



JOINT FAO/WHO FOOD STANDARDS PROGRAMME

CODEx COMMITTEE ON FOOD ADDITIVES

Fifty-Third Session

GENERAL STANDARD FOR FOOD ADDITIVES (GSFA): REPORT OF THE EWG ON THE GSFA

Prepared by the United States of America with the assistance of Australia, Brazil, Canada, Chile, China, Columbia, European Union, Guatemala, India, Indonesia, Japan, Kenya, Republic of Korea, New Zealand, South Africa, Thailand, United Kingdom, United States, Calorie Control Council (CCC), Collagen Casing Trade Association (CCTA), EU Specialty Food Ingredients, FoodDrinkEurope, Food Industry Asia (FIA), International Association of Color Manufacturers (IACM), International Alliance of Dietary/Food Supplement Associations (IADSA), International Confectionery Association (ICA), International Council of Beverages Associations (ICBA), International Chewing Gum Association (ICGA), International Dairy Federation (IDF), International Food Additives Council (IFAC), International Fruit and Vegetable Juice Association (IFU), International Sweeteners Association (ISA), International Stevia Council (ISC), Natural Food Colours Association (NATCOL)

Introduction

1. CCFA52 agreed to establish an EWG to provide recommendations to CCFA53 on the following topics:¹
 - (i) The result of review of 87th JECFA on CAROTENOIDS as well as discussion at CCFA52 on agenda item 3(a) (see para. 60);
 - (ii) Replies from CCPFV on:
 - a. tartrates (INS 334, 335(ii), 337) in FC 04.1.2.6 "Fruit based spreads (e.g., chutney), excluding products in FC 04.1.2.5";
 - b. acidity regulators in general, and tartrates (INS 334, 335(ii), 337) specifically in FC 04.1.2.2 "Dried fruit";
 - c. emulsifiers, stabilizers, thickeners in general, and xanthan gum (INS 415) specifically, in FC 14.1.2 "Fruit and vegetable juices" and its subcategories and FC 14.1.3 "Fruit and vegetable nectar" and its subcategories. This would also include tamarind seed polysaccharide (INS 437) in FCs 14.1.3.1, 14.1.3.2, 14.1.3.3, and 14.1.3.4 as listed in Annex 3 Part D of CRD2;
 - d. colours in the Annex on French fried potatoes of the *Standard for Quick Frozen Vegetables* (CXS 320-2015);
 - e. acidity regulators in general, and calcium lactate (INS 327) specifically, in FC 14.1.2.1 "Fruit juice" generally, and in Chinese plum juice specifically;
 - f. acidity regulators in general, and phosphates (INS 338; 339(i)-(iii); 340(i)-(iii); 341(i)-(iii); 342(i)-(ii); 343(i)-(iii); 450(i)-(iii),(v)-(vii), (ix); 451(i),(ii); 452(i) (v);542) and tartrates (INS 334, 335(ii), 337) specifically in FC 14.1.2.2 "Vegetable juice", FC 14.1.2.4 "Concentrates for vegetable juice", FC 14.1.3.2 "Vegetable nectar", and FC 14.1.3.4 "Concentrates for vegetable nectar" and the maximum use levels needed to achieve the intended technological effect;
 - g. tamarind seed polysaccharide (INS 437) in the *Standard for Pickled Cucumbers* (CXS 115-1981);
 - (iii) The appropriateness of the proposals listed in Appendix 1 of CX/FA 21/52/2 pertaining to notes associated with food additives contained under group headers;

¹ REP 21/FA, para. 183.

- (iv) Whether the notes in the GSFA linked to aspartame (INS 951), acesulfame potassium (INS 950) and the aspartame-acesulfame salt (INS 962) are aligned and revise related provisions in the GSFA accordingly;
- (v) The provision for propylene glycol alginate (INS 405) in FC 01.1.2 for comment on the specific use level and technological justifications for the use level (CRD2, Annex 3 Part B);
- (vi) Draft and proposed draft provisions for sweeteners in FC 14.1.5 for comment on the actual use level as well as the reporting basis for any provided use level (CRD2, Annex 3 Part E);
- (vii) The requests from agenda item 5c: draft and proposed draft sweetener provisions still in the Step Process in the Food Categories listed in Appendix 1 of CX/FA 21/52/9 (see para. 173(iii)a));
- (viii) The requests from agenda item 5c: discuss provisions with Note 161 attached to them in FCs 05.1.1, 07.1 and 12.2 and its subcategories (see para. 173(iii)b));
- (ix) Draft and proposed draft provisions for sweeteners in all FCs of the GSFA not covered by the topics (vi), (vii), and (viii); and
- (x) Provisions entered at Step 2 of the GSFA contained in CRD2 Annex 5.

Working Documents

2. The working documents for the report of the EWG on the *General Standard for Food Additives* are presented as appendices to this document. The appendices provide background on the topic under discussion, collate comments on the topic from the EWG, and provide recommendations for each topic.

- provisions affected by the review of the 87th JECFA on CAROTENOIDS that pertain to topic i are presented in Appendix 1.
- provisions affected by replies from CCPFV that pertain to topic ii are presented in Appendix 2.
- proposals related food additives contained under group headers that pertain to topic iii are presented in Appendix 3.
- provisions for sweeteners that pertain to topic iv and topics vi - ix, are combined into Appendix 4.
- the provision for propylene glycol alginate (INS 4045) in FC 01.1.2 that pertains to topic v and provisions entered into the step process by CCFA52 that pertain to topic x are presented in Appendix 5.

Appendix 1: Review of Carotenoids and Related Additives

1. Among several topics, the 52nd CCFA requested the EWG on the GSFA to the 53rd CCFA to consider:

The result of review of the 87th JECFA on CAROTENOIDS as well as discussion at CCFA52 on agenda item 3(a):

1

- Revise the list of food additives contained in the GSFA under the group header “CAROTENOIDS” based on the recommendations from JECFA:
 - a) Removal of Beta-apo-8'-Carotenal (INS 160e) from the group header “CAROTENOIDS” and consequentially duplicate separate provisions for Beta-apo-8'-Carotenal (INS 160e) as currently exist for “CAROTENOIDS” in the GSFA and circulate those provisions for comment on actual use and use level;
 - b) Removal of Beta-apo-8'-carotenoic acid ethyl ester (INS 160f) from the group header “CAROTENOIDS”, and consequential removal of this additive from the GSFA;
 - c) Add Beta-Carotene-Rich Extract from *Dunaliella salina* (INS 160a(iv)) to the “CAROTENOIDS” group header in the GSFA
 - As a consequence, circulate for comment existing provisions in the GSFA for INS 160a(iv) for comparison with the existing provisions for “CAROTENOIDS” with the intention of subsuming the existing provisions for INS 160a(iv) into provisions for “CAROTENOIDS” and consequential removal of separate provisions for INS 160a(iv) from the GSFA;
 - d) Circulate for comment the existing provisions in the GSFA for the group header “CAROTENOIDS” (inclusive of Beta-carotene, synthetic (INS 160a(ii)) and Beta-Carotenes, *Blakeslea trispora* (INS 160a(iii)), and Beta-Carotene-Rich Extract from *Dunaliella salina* INS 160a(iv)) for comment on actual use and use level;
- Pertaining to discussion at CCFA52 on Agenda Item 3(a), also circulate provisions for carotenes, Beta -, vegetable (INS 160a(ii)) for comment on actual use and use level in the context of the mandate for provisions in the GSFA for the group header “CAROTENOIDS”.
- In the context of provisions for the group header “CAROTENOIDS”, INS 160a(iv), and INS 160a(ii), request that all information on use levels be provided on a Beta-carotene basis.

Introduction:

2. CCFA52 noted that the 87th JECFA withdrew the two group ADIs of 0–5 mg/kg bw for (1) the sum of the synthetic carotenoids beta-carotene, beta-apo-8'-carotenal and beta-apo-8'-carotenoic acid methyl and ethyl esters and (2) synthetic beta-carotene and beta-carotene derived from *Blakeslea trispora*.² While the 87th JECFA review of Beta-Carotenes did not include Beta-Carotenes, vegetable (INS 160a(ii)), it did include Beta-Carotene-Rich Extract from *Dunaliella salina* (INS 160a(iv)). The JECFA Secretariat noted, that due to the elevated level of risk of developing lung cancer in heavy smokers as observed in some intervention studies where participants had received beta-carotene as supplements, the 87th JECFA Committee found it to be unlikely that it will ever be able to establish a group ADI for beta-carotenes.³ The JECFA Secretariat further clarified that although JECFA was not able to develop a group ADI for Carotenoids, there were no safety concerns for the general population and CCFA could address the recommendations in the JECFA assessment with appropriate risk management measures. CCFA52 noted that Section 1.1 of the Preamble to the GSFA allows for the inclusion of additives without a JECFA ADI in the GSFA if they are determined by JECFA to be safe on the basis of other criteria.⁴ CCFA further noted that JECFA had established an ADI of 0-0.3 mg/kg bw for INS 160e and that no data was submitted for INS 160f.

¹ REP 21/FA, paras. 60 and 183 (i)

² REP 21/FA, para. 38

³ REP 21/FA, para. 40

⁴ REP 21/FA, para. 41

A request was also made by CCFA52 for the GSFA EWG to also circulate provisions for beta-Carotenes, vegetable (INS 160a(ii)) for comment on actual use and use level in the context of the mandate for provisions in the GSFA for the group header Carotenoids.

3. Explanations and proposals provided by the Chair of the EWG on the GSFA to CCFA52:⁵
 - a. For INS 160e: this food additive is currently under the GSFA CAROTENOIDS group header, however JECFA established a separate ADI. As a consequence, it should be taken out of the group header and consider its use levels individually. GSFA EWG would circulate those provisions for comment on actual use and use level;
 - b. For INS 160f: this food additive is currently under the GSFA CAROTENOIDS group header, however JECFA did not receive any information on this food additive. As food additives are not eligible for inclusion into the GSFA if they do not have a corresponding JECFA evaluation, GSFA EWG would discuss removal of INS160f from the group header for CAROTENOIDS and the subsequent removal from the GSFA;
 - c. For INS 160a(iv): this food additive will be added to the group header for CAROTENOIDS in the GSFA due to the fact that this was included in the JECFA evaluation for CAROTENOIDS. This food additive has separate proposed draft provisions in the GSFA. The GSFA EWG would circulate for comment on existing proposed draft provisions in the GSFA for INS 160a(iv) for comparison with the existing provisions for CAROTENOIDS with the intention of subsuming the existing proposed draft provisions for INS 160a(iv) and incorporating them into provisions for CAROTENOIDS;
 - d. For INS 160a(ii): this food additive has a separate JECFA ADI and provisions. Provisions for this food additive would be circulated for comments separately; and
 - e. Reporting basis: in order to set the maximum use levels that would be applicable across the group header of CAROTENOIDS, a common reporting basis (i.e., Beta-carotene basis) is needed. This common reporting basis should also be applied to INS 160a(ii) but not for INS 160e as that additive is not a beta-carotene.

Working Document:

4. The EWG on the GSFA issued three circulars for comment pertaining to Appendix 1. In the First Circular, EWG members were asked to take into account the currently adopted provisions for Carotenoids and the draft provisions for INS 160a(iv) in corresponding food categories in order to provide information on actual use and use level for the colours in the corresponding GSFA food categories. In the Second Circular, EWG members were asked to comment on the consensus proposal put forward by the Chair based on the information provided to the first circular. For the third circular, EWG members were asked to comment on the revised proposals taking into account information provided to the second circular. EWG members were also asked to comment on the utilization of a horizontal approach which seeks to harmonize provisions in the same food categories for “beta-Carotenes” and “beta-carotene, vegetable” by means of a “singly or in combination” note as well as common use levels and notes.

5. Appendix 1 contains three Annexes.
 - a. Annex 1 presents provisions for the new Carotenoids group header which includes: beta-carotenes, synthetic (INS 160a(i)), beta-carotenes, *Blakeslea trispora* (INS 160a(iii)) and beta-Carotene-Rich Extract from *Dunaliella salina* (INS 160a(iv)). As noted, under Conventions, below, the EWG is recommending that the name for the Carotenoids Group Header be revised to “Beta-Carotenes”.
 - b. Annex 2 presents provisions for beta-apoo-8'-carotenal (INS160e).
 - c. Annex 3 presents provisions for beta-Carotenes, vegetable (INS 160a(ii)).
 - d. A list of notes covering all three Annexes is contained at the end of the document.

⁵ REP 21/FA, para. 47

6. The current document only contains final proposals. A full compilation of all comments submitted to the EWG for Appendix 1 from the three circulars is available on [CCFA53 webpage](#):

Conventions:

7. Over the course of the three circulars, the EWG came to several consensus decisions regarding the proposals in all three Annexes. These conventions based on consensus are incorporated into the recommendations for all of the proposals. The conventions are as follows:

- a. The name of the group header for “Carotenoids” is proposed to be revised to “Beta-Carotenes”.
- b. The group header for “Beta-Carotenes” (formerly “Carotenoids”) is proposed as follows:

BETA-CAROTENES

INS 160a(i) beta-Carotenes, synthetic Functional class: Colour

INS 160a(iii) beta-Carotenes, *Blakeslea trispora* Functional class: Colour

INS 160a(iv) beta-Carotene-Rich Extract from *Dunaliella salina* Functional class: Colour

- c. There was consensus that the use levels for Beta-Carotenes (INS 160a(i), 160a(iii), and 160a(iv)) as well as beta-Carotenes, vegetable (INS 160a(ii)) should be reported on a beta-carotene basis. As a result, all provisions for Beta-Carotenes and beta-Carotenes, vegetable contain the note: “Expressed as beta-Carotene”.
- d. There was consensus among the EWG members that INS 160a(iv) (beta-Carotene-Rich Extract from *Dunaliella salina*) should be permitted in Codex commodity standards that already permit the use of the colors INS 160a(i) (beta-Carotenes, synthetic) and 160a(iii) (beta-Carotenes, *Blakeslea trispora*). This convention was taken into account in the Final EWG proposals shown in Annex 1. As a result, many of “XS” type notes excluding the use of INS 160a(iv) are not needed in the provision put forward for the new “Beta-Carotenes” group header.
- e. There were discussions within the EWG that the use of beta-Carotenes, vegetable (INS 160a(ii)) should be linked with the other Beta-Carotenes (INS 160a(i), 160a(iii), and 160a(iv)) as all four additives have the same colouring principle. The EWG considered that it was appropriate to link provisions for beta-Carotenes, vegetable (INS 160a(ii)) with those for Beta-Carotenes (INS 160a(i), 160a(iii), and 160a(iv)) when used in the same food category. The following “Singly or in combination” note was applied to all provisions for the two sets of additives (Annex 1 and Annex 3) when used in the same food category: “Singly or in combination: Beta-Carotenes (beta-carotenes, synthetic (INS 160a(i)), beta-carotenes, *Blakeslea trispora* (INS 160a(iii)), beta-Carotene-Rich Extract from *Dunaliella salina* (INS 160a(iv)) and beta-carotenes, vegetable (INS 160a(ii)).”
- f. The EWG discussed whether the use levels (on a beta-carotene basis) and notes (where appropriate) for “Beta-Carotenes” (INS 160a(i), 160a(iii), 160a(iv)) and those of beta-Carotenes, vegetable (INS 160a(ii)) should be made consistent with each other. All EWG members except for one agreed that it was appropriate to make the use levels and notes for “Beta-Carotenes” and beta-Carotenes, vegetable consistent. As a result, any changes made to use levels or notes for provisions in Annex 1 or Annex 3 will need to be adjusted in the corresponding Annex as well.

Annex 1: Final EWG Proposals for Beta-Carotenes (beta-carotenes, synthetic (INS 160a(i)), beta-carotenes, *Blakeslea trispora* (INS 160a(iii)), beta-Carotene-Rich Extract from *Dunaliella salina* (INS 160a(iv)), formerly called “Carotenoids”.

Food Cat. No.	Food Category Name	CAROTENOIDS INS 160a(i), 160a(iii), 160a(iv) Functional effect: Colour			beta-Carotene-Rich Extract from <i>Dunaliella salina</i> INS 160a(iv) Functional effect: Colour			Final EWG Proposal for “BETA-CAROTENES”
		Max Level	Notes	Year Adopted	Max Level	Notes	Step	
01.1.4	Flavoured fluid milk drinks	150	52 & 402	2017	150	52 & XS243	2	Adopt at 20 mg/kg with Note 52, new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and new “singly or in combination” note.
01.3.2	Beverage whiteners	100	XS250 & XS252	2021	100	XS250 & XS252	2	Adopt at 10 mg/kg with Notes XS250, XS252, new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene) and new “singly or in combination” note.
01.5.2	Milk and cream powder analogues	100	XS251	2021	100	XS251	2	Adopt at 6 mg/kg with Note XS251, new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene) and new “singly or in combination” note.
01.6.1	Unripened cheese	100	489, 490 & XS273	2021	100	XS221, XS262, XS273, XS275, XS283	2	Adopt at 3 mg/kg with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), new “singly or in combination” note, with revised Note 489 (CAROT489) “Except for use in products conforming to the General Standard for Unripened Cheese including Fresh Cheese (CXS 221-2001) at 25 mg/kg”, and revised Note 490 (CAROT490) “Except for use in products conforming to the Standard for Cream Cheese (CXS 275-1973) at 35 mg/kg”, and XS273.
01.6.2.1	Ripened cheese, includes rind	100	458, 500, XS208, XS278	2021	100	XS208, XS263, XS264, XS265, XS266, XS267, XS268, XS269, XS270, XS271, XS272, XS274,	2	Adopt at 25 mg/kg with XS208, XS278, new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), new “singly or in combination” note, revised Note 458 (CAROT458) “Except for use in cheese mass only for products conforming to the Standards for Cheddar (CXS 263-1966), Danbo (CXS 264-1966), Edam (CXS 265-1966), Gouda (CXS 266-1966), Havarti (CXS 267-1966), Samsø (CXS 268-1966), Emmental (CXS 269-1967), Tilsiter (CXS 270-1968), Saint-Paulin (CXS 271-1968), Provolone (CXS 272-1968), Coulommiers (CXS 274-1969), Camembert (CXS 276-1973) and Brie (CXS 277-1973) at 35 mg/kg”,

		CAROTENOIDS INS 160a(i), 160a(iii), 160a(iv) Functional effect: Colour			beta-Carotene-Rich Extract from <i>Dunaliella</i> <i>salina</i> INS 160a(iv) Functional effect: Colour			
Food Cat. No.	Food Category Name	Max Lev el	Notes	Year Adopted	Max Level	Notes	Step	Final EWG Proposal for "BETA-CAROTENES"
						XS276, XS277, XS278, XS283		Chair's note: Revised note 500 is not necessary if the use level for beta-Carotenes in FC 01.6.2.1 is 25 mg/kg.
01.6.2.2	Rind of ripened cheese	500		2009	500		2	Adopt at 100 mg/kg, add new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene) and new "singly or in combination" note.
01.6.2.3	Cheese powder (for reconstitution; e.g. for cheese sauces)	100		2009	100		2	Adopt at 20 mg/kg with Note 381 ("As consumed") to clarify that the use level is for after reconstitution, new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and new "singly or in combination" note.
01.6.4	Processed cheese	100		2009	100		2	Maintain use level at 100 mg/kg, add new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene) and new "singly or in combination" note.
01.6.5	Cheese analogues	200		2009	200		2	Adopt at 100 mg/kg (for consistency with beta-carotene, vegetable), add new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene) and new "singly or in combination" note.
01.7	Dairy-based desserts (e.g. pudding, fruit or flavoured yoghurt)	100		2009	100	XS243	2	Adopt at 20 mg/kg with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and new "singly or in combination" note.
02.1.2	Vegetable oils and fats	25	508, 509, XS33, XS210	2021	25	232, XS33, XS210, XS325R	2	Maintain use level at 25 mg/kg, with Notes 508, 509, XS33, XS210, XS325R, new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene) and new "singly or in combination" note.
02.1.3	Lard, tallow, fish oil, and other animal fats	25	512 & XS329	2021	25	XS211, XS329	2	Adopt at 10 mg/kg with Notes 518, XS329, new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and "singly or in combination" note. Chair's note: Note 518 is more appropriate as the level permitted in CXS 19-81 and CXS 211-1999 was 25 mg/kg.

		CAROTENOIDS INS 160a(i), 160a(iii), 160a(iv) Functional effect: Colour			beta-Carotene-Rich Extract from <i>Dunaliella</i> <i>salina</i> INS 160a(iv) Functional effect: Colour			
Food Cat. No.	Food Category Name	Max Lev el	Notes	Year Adopted	Max Level	Notes	Step	Final EWG Proposal for "BETA-CAROTENES"
02.2.1	Butter	25	146 & 291	2008	25	146, 291, XS279	2	Adopt at 12 mg/kg with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene) and "singly or in combination" note.
02.2.2	Fat spreads, dairy fat spreads and blended spreads	35		2010	35	XS253, XS256	2	Maintain use at 35 mg/kg with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and "singly or in combination" note.
02.3	Fat emulsions mainly of type oil-in-water, including mixed and/or flavoured products based on fat emulsions	200		2009	200		2	Adopt at 10 mg/kg with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and "singly or in combination" note.
02.4	Fat-based desserts excluding dairy-based dessert products of food category 01.7	150		2009	150		2	Adopt at 10 mg/kg with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and "singly or in combination" note.
03.0	Edible ices, including sherbet and sorbet	200		2009	200		2	Adopt at 70 mg/kg with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and "singly or in combination" note.
04.1.2.3	Fruit in vinegar, oil, or brine	100 0		2009	1000	XS260	2	Adopt at 90 mg/kg with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and "singly or in combination" note
04.1.2.4	Canned or bottled (pasteurized) fruit	200	161 & 104	2018				Adopt at 50 mg/kg (for consistency with beta-carotenes, vegetable) with Notes 104, 161, new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and "singly or in combination" note.
04.1.2.5	Jams, jellies, marmelades	200		2009	200	XS296	2	Adopt at 15 mg/kg with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and "singly or in combination" note

		CAROTENOIDS INS 160a(i), 160a(iii), 160a(iv) Functional effect: Colour			beta-Carotene-Rich Extract from <i>Dunaliella</i> <i>salina</i> INS 160a(iv) Functional effect: Colour			
Food Cat. No.	Food Category Name	Max Lev el	Notes	Year Adopted	Max Level	Notes	Step	Final EWG Proposal for "BETA-CAROTENES"
04.1.2.6	Fruit-based spreads (e.g. chutney) excluding products of food category 04.1.2.5	500		2009	500	XS160	2	Adopt at 10 mg/kg with XS160 (Codex Stan 160-1987 does not permit colors) and new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and "singly or in combination" note.
04.1.2.7	Candied fruit	200		2009	200		2	Adopt at 30 mg/kg with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene) and "singly or in combination" note.
04.1.2.8	Fruit preparations, including pulp, purees, fruit toppings and coconut milk	100	161 & 182	2009				Adopt at 10 mg/kg with Note 161, XS240, new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and "singly or in combination" note. Chair's note: XS240 replaces Note 182.
04.1.2.9	Fruit-based desserts, including fruit-flavoured water-based desserts	150		2009	150		2	Adopt at 15 mg/kg with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene) and "singly or in combination" note.
04.1.2.10	Fermented fruit products	500		2009	500		2	Adopt at 10 mg/kg with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene) and "singly or in combination" note.
04.1.2.11	Fruit fillings for pastries	100		2009	100		2	Adopt at 10 mg/kg with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene) and "singly or in combination" note.
04.2.1.2	Surface-treated fresh vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds	500	4, 16 & 161	2010				Lack of consensus in EWG. Seeking additional information on uses to justify proposed use level of 90 mg/kg. Chair's note: there is no corresponding provision for beta-carotenes, vegetable.

		CAROTENOIDS INS 160a(i), 160a(iii), 160a(iv) Functional effect: Colour			beta-Carotene-Rich Extract from <i>Dunaliella</i> <i>salina</i> INS 160a(iv) Functional effect: Colour			
Food Cat. No.	Food Category Name	Max Lev el	Notes	Year Adopted	Max Level	Notes	Step	Final EWG Proposal for "BETA-CAROTENES"
04.2.2.2	Dried vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds	100 0	161	2009				Adopt at 90 mg/kg with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and new "singly or in combination" note.
04.2.2.3	Vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds in vinegar, oil, brine, or soybean sauce	50	161	2010				Adopt at 5 mg/kg with Note 161 and new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and "singly or in combination" note.
04.2.2.4	Canned or bottled (pasteurized) or retort pouch vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds	50	161	2010				Maintain use at 50 mg/kg with Note 161 new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene) and "singly or in combination" note
04.2.2.5	Vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe	50	161	2010				Maintain use at 50 mg/kg with Note 161, new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene) and "singly or in combination" note.

		CAROTENOIDS INS 160a(i), 160a(iii), 160a(iv) Functional effect: Colour			beta-Carotene-Rich Extract from <i>Dunaliella</i> <i>salina</i> INS 160a(iv) Functional effect: Colour			
Food Cat. No.	Food Category Name	Max Lev el	Notes	Year Adopted	Max Level	Notes	Step	Final EWG Proposal for "BETA-CAROTENES"
	vera), seaweed, and nut and seed purees and spreads (e.g., peanut butter)							
04.2.2.6	Vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed pulp and preparations (e.g. vegetable desserts and sauces, candied vegetables) other than food category 04.2.2.5	50	92 & 161	2010				Maintain use at 50 mg/kg with Notes 92, 161, new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene) and "singly or in combination" note
04.2.2.7	Fermented vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and seaweed products, excluding fermented soybean products of food categories 06.8.6, 06.8.7, 12.9.1,	50		2009	50	XS38, XS151, XS223, XS260, XS294R	2	Adopt at 5 mg/kg with XS38, XS151, XS223, XS294R (these standards do not permit colors), new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and "singly or in combination" note.

		CAROTENOIDS INS 160a(i), 160a(iii), 160a(iv) Functional effect: Colour			beta-Carotene-Rich Extract from <i>Dunaliella salina</i> INS 160a(iv) Functional effect: Colour			
Food Cat. No.	Food Category Name	Max Lev el	Notes	Year Adopted	Max Level	Notes	Step	Final EWG Proposal for “BETA-CAROTENES”
	12.9.2.1 and 12.9.2.3							
05.1.3	Cocoa-based spreads, including fillings	100	161 & XS86	2016				Adopt at 3 mg/kg with Note 161, XS86, new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and “singly or in combination” note.
05.1.4	Cocoa and chocolate products	100	183	2016	100	183, XS87	2	Maintain use at 100 mg/kg with Note 183 with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and “singly or in combination” note.
05.1.5	Imitation chocolate, chocolate substitute products	100		2009	100		2	Maintain use at 100 mg/kg, new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and “singly or in combination” note.
05.2	Confectionery including hard and soft candy, nougats, etc. other than food categories 05.1, 05.3 and 05.4	100	XS309 R	2017	100		2	Adopt at 150 mg/kg (for parity with beta-carotenes, vegetable) with XS309R, new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and “singly or in combination” note.
05.3	Chewing gum	100		2009	100		2	Adopt at 180 mg/kg with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and “singly or in combination” note.
05.4	Decorations (e.g. for fine bakery wares), toppings (non-fruit) and sweet sauces	100		2009	100		2	Adopt at 200 mg/kg (for parity with beta-carotene, vegetable) with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and “singly or in combination” note.
06.3	Breakfast cereals, including rolled oats	200		2009	200		2	Adopt at 50 mg/kg (for parity with beta-carotenes, vegetable) with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and “singly or in combination” note.
06.4.3	Pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products	120 0	153, 474	2019	1200	153 & XS249	2	Adopt at 40 mg/kg with note 153, new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and “singly or in combination” note.

Food Cat. No.	Food Category Name	CAROTENOIDS INS 160a(i), 160a(iii), 160a(iv) Functional effect: Colour			beta-Carotene-Rich Extract from <i>Dunaliella salina</i> INS 160a(iv) Functional effect: Colour			Final EWG Proposal for "BETA-CAROTENES"
		Max Level	Notes	Year Adopted	Max Level	Notes	Step	
								Chair's note: A comment was made regarding the use of carotenoids in the sauce used in frozen pasta meal products. It is our understanding that the sauce portion of a frozen meal would actually be covered under FC 04.2.2.6. We believe that FC 06.4.3 would only cover the starch portion of a frozen meal.
06.5	Cereal and starch based desserts (e.g. rice pudding, tapioca pudding)	150		2009	150		2	Adopt at 40 mg/kg with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and "singly or in combination" note.
06.6	Batters (e.g. for breading or batters for fish or poultry)	500		2009	500		2	Adopt at 50 mg/kg with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene) and "singly or in combination" note.
07.1.2	Crackers, excluding sweet crackers	1000		2009	1000		2	Adopt at 200 mg/kg with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and "singly or in combination" note.
07.1.3	Other ordinary bakery products (e.g. bagels, pita, English muffins)	100		2011	100		2	Adopt at 60 mg/kg with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene).
07.1.4	Bread-type products, including bread stuffing and bread crumbs	200	116	2011	200	116	2	Adopt at 30 mg/kg with Note 116, new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and "singly or in combination" note.
07.1.5	Steamed breads and buns	100	216	2011	100	216	2	Adopt at 60 mg/kg with Note 216 and new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene).
07.2	Fine bakery wares (sweet, salty, savoury) and mixes	100		2009	100		2	Adopt at 42 mg/kg (for parity with beta-carotenes, vegetable provision), add new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and "singly or in combination" note.

