

# codex alimentarius commission E



FOOD AND AGRICULTURE  
ORGANIZATION  
OF THE UNITED NATIONS

WORLD  
HEALTH  
ORGANIZATION



JOINT OFFICE: Viale delle Terme di Caracalla 00153 ROME Tel: 39 06 57051 www.codexalimentarius.net Email: codex@fao.org Facsimile: 39 06 5705 4593

## Agenda Item 4

**CX/MMP 10/9/4**  
**August 2009**

### **JOINT FAO/WHO FOOD STANDARDS PROGRAMME CODEX COMMITTEE ON MILK AND MILK PRODUCTS**

#### **Ninth Session**

**Auckland, New Zealand, 1-5 February 2010**

#### **REPORT OF THE PHYSICAL WORKING GROUP ON THE PROPOSED DRAFT STANDARD FOR PROCESSED CHEESE**

1. At its 8<sup>th</sup> session, the CCMMP agreed to establish a physical Working Group under the co-leadership of France and New Zealand to revise the proposed draft standard for processed cheese.
2. The Committee agreed that in revising the standard the Working Group would give full attention to its simplification; that it would take into account the 8<sup>th</sup> session discussion and written comments and that the revised proposed draft standard should at least include provisions for addressing the following issues:
  - Cheese content of processed cheese;
  - The acceptability of use of gelatine, starches and stabilizers in the manufacture of processed cheese, for instance by reference to national legislations;
  - The clear distinction between processed cheese and processed cheese preparations, for instance by labelling provisions.
3. To facilitate the work, Australia offered to collate information on production, trade, national legislation and practices related to the discussed issues.
4. In December five documents were sent to the registered delegates: the list of participants; the presentation by Australia of the answers to the questionnaire; the IDF technical contribution on the use of stabilisers and certain stabilising ingredients in processed cheeses products; a version of the draft standard revised according to the discussion of the 8<sup>th</sup> session of the CCMMP, and a working paper on the proposed draft standard for processed cheese (doc. 5).
5. The Working Group was held in Brussels on 20, 21 and 22 January in a European Commission Conference Centre, which kindly offered the meeting facilities, including interpretation in English, French and Spanish.
6. The Working Group agreed to use “doc. 5” as a working paper, addressing in turn each of the five contentious issues indicated in greyed-out text. Delegations were given the opportunity to outline their views on the options in the paper, prior to discussion of possible solutions.
7. The Working Group discussed the issue of permitted ingredients and was able to make some progress towards agreement regarding conditions for the use of starches, subject to a satisfactory outcome being reached on the issue of the use of stabilisers. There appeared to be a preponderance of opinion in favour of the exclusion of gelatine.
8. Following an initial, inconclusive discussion on the issue of composition, the Working Group held an initial exchange of views on the use of Food Additives. Discussion on the use of stabilisers drew upon the work of the IDF and responses to the Codex questionnaire. While a large majority of delegations considered

it possible to reach tentative conclusions on the use of stabilisers, some delegations expressed strong opposition to this until compositional issues had been resolved. It was clear to the co-chairs following this discussion that agreement on the use of stabilisers would not be reached in the absence of a stable consensus on the issue of composition, including cheese content. It was thus agreed to return to the question of composition.

9. The Working Group spent considerable time on the issue of composition and cheese content. Several proposals were received from delegations in an effort to find an inclusive solution consistent with the Working Group's mandate to simplify and improve the provisions in the draft standard. The Working Group made some progress toward achieving a text, permitting the elaboration and presentation of a draft compositional table by the co-chairs. This attracted the support of a large number of delegations. Some delegations, however, continued to insist on textual solutions reflecting closely their own national situation, which did not attract consensus.

10. This issue was discussed at length, but the Working Group was unfortunately not able to develop a text that met the needs of all delegations and was consistent with its mandate to simplify and improve the text. After considerable discussion, the co-chairs concluded with regret that it would not be possible to reach an agreement on this point. This in turn led to the inescapable conclusion that it would also not be possible to reach agreement before the end of the meeting on other related issues, including labelling, stabilisers and starches.

11. The co-chairs accordingly advised that, in their view, it would not be possible to present a revised draft standard to the next meeting of the CCMMP, and advised the Working Group of this. The delegations participating in the Working Group did not demur. The meeting finished on the basis that co-chairs would reflect the outcome of the Working Group's discussions in a note to be circulated to delegations for information, and transmitted to the CCMMP for consideration.

12. In the opinion of the co-chairs, the fundamental difficulty with attempting to develop this standard arises from the requirement for the standard to address the very large variety of products marketed as processed cheese, while retaining scope for innovation. Given this difficulty, the unwavering choice of some delegations to insist on a standard reflecting very closely their own national product specifications, as distinct from a more global approach, suggests that it may not be possible to resolve this problem.

13. The co-chairs would like to express their appreciation and thanks to those many delegations that sought to work towards a successful conclusion to the Working Group Session.

Attachments (*only in original language*):

- Annex 1: List of participants
- Annex 2: Working Paper on the Proposed Draft Standard for Processed Cheese (doc. 5)
- Annex 3: IDF Technical Paper "The use of stabilisers and certain stabilising ingredients in Processed Cheese Products"
- Annex 4: Australia presentation of the outcomes of the survey on processed cheese "CCMMP Questionnaire on Processed Cheese"

**PHYSICAL WORKING GROUP ON PROCESSED CHEESE**

Brussels, 20 – 22 January 2009

*List of Participants*

**CO-CHAIR :** Mr. Paul ASH  
Deputy Head of Mission  
New Zealand Embassy to Belgium and Mission to the  
European Union  
Square de Meeus 1  
B-1000 Brussels  
Belgium  
Ph: +32 2 550 12 11  
Fax: +32 2 513 48 56  
Email: [paul.ash@mfat.govt.nz](mailto:paul.ash@mfat.govt.nz)

**CO-CHAIR:** Ms Roseline LECOURT  
Chargée de mission  
Ministère de l'économie, de l'industrie et de l'emploi  
DGCCRF - Teledoc 251  
59, boulevard Vincent Auriol  
75703 PARIS Cedex 13  
France  
Ph: +33 1 44 97 34 70  
Fax: +33 1 44 97 30 37  
Email: [roseline.lecourt@dgccrf.finances.gouv.fr](mailto:roseline.lecourt@dgccrf.finances.gouv.fr)

**AUSTRALIA**

Mr. Matthew KOVAL  
Minister Counsellor (Agriculture)  
Embassy of Australia, Australian Mission to the European  
Union  
Ph: + 32 2 286 0513  
Fax: + 32 2 230 6802  
Email : [matthew.koval@dfat.gov.au](mailto:matthew.koval@dfat.gov.au)

Mr Donald SNYDER  
-DPAC –Canada  
Dairy Processors Association of Canada  
76 Margaret Ave N.,  
Waterloo, Ontario  
Canada N2J3P9  
Ph: +1 519-885-6968  
Ph : Also +1 519-885-6968  
Email: [dksnyder@kw.igs.net](mailto:dksnyder@kw.igs.net)

**AUSTRIA**

Mr. Karl SCHOBER  
Ministry of Agriculture and Forestry, Environment and Water  
Management  
Stubenring 1,  
1012 Vienna,  
Austria  
Ph: +431 71100 2844  
Fax: +431 71100 2972  
Email: [karl.schober@lebensministerium.at](mailto:karl.schober@lebensministerium.at)

**CZECH REPUBLIC**

Mr. Vallav BARTA  
Dairy Expert, Head of Department  
Milcom Servis A.S.  
Hostivarska 538/56  
102 00 Praha 10  
Ceska Republika  
Ph: +420 274 016 130, +420 603 858387  
Fax: +420 274 016 199  
Email: [barta@milcom.cz](mailto:barta@milcom.cz)

**CANADA**

Ms Gail Daniels  
Chief, Dairy Program Canadian Food Inspection Agency  
159 Cleopatra Dr  
Ottawa On K1a 0y9  
Ph +613-221-7000  
Fax +613-221-7294  
Email: [gdaniels@inspection.gc.ca](mailto:gdaniels@inspection.gc.ca)

Mrs. Jarmila STIPKOVA  
Dairy Expert  
Milcom Servis A.S.  
Hostivarska 538/56  
102 00 Praha 10  
Ceska Republika  
Ph: +420 274 016 131, +420 603 858386  
Fax: +420 274 016 199  
Email: [Stipkova@Milcom.Cz](mailto:Stipkova@Milcom.Cz)

**FRANCE**

Ms Karine SIMBELIE  
 Inspector, Head of the French delegation  
 Ministère de l'économie, de l'industrie et de l'emploi  
 DGCCRF - Teledoc 251  
 59, boulevard Vincent Auriol  
 75703 Paris 13  
 France  
 Ph: +33 1 44 97 28 40  
 Fax: +33 1 44 97 30 48  
 Email: [Karine.Simbelie@dgccrf.finances.gouv.fr](mailto:Karine.Simbelie@dgccrf.finances.gouv.fr)

