wines	160 mg/kg	Note X	China	Revise and enter GSFA at Step 3 at 160 mg/kg as steviol equivalent based on technological need
14.2.4	Wines (other than grape)	160 mg/kg	Note X	China	Revise and enter GSFA at Step 3 at 160 mg/kg as steviol equivalent based on technological need
14.2.5	Mead	160 mg/kg	Note X	China	Revise and enter GSFA at Step 3 at 160 mg/kg as steviol equivalent based on technological need
14.2.6	distilled spirituous beverages containing more than 15% alcohol	160 mg/kg	Note X	China	Revise and enter GSFA at Step 3 at 160 mg/kg as steviol equivalent based on technological need
14.2.7	Aromatized alcoholic beverages (e.g., beer, wine and spirituous cooler-type beverages, low-alcoholic refreshers)	200 mg/kg	Note X	ICGMA, IFAC, USA	Enter GSFA at Step 3 at 200 mg/kg as steviol equivalent based on technological need
15.0	Ready-to-eat savouries	170 mg/kg	Note X	IFAC	Enter GSFA at Step 3 at 170 mg/kg as steviol equivalent based on technological need

Sulfites (INS 220-225, 227, 228, 539)					
Food Cat No	**Food Category**	**Max Level**	**Comments**	**Source of Max Level**	**Proposal**
04.1.1.2	Surface-treated fresh fruit	50 mg/kg	Note 44[11]	38CCFAC[12]	Revise to **30 mg/kg**
04.2.2.6	Vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed pulps and preparations (e.g., vegetable desserts and sauces, candied vegetables) other than food category 04.2.2.5	500 mg/kg	Note 44	38CCFAC; Canada (04.2.2)	Revise to **100 mg/kg**

Erythrosine (INS 127)						
Food Cat No.	**Food Category**	**Max Level**	**Comments**	**Step**	**Source of Max Level**	**Justification/Comments**
04.1.2.6	Fruit-based spreads (e.g., chutney) excluding products of food category 04.1.2.5	300 mg/kg	Note 161[13]	7	Canada	Thailand proposes new ML of **200 mg/kg**. Daily exposure at current ML is above the ADI
04.1.2.9	Fruit-based desserts, including fruit-flavoured water-based desserts	300 mg/kg	Note 161	7	Canada	Thailand proposes **70 mg/kg** based on technological need

[11] **Note 44:** As residual SO_2.
[12] ALINORM 06/29/12.
[13] **Note 182:** Subject to national legislation of the importing country aimed, in particular, at consistency with Section 3.2 of the Preamble.

Erythrosine (INS 127)						
Food Cat No.	**Food Category**	**Max Level**	**Comments**	**Step**	**Source of Max Level**	**Justification/Comments**
04.1.2.11	Fruit fillings for pastries	300 mg/kg	Note 161	7	Canada	Daily exposure exceeds ADI. Propose new ML of **190 mg/kg** based on reports from USA for use in fruit fillings and Japan's request to reduce ML
04.2.2.7	Fermented vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and seaweed products, excluding fermented soybean products of food categories 06.8.6, 06.8.7, 12.9.1, 12.9.2.1 and 12.9.2.3	300 mg/kg	Note 161	4	Japan	Propose new ML of **30 mg/kg** because daily exposure exceeds ADI
05.2	Confectionery including hard and soft candy, nougats, etc. other than food categories 05.1, 05.3 and 05.4	300 mg/kg		7	Canada	Propose new ML of **70 mg/kg** because daily exposure exceeds ADI
05.3	Chewing gum	100 mg/kg		7	Brazil	Propose new ML of **70 mg/kg** because daily exposure exceeds ADI
05.4	Decorations (e.g., for fine bakery wares), toppings (non-fruit) and sweet sauces	300 mg/kg		7	Canada	Propose new level of **100 mg/kg** based on current ADI
08.2	Processed meat, poultry, and game products in whole pieces or cuts	30 mg/kg	**Notes 4[14] & 16[15]**	6	South Africa	Adopt with addition of Notes 4 and 16

[14] **Note 4:** For decoration, stamping, marking or branding the product.
[15] **Note 16:** For use in glaze, coatings or decorations for fruit, vegetables, meat or fish.

Appendix 2

The eWG could not reach consensus on recommendations for the 43rd CCFA with regard to the following food additive provisions for lauric arginate ethyl ester (INS 243), steviol glycosides (INS 960), sulfites (INS 220-225, 227, 228, 539) and erythrosine (INS 127). The eWG recommends that the Physical WG **discuss further** these provisions with a view toward determining, which should be included in the GSFA and circulated for comments at Step 3 for further consideration by the 44th CCFA.