		CAROTENOIDS INS 160a(i), 160a(iii), 160a(iv) Functional effect: Colour			beta-Carotene-Rich Extract from <i>Dunaliella</i> <i>salina</i> INS 160a(iv) Functional effect: Colour			
Food Cat. No.	Food Category Name	Max Level	Notes	Year Adopted	Max Level	Notes	Step	Final EWG Proposal for "BETA-CAROTENES"
08.1.2	Fresh meat, poultry, and game, comminuted	100	4 & 16	2011	100	4 & 16	2	Revoke provision as there is no indication of use.
08.3.1.1	Cured (including salted) non-heat treated processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	100	16	2010	100	16	2	Adopt at 20 mg/kg (for parity with beta-carotene, vegetable) in Food Category 8.3.1 with Note 16, new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and "singly or in combination" note.
08.3.1.2	Cured (including salted) and dried non-heat treated processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	20	16	2010	20	16	2	Adopt at 20 mg/kg (for parity with beta-carotene, vegetable) in Food Category 8.3.1 with Note 16, new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and "singly or in combination" note.
08.3.1.3	Fermented non-heat treated processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	20	16	2010	20	16	2	Adopt at 20 mg/kg (for parity with beta-carotene, vegetable) in Food Category 8.3.1 with Note 16, new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and "singly or in combination" note.
08.3.2	Heat-treated processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	20	16, XS88, XS89 & XS98	2014	20	16, XS88, XS89, XS98	2	Adopt at 7 mg/kg with Note 16, XS88, XS89, XS98, new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and "singly or in combination" note
08.4	Edible casings (e.g. sausage casings)	100		2011	100		2	Adopt at 50 mg/kg with new note (APP1A) "Level of colour corresponds to the finished product as consumed (e.g., the sausage), with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene) and "singly or in combination" note.
08.4	Edible casings (e.g. sausage casings)	100		Step 2	100		2	Discontinue provision.
09.1.1	Fresh fish	300	4	2011	300	4	2	Revoke provision as no use is indicated.

		CAROTENOIDS INS 160a(i), 160a(iii), 160a(iv) Functional effect: Colour			beta-Carotene-Rich Extract from <i>Dunaliella</i> <i>salina</i> INS 160a(iv) Functional effect: Colour			
Food Cat. No.	Food Category Name	Max Lev el	Notes	Year Adopted	Max Level	Notes	Step	Final EWG Proposal for “BETA-CAROTENES”
09.1.2	Fresh mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	100	4, 16, XS292 , XS312 & XS315	2017	100	4, 16, XS292, XS312, XS315	2	Revoke provision as no use is indicated.
09.2	Processed fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	100	95, 304, XS36, XS92, XS95, XS165 , XS167 , XS189 , XS190 , XS191 , XS222 , XS236 , XS244 , XS292 , XS311 , XS312 & XS315	2018	100	95, 304, XS36, XS92, XS95, XS165, XS167, XS189, XS190, XS191, XS222, XS236, XS244, XS292, XS311, XS312 & XS315	2	Maintain 100 mg/kg with New Note (APP1B) “For non-standardized foods: for use in surimi, fish roe products, and dried mollusks and crustaceans, only”, revised note 304 (CAROT304) “For use only in breaded or batter coatings in products conforming to the Standard for Quick Frozen Fish Sticks (Fish Fingers), Fish Portions and Fish Fillets –Breaded or in Batter (CODEX STAN 166- 1989), singly or in combination: carotenoids beta-Carotenes (beta-carotenes, synthetic (INS 160a(i)), beta-carotenes, <i>Blakeslea trispora</i> (INS 160a(iii)), beta-Carotene-Rich Extract from <i>Dunaliella salina</i> (INS160a(iv)) , carotenal, beta-apo-8’ (INS 160e), carotenoic acid, ethyl ester, betaapo-8’ (INS 160f) and beta-carotenes, vegetable (INS 160a(ii))”, XS36, XS92, XS95, XS165, XS167, XS189, XS190, XS191, XS222, XS236, XS244, XS292, XS311, XS312, XS315 and new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and “singly or in combination” note

		CAROTENOIDS INS 160a(i), 160a(iii), 160a(iv) Functional effect: Colour			beta-Carotene-Rich Extract from <i>Dunaliella</i> <i>salina</i> INS 160a(iv) Functional effect: Colour			
Food Cat. No.	Food Category Name	Max Lev el	Notes	Year Adopted	Max Level	Notes	Step	Final EWG Proposal for "BETA-CAROTENES"
09.3	Semi-preserved fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	100	95 & XS291	2018	100	96 & XS291	2	Adopt at 20 mg/kg with Notes 95, XS291, new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and "singly or in combination" note.
09.4	Fully preserved, including canned or fermented fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	100	95, XS3, XS37, XS70, XS90, XS94 & XS119	2018	100	95, XS3, XS37, XS70, XS90, XS94, XS119	2	For parity with "beta-carotenes, vegetable" adopt at 20 mg/kg with Notes 95, XS3, XS37, XS70, XS90, XS94, XS119, new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and "singly or in combination" note.
10.1	Fresh eggs	1000	4	2011	1000	4	2	Revoke provision as no indication of use.
10.4	Egg-based desserts (e.g. custard)	150		2009	150		2	Adopt at 15 mg/kg with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and "singly or in combination" note.
11.4	Other sugars and syrups (e.g. xylose, maple syrup, sugar toppings)	50	217	2011	50	217	2	Revoke provision as no indication of use.
12.2.2	Seasonings and condiments	500		2009	500		2	Adopt at 100 mg/kg with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and "singly or in combination" note.
12.4	Mustards	300		2009	300		2	Adopt at 5 mg/kg with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and "singly or in combination" note.
12.5	Soups and broths	300	341	2015	300	341 & XS117	2	Adopt at 10 mg/kg with revised note 341 (CAROT341) "For use in products conforming to the Codex Standard for Bouillons and Consommés (CODEX STAN 117-1981), singly or in combination: beta-Carotenes (INS 160a(i), 160a(iii), and 160a(iv)) , Carotenes, beta-, vegetable (INS 160a(ii)) and carotenal, beta-apo-8'- (INS 160e) at 50

		CAROTENOIDS INS 160a(i), 160a(iii), 160a(iv) Functional effect: Colour			beta-Carotene-Rich Extract from <i>Dunaliella salina</i> INS 160a(iv) Functional effect: Colour			
Food Cat. No.	Food Category Name	Max Lev el	Notes	Year Adopted	Max Level	Notes	Step	Final EWG Proposal for "BETA-CAROTENES"
								mg/kg" and new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene).
12.6	Sauces and like products	500	XS302	2018	500	XS302	2	Adopt at 80 mg/kg with XS302, new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and "singly or in combination" note.
12.7	Salads (e.g. macaroni salad, potato salad) and sandwich spreads excluding cocoa- and nut-based spreads of food categories 04.2.2.5 and 05.1.3	50		2009	50		2	Adopt at 20 mg/kg with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene) and "singly or in combination" note.
13.3	Dietetic foods intended for special medical purposes (excluding products of food category 13.1)	50		2009	50	XS118	2	Maintain use level at 50 mg/kg with Note XS118, new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and "singly or in combination" note.
13.4	Dietetic formulae for slimming purposes and weight reduction	50		2009	50	XS181 & XS203	2	Adopt at 8 mg/kg (for parity with beta-carotenes, vegetable) with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and "singly or in combination" note.
13.5	Dietetic foods (e.g. supplementary foods for dietary use) excluding products of food categories 13.1 - 13.4 and 13.6	300		2009	300		2	Adopt use level at 100 mg/kg with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and "singly or in combination" note.
13.6	Food supplements	300		2009	300		2	Adopt use level of 220 mg/kg with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and "singly or in combination" note.

		CAROTENOIDS INS 160a(i), 160a(iii), 160a(iv) Functional effect: Colour			beta-Carotene-Rich Extract from <i>Dunaliella</i> <i>salina</i> INS 160a(iv) Functional effect: Colour			
Food Cat. No.	Food Category Name	Max Lev el	Notes	Year Adopted	Max Level	Notes	Step	Final EWG Proposal for "BETA-CAROTENES"
14.1.4	Water-based flavoured drinks, including "sport," "energy," or "electrolyte" drinks and particulated drinks	100		2009	100		2	Adopt use level of 50 mg/kg with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and "singly or in combination" note.
14.2.2	Cider and perry	200		2009	200		2	Adopt use level of 2.5 mg/kg with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and "singly or in combination" note.
14.2.4	Wines (other than grape)	200		2009	200		2	Adopt use level of 3 mg/kg (for parity with beta-carotenes, vegetable) with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and "singly or in combination" note.
14.2.6	Distilled spirituous beverages containing more than 15% alcohol	200		2009	200		2	Adopt at 3 mg/kg (for parity with beta-carotenes, vegetable) with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and "singly or in combination" note.
14.2.7	Aromatized alcoholic beverages (e.g. beer, wine and spirituous cooler-type beverages, low alcoholic refreshers)	200		2009	200		2	Adopt use level of 15 mg/kg with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and "singly or in combination" note.
15.1	Snacks - potato, cereal, flour or starch based (from roots and tubers, pulses and legumes)	100		2010	100		2	Adopt use level of 30 mg/kg with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and "singly or in combination" note.

		CAROTENOIDS INS 160a(i), 160a(iii), 160a(iv) Functional effect: Colour			beta-Carotene-Rich Extract from <i>Dunaliella</i> <i>salina</i> INS 160a(iv) Functional effect: Colour			
Food Cat. No.	Food Category Name	Max Lev el	Notes	Year Adopted	Max Level	Notes	Step	Final EWG Proposal for "BETA-CAROTENES"
15.2	Processed nuts, including coated nuts and nut mixtures (with e.g. dried fruit)	100		2009	100		2	Adopt at 4 mg/kg (for parity with beta-carotenes, vegetable) with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene).

Annex 2: Final EWG Proposals for Beta-apo-8'-carotenal (INS 160e)

The 87th JECFA established a new ADI of 0-0.3 mg/kg bw for beta-apo-8'-Carotenal (INS 160e). As a result, CCFA52 requested that the GSFA EWG remove INS 160e from the group header for Carotenoids and duplicate as separate provisions those provisions that currently exist for "CAROTENOIDS" for Beta -apo-8'-Carotenal (INS 160e) in the GSFA and circulate those provisions for comment on actual use and use level. Final EWG proposals from the EWG discussions for INS 160e are presented, below.

Carotenal, beta-apo-8'-					
INS 160e beta-apo-8'-Carotenal Functional class: Colour					
Food Cat. No.	Food Cat. Name	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step	Final EWG Proposal
01.1.4	Flavoured fluid milk drinks	150	52 & 402		Adopt at 10 mg/kg with Note 52.
01.3.2	Beverage whiteners	100	XS250 & XS252		Do not add a provision for INS 160e in this food category.
01.4.4	Cream analogues	20			Do not add a provision for INS 160e in this food category.
01.5.2	Milk and cream powder analogues	100	XS251		Do not add a provision for INS 160e in this food category.
01.6.1	Unripened cheese	100	489, 490, XS273		Adopt at 0.4 mg/kg with revised Note 489 (APO489) "Except for use in products conforming to the General Standard for Unripened Cheese including Fresh Cheese (CXS 221-2001) at 35 mg/kg and revised Note 490 (CAROT490) "Except for use in products conforming to the Standard for Cream Cheese (CXS 275-1973) at 35 mg/kg" and XS273.
01.6.2.1	Ripened cheese, includes rind	100	458, 500, XS208, XS278		Adopt at 12 mg/kg with revised Note 458 (CAROT458) "Except for use in cheese mass only for products conforming to the Standards for Cheddar (CXS 263-1966), Danbo (CXS 264-1966), Edam (CXS 265-1966), Gouda (CXS 266-1966), Havarti (CXS 267-1966), Samsø (CXS 268-1966), Emmental (CXS 269-1967), Tilsiter (CXS 270-1968), Saint-Paulin (CXS 271-1968), Provolone (CXS 272-1968), Coulommiers (CXS 274-1969), Camembert (CXS 276-1973) and Brie (CXS 277-1973) at 35 mg/kg", and revised Note 500 (APO500) "Except for use in products conforming to the General Standard for Cheese (CXS-283-1978) at 35 mg/kg", XS208 and XS278.
01.6.2.2	Rind of ripened cheese	500			Adopt at 50 mg/kg.
01.6.2.3	Cheese powder (for reconstitution; e.g. for cheese sauces)	100			Adopt at 15 mg/kg.
01.6.4	Processed cheese	100			Adopt at 100 mg/kg.

Carotenal, beta-apo-8'-					
INS 160e beta-apo-8'-Carotenal Functional class: Colour					
Food Cat. No.	Food Cat. Name	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step	Final EWG Proposal
01.6.5	Cheese analogues	200			Adopt at 100 mg/kg.
01.7	Dairy-based desserts (e.g. pudding, fruit or flavoured yoghurt)	100			Adopt at 100 mg/kg.
02.1.2	Vegetable oils and fats	25	508, 509, XS33, XS210		Do not add a provision for INS 160e in this food category.
02.1.3	Lard, tallow, fish oil, and other animal fats	25	512 & XS329		Do not add a provision for INS 160e in this food category.
02.2.1	Butter	25	146 & 291		Do not add a provision for INS 160e in this food category.
02.2.2	Fat spreads, dairy fat spreads and blended spreads	35			Do not add a provision for INS 160e in this food category.
02.3	Fat emulsions mainly of type oil-in-water, including mixed and/or flavoured products based on fat emulsions	200			Do not add a provision for INS 160e in this food category.
02.4	Fat-based desserts excluding dairy-based dessert products of food category 01.7	150			Do not add a provision for INS 160e in this food category.
03.0	Edible ices, including sherbet and sorbet	200			Adopt provision at 20 mg/kg.
04.1.2.3	Fruit in vinegar, oil, or brine	1000			Do not add a provision for INS 160e in this food category.
04.1.2.4	Canned or bottled (pasteurized) fruit	200	161 & 104		Do not add a provision for INS 160e in this food category.
04.1.2.5	Jams, jellies, marmelades	200			Do not add a provision for INS 160e in this food category.
04.1.2.6	Fruit-based spreads (e.g. chutney) excluding products of food category 04.1.2.5	500			Do not add a provision for INS 160e in this food category.
04.1.2.7	Candied fruit	200			Adopt at 2 mg/kg.
04.1.2.8	Fruit preparations, including pulp, purees, fruit toppings and coconut milk	100	161 & 182		Adopt at 100 mg/kg with new note "For use in purees and toppings only."
04.1.2.9	Fruit-based desserts, including fruit-flavoured water-based desserts	150			Adopt provision at 48 mg/kg.

Carotenal, beta-apo-8'-					
INS 160e beta-apo-8'-Carotenal Functional class: Colour					
Food Cat. No.	Food Cat. Name	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step	Final EWG Proposal
04.1.2.10	Fermented fruit products	500			Do not add a provision for INS 160e in this food category.
04.1.2.11	Fruit fillings for pastries	100			Do not add a provision for INS 160e in this food category.
04.2.1.2	Surface-treated fresh vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds	500	4, 16 & 161		Do not add a provision for INS 160e in this food category.
04.2.2.2	Dried vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds	1000	161		Do not add a provision for INS 160e in this food category.
04.2.2.3	Vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds in vinegar, oil, brine, or soybean sauce	50	161		Do not add a provision for INS 160e in this food category.
04.2.2.4	Canned or bottled (pasteurized) or retort pouch vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds	50	161		Do not add a provision for INS 160e in this food category.
04.2.2.5	Vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed purees and spreads (e.g., peanut butter)	50	161		Do not add a provision for INS 160e in this food category.
04.2.2.6	Vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed pulps and preparations	50	92 & 161		Adopt at 100 mg/kg with new note "For use in seed preparations only."

Carotenal, beta-apo-8'-					
INS 160e beta-apo-8'-Carotenal Functional class: Colour					
Food Cat. No.	Food Cat. Name	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step	Final EWG Proposal
	(e.g. vegetable desserts and sauces, candied vegetables) other than food category 04.2.2.5				
04.2.2.7	Fermented vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and seaweed products, excluding fermented soybean products of food categories 06.8.6, 06.8.7, 12.9.1, 12.9.2.1 and 12.9.2.3	50			Do not add a provision for INS 160e in this food category.
05.1.3	Cocoa-based spreads, including fillings	100	161 & XS86		Adopt at 10 mg/kg with Note 161 and XS86.
05.1.4	Cocoa and chocolate products	100	183		Adopt at 50 mg/kg with Note 183.
05.1.5	Imitation chocolate, chocolate substitute products	100			Do not add a provision for INS 160e in this food category.
05.2	Confectionery including hard and soft candy, nougats, etc. other than food categories 05.1, 05.3 and 05.4	100	XS309R		Adopt at 50 mg/kg with Note XS309R
05.3	Chewing gum	100			Adopt at 25 mg/kg.
05.4	Decorations (e.g. for fine bakery wares), toppings (non-fruit) and sweet sauces	100			Adopt at 11 mg/kg.
06.3	Breakfast cereals, including rolled oats	200			Do not add a provision for INS 160e in this food category.
06.4.3	Pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products	1200	153, 474		Adopt at 200 mg/kg with Note 153
06.5	Cereal and starch based desserts (e.g. rice pudding, tapioca pudding)	150			Adopt at 10.8 mg/kg
06.6	Batters (e.g. for breading or batters for fish or poultry)	500			Do not add a provision for INS 160e in this food category.
07.1.2	Crackers, excluding sweet crackers	1000			Do not add a provision for INS 160e in this food category.

Carotenal, beta-apo-8'-					
INS 160e beta-apo-8'-Carotenal Functional class: Colour					
Food Cat. No.	Food Cat. Name	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step	Final EWG Proposal
07.1.3	Other ordinary bakery products (e.g. bagels, pita, English muffins)	100			Do not add a provision for INS 160e in this food category.
07.1.4	Bread-type products, including bread stuffing and bread crumbs	200	116		Do not add a provision for INS 160e in this food category.
07.1.5	Steamed breads and buns	100	216		Do not add a provision for INS 160e in this food category.
07.2	Fine bakery wares (sweet, salty, savoury) and mixes	100			Adopt at 20 mg/kg.
08.1.2	Fresh meat, poultry, and game, comminuted	100	4 & 16		Do not add a provision for INS 160e in this food category.
08.3.1.1	Cured (including salted) non-heat treated processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	100	16		Do not add a provision for INS 160e in this food category.
08.3.1.2	Cured (including salted) and dried non-heat treated processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	20	16		Do not add a provision for INS 160e in this food category.
08.3.1.3	Fermented non-heat treated processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	20	16		Do not add a provision for INS 160e in this food category.
08.3.2	Heat-treated processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	20	16, XS88, XS89 & XS98		Do not add a provision for INS 160e in this food category.
08.4	Edible casings (e.g. sausage casings)	100			Adopt provision at 100 mg/kg with new note (APP1A) "Level of colour corresponds to the finished product as consumed (e.g., the sausage)"
08.4	Edible casings (e.g. sausage casings)	10000			Do not move provision forward (see FC 08.4 provision above).
09.1.1	Fresh fish	300	4		Do not add a provision for INS 160e in this food category.
09.1.2	Fresh mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	100	4, 16, XS292, XS312 & XS315		Do not add a provision for INS 160e in this food category.

Carotenal, beta-apo-8'-					
INS 160e beta-apo-8'-Carotenal Functional class: Colour					
Food Cat. No.	Food Cat. Name	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step	Final EWG Proposal
09.2	Processed fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	100	95, 304, XS36, XS92, XS95, XS165, XS167, XS189, XS190, XS191, XS222, XS236, XS244, XS292, XS311, XS312 & XS315		Maintain 100 mg/kg with New Note (APP1B) ““For non-standardized foods: for use in surimi, fish roe products, and dried mollusks and crustaceans, only”, revised note 304 (CAROT304) “For use only in breaded or batter coatings in products conforming to the Standard for Quick Frozen Fish Sticks (Fish Fingers), Fish Portions and Fish Fillets –Breaded or in Batter (CODEX STAN 166- 1989), singly or in combination: carotenoids beta-Carotenes (beta-carotenes, synthetic (INS 160a(i)), beta-carotenes, Blakeslea trispora (INS 160a(iii)), beta-Carotene-Rich Extract from <i>Dunaliella salina</i> (INS160a(iv)) , carotenal, beta-apo-8' (INS 160e), carotenoic acid, ethyl ester, betaapo-8' (INS 160f) and beta-carotenes, vegetable (INS 160a(ii))”., XS36, XS92, XS95, XS165, XS167, XS189, XS190, XS191, XS222, XS236, XS244, XS292, XS311, XS312, XS315. Chair’s note: New note and revised note 304 added for consistency with beta-Carotenes and beta-carotene, vegetable.
09.3	Semi-preserved fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	100	95 & XS291		Adopt at 20 mg/kg with Notes 95 and XS291.
09.4	Fully preserved, including canned or fermented fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	100	95, XS3, XS37, XS70, XS90, XS94 & XS119		Adopt at 20 mg/kg with notes 95, XS3, XS37, XS70, XS90, XS94 & XS119
10.1	Fresh eggs	1000	4		Do not add a provision for INS 160e in this food category.
10.4	Egg-based desserts (e.g. custard)	150			Adopt at 10.8 mg/kg.
11.4	Other sugars and syrups (e.g. xylose, maple syrup, sugar toppings)	50	217		Do not add a provision for INS 160e in this food category.
12.2.2	Seasonings and condiments	500			Adopt at 50 mg/kg.
12.4	Mustards	300			Do not add a provision for INS 160e in this food category.
12.5	Soups and broths	300	341		Adopt at 15 mg/kg with revised note 341 (CAROT341) “For use in products conforming to the Codex Standard for Bouillons and

Carotenal, beta-apo-8'-					
INS 160e beta-apo-8'-Carotenal Functional class: Colour					
Food Cat. No.	Food Cat. Name	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step	Final EWG Proposal
					Consommés (CODEX STAN 117-1981), singly or in combination: beta-Carotenes (INS 160a(i), 160a(iii), and 160a(iv)) , Carotenes, beta-, vegetable (INS 160a(ii)) and carotenal, beta-apo-8'- (INS 160e) at 50 mg/kg".
12.6	Sauces and like products	500	XS302		Adopt at 80 mg/kg with Note XS302.
12.7	Salads (e.g. macaroni salad, potato salad) and sandwich spreads excluding cocoa- and nut-based spreads of food categories 04.2.2.5 and 05.1.3	50			Do not add a provision for INS 160e in this food category.
13.3	Dietetic foods intended for special medical purposes (excluding products of food category 13.1)	50			Do not add a provision for INS 160e in this food category.
13.4	Dietetic formulae for slimming purposes and weight reduction	50			Do not add a provision for INS 160e in this food category.
13.5	Dietetic foods (e.g. supplementary foods for dietary use) excluding products of food categories 13.1 - 13.4 and 13.6	300			Do not add a provision for INS 160e in this food category.
13.6	Food supplements	300			Adopt at 210 mg/kg.
14.1.4	Water-based flavoured drinks, including "sport," "energy," or "electrolyte" drinks and particulated drinks	100			Adopt at 10 mg/kg.
14.2.2	Cider and perry	200			Do not add a provision for INS 160e in this food category.
14.2.4	Wines (other than grape)	200			Do not add a provision for INS 160e in this food category.
14.2.6	Distilled spirituous beverages containing more than 15% alcohol	200			Do not add a provision for INS 160e in this food category.
14.2.7	Aromatized alcoholic beverages (e.g. beer, wine and spirituous cooler-type beverages, low alcoholic refreshers)	200			Do not add a provision for INS 160e in this food category.

Carotenal, beta-apo-8'-					
INS 160e beta-apo-8'-Carotenal Functional class: Colour					
Food Cat. No.	Food Cat. Name	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step	Final EWG Proposal
15.1	Snacks - potato, cereal, flour or starch based (from roots and tubers, pulses and legumes)	100			Adopt at 30 mg/kg.
15.2	Processed nuts, including coated nuts and nut mixtures (with e.g. dried fruit)	100			Do not add provision in this food category.

Annex 3: Final EWG Proposals for beta-Carotenes, Vegetable (INS 160a(ii))

CCFA52 requested that the GSFA EWG circulate provisions for carotenes, Beta -, vegetable (INS 160a(ii)) for comment on actual use and use level in the context of the mandate for provisions in the GSFA for the group header “CAROTENOIDS”. Final EWG proposals from the EWG discussions for INS 160a(ii) are presented, below.

Carotenes, Beta-, Vegetable					
INS 160a(ii) beta-Carotenes, vegetable Functional class: Colour					
Food Cat. No.	Food Cat. Name	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Year Adopted	Final EWG Proposal
01.1.4	Flavoured fluid milk drinks	1000	52 & 401	2017	Adopt at 20 mg/kg (consistent with beta-carotenes) with Note 52, new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and new “singly or in combination” note.
01.3.2	Beverage whiteners	1000	XS250 & XS252	2021	Adopt at 10 mg/kg with Notes XS250, XS252, new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene) and new “singly or in combination” note.
01.4.4	Cream analogues	20		2011	Adopt at 20 mg/kg with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene) and new “Singly or in Combination” note.
01.5.2	Milk and cream powder analogues	1000	XS251	2021	Adopt at 6 mg/kg with Note XS251, new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene) and new “singly or in combination” note.
01.6.1	Unripened cheese	600		2005	Adopt at 3 mg/kg (lower use level for consistency with beta-carotenes) with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), new “singly or in combination” note and XS273. Chair’s Note: Also recommend adding revised Note 489 (CAROT489) “Except for use in products conforming to the General Standard for Unripened Cheese including Fresh Cheese (CXS 221-2001) at 25 mg/kg”, and revised Note 490 (CAROT490) “Except for use in products conforming to the Standard for Cream Cheese (CXS 275-1973) at 35 mg/kg.” INS 160a(ii) was permitted for use in CXS 221-2001 and CXS 275-1973 at 600 mg/kg. These notes would tie use levels with those for the beta-Carotenes which are expected to be on a beta-carotene basis and would also be covered by the general “singly or in combination” note.
01.6.2.1	Ripened cheese, includes rind	600	463, XS208, XS278	2021	Adopt at 25 mg/kg (to align use level with beta-Carotenes) with XS208, XS278, new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-

Carotenes, Beta-, Vegetable					
INS 160a(ii) beta-Carotenes, vegetable Functional class: Colour					
Food Cat. No.	Food Cat. Name	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Year Adopted	Final EWG Proposal
					<p>Carotene), new “singly or in combination” note, revised Note 458 (CAROT458) “Except for use in cheese mass only for products conforming to the Standards for Cheddar (CXS 263-1966), Danbo (CXS 264-1966), Edam (CXS 265-1966), Gouda (CXS 266-1966), Havarti (CXS 267-1966), Samsø (CXS 268-1966), Emmental (CXS 269-1967), Tilsiter (CXS 270-1968), Saint-Paulin (CXS 271-1968), Provolone (CXS 272-1968), Coulommiers (CXS 274-1969), Camembert (CXS 276-1973) and Brie (CXS 277-1973) at 35 mg/kg”,</p> <p>Chair’s note: Revised notes 458 (CAROT458) would tie use levels with those for the beta-Carotenes which are expected to be on a beta-carotene basis and would also be covered by the general “singly or in combination” note.</p>
01.6.2.2	Rind of ripened cheese	1000		2005	Adopt at 100 mg/kg with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene) and new “singly or in combination” note.
01.6.2.3	Cheese powder (for reconstitution; e.g. for cheese sauces)	1000		2005	Adopt at 20 mg/kg with Note 381 (“As consumed”) to clarify that the use level is for after reconstitution, new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and new “singly or in combination” note.
01.6.4	Processed cheese	1000		2005	Adopt at 100 mg/kg with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene) and new “singly or in combination” note.
01.6.5	Cheese analogues	1000	3	2005	Adopt at 100 mg/kg (for parity with beta-carotenes) with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene) and new “singly or in combination” note.
01.7	Dairy-based desserts (e.g. pudding, fruit or flavoured yoghurt)	1000		2005	Adopt at 20 mg/kg (for parity with beta-Carotenes) with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene) and new “singly or in combination” note.
02.1.2	Vegetable oils and fats	1000	509, 517, XS33, XS210	2021	<p>Adopt at 25 mg/kg (for consistency with beta-Carotenes), with Notes 508, 509, XS33, XS210, XS325R, new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene) and new “singly or in combination” note.</p> <p>Chair’s note: If a level of 25 mg/kg is adopted, then Note 517 is not necessary. However, if Note 517 is removed, Note 508 should be added to indicate the purpose of colours in CXS 19-1981.</p>

Carotenes, Beta-, Vegetable					
INS 160a(ii) beta-Carotenes, vegetable Functional class: Colour					
Food Cat. No.	Food Cat. Name	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Year Adopted	Final EWG Proposal
02.1.3	Lard, tallow, fish oil, and other animal fats	1000	518, XS329	2021	Adopt at 10 mg/kg with note 518, XS329, new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene) and “singly or in combination” note.
02.2.1	Butter	600		2008	Adopt at 12 mg/kg (for consistency with beta-Carotenes) with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene) and “singly or in combination” note.
02.2.2	Fat spreads, dairy fat spreads and blended spreads	1000		2005	Adopt at 35 mg/kg with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene) and “singly or in combination” note.
02.3	Fat emulsions mainly of type oil-in-water, including mixed and/or flavoured products based on fat emulsions	1000		2005	Adopt at 10 mg/kg with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and “singly or in combination” note.
02.4	Fat-based desserts excluding dairy-based dessert products of food category 01.7	1000		2005	Adopt at 10 mg/kg with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and “singly or in combination” note.
03.0	Edible ices, including sherbet and sorbet	1000		2005	Adopt at 70 mg/kg with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and “singly or in combination” note.
04.1.2.3	Fruit in vinegar, oil, or brine	1000		2005	Adopt at 90 mg/kg with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and “singly or in combination” note.
04.1.2.4	Canned or bottled (pasteurized) fruit	1000	104	2018	Adopt at 50 mg/kg with Note 104 and new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene) and “singly or in combination” note.
04.1.2.5	Jams, jellies, marmelades	1000		2005	Adopt at 15 mg/kg (for consistency with beta-Carotenes) with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and “singly or in combination” note.
04.1.2.6	Fruit-based spreads (e.g. chutney) excluding products of food category 04.1.2.5	500		2005	Adopt at 10 mg/kg with XS160 (Codex Stan 160-1987 does not permit colors) and new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and “singly or in combination” note.
04.1.2.8	Fruit preparations, including pulp, purees, fruit toppings and coconut milk	100	182	2011	Adopt at 10 mg/kg with Note XS240, new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and “singly or in combination” note. Chair’s note: XS240 replaces Note 182.
04.1.2.9	Fruit-based desserts, including fruit-flavoured water-based desserts	1000		2005	Adopt at 15 mg/kg with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene) and “singly or in combination” note.