Ms Lucile GAUCHET  
 Ministère de l'agriculture et de la pêche  
 3, rue Barbet de Jouy  
 75349 Paris 07  
 Ph : +33 1 49 55 46 08  
 Fax : +33 1 49 55 49 25  
 Email : [lucile.gauchet@agriculture.gouv.fr](mailto:lucile.gauchet@agriculture.gouv.fr)

Mrs Dominique BUREL  
 CNIEL  
 Head of Service – Secretary General Fil France/ALF  
 42, rue de Châteaudun  
 75314 Paris Cedex 09  
 France  
 Ph: +33 1 49 70 71 15  
 Email : [filfrance-alf@cniel.com](mailto:filfrance-alf@cniel.com)

Mr Jean-François COUTREL  
 Responsable réglementation produits  
 Groupe Bel  
 16, boulevard Malesherbes  
 75008 Paris  
 France  
 Ph: 33 1 40 07 73 11  
 Fax: 33 1 40 07 72 98  
 Email: [jfcoutrel@groupe-bel.com](mailto:jfcoutrel@groupe-bel.com)

Mr. Jean-Claude GILLIS  
 Chef du service scientifique, technique et réglementaire  
 ATLA  
 42, rue de Châteaudun  
 75009 Paris  
 France  
 33 1 49 79 72 68  
 33 1 42 80 63 65  
 Email: [trs@atla.asso.fr](mailto:trs@atla.asso.fr)

Dr Eric GRANDE  
 Regulatory Affairs Director  
 Lactalis  
 10-20, Rue Adolphe Beck  
 53000 Laval  
 Ph: +33 6 16 99 27 96  
 Email: [eric.grande@lactalis.fr](mailto:eric.grande@lactalis.fr)

Ms Jennifer HUET  
 CNIEL  
 Project Manager  
 42, rue de Châteaudun  
 75314 Paris Cedex 09  
 France  
 Ph: +33 1 49 70 71 08  
 Email : [jhuet@cniel.com](mailto:jhuet@cniel.com)

Mrs Huguette MEYER-CARON  
 Directeur Sécurité Alimentaire et Nutrition  
 Head of Food Safety and Nutrition Service  
 Fromageries Bel  
 16, Boulevard Malesherbes  
 75008 Paris  
 France  
 Ph: +33 1 40 07 73 82  
 Fax: +33 1 40 07 72 98  
 Email: [hmeyercaron@groupe-bel.com](mailto:hmeyercaron@groupe-bel.com)

**GERMANY**

Mrs. Marlies Reimann  
 Regierungsdirektorin  
 Bundesministerium für Ernährung, Landwirtschaft und  
 Verbraucherschutz  
 Rochusstraße 1  
 D-53123 Bonn  
 Ph: +49 228 99 529 4349  
 Fax: +49 228 99 529 55 4247  
 Email: [423@bmelv.bund.de](mailto:423@bmelv.bund.de),  
[marlies.reimann@bmelv.bund.de](mailto:marlies.reimann@bmelv.bund.de)

Mr. Konrad HAUBER  
 Rechtsanwalt  
 Milchindustrie-Verband e.V.  
 Jägerstraße 51  
 10117 Berlin  
 Germany  
 Ph: +49 (0) 30 4030 445 22  
 Fax: +49 (0) 30 4030 445 55  
 Email: [konrad.hauber@milchindustrie.de](mailto:konrad.hauber@milchindustrie.de)

**IRELAND**

Mr John M. DOODY  
 Senior Inspector  
 Department of Agriculture and Food  
 Milk and Milk Products  
 Agriculture House, Kildare Street  
 Dublin 2  
 Ireland  
 Ph: + 353 1 607 2605  
 Fax: + 353 1 607 2848  
 Email: [john.doody@agriculture.gov.ie](mailto:john.doody@agriculture.gov.ie)

**ITALY**

Mr. Ciro IMPAGNATIELLO  
 Italian Codex Committee  
 Ministero delle Politiche Agricole Alimentari e Forestali  
 Via XX Settembre, 20  
 00187 Roma,  
 Italy  
 Ph: + 39 06 46656046  
 Fax: +39 06 4880273  
 Email : [c.impagnatiello@politicheagricole.gov.it](mailto:c.impagnatiello@politicheagricole.gov.it)

Mrs Brunella LO TURCO  
 Secretary General Italian Codex Committee  
 Ministero delle Politiche Agricole Alimentari e Forestali  
 Via XX Settembre, 20  
 00187 Roma  
 Italy  
 Ph : +39 06 46656041  
 Fax : +39 06 4880273  
 Email : [saco8@politicheagricole.gov.it](mailto:saco8@politicheagricole.gov.it)

**JAPAN**

Ms Kiyoko KOTSUBO  
Deputy Director  
Milk and Dairy Products Division  
Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries  
1-2-1 Kasumigaseki, Chiyoda-ku, Tokyo 100-8950,  
Japan  
Ph: +81-3-6744-2127  
Fax: +81-3-3506-9578  
Email: [Kiyoko\\_kotsubo@nm.maff.go.jp](mailto:Kiyoko_kotsubo@nm.maff.go.jp)

Mr Kaoru KOIDE  
Japanese National Committee of IDF  
Nyugyo Kaikan,  
1-14-19 Kudankita, Chiyoda-Ku  
Tokyo 102-0073  
Japan  
Ph: +81 3 3264 3731  
Fax: +81 3 3264 3732  
Email: [idfjapan@rapid.ocn.ne.jp](mailto:idfjapan@rapid.ocn.ne.jp)

Mr. Shiro KAWABATA  
Japanese National Committee of IDF  
Nyugo Kaikan  
1-14-19 Kudankita, Chiyoda-Ku,  
Tokyo 102-0073  
Japan  
Ph: +81 3 3264 3731  
Fax: +81 3 3264 3732  
Email: [Idfjapan@rapid.ocn.ne.jp](mailto:Idfjapan@rapid.ocn.ne.jp)

**LATVIA**

Mrs Olga ORLOVA  
Permanent Representative  
Email : [olga.orlova@mfa.gov.lv](mailto:olga.orlova@mfa.gov.lv)

**LIBYA**

Dr. Mohamed NAHAISI  
Professor  
Libyan National Centre for Standardization and Metrology  
P.O.Box 84033  
Tripoli- Libya  
Ph: +218 926452587  
Fax: +218 4630885  
Email: [nahaisimh@yahoo.com](mailto:nahaisimh@yahoo.com)

**NETHERLANDS**

Mr Gert STIEKEMA  
Ministry of Agriculture, Nature and Food Quality  
PO Box 20401  
2500 EK Den Haag  
The Netherlands  
Ph ; +31-703784235  
Fax : +31-70-3786123  
Email : [o.t.j.stiekema@minlnv.nl](mailto:o.t.j.stiekema@minlnv.nl)

Mr Rob OOST  
Ing  
Ministry of Agriculture, Nature and Food Quality  
PO box 755  
2700 AT Zoetermeer  
The Netherlands  
Ph: +31 79-3681516  
Fax: +31 79-3681951  
Email: [r.h.oost@pz.agro.nl](mailto:r.h.oost@pz.agro.nl)

**NEW ZEALAND**

Mr Phil FAWCET  
Senior Programme Manager (International Standards)  
New Zealand Food Safety Authority  
South Tower, Telecom House,  
86 Jervois Quay  
PO Box 2835 - Wellington  
New Zealand  
Ph: +64 4 894 2656  
Fax: +64 4 894 2675  
Email: [phil.fawcet@nzfsa.govt.nz](mailto:phil.fawcet@nzfsa.govt.nz)

Mr Keith JOHNSTON  
Principal Research Technologist  
Fonterra Palmerston North  
Private Bag 11029,  
Dairy Farm Rd  
Palmerston North,  
New Zealand  
Ph: +64 6 350 4640  
Fax: +64 6 350 6330  
Email: [keith.johnston@fonterra.com](mailto:keith.johnston@fonterra.com)

**PORTUGAL**

Mr Luis SALINO  
Adviser- Portuguese Codex Contact Point  
Gabinete De Planeamento E Políticas  
Rua Padre António Vieira, 1 – 1099-073 Lisboa  
Portugal  
Ph: + 351 213819305  
Fax: + 351 21866650  
Email: [lsalino@gpp.pt](mailto:lsalino@gpp.pt)

**SPAIN**

Ms Teresa Calvo Sanz  
Jefa de Área  
Ministry of the Environment and Rural and Marine Affairs  
Paseo Infanta Isabel nº 1. 28071 Madrid.  
Spain  
Ph: +34 91347 8463  
Fax: +34 913475728  
Email: [tcavosa@mapya.es](mailto:tcavosa@mapya.es)

**SWEDEN**

Mrs. Karin BÄCKSTRÖM  
Chief Government Inspector  
National Food Administration  
Box 622  
SE- 751 26 Uppsala  
Sweden  
Ph: +46-18-175664  
Fax: +46-18-175310  
Email: [karb@slv.se](mailto:karb@slv.se)