Lauric arginate ethyl ester (INS 243)					
Food Cat No	**Food Category**	**Max Level**	**Comments**	**Source of Max Level**	**Justification/Comment**
08.1	Fresh meat, poultry and game	200 mg/kg		USA	Norway states there is limited stability in meat products and salted dry fish
08.2.3	Frozen processed meat, poultry, and game products in whole pieces or cuts	200 mg/kg		USA	
08.3.3	Frozen processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	200 mg/kg		USA	
09.1	Fresh fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	200 mg/kg		USA	
09.2.1	Frozen fish, fish fillets, and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	200 mg/kg		USA	
09.2.2	Frozen battered fish, fish fillets and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	200 mg/kg		USA	
09.2.3	Frozen minced and creamed fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	200 mg/kg		USA	

Steviol Glycosides (INS 960)					
Food Cat No.	**Food Category**	**Max Level**	**Comments**	**Source of Max Level**	**Justification/Comment**
01.2.2	Renneted milk (plain)	600 mg/kg	**Note X**[16]	ICGMA	No sweeteners in this category
05.2	Confectionery, including hard and soft candy, nougats, etc., other than food categories 05.1, 05.3 and 05.4	700 mg/kg	**Notes C**[17] **& X**	IFAC	Thailand proposes MLs for the sub-categories 05.2.1 at 3290 mg/kg, 05.2.2 at 490 mg/kg, and 05.2.3 at 490 mg/kg (all as steviol equivalents), and states that this is technologically justified and safe for consumer health.

[16] **Note X:** As steviol equivalents.
[17] **Note C:** For use in microsweets and breath freshening mints at 6000 mg/kg as steviol equivalents.

08.2	Processed meat, poultry, and game products in whole pieces or cuts	80 mg/kg	**Notes X & D**[18]	Australia	Japan proposes to enter this into the GSFA at Step 3 at 120 mg/kg as steviol equivalent based on technological need Japan also seeks clarification if products such as packed raw pork seasoned mainly with fermented soy bean paste would be included in this category.
14.1.2	Fruit and vegetable juices	240 mg/kg	**Note X**	Australia, Mexico	USA acknowledges use at 600 mg/kg stevioside (240mg/kg, as steviol equivalent) as sweetener in vegetable juices. CIAA supports alignment with the category 14.1.3 (Fruit and vegetable nectars), i.e., 200 mg/kg as steviol equivalent.

Sulfites (INS 220-225, 227, 228, 539)					
Food Cat No	**Food Category**	**Max Level**	**Comments**	**Source of Max Level**	**Justification/Comment**
04.1.2.1	Frozen fruit	500 mg/kg	Notes 44[19] & 155[20]	Canada	Thailand uses sulfites as antimicrobial agents but no level was provided, UK sees no technological need and Indonesia proposes that the daily exposure exceeds than ADI.
04.1.2.2	Dried fruit	1000 mg/kg	Notes 44 & 135[21]	EU [For Note 135: Codex [67-1981, 130-1981, 177-1981], EU, Australia, Singapore]	Need more information because CIAA has proposed that the ML of 2000 mg/kg should apply for dried apricots and peaches as permitted in the EU and has requested for the inclusion of lightly "sugared tropic dried fruits" like mangos or pineapples in this Category or to establish a new category and at ML of 500 mg/kg. ICGMA proposes that current use levels of sodium sulfite for a variety of dried fruits range between 1,500 mg/kg-2,500 mg/kg as residual SO2 to help stop browning. Indonesia suggests that the daily exposure exceed the ADI
04.1.2.9	Fruit-based desserts, including fruit-flavoured water-based desserts	100 mg/kg	Note 44	Singapore	Need more information because UK has safety concerns about the extent of use of sulphites and see no so there is no technological need for this use. Indonesia and Thailand support this level but have not provided technical justification.

[18] **Note D:** Except for use in Japanese style 'lachs ham' of pork loin (cured and not heat-treated) at 3000 mg/kg as steviol equivalents.
[19] **Note 44:** As residual SO_2.
[20] **Note 155:** For use in frozen, sliced apples only.
[21] **Note 135:** Except for use in dried apricots at 2000 mg/kg, bleached raisins at 1500 mg/kg, and desiccated coconut at 50 mg/kg.