Carotenes, Beta-, Vegetable					
INS 160a(ii) beta-Carotenes, vegetable Functional class: Colour					
Food Cat. No.	Food Cat. Name	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Year Adopted	Final EWG Proposal
04.1.2.10	Fermented fruit products	200		2005	Adopt at 10 mg/kg with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene) and “singly or in combination” note.
04.1.2.11	Fruit fillings for pastries	100		2009	Adopt at 10 mg/kg (for parity with beta-Carotenes) with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene) and “singly or in combination” note.
04.2.2.2	Dried vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds	200		2011	Adopt at 90 mg/kg with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and with “singly or in combination” note.
04.2.2.3	Vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds in vinegar, oil, brine, or soybean sauce	1320		2011	Adopt at 5 mg/kg with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and “singly or in combination” note.
04.2.2.4	Canned or bottled (pasteurized) or retort pouch vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds	200		2011	Adopt at 50 mg/kg with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene) and “singly or in combination” note.
04.2.2.5	Vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed purees and spreads (e.g., peanut butter)	1000		2005	Adopt at 50 mg/kg with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene) and “singly or in combination” note.
04.2.2.6	Vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed pulps and preparations (e.g. vegetable desserts and sauces,	1000	92	2008	Adopt at 50 mg/kg with Note 92, new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene) and “singly or in combination” note.

Carotenes, Beta-, Vegetable					
INS 160a(ii) beta-Carotenes, vegetable Functional class: Colour					
Food Cat. No.	Food Cat. Name	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Year Adopted	Final EWG Proposal
	candied vegetables) other than food category 04.2.2.5				
04.2.2.7	Fermented vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and seaweed products, excluding fermented soybean products of food categories 06.8.6, 06.8.7, 12.9.1, 12.9.2.1 and 12.9.2.3	1000		2005	Adopt at 5 mg/kg with XS38, XS151, XS223, XS294R (these standards do not permit colors), new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and “singly or in combination” note.
05.1.3	Cocoa-based spreads, including fillings	100	XS86	2016	Adopt at 3 mg/kg (for parity with beta-Carotenes provision) with Note XS86, new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and “singly or in combination” note.
05.1.4	Cocoa and chocolate products	100	183	2016	Maintain use at 100 mg/kg with Note 183 with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and “singly or in combination” note.
05.1.5	Imitation chocolate, chocolate substitute products	100		2010	Maintain use at 100 mg/kg, new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and “singly or in combination” note.
05.2	Confectionery including hard and soft candy, nougats, etc. other than food categories 05.1, 05.3 and 05.4	500	XS309R	2017	Adopt at 150 mg/kg with XS309R, new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and “singly or in combination” note.
05.3	Chewing gum	500		2005	Adopt at 180 mg/kg with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and “singly or in combination” note.
05.4	Decorations (e.g. for fine bakery wares), toppings (non-fruit) and sweet sauces	20000		2005	Adopt at 200 mg/kg with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and “singly or in combination” note.
06.3	Breakfast cereals, including rolled oats	400		2005	Adopt at 50 mg/kg with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and “singly or in combination” note.
06.4.2	Dried pastas and noodles and like products	1000	211	2011	Revoke provision.
06.4.3	Pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products	1000	153	2010	Adopt at 40 mg/kg (for parity with beta-Carotenes) with note 153, new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and “singly or in combination” note.

Carotenes, Beta-, Vegetable					
INS 160a(ii) beta-Carotenes, vegetable Functional class: Colour					
Food Cat. No.	Food Cat. Name	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Year Adopted	Final EWG Proposal
06.5	Cereal and starch based desserts (e.g. rice pudding, tapioca pudding)	1000		2005	Adopt at 40 mg/kg (for parity with beta-Carotenes) with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and “singly or in combination” note.
06.6	Batters (e.g. for breading or batters for fish or poultry)	1000		2005	Adopt at 50 mg/kg with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene) and “singly or in combination” note.
07.1.2	Crackers, excluding sweet crackers	1000		2005	Adopt at 200 mg/kg (same as beta-Carotenes) with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene).
07.1.4	Bread-type products, including bread stuffing and bread crumbs	1000		2005	Adopt at 30 mg/kg with Note 116, new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and “singly or in combination” note.
07.2	Fine bakery wares (sweet, salty, savoury) and mixes	1000		2005	Adopt at 42 mg/kg and add new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and “singly or in combination” note.
08.1.2	Fresh meat, poultry, and game, comminuted	20	4 & 16	2011	Revoke provision as there is no indication of use.
08.2	Processed meat, poultry, and game products in whole pieces or cuts	5000	16, XS96 & XS97	2014	Adopt at 20 mg/kg with notes 16, XS96 & XS97 and add new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene). Chair’s note: There is no corresponding provision for beta-Carotenes in FC 8.2, therefore a “singly or in combination” note is not necessary.
08.3.1	Non-heat treated processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	20	118	2005	Adopt at 20 mg/kg with Note 16 (for parity with beta-Carotenes provision), new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and “singly or in combination” note.
08.3.2	Heat-treated processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	20	XS88, XS89 & XS98	2014	Adopt at 7 mg/kg (for parity with beta-Carotene provision) with Note 16 (for parity with beta-carotene provision), XS88, XS89, XS98, new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and “singly or in combination” note.
08.3.3	Frozen processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	5000	16	2005	Adopt at 15 mg/kg with Note 16 and add new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene). Chair’s note: No corresponding provision for beta-carotenes, therefore no need for “singly or in combination” note.
08.4	Edible casings (e.g. sausage casings)	5000		2005	Adopt at 50 mg/kg with new note (APP1A) “Level of colour corresponds to the finished product as consumed (e.g., the

Carotenes, Beta-, Vegetable					
INS 160a(ii) beta-Carotenes, vegetable Functional class: Colour					
Food Cat. No.	Food Cat. Name	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Year Adopted	Final EWG Proposal
					sausage)", with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene) and "singly or in combination" note.
09.2.2	Frozen battered fish, fish fillets, and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	100	304	2017	For alignment with "beta-Carotenes", propose moving provisions to higher FC 9.2 by adopting at 100 mg/kg with New Note (APP1B) "For non-standardized foods: for use in surimi, fish roe products, and dried mollusks and crustaceans, only", revised note 304 (CAROT304) "For use only in breaded or batter coatings in products conforming to the Standard for Quick Frozen Fish Sticks (Fish Fingers), Fish Portions and Fish Fillets –Breaded or in Batter (CODEX STAN 166- 1989), singly or in combination: carotenoids beta-Carotenes (beta-carotenes, synthetic (INS 160a(i)), beta-carotenes, Blakeslea trispora (INS 160a(iii)), beta-Carotene-Rich Extract from <i>Dunaliella salina</i> (INS160a(iv)) , carotenal, beta-apo-8' (INS 160e), carotenoic acid, ethyl ester, betaapo-8' (INS 160f) and beta-carotenes, vegetable (INS 160a(ii))", XS36, XS92, XS95, XS165, XS167, XS189, XS190, XS191, XS222, XS236, XS244, XS292, XS311, XS312, XS315 and new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and "singly or in combination" note
09.2.3	Frozen minced and creamed fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	1000	16	2005	For alignment with "beta-Carotenes", propose moving provisions to higher FC 9.2 by adopting at 100 mg/kg with New Note (APP1B) "For non-standardized foods: for use in surimi, fish roe products, and dried mollusks and crustaceans, only", revised note 304 (CAROT304) "For use only in breaded or batter coatings in products conforming to the Standard for Quick Frozen Fish Sticks (Fish Fingers), Fish Portions and Fish Fillets –Breaded or in Batter (CODEX STAN 166- 1989), singly or in combination: carotenoids beta-Carotenes (beta-carotenes, synthetic (INS 160a(i)), beta-carotenes, Blakeslea trispora (INS 160a(iii)), beta-Carotene-Rich Extract from <i>Dunaliella salina</i> (INS160a(iv)) , carotenal, beta-apo-8' (INS 160e), carotenoic acid, ethyl ester, betaapo-8' (INS 160f) and beta-carotenes, vegetable (INS 160a(ii))", XS36, XS92, XS95, XS165, XS167, XS189, XS190, XS191, XS222, XS236, XS244, XS292, XS311, XS312, XS315 and new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and "singly or in combination" note
09.2.4.1	Cooked fish and fish products	1000	95	2009	For alignment with "beta-Carotenes", propose moving provisions to higher FC 9.2 by adopting at 100 mg/kg with New Note (APP1B) "For

Carotenes, Beta-, Vegetable					
INS 160a(ii) beta-Carotenes, vegetable Functional class: Colour					
Food Cat. No.	Food Cat. Name	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Year Adopted	Final EWG Proposal
					non-standardized foods: for use in surimi, fish roe products, and dried mollusks and crustaceans, only”, revised note 304 (CAROT304) “For use only in breaded or batter coatings in products conforming to the Standard for Quick Frozen Fish Sticks (Fish Fingers), Fish Portions and Fish Fillets –Breaded or in Batter (CODEX STAN 166- 1989), singly or in combination: carotenoids beta-Carotenes (beta-carotenes, synthetic (INS 160a(i)), beta-carotenes, Blakeslea trispora (INS 160a(iii)), beta-Carotene-Rich Extract from <i>Dunaliella salina</i> (INS160a(iv)) , carotenal, beta-apo-8’ (INS 160e), carotenoic acid, ethyl ester, betaapo-8’ (INS 160f)) and beta-carotenes, vegetable (INS 160a(ii))”, XS36, XS92, XS95, XS165, XS167, XS189, XS190, XS191, XS222, XS236, XS244, XS292, XS311, XS312, XS315 and new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and “singly or in combination” note
09.2.4.2	Cooked mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	1000		2005	For alignment with “beta-Carotenes”, propose moving provisions to higher FC 9.2 by adopting at 100 mg/kg with New Note (APP1B) “For non-standardized foods: for use in surimi, fish roe products, and dried mollusks and crustaceans, only”, revised note 304 (CAROT304) “For use only in breaded or batter coatings in products conforming to the Standard for Quick Frozen Fish Sticks (Fish Fingers), Fish Portions and Fish Fillets –Breaded or in Batter (CODEX STAN 166- 1989), singly or in combination: carotenoids beta-Carotenes (beta-carotenes, synthetic (INS 160a(i)), beta-carotenes, Blakeslea trispora (INS 160a(iii)), beta-Carotene-Rich Extract from <i>Dunaliella salina</i> (INS160a(iv)) , carotenal, beta-apo-8’ (INS 160e), carotenoic acid, ethyl ester, betaapo-8’ (INS 160f)) and beta-carotenes, vegetable (INS 160a(ii))”, XS36, XS92, XS95, XS165, XS167, XS189, XS190, XS191, XS222, XS236, XS244, XS292, XS311, XS312, XS315 and new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and “singly or in combination” note
09.2.4.3	Fried fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	1000	16	2005	For alignment with “beta-Carotenes”, propose moving provisions to higher FC 9.2 by adopting at 100 mg/kg with New Note (APP1B) “For non-standardized foods: for use in surimi, fish roe products, and dried mollusks and crustaceans, only”, revised note 304 (CAROT304) “For use only in breaded or batter coatings in products conforming to the Standard for Quick Frozen Fish Sticks (Fish Fingers), Fish Portions and Fish Fillets –Breaded or in Batter

Carotenes, Beta-, Vegetable					
INS 160a(ii) beta-Carotenes, vegetable Functional class: Colour					
Food Cat. No.	Food Cat. Name	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Year Adopted	Final EWG Proposal
					(CODEX STAN 166- 1989), singly or in combination: carotenoids beta-Carotenes (beta-carotenes, synthetic (INS 160a(i)), beta-carotenes, Blakeslea trispora (INS 160a(iii)), beta-Carotene-Rich Extract from <i>Dunaliella salina</i> (INS160a(iv)) , carotenal, beta-apo-8' (INS 160e), carotenoic acid, ethyl ester, betaapo-8' (INS 160f)) and beta-carotenes, vegetable (INS 160a(ii))", XS36, XS92, XS95, XS165, XS167, XS189, XS190, XS191, XS222, XS236, XS244, XS292, XS311, XS312, XS315 and new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and "singly or in combination" note
09.2.5	Smoked, dried, fermented, and/or salted fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	1000	XS167, XS189, XS222, XS236, XS244 & XS311	2018	For alignment with "beta-Carotenes", propose moving provisions to higher FC 9.2 by adopting at 100 mg/kg with New Note ""For non-standardized foods: for use in surimi, fish roe products, and dried mollusks and crustaceans, only", revised note 304 ("For use only in breaded or batter coatings in products conforming to the Standard for Quick Frozen Fish Sticks (Fish Fingers), Fish Portions and Fish Fillets –Breaded or in Batter (CODEX STAN 166- 1989), singly or in combination: carotenoids (beta-carotenes, synthetic (INS 160a(i)), beta-carotenes, Blakeslea trispora (INS 160a(iii)), beta-Carotene-Rich Extract from <i>Dunaliella salina</i> (INS160a(iv)) carotenal, beta-apo-8' (INS 160e), carotenoic acid, ethyl ester, betaapo-8' (INS 160f)) and beta-carotenes, vegetable (INS 160a(ii))", XS36, XS92, XS95, XS165, XS167, XS189, XS190, XS191, XS222, XS236, XS244, XS292, XS311, XS312, XS315 and new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and "singly or in combination" note.
09.3.1	Fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms, marinated and/or in jelly	1000	16	2005	For parity with "beta-carotenes", propose to move to higher food category 9.3 and adopt at 20 mg/kg with Notes 95, XS291, new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and "singly or in combination" note.
09.3.2	Fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms, pickled and/or in brine	1000	16	2005	For parity with "beta-carotenes", propose to move to higher food category 9.3 and adopt at 20 mg/kg with Notes 95, XS291, new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and "singly or in combination" note.
09.3.3	Salmon substitutes, caviar, and other fish roe products	1000	XS291	2018	For parity with "beta-carotenes", propose to move to higher food category 9.3 and adopt at 20 mg/kg with Notes 95, XS291, new

Carotenes, Beta-, Vegetable					
INS 160a(ii) beta-Carotenes, vegetable Functional class: Colour					
Food Cat. No.	Food Cat. Name	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Year Adopted	Final EWG Proposal
					reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and “singly or in combination” note.
09.3.4	Semi-preserved fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms (e.g. fish paste), excluding products of food categories 09.3.1 - 09.3.3	1000	16	2005	For parity with “beta-carotenes”, propose to move to higher food category 9.3 and adopt at 20 mg/kg with Notes 95, XS291, new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and “singly or in combination” note.
09.4	Fully preserved, including canned or fermented fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	500	XS3, XS37, XS70, XS90, XS94 & XS119	2018	For parity with “beta-carotenes” adopt at 20 mg/kg with Notes 95, XS3, XS37, XS70, XS90, XS94, XS119, new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and “singly or in combination” note.
10.1	Fresh eggs	1000	4	2005	Revoke provision as no indication of use.
10.2	Egg products	1000		2005	Adopt at 200 mg/kg with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene). Chair’s note: There is currently not a provision for this food category for “beta-carotenes”.
10.4	Egg-based desserts (e.g. custard)	150		2005	Adopt at 15 mg/kg with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene). and “singly or in combination” note.
11.4	Other sugars and syrups (e.g. xylose, maple syrup, sugar toppings)	50		2005	Revoke provision as no indication of use.
12.2.2	Seasonings and condiments	500		2011	Adopt at 100 mg/kg (for parity with beta-carotenes) with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and “singly or in combination” note.
12.4	Mustards	1000		2005	Adopt at 5 mg/kg with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene) and “singly or in combination” note.
12.5	Soups and broths	1000	341	2015	Adopt at 10 mg/kg with revised note 341 (CAROT341) “For use in products conforming to the Codex Standard for Bouillons and Consommés (CODEX STAN 117-1981), singly or in combination: beta-Carotenes (INS 160a(i), 160a(iii), and 160a(iv)) , Carotenes, beta-, vegetable (INS 160a(ii)) and carotenal, beta-apo-8’- (INS

Carotenes, Beta-, Vegetable					
INS 160a(ii) beta-Carotenes, vegetable Functional class: Colour					
Food Cat. No.	Food Cat. Name	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Year Adopted	Final EWG Proposal
					160e) at 50 mg/kg" and new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene).
12.6.1	Emulsified sauces and dips (e.g. mayonnaise, salad dressing, onion dip)	2000		2005	Propose moving to FC 12.6 (for parity with beta-carotenes) with adoption at 80 mg/kg with XS302 new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene) and "singly or in combination note".
12.6.2	Non-emulsified sauces (e.g. ketchup, cheese sauce, cream sauce, brown gravy)	2000		2005	Propose moving to FC 12.6 (for parity with beta-carotenes) with adoption at 80 mg/kg with XS302 new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene) and "singly or in combination note".
12.6.3	Mixes for sauces and gravies	2000		2005	Propose moving to FC 12.6 (for parity with beta-carotenes) with adoption at 80 mg/kg with XS302 new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene) and "singly or in combination note".
12.7	Salads (e.g. macaroni salad, potato salad) and sandwich spreads excluding cocoa- and nut-based spreads of food categories 04.2.2.5 and 05.1.3	1000		2005	Adopt at 20 mg/kg with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene) and "singly or in combination" note.
13.3	Dietetic foods intended for special medical purposes (excluding products of food category 13.1)	600		2005	Adopt at 50 mg/kg (for parity with beta-Carotenes) with Note XS118, new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and "singly or in combination" note.
13.4	Dietetic formulae for slimming purposes and weight reduction	600		2005	Adopt at 8 mg/kg with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and "singly or in combination" note.
13.5	Dietetic foods (e.g. supplementary foods for dietary use) excluding products of food categories 13.1 - 13.4 and 13.6	600		2005	Adopt at 100 mg/kg (for parity with beta-carotenes) with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and "singly or in combination" note.
13.6	Food supplements	600		2005	Adopt use level of 220 mg/kg (for parity with beta-Carotenes) with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and "singly or in combination" note.
14.1.4	Water-based flavoured drinks, including "sport," "energy," or "electrolyte" drinks and particulated drinks	2000		2005	Adopt use level of 50 mg/kg (for parity with beta-Carotenes) with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene).

Carotenes, Beta-, Vegetable					
INS 160a(ii) beta-Carotenes, vegetable Functional class: Colour					
Food Cat. No.	Food Cat. Name	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Year Adopted	Final EWG Proposal
14.2.1	Beer and malt beverages	600		2005	Revoke provision.
14.2.2	Cider and perry	600		2005	Adopt use level of 2.5 mg/kg with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and “singly or in combination” note.
14.2.4	Wines (other than grape)	600		2005	Adopt use level of 3 mg/kg with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and “singly or in combination” note.
14.2.6	Distilled spirituous beverages containing more than 15% alcohol	600		2005	Adopt use level of 3 mg/kg with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and “singly or in combination” note.
14.2.7	Aromatized alcoholic beverages (e.g. beer, wine and spirituous cooler-type beverages, low alcoholic refreshers)	600		2005	Adopt at 15 mg/kg (for parity with beta-Carotenes) with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and “singly or in combination” note.
15.1	Snacks - potato, cereal, flour or starch based (from roots and tubers, pulses and legumes)	100		2009	Adopt use level of 30 mg/kg with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and “singly or in combination” note.
15.2	Processed nuts, including coated nuts and nut mixtures (with e.g. dried fruit)	20000	3	2011	Adopt use level of 4 mg/kg with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene), and “singly or in combination” note.
15.3	Snacks - fish based	100		2010	Adopt use level of 4 mg/kg with new reporting basis note (Expressed as beta-Carotene). Chair’s note: There is no corresponding provision for FC 15.3, therefore no need for “singly or in combination” note.

Notes

Note Name	Note Text
“Singly or in Combination Note”	Singly or in combination: Beta-Carotenes (beta-carotenes, synthetic (INS 160a(i)), beta-carotenes, Blakeslea trispora (INS 160a(iii)), beta-Carotene-Rich Extract from <i>Dunaliella salina</i> (INS 160a(iv)) and beta-carotenes, vegetable (INS 160a(ii)).
“Reporting basis note”	Expressed as beta-Carotene.
APO489	Except for use in products conforming to the General Standard for Unripened Cheese including Fresh Cheese (CXS 221-2001) at 35 mg/kg.
APO500	Except for use in products conforming to the General Standard for Cheese (CXS-283-1978) at 35 mg/kg.
APP1A	Level of colour corresponds to the finished product as consumed (e.g., the sausage).
APP1B	For non-standardized foods: for use in surimi, fish roe products, and dried mollusks and crustaceans, only.
CAROT304	For use only in breaded or batter coatings in products conforming to the Standard for Quick Frozen Fish Sticks (Fish Fingers), Fish Portions and Fish Fillets - Breaded or in Batter (CODEX STAN 166- 1989), singly or in combination: beta-Carotenes (beta-carotenes, synthetic (INS 160a(i)), beta-carotenes, Blakeslea trispora (INS 160a(iii)), beta-Carotene-Rich Extract from <i>Dunaliella salina</i> (INS160a(iv)), carotenal, beta-apo-8' (INS 160e), and beta-carotenes, vegetable (INS 160a(ii))
CAROT341	For use in products conforming to the Codex Standard for Bouillons and Consommés (CODEX STAN 117-1981), singly or in combination: beta-Carotenes (INS 160a(i), 160a(iii), and 160a(iv)), Carotenes, beta-, vegetable (INS 160a(ii)) and carotenal, beta-apo-8' (INS 160e) at 50 mg/kg
CAROT458	Except for use in cheese mass only for products conforming to the Standards for Cheddar (CXS 263-1966), Danbo (CXS 264-1966), Edam (CXS 265-1966), Gouda (CXS 266-1966), Havarti (CXS 267-1966), Samsø (CXS 268-1966), Emmental (CXS 269-1967), Tilsiter (CXS 270-1968), Saint-Paulin (CXS 271-1968), Provolone (CXS 272-1968), Coulommiers (CXS 274-1969), Camembert (CXS 276-1973) and Brie (CXS 277-1973) at 35 mg/kg.
CAROT489	Except for use in products conforming to the General Standard for Unripened Cheese including Fresh Cheese (CXS 221-2001) at 25 mg/kg.
CAROT490	Except for use in products conforming to the Standard for Cream Cheese (CXS 275-1973) at 35 mg/kg.
Note 3	For use in surface treatment only.
Note 4	For use in decoration, stamping, marking or branding the product only.
Note 16	For use in glaze, coatings or decorations for fruit, vegetables, meat or fish only.
Note 52	Excluding chocolate milk.
Note 92	Excluding tomato-based sauces.
Note 95	For non-standardized foods: for use in surimi and fish roe products only.
Note 104	Excluding canned pears (except for use in special holiday packs) and canned pineapples conforming to the Standard for Certain Canned Fruits (CODEX STAN 319-2015).
Note 116	For use in doughs only.
Note 118	Except for use in tocino (fresh, cured sausage) at 1 000 mg/kg.
Note 146	Beta-carotene (synthetic) (INS 160a(i)) only.
Note 153	For use in instant noodles only.
Note 161	Subject to national legislation of the importing country aimed, in particular, at consistency with Section 3.2 of the Preamble.
Note 182	Excluding coconut milk.
Note 183	For use in surface decoration only.
Note 211	For use in noodles only.

Note 216	For use in maize-based products only.
Note 217	Except for use in toppings at 300 mg/kg.
Note 291	Except for use of beta-apo-8'-carotenal (INS 160e) and beta-apo-8'-carotenoic acid, methyl or ethyl ester (INS 160f) at 35 mg/kg.
Note 304	For use only in breaded or batter coatings in products conforming to the Standard for Quick Frozen Fish Sticks (Fish Fingers), Fish Portions and Fish Fillets – Breaded or in Batter (CODEX STAN 166- 1989), singly or in combination: carotenoids (beta-carotenes, synthetic (INS 160a(i)), beta-carotenes, Blakeslea trispora (INS 160a(iii)), carotenal, beta-apo-8' (INS 160e), carotenoic acid, ethyl ester, betaapo-8'- (INS 160f)) and beta-carotenes, vegetable (INS 160a(ii)).
Note 341	For use in products conforming to the Codex Standard for Bouillons and Consommés (CODEX STAN 117-1981) singly or in combination: carotenes, beta-, vegetable (INS 160a(ii)), carotenal, beta-apo-8'- (INS 160e) and carotenoic acid, ethyl ester, beta-apo-8'- (INS 160f) at 50 mg/kg.
Note 381	As consumed.
Note 401	For use in products conforming to the Standard for Fermented Milk (CODEX STAN 243- 2003) at 600 mg/kg.
Note 402	For use in products conforming to the Standard for Fermented Milk (CODEX STAN 243- 2003) at 100 mg/kg.
Note 458	Except for use in cheese mass only for products conforming to the Standards for Cheddar (CXS 263-1966), Danbo (CXS 264-1966), Edam (CXS 265-1966), Gouda (CXS 266-1966), Havarti (CXS 267-1966), Samsø (CXS 268-1966), Emmental (CXS 269-1967), Tilsiter (CXS 270-1968), Saint-Paulin (CXS 271-1968), Provolone (CXS 272-1968), Coulommiers (CXS 274-1969), Camembert (CXS 276-1973) and Brie (CXS 277-1973); singly or in combination at 35 mg/kg.
Note 463	For use in cheese mass only for products conforming to the Standards for Cheddar (CXS 263-1966), Danbo (CXS 264-1966) Edam (CXS 265-1966), Gouda (CXS 266-1966), Havarti (CXS 267-1966), Samsø (CXS 268-1966), Emmental (CXS 269-1967), Tilsiter (CXS 270-1968), Saint-Paulin (CXS 271-1968), Provolone (CXS 272-1968), Coulommiers (CXS 274-1969), Camembert (CXS 276-1973) and Brie (CXS 277-1973).
Note 474	Except for use of beta-carotenes, Blakeslea trispora (INS 160a(iii)) at 1000 mg/kg, carotenal, beta-apo-8' (INS 160e) at 200 mg/kg, and carotenoic acid, ethyl ester, beta-apo-8' (INS 160f) at 1000 mg/kg in products conforming to the Standard for Instant Noodles (CXS 249-2006).
Note 489	Except for use in products conforming to the General Standard for Unripened Cheese including Fresh Cheese (CXS 221-2001) at 25 mg/kg for carotenes, beta-, synthetic (INS 160a(ii)) and 35 mg/kg for both carotenal, beta-apo-8' (INS 160e) and carotenoic acid, ethyl ester, beta-apo-08'- (INS 160f) only, i.e. no provision for carotenes, beta-, Blakeslea trispora (INS 160a(iii)).
Note 490	Except for use in products conforming to the Standard for Cream Cheese (CXS 275-1973), for carotenes, beta-, synthetic (INS 160a(i)), beta-, Blakeslea trispora (INS 160a(iii)), carotenal, beta-apo-8' (INS 160e) and carotenoic acid, ethyl ester, beta-apo-08'- (INS 160f), singly or in combination, at 35 mg/kg.
Note 500	Except for use in products conforming to the General Standard for Cheese (CXS 283-1978) at 25 mg/kg for carotenes, beta-, synthetic (INS 160a(i)) and 35 mg/kg for both carotenal, beta-apo-8' (INS 160e) and carotenoic acid, ethyl ester, beta-apo-08'- (INS 160f) only, i.e. no provision for carotenes, beta-, Blakeslea trispora (INS 160a(iii)).
Note 508	For use in products conforming to the Standard for Edible Fats and Oils not Covered by Individual Standards (CXS 19-1981) for the purposes of natural colour lost in processing, or standardizing colour only.
Note 509	Excluding virgin and cold pressed oils in products conforming to the Standard for Edible Fats and Oils not Covered by Individual Standards (CXS 19-1981).
Note 512	For use in products conforming to the Standard for Edible fats and oils not Covered by Individual Standards (CXS 19-1981) and the Standard for Named Animal Fats (CXS 211-1999) for the purposes of restoring natural colour lost in processing, or standardizing colour only.
Note 517	Except for use in products conforming to the Standard for Edible fats and oils not covered by individual standards (CXS 19-1981) at 25 mg/kg for the purposes of restoring natural colour lost in processing, or standardizing colour only.