**SWITZERLAND**

Ms Christina Blumer  
Scientific employee  
Federal Office for Public Health  
Schwarzenburgstr. 165  
P.O. Box 3003  
Berne  
Switzerland  
Ph: +41 31 322 95 67  
Fax: +41 31 322 95 74  
Email: [christina.blumer@bag.admin.ch](mailto:christina.blumer@bag.admin.ch)

**UNITED STATES OF AMERICA**

Mr Duane R. SPOMER  
 Food Defense Advisor  
 Agricultural Marketing Service  
 Compliance and Analysis  
 U.S. Department of Agriculture  
 1400 Independence Avenue, SW,  
 Stop 0203  
 Washington, DC 20250-0203  
 Ph: +1 (202) 720-1861  
 Fax: +1 (202) 205-5772  
 Email: [Duane.Spomer@usda.gov](mailto:Duane.Spomer@usda.gov)

Mr John F. SHEEHAN  
 Director  
 Division of Dairy and Egg Safety  
 Office of Plant and Dairy Foods and Beverages  
 Center for Food Safety and Applied Nutrition - HFS-306  
 Food and Drug Administration  
 Harvey W. Wiley Federal Building  
 5100 Paint Branch Parkway  
 College Park, MD 20740  
 Ph: +1 (301) 436-1488  
 Fax: +1 (301) 436-2632  
 Email: [John.Sheehan@fda.hhs.gov](mailto:John.Sheehan@fda.hhs.gov)

Ms Susan M. SAUSVILLE  
 Chief, Dairy Standardization  
 Agricultural Marketing Service  
 Dairy Programs  
 U.S. Department of Agriculture  
 1400 Independence Avenue, SW, Stop 0230  
 Washington, DC 20250-0230  
 Tel: +1 (202) 720-9382  
 Fax: +1 (202) 720-2643  
 Email : [Susan.Sausville@usda.gov](mailto:Susan.Sausville@usda.gov)

Mr Russell J. BISHOP  
 Director  
 Center for Dairy Research  
 University of Wisconsin – Madison  
 1605 Lindon Drive  
 Babcock Hall  
 Madison, WI 53706  
 Ph: +1 (608) 265-3696  
 Fax: +1 (608) 262-1578  
 Email: [jrbishop@cdr.wisc.edu](mailto:jrbishop@cdr.wisc.edu)

Ms Ann Mileur BOECKMAN  
 Senior Counsel, Food Law  
 Kraft Foods  
 Three Lakes Drive  
 Northfield, IL 60093  
 Ph: +1 (847) 646-2862  
 Fax: +1 (847) 646-4431  
 Email: [Ann.Boeckman@Kraft.com](mailto:Ann.Boeckman@Kraft.com)

Ms Cary FRYE  
 Vice President, Regulatory Affairs  
 International Dairy Foods Association  
 1250 H Street, NW, Suite 900  
 Washington, DC 20050  
 Ph: +1 (202) 737-4332  
 Fax: +1 (202) 331-7820  
 Email: [cfrye@idfa.org](mailto:cfrye@idfa.org)

Ms Deborah VAN DYK  
 Director of Legal Affairs  
 Schreiber Food, Inc.  
 425 Pine Street  
 P.O. Box 19010  
 Green Bay, WI 54307  
 Ph: +1 (920) 437-7601  
 Fax: +1 (920) 436-2700  
 Email: [deborah.van-dyk@sficorp.com](mailto:deborah.van-dyk@sficorp.com)

Mr Jim Moran  
 Research Principal  
 Kraft Foods R&D  
 Global Cheese & Dairy Technology  
 801 Waukegan Rd.  
 Glenview, IL 60025  
 Ph :+1 847 646-3859  
 Fax: +1 847 646-3864  
 Email: [jmoran@Kraft.com](mailto:jmoran@Kraft.com)

**INTERNATIONAL DAIRY FEDERATION**

Mr Michael HICKEY  
 Advisor  
 International Dairy Federation (IDF)  
 Irish National Committee of IDF  
 Derryreigh - Creggane, Charleville  
 Co. Cork  
 Ireland  
 Ph: +353 63 89392  
 Fax: +353 63 89392  
 Email : [mfhickey@oceanfree.net](mailto:mfhickey@oceanfree.net)

Ms Aurélie DUBOIS  
 Standards Officer  
 International Dairy Federation (IDF)  
 Diamant Building  
 80, Boulevard Auguste Reyers  
 1030 Brussels  
 Belgium  
 Ph: +322 706 8645  
 Fax: +322 733 0413  
 Email: [ADubois@fil-idf.org](mailto:ADubois@fil-idf.org)

**CODEX SECRETARIAT**

Ms Annamaria BRUNO  
 Food Standards Officer  
 Codex Secretariat – Joint FAO - WHO Food Standards  
 Programme  
 Viale delle Terme di Caracalla  
 00153 Rome  
 Italy  
 Ph: +39 06 570 56254  
 Fax: +39 570 54593  
 Email: [Annamaria.bruno@fao.org](mailto:Annamaria.bruno@fao.org)

**EUROPEAN COMMISSION**

Mr Jerome LEPEINTRE  
 Acting Head of Unit  
 European Commission  
 Rue Froissart 101 – 2/62  
 1049 Brussels  
 Belgium  
 Ph: +32 2 299 37 01  
 Fax: +32 2 299 85 66  
 Email: [Jerome.lepeintre@ec.europa.eu](mailto:Jerome.lepeintre@ec.europa.eu)

Mrs Bernadette KLINK KHACHAN  
EC Codex Contact Point  
European Commission  
Rue Froissart 101 – 2/50  
1049 Brussels  
Belgium  
Ph: +32 2 295 79 08  
Fax: +32 2 299 85 66  
Email: [Bernadette.klink-khachan@ec.europa.eu](mailto:Bernadette.klink-khachan@ec.europa.eu)

Mr José PAIXAO  
Administrator  
DG Agriculture  
European Commission  
Rue de la Loi 200  
1049 Brussels  
Belgium  
Ph : +32 2 296 14 63  
Fax: +32 2 295 33 10  
Email: [Jose.Paixao@ec.europa.eu](mailto:Jose.Paixao@ec.europa.eu)

Mr César CORTES  
General Secretariat of the Council of the European Union  
Rue de la Loi 175  
1048 Brussels  
Belgium  
Ph : +32 2 281 61 14  
Fax : +32 2 281 61 98  
Email : [cesar.cortes@consilium.europa.com](mailto:cesar.cortes@consilium.europa.com)

Mr Kari TÖLLIKKÖ  
General Secretariat of the Council of the European Union  
Rue de la Loi 175  
1048 Brussels  
Belgium  
Ph : +32 2 281 78 41  
Fax : +32 2 281 61 98  
Email : [kari.tollikko@consilium.europa.com](mailto:kari.tollikko@consilium.europa.com)

Mrs Raluca IVANESCU  
General Secretariat of the Council of the European Union  
Rue de la Loi 175  
1048 Brussels  
Belgium  
Ph : +32 2 281 31 58  
Fax : +32 2 281 61 98  
Email : [raluca.ivanescu@consilium.europa.com](mailto:raluca.ivanescu@consilium.europa.com)

**Working Paper on the Proposed Draft Standard for Processed Cheese (doc. 5)****1. Scope**

This Standard applies to products that are named “Process(ed) Cheese” (including named variety(ies) processed cheeses) intended for direct consumption or further processing, in conformity with the description in Section 2 of this Standard<sup>1</sup>.

**2. Description**

**Processed cheeses** are the semi-solid and spreadable<sup>2</sup> to solid and sliceable milk products obtained

- (i) from cheese (CODEX STAN A-6-1978), with or without the addition of other raw materials and permitted ingredients,
- (ii) by melting and emulsifying the mixture,
- (iii) with the aid of heat and emulsifying (or melting) salts in a well-mixed medium<sup>3</sup>,

to produce a homogeneous, smooth and stable oil-in-water emulsion.

**Named variety(ies) processed cheeses** are processed cheeses, as defined above, characterized by the use in their manufacture of one or more recognized varieties of cheese, and a reference to these in their designation<sup>4</sup>.

**3. Essential Composition and Quality Factors****3.1 Raw Materials**

- a. Cheese\*;
- b. Milk products rich in fat (e.g. butter\*, butteroil\*, ghee\*, cream\*, cream powder\*);
- c. Milk and milk products other than the above (e.g. milk concentrates, buttermilk, milk powders\*, milk proteins, whey powders\*, lactose\*).

\*) For further details, see relevant Codex standards.

The use of these raw materials shall be in conformance with Section 3.3.1.