Sulfites (INS 220-225, 227, 228, 539)					
Food Cat No	**Food Category**	**Max Level**	**Comments**	**Source of Max Level**	**Justification/Comment**
04.1.2.10	Fermented fruit products	100 mg/kg	Note 44	Codex [260-2007]	Need more information because UK has safety concerns about the extent of use of sulphites and see no so there is no technological need for this use while Indonesia supports this level but has not provided technical justification.
04.2.2.4	Canned or bottled (pasteurized) or retort pouch vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds	50 mg/kg	Note 44	EU; EU (04.2.2)	Need more information because UK and Thailand would like to adopt this ML while Indonesia proposes to revoke, and there is no technical justification provided.
04.2.2.7	Fermented vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and seaweed products, excluding fermented soybean products of food categories 06.8.6, 06.8.7, 12.9.1, 12.9.2.1 and 12.9.2.3	500 mg/kg	Note 44	38CCFAC[22]; Canada (04.2.2)	Need more information because UK and Thailand would like to adopt this ML while Indonesia proposes to revoke, and there is no technical justification provided.
06.2.1	Flours	200 mg/kg	Note 44	Codex [152-1985], Mexico, Singapore	UK sees no technological need while Indonesia proposes that the daily exposure exceeds than ADI .and Thailand supports this ML
09.2.4.2	Cooked mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	150 mg/kg	Note 44	39CCFA[23]	Need more information because UK and Thailand support this ML but no technical justification is provided and Indonesia proposes to revoke, as the daily exposure exceeds the ADI
14.2.2	Cider and perry	200 mg/kg	Note 44	EU, Singapore	Need more information because UK would like to adopt this ML but no technical justification is provided and Indonesia proposes to revoke, as the daily exposure exceeds the ADI
14.2.4	Wines (other than grape)	200 mg/kg	Note 44	Australia, EU	Need more information because UK would like to adopt this ML but no technical justification is provided and Indonesia proposes to revoke, as the daily exposure exceeds the ADI

[22] ALINORM 06/29/12.
[23] ALINORM 07/30/12.

Sulfites (INS 220-225, 227, 228, 539)					
Food Cat No	**Food Category**	**Max Level**	**Comments**	**Source of Max Level**	**Justification/Comment**
14.2.5	Mead	200 mg/kg	Note 44	Australia, EU	Need more information because UK would like to adopt this ML but no technical justification is provided and Indonesia proposes to revoke, as the daily exposure exceeds the ADI

Erythrosine (INS 127)						
Food Cat No.	**Food Category**	**Max Level**	**Comments**	**Step**	**Source of Max Level**	**Justification/Comments**
02.1.3	Lard, tallow, fish oil, and other animal fats	300 mg/kg		7	Japan	Needs additional information to lower ML because current level of daily exposure exceeds ADI
02.3	Fat emulsions mainly of type oil-in-water, including mixed and/or flavoured products based on fat emulsions	300 mg/kg		7	ICGMA	Needs additional information to lower ML because current level of daily exposure exceeds ADI
04.1.2.4	Canned or bottled (pasteurized) fruit	300 mg/kg	Notes 54[24] & 161[25]	7	Codex [242-2003]	Needs additional information on uses ML because current level of daily exposure exceeds ADI
04.1.2.8	Fruit preparations, including pulp, purees, fruit toppings and coconut milk	300 mg/kg	Notes 161 and 182[26]	7	Canada	USA reports use level of 2.77 mg/kg for fruit toppings. Thailand and Indonesia report daily exposure to exceed ADI
08.3	Processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	30 mg/kg		6	South Africa (08.3), Thailand (08.3.2)	Japan would like to clarify whether Note 4 and 16 include the use of erythrosine less than Maximum Use Level on the surface of sausages and hams, if adopted

[24] **Note 54:** For use in cocktail cherries and candied cherries only.
[25] **Note 161:** Subject to national legislation of the importing country aimed, in particular, at consistency with Section 3.2 of the Preamble.
[26] **Note 182:** Except for use in coconut milk.

Appendix 3

The eWG recommends that the 43rd CCFA **stop, revoke or discontinue work** on the following food additive provision for steviol glycosides (INS 960), sulfites (INS 220-225, 227, 228, 539) and erythrosine (INS 127).

Please Note

The provision for steviol glycosides (INS 960) was introduced at the 42nd CCFA (CRD 2, Appendix 6).

The provisions for sulfites (INS 220-225, 227, 228, 539) are all adopted provisions in the GSFA.

The provisions for erythrosine (INS 127) are provisions in the Step process.

Steviol Glycosides (INS 960)					
Food Cat No.	**Food Category**	**Max Level**	**Comments**	**Source of Max Level**	**Justification/Comment**
11.1.2	Powdered sugar, powdered dextrose	110 mg/kg	Note A[27]	Mexico	Stop work because it is not technologically justified.