Note 518	Except for use in products conforming to the Standard for Edible fats and oils not covered by individual standards (CXS 19-1981) and the Standard for Named Animal Fats (CXS 211-1999) at 25 mg/kg for the purposes of restoring natural colour lost in processing, or standardizing colour only.
XS3	Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Canned Salmon (CODEX STAN 3-1981).
XS33	Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Olive Oils and Olive Pomace Oils (CODEX STAN 33-1981).
XS36	Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Quick Frozen Finfish, Uneviscerated and Eviscerated (CODEX STAN 36-1981).
XS37	Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Canned Shrimps or Prawns (CODEX STAN 37-1991).
XS38	Excluding products conforming to the General Standard for Edible Fungi and Fungus Products (CODEX STAN 38-1981).
XS70	Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Canned Tuna and Bonito (70-1981).
XS86	Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Cocoa Butter (CODEX STAN 86-1981).
XS88	Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Corned Beef (CODEX STAN 88-1981).
XS89	Excluding products conforming to Standard for Luncheon Meat (CODEX STAN 89-1981).
XS90	Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Canned Crab Meat (CODEX STAN 90-1981).
XS92	Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Quick Frozen Shrimps and Prawns (CODEX STAN 92-1981).
XS94	Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Canned Sardines and Sardine-Type Products (CODEX STAN 94-1981).
XS95	Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Quick Frozen Lobsters (CODEX STAN 95-1981).
XS96	Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Cooked Cured Ham (CODEX STAN 96-1981).
XS97	Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Cooked Cured Pork Shoulder (CODEX STAN 97-1981).
XS98	Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Cooked Cured Chopped Meat (CODEX STAN 98-1981).
XS118	Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Foods for Special Dietary Use for Persons Intolerant to Gluten (CXS 118-1979).
XS119	Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Canned Finfish (CODEX STAN 119-1981).
XS151	Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Gari (CXS 151-1985).
XS160	Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Mango Chutney (CODEX STAN 160-1987).
XS165	Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Quick Frozen Blocks of Fish Fillet, Minced Fish Flesh and Mixtures of Fillets and Minced Fish Flesh (CODEX STAN 165-1989).
XS167	Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Salted Fish and Dried Salted Fish of the Gadidae Family of Fishes (CODEX STAN 167-1989).
XS189	Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Dried Shark Fins (CODEX STAN 189-1993).
XS190	Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Quick Frozen Fish Fillets (CODEX STAN 190-1995).
XS191	Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Quick Frozen Raw Squid (CODEX STAN 191-1995).
XS208	Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Cheese in Brine (CODEX STAN 208-1999).
XS210	Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Named Vegetable Oils (CXS 210-1999).
XS222	Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Crackers from Marine and Freshwater Fish, Crustaceans and Molluscan Shellfish (CODEX STAN 222-2001).
XS223	Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Kimchi (CXS 223-2001).
XS236	Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Boiled Dried Salted Anchovies (CODEX STAN 236-2003).
XS240	Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Aqueous Coconut Products (CODEX STAN 240-2003).
XS244	Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Salted Atlantic Herring and Salted Sprat (CODEX STAN 244-2004).
XS250	Excluding products conforming to the Standard for a Blend of Evaporated Skimmed Milk and Vegetable Fat (CODEX STAN 250-2006).
XS251	Excluding products conforming to the Standard for a Blend of Skimmed Milk and Vegetable Fat in Powdered Form (CODEX STAN 251-2006).
XS252	Excluding products conforming to the Standard for a Blend of Sweetened Condensed Skimmed Milk and Vegetable Fat (CODEX STAN 252-2006).

XS273	Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Cottage Cheese (CXS 273-1968).
XS278	Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Extra Hard Grating Cheese (CXS 278-1978).
XS291	Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Sturgeon Caviar (CODEX STAN 291-2010).
XS292	Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Live and Raw Bivalve Molluscs (CODEX STAN 292-2008).
XS294R	Excluding products conforming to the Regional Standard for Gochujang (CXS 294R-2009).
XS302	Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Fish Sauce (CODEX STAN 302-2011).
XS309R	Excluding products conforming to the Codex Regional Standard for Halawa Tehenia (CODEX STAN 309R-211).
XS311	Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Smoked Fish, Smoked-flavoured Fish and Smoke-dried Fish (CODEX STAN 311-2013).
XS312	Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Live Abalone and for Raw Fresh Chilled or Frozen Abalone for Direct Consumption or for Further Processing (CODEX STAN 312-2013).
XS315	Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Fresh and Quick Frozen Raw Scallop Products (CODEX STAN 315-2014).
XS325R	Excluding products conforming to the Regional Standard for Unrefined Shea Butter (CXS 325R-2017).
XS329	Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Fish Oils (CXS 329-2017).

Appendix 2: Replies of Codex Committee on Processed Fruits and Vegetables (CCPFV)

1. Among several topics, the CCFA52 requested the EWG on the GSFA to CCFA53 to consider:¹
 - Replies of the Codex Committee on Processed Fruits and Vegetables (CCPFV) on:
 - A. tartrates (INS 334, 335(ii), 337) in FC 04.1.2.6 “Fruit based spreads (e.g. chutney), excluding products in FC 04.1.2.5”;
 - B. acidity regulators in general, and tartrates (INS 334, 335(ii), 337) specifically in FC 04.1.2.2 “Dried fruit”;
 - C. emulsifiers, stabilizers, thickeners in general, and xanthan gum (INS 415) specifically, in FC 14.1.2 “Fruit and vegetable juices” and its subcategories and FC 14.1.3 “Fruit and vegetable nectar” and its subcategories. This would also include tamarind seed polysaccharide (INS 437) in FCs 14.1.3.1, 14.1.3.2, 14.1.3.3, and 14.1.3.4 as listed in Annex 3 Part D of CRD2;
 - D. colours in the Annex on French fried potatoes of the Standard for Quick Frozen Vegetables (CXS 320-2015);
 - E. acidity regulators in general, and calcium lactate (INS 327) specifically, in FC 14.1.2.1 “Fruit juice” generally, and in Chinese plum juice specifically;
 - F. acidity regulators in general, and phosphates (INS 338; 339(i)-(iii); 340(i)-(iii); 341(i)-(iii); 342(i)-(ii); 343(i)-(iii); 450(i)-(iii),(v)-(vii), (ix); 451(i),(ii); 452(i) (v);542) and tartrates (INS 334, 335(ii), 337) specifically in FC 14.1.2.2 “Vegetable juice”, FC 14.1.2.4 “Concentrates for vegetable juice”, FC 14.1.3.2 “Vegetable nectar”, and FC 14.1.3.4 “Concentrates for vegetable nectar” and the maximum use levels needed to achieve the intended technological effect; and
 - G. tamarind seed polysaccharide (INS 437) in the Standard for Pickled Cucumbers (CXS 115-1981).

Introduction:

2. CCFA47, CCFA48, CCFA49, and CCFA50 considered the use of additives with “acidity regulator” function and “emulsifier”, “stabilizer”, and/or “thickener” function in foods that fall within the mandate of CCPFV. These sessions of CCFA requested guidance from CCPFV on the use of food additives with these technological functions in these foods. CCPFV29 provided a response on these matters to CCFA52 in CX/FA 21/52/2. CCPFV is currently adjourned sine die.

¹ REP 21/FA, para. 183(ii)

Background on Topics A) and B): Provisions for Tartrates in FCs 04.1.2.2 and 04.1.2.6

3. The physical Working Group (pWG) on the GSFA to CCFA48 discussed proposed provisions for Tartrates (INS 334, 335(ii), 337) in food categories (FCs) 04.1.2.2 (Dried fruit) and 04.1.2.6 (Fruit based spreads (e. g. chutney) excluding products of food category 04.1.2.5). It was noted that Tartrates are used as an acidity regulator in the standardized and non-standardized products in these food categories. However, it was also noted that the commodity standard corresponding to food category 04.1.2.2 (Codex Standard for Dessicated Coconut (CODEX STAN 177-1991)) does not allow acidity regulators and Tartrates are not listed included in the list of acidity regulators in the commodity standard corresponding to food category 04.1.2.6 (Codex Standard for Mango Chutney (CODEX STAN 160-1987)).² The 48th CCFA agreed to hold the provisions for the use of Tartrates in food categories 04.1.2.2 and 04.1.2.6 in the GSFA and request guidance from CCPFV on the use of acidity regulators in general and Tartrates specifically in foods in those food categories and corresponding commodity standards.³

4

Background on Topic C): General use of Emulsifiers, Stabilizers, and Thickeners in Fruit and Vegetable Juices and Nectars

4. The pWG on the GSFA to CCFA47 discussed existing draft provisions in Tables 1 and 2 of the GSFA for food additives with “emulsifier, stabilizer, thickener” function, including provisions for Pectins (INS 440) and Xanthan gum (INS 416) in FCs 14.1.2 and 14.1.3.⁵ CCFA47 agreed to request clarification from CCPFV on the use technological justification of “emulsifiers, stabilizers, and thickeners” in general and Xanthan gum (INS 415) in particular in these FCs.^{6,4} When discussing draft provisions for Sodium carboxymethyl cellulose (cellulose gum) (INS 466), Gellan gum (INS 418), and Trisodium citrate (INS 331(iii)) in FC 14.1.2.1, the pWG on the GSFA to CCFA50 noted that the Committee still awaited CCPFV’s reply to CCFA47’s request pertaining to the use of food additives with “emulsifier, stabilizer, thickener” function in this food category, and held those provisions at their current step pending CCPFV’s reply.⁷

5. Draft provisions for the use of tamarind seed polysaccharide (INS 437) were proposed for inclusion into the GSFA by Japan in response to CL 2018/27-FA.⁸ CCFA51 entered these provisions into the GSFA at step 2 and requested the EWG on the GSFA to CCFA52 circulate the provisions for comment.⁹ During discussion of the draft provisions for tamarind seed polysaccharide in FCs 14.1.3.1, 14.1.3.2, 14.1.3.3, and 14.1.3.4, CCFA52 noted the discussion from CCPFV29 provided in CX/FA 21/52/2 on the general use of additives with emulsifier, stabilizer, thickener function in these food categories, and agreed to request the EWG on the GSFA to CCFA53 to recirculate these provisions for comment.¹⁰

Background on Topic D): Colours in French Fried Potatoes

6. As part of its normal standard setting work considering food additive provisions for the Standard for Quick Frozen Vegetables (CODEX STAN 320-2015), CCPFV28 could not reach consensus on the use of colours in French fried potatoes (an Annex of CODEX STAN 320-2015) and asked CCFA49 to provide clarity on this use in connection with the reduction of acrylamide.¹¹ CCFA49 replied that the technological justification of the use of

² FA/48 CRD2

³ REP 16/FA, para. 65

⁴ A reply from CCPFV28 on this matter were received for consideration by CCFA49. However, CCFA49 noted that the reply from CCPFV28 on this matter was not conclusive and requested that CCPFV provide more conclusive replies (REP17/FA, paras. 9 and 14(ii)).

⁵ FA/47 CRD2

⁶ REP 15/FA, para. 74

⁷ FA/50 CRD2

⁸ CX/FA 19/51/8

⁹ REP 19/FA, paras. 24 and 138(xiii).

¹⁰ REP 21/FA, para. 138.

¹¹ CX/FA 17/49/2, para. 30

colors in French fried potatoes was in the purview of the CCPFV referred to CCPFV clarification from the JECFA Secretariat regarding acrylamide.¹² CODEX STAN 320-2015 corresponds to FC 04.2.2.1 in the GSFA.

Background on Topic E): Acidity Regulators in Fruit Juice (FC 14.1.2.1) related to use of Gellan gum (INS 418) as an emulsifier in Chinese plum juice

7. Draft provisions for the use of Gellan Gum (INS 418) in FC 14.1.2.1 specific to use in Chinese plum juice and in combination with Calcium lactate (INS 327) and Trisodium citrate (INS 331(iii)) were proposed for inclusion into the GSFA by Thailand in response to CL 2014/15-FA¹³ The pWG on the GSFA to CCFA50 discussed the draft provisions in food category 14.1.2.1 (Fruit juice) and noted that the commodity standard corresponding to this food category (CODEX STAN 247-2005) had been aligned to include a general reference to the GSFA.⁷ As a result of this alignment, provisions for additives previously listed in CODEX STAN 247-2005 (including some acidity regulators) are currently adopted in FC 14.1.2.1 of the GSFA. However, Gellan gum, Calcium lactate and Trisodium citrate were not listed in the commodity standard prior to alignment, and the proposed draft provisions remained at step 2 in FC 14.1.2.1 with Note 336 “For use in Chinese plum juices only”. It was also noted that these are Table 3 additives, but the draft provisions in FC 14.1.2.1 list numeric use levels. CCFA50 subsequently requested that CCPFV provide clarification on the technological justification for Calcium lactate used as an acidity regulator in fruit juice in general and in Chinese plum juice specifically, as well as the use level at GMP.¹⁴

Background on Topic F): Acidity Regulators in Vegetable Juices and Nectars (FC 14.1.2.2, 14.1.2.4, 14.1.3.2, 14.1.3.4)

8. The pWG on the GSFA to CCFA50 also discussed the provisions in the step process for the use of Phosphates (INS 338; 339(i)-(iii); 340(i)-(iii); 341(i)-(iii); 342(i)-(ii); 343(i)-(iii); 450(i)-(iii),(v)-(vii), (ix); 451(i),(ii); 452(i)-(v);542) and Tartrates (INS 334, 335(ii), 337) in food categories 14.1.2.2 (Vegetable juice), 14.1.2.4 (Concentrates for vegetable juice), 14.1.3.2 (Vegetable nectar) and 14.1.3.4 (Concentrates for vegetable nectar) and recommended the provisions be held pending guidance from CCPFV on the technological justification for the use of acidity regulators in general in those food categories, and those additives as acidity regulator specifically, as well as the maximum use levels needed to achieve the technical effect.⁷

Background on Topic G): Provision for Tamarind seed polysaccharide in the Standard for Pickled Cucumbers (CXS 115-1981)

9. Tamarind seed polysaccharide (INS 437) received an ADI of “not specified” from the 84th Joint FAO/WHO Expert Committee on Food Additives (JECFA), and as a result CCFA50 entered a provision for this additive into Table 3 of the GSFA at Step 3 and requested the EWG on the GSFA to CCFA51 to circulate the provisions for comment at Step 3, including for the use of Tamarind seed polysaccharide in commodity standards corresponding to food categories not listed in the Annex to Table 3 (necessitating a listing of that commodity standard in the Table 3 provision for the additive).¹⁵ The pWG on the GSFA to CCFA51 discussed a proposal for inclusion of the Standard for Pickled Cucumbers (CXS 115-1981) in the Table 3 provision for Tamarind seed polysaccharide.¹⁶ (CXS 115-1981 corresponds to FC 04.2.2.3 in the GSFA – a FC that is not listed in the Annex to Table 3. Therefore CXS 115-1981 would need to be listed in the Table 3 provision for Tamarind seed polysaccharide as there would be no provision for Tamarind seed polysaccharide in Tables 1 and 2 of the GSFA). CCFA51 noted that CXS 115-1981 lists specific thickening agents for use in mustard type pickled cucumbers only, but that this list was endorsed prior to tamarind seed polysaccharide’s review by the 84th JECFA, therefore INS 437 is not listed in CXS 115-1981. CCFA51 also noted that CXS 115-1981 falls under the mandate of CCPFV. Therefore, CCFA51 requested that CCPFV provide guidance on this topic.¹⁷

¹² REP17/FA, paras. 11, 12, and 14(iii)

¹³ CX/FA 15/47/14

¹⁴ REP18/FA, para. 86

¹⁵ REP18_FA, para. 12

¹⁶ FA/51, CRD2.

¹⁷ REP19_FA, para. 67

Working Document:

10. The EWG on the GSFA issued three circulars for this Appendix requesting comments on general approach to address the use across a food category, or actual use levels and/or technological and justification for the specific draft and proposed draft provisions under discussion.

11. The current document is split into two annexes and presents proposals for each provision under discussion (adopt, adopt with revision, discontinue, discontinue and move to subcategories as appropriate, request information) in the format of the food categories listed in Table 2 of the GSFA. Annex 1 presents proposals on provisions in food categories not related to fruit and vegetable juices and nectars (Topics A, B, D, and G). Annex 2 addresses provisions for the use of additives in food categories 14.1.2 and 14.1.3 and their subcategories (the use of additives in fruit and vegetable juices and nectars – Topics C, E, and F).

12. The proposals put forward in this report are based upon a consensus approach taking into account the following information:

- Information on corresponding Codex commodity standards and the use of food additives in those commodity standards is provided for each food category;
- Comments from CCPFV29 as presented in REP20/PFV;
- Historical discussions on the provision in previous sessions of CCFA; and
- Comments by EWG members.

13. These recommendations are based on the “weight of evidence”; that is, comments containing justifications were given more weight than comments with no supporting justification.

Annex A - provisions in food categories not related to fruit and vegetable juices and nectars (Topics A, B, D, and G)

This annex provides recommendations on provisions in food categories not related to fruit and vegetable juices and nectars (Topics A, B, D, and G).

Topics A and B: Provisions for Tartrates in FCs 04.1.2.2 (Dried fruit) and 04.1.2.6 (Fruit based spreads)**Food Category No. 04.1.2.2 (Dried fruit)**

Corresponding commodity standards: CODEX STAN 67-1981, CODEX STAN 130-1981: Allows sorbic acid, sulphur dioxide, mineral oil (67-1981 only); **CODEX STAN 177-1991:** Allows antioxidants and preservatives in GSFA FC 04.1.2.2 (CCPFV28 informed CCFA49 that tartrates are not used in products conforming to CODEX STAN 177-1991 (CX/FA 17/49/2 para 21)).

From CCPFV29 (REP20/PFV paras 23, 24): on technical justification for the use of acidity regulators in general in FC 04.1.2.2 (Dried fruit): Acidity regulators are used to control the acidity or alkalinity of various types of dried fruits. The pH of food can greatly affect food safety and consumer perception and therefore acidity regulators such as citric acid (INS 330) and ascorbic acid, L- (INS 300) are needed to be used as pH adjusting agents to protect dried fruits against microbial growth. CCPFV29 did not provide a response regarding the use of tartrates specifically (INS 334, 335(ii), 337) in FC 04.1.2.2 (Dried fruit).

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
TARTRATES	334, 335(ii), 337	GMP	45	7	Acidity regulator, Antioxidant, Emulsifying salt, Flavour enhancer (INS 334 only), Sequestrant, Stabilizer	Discontinue
<p><u>Comments by EWG Members to EWG on GSFA to CCFA53 on the First Circular Proposal (Request comment on numeric use level (Tartrates has a numeric JECFA ADI). Add notes XS67, XS130 and XS177):</u></p> <p><u>EU:</u> the EU is not aware of the use of tartrates in this FC. In the recent call for data (2021) business operators did not report any use of tartrates in dried fruit in the EU.</p> <p><u>Indonesia:</u> Supports 1st circular proposal</p> <p><u>US:</u> Permitted for general use in foods in US at GMP</p>						
<p><u>Comments by EWG Members to EWG on GSFA to CCFA53 on the Second Circular Proposal (Discontinue if no information on numeric use level provided; No comments were provided by Members of EWG on the actual use or numeric use level for Tartrates in products covered under FC 04.1.2.2.):</u></p> <p><u>Australia, Indonesia:</u> Supports request for information</p>						

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
<p>Colombia: Colombia has Regulations regarding the use of TARTRATES. “Resolución 4126 de 1991”. Under said Regulations, use of TARTRATES, as food additive functional class “Acidity regulator”, is at 3g/kg ML.</p> <p>EU: Supports discontinuation</p>						

Food Category No. 04.1.2.6 (Fruit based spreads (e.g. chutney), excluding products in FC 04.1.2.5)

Corresponding commodity standards: CODEX STAN 160-1987 (Standard for Mango Chutney): Lists specific acidity regulators and preservatives.

From CCPFV29 (REP20/PFV para 20): CCPFV29 agreed with the inclusion of tartrates as acidity regulators in FC 04.1.2.6 with the technological justifications that (i) Mango is generally rich in vitamins & minerals like calcium, iron, vitamin C, vitamin B complex. These nutrients are highly susceptible to temperature and oxidation. Tartrates, as acidity regulators, can protect against this; (ii) the use of tartrates in fruit-based spreads, e.g., mango chutney, can help improve product shelf life by helping ensure that the pH of the product does not exceed 4.6; product is not spoiled by bacteria (spoilage bacteria cannot grow at low pH); and potential for lesser amounts of preservatives to be used due to the maintenance of a low pH.

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
TARTRATES	334, 335(ii), 337	3000	45	7	Acidity regulator, Antioxidant, Emulsifying salt, Flavour enhancer (INS 334 only), Sequestrant, Stabilizer	Adopt. Forward to WG on Alignment to revise CODEX STAN 160-1987 to include a provision for tartrates with a note “To maintain the pH at a level not above 4.6”

Comments by EWG Members to EWG on GSFA to CCFA53 on the First Circular Proposal (Although CCPFV29 provided technological justification for the use of tartrates in mango chutney, it did not revise CODX STAN 160-1987. Request comment on adoption of provision in GSFA and revision of CODEX STAN 160-1987 to include provision for tartrates with a note “To maintain the pH at a level not above 4.6”):

EU: Accepts

Comments by EWG Members to EWG on GSFA to CCFA53 on the Second Circular Proposal (Adopt; (Chair’s note: the alignment of CODEX STAN 160-1987 is currently under discussion by the EWG on Alignment to CCFA53)):

Australia: Australia notes that the EWG on Alignment proposed provision is contained within 2nd circular, Appendix 7 (explanation page 1, proposed amendments pages 41 & 47). It is to propose alignment with CXS 160, so consistent with this EWG GSFA proposal to adopt.

Colombia: Colombia has Regulations regarding the use of TARTRATES. “Resolución 4126 de 1991”. Under said Regulations, use of TARTRATES, as food additive functional class “Acidity regulator”, is at 3g/kg ML.

EU: Supports

Topic D: Colours in French fried potatoes

Chair's note from First Circular: CCPFV27 considered updating and incorporating multiple existing individual standards into a Standard for Quick Frozen Vegetables (CXS 320-2015). When considering the incorporation of quick frozen French fried potatoes into the Standard for Quick Frozen Vegetables, several new functional classes of food additives were proposed that were not included in the original Standard for Quick Frozen French Fried Potatoes (CXS 114-1981). These new functional classes, which included "colouring agents" were discussed further at CCPFV28 (Rep 17/PV paras 56 – 61). Some CCPFV delegations noted that colouring agents were currently used to restore colour and facilitate the reduction of acrylamide by allowing frying at decreased temperatures (reducing acrylamide formation) while providing the colour expected by consumers for potatoes fried to "doneness". Therefore, the omission would be counter-productive to efforts of both governments and industry to minimize acrylamide formation and thereby mitigate human health risks. However, other delegations noted that the education of consumers to accept a lighter color of French fried potatoes might be more appropriate and that other means to achieve reduced acrylamide formation existed (e.g., the use of enzyme asparaginase which would not entail the use of colors). As consensus could not be reached CCPFV28 requested CCFA49 to provide clarity on this use.

CCFA49 discussed this issue, including with input from the JECFA secretariat (REP17/FA paras 11, 12). JECFA noted that acrylamide is formed during high heat treatment such as frying and baking but that there was no direct functional relationship between the use of colour and the lower of exposure of consumers to acrylamide. CCFA49 also noted the Code of Practice for the Reduction of Acrylamide in Foods (CAC/RCP 67-2009) and that the use of colours in processed fruits and vegetables was in the purview of CCPFV.

From CCPFV29 (REP20/PFV para 28 and Appendix VII Part A): CCPFV29 noted that while colour additives enhance colour and thus could facilitate the reduction of acrylamide formation in frozen French fried potatoes, members did not agree on whether such use was necessary as there were other means for acrylamide reduction.

First, Second, and Third Circulars: The first and second circulars requested comment on whether food additives with the functional class of colour are used in quick frozen French fried potatoes that are currently in international trade and why other means of reducing acrylamide formation are not sufficient. These circulars also requested information, from members opposed to the use, how this misleads the consumer in the context that these products are more processed than other quick frozen vegetables and CXS 320-2015 already allows food additives (sequesterants) in French fried potatoes to facilitate processing that are not permitted for other vegetables (most of which do not allow any food additives and are only blanched, not fried) and stipulates that the product shall be treated to achieve satisfactory and stable colour. Comments to both circulars mirrored the discussion from CCPFV27 thru CCPFV29, with no consensus among EWG members. One member also noted that, while CXS 320-2015 corresponds to FC 04.2.2.1 and the descriptor for FC 04.2.2.1 mentions "quick frozen French-fried potatoes", the descriptor for FC 04.2.2.8 mentions "fried potatoes" and does not have a corresponding commodity standard. Furthermore, although the parent FC 04.2.2 and 04.2.2.8 have provisions for colours, FC 04.2.2.1 does not have provisions for colours. Therefore, the third circular recommended that discussion on this matter be postponed until CCFA take up provisions for the use of colours in FC 04.2.2 and its subcategories.

Final EWG proposal: Postpone discussion on Topic D until the EWG on the GSFA takes up provisions for the use of colors in FC 04.2.2 and its subcategories, so that the discussion on the inclusion of colors in CXS 320-2015 can be included in the broader discussion of the use of colors in FC 04.2.2 and its subcategories.

Topic G: Inclusion of Tamarind seed polysaccharide (INS 437) in the Standard for Pickled Cucumbers (CXS 115-1981)

From CCPFV29 (REP20/PFV para 31 and Appendix VII Part B): CCPFV29 agreed to forward to CCFA the revised food additive provisions in CXS 115-1981 to include a provision for INS 437 in the list of thickening agents in that commodity standard.

Chair's Note: Tamarind seed polysaccharide is a Table 3 additive. CXS 115-1981 corresponds to FC 04.2.2.3, which is not in the Annex to Table 3. Therefore, inclusion of a provision for Tamarind seed polysaccharide in CXS 115-1981 would be reflected in the "acceptable, including foods conforming to the following commodity standards" column in the Table 3 provision for Tamarind seed polysaccharide.

First Circular: The first circular proposed that the inclusion of CXS 15-1981 in the Table 3 provision for Tamarind seed polysaccharide be forward to the WG on alignment to be captured as per normal alignment procedure. All comments submitted to the first circular agreed with the proposal. As consensus was reached in response to the first circular, Topic G was not included in the second and third circulars.