**3.2 Permitted Ingredients**

- Sodium chloride, and/or salt substitutes (eg: potassium chloride);
- Water;
- Safe and suitable processing aids;

- [Gelatine and starches: these substances can be used in the same function as stabilizers, provided they are added only in amounts functionally necessary as governed by Good Manufacturing Practice taking into account any use of the stabilizers listed in section 4];

**Issues** : “Some delegations were in favour of the use of gelatine and starches in processed cheese because in their view they were required to manufacture processed cheese. Some delegations were in favour of the use of gelatine and starches provided that they were used within defined limits. Other delegations proposed their exclusion from the list of permitted ingredients because in their view they were not necessary in these products”. (cf. Alinorm 08/31/11 par.61)

“The Committee discussed the use of gelatine and starches in processed cheese. Several delegations opposed

<sup>1</sup> This standard does not cover other plain products that are named with descriptive designations that include the words “processed” and/or “cheese”, such as” Process(ed) Cheese Preparation”, “Process(ed) Cheese Product”, “Process(ed) Cheese Spread”, “Process(ed) Cheese Food”, “Process(ed) Cheese Speciality” and “Process(ed) Cheese Dessert”. **(This footnote is to be removed prior to adoption of the standard at step 8.)**

<sup>2</sup> In this context, reference to “spreadable” means that the product has a texture that is suitable for spreading by the consumer, e.g. it readily spreads on bread when taken directly from chilled storage conditions.

<sup>3</sup> Foot note explaining that emulsifying salts do not function directly as emulsifiers.

<sup>4</sup> For instance, “Process(ed) Cheddar Cheese”, “Cheddar Process(ed) Cheese”, “Process(ed) Cheddar”.



their inclusion in the standard because in their view binding agents were not necessary in the manufacture of processed cheese *per se*. Other delegations were in favour of their retention in the standard. In this regard it was variously mentioned that: gelatine and starches were used for the same function as stabilizers that needed to be applied to the manufacture of stringy and sliceable processed cheese; and that in their view, they were necessary in the manufacture especially of low fat processed cheese” (*Alinorm 08/31/11 par.66*)

“The revised proposed draft standard should at least include provisions for addressing the following issues: ...

- The acceptability of use of gelatine, starches and stabilizers in the manufacture of processed cheese, for instance by reference to national legislation; ...” (*Alinorm 08/31/11 par.72*)

**Objectives:** Address the use of gelatine and starch in the manufacture of processed cheese, taking into account the use of stabilizers (section 4); in relation to a distinction between processed cheese, which is covered by this standard, and processed cheese preparation, which is not covered by this standard.

**Proposed solutions:**

**Option 1:** no gelatine and starches authorized in PC covered by this standard

*Comments:*

There would be no restriction on the use of gelatine and starch in processed cheese preparations and products not covered by this standard, such as those listed in footnote 1.

There would be a clear difference between PC and processed cheese preparations.

**Option 2:** gelatine and starches could be used in all types of PC covered by this standard, with a defined maximum level

*Comments:*

There would be no restriction on the use of gelatine and starch in processed cheese preparations and products not covered by this standard, such as those listed in footnote 1.

The maximum level can be specified in a way that excludes unacceptable use of gelatine and starch.

**Option 3 (the current proposal):** “gelatine and starches can be used in the same function as stabilizers, provided they are added only in amounts functionally necessary as governed by Good Manufacturing Practice taking into account any use of the stabilizers listed in section 4”

*Comments:*

Gelatine and starch would be allowed to be used in PC covered by this standard but the limit allowed would be governed by GMP rather than defined.

Good manufacturing practice in the use of food additives means<sup>5</sup>:

a) the quantity of the additive added to food shall be limited to the lowest possible level necessary to accomplish its desired effect;

b) the quantity of the additive that becomes a component of food as a result of its use in the manufacturing, processing or packaging of a food and which is not intended to accomplish any physical, or other technical effect in the food itself, is reduced to the extent reasonably possible; and,

c) the additive is of appropriate food grade quality and is prepared and handled in the same way as a food ingredient.

Similar provisions are included in the standards for unripened cheese, cottage cheese, cream cheese, fermented milks, cream and dairy fat spreads.

- Vinegar;

- [cultures of harmless bacteria and enzymes]

- Where allowed in accordance with the Codex General Principles for the Addition of Essential Nutrients for Food, maximum and minimum levels for vitamins A, D and other nutrients, where appropriate, should be laid down by national legislation in accordance with the needs of individual

<sup>5</sup> Codex General Standard for Food Additives. Codex Stan 192-1995, Rev.9-2008. Preamble, section 3.3.

countries including, where appropriate, the prohibition of the use of particular nutrients.

### [3.3 Composition

The specifications for relative amounts of the three categories of raw materials specified below are to be calculated on product weight basis (*Alinorm 08/31/11 par.55, General support of the CCMMP*)

#### 3.3.1 Processed cheeses

**Issue :** “The Committee agreed that the presentation of the entire section needed to be improved and simplified. Some delegations noted that the two categories “products with relatively low moisture on a fat free basis” and “products with relatively high moisture on a fat free basis” were open to interpretation and might lead to disparity with respect to cheese content for products with the same moisture levels. These delegations suggested to either define the terms “relatively low moisture” and “relatively high moisture” or find other terms for these categories or ways to express the different compositions of these products. Other delegations suggested not to categorize these products on moisture on fat-free basis (MFFB) and to simplify the section by only categorizing the products by specifying the required dry matter (DM) contents for different ranges of fat in dry matter (FDM) content.

“The Committee discussed the FDM figures in section 3.3.2 “End product composition”. Some delegations were of the opinion that 75% maximum content (m/m) was too high and needed to be lowered to 65%. In this regard it was noted that the A-8 standards for the group with the highest fat content indicated 65% as minimum value and that there was a need to distinguish among different types of products (high fat and low fat content).

“In concluding the discussion on this section, the Committee agreed that the structure and presentation of the section needed to be considerably simplified and its content reconsidered and further discussed so as to reconcile the different views. Therefore, the Committee agreed to put the entire Section in square brackets.” (*Alinorm 08/31/11 par.63 - 65*)

**Objectives :** To follow CCMMP’s recommendations, simplifying this section, by proposing different options ranked from the simplest to the most complex, and using answers to the Codex questionnaire on processed cheese and IDF technological input

**Proposed solutions :**

#### **Option 1 : an inclusive standard (Ex : standard A6 « Cheese »,...)**

with only an end product composition criteria, and without differentiating types of processed cheese, and no raw materials criteria.

*Comments:*

Standard A6 is a General Standard that has a comprehensive and general description of cheese. It does not include compositional specifications, but instead the labelling section provides descriptive designations (e.g. Ripened, Mould ripened, Unripened, Hard, Soft, etc), and declaration of fat content (High fat, Full fat, etc).

A similar approach could be used for PC covered by this standard. Labelling provisions could be used to inform consumers of the nature of the processed cheese, for instance by using descriptive terms associated with specific FDM, DM, and cheese content.

#### **Option 2 : an inclusive standard (Ex : standard A6 « Cheese »,...), but with 2 types of products differentiated on the FDM and DM criteria**

such as in the current proposal, simplified by using the same ranges of Fat in Dry Matter for both types of processed cheese to be consistent

*Comments:*

Similar to Option 1 but FDM and DM provisions would be covered as part of the Composition section and more specifically stated.

A possible format for the table of composition could be:

| FDM content                 | Minimum DM content |         |
|-----------------------------|--------------------|---------|
|                             | Type I             | Type II |
| Equal to or above 50% MG/ES | 50%                | 40%     |

|                                |     |     |
|--------------------------------|-----|-----|
| Equal to 40% but less than 50% | 42% | 35% |
| Equal to 30% but less than 40% | 34% | 30% |
| Less than 30%                  | 29% | 25% |

Labelling provisions can be used to inform consumers of the nature of the processed cheese.

**Option 3 : an inclusive standard** (Ex : standard A6 « Cheese »,...), with 2 categories of products differentiated on both the FDM and DM (on the basis of option 2) and the cheese content criteria, simplified by merging points 3.3.1 and 3.3.2 of the current draft standard

*Comment:*

Similar to Option 1 but FDM, DM and cheese content provisions would be covered as part of the Composition section and more specifically stated.

|   |
|---|
| <p><u>Milk fat in dry matter (FDM):</u></p> <p>Minimum content (m/m): None</p> <p>Maximum content (m/m): 75%</p> <p>Compositional modifications beyond the minima and maxima specified above for FDM and DM are not considered to be in compliance with section 4.3.3 of the Codex General Standard for the Use of Dairy Terms (CODEX STAN 206-1999).</p> |
|---|

### 3.3.2 Named variety processed cheeses

|   |
|---|
| <p>Notwithstanding 3.3.1, the cheese variety(ies) referenced in the designation of named variety(ies) processed cheeses in accordance with section 7.1.3 shall constitute at least [60 / 75% on a product weight basis and 55% on a product weight basis for mould ripened cheese]</p> <p>Of the three categories of raw materials specified in Section 3.1, category (c) materials shall not exceed [x % on product weight basis]</p> <p><u>Issue:</u> “The Committee had a general discussion [...] on the figure [15%] on a product weight basis for raw materials specified in section 3.1, category c. [...] With regard to raw materials specified in section 3.1, category c, several delegations noted that it was not possible to comment on this figure until the issue of the basis for determination of cheese content was decided (<i>Alinorm 08/31/11 par.56</i>). As a conclusion, the Committee agreed to use as a basis for its discussion the following figures : [...]For raw materials specified in Section 3.1 category c: [x% on a product weight basis]. (<i>Alinorm 08/31/11 par.57</i>)”</p> |
|---|