Sulfites (INS 220-225, 227, 228, 539)					
Food Cat. No	**Food Category**	**Max Level**	**Comments**	**Source of Max Level**	**Justification/Comments**
04.1.2.6	Fruit-based spreads (e.g., chutney) excluding products of food category 04.1.2.5	500 mg/kg	Note 44[28]	Canada	Revoke because UK sees no technological need and Indonesia proposes that the daily exposure exceeds than ADI.
04.1.2.8	Fruit preparations, including pulp, purees, fruit toppings and coconut milk	500 mg/kg	Note 44	38CCFAC[29]	Revoke because UK sees no technological need and alternatives available. Indonesia proposes that the daily exposure would exceed the ADI.
14.2.6	Distilled spirituous beverages containing more than 15% alcohol	200 mg/kg	Note 44	38CCFAC	Revoke because UK sees no technological need and Indonesia proposes that the daily exposure would exceed the ADI.
14.2.7	Aromatized alcoholic beverages (e.g., beer, wine and spirituous cooler-type beverages, low alcoholic refreshers)	350 mg/kg	Notes 44 & 170[30]	Japan, Mexico	Revoke because UK sees no technological need and Indonesia proposes that the daily exposure would exceed the ADI.

Erythrosine (INS 127)						
Food Cat No.	**Food Category**	**Max Level**	**Comments**	**Step**	**Source of Max Level**	**Justification/Comment**
01.1.2	Dairy-based drinks, flavoured and/or fermented (e.g., chocolate milk, cocoa, eggnog, drinking yoghurt, whey-based drinks)	300 mg/kg	Note 52[31]	7	Canada, Thailand	Discontinue because daily exposure is above the ADI. Other substitutes available.

[27] **Note A:** As rebaudioside
[28] **Note 44:** As residual SO_2.
[29] ALINORM 06/29/12.
[30] **Note 170:** Acceptable maximum level based on combined state of total sulfites. This is equivalent to 70 mg/kg in the free state.
[31] **Note 52:** Excluding chocolate milk.

Erythrosine (INS 127)						
Food Cat No.	**Food Category**	**Max Level**	**Comments**	**Step**	**Source of Max Level**	**Justification/Comment**
01.7	Dairy-based desserts (e.g., pudding, fruit or flavoured yoghurt)	300 mg/kg		7	Canada, Japan	Discontinue because daily exposure is above the ADI. Other substitutes available.
02.4	Fat-based desserts excluding dairy-based dessert products of food category 01.7	300 mg/kg		7	Canada	Discontinue because daily exposure is above the ADI. Other substitutes available.
03.0	Edible ices, including sherbet and sorbet	300 mg/kg		7	Canada	Discontinue because daily exposure is above the ADI. Other substitutes available.
04.1.2.5	Jams, jellies, marmelades	400 mg/kg		6	Thailand	Discontinue because daily exposure is above the ADI. Other substitutes available.
04.2.2.3	Vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds in vinegar, oil, brine, or soybean sauce	300 mg/kg	Note 161[32]	7	Canada	Discontinue because daily exposure is above the ADI
06.3	Breakfast cereals, including rolled oats	300 mg/kg		7	Canada	Discontinue because daily exposure is above the ADI
06.5	Cereal and starch based desserts (e.g., rice pudding, tapioca pudding)	300 mg/kg		7	Canada	Discontinue because daily exposure is above the ADI
06.8.1	Soybean-based beverages	10 mg/kg		3	Malaysia	Discontinue because of safety concerns in high consumers
11.4	Other sugars and syrups (e.g., xylose, maple syrup, sugar toppings)	300 mg/kg		7	Canada	Discontinue because daily exposure is above the ADI
12.2	Herbs, spices, seasonings and condiments (e.g., seasoning for instant noodles)	300 mg/kg		7	Canada (12.2.1 & 12.2.2), Malaysia (12.2.2)	Discontinue because could mislead over the quality of herbs and spices and: the daily exposure exceed the ADI.
13.6	Food supplements	300 mg/kg		7	Canada	Discontinue because of daily exposure from frequent consumption
14.1.4	Water-based flavoured drinks, including "sport," "energy," or "electrolyte" drinks and particulated drinks	300 mg/kg		7	Canada	Discontinue because daily exposure is above the ADI

[32] **Note 161:** Subject to national legislation of the importing country aimed, in particular, at consistency with Section 3.2 of the Preamble.