Final EWG Proposal: Forward the inclusion of CXS-115-1981 in the Table 3 provision for Tamarind seed polysaccharide to the WG on Alignment to be captured as per normal alignment procedure.

Annex B - provisions in food categories 14.1.2 and 14.1.3 and their subcategories (the use of additives in fruit and vegetable juices and nectars – Topics C, E, and F)

This annex is divided into two parts:

- Part 1 addresses provisions in FCs 14.1.2 and 14.1.3 and their subcategories that the EWG was able to reach consensus on: Topic C (with the exception of provisions for the use of Xanthan gum (INS 415) and Tamarind seed polysaccharide (INS 437)), Topic E, and Topic F.
- Part 2 addresses provisions from Topic C that require further discussion, specifically provisions for Xanthan gum (INS 415) and Tamarind seed polysaccharide (INS 437).

Part 1: Provisions in FCs 14.1.2 and 14.1.3 and their subcategories that the EWG was able to reach consensus on

Topic C: Provisions for Emulsifiers, Stabilizers, and Thickeners in Fruit and Vegetable Juices and Nectars (FCs 14.1.2, 14.1.3, and subcategories) with the exception of provisions for Xanthan gum (INS 415), Tamarind seed polysaccharide (INS 437), and Gellan gum (INS 418)

Food Category No. 14.1.2 (Fruit and vegetable juices)

Horizontal approach (FA/45 CRD2 Appendix IV, FA/46 CRD 2 Appendix II): The use of acidity regulators is justified on a case-by-case basis. The use of emulsifiers, stabilizers, and thickeners is **not** justified on a general basis

Corresponding commodity standards: CODEX STAN 247-2005 applies to subcategories 14.1.2.1 and 14.1.2.3. Contains a general reference to the GSFA.

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
Pectins	440	3000		2	Emulsifier, Gelling agent, Glazing agent, Stabilizer, Thickener	Discontinue and move to subcategories 14.1.2.2 and 14.1.2.4
<p><u>Comments by EWG Members to EWG on GSFA to CCFA53 on the First and Second Circular (Discontinue provision and move to subcategories 14.1.2.2 and 14.1.2.4. There are already adopted provision for Pectins in all other subcategories of FC 14.1.2.):</u></p> <p><u>Canada, Chile, EU, Kenya, South Africa, FoodDrinkEurope, ICBA, IFU:</u> Supports Proposal</p> <p><u>Colombia:</u> Supports use of Pectins at GMP level</p>						
SODIUM CARBOXYMETHYL CELLULOSE (CELLULOSE GUM)	466	2000		2	Emulsifier, Foaming agent, Stabilizer, Thickener	Discontinue
<p><u>EWG Member comments on First Circular Proposal (comments not requested in 1st circular):</u></p>						

FoodDrinkEurope: We do not support the approval of Sodium Carboxymethyl Cellulose in Fruit Juices and Nectars. Sodium Carboxymethyl Cellulose acts as a thickener and so compromises the authenticity of juices and in particular the section in the codex standard 247/2005 “3.3 AUTHENTICITY Authenticity is the maintenance of the product’s essential physical, chemical, organoleptical, and nutritional characteristics of the fruit(s) from which it comes.

IFU: We do not support the approval of Sodium Carboxymethyl Cellulose in Fruit Juices and Nectars

EWG Member comments on Second Circular Proposal (Request information on use. Discontinue if no information provided):

Australia, EU, FIA, ICBA, IFU: Supports discontinuation

Columbia: Colombia doesn’t have risk assessment data on SODIUM CARBOXYMETHYL CELLULOSE (CELLULOSE GUM) for said FC. Use of SODIUM CARBOXYMETHYL CELLULOSE (CELLULOSE GUM) is not restricted in Colombia.

Food Category No. 14.1.2.2 (Vegetable juices)

From CCPFV29 (REP20/PFV para 28 and Appendix VI Part A): CCPFV29 recommend the addition of pectins (INS 440) at a use level of GMP in Tables 1 and 2 of the GSFA for FC 14.1.2.2 (vegetable juice) with note 35

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
Pectins	440	3000			Emulsifier, Gelling agent, Glazing agent, Stabilizer, Thickener	Moved from FC 14.1.2. Adopt at GMP with Note 35 “For use in cloudy juices only.”

Comments by EWG Members to EWG on GSFA to CCFA53 on the First Circular Proposal:

Canada, Chile, EU, South Africa, ICBA: Supports the first circular proposal.

Japan: Supports 1st circular proposal. Pectins is used in mixed vegetable and fruit juice (cloudy juice) at 2,900 mg/kg to uniform the ingredients.

Kenya: Agrees with the recommendation in 1st Circular letter. However emphasis is made to ensure this is not used to mislead the consumers.

FoodDrinkEurope and IFU: To be consistent with food category 14.1.2.1 - Fruit juice, we agree with the proposal

Comments by EWG Members to EWG on GSFA to CCFA53 on the Second Circular Proposal (Adopt at GMP with Note 35 “For use in cloudy juices only.”):

Australia, Chile, EU, FIA, ICBA, IFAC, IFU: Supports

Colombia: Supports use of Pectins at GMP level

Food Category No. 14.1.2.4 (Concentrates for vegetable juices)

From **CCPFV29 (REP20/PFV para 28 and Appendix VI Part A)**: CCPFV29 recommend the addition of pectins (INS 440) at a use level of GMP in Tables 1 and 2 of the GSFA for FC 14.1.2.4 (concentrates for vegetable juice) with notes 35 “For use in cloudy juices only” and 127 “On the served to the consumer basis”

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
Pectins	440	3000			Emulsifier, Gelling agent, Glazing agent, Stabilizer, Thickener	Moved from FC 14.1.2. Adopt at GMP with Note 35 “For use in cloudy juices only.”

Comments by EWG Members to EWG on GSFA to CCFA53 on the First Circular Proposal: (**Chair’s Note:** Several comments to the first circular request that Note 127 “on the served to consumer basis” be removed from all provisions in related FCs 14.1.2.3 and 14.1.3.3 with a ML of GMP as this note is only necessary for additives with a numeric use level. This topic is not in the mandate of the EWG, however, it will be noted in the report of the EWG so that it can be discussed further at CCFA53).

Canada: Canada supports the proposal and we have no concern with the absence of Note 127 for the reason stated. We do note, however, that the fruit product concentrates (FCs 14.1.2.3 and 14.1.3.3) always include Note 127, even for “GMP additives”, while the vegetable product concentrates do not. Canada wonders if an incidental clean-up of the Notes in FCCs 14.1.2.3 and 14.1.3.3 is warranted.

Chile, EU, Kenya, South Africa, ICBA: Agrees with the 1st circular proposal

Japan: Supports 1st circular proposal. Pectins is used in concentrates for mixed vegetable and fruit juice (cloudy juice) at 2,900 mg/kg on the served to the consumer basis to uniform the ingredients.

FoodDrinkEurope and IFU: To be consistent with food category 14.1.2.3 - Concentrates for Fruit juice, we agree with the first circular proposal. We agree that Note 127 is not necessary as the ML is GMP and therefore we suggest to remove Note 127 for pectin in food category 14.1.2.3 Concentrates for Fruit juice.

Comments by EWG Members to EWG on GSFA to CCFA53 on the Second Circular Proposal (Adopt at GMP with Note 35 “For use in cloudy juices only.” Note 127 “On the served to the consumer basis” is not necessary as the ML is GMP. Note 127 would only be necessary for additives with a numeric use level):

Australia, Chile, Colombia, EU, FIA, ICBA, IFAC, IFU: Supports

Food Category No. 14.1.3 (Fruit and vegetable nectars)

Corresponding commodity standards: CODEX STAN 247-2005 (Standard for Fruit Juices and Nectars): General reference to the GSFA.

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
Pectins	440	3000		2	Emulsifier, Gelling agent, Glazing agent, Stabilizer, Thickener	Discontinue. There are already adopted provisions for pectins at GMP in all subcategories.

Comments by EWG Members to EWG on GSFA to CCFA53 on the First and Second Circular (Discontinue. There are already adopted provisions for Pectins at GMP level in all subcategories of FC 14.1.3.):

Canada, Chile, Columbia, EU, Kenya, South Africa, ICBA: Supports the proposal

FoodDrinkEurope: FoodDrinkEurope supports this since there are already adopted provisions for Pectins at GMP level in all subcategories of FC 14.1.3. There is an inconsistency between fruit nectars & their concentrates which has Note 127 applied and vegetable nectars and their concentrates which do not. For consistency we suggest removing Note 127 from Fruit Nectars and their concentrates as the ML is at GMP.

IFU: We agree with the proposal. There is an inconsistency between fruit nectars & their concentrates which has Note 127 applied and vegetable nectars and their concentrates which do not. For consistency we suggest removing Note 127 from Fruit Nectars and their concentrates as the ML is at GMP

Topic E: Acidity Regulators in Fruit Juice (FC 14.1.2.1) and related use of Gellan gum (INS 418) in Chinese Plum Juice**Food Category No. 14.1.2.1 (Fruit juice)**

Corresponding commodity standards: CODEX STAN 247-2005 (Standard for Fruit Juices and Nectars): General reference to the GSFA

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
GELLAN GUM	418	200	336*	2	Gelling agent,	Discontinue – Note 336 limits use to “Chinese Plum Juice” which is included under FC 14.1.4 (water-based flavored drinks). FC 14.1.4 is not in the annex to Table 3, so all Table 3 additives are allowed in FC 14.1.4. The additives under discussion are Table 3 additives.
CALCIUM LACTATE	327	1200	336*	2	Acidity regulator, Emulsifying salt, Firming agent, Flour treatment agent, Thickener	
TRISODIUM CITRATE	331(iii)	500	336*	2	Acidity regulator, Emulsifier, Emulsifying salt, Sequestant, Stabilizer	

Comments by EWG Members on the First Circular Proposal (The first circular requested comment on whether Chinese Plum Juice is a product under FC 14.1.2 (Fruit Juice) or FC 14.1.4 (water-based flavoured drinks):

Brazil: This product (Chinese Plum Juice) is not usually consumed in Brazil.

Chile: Supports that these provisions should be included in the general discussion on formulated juice and nectar products with “non-juice food additive ingredients”.

EU: Accepts that Chinese Plum Juice is covered by FC 14.1.4.

Kenya and FIA: Supportive of ICBA’s comment.

Thailand: Has no objection that Chinese plum juice containing fructose syrup, sugar and non-permitted food additives did not fall under FC 14.1.2.1 (Fruit juice) and it is a product under FC 14.1.4 (water-based flavoured drinks).

We also can agree that the use of gellan gum (INS 418), trisodium citrate (INS331(iii)), and calcium lactate (INS 327) in this product is already captured under FC 14.1.4 (water-based flavoured drinks).

FoodDrinkEurope and IFU: Examples we have seen of these products do not fit in the category of juices, but juice-based beverages (14.1.4). Please see examples below.

Brand	Ingredient
Chivalry	Water, high fructose syrup, concentrated apple juice, concentrated plum juice, additives (CO2, citric acid, caramel, sodium cyclamate, Sodium Benzoate), flavors
Netease	Water, high fructose syrup, custer sugar, crystal sugar, hawthorn, plum, osmanthus, additives (citric acid, caramel, sodium cyclamate, sodium Benzoate), flavors
Jiulongzhai	Water, crystal sugar, plum, osmanthus, red rose, hawthorn, glycyrrhiza, tangerine peel, salt
Master Kong	Water, custer sugar, plum, tangerine peel, hawthorn, glycyrrhiza, salt, additive and flavor
Erbao	Water, fresh plum juice, custer sugar, brown sugar, high fructose syrup, glucose, additives (citric acid, DL-malic acid, sodium carboxymethyl cellulose, xanthan gum, sodium citrate, sodium D-isoascorbate)

ICBA: The Chinese plum juice described is in fact a juice drink that fits under 14.1.4.2. (i.e., not 100% juice). Thus, the specific issue of calcium lactate (and the other listed acidity regulators) and Chinese plum juice renders this discussion moot. Relative to the broader question of non-juice acidity regulators in fruit juices/nectars, whatever decision is made as to the approach for ESTs should then be extended to non-juice acidity regulators as well.

Comments by EWG Members to EWG on GSFA to CCFA53 on the Second Circular Proposal (Discontinue – use limited to “Chinese Plum Juice” (note 336) which first circular agreed is included in FC 14.1.4, not FC 14.1.2.1):

Australia: Australia is not familiar with the product, but able to support the chair’s proposal if EWG supports. It notes ICBA’s comments that these 3 f.a. are Table 3 additives and 14.1.4 is not listed in the annex to Table 3 (so Table 3 f.a. are permitted in FC 14.1.4 and so 14.1.4.2).

Chile: This product (Chinese Plum Juice) is not usually consumed in Chile. However, Chile supports those countries that in the first circular agree to include Chinese plum juice in FC 14.1.4.

EU, FIA, FoodDrinkEurope, ICBA, IFU: Supports discontinuation

Topic F: Acidity Regulators in Vegetable Juices (FC 14.1.2.2, 14.1.2.4) and Vegetable Nectars (FC 14.1.3.2, 14.1.3.4)

Chair's Note: Discussion in the first circular on the use of acidity regulators in vegetable juices and nectars was limited to provisions in FC 14.3.4 (Concentrates for vegetable nectars) as CCPFV had provided a response on the use of phosphates and tartrates in that food category. However, CCPFV's response for FC 14.1.3.4 ties phosphates to use in combination with benzoates and sorbates, neither of which have provisions in the GSFA for use in vegetable juices or nectars. In response to the first circular many EWG members noted CCPFV's guidance for FC 14.1.3.4 was very similar to that for fruit juices and nectars, which limits use to in combination with benzoates and sorbates, and also that use of tartrates in fruit juices and nectars was limited to use in grape juice. Therefore several EWG members requested information on actual use of phosphates and tartrates in vegetable juices and nectars.

Food Category No. 14.1.2.2 (Vegetable juice)

Horizontal approach (FA/45 CRD2 Appendix IV, FA/46 CRD 2 Appendix II): The use of acidity regulators is justified in this FC on a general basis

Corresponding commodity standards: None

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
PHOSPHATES	338; 339(i)-(iii); 340(i)-(iii); 341(i)-(iii); 342(i)-(ii); 343(i)-(iii); 450(i)-(iii), (v)-(vii), (ix); 451(i), (ii); 452(i)-(v); 542	1000	33, 127	7	Acidity regulator, Emulsifier, Emulsifying salt, Humectant, Raising agent, Sequestrant, Stabilizer, Thickener	Discontinue

Comments by EWG Members to EWG on GSFA to CCFA53 on the Second Circular Proposal (Request information on actual use in this FC and if use is in combination with benzoates and sorbates):

Australia: Supports request for information

Colombia: Colombia has Regulations regarding the use of PHOSPHATES. "Resolución 4126 de 1991". Under said Regulations, use of PHOSPHATES, as food additive functional class "Acidity regulator", is at GMP level.

EU: EU is not aware of the technological need and actual use of phosphates in this food category. EU does not support the use of phosphates in this food category.

ICBA: Defers to others to support uses

IFU: Has asked its members if phosphates are used in vegetable Juices. No examples were provided so IFU recommends to discontinue the proposal						
TARTRATES	334, 335(II), 337	4000	45	7	Acidity regulator, Antioxidant, Emulsifying salt, Flavour enhancer (INS 334 only), Sequestrant, Stabilizer	Discontinue
Comments by EWG Members to EWG on GSFA to CCFA53 on the Second Circular Proposal (Request information on actual use in this FC and if use is limited to Tartaric acid (INS 334) only):						
Australia: Supports request for information						
Colombia: Colombia has Regulations regarding the use of TARTRATES. “Resolución 4126 de 1991”. Under said Regulations, use of TARTRATES, as food additive functional class “Acidity regulator”, is at 3g/kg ML.						
EU: EU is not aware of the technological need and actual use in this food category.						
ICBA: Defers to others to support uses						
IFU: Has asked its members if tartrates are used in the vegetable juice. No examples were provided so IFU recommends to discontinue the proposal						

Food Category No. 14.1.2.4 (Concentrates for vegetable juice)

Horizontal approach (FA/45 CRD2 Appendix IV, FA/46 CRD 2 Appendix II): The use of acidity regulators is justified in this FC on a general basis

Corresponding commodity standards: None

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
PHOSPHATES	338; 339(i)-(iii); 340(i)-(iii); 341(i)-(iii); 342(i)-(ii); 343(i)-(iii); 450(i)-(iii),(v)-(vii), (ix); 451(i),(ii); 452(i)-(v); 542	1000	33	7	Acidity regulator, Emulsifier, Emulsifying salt, Humectant, Raising agent, Sequestrant, Stabilizer, Thickener	Discontinue
Comments by EWG Members to EWG on GSFA to CCFA53 on the Second Circular Proposal (Request information on actual use in this FC and if use is in combination with benzoates and sorbates):						
Australia: Supports request for information						

Colombia: Colombia has Regulations regarding the use of PHOSPHATES. “Resolución 4126 de 1991”. Under said Regulations, use of PHOSPHATES, as food additive functional class “Acidity regulator”, is at GMP level.

EU: EU is not aware of the technological need and actual use of phosphates in this food category. EU does not support the use of phosphates in this food category.

ICBA: Defers to others to support uses

IFU: Has asked its members if the phosphates are used in concentrates for vegetable juices. No examples were provided so IFU recommends to discontinue the proposal

TARTRATES	334, 335(II), 337	4000	45	7	Acidity regulator, Antioxidant, Emulsifying salt, Flavour enhancer (INS 334 only), Sequestrant, Stabilizer	Discontinue
-----------	-------------------	------	----	---	---	-------------

Comments by EWG Members to EWG on GSFA to CCFA53 on the Second Circular Proposal (Request information on actual use in this FC and if use is limited to Tartaric acid (INS 334) only):

Australia: Supports request for information

Colombia: Colombia has Regulations regarding the use of TARTRATES. “Resolución 4126 de 1991”. Under said Regulations, use of TARTRATES, as food additive functional class “Acidity regulator”, is at 3g/kg ML

EU: EU is not aware of the technological need and actual use in this food category.

ICBA: Defers to others to support uses

IFU: has asked its members if tartrates are used in concentrates for vegetable juice. No examples were provided so IFU recommends to discontinue the proposal

Food Category No. 14.1.3.2 (Vegetable nectar)

Horizontal approach (FA/45 CRD2 Appendix IV, FA/46 CRD 2 Appendix II): The use of acidity regulators is justified in this FC on a general basis

Corresponding commodity standards: None

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
----------	-----	-------------------	-------	----------------	----------------------	--------------------

PHOSPHATES	338; 339(i)-(iii); 340(i)-(iii); 341(i)- (iii); 342(i)-(ii); 343(i)-(iii); 450(i)- (iii),(v)-(vii), (ix); 451(i),(ii); 452(i)-(v); 542	1000	33	7	Acidity regulator, Emulsifier, Emulsifying salt, Humectant, Raising agent, Sequestrant, Stabilizer, Thickener	Discontinue
Comments by EWG Members to EWG on GSFA to CCFA53 on the Second Circular Proposal (Request information on actual use in this FC and if use is in combination with benzoates and sorbates):						
Australia: Supports request for information						
Colombia: Colombia has Regulations regarding the use of PHOSPHATES. “Resolución 4126 de 1991”. Under said Regulations, use of PHOSPHATES, as food additive functional class “Acidity regulator”, is at GMP level.						
EU: EU is not aware of the technological need and actual use of phosphates in this food category. EU does not support the use of phosphates in this food category.						
ICBA: Defers to others to support uses						
IFU: has asked its members if phosphates are used in vegetable nectars. No examples were provided so IFU recommends to discontinue the proposal						
TARTRATES	334, 335(II), 337	1600	45	7	Acidity regulator, Antioxidant, Emulsifying salt, Flavour enhancer (INS 334 only), Sequestrant, Stabilizer	Discontinue
Comments by EWG Members to EWG on GSFA to CCFA53 on the Second Circular Proposal (Request information on actual use in this FC and if use is limited to Tartaric acid (INS 334) only):						
Australia: Supports request for information						
Colombia: Colombia has Regulations regarding the use of TARTRATES. “Resolución 4126 de 1991”. Under said Regulations, use of TARTRATES, as food additive functional class “Acidity regulator”, is at 3g/kg ML.						
EU: EU is not aware of the technological need and actual use in this food category.						
ICBA: Defers to others to support uses						
IFU: has asked its members if tartrates are used in vegetable nectar. No examples were provided so IFU recommends to discontinue the proposal						

Food Category No. 14.1.3.4 (Concentrates for vegetable nectar)

Horizontal approach (FA/45 CRD2 Appendix IV, FA/46 CRD 2 Appendix II): The use of acidity regulators is justified in this FC on a general basis

Corresponding commodity standards: None

From CCPFV29 (REP20/PFV para 28 and Appendix VII Part A): CCPFV29 agreed to add phosphates (INS 338; 339(i)-(iii); 340(i)-(iii); 341(i)-(iii); 342(i)-(ii); 343(i)-(iii); 450(i)-(iii),(v)-(vii), (ix); 451(i),(ii); 452(i)-(v);542) and tartrates (INS 334, 335(ii), 337) in Tables 1 and 2 of the GSFA for FC 14.1.3.4 (concentrates for vegetable nectar) with notes 33 “As phosphorous”, 40 “Pentasodium triphosphate (INS 451(i)) only, to enhance the effectiveness of benzoates and sorbates”, and 127 “On the served to the consumer basis” with a maximum use limit of 1000 mg/kg as phosphorous.

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
PHOSPHATES	338; 339(i)-(iii); 340(i)-(iii); 341(i)-(iii); 342(i)-(ii); 343(i)-(iii); 450(i)-(iii),(v)- (vii), (ix); 451(i),(ii); 452(i)-(v); 542	1000	33	7	Acidity regulator, Emulsifier, Emulsifying salt, Humectant, Raising agent, Sequestrant, Stabilizer, Thickener	Adopt as listed, add Notes 40 and 127 as per CCPFV29 guidance

Comments by EWG Members to EWG on GSFA to CCFA53 on the First Circular Proposal (Adopt, add Notes 40 and 127 as per CCPFV29 guidance):

Canada: While Canada can support the Chair’s proposal in principle, we remark that sorbates are not currently permitted in FC 14.1.3.4, thus we ask if Note 40 could potentially be misleading by implying that sorbates are used (this is similar to the questions about misleading Notes for acesulfame-aspartame in Appendix 4). That said, we do not object to Note 40 as, in the event sorbates become permitted in the future, it may prove difficult to recall that any “New Note” attached to phosphates should be amended to refer to both benzoates and sorbates.

Chile, EU, Kenya, South Africa, UK, ICBA: Can support first circular proposal of adopt with Notes 40 and 127. The Note 33 should carry-over as well.

Japan: Phosphoric acid (INS 338) is used in concentrates for mixed vegetable and fruit nectar at 810 mg/kg (as phosphorus) to provide acidity for product design.

FoodDrinkEurope and IFU: For consistency with food category 14.1.3.3 - Concentrates for fruit nectar, we suggest the inclusion of Note 33 (as phosphorous) and Note 122 (Subject to national legislation of the importing country)

Comments by EWG Members to EWG on GSFA to CCFA53 on the Second Circular Proposal (Request information on actual use in this FC – inclusion of Note 40 ties use to benzoates and sorbates, neither of which have provisions in this FC. – **Chair’s note – the second proposal was in error, there is an adopted provision for benzoates in this food category**

Australia: Supports request for information

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
<p>Colombia: Colombia has Regulations regarding the use of PHOSPHATES. “Resolución 4126 de 1991”. Under said Regulations, use of PHOSPHATES, as food additive functional class “Acidity regulator”, is at GMP level.</p> <p>EU: EU is not aware of the technological need and actual use of phosphates in this food category. EU does not support the use of phosphates in this food category.</p> <p>Japan: Japan proposes to remove Note 40. Phosphoric acid (INS 338) is used without benzoates and sorbates in concentrates for mixed vegetable and fruit nectar at 810 mg/kg (as phosphorus). It is used to adjust pH and provide acidity.</p> <p>ICBA: Defers to others to support uses</p> <p>IFU: has asked its members if phosphates are used in concentrates for vegetable nectars. No examples were provided so IFU recommends to discontinue the proposal</p>						
<p>Comments by EWG members on Third Circular Proposal (Adopt, with Note 33 and 127):</p> <p>Brazil, Chile, Guatemala, Japan, US, ICBA, IFAC: Supports</p> <p>EU: EU does not support. Phosphates are not permitted in the EU in this FC. The EU notes that the JECFA’s assessment of phosphates dates back to 1982. Based on more recent EFSA’s re-evaluation of phosphates (2019, https://efsa.onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/epdf/10.2903/j.efsa.2019.5674), the exposure estimates from the whole diet, using mainly analytical data, exceeded the ADI for infants, toddlers and other children at the mean level, and for infants, toddlers, children and adolescents at the 95th percentile.</p> <p>FIA: Supports ICBA’s recommendation which are based on comments by Japan, Colombia and IFU</p> <p>FoodDrinkEurope, IFU: Can support with notes 33, 40 and 127</p>						
TARTRATES	334, 335(II), 337	1600	45	7	Acidity regulator, Antioxidant, Emulsifying salt, Flavour enhancer (INS 334 only), Sequestrant, Stabilizer	Adopt with Notes 45, 127, and 128
<p>Comments by EWG Members to EWG on GSFA to CCFA53 on the First Circular Proposal (Adopt as per CCPFV29 guidance):</p> <p>Chile, EU, Indonesia, Kenya: Agrees with the 1st circular proposal</p> <p>UK: Notes that tartaric acid is not a predominant acid in vegetable juices so we are unsure of the appropriateness in this category. If the EWG consensus is that it should be added then we would request that it should be consistent with the provision in category 14.1.3.3.</p>						

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
<p>FoodDrinkEurope and IFU: In food category 14.1.3.3 – Concentrates from fruit nectar, Tartrates have additional Notes applied. Note 127 (On the served to consumer basis). As the ML is not at GMP, the note is valid in this case, though the ML for food category 14.1.3.3 is 4,000 mg/Kg. Further, Note 128 (Tartaric acid (INS 334) only) is also applied to food category 14.1.3.3. As Tartaric acid only predominantly exists in grape juice and is not a major acid in Vegetable Juices is it necessary to include Tartrates in this category?</p> <p>ICBA: Defers to the EWG to decide.</p>						
<p>Comments by EWG Members to EWG on GSFA to CCFA53 on the Second Circular Proposal (Add Note 127 and request information on actual use in this FC and if use is restricted to tartaric acid (Note 128)):</p> <p>Australia: Supports request for information</p> <p>Colombia: Colombia has Regulations regarding the use of TARTRATES. “Resolución 4126 de 1991”. Under said Regulations, use of TARTRATES, as food additive functional class “Acidity regulator”, is at 3g/kg ML.</p> <p>EU: EU is not aware of the technological need and actual use in this food category.</p> <p>ICBA: Defers to others to support uses</p> <p>IFU: has asked its members if tartrates are used in concentrates for vegetable nectars. No examples were provided so IFU recommends to discontinue the proposal</p>						
<p>Comments by EWG members on Third Circular Proposal (Adopt with notes 45 (as tartaric acid), 127 (on the served to the consumer basis) and 128 (tartaric acid (INS 334) only) to align with provision in FC 14.1.3.3 (concentrates for fruit nectar):</p> <p>Chile, EU, US: Supports</p> <p>Guatemala, FIA, ICBA: Defers to others to support.</p> <p>FoodDrinkEurope, IFU: Can support as the proposal to align with FC 14.1.3.3. (concentrates for fruit nectar). Saying that tartaric acid is not found in vegetable juices.</p>						

Part 2: Provisions from Topic C that require further discussion: provisions for Xanthan gum (INS 415) in FCs 14.1.2 and 14.1.3 and Tamarind seed polysaccharide (INS 437) in FC 14.1.3

Background and summary of First Circular: When discussing provisions for emulsifiers and stabilizers for use in fruit and vegetable juices and nectars the first circular focused on a request from CCPFV29 that CCFA determine how to properly classify, within the GSFA, formulated juice/nectar products with “non-juice food additive ingredients”. To assist with the discussion CCPFV29 provided a compilation of comments submitted to CCPFV on this matter. The

first circular presented an analysis of this comment compilation and noted that several comments suggested that these products should be placed in a new food category (FC) to differentiate them from “traditional” juices and nectars. To address this the first circular requested comment from EWG members if such products were considered juices and nectars and therefore should be placed in new subcategories of FC 14.1.2 (Fruit and vegetable juices) and 14.1.3 (Fruit and vegetable nectars), or if such products were considered juice- or nectar-based drinks and should be placed in a new subcategory of FC 14.1.4 (water-based flavoured drinks). To assist with this discussion the first circular also requested comment from EWG members on how such products in international trade were currently labeled (as “juice with added Y / nectar with added Y”, or as “juice-based drink / nectar-based drink”).