## 4. Food Additives

Only those additives classes indicated in the table below may be used for the product categories specified<sup>6</sup>.

| Additive functional class:     | Processed cheese    |                     |         |
|--------------------------------|---------------------|---------------------|---------|
|                                | Type I<br>[> x% DM] | Type I<br>[< x% DM] | Type II |
| Colours                        | X                   | X                   | X       |
| Emulsifying (or Melting) Salts | X                   | X                   | X       |

*Cf. point 3.3.1 “Processed cheese””, option 2 or 3.*

<sup>6</sup> It should be understood that individual additives are listed indicating their principal functional class in products covered by this standard, but it is recognized that some of these additives have more than one function and such additives may be used for those functions provided that class is permitted in this standard and the additive concerned is recognized as having that function in the GSFA and only within the limits specified hereafter.

|                    |   |     |     |  |
|--------------------|---|-----|-----|--|
| Acidity Regulators | X | X   | X   |  |
| Preservatives      | X | X   | X   |  |
| Emulsifiers        | X | X   | X   |  |
| Stabilizers        | - | [X] | [X] |  |
| Thickeners         | - | -   | -   |  |
| Anticaking Agents* | X | X   | X   |  |

\*) For the surface treatment of sliced, cut, shredded and grated products only.

X = The use of additives belonging to the class is technologically justified.

- = The use of additives belonging to the class is not technologically justified.

Issues: See section 3.2.

Objectives: Address the acceptability of use of [...] stabilizers in the manufacture of processed cheese, for instance by reference to national legislation (*Alinorm 08/31/11 par.72*); taking into account the use of gelatine and starch (section 3.2); in relation with the distinction between processed cheese and processed cheese preparations;

Proposal: IDF has been asked to provide a description of the technical functions of stabilizers. See also countries' answers to the Codex questionnaire.

*Comment:*

Technological justification relevant to stabilizers means<sup>7</sup>:

“The use of food additives is justified only when such use has an advantage, does not present an appreciable health risk to consumers, does not mislead the consumer, and serves one or more of the technological functions set out by Codex and the needs set out from (a) through (d) below, and only where these objectives cannot be achieved by other means that are economically and technologically practicable: (...)

c) to enhance the keeping quality or stability of a food or to improve its organoleptic properties, provided that this does not change the nature, substance or quality of the food so as to deceive the consumer; (...)”

*Note – points (a), (b) and (d) omitted as not relevant to the use of stabilizers.*

| INS No.                               | Name of Additive   | Maximum level |                          |
|---------------------------------------|--|---------------|--------------------------|
| <b>Colours</b>                        |  |               |                          |
| 101i,ii                               | Riboflavins  | 300 mg/kg     |                          |
| 140                                   | Chlorophyll  | [15] mg/kg    | Singly or in combination |
| 141i, ii                              | Chlorophylls, Copper Complexes   |               |                          |
| 160a (i)                              | Beta-Carotene (Synthetic)  | 25 mg/kg      |                          |
| 160a (ii)                             | Carotenes (Vegetable); Natural Extracts  | 600 mg/kg     |                          |
| 160b (i)                              | Annatto Extracts – Bixin Based   | 60 mg/kg      | Calculated as bixin      |
| 160b (ii)                             | Annatto Extracts – Norbixin Based  | 25 mg/kg      | Calculated as bixin      |
| 160e                                  | beta-Apo-8'-Carotenal  | 35 mg/kg      |                          |
| 160f                                  | beta-Apo-8'-Carotenoic Acid, methyl and ethyl esters                           | 35 mg/kg      |                          |
| <b>Emulsifying (or Melting) Salts</b> |  |               |                          |
| 325                                   | Sodium Lactate   | GMP           |                          |
| 326                                   | Potassium Lactate  | GMP           |                          |
| 327                                   | Calcium Lactate  | GMP           |                          |
| 331i-iii                              | Sodium Dihydrogen Citrate; [Disodium Citrate <sup>8</sup> ]; Trisodium Citrate | GMP           |                          |
| 332i,ii                               | Potassium citrates   | GMP           |                          |
| 333                                   | Calcium Citrates   | GMP           |                          |
| 334                                   | Tartaric Acid (L(+)-)  | 34,900 mg/kg  | Singly or in combination |
| 335i,ii                               | Monosodium Tartrate; Disodium Tartrate   |               |                          |
| 336i,ii                               | Monopotassium Tartrate; Dipotassium Tartrate                                   |               |                          |
| 337                                   | Potassium Sodium Tartrate  |               |                          |

<sup>7</sup> Codex General Standard for Food Additives. Codex Stan 192-1995, Rev.9-2008. Preamble, section 3.2.

<sup>8</sup> Subject to JECFA approval for processed cheese.

| INS No.                   | Name of Additive  | Maximum level |   |
|---------------------------|---|---------------|---|
| 339i-iii                  | Sodium Dihydrogen Phosphate; Disodium Hydrogen Phosphate; Trisodium Phosphate   | 20,000 mg/kg  | Singly or in combination expressed as P2O5 <sup>9</sup> |
| 340i-iii                  | Potassium Dihydrogen Phosphate; Dipotassium Hydrogen Phosphate; Tripotassium Phosphate  |               |   |
| 341i-iii                  | Calcium Dihydrogen Phosphate; Calcium Hydrogen Phosphate; Tricalcium Phosphate  |               |   |
| 343i,ii                   | Monomagnesium Phosphate; Dimagnesium Orthophosphate   |               |   |
| 450i-vii                  | Disodium Diphosphate; Trisodium Diphosphate; Tetrasodium Diphosphate; [Dipotassium Diphosphate <sup>10</sup> ;] Tetrapotassium Diphosphate; Dicalcium Diphosphate; Calcium Dihydrogen Diphosphate |               |   |
| 451i,ii                   | Pentasodium Triphosphate; Pentapotassium Triphosphate   |               |   |
| 452i,ii,iv,v              | Sodium Polyphosphates, Glassy; Potassium Polyphosphate; Calcium Polyphosphate; Ammonium Polyphosphate   |               |   |
| <b>Acidity Regulators</b> |   |               |   |
| 170i                      | Calcium Carbonate   | GMP           |   |
| 260                       | Acetic Acid, Glacial  | GMP           |   |
| 261                       | Potassium Acetate   | GMP           |   |
| 262i                      | Sodium Acetate  | GMP           |   |
| 263                       | Calcium Acetate   | GMP           |   |
| 270                       | Lactic Acid   | GMP           |   |
| 296                       | Malic Acid (DL-)  | GMP           |   |
| [297]                     | [Fumaric Acid]  | [GMP]         |   |
| 330                       | Citric Acid GMP   | GMP           |   |
| 338                       | Orthophosphoric Acid  | 5,000 mg/kg   | expressed as P2O5                                       |
| 575                       | Glucono delta-Lactone   | GMP           |   |
| <b>Preservatives</b>      |   |               |   |
| 200                       | Sorbic Acid   | 2,000 mg/kg   | Singly or in combination expressed as sorbic acid       |
| 201                       | Sodium Sorbate  |               |   |
| 202                       | Potassium Sorbate   |               |   |
| 203                       | Calcium Sorbate   |               |   |
| 280                       | Propionic Acid  | GMP           |   |
| 281                       | Sodium Propionate   | GMP           |   |
| 282                       | Calcium Propionate  | GMP           |   |
| 283                       | Potassium Propionate  | GMP           |   |
| 234                       | Nisin   | 12.5 mg/kg    |   |
| 301                       | Sodium Ascorbate  | GMP           |   |
| 302                       | Calcium Ascorbate   | GMP           |   |
| 1105                      | Lysozyme Hydrochloride  | GMP           |   |
| <b>Emulsifiers</b>        |   |               |   |
| 322                       | Lecithins   | GMP           |   |
| 471                       | Mono- and Diglycerides of fatty acids   | GMP           |   |
| 472a                      | Acetic and Fatty Acid Esters of Glycerol  | GMP           |   |
| 472b                      | Lactic and Fatty Acid Esters of Glycerol  | GMP           |   |
| 472c                      | Citric and Fatty Acid Esters of Glycerol  | GMP           |   |
| 472e                      | Diacetyltartaric and Fatty Acid Esters of Glycerol  | 10,000 mg/kg  |   |
| 472f                      | Tartaric, Acetic and Fatty Acid Esters of Glycerol (Mixed)  |               |   |
| 473                       | Sucrose Esters of Fatty Acids   | 10,000 mg/kg  |   |
| 476                       | Polyglycerol Esters of Interesterified Ricinoleic Acid  | 5,000 mg/kg   |   |

<sup>9</sup> The GSFA expresses phosphates as P and max. 14,050 mg/kg

<sup>10</sup> Subject to JECFA approval for processed cheese.

| INS No.                  | Name of Additive                                  | Maximum level |  |
|--------------------------|---|---------------|--|
| <b>[Stabilizers]</b>     |   |               |  |
| [401]                    | [Sodium Alginate]                                 | [GMP]         |  |
| [402]                    | [Potassium Alginate]                              | [GMP]         |  |
| [403]                    | [Ammonium Alginate]                               | [GMP]         |  |
| [404]                    | [Calcium Alginate]                                | [GMP]         |  |
| [406]                    | [Agar]  | [GMP]         |  |
| [407]                    | [Carrageenan]                                     | [GMP]         |  |
| [410]                    | [Carob Bean Gum]                                  | [GMP]         |  |
| [412]                    | [Guar Gum]  | [GMP]         |  |
| [413]                    | [Tragacanth Gum]                                  | [GMP]         |  |
| [414]                    | [Gum Arabic]                                      | [GMP]         |  |
| [415]                    | [Xanthan Gum]                                     | [GMP]         |  |
| [418]                    | [Gellan Gum]                                      | [GMP]         |  |
| [440]                    | [Pectins (Amidated and Non-amidated)]             | [GMP]         |  |
| [461]                    | [Methyl Cellulose]                                | [GMP]         |  |
| [466]                    | [Sodium Carboxymethyl Cellulose]                  | [GMP]         |  |
| [1400]                   | [Dextrins White and yellow, Roasted Starch]       | [GMP]         |  |
| [1401]                   | [Acid Treated Starch]                             | [GMP]         |  |
| [1402]                   | [Alkaline Treated Starch]                         | [GMP]         |  |
| [1403]                   | [Bleached Starch]                                 | [GMP]         |  |
| [1404]                   | [Oxidised Starch]                                 | [GMP]         |  |
| [1405]                   | [Enzyme Treated Starch]                           | [GMP]         |  |
| [1410]                   | [Monostarch Phosphate]                            | [GMP]         |  |
| [1412]                   | [Distarch Phosphate]                              | [GMP]         |  |
| [1413]                   | [Phosphated Distarch Phosphate]                   | [GMP]         |  |
| [1414]                   | [Acetylated Distarch Phosphate]                   | [GMP]         |  |
| [1420]                   | [Starch Acetate esterified with Acetic Anhydride] | [GMP]         |  |
| [1421]                   | [Starch Acetate esterified with Vinyl Acetate]    | [GMP]         |  |
| [1422]                   | [Acetylated Distarch Adipate]                     | [GMP]         |  |
| [1440]                   | [Hydroxypropyl Starch]                            | [GMP]         |  |
| [1442]                   | [Hydroxypropyl Distarch Phosphate]                | [GMP]         |  |
| [1450]                   | [Starch Sodium Octenyl Succinate]                 | [GMP]         |  |
| <b>Anticaking Agents</b> |   |               |  |
| 460i                     | Microcrystalline Cellulose                        | GMP           |  |
| 460ii                    | Powdered Cellulose                                | GMP           |  |
| 551                      | Silicon Dioxide(Amorphous)                        | 10 g/kg       | Singly or in combination expressed as SiO <sub>2</sub> |
| 552                      | Calcium Silicate                                  |               |  |
| 553i                     | Magnesium Silicate (Synthetic)                    |               |  |
| 553iii                   | Talc  |               |  |
| 554                      | Sodium Aluminosilicate                            |               |  |
| 556                      | Calcium Aluminium Silicate                        |               |  |
| 559                      | Aluminium Silicate                                |               |  |

## 5. Contaminants

The milk used in the manufacture of the raw materials and of the products covered by this Standard shall comply with the maximum limits for contaminants and the maximum residue limits for pesticides and veterinary drugs established by the Codex Alimentarius Commission.

## 6. Hygiene

It is recommended that the products covered by the provisions of this standard be prepared and handled in accordance with the appropriate Sections of the Recommended International Code of Practice – General Principles of Food Hygiene (CAC/RCP 1-1969), the Code of Hygienic Practice for Milk and Milk Products (CAC/RCP 57-2004) and other relevant Codex texts such as Codes of Hygienic Practice and Codes of Practice. The products should comply with any microbiological criteria established in accordance with the Principles for the Establishment and Application of Microbiological Criteria for Foods (CAC/GL 21-1997).

## 7. Labelling

In addition to the provisions of the Codex General Standard for the Labelling of Prepackaged Foods (CODEX STAN 1-1985) and the General Standard for the Use of Dairy Terms (CODEX STAN 206-1999), the following specific provisions apply:

### 7.1. Name of the food

**7.1.1** The name of the food shall be “Process(ed) Cheese”.

**7.1.2** The designation of Processed Cheese with a relatively high moisture on fat free basis (MFFB) shall be accompanied by a qualifying term describing the true nature of the product, in a way that is accurate and not misleading to the consumer in the country of retail sale.

Issue: The Committee noted that the section needed to be revised to reflect further decisions on the categorization of processed cheese (composition section). (Alinorm 08/31/11 par.67)

Objectives: to follow the CCMMP recommendation, and to actualize this paragraph in relation with previous proposals established in the standard

Proposed solutions:

#### **Option 1: Delete the current paragraph 7.1.2 and replace it by the following proposals:**

*Comments:*

In order to take the different situations in the world into account, it is proposed to consider alternatives referring to national legislations and previously used in existing Codex standards such as “fermented milks” or “cream”...:

1/ Example Codex standard for “Fermented milk, par.7.1.2”: “Products in the scope of this standard shall be named “Processed cheese”. If the consumer would be misled by this name, the products shall be named as permitted by national legislation in the country of retail sale. In countries where no such legislation exists, or no other names are in common usage, the product shall be named “Processed cheese”.

2/ Example : Codex standard for “Creams”: “The name of the food shall be “Processed cheese”. The products covered by this Standard may alternatively be designated with other names specified in the national legislation of the country in which the product is manufactured and/or sold or with a name existing by common usage, provided that such designations do not create an erroneous impression in the country of retail sale regarding the character and identity of the food.”

#### **Option 2: Revise the current paragraph 7.1.2 as follows**

*Comment:*

The wording could be simplified by referring to Type II, for example:

“The designation of Type II Processed Cheese shall be accompanied by an appropriate qualifying term if the consumer in the country of retail sale would be misled by its omission”.

In addition, appropriate qualifiers describing the fat content may be used.

Use of nutritional claims such as reduced fat can be part of the designation and shall be in line with the Guidelines for the Use of Nutritional Claims (CAC/GL 23-1997). For the purpose of comparative nutritional claims, the minimum fat content of 40% fat in dry matter constitutes the reference.

**7.1.3** Named variety(ies) processed cheeses shall be named “\_\_\_\_\_ Process(ed) Cheese” or “Process(ed) \_\_\_\_\_ Cheese”, the blank being filled with the name(s) of a cheese variety(ies), as appropriate, in accordance with sections 2 and 3.1. of this Standard. Where acceptable in the country of retail sale, the word “cheese” can be omitted.

**7.1.4** The designation of a product, in which recognized cheese variety(ies) constitute(s) less than the minimum amount required for named variety(ies) processed cheese (Section 3.3.2), may place special emphasis on the presence by designating the product “Process(ed) Cheese with \_\_\_\_\_” or “Process(ed) Cheese flavoured with \_\_\_\_\_”, as appropriate, the blank being filled with the name(s) of the variety(ies), provided that the variety(ies) constitute(s) at least 2% of the ingoing raw materials on product weight basis and that the ingoing percentage(s) of the variety(ies) (m/m) at the time of manufacture is declared in the list of ingredients (on product weight basis).

Issue: Several delegations did not support the provision allowing for the use in the labelling of the name of a cheese variety of which the presence constituted at least 2% of ingoing raw materials since it could mislead consumers. These delegations suggested either to delete the provisions or to retain the provision to declare the percentage on the label. ” (Alinorm 08/31/11 par.68)

### **7.2 Declaration of milk fat content**

The milk fat content shall be declared in a manner found acceptable in the country of sale to the final consumer, either (i) as a percentage by mass, (ii) as a percentage of fat in dry matter, or (iii) in grams per serving as quantified in the label provided that the number of servings is stated.

### **7.3 Declaration of cheese content**

1. The ingoing percentage of cheese in the formulation (m/m) shall be declared if so required in the country of retail sale.

Proposed solution:

According to the different options proposed in section 3.3 “Composition”, different labelling solutions can be considered:

**Option 1 of paragraph 3.3:** labelling of cheese should be mandatory

**Option 2 of paragraph 3.3:** labelling of cheese content should be made if so required in the national legislation of the country of retail sale

**Option 3 of paragraph 3.3 :** as a minimum cheese content is set, labelling should not be mandatory

*Comment:*

Results of the Codex questionnaire on processed cheese should be taken into account

### **7.4 Declaration of milk protein content<sup>11</sup>**

If the consumer would be misled by the omission, the milk protein content shall be declared in a manner acceptable in the country of sale to the final consumer, either as (i) a percentage by mass, or (ii) grams per serving as quantified in the label provided the number of servings is stated.