Summary of Second and Third Circulars: The majority of comments submitted to the first circular were not in favor of the approach suggested by CCPFV. Rather than placing formulated juice/nectars with “non-juice food additive ingredients” in a new FC to differentiate them from “traditional” juices and nectars, these comments proposed that such products should be included in the same FCs as “traditional” juices and nectars. These comments proposed that the use of specific “non-juice food additive ingredients” in formulated juice/nectar products could be differentiated through the use of a note. These comments cited the use of Note 122 in adopted provisions for certain food additives in FCs 14.1.2 and 14.1.3 and their subcategories as evidence that CCFA had previously agreed to such an approach to differentiate the use of certain non-juice additives while including the resultant formulated juice and nectar products in the same food categories as juice and nectar products that do not include those additives.

These comments proposed an approach that includes the following:

- 1) draft a new note to differentiate that some members allow the use of the additive while others limit that use
- 2) attach Note XS247 “Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Fruit Juices and Nectars” to these provisions
- 3) Amend the Codex General Standard for the Labeling of Prepackaged Foods (CXS 1-1985) to include a requirement for juice labels to include the “with added” qualifier when non-juice ingredients are added to the product.
- 4) Amend the “Labelling” section of the Standard for Fruit Juices and Nectars (CXS 247-2005) to include a requirement for juice labels to include the “with added” qualifier when non-juice ingredients are added to the product.

For the Second Circular, the EWG was invited to comment on proposals corresponding to the above 4 points. However, the EWG was not able to reach consensus on any of the proposals. For the third circular the proposals were circulated for additional comment. Although progress was made in the discussion on the third circular, the EWG did not reach consensus on any of the proposals. A summary of the discussion for each proposal is presented below with further recommendations for consideration by the physical working group on the GSFA to CCFA53. A full compilation of comments submitted for each proposal to the second and third circulars are available [CCFA53 webpage](#).

Proposal 1: Draft a new Note to differentiate the allowance of emulsifiers or stabilizers in fruit and vegetable juices and nectars by various Codex Members:

The Second Circular proposed the following note and requested comment from EWG Members:

“Some Codex Members allow the use of this additive as a stabilizer or emulsifier in 100% juices or nectars while others limit this use.”

While many EWG members were in favor of the note, some members were of the opinion that it may not be sufficient to differentiate that some Codex Members do not allow the use of the additives under discussion in fruit and vegetable juices and nectars. Those EWG members proposed that the note be revised to state:

*“Some Codex Members allow the use of this additive as a stabilizer or emulsifier in 100% juices or nectars while others **do not allow or limit this use.**”*

In the third circular the Chair of the EWG proposed a revised note:

*“Some Codex Members allow the use of this additive as a stabilizer or emulsifier in 100% juices or nectars while others **restrict its use.**”*

While some EWG members noted they preferred the “do not allow” note, those members also noted they could support alternative wording if a consensus could be reached within the committee that such wording also covers the situation when a food additive is not allowed for use by a Codex Member. Other members noted a view that “restrict” includes both limiting use or not allowing use. Several members also expressed concern with the term “100%” juices or nectar and suggested “100% be removed from the note.

Chair Recommendation for Proposal 1: That the pWG on the GSFA to CCFA53 **discuss further** whether the note proposed below, in combination with text in the CCFA report noting consensus within the Committee that “restrict” encompasses both limiting use or not allowing use, is sufficient to address those members that allow the use of Xanthan gum and Tamarind seed polysaccharide in fruit and vegetable juices and nectars, and those that do not:

*“Some Codex Members allow the use of this additive as a stabilizer or emulsifier in juices or nectars while others **restrict its use.**”*

Proposal 2: attach Note XS247 “Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Fruit Juices and Nectars” to these provisions

Both the second and third circular discussed the proposal to attach Note XS247 to the provisions for Xanthan gum and Tamarind seed polysaccharide in provisions for their use in fruit juices and nectars.

- Many EWG members supported attachment of XS247 to these provisions and expressed the opinion that the addition of Xanthan gum and Tamarind seed polysaccharide to fruit juices and nectars compromises section 3.3 of CXS 247-2005 “3.3 AUTHENTICITY – Authenticity is the maintenance of the product’s essential physical, chemical, organoleptical, and nutritional characteristics of the fruit(s) from which it comes.” Several of these EWG members also expressed the opinion that when properly labeled and disclosed on the principal display panel while ensuring no diminution of either (i) fruit juice soluble solids OR (ii) volume for the expressed fruit juice – is considered an addition to the standardized product and becomes a modified product of the standardized product.
- However, several EWG members did not support attaching Note XS247 to these provisions and expressed the opinion that Note XS247 was not necessary if agreement can be reached on Proposal 1. These EWG members expressed the opinion that they considered fruit juices and nectars that utilize Xanthan gum and Tamarind seed polysaccharide would be within the scope of CXS 247-2005 to the same extent as products with added pectin in those countries where these additives are allowed.
- Several eMG members noted that if the decision is to add XS247 to provisions for Xanthan gum and Tamarind seed polysaccharide, this could have implications for provisions for other additives in FCs that correspond to CX 247-2005 including FCs 14.1.2, 14.1.2.1, 14.1.2.3, 14.1.3, 14.1.3.1, and 14.1.3.3.

Chair Recommendation for Proposal 2: That the pWG on the GSFA to CCFA53 **discuss further** the applicability of Note XS247 to provisions for Xanthan gum and Tamarind seed polysaccharide in FC 14.1.2 and 14.1.3.

Proposal 3: Amend the Codex General Standard for the Labeling of Prepackaged Foods (CXS 1-1985) to include a requirement for juice labels to include the “with added” qualifier when non-juice ingredients are added to the product

In the second circular the Chair observed that CXS 1-1985 is a general standard and currently does not have any sections on specific types of foods – all provisions in CODEX STAN 1-1985 apply to all packaged foods. Furthermore, labeling requirements for specific food types are only appropriate for standardized foods. Proposing a labeling requirement for fruit juices and nectars with “non-juice ingredients” implies that such products are standardized products, and therefore if such a labeling requirement is needed it should be included in CODEX STAN 247-2005 (the applicable commodity standard), not CODEX STAN 1-1985. In response to the second circular many EWG members were not in favor of amending CXS 1-1985. However, several EWG members put forward a proposal for a specific revision to Section 4.1.2 of CXS 1-1985. For the third circular the EWG was invited to comment on this proposal. No comments in response to third circular were in favor of revising Section 4.1.2 of CXS 1-1985.

EWG Recommendation for Proposal 3: Do not amend the Codex General Standard for the Labeling of Prepackaged Foods (CXS 1-1985).

Proposal 4: Amend the “Labelling” section of the Standard for Fruit Juices and Nectars (CXS 247-2005) to include a requirement for juice labels to include the “with added” qualifier when non-juice ingredients are added to the product

In the second circular the Chair provided a summary that the intent of this proposal was to work in conjunction with the note discussed in Proposal 1 to provide sufficient differentiation for the consumer between fruits and nectars produced with Xanthan gum and Tamarind seed polysaccharide from those products that are produced without such additives. However, such a proposal would require agreement within CCFA that fruit juice and nectar products produced with these additives conform to CXS 247-2005. This would be in contradiction with Proposal 2 to attach Note XS247 to the provisions under consideration for the use of these additives in fruit juices and nectars.

In response to the second circular, some EWG members opposed to amending CXS 247-2005 as they considered such products are not included in the scope of CXS 247-2005, with others of the opinion that revising CXS 247-2005 was not necessary if agreement was reached on Proposal 1. However, several EWG members put forward a proposal for a specific revision to Section 8.1.2.7 of CXS 247-2005. For the third circular the EWG was invited to comment on this proposal. In response some EWG members reiterated their opposition as they considered such products are not included in the scope of CXS 247-2005. Others expressed the view that such revision may still be appropriate to address when other non-juice ingredients such as vitamins and minerals are added to fruit juices and nectars. A third proposal was put forward to address the specific use of emulsifiers and stabilizers if such an amendment to CXS 247-2005 may allow the Committee to reach consensus that Note XS247 is not necessary if consensus is reached on Proposal 1.

Chair Recommendation for Proposal 4: That the pWG on the GSFA to CCFA53 **discuss further** whether amending Section 8.1.2.7 of the Standard for Fruit Juices and Nectars (CXS 247-2005) will allow the Committee to reach consensus on Proposals 1 and 2. The proposals for consideration put forward by EWG are presented below. Additions are presented in **bold** text:

- *“Any added essential nutrients declaration should be labelled in accordance with the General Guidelines on Claims (CAC/GL 1-1979), Guidelines on Nutrition Labelling (CAC/GL 2-1985) and the Guidelines for Use of Nutrition Claims (CAC/GL 23-1997), **and consistent with Section 4.1.2. in the Codex General Standard for the Labeling of Prepackaged Foods (CXS 1-1985).**”;*
- *“**juices and nectars which contain food additives with the technological function of emulsifier or stabilizer function should include a ‘with added (food additive name)’ qualifier declaration on the label**”*

Affected provisions:

The provisions for Xanthan gum (INS 415) and Tamarind see polysaccharide (INS 437) in FCs 14.1.2 and 14.1.3 and subcategories that will be impacted by the above discussion on Proposals 1-4 are presented below. A full compilation of comments for each provision submitted to the second and third circulars are available on [CCFA53 webpage](#).

Food Category No. 14.1.2 (Fruit and vegetable juices)

Corresponding commodity standards: CODEX STAN 247-2005 applies to subcategories 14.1.2.1 and 14.1.2.3. Contains a general reference to the GSFA.

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
XANTHAN GUM	415	3000		2	Emulsifier, Foaming agent, Stabilizer, Thickener	Consider in context of decision on Proposals 1-4

Food Category No. 14.1.3 (Fruit and vegetable nectars)

Corresponding commodity standards: CODEX STAN 247-2005 applies to subcategories 14.1.3.1 and 14.1.3.3. Contains a general reference to the GSFA.

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
----------	-----	-------------------	-------	----------------	----------------------	--------------------

TAMARIND SEED POLYSACCHARIDE*	437	GMP			Emulsifying salt, Gelling agent, Stabilizer, Thickener	Move provisions from subcategories to FC 14.1.3. Consider in context of decision on Proposals 1-4
XANTHAN GUM	415	3000		2	Emulsifier, Foaming agent, Stabilizer, Thickener	Consider in context of decision on Proposals 1-4

* Tamarind seed polysaccharide (INS 437) has provisions with an ML of GMP at Step 2 in all sub-categories of FC 14.1.3. Those provisions have been collapsed here into a single provision in the parent category FC 14.1.3 to simplify the presentation and discussion.

Chair's Note: The provisions under discussion for Tamarind seed polysaccharide are the result of a proposal from Japan (submitted in response to CL 2018/27-FA, see CX/FA 19/51/8) for new provisions for Tamarind seed polysaccharide to be added to the GSFA as a result of a recent evaluation by the 84th JECFA (2017) which resulted in an ADI of "not specified". Among the provisions proposed by Japan were provisions for Tamarind seed polysaccharide in FCs 14.1.3.1, 14.1.3.2, 14.1.3.3, and 14.1.3.4.

Appendix 3: Recommendations to the notes associated with provisions for the seven group food additives in the GSFA

1. Among several topics, CCFA52 requested the EWG on the GSFA to CCFA53 to consider:¹
 - the appropriateness of the proposals listed in Appendix 1 of CX/FA 21/52/2 pertaining to notes associated with food additives contained under group headers

Introduction:

2. At CCFA50 the Codex Secretariat informed the Committee that it had noted that for several group headers for food additives in the GSFA it was unclear if all food additives under those group headers shared the same group acceptable dietary intake (ADI). As a result, CCFA50 requested the Codex Secretariat, in consultation with the JECFA Secretariats, to undertake a review of all group food additives in the GSFA and prepare a comprehensive document for consideration at CCFA51.² The Codex Secretariat presented this comprehensive document to CCFA51 as Appendix 1 of CX/FA 19/51/2 Add.1. At CCFA51 the Codex Secretariat agreed to update Table 1 in document CX/FA 19/51/2 Add.1 for discussion at CCFA52 pertaining to the need to add notes on the reporting basis for seven group food additives based on the group JECFA ADI for those additives.^{3, 4}

3. The Codex Secretariat provided the update on the reporting basis for seven group additives to CCFA52 in CX/FA 20/52/2 Appendix 1. During discussion at CCFA52, the JECFA Secretariat stated that the reporting basis of the provisions in the GSFA for the group of saccharins should be revised as “For saccharin and its Ca, K, Na salts, expressed as Na Saccharin”. After discussion CCFA52 agreed to have the EWG on the GSFA to CCFA53 consider the recommendations on the reporting basis for the group food additives contained in Appendix 1 of CX/FA 21/52/2.⁵

Working Document:

4. The EWG issued two circulars for comment on recommendations to the notes associated with provisions for the seven group food additives in the GSFA to determine if a standardized reporting basis is necessary for the Group additives listed in Table 1 of CX/FA 21/52/2. The two circulars requested comments on proposals from the Chair of the EWG for adding reporting basis notes for the group additives under discussion. Comments from the first and second circular have been taken into account in making final proposals.

¹ REP 21/FA, para. 183(iii)

² REP 18/FA, paras. 17, 18, and 77.

³ REP 19/FA, para. 10(i).

⁴ CCFA51 also placed analysis of other group headers in Table 1 of CX/FA 19/51/2 Add.1 on hold where JECFA had not included the term “group” in their common ADI until after JECFA’s planned general discussion on the terms “group” ADI or PTWI as well as how to assign group ADIs at their next session, as well as analysis of Carotenoids until after JECFA completed its re-evaluation of the ADI applicable to that group of additives. These were subsequently addressed at CCFA52 in CX/FA 20/52/3, paras 7 – 11 and Table 1.

⁵ REP 21/FA, paras 30 and 31.

Table 1. Recommendations for revisions to notes for GSFA group food additives

Group Food Additive Name	Current relevant notes in the GSFA	Current JECFA Safety Determination	Recommendation from Codex Secretariat to CCFA52	1 st Circular EWG Chair Proposal	2 nd Circular EWG Chair Proposal	Final EWG Proposal
CYCLAMATES INS 952(i) Cyclamic acid INS 952(ii) Calcium cyclamate INS 952(iv) Sodium cyclamate	Note 17: as cyclamic acid	ADI (0-11 mg/kg bw) for cyclamic acid and its calcium and, sodium salts (as cyclamic acid) (1982, 26th JECFA)	To change Note 17 to “for cyclamate, calcium and sodium salts, expressed as cyclamic acid”	<p>The note format typically used in the GSFA to indicate the reporting basis of the maximum level for a group additive is to simply state the reporting basis. As an example, the reporting basis for the Group food additive “Benzoates” is simply: “Note 13: As benzoic acid”.</p> <p><u>EWG Chair Proposal:</u> For consistency with other notes in the GSFA, it is recommended that the current note for Cyclamates be maintained as “As cyclamic acid”.</p>	<p>Comments received indicate consensus for the first circular EWG proposal.</p> <p><u>Final EWG Proposal:</u> The EWG Chair proposes that the current note for Cyclamates be maintained: “As cyclamic acid”.</p>	Maintain the current note for Cyclamates, Note 17 “As cyclamic acid”.
Comments to 1st Circular:						
<u>Australia, Brazil, Chile, China, EU, South Africa, USA, CCC, FoodDrinkEurope, ICGA, ISA:</u> Supports EWG chair’s proposal						
Comments to 2nd Circular:						
<u>Australia, Chile, Colombia, EU, Guatemala, India, UK, USA, FoodDrinkEurope, ICGA, ISA:</u> Supports EWG chair’s proposal						
IRON OXIDES	None	ADI (0-0.5 mg/kg bw) for	To insert a new note reading “for	The JECFA safety assessment for Iron	The intention of the Chair’s proposal to	Since no examples were provided by

Group Food Additive Name	Current relevant notes in the GSFA	Current JECFA Safety Determination	Recommendation from Codex Secretariat to CCFA52	1 st Circular EWG Chair Proposal	2 nd Circular EWG Chair Proposal	Final EWG Proposal
INS 172(i) Iron oxide, black INS 172(ii) Iron oxide, red INS 172(iii) Iron oxide, yellow		iron oxides and hydrated iron oxides (1980. 23th JECFA)	iron oxides and hydrated iron oxides”	oxides does not indicate a reporting basis. <u>EWG Chair Proposal:</u> Based on the current JECFA ADI for Iron oxides, no information is provided on the reporting basis and therefore there is not sufficient information to determine an appropriate note on the reporting basis. EWG members should comment if a note on the reporting basis of the ML is or is not necessary to enable use of the GSFA. If a note on the reporting basis for Iron oxides would be helpful for users of the GSFA, then JECFA should be asked to assist CCFA by providing a reporting basis for the group ADI.	the first circular was to ask if EWG members were aware of examples where the lack of a reporting basis for the group additive had caused problems. No indication of problems from a lack of reporting basis was provided by any of the EWG members. If there are no examples provided by any members, the EWG Chair recommends not asking JECFA to provide a reporting basis for the group ADI. The concern is that the level of effort required of JECFA to establish a reporting basis would not be worthwhile unless problems have been encountered.	any members of instances where the lack of a reporting basis for the group additive had caused problems, the EWG will not ask JECFA to provide a reporting basis for the group ADI. Maintain provision for Iron oxides as listed.

Comments to 1st Circular:

Australia, Brazil, Canada, EU, UK, FoodDrinkEurope: Supports EWG Chair’s proposal to seek JECFA’s input

USA: The USA has not been made aware of any situations where a lack of reporting basis for Iron oxides has caused an issue. Unless the lack of a reporting basis has caused problems, we do not believe that the additional burden on JECFA resources needed to develop a reporting basis is warranted.

Group Food Additive Name	Current relevant notes in the GSFA	Current JECFA Safety Determination	Recommendation from Codex Secretariat to CCFA52	1 st Circular EWG Chair Proposal	2 nd Circular EWG Chair Proposal	Final EWG Proposal
ICGA: is not aware of any implementation problem with regards to this group. The issue may be revisited at a later stage.						
Comments to 2nd Circular:						
Australia, Colombia, EU, Guatemala, FoodDrinkEurope, ICGA: Supports the chair's proposal						
UK: If no examples are provided by EWG members, then the UK would support the Chair's proposal						
US: The US is not aware of any examples where the lack of a reporting basis for the group additive has caused problems.						
POLYOXYETHYLENE STEARATES INS 430 Polyoxyethylene (8) stearate INS 431 Polyoxyethylene (40) stearate	None	Group ADI (0-25mg/kg bw) of total of polyoxyethylene (8) and (40) stearates used in together (1973, 17th JECFA)	To insert a new note reading "Total of polyoxyethylene (8) and (40) stearates used in together"	The JECFA safety assessment for Polyoxyethylene stearate does not indicate a reporting basis for the group ADI. <u>EWG Chair Proposal:</u> Based on the current JECFA ADI for Polyoxyethylene stearate, no information is provided on the reporting basis and therefore there is not sufficient information to determine an appropriate note on the reporting basis. EWG members should comment if a note on the reporting basis of the ML is or is not necessary to enable use of the GSFA. If a note on the reporting basis for Polyoxyethylene	The intention of the Chair's proposal to the first circular was to ask if EWG members were aware of examples where the lack of a reporting basis for the group additives had caused problems. No indication of problems from a lack of reporting basis was provided by any of the EWG members. If there are no examples provided by any members, the EWG Chair recommends not asking JECFA to provide a reporting basis for the group ADI. The concern is that the level of effort required of JECFA to establish a reporting basis would not be worthwhile unless	Since no examples were provided by any members of instances where the lack of a reporting basis for the group additive had caused problems, the EWG will not ask JECFA to provide a reporting basis for the group ADI. Maintain provision for Polyoxyethylene Stearates as listed.

Group Food Additive Name	Current relevant notes in the GSFA	Current JECFA Safety Determination	Recommendation from Codex Secretariat to CCFA52	1 st Circular EWG Chair Proposal	2 nd Circular EWG Chair Proposal	Final EWG Proposal
				stearate, would be helpful for users of the GSFA then JECFA should be asked to assist CCFA by providing a reporting basis for the group ADI.	problems have been encountered.	
<p>Comments to 1st Circular:</p> <p>Australia, Brazil, Canada, EU, UK, FoodDrinkEurope: Supports EWG Chair's proposal to seek JECFA's input</p> <p>USA: The USA has not been made aware of any situations where a lack of reporting basis for Polyoxyethylene stearates has caused an issue. Unless the lack of a reporting basis has caused problems, we do not believe that the additional burden on JECFA resources needed to develop a reporting basis is warranted.</p> <p>ICGA: is not aware of any implementation problem with regards to this group. The issue may be revisited at a later stage.</p>						
<p>Comments to 2nd Circular:</p> <p>Australia, Colombia, EU, Guatemala, FoodDrinkEurope, ICGA: Supports EWG Chair's proposal</p> <p>UK: If no examples are provided by EWG members, then the UK would support the Chair's proposal</p> <p>US: The US is not aware of any examples where the lack of a reporting basis for the group additive has caused problems.</p>						
POLYSORBATES INS 432 Polyoxyethylene (20) sorbitan monolaurate INS 433 Polyoxyethylene (20) sorbitan monooleate INS 434 Polyoxyethylene (20) sorbitan monopalmitate	None	ADI (0-25mg/kg bw) As total polyoxyethylene (20) sorbitan esters (1973, 17th JECFA)	To insert a new note reading "As total polyoxyethylene (20) sorbitan esters"	The JECFA safety assessment for Polysorbates does not indicate a reporting basis for the group ADI. <u>EWG Chair Proposal:</u> Based on the current JECFA ADI for Polysorbates no information is provided on the reporting basis and therefore there is not sufficient information to	The intention of the Chair's proposal to the first circular was to ask if EWG members were aware of examples where the lack of a reporting basis for the group additives had caused problems. No indication of problems from a lack of reporting basis was provided by any	Since no examples were provided by any members of instances where the lack of a reporting basis for the group additive had caused problems, the EWG will not ask JECFA to provide a reporting basis for the group ADI. Maintain provision for Polysorbates as listed.

Group Food Additive Name	Current relevant notes in the GSFA	Current JECFA Safety Determination	Recommendation from Codex Secretariat to CCFA52	1 st Circular EWG Chair Proposal	2 nd Circular EWG Chair Proposal	Final EWG Proposal
INS 435 Polyoxyethylene (20) sorbitan monostearate INS 436 Polyoxyethylene (20) sorbitan tristearate				determine an appropriate note on the reporting basis. EWG members should comment if a note on the reporting basis of the ML is or is not necessary to enable use of the GSFA. If a note on the reporting basis for Polysorbates would be helpful for users of the GSFA, then JECFA should be asked to assist CCFA by providing a reporting basis for the group ADI.	of the EWG members. If there are no examples provided by any members, the EWG Chair recommends not asking JECFA to provide a reporting basis for the group ADI. The concern is that the level of effort required of JECFA to establish a reporting basis would not be worthwhile unless problems have been encountered.	
<p>Comments to 1st Circular:</p> <p>Australia, Brazil, EU, UK, FoodDrinkEurope: Supports EWG Chair's proposal to seek JECFA's input</p> <p>Canada: In Canada, maximum levels for combinations of polysorbates are applied in respect of the total percentage by weight of polysorbates. Therefore, Canada does not believe a common reporting basis is necessary.</p> <p>USA: The USA has not been made aware of any situations where a lack of reporting basis for Polysorbates has caused an issue. Unless the lack of a reporting basis has caused problems, we do not believe that the additional burden on JECFA resources needed to develop a reporting basis is warranted.</p> <p>ICGA: is not aware of any implementation problem with regards to this group. The issue may be revisited at a later stage.</p>						
<p>Comments to 2nd Circular:</p> <p>Australia, Colombia, EU, Guatemala, FoodDrinkEurope, ICGA: Supports the chair's proposal</p> <p>UK: If no examples are provided by EWG members, then the UK would support the Chair's proposal</p> <p>US: The US is not aware of any examples where the lack of a reporting basis for the group additive has caused problems.</p>						
RIBOFLAVINS	None	Group ADI (0-0.5 mg/kg bw) for riboflavin	To insert a new note reading "For riboflavin from	The JECFA safety assessment for Riboflavins does not	Several EWG members noted that the 92 nd JECFA	A group reporting basis is not necessary for

Group Food Additive Name	Current relevant notes in the GSFA	Current JECFA Safety Determination	Recommendation from Codex Secretariat to CCFA52	1 st Circular EWG Chair Proposal	2 nd Circular EWG Chair Proposal	Final EWG Proposal
<p>INS 101(i) Riboflavin, synthetic</p> <p>INS 101(ii) Riboflavin 5'-phosphate sodium</p> <p>INS 101(iii) Riboflavin from Bacillus subtilis</p>		<p>from Bacillus subtilis, synthetic riboflavin and riboflavin-5-phosphate as riboflavin (1998, 51st JECFA</p>	<p>Bacillus subtilis, synthetic riboflavin and riboflavin-5-phosphate as riboflavin”</p>	<p>indicate a reporting basis for the group ADI.</p> <p><u>EWG Chair Proposal:</u> Based on the current JECFA ADI for Riboflavins, no information is provided on the reporting basis and therefore there is not sufficient information to determine an appropriate note on the reporting basis.</p> <p>EWG members should comment if a note on the reporting basis of the ML is or is not necessary to enable use of the GSFA. If a note on the reporting basis for Riboflavins, would be helpful for users of the GSFA, then JECFA should be asked to assist CCFA by providing a reporting basis for the group ADI.</p>	<p>revoked the group ADI for Riboflavins and replaced it with an ADI of “not specified”. As a result, the individual Riboflavins would be expected to be added individually to Table 3 of the GSFA. Once this occurs, there is no longer a safety based reason to tie a numeric use level to a group reporting basis.</p> <p>The Chair recommends that a group reporting basis is not necessary for Riboflavins as these additives should be added to Table 3 of the GSFA.</p>	<p>Riboflavins as these additives should be added to Table 3 of the GSFA, there is no longer a safety based reason to tie a numeric use level to a group reporting basis.</p> <p>Maintain provisions for Riboflavins as listed.</p>

Comments to 1st Circular:

Australia, Brazil, EU, UK, FoodDrinkEurope: Supports EWG Chair’s proposal to seek JECFA’s input

Canada: An outcome of the 92nd meeting of JECFA (2021), was that the group ADI for riboflavins was revoked and replaced with an ADI of “not specified”. Given this, Canada wonders if consideration should be given to making RIBOFLAVINS table 3 additives, which would not require a common reporting basis.