### **7.5 Labelling of Non-retail Containers**

Information required in Section 7 of this Standard and Sections 4.1 to 4.8 of the General Standard for the Labelling of Prepackaged Foods (CODEX STAN 1), and, if necessary, storage instructions, shall be given either on the container or in accompanying documents, except that the name of the product, lot identification, and the name and the address of the manufacturer or packer shall appear on the container, and in the absence of such a container on the processed cheeses themselves. However, lot identification, and the name and address of the manufacturer or packer may be replaced by an identification mark, provided that such a mark is clearly identifiable with the accompanying documents.

<sup>11</sup> The nitrogen to protein conversion factor of 6,38 should be used



**8. Methods of sampling and analysis<sup>12</sup>**

| <b>Provision</b>   | <b>Method</b>                        | <b>Principle</b>                        | <b>Comments</b>   | <b>Type</b> |
|--|--------------------------------------|---|---|-------------|
| Milk fat in dry matter   | IDF 5:2004   ISO 1735:2004           | Gravimetry (Schmid-Bondzynski-Ratzlaff) | This method measures fat. When DM is measured by IDF 4:2004/ISO5534:2004 FDM may be obtained by calculation | I           |
| Milk fat in dry matter [in processed cheese types to be specified] | IDF 124-1/3:2005   ISO 8262-1/3:2005 | Gravimetry (Weibull- Berntrop)          | This method measures fat. When DM is measured by IDF 4:2004/ISO5534:2004 FDM may be obtained by calculation |             |
| Dry matter   | IDF 4:2004   ISO 5534:2004           | Gravimetry Drying at 102°C              | Applicability of this method has not been checked for this type of product.                                 |             |
| Protein  | IDF/RM 25: 2005   ISO/TS17837:2005   | Kjeldahl Method                         | This method measures total protein and does not specifically measure milk protein                           | I           |

---

<sup>12</sup> This section is based on CX/MMP 06/7/13

## THE USE OF STABILISERS AND CERTAIN STABILISING INGREDIENTS IN PROCESSED CHEESE PRODUCTS

Submitted by the International Dairy Federation (IDF) as technical input to the on-going deliberations of the CCMMP Working Group on Processed Cheese

### INTRODUCTION

IDF has developed this document in response to a request for technical input from the joint Chairs (FR, NZ) of the Codex Working Group (WG) on Processed Cheese.

IDF would like to point out that some countries do allow the use stabilisers and ingredients with stabilising properties (gelatine and starch) in the manufacture of processed cheese whereas others do not. In some countries where the use is permitted the resulting products are designated as processed cheese whereas in other countries such products are designated as processed cheese preparations. In light of these facts and for the purpose of this document, IDF uses the term “Processed Cheese Products” as a term intended to encompass Processed Cheeses (PCs) and Processed Cheese Preparations (PCPs), yet remain neutral as regards the issue of whether such additives and/or ingredients should be used in PCs and/or PCPs. The question on whether or not to use ingredients with stabilising properties (gelatine and starch) in Processed Cheese Products is related to the composition of the product, the raw materials used and certain processing conditions.

This response has been prepared based on information received from the members of the IDF Standing Committee on Standards of Identity as well a number of sources within the public domain (publications, personal discussions etc). However IDF recognises that some information, being commercially sensitive, has not necessarily been supplied and therefore the document may not reflect all the uses of stabilizers and ingredients with stabilising properties.

#### Response:

Traditionally the primary stabilisation in processed cheese products is by casein and/or paracasein, which is brought into its active stabilising state by the use of emulsifying salts, which, in effect, remove the calcium from the casein and increase the pH to about 5.8 – 6.0. 60% to 80% of the total casein is then soluble; it binds water and emulsifies the free fat released in the processing of the raw material cheese in the processed cheese “cooker”.

In the case of rennet coagulated cheese, the casein is in the form of insoluble calcium phosphate paracasein. The added emulsifying salts sequester the calcium and in the presence of high pH (5.8 – 6.0), the calcium depleted paracasein is soluble to the extent of 60% – 80% of the total casein present.

In the case of acid coagulated cheese, the casein is insoluble due to the low pH and the absence of a negative charge. In the presence of emulsifying salts, the pH is buffered to 5.8 – 6.0 and the casein now becomes sodium caseinate and is soluble to a similar extent to that described for rennet coagulated cheese above (i.e. 60% – 80%)<sup>13</sup>.

In the case of more mature cheeses (with high levels of primary proteolysis and hence lower levels of intact casein – for example at about 65%, compared to 85% - 90% in relatively young cheese with little proteolysis), one gets similar high levels of soluble casein, but this will not give the necessary emulsification of the free fat, because it is the soluble intact casein that emulsifies the free fat efficiently and contributes to the viscosity, texture and consistency of the finished processed cheese product.

In products containing an equivalent level of soluble protein, but which has been hydrolysed to a greater degree (and hence contains less intact casein), the contribution of the soluble protein phase to viscosity, texture and consistency of the finished product, particularly in high moisture processed cheese spreads (spreadable processed cheese) will be less. In such cases the addition of stabilisers (and ingredients with stabilising effects, such as starch and gelatine) can provide an important role in imparting viscosity and consistency which facilitates filling into packaging, particularly where high throughput filling equipment is used, and also contribute to a smooth creamy texture in the final product, without altering the organoleptic properties. However, their addition is but one approach, and other means can also be considered, including selection of cheese, the type/level of milk protein/casein ingredients, “creaming” in processing by the use of rework/remelt cheese, processing conditions, etc.

#### Evolving processes and products

In addition to the above example, stabilisers and ingredients with stabilising properties are used in processed cheese products where certain evolving technologies are used to produce products with specific functional properties or compositional characteristics.

---

<sup>13</sup> This description of Processed Cheese Products is a general one. It is not intended to be an all inclusive description of the many ways in which they are manufactured. The authors fully appreciate that some such products, currently on the market, may differ in composition, pH and ingredients to that described here.

Hydrocolloids, including the vegetable gums, pectins, alginates, carrageenan, agar, methyl celluloses, starch and the related chemically modified or semi-synthetic products (such as the modified starches) are the stabilisers most commonly used. Gelatine is a protein product, while most of the others are hydrophilic carbohydrates and/or cellulose derivatives or polymers of sugars (starch is such a polymer of glucose). They have a common ability to bind water to improve consistency, provide a smooth mouthfeel and form thick products with variable consistency (Berger et al, 1989).

The hydrocolloid stabilisers are used at maximum levels of between 1.5% and 2%, with the higher levels used in lower fat products. The levels of the additives that are modified starches<sup>14</sup> tend to be used at levels up to 4%. Combinations of stabilisers tend to be used rather than individual stabilisers. One example given in the literature is of the use and levels of stabiliser(s) that could be used is a mix of Xanthan Gum and Guar Gum in a 60:40 ⇔ 40:60. Other references give a combination of carboxymethyl cellulose (CMC) and Xanthan Gum, combined with a special emulsifying salt as the best stabiliser for processed cheeses based on fresh cheeses (Berger et al, 1989).

Gelatine is used to maximum levels of about 2.5% to 3%, while starches, classified in the GSLPF as ingredients, are used at levels up to 4%.

**The following are some particular examples of where stabilisers and ingredients with stabilising properties are used in the manufacture of processed cheese products.**

These are given by way of example and do not purport to be an exhaustive list.

**1. High Temperature Processing**

This process is used to produce different types of processed cheese products for consumption in different regions of the world but also modify the structure with stabilisers used to provide the necessary texture and stability (by preventing syneresis and oil release).

**2. Lower pH Products**

Some processed cheese products have lower pH levels to those outlined earlier (e.g. 5.2 to 5.8). Such products have increased bacteriostatic and good organoleptic properties. Products, particularly those with a pH at the lower level of this range use stabilisers (e.g. hydrocolloids and modified starches) to achieve the desired texture and stability in addition to casein and emulsifying salts.

**3. Products with certain functionalities (e.g. stringiness and melting)**

**Stringy products:**

Processed cheese products with a relatively low level of emulsifying salts (less than 1% versus 2.5% to 3%) and a relatively low pH (5.3 -5.5) giving an end product (normally in slice format, but can also be in blocks) with increased stringiness when heated on toast. Stabilisers, generally the gums, are added at a level of less than 1% to provide the required emulsification and compensate for the lower level of emulsifying salts used. Even with the normal levels of emulsifying salts, the addition of stabilisers improves the melting functionality and also the sliceability of processed cheese products in blocks when used on high throughput slicing equipment.

**Good spreadability and good melting properties:**

Hydrocolloid stabilisers are also used in the production of spreadable products that are smooth with a spreadable texture when used at ambient temperature and also have good melting properties when heated.

**4. Lower fat products (e.g. < 40% FDM):**

There is an increasing demand for lower fat properties. Stabilisers are used in the manufacture of some such products to achieve smooth texture and good mouthfeel, to assist sliceability of processed cheese in blocks, and also to contribute to food safety and keeping quality. The level of stabilizers needed in such products is higher than in those used in products with higher dry matter and fat in dry matter.

**The use of food additives**

The use of food additives is governed by the principle of justification as outlined in Section 3.2 of the Preamble to the Codex General Standard for Food Additives (see Appendix I).