Group Food Additive Name	Current relevant notes in the GSFA	Current JECFA Safety Determination	Recommendation from Codex Secretariat to CCFA52	1 st Circular EWG Chair Proposal	2 nd Circular EWG Chair Proposal	Final EWG Proposal
<p>USA: The USA has not been made aware of any situations where a lack of reporting basis for Riboflavins has caused an issue. Unless the lack of a reporting basis has caused problems, we do not believe that the additional burden on JECFA resources needed to develop a reporting basis is warranted.</p> <p>EU Specialty Food Ingredients: We wish to refer to the 92nd JECFA evaluation of Riboflavin from <i>Ashbya gossypii</i>, where the Committee “established a group ADI “not specified”¹ for riboflavin, riboflavin- 5’-phosphate, riboflavin from <i>B. subtilis</i> and riboflavin from <i>A. gossypii</i>, expressed as riboflavin. The Committee withdrew the previous group ADI of 0–0.5 mg/kg bw”.</p> <p>The Natural Food Colours Association (NATCOL): would like to draw the attention of the EWG to the fact that the table should be updated for riboflavins to include the result of the 92nd JECFA meeting held in June 2021. Whilst establishing the specification for Riboflavin from <i>Ashbya gossypii</i>, “the Committee established a group ADI “not specified” for riboflavin, riboflavin- 5’-phosphate, riboflavin from <i>B. subtilis</i> and riboflavin from <i>A. gossypii</i>, expressed as riboflavin. The Committee withdrew the previous group ADI of 0–0.5 mg/kg bw.” This means that an ADI not specified now applies to all Riboflavins, whatever their origin.</p> <p>ICGA: is not aware of any implementation problem with regards to this group. The issue may be revisited at a later stage.</p>						
<p>Comments to 2nd Circular:</p> <p>Australia, Chile, Colombia, EU, Guatemala, UK, US, ICGA: Supports the chair’s proposal</p>						
<p>SACCHARINS</p> <p>INS 954(i) Saccharin</p> <p>INS 954(ii) Calcium saccharin</p> <p>INS 954(iii) Potassium saccharin</p> <p>INS 954(iv) Sodium saccharin</p>	<p>New note from CCFA52: For saccharin and its Ca, K, Na salts, expressed as Na Saccharin</p>	<p>Group ADI (0-5 mg/kg bw) for saccharin and its Ca, K, Na (1993, 41st JECFA)</p>	<p>To insert a new note reading “For saccharin and its Ca, K, Na”</p>	<p>The JECFA Secretariat recommended that the appropriate note for Saccharins to reflect the JECFA safety determination is: “For saccharin and its Ca, K, Na salts, expressed as Na Saccharin”</p> <p><u>EWG Chair Proposal:</u> Maintain new note proposed by JECFA Secretariat and added at CCFA52.</p>	<p>Comments received indicate consensus for the first circular EWG proposal.</p> <p><u>Final EWG Proposal:</u> The EWG Chair proposes that the note for Saccharins proposed by the JECFA Secretariat at the 52nd CCFA “For saccharin and its Ca, K, Na” be added to all provisions for Saccharins in the GSFA.</p>	<p>That the note for Saccharins proposed by the JECFA Secretariat at the 52nd CCFA “For saccharin and its Ca, K, Na salts, expressed as Na Saccharin” be added to all provisions for Saccharins in the GSFA.</p>

Group Food Additive Name	Current relevant notes in the GSFA	Current JECFA Safety Determination	Recommendation from Codex Secretariat to CCFA52	1 st Circular EWG Chair Proposal	2 nd Circular EWG Chair Proposal	Final EWG Proposal
Comments to 1st Circular:						
Australia, Brazil, Canada, Chile, China, EU, Kenya, South Africa, UK, USA, CCC, FIA, FoodDrinkEurope, ICBA, ICGA, ISA: Supports the JECFA Secretariat's and the EWG Chair's recommendation						
Comments to 2nd Circular:						
Australia, Chile, Colombia, EU, Guatemala, India, UK, USA, FoodDrinkEurope, ICBA, ICGA, ISA: Supports the chair's proposal; Note should read as:						
"For saccharin and its Ca, K, Na salts, expressed as Na Saccharin" be added to all provisions for Saccharins in the GSFA.						
SORBITAN ESTERS OF FATTY ACIDS INS 491 Sorbitan monostearate INS 492 Sorbitan tristearate INS 493 Sorbitan monolaurate INS 494 Sorbitan monooleate INS 495 Sorbitan monopalmitate	None	Group ADI (0-25 mg/kg bw) as the sum of the sorbitan esters of lauric, oleic, palmitic and stearic acid (1973, 17th JECFA)	To insert a new note reading "As the sum of the sorbitan esters of lauric, oleic, palmitic and stearic acid"	The JECFA safety assessment for Sorbitan esters of fatty acids does not indicate a reporting basis for the group ADI. <u>EWG Chair Proposal:</u> Based on the current JECFA ADI for Sorbitan esters of fatty acids, no information is provided on the reporting basis and therefore there is not sufficient information to determine an appropriate note on the reporting basis. EWG members should comment if a note on the reporting basis of the ML is or is not necessary to enable use of the GSFA. If a note on the reporting basis for Sorbitan esters of fatty acids	The intention of the Chair's proposal to the first circular was to ask if EWG members were aware of examples where the lack of a reporting basis for the group additive had caused problems. No indication of problems from a lack of reporting basis was provided by any of the EWG members. If there are no examples provided by any members, the EWG Chair recommends not asking JECFA to provide a reporting basis for the group ADI. The concern is that the level of effort required of JECFA to establish a reporting	Since no examples were provided by any members of instances where the lack of a reporting basis for the group additive had caused problems, the EWG will not ask JECFA to provide a reporting basis for the group ADI. Maintain provision for Sorbitan Esters of Fatty Acids as listed.

Group Food Additive Name	Current relevant notes in the GSFA	Current JECFA Safety Determination	Recommendation from Codex Secretariat to CCFA52	1 st Circular EWG Chair Proposal	2 nd Circular EWG Chair Proposal	Final EWG Proposal
				would be helpful for users of the GSFA, then JECFA should be asked to assist CCFA by providing a reporting basis for the group ADI.	basis would not be worthwhile unless problems have been encountered.	
<p>Comments to 1st Circular:</p> <p>Australia, Brazil, UK, FoodDrinkEurope: Supports EWG Chair's proposal to seek JECFA's input</p> <p>Canada: In Canada, where combination rules are described for sorbitan esters of fatty acids, they are in respect of the total percentage by weight. Therefore, Canada does not believe a common reporting basis is necessary.</p> <p>EU: supports that JECFA is asked to assist CCFA by providing a reporting basis for the group ADI. To be noted: EFSA re-evaluated safety of sorbitan esters in 2017 https://www.efsa.europa.eu/en/efsajournal/pub/4788 and derived a group ADI of 10 mg/kg bw day (JECFA ADI (1982) is 25 mg/kg bw/day) expressed as sorbitan for sorbitan esters (E 491–495) singly or in combination (i.e. as 'sorbitan equivalents'). EFSA further clarified that this group ADI of 10 mg sorbitan/kg bw per day is equivalent to 26 mg sorbitan monostearate/kg bw per day.</p> <p>USA: The USA has not been made aware of any situations where a lack of reporting basis for Sorbitan esters of fatty acids has caused an issue. Unless the lack of a reporting basis has caused problems, we do not believe that the additional burden on JECFA resources needed to develop a reporting basis is warranted.</p> <p>ICGA: is not aware of any implementation problem with regards to this group. The issue may be revisited at a later stage.</p>						
<p>Comments to 2nd Circular:</p> <p>Australia, Colombia, EU, Guatemala, USA, FoodDrinkEurope, ICGA: Supports the chair's proposal</p> <p>UK: If no examples are provided by EWG members, then the UK would agree with the Chair's proposal.</p> <p>US: The US is not aware of any examples where the lack of a reporting basis for the group additive has caused problems.</p>						

Appendix 4: Discussion on Adopted, Draft and Proposed Draft Provisions for Sweeteners

1. Among several topics, the 52nd CCFA requested the EWG on the GSFA to the 53rd CCFA to consider:¹
 - A. Whether the notes in the GSFA linked to aspartame (INS 951), acesulfame potassium (INS 950) and the aspartame-acesulfame salt (INS 962) are aligned and revise related provisions in the GSFA accordingly;
 - B. Draft and proposed draft provisions for sweeteners in FC 14.1.5 for comment on the actual use level as well as the reporting basis for any provided use level (CRD2, Annex 3 Part E);
 - C. Requests from agenda item 5c: draft and proposed draft sweetener provisions still in the Step Process in the Food Categories listed in Appendix 1 of CX/FA 21/52/9 (see para. 173(iii)a);
 - D. Requests from agenda item 5c: discuss provisions with Note 161 attached to them in FCs 05.1.1, 07.1 and 12.2 and its subcategories (see para. 173(iii)b)); and
 - E. Draft and proposed draft provisions for sweeteners in all FCs of the GSFA not covered by other topics.

Introduction:**Background on Topic A: Notes in the GSFA that link Aspartame (INS 951), Acesulfame potassium (INS 950) and the Aspartame-acesulfame salt (INS 962)**

2. During the discussion held by the EWG on Alignment to CCFA52 on aligning the provisions in food category 12.2 of the GSFA and those in corresponding commodity standards, one EWG member noted that the adopted provision for acesulfame potassium (INS 950) contained Note 188 “If used in combination with aspartame-acesulfame salt (INS 962), the combined maximum use level, expressed as acesulfame potassium, should not exceed this level”. However, as there is no provision for aspartame-acesulfame salt in food category 12.2, the EWG discussed whether Note 188 should be removed.² During the discussion in the pWG on Alignment to CCFA52, the Chair recommended that CCFA task the EWG on the GSFA to consider the GSFA notes dealing with aspartame (INS 951), acesulfame potassium (INS 950) and the aspartame-acesulfame salt (INS 962) to ensure they are correct and appropriate.³ The 52nd CCFA endorsed the recommendation to task the EWG on the GSFA to consider whether Note 188 in the GSFA linked to aspartame (INS 951), acesulfame potassium (INS 950) and the aspartame-acesulfame salt (INS 962) was correct and appropriate in all FCs.⁴

3. CCFA52 tasked the EWG on the GSFA to consider whether the notes in the GSFA that link aspartame (INS 951), acesulfame potassium (INS 950) and the aspartame-acesulfame salt (INS 962) are aligned and revise related provisions in the GSFA accordingly.¹ In addition to Note 188, there are three other notes which link these additives: Notes 113, 119, and 191. All four notes are the result of the fact that the aspartame and acesulfame moieties in the aspartame-acesulfame salt are covered under separate JECFA acceptable daily intakes (ADIs – see report of 55th JECFA). Therefore, these notes are used to link and combine maximum use levels if aspartame (INS 951) and/or acesulfame potassium (INS 950) are used in combination with the aspartame-acesulfame salt (INS 962) in the same food. Note 188 is a “combination” note that was attached to all provisions for acesulfame potassium (INS 950) by CCFA41 to address the potential for acesulfame potassium to be used in combination with aspartame-acesulfame salt (INS 962) in the same food.⁵ Note 191 is a “combination” note that was attached to all provisions for aspartame (INS 951) by CCFA41 for the same reason. CCFA41 also attached corresponding Notes 113 and 119 to provisions for the aspartame-acesulfame salt (INS 962).

¹ REP 21/FA, para. 183(iv) and (vi) - (ix)

² CX/FA 20/52/6, Appendix 1, Issue 35.

³ FA/52 CRD3, Recommendation 17.

⁴ REP 21/FA para 101.⁵ ALINORM 09/32/12 para 95.

⁵ ALINORM 09/32/12 para 95.

Background on Topic B: Draft provisions for the use of sweeteners (Polyols) in FC 14.1.5

4. The EWG on the GSFA to CCFA52 was tasked to consider draft and proposed draft provisions for sweeteners in food categories of the GSFA for which a horizontal approach to replacing note 161 had been determined at CCFA51. This included provisions for sweeteners in FC 14.1.5 “Coffee, coffee substitutes, tea, herbal infusions, and other hot cereal and grain beverages, excluding cocoa”. During the discussion on provisions in FC 14.1.5, one EWG member expressed concern that a maximum use level of GMP could result in a laxative effect for specific Table 3 additives known as sugar alcohols or “polyols” and therefore a numerical use level was necessary for these sweeteners. This issue was extensively discussed at the physical working group (pWG) on the GSFA to CCFA52 (see FA/52 CRD 02). After this discussion the Chair of the pWG noted that it appeared consensus would not be reached on these provisions at GMP level and proposed that the WG instead discuss suitable numerical use levels. However, after consensus could not be reached on several of the provisions under discussion, CCFA52 agreed to recirculate those provisions for further discussion on actual use level and reporting basis.⁶

Background on Topic C: Sweetener Provisions still in the Step Process in the Food Categories listed in Appendix 1 of CX/FA 21/52/9 (Food Categories for which CCFA52 was able to reach a consensus approach to Note 161)

5. CCFA50 established the EWG on Note 161 to consider the use of Note 161 related to the use of sweeteners in the context of adopted provisions for sweeteners with Note 161.⁷ As a result of the work of this EWG, CCFA51 was able to reach consensus on a horizontal approach to replace Note 161 with alternative notes for a large percentage of food categories with adopted provisions for sweeteners with Note 161 attached to them.⁸ CCFA51 tasked the EWG on Note 161 to CCFA52 to develop a horizontal approach to replace Note 161 in the remaining food categories with adopted provisions for sweeteners with Note 161 attached to them for which CCFA51 was not able to reach consensus.⁹ Based on the work of the EWG and subsequent pWG, CCFA52 was able to reach consensus on a horizontal approach to replace Note 161 with alternative notes for the remaining food categories with adopted provisions for sweeteners with Note 161 attached to them with the exception of food categories 05.1.1, 07.1, and 12.2 and its subcategories. CCFA52 subsequently tasked the EWG on the GSFA to CCFA53 to revise those provisions still in the step process in those food categories for which CCFA52 was able to reach consensus on a horizontal approach to address Note 161, and to circulate those revised provisions for comment.¹⁰

Background on Topic D: Provisions with Note 161 attached to them in Food Categories 05.1.1, 07.1, and 12.2.2 and its subcategories (Food Categories for which CCFA52 was not able to reach a consensus approach to Note 161)

6. CCFA51 tasked the EWG on Note 161 to CCFA52 to develop a horizontal approach to replace Note 161 in the remaining food categories with adopted provisions for sweeteners with Note 161 attached to them.¹¹ Based on the work of the EWG and subsequent pWG, CCFA52 was able to reach consensus on a horizontal approach to replace Note 161 with alternative notes for the remaining food categories with adopted provisions for sweeteners with Note 161 attached to them with the exception of food categories 05.1.1, 07.1, and 12.2 and its subcategories. CCFA52 subsequently tasked the EWG on the GSFA to CCFA53 to discuss provisions in these food categories with Note 161 attach to them to provide recommendations for a replacement of Note 161, or where such provisions should be revoked/discontinued and whether the descriptors of these food categories should be revised to address the use of food additives, including sweeteners.¹¹

⁶ REP 21/FA, para. 144.

⁷ REP 18/FA, para. 142

⁸ REP 19/FA, para. 114

⁹ REP 18/FA, para. 117.

¹⁰ REP 21/FA, para 173(iii)(a).

¹¹ REP 21/FA, paras. 166-169.

Background on Topic E: All Provisions for Sweeteners in the Step Process that are not covered by other Topics

7. During the Plenary session of CCFA52, the Chair of the EWG on the GSFA proposed that the mandate for the EWG on the GSFA to CCFA53 include all remaining draft and proposed draft provisions for sweeteners in the GSFA. As a result, CCFA52 agreed to task the EWG on the GSFA to CCFA53 to consider “draft and proposed draft provisions for sweeteners in all FCs of the GSFA not covered by topics (vi), (vii), and (viii).”¹² Topics (vi), (vii), and (viii) correspond to Topics B, C, and D respectively.

Working Document:

8. The Appendix was split into four Annexes. The EWG on the GSFA issued three circulars for this Appendix requesting comments on actual use levels and/or technological and justification for the draft and proposed draft provisions under discussion.

9. The current document presents proposals for each provision under discussion (adopt, adopt with revision, discontinue, discontinue and move to subcategories as appropriate, request information) in the format of the food categories listed in Table 2 of the GSFA.

10. These proposals are based upon a consensus approach taking into account the following information:

- Information on corresponding Codex commodity standards and the use of food additives in those commodity standards is provided for each food category;
- Historical discussions on the provision in previous sessions of CCFA; and
- Comments by EWG members.

11. A full compilation of comments submitted for Appendix 4 (Sweeteners) to the three circulars are available on [CCFA53 webpage](#).

12. These recommendations are based on the “weight of evidence”; that is, comments containing justifications were given more weight than comments with no supporting justification.

¹² REP21/FA Para 183 (ix).

Topic A - Notes in the GSFA that link Aspartame (INS 951), Acesulfame potassium (INS 950) and the Aspartame-acesulfame salt (INS 962)

General Background: This Annex address the use of Notes to align provisions for acesulfame potassium (INS 950), aspartame (INS 951), and aspartame-acesulfame salt (INS 962). Alignment of provisions for these additives is necessary due to the relationship of aspartame-acesulfame salt to the JECFA ADI of its component moieties; acesulfame potassium and aspartame. The 55th JECFA (2000) concluded that the aspartame and acesulfame moieties comprising the aspartame-acesulfame salt (INS 962) are covered by the ADIs for aspartame (40 mg/kg bw) and acesulfame potassium (15 mg/kg bw). Because JECFA concluded that the aspartame and acesulfame moieties in aspartame-acesulfame salt are included in the ADIs established for aspartame (INS 951) and acesulfame K (INS 950), the equivalent level of aspartame and acesulfame K from the use of the double salt should not exceed the individual maximum use level for aspartame or for acesulfame potassium.

As a result of the guidance from the 55th JECFA, CCFA41 (see paras. 25-29 and Recommendation 1 in CX/FA 09/41/6) determined that it was most appropriate to present the ML for the aspartame-acesulfame salt in terms of either aspartame or acesulfame potassium equivalents. The MLs for the aspartame-acesulfame salt should be harmonized with the current GSFA maximum use levels for aspartame and acesulfame potassium (i.e., the maximum level of salt would be expressed as aspartame or acesulfame potassium depending upon which individual sweetener would result in a lower level for the aspartame-acesulfame salt when expressed on the aspartame-acesulfame salt basis). For this reason, Note 113 or Note 119 were attached to GSFA provisions for Aspartame-acesulfame salt (INS 962) to explain how to convert maximum levels between the various forms as appropriate.

Note 113: As acesulfame potassium equivalents (the reported maximum level can be converted to an aspartame-acesulfame salt basis by dividing by 0.44). Combined use of aspartame-acesulfame salt with individual acesulfame potassium or aspartame should not exceed the individual maximum levels for acesulfame potassium or aspartame (the reported maximum level can be converted to aspartame equivalents by dividing by 0.68).

Note 119: As aspartame equivalents (the reported maximum level can be converted to an aspartame-acesulfame salt basis by dividing by 0.64). Combined use of aspartame-acesulfame salt with individual aspartame or acesulfame potassium should not exceed the individual maximum levels for aspartame or acesulfame potassium (the reported maximum level can be converted to acesulfame potassium equivalents by multiplying by 0.68).

CCFA 41 also attached Note 188 and Note 191 to provisions for acesulfame potassium (INS 950) and aspartame (INS 951), respectively, to alert users that combined use of the individual additives (INS 950 and INS 951) with the aspartame-acesulfame salt (INS 962) should not exceed the use level for acesulfame potassium (INS 950) or aspartame (INS 951), as the JECFA ADI for the individual moieties of the aspartame-acesulfame salt (INS 962) are tied to acesulfame potassium (INS 950) and aspartame (INS 951). The two associated notes are presented, below.

Note 188: If used in combination with aspartame-acesulfame salt (INS 962), the combined maximum use level, expressed as acesulfame potassium, should not exceed this level.

Note 191: If used in combination with aspartame-acesulfame salt (INS 962), the combined maximum use level, expressed as aspartame, should not exceed this level.

The GSFA EWGs to CCFA44 and CCFA45 discussed whether including Note 188 and Note 191 for provisions for acesulfame potassium (INS 950) and aspartame (INS 951), respectively, may be misleading for users of the GSFA when there is not also an adopted provision for the aspartame-acesulfame salt (INS 962) in the same food category (see FA44/CRD 2 Recommendation 11 and CX/FA 13/45/13). However, discussion on this aspect was postponed at CCFA45 until issues pertaining to Note 161 and the use of sweeteners was resolved.

As part of the discussion held during the Alignment EWG for CCFA52, a member country questioned whether Note 188 was necessary for inclusion in provisions for Acesulfame potassium (INS 950) in cases where there was not also an adopted provision for the Aspartame-acesulfame salt (INS 962) (see Para. 35 of CX/FA 21/52/6). This question could also be applied as to whether Note 191 is necessary for inclusion in provisions for Aspartame (INS 951) in cases where there is not also an adopted provision for the Aspartame-acesulfame salt (INS 962). After further discussion CCFA52 tasked the EWG on the GSFA to consider whether the notes in the GSFA that link aspartame (INS 951), acesulfame potassium (INS 950) and the aspartame-acesulfame salt (INS 962) are aligned and revise related provisions in the GSFA accordingly.

First Circular: The first circular requested comment by EWG members on a general approach to two scenarios. Scenario 1 requested comment on whether Notes 188 or 191 should be retained in provisions for Acesulfame potassium (INS 950) or aspartame (INS 951) in food categories where there is only a provision for INS 950 or INS 951 (**but not both**) and there is also no corresponding provision for aspartame-acesulfame potassium (INS 962). Scenario 2 requested comment on whether a new provision for aspartame-acesulfame potassium (INS 962) should be added systematically to food categories that contain provisions for both INS 950 or INS 951, or alternatively should a provision for aspartame-acesulfame potassium (INS 962) not be added and instead Note 188 removed from the provision for INS 950 and Note 191 removed from the provision for INS 951 in that food category

For Scenario 1, all comments submitted to the first circular, with the exception of comments from one observer organization, supported removal of Notes 188 or 191 from provisions for Acesulfame potassium (INS 950) or Aspartame (INS 951) in food categories where there is only a provision for INS 950 or INS 951 (**but not both**) and there is also no corresponding provision for aspartame-acesulfame potassium (INS 962).

For Scenario 2, all comments to the first circular indicated that it is appropriate to add a provision for the aspartame-acesulfame salt (INS 962) in food categories where adopted provisions already exist for aspartame and acesulfame potassium. However, while most EWG members indicated it was appropriate to add the provisions as part of the current EWG exercise, one Member Organization indicated that any new provisions for aspartame-acesulfame potassium (INS 962) should result as part of the normal procedure for introducing provisions into the GSFA (i.e., responding to Circular Letter "Request for proposals for new and/or revision of food additive provisions of the GSFA").

Second Circular:

For Scenario 1 - As consensus had been reached in response to the First Circular on a general approach to Scenario 1, the Second Circular did not request further comment on a general approach to this scenario and instead presented final recommendations that Note 188 or 191 be removed from specific provisions for Acesulfame potassium (INS 950) or Aspartame (INS 951) in food categories where there is only a provision for INS 950 or INS 951 (**but not both**) and there is also no corresponding provision for aspartame-acesulfame potassium (INS 962).

For Scenario 2 - As all comments submitted to the First Circular were in support of inclusion of a provision for aspartame-acesulfame salt (INS 962) under this scenario, with only some disagreement on the administrative process, the second circular did not request further comment on a general approach for this scenario and instead requested comment on the inclusion of a new provision for aspartame-acesulfame potassium (INS 962) in specific food categories that met this scenario: food categories that already have adopted provisions for **both** aspartame and acesulfame potassium. The Second circular presented the new provision for INS 962 with the appropriate maximum level expressed as aspartame or acesulfame potassium depending upon which individual sweetener would result in a lower level for the aspartame-acesulfame salt when expressed on the aspartame-acesulfame salt basis. The new provision for INS 962 also included Note 113 or Note 119 as appropriate. If necessary, Note 188 or Note 191 was also added to the already adopted provisions for aspartame or acesulfame potassium in that food category, as appropriate.

Third Circular: Consensus had been reached on multiple topics in the first and second circular. The third circular presented final recommendations where consensus have already been reached (with no request for comment on those recommendations) and requested comment on aspects where consensus had not yet been reached. The third circular split this Annex into three Parts:

- Part 1 - addresses food categories with only adopted provisions. As consensus had been reached in the second circular, this part only presented final recommendations and did not request comment.
- Part 2 - addresses food categories with provisions for acesulfame potassium (INS 950) in the step process. The third circular requested comment on the numeric use level for one provision.
- Part 3 - addressed food categories with provisions for aspartame-acesulfame potassium (INS 962) in the step process. As consensus had been reached in the second circular, this part only presented final recommendations and did not request comment.

*Note – there are no provisions for aspartame (INS 951) in the step process. So, while there are separate “Parts” to this Annex to address food categories with provisions in the step process for acesulfame potassium (INS 950) or aspartame-acesulfame potassium (INS 962), there is no need for a “Part 4” to address food categories with provisions in the step process for aspartame (INS 951).

Topic A, Part 1: Food categories in the GSFA only have adopted provisions for Acesulfame potassium (INS 950), Aspartame (INS 951), or Aspartame-acesulfame salt (INS 962).

Chair's note: As the provisions for Acesulfame potassium (INS 950), Aspartame (INS 951), and the Aspartame-acesulfame salt (INS 962) in a particular food category are tied together by use level and notes 113, 119, 188, and 191, information on adopted provisions for all three additives (if present) in particular food category are shown together in the table, below. CCFA52 tasked the EWG to review whether all notes linking these additives are aligned and to revise related provisions in the GSFA accordingly. Therefore, in addition to food categories that fit either Scenario 1 or 2 from the General Background of this Annex, this Table also provides information on food categories where there are adopted provisions for all 3 additives.

	Acesulfame potassium INS 950 Functional effect: Flavour enhancer, Sweetener			Aspartame INS 951 Functional effect: Flavour enhancer, Sweetener			Aspartame-acesulfame salt INS 962 Functional effect: Sweetener			Final EWG Recommendation
Food Category No.	ACK Adoption Year	ACK Max Level	ACK Notes	ASP Adoption Year	ASP Max Level	ASP Notes	ASP-ACK Adoption Year	ASP-ACK Max Level	ASP-ACK Salt Notes	
01.1.4	Adopted 2019	350	478 & 188	Adopted 2019	600	478, 191 & 405	Adopted 2019	350	113 & 477	Correct notes for all provisions. No change necessary
01.6.1				Adopted 2021	1000	191, 201, 478, XS221, XS262, XS273 & XS275				Remove Note 191 from provision for Aspartame.
01.7	Adopted 2019	350	478 & 188	Adopted 2019	1000	478 & 191	Adopted 2019	350	113 & 477	Correct notes for all provisions. No change necessary. This FC currently under consideration by Alignment WG.
02.4	Adopted 2021	350	188 & 478	Adopted 2021	1000	191 & 478	Adopted 2021	350	113 & 477	Correct notes for all provisions. No change necessary
03.0	Adopted 2019	800	478 & 188	Adopted 2019	1000	478 & 191	Adopted 2021	1000	119 & 477	Correct notes for all provisions. No change necessary

	Acesulfame potassium INS 950 Functional effect: Flavour enhancer, Sweetener			Aspartame INS 951 Functional effect: Flavour enhancer, Sweetener			Aspartame-acesulfame salt INS 962 Functional effect: Sweetener			Final EWG Recommendation
Food Categor y No.	ACK Adoption Year	ACK Max Level	ACK Notes	ASP Adoption Year	ASP Max Level	ASP Notes	ASP- ACK Adoptio n Year	ASP- ACK Max Level	ASP-ACK Salt Notes	
04.1.2.4	Adopted 2021	350	188, 478 & XS319	Adopted 2021	1000	191, 478 & XS319	Adopted 2021	350	113, 477 & XS319	Correct notes for all provisions. No change necessary
04.1.2.5	Adopted 2019	1000	478 & 188	Adopted 2019	1000	478 & 191	Adopted 2019	1000	119 & 477	Correct notes for all provisions. No change necessary
04.1.2.6	Adopted 2019	1000	478 & 188	Adopted 2019	1000	478 & 191	Adopted 2021	1000	119, 477 & XS160	Correct notes for all provisions. No change necessary
04.1.2.8	Adopted 2019	350	478 & 188	Adopted 2019	1000	478 & 191	Adopted 2019	350	113 & 477	Correct notes for all provisions. No change necessary
04.1.2.9	Adopted 2019	350	478 & 188	Adopted 2019	1000	478 & 191	Adopted 2019	350	113 & 477	Correct notes for all provisions. No change necessary
04.1.2.10	Adopted 2019	350	478 & 188	Adopted 2019	1000	478 & 191	Adopted 2021	350	113 & 477	Correct notes for all provisions. No change necessary
04.1.2.12	Adopted 2019	500	478 & 188	Adopted 2019	1000	478 & 191	Adopted 2021	500	113 & 477	Correct notes for all provisions. No change necessary
04.2.2.2				Adopted 2021	1000	144, 191 & A3				Remove Note 191 from provision for Aspartame.
04.2.2.3	Adopted 2007	200	144 & 188	Adopted 2007	300	144 & 191	Adopted 2021	200	113 & 144	Correct notes for all provisions. No change necessary

	Acesulfame potassium INS 950 Functional effect: Flavour enhancer, Sweetener			Aspartame INS 951 Functional effect: Flavour enhancer, Sweetener			Aspartame-acesulfame salt INS 962 Functional effect: Sweetener			Final EWG Recommendation
Food Categor y No.	ACK Adoption Year	ACK Max Level	ACK Notes	ASP Adoption Year	ASP Max Level	ASP Notes	ASP- ACK Adoptio n Year	ASP- ACK Max Level	ASP-ACK Salt Notes	
04.2.2.6	Adopted 2021	350	188 & 478	Adopted 2021	1000	191 & 478	Adopted 2021	350	113 & 477	Correct notes for all provisions. No change necessary
04.2.2.8				Adopted 2021	1000	144, 191, 478 & A4				Remove Note 191 from provision for Aspartame.
05.1.1	Adopted 2016	350	97, 188 & XS141	Adopted 2016	3000	97, 191 & XS141				Add and adopt provision for INS 962 in FC 05.1.1 at 350 mg/kg with Note 97, 113, & XS141
05.1.3	Adopted 2019	1000	478, 188 & XS86	Adopted 2019	3000	478, 191 & XS86	Adopted 2021	1000	113, 477 & XS86	Correct notes for all provisions. No change necessary
05.1.4	Adopted 2019	500	478 & 188	Adopted 2019	3000	37, 478 & 191	Adopted 2021	500	113 & 477	Correct notes for all provisions. No change necessary
05.1.5	Adopted 2021	500	188 & 478	Adopted 2021	3000	191 & 478	Adopted 2021	500	113 & 477	Correct notes for all provisions. No change necessary
05.2.1	Adopted 2019	500	156, 478 & 188	Adopted 2019	3000	478 & 148				Add and adopt provision for INS 962 at 500 mg/kg with Notes 113, 156, and 477. If provision for INS 962 is adopted, add Note 191 to provision for Aspartame.
05.2.2	Adopted 2019	1000	157, 478, 188 &	Adopted 2019	3000	148, 478 & XS309R				Add and adopt provision for INS 962 at 1000 mg/kg with Notes 113, 157, 477, and XS309R. If provision

	Acesulfame potassium INS 950 Functional effect: Flavour enhancer, Sweetener			Aspartame INS 951 Functional effect: Flavour enhancer, Sweetener			Aspartame-acesulfame salt INS 962 Functional effect: Sweetener			Final EWG Recommendation
Food Categor y No.	ACK Adoption Year	ACK Max Level	ACK Notes	ASP Adoption Year	ASP Max Level	ASP Notes	ASP- ACK Adoptio n Year	ASP- ACK Max Level	ASP-ACK Salt Notes	
			XS309 R							for INS 962 is adopted, add Note 191 to provision for Aspartame.
05.2.3	Adopted 2019	1000	478 & 188	Adopted 2019	3000	478 & 191				Add and adopt provision for INS 962 at 1000 mg/kg with Notes 113 and 477.
05.3	Adopted 2019	5000	478 & 188	Adopted 2019	10000	478 & 191	Adopted 2021	5000	113 & 477	Correct notes for all provisions. No change necessary
05.4	Adopted 2019	500	478 & 188	Adopted 2019	1000	478 & 191	Adopted 2021	500	113 & 477	Correct notes for all provisions. No change necessary
06.3	Adopted 2019	1200	478 & 188	Adopted 2019	1000	478 & 191	Adopted 2021	1000	119 & 477	Correct notes for all provisions. No change necessary
07.2	Adopted 2007	1000	165 & 188	Adopted 2007	1700	165 & 191	Adopted 2009	1000	77 & 113	Correct notes for all provisions. No change necessary
09.2	Adopted 2018	200	144, 188, XS36, XS92, XS95, XS165, XS166, XS167, XS189, XS190, XS191, XS222,	Adopted 2018	300	144, 191, XS36, XS92, XS95, XS165, XS166, XS167, XS189, XS190, XS191, XS222, XS236,				Add and adopt provision for INS 962 at 200 mg/kg with Note 113, 144, and XS notes as per INS 950 provision.