**Conformance with the GSUDT**

In addition to the general principle contained in the GSFA, the use of gelatine, starch or stabilisers in processed cheese products is also governed by the principles of the Codex General Standard for the Use of Dairy Terms and in particular Section 4.6.4. thereof:-

---

<sup>14</sup> This refers to chemically modified starches (INS Numbers from 1400 – 1451) which are additives. Starch may also be modified by physical or enzymatic methods but such starches, together with native (unmodified) starch may be designated as “starch” under the Codex GSLPF Section 4.2.3.1.

*“... the term “milk”, or the name of a milk product may be used in the description of the true nature of the product, provided that the constituents not derived from milk are not intended to take the place, in part or in whole, of any milk constituent. For these products dairy terms may be used only if the consumer would not be misled.*

**Reference:**

Berger, W., Klostermeyer, H., Merkenich, K., and Uhlmann, G. (1989). Development of the Processed Cheese Market. Pages 11-25 in *Processed Cheese Manufacture: A JOHA Guide*. BK Ladenburg GmbH, Ladenburg.

---

**Annex I**

**Section 3.2 of Preamble to GSFA**

**The Justification for the Use of Additives**

The use of food additives is justified only when such use has an advantage, does not present an appreciable health risk to consumers, does not mislead the consumer, and serves one or more of the technological functions set out by Codex and the needs set out from (a) through (d) below, and only where these objectives cannot be achieved by other means that are economically and technologically practicable:

- (a) to preserve the nutritional quality of the food; an intentional reduction in the nutritional quality of a food would be justified in the circumstances dealt with in sub-paragraph and also in other circumstances where the food does not constitute a significant item in a normal diet;
- (b) to provide necessary ingredients or constituents for foods manufactured for groups of consumers having special dietary needs;
- (c) to enhance the keeping quality or stability of a food or to improve its organoleptic properties, provided that this does not change the nature, substance or quality of the food so as to deceive the consumer;
- (d) to provide aids in the manufacture, processing, preparation, treatment, packing, transport or storage of food, provided that the additive is not used to disguise the effects of the use of faulty raw materials or of undesirable (including unhygienic) practices or techniques during the course of any of these activities.



**Australian Government**

**Australian Quarantine  
and Inspection Service**

# **CCMMP QUESTIONNAIRE ON PROCESSED CHEESE**

**Presentation prepared by Slava Zeman  
Leader of the Australian delegation to CCMMP**

**January 2009**

# Introduction

- A physical Working Group, under the co-leadership of France and New Zealand, was established in February '08 to revise the proposed draft standard for processed cheese for circulation at Step 3 and further consideration at Step 4 at the 9th Session of the Committee.
- In order to facilitate the work of the Working Group, Codex members and observers would be invited to electronically submit information.
- France, New Zealand and Australia developed a questionnaire that facilitated the gathering of information.

# Introduction continued

Information requested in the questionnaire included;

- Name of product (other than brand name) / product designation;
- Quantity produced
  - total quantity
  - per international trade
  - per cheese content
  - per true nature (spreadable, sliceable, stringy);
- Labelling cheese content;
- Gelatine and starches;
- Stabilisers;
- Fat and dry matter content; and
- National legislation in relation to the above 4 points.

# Results

## **21 delegations have responded to the questionnaire**

- Australia
- Czech Republic
- Ireland
- Lithuania
- Spain
- Portugal
- Austria
- France
- Italy
- Netherlands
- Sweden
- Belgium
- Germany
- Japan
- New Zealand
- United Kingdom
- Canada
- Iran
- Libya
- Slovakia
- United States



# Results - Question 1

## ***Name of product /product designation (not brand name)***

Product names or designations within individual country legislation is most commonly categorised on one hand as 'processed cheese' (general) and on the other hand 'processed cheese preparations' (ie Codex terminology) or other names such as processed cheese spread, processed cheese food (in Canada, Libya and USA).

Designations such as 'sliceable processed cheese', "spreadable processed cheese" or "stringy processed cheese" are generally not used (they are included within other designations or considered as not relevant).

# Results - Question 2

## ***Quantity manufactured (annually, in tonnes)***

- Countries responded to this question in various ways, however, provided data are interesting if analysed country by country:
  - 19 countries provided information regarding quantity produced annually;
  - some countries provided a response as a % value of total production, others provided total tonnage. Where this was clear, tonnage were added.
- Answers to this question give an interesting information on processed cheese and processed cheese preparation production in each country.
  - Additional information is also provided regarding the different categories of processed cheese manufactured in each country.
- The diversity of provided data makes difficult the realisation of a clear synthesis of answers.

# Results - Question 2.1

## *TOTAL PRODUCED*

- *Per cheese content <25% cheese (on weight basis).*
- *Per cheese content <25 – 50% cheese content (on weight basis)*
- *Per cheese content <50 – 75% cheese (on weight basis)*
- *Per cheese content > 75% cheese (on weight basis)*

Limited number of countries responded to this question, therefore it is not possible to propose a conclusion - summary.

# Results - Question 2.2

## ***2.2.1 Quantity Produced in International Trade***

- 20 countries provided information regarding quantity produced per international trade.
- Answers to this question give an interesting information on the importance of the trade of processed cheese in each country, and of processed cheese preparations when data could be provided.
- These data could be related to answers provided by each country on quantities produced annually (question 2).

## Results - Question 2.2 - continued

### **2.2.1 Quantity Produced per cheese content**

*<25% cheese (on weight basis)*

*>25-50% cheese (on weight basis)*

*>50-75% cheese (on weight basis)*

*> 75% cheese (on weight basis)*

Limited number of countries responded to these questions, a meaningful summary is not possible.

# Results - Question 3

## ***Cheese content***

*Does your national legislation stipulate a cheese content value? Please indicate the value and the format.*

Responses indicate that in general, national legislations do not stipulate cheese content; where it is prescribed, this is limited to 'Processed cheese' (general) and, to a smaller extent, to 'Processed cheese preparation'.

Within these designations, less than half of countries (7 out of documented answers) indicated that cheese content is stipulated.

# Results - Question 4

## ***Labelling cheese content***

*Please indicate*

- 1. whether labelling of cheese content is required in your national legislation and*
- 2. in what format it is applied, e.g. as % of the dry matter content or as a % of the final product weight.*

Responses indicate that, for the majority of countries, legislation does not specify labelling of cheese content.

However:

- Italy, Sweden and Czech Republic indicated they require labelling in the case of named variety processed cheese and
- labelling is required in Belgium, Libya and New Zealand.
- when labelling is required, the format applied varies from one country to another.

# Results - Question 5

## ***Gelatine and starches***

*Please indicate whether the use of gelatine or starches in each product (in all or only some types) is permitted under your national legislation.*

Responses indicate that legislative permission to use gelatine and starches varies between countries and product designations.



# Results - Question 6

## ***Stabilisers***

*Please indicate whether the use of stabilisers in each product (in all or only some types) is permitted under your national legislation.*

Responses indicate that, in general, stabilisers are allowed or not prohibited, within legislation.

Some countries specify a maximum allowable limit, e.g. Iran 3%.

Libya indicated it specifies that in some situations gums are not allowed and that stabilisers of animal origin are not permitted.

# Results - Question 7

## ***Fat and dry matter content***

*Please indicate whether your national legislation mandates the fat and dry matter content of each product and labelling thereof (Please note CCMP 8 did not nominate 'fat in dry matter' as a question).*

Responses indicate that fat and dry matter content is mandated in the legislation of some countries.

Fat content is expressed as:

either % fat in dry matter, or

% fat in moisture wet basis (Canada) / wet weight basis (Libya).

The labelling of fat content is required by many countries but responses make little reference to dry matter content. The specific levels change depending on the designation.

## Results - Question 8

### ***National Legislation on labelling cheese content***

Response is the same as question 4, ie responses indicate that, for the majority of countries, legislation does not specify labelling of cheese content.

However Italy, Sweden and Czech Republic require labelling in the case of named variety processed cheese and labelling is required in Belgium, Libya and New Zealand.

When labelling is required, the format applied varies from one country to another.

## Results - Question 8 continued

### ***National legislation on gelatine and starches***

Response is the same as question 5, ie responses indicate that legislative permission to use gelatine and starches varies between countries and product designations.

# Results - Question 8 continued

## ***National legislation on stabilisers***

Response is the same as question 6, ie responses indicate that, in general, stabilisers are allowed or not prohibited, within legislation.

Some countries specify a maximum allowable limit, e.g. Iran 3%.

Libya specifies that in some situations gums are not allowed and that stabilisers of animal origin are not permitted

## Results - Question 8 continued

### ***National legislation on fat and dry matter content***

Response is the same as question 7, i.e. responses indicate that fat and dry matter content is mandated in the legislation of some countries.

Fat content is expressed as either % fat in dry matter, or % fat in moisture wet basis (Canada) / wet weight basis (Libya).

The labelling of fat content is required by many countries but responses make little reference to dry matter content. The specific levels change depending on the designation