	Acesulfame potassium INS 950 Functional effect: Flavour enhancer, Sweetener			Aspartame INS 951 Functional effect: Flavour enhancer, Sweetener			Aspartame-acesulfame salt INS 962 Functional effect: Sweetener			Final EWG Recommendation
Food Category No.	ACK Adoption Year	ACK Max Level	ACK Notes	ASP Adoption Year	ASP Max Level	ASP Notes	ASP- ACK Adoption Year	ASP- ACK Max Level	ASP-ACK Salt Notes	
			XS236, XS244, XS292, XS311, XS312 & XS315			XS244, XS292, XS311, XS312 & XS315				
09.3	Adopted 2018	200	144, 188 & XS291	Adopted 2018	300	144, 191 & XS291	Adopted 2018	200	113 & XS291	Correct notes for all provisions. No change necessary. Addition of Note 144 to INS 962 provision (Note 161 horizontal approach) to be addressed by Codex Secretariat.
09.4	Adopted 2018	200	144, 188, XS3, XS37, XS70, XS90, XS94 & XS119	Adopted 2018	300	144, 191, XS3, XS37, XS70, XS90, XS94 & XS119	Adopted 2018	200	113, XS3, XS37, XS70, XS90, XS94 & XS119	Correct notes for all provisions. No change necessary. Addition of Note 144 to INS 962 provision (Note 161 horizontal approach) to be addressed by Codex Secretariat.
10.4	Adopted 2019	350	478 & 188	Adopted 2019	1000	478 & 191	Adopted 2021	350	113 & 477	Correct notes for all provisions. No change necessary
11.4	Adopted 2007	1000	159 & 188	Adopted 2007	3000	159 & 191				Add and adopt provision for INS 962 at 1000 mg/kg with Note 113, 159, and 477.

	Acesulfame potassium INS 950 Functional effect: Flavour enhancer, Sweetener			Aspartame INS 951 Functional effect: Flavour enhancer, Sweetener			Aspartame-acesulfame salt INS 962 Functional effect: Sweetener			Final EWG Recommendation
Food Category No.	ACK Adoption Year	ACK Max Level	ACK Notes	ASP Adoption Year	ASP Max Level	ASP Notes	ASP- ACK Adoptio n Year	ASP- ACK Max Level	ASP-ACK Salt Notes	
11.6	Adopted 2007	GMP	188	Adopted 2007	GMP	191	Adopted 2012	GMP		Food Category is for Table-top sweeteners. All three provisions adopted at GMP. Notes based on numerical use levels are not relevant. EWG Proposal: Note 188 and Note 191 should be removed from INS 950 and 951.
12.2	Adopted 2021	2000	161, 188, XS326, XS327, XS328							Discussion in Annex 4 of this Appendix to move provision to FC 12.2.2. If moved, follow recommendation in Appendix 4. If decision in Appendix 4 is not to move provision to FC 12.2.2 and the provision remains in FC 12.2, there is No provision for Aspartame or Aspartame-acesulfame salt so Note 188 should be removed.
12.3	Adopted 2021	2000	188, 478 & 277	Adopted 2021	3000	191, 478 & 277				Add and adopt provision for INS 962 at 2000 mg/kg with Note 113, 277 and 477.
12.5	Adopted 2019	110	478, 188 & XS117	Adopted 2019	1200	478, 188 & XS117	Adopted 2021	110	113, 138, 477 & XS117	Replace Note 188 with Note 191 in provision for Aspartame.

	Acesulfame potassium INS 950 Functional effect: Flavour enhancer, Sweetener			Aspartame INS 951 Functional effect: Flavour enhancer, Sweetener			Aspartame-acesulfame salt INS 962 Functional effect: Sweetener			Final EWG Recommendation
Food Category No.	ACK Adoption Year	ACK Max Level	ACK Notes	ASP Adoption Year	ASP Max Level	ASP Notes	ASP- ACK Adoptio n Year	ASP- ACK Max Level	ASP-ACK Salt Notes	
12.6	Adopted 2007	1000	188	Adopted 2007	350	191				Add and adopt provision for INS 962 at 350 mg/kg with Note 119 and 477.
13.3	Adopted 2007	500	188	Adopted 2007	1000	191	Adopted 2012	500	113	Correct notes for all provisions. No change necessary
13.4	Adopted 2007	450	188	Adopted 2007	800	191	Adopted 2009	450	113	Correct notes for all provisions. No change necessary
13.5	Adopted 2007	450	188	Adopted 2007	1000	191	Adopted 2009	450	113	Correct notes for all provisions. No change necessary
13.6	Adopted 2007	2000	188	Adopted 2007	5500	191	Adopted 2012	2000	113	Correct notes for all provisions. No change necessary
14.1.3.2	Adopted 2021	350	188 & 478	Adopted 2021	600	191 & 478				Add and adopt provision for INS 962 at 350 mg/kg with Note 113 and 477.
14.1.4	Adopted 2007	600	161 & 188	Adopted 2019	600	478 & 191	Adopted 2021	600	119 & 477	Correct notes for all provisions. No change necessary
14.1.5	Adopted 2007	600	160, 161 & 188	Adopted 2019	600	160 & 478	Adopted 2021	600	119, 160 & 477	Add Note 191 to Aspartame provision.
14.2.7	Adopted 2007	350	188	Adopted 2007	600	191	Adopted 2010	350	113	Correct notes for all provisions. No change necessary

Topic A, Part 2: provisions for Acesulfame potassium (INS 950) in the step process

There are currently no provisions (adopted or in the step process) for Aspartame (INS 951) or Aspartame-acesulfame salt (INS 962) in the food categories under discussion in this section (Food Categories 06.8.1 or 12.9.1).

ACESULFAME POTASSIUM INS 950					
Functional Classes: Flavour enhancer, Sweetener					
Food Category No.	Food Category Name	Max Level	Notes	Step	Final EWG Proposal
06.8.1	Soybean-based beverages	500	188	3	Adopt at 500 mg/kg. This use level is below that of adopted provisions in analogous FCs (14.1.4 and 14.1.5). This level can be revisited, if necessary, after JECFA completes its review of INS 950 in those food categories.
12.9.1	Fermented soybean paste (e.g., miso)	350	188	3	Adopt provision at 350 mg/kg with Note 478 (remove Note 188)

Topic A, Part 3: Aspartame-acesulfame salt (INS 962) provisions in the step process and proposals on the notes for adopted Acesulfame potassium (INS 950) and Aspartame (INS 951) provisions in the same food category.

Food Category No. 01.3.2 (Beverage whiteners)

Additive	INS	Max Level	Notes	Adopted/ Step	Final EWG Proposal
Acesulfame potassium	950	2000	188, 201, 478, XS250, XS252	2021	Maintain
Aspartame	951	6000	191, 201, 478, XS250, XS252	2021	Maintain
Aspartame-acesulfame salt	962	4540	113	3	Adopt at 2000 mg/kg with Notes 113, 201, 477, XS250 & XS252

Food Category No. 01.4.4 (Cream analogues)

Additive	INS	Max Level	Notes	Adopted/ Step	Final EWG Proposal
Acesulfame potassium	950	1000	188, 478 & 68	2021	Maintain
Aspartame	951	1000	191, 478 & 68	2021	Maintain
Aspartame-acesulfame salt	962	4540	113	3	Adopt at 1000 mg/kg with Note 68, 119 & 477

Note A7: For use in flavoured and/or sweetened products only.

Food Category No. 01.5.2 (Milk and cream powder analogues)

Additive	INS	Max Level	Notes	Adopted/ Step	Final EWG Proposal
Acesulfame potassium	950	1000	188, 478, XS251 & 408	2021	Maintain
Aspartame	951	2000	191, 478, XS251 & 408	2021	Maintain

Aspartame-acesulfame salt	962	3100	119	3	Adopt at 1000 mg/kg with Note 113, 477, XS251 & 408
---------------------------	-----	------	-----	---	---

Note A1: For use in flavoured and/or sweetened milk powder analogues only.

Food Category No. 01.6.5 (Cheese analogues)

There are no adopted provisions for Acesulfame potassium or Aspartame in FC 01.6.5.

Additive	INS	Max Level	Notes	Adopted/ Step	Final EWG Proposal
Aspartame-acesulfame salt	962	790	113	3	Discontinue

Food Category No. 02.3 (Fat emulsions mainly of type oil-in-water, including mixed and/or flavoured products based on fat emulsions)

There are no adopted provisions for Acesulfame potassium or Aspartame in FC 02.3.

Additive	INS	Max Level	Notes	Adopted/ Step	Final EWG Proposal
Aspartame-acesulfame salt	962	1550	119	3	Discontinue

Food Category No. 04.1.2.1 (Frozen fruit)

Additive	INS	Max Level	Notes	Adopted/ Step	Final EWG Proposal
Acesulfame potassium	950	500	188, 478 & 358	2021	Maintain
Aspartame	951	2000	191, 478, & 358	2021	Maintain
Aspartame-acesulfame salt	962	1130	113	3	Adopt at 500 mg/kg with Note 113, 477 & 358

Note A2: For use in products in a syrup or juice only.

Food Category No. 04.1.2.2 (Dried fruit)

There are no adopted provisions for Acesulfame potassium or Aspartame in FC 04.1.2.2.

Additive	INS	Max Level	Notes	Adopted/ Step	Final EWG Proposal
Aspartame-acesulfame salt	962	1130	113	3	Discontinue

Food Category No. 04.1.2.3 (Fruit in vinegar, oil, or brine)

Additive	INS	Max Level	Notes	Adopted/ Step	Final EWG Proposal
Acesulfame potassium	950	200	144 & 188	2021	Maintain
Aspartame	951	300	144 & 191	2007	Maintain
Aspartame-acesulfame salt	962	450	113 & 144	3	Adopt at 200 mg/kg with Note 113 & 144

Food Category No. 04.1.2.7 (Candied fruit)

Additive	INS	Max Level	Notes	Adopted/ Step	Final EWG Proposal
Acesulfame potassium	950	500	188 & 478	2021	Maintain
Aspartame	951	2000	191 & 478	2021	Maintain
Aspartame-acesulfame salt	962	1130	113	3	Adopt at 500 mg/kg with Note 113 & 477

Food Category No. 04.1.2.11 (Fruit fillings for pastries)

Additive	INS	Max Level	Notes	Adopted/ Step	Final EWG Proposal
Acesulfame potassium	950	350	188 & 478	2021	Maintain
Aspartame	951	1000	191 & 478	2021	Maintain

Aspartame-acesulfame salt	962	790	113	3	Adopt at 350 mg/kg with Note 113 & 477
---------------------------	-----	-----	-----	---	--

Food Category No. 04.2.2.4 (Canned or bottled (pasteurized) or retort pouch vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds)

Additive	INS	Max Level	Notes	Adopted/ Step	Final EWG Proposal
Acesulfame potassium	950	350	188 & 478	2021	Maintain
Aspartame	951	1000	191 & 478	2021	Maintain
Aspartame-acesulfame salt	962	790	113	3	Adopt at 350 mg/kg with Note 113 & 477

Food Category No. 04.2.2.5 (Vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed purees and spreads (e.g., peanut butter))

Additive	INS	Max Level	Notes	Adopted/ Step	Final EWG Proposal
Acesulfame potassium	950	1000	188	2008	Revise Adopted; Add Note 478 (Note 161 horizontal approach) to be addressed by Codex Secretariat.
Aspartame	951	1000	191 & 478	2021	Maintain
Aspartame-acesulfame salt	962	4660	119	3	Adopt at 1000 mg/kg with Note 119 & 477

Food Category No. 04.2.2.7 (Fermented vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and seaweed products, excluding fermented soybean products of food categories 06.8.6, 06.8.7, 12.9.1, 12.9.2.1 and 12.9.2.3)

Additive	INS	Max Level	Notes	Adopted/ Step	Final EWG Proposal
----------	-----	-----------	-------	---------------	--------------------

Acesulfame potassium	950	1000	188	2008	Revise Adopted; Add Note 478 (Note 161 horizontal approach) to be addressed by Codex Secretariat.
Aspartame	951	2500	144 & 191	2021	Maintain
Aspartame-acesulfame salt	962	2270	113	3	Adopt at 1000 mg/kg with Note 113 and Note 144 (Note 161 horizontal approach)

Food Category No. 05.1.2 (Cocoa mixes (syrups))

Additive	INS	Max Level	Notes	Adopted/ Step	Final EWG Proposal
Acesulfame potassium	950	350	97, 188 & 478	2021	Maintain Note 97 (“on the final cocoa and chocolate product basis”).
Aspartame	951	1000	191 & 478	2021	Add Note 97 to provision (“on the final cocoa and chocolate product basis”).
Aspartame-acesulfame salt	962	1130	113	3	Adopt provision at 350 mg/kg with Notes 97, 113 & 477

Food Category No. 06.5 (Cereal and starch based desserts (e.g. rice pudding, tapioca pudding))

Additive	INS	Max Level	Notes	Adopted/ Step	Final EWG Proposal
Acesulfame potassium	950	350	188 & 478	2021	Maintain
Aspartame	951	1000	191 & 478	2021	Maintain
Aspartame-acesulfame salt	962	790	113 & 145	3	Adopt at 350 mg/kg with Note 113 & 477

Food Category No. 07.1 (Bread and ordinary bakery wares)

Additive	INS	Max Level	Notes	Adopted/ Step	Final EWG Proposal
Acesulfame potassium	950	1000	161 & 188	2008	Revise Adopted; Replace Note 161 once horizontal approach is determined (see Annex 4 of this Appendix)
Aspartame	951	4000	161 & 191	2008	Revise Adopted; Replace Note 161 once horizontal approach is determined (see Annex 4 of this Appendix)
Aspartame-acesulfame salt	962	2270	113	3	Adopt at 1000 mg/kg with Note 113 and replacement note for Note 161 as determined in Annex 4 of this Appendix

Food Category No. 12.2.2 (Seasonings and condiments)

Additive	INS	Max Level	Notes	Adopted/ Step	Final EWG Proposal
Acesulfame potassium	950	2000	161 & 188	2008	(Note that this provision is currently in FC 12.2. In Annex 4 of this document, the provision is proposed to be moved to FC 12.2.2). Revise Adopted. Replace Note 161 (and move to FC 12.2.2) as determined in Annex 4 of this Appendix regarding FC 12.2.2.
Aspartame	951	2000	161 & 191	2008	Revise Adopted. Replace Note 161 as determined in Annex 4 of this Appendix regarding FC 12.2.2.
Aspartame-acesulfame salt	962	3100	113	3	Adopt at 2000 mg/kg with Note 119 and replacement note for Note 161 as determined in Annex 4 of this Appendix regarding FC 12.2.2.

Food Category No. 12.4 (Mustards)

Additive	INS	Max Level	Notes	Adopted/ Step	Final EWG Proposal
Acesulfame potassium	950	350	188	2007	Maintain

Aspartame	951	350	191	2007	Maintain
Aspartame-acesulfame salt	962	540	119	3	Adopt at 350 mg/kg with Note 119

Food Category No. 12.7 (Salads (e.g. macaroni salad, potato salad) and sandwich spreads excluding cocoa- and nut-based spreads of food categories 04.2.2.5 and 05.1.3)

Additive	INS	Max Level	Notes	Adopted/ Step	Final EWG Proposal
Acesulfame potassium	950	350	188 & 478	2021	Add Note 166 "for use in milk-based sandwich spreads only" for parity with provision for INS 951.
Aspartame	951	350	166 & 478	2021	Revised Adopted; Add Note 191
Aspartame-acesulfame salt	962	1550	113 & 145	3	Adopt at 350 mg/kg with Note 119, 166 & 477. Remove notes 113 and 145.

Food Category No. 14.1.3.1 (Fruit nectar)

Additive	INS	Max Level	Notes	Adopted/ Step	Final EWG Proposal
Acesulfame potassium	950	350	188	2005	Maintain
Aspartame	951	600	191	2005	Maintain
Aspartame-acesulfame salt	962	350	113	3	Adopt at 350 mg/kg with Notes 113 and 477

Food Category No. 14.1.3.3 (Concentrates for fruit nectar)

Additive	INS	Max Level	Notes	Adopted/ Step	Final EWG Proposal
Acesulfame potassium	950	350	127 & 188	2005	Maintain

Aspartame	951	600	127 & 191	2005	Maintain
Aspartame-acesulfame salt	962	350	113 & 127	3	Adopt at 350 mg/kg with Notes 113, 127, and 477

Food Category No. 14.1.3.4 (Concentrates for vegetable nectar)

Additive	INS	Max Level	Notes	Adopted/ Step	Final EWG Proposal
Acesulfame potassium	950	350	127, 188 & 478	2021	Maintain
Aspartame	951	600	127 & 478	2021	Revised Adopted, add Note 191.
Aspartame-acesulfame salt	962	3100	113	3	Adopt at 350 mg/kg with Note 113, 127 & 477

Food Category No. 14.2.1 (Beer and malt beverages)

There are no adopted provisions for Acesulfame potassium or Aspartame in FC 04.1.2.2.

Additive	INS	Max Level	Notes	Step	Final EWG Proposal
Aspartame-acesulfame salt	962	790	113 & 138	3	Discontinue

Food Category No. 15.0 (Ready-to-eat savouries)

Additive	INS	Max Level	Notes	Adopted/ Step	Final EWG Proposal
Acesulfame potassium	950	350	188	2007	Maintain, Addition of Note 478 (Note 161 horizontal approach) to be addressed by Codex Secretariat.
Aspartame	951	500	191	2008	Maintain, Addition of Note 478 (Note 161 horizontal approach) to be addressed by Codex Secretariat.

Aspartame-acesulfame salt	96 2	770	119 & 144	3	Adopt at 500 mg/kg with Note 119.
---------------------------	---------	-----	-----------	---	-----------------------------------

Topic B: Draft and proposed draft provisions for sweeteners (polyols) in FC 14.1.5 for comment on actual use level as well as the reporting basis

Chair's note (from first circular): During the discussion at the pWG on the GSFA to CCFA52, most of discussion on the safety of polyols pertained to whether a given use level would result in a laxative effect. Much of this conversation compared proposed use levels to the use level for erythritol (INS 968), which was adopted by CCFA52 at 1,600 mg/kg with Note 381 "As consumed". During the discussion it was noted that FC 14.1.5 includes both ready-to-drink products and their mixes and concentrates, and it was unclear if the numerical use levels listed in the provisions under discussion were on an "as consumed" basis or a dry mixture basis.

Category No. 14.1.5 (Coffee, coffee substitutes, tea, herbal infusions, and other hot cereal and grain beverages, excluding cocoa)

Corresponding commodity standards: None

Information: The majority of adopted provisions in FC 14.1.5 contain Note 160 "For use in ready-to-drink products and pre-mixes for ready-to-drink products only".

Horizontal approach to sweeteners in FC 14.1.5 (Note 161 replacement – FA/52 CRD4 Annex 1): The use of sweeteners in this food category is justified on a general basis with Note 477 or 478 as appropriate.

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
SORBITOL	420(i)	GMP		4	Bulking agent, Humectant, Sequestrant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	Information has only been provided for 100,000 mg/kg on a dry-mixture basis. Discontinue if information on the corresponding "As consumed" basis is not provided.
XYLITOL	967	30000		4	Emulsifier, Humectant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	Information has only been provided for 100,000 mg/kg on a dry-mixture basis. Discontinue if information on the corresponding "As consumed" basis is not provided.
Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ISOMALT (HYDROGENATED ISOMALTULOSE)	953	300000		4	Anticaking agent, Bulking agent, Glazing agent, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	Discontinue
LACTITOL	966	30000		4	Emulsifier, Sweetener, Thickener	Discontinue

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
SORBITOL SYRUP	420(ii)	GMP		4	Bulking agent, Humectant, Sequestrant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	Discontinue

Topics C and E: Provisions in the step process for sweeteners in FCs for which CCFA52 reached consensus on an approach to replace Note 161 and all other provisions in the step process for sweeteners not covered under other Topics

Chair's Note: CCFA52 tasked the EWG on the GSFA to CCFA53 to i) revise the provisions in the step process in food categories for which CCFA52 reached consensus on an approach to replace Note 161 as per the horizontal approach listed in Annex 1 of FA/52 CRD04; and ii) to circulate those provisions for comment to reach consensus towards adoption or discontinuation. For those provisions in FCs for which CCFA52 reached a consensus approach, the alternative note for Note 161 appears in the presented provision in **bold** type. However, under Topic E there are food categories that did not have adopted provisions in them with Note 161 attached and therefore a horizontal approach to sweeteners in those food categories was not developed by the EWGs on Note 161 to CCFA51 or CCFA52. Provisions in these food categories are marked in grey highlight. For those food categories marked in grey highlight, the EWG is invited to discuss if the general replacement notes 477 or 478 should be added to the listed provisions, a different alternative note, or if no note is necessary to address the use of sweeteners in those food categories.

Note 477: Some Codex Members allow use of additives with sweetener function in all foods within this Food Category while others limit additives with sweetener function to those foods with significant energy reduction or no added sugars.

Note 478: Some Codex Members allow use of additives with sweetener function in all foods within this Food Category while others limit additives with sweetener function to those foods with significant energy reduction or no added sugars. This limitation may not apply to the appropriate use as a flavour enhancer.

Category No. 01.1.4 (Flavoured fluid milk drinks)

Corresponding commodity standards: CODEX STAN 243-2003: Lists specific acidity regulators, carbonating agents, colours, emulsifiers, flavour enhancers, packaging gases, preservatives, stabilizers, sweeteners, and thickeners

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ADVANTAME	969	10	478	2	Flavour enhancer, Sweetener	Adopt as listed, add Notes 381 "As consumed". This FC currently under consideration by Alignment WG which is considering the addition of note XS243 to this provision.

Category No. 01.2 (Fermented and renneted milk products (plain))

Corresponding commodity standards: None; Corresponding commodity standard to subcategories 01.2.1, 01.2.1.1, and 01.2.1.2 (CODEX STAN 243-2003, 332R-2018). Does not allow sweeteners

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ERYTHRITOL	968	40000		4	Flavour enhancer, Humectant, Sweetener	Discontinue
LACTITOL	966	30000		4	Emulsifier, Sweetener, Thickener	
MALTITOL	965(i)	50000		4	Bulking agent, Emulsifier, Humectant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	
MALTITOL SYRUP	965(ii)	50000		4	Bulking agent, Emulsifier, Humectant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	Discontinue
THAUMATIN	957	GMP		4	Flavour enhancer, Sweetener	
XYLITOL	967	30000		7	Emulsifier, Humectant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	Discontinue

Category No. 01.2.1.2 (Fermented milks (plain), heat-treated after fermentation)

Corresponding commodity standards: CODEX STAN 243-2003: Does not allow sweeteners; No food additives listed in **CODEX STAN 332R-2018**

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ISOMALT (HYDROGENATED ISOMALTULOSE)	953	GMP		7	Anticaking agent, Bulking agent, Glazing agent, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	Discontinue
SORBITOL	420(i)	GMP		7	Bulking agent, Humectant, Sequestrant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	
SORBITOL SYRUP	420(ii)	GMP		7	Bulking agent, Humectant, Sequestrant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	
XYLITOL	967	GMP		7	Emulsifier, Humectant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	Discontinue

Category No. 01.2.2 (Renneted milk (plain))**Corresponding commodity standards:** None

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ISOMALT (HYDROGENATED ISOMALTULOSE)	953	GMP		7	Anticaking agent, Bulking agent, Glazing agent, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	Discontinue
SORBITOL	420(i)	GMP		7	Bulking agent, Humectant, Sequestrant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	
SORBITOL SYRUP	420(ii)	GMP		7	Bulking agent, Humectant, Sequestrant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	
XYLITOL	967	GMP		7	Emulsifier, Humectant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	

Category No. 01.3.2 (Beverage whiteners)

Corresponding commodity standards: Codex STAN 250-2010: Lists specific emulsifiers, acidity regulators and thickeners; **Codex STAN 252-2010:** Lists specific emulsifiers, acidity regulators, stabilizers and thickeners

Horizontal approach for sweeteners (CCFA52 CRD4 Annex 1): The use of sweeteners in this food category is justified on a general basis with Note 477 or 478 as appropriate, Notes XS250, XS252, and Note 201 (For use in flavoured products only).

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ADVANTAME	969	60	478, 201, XS250, XS252	2	Flavour enhancer, Sweetener	Adopt as listed

Category No. 01.4.1 (Pasteurized cream (plain))

Corresponding commodity standards: CODEX STAN 288-1976: Lists specific acidity regulators, emulsifiers, packing gases, propellants, stabilizers, and thickeners

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ERYTHRITOL	968	600000		4	Flavour enhancer, Humectant, Sweetener	Discontinue
LACTITOL	966	30000		4	Emulsifier, Sweetener, Thickener	
MALTITOL	965(i)	300000		4	Bulking agent, Emulsifier, Humectant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	
MALTITOL SYRUP	965(ii)	300000		4	Bulking agent, Emulsifier, Humectant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	
SORBITOL	420(i)	200000		4	Bulking agent, Humectant, Sequestrant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
SORBITOL SYRUP	420(ii)	200000		4	Bulking agent, Humectant, Sequestrant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	
XYLITOL	967	30000		4	Emulsifier, Humectant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	

Category No. 01.4.2 (Sterilized and UHT creams, whipping and whipped creams, and reduced fat creams (plain))

Corresponding commodity standards: CODEX STAN 288-1976: Lists specific acidity regulators, emulsifiers, packing gases, propellants, stabilizers, and thickeners

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ERYTHRITOL	968	600000		4	Flavour enhancer, Humectant, Sweetener	Discontinue
LACTITOL	966	30000		4	Emulsifier, Sweetener, Thickener	
MALTITOL	965(i)	300000		4	Bulking agent, Emulsifier, Humectant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	
MALTITOL SYRUP	965(ii)	300000		4	Bulking agent, Emulsifier, Humectant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	
SORBITOL	420(i)	200000		4	Bulking agent, Humectant, Sequestrant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
SORBITOL SYRUP	420(ii)	200000		4	Bulking agent, Humectant, Sequestrant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	
XYLITOL	967	30000		4	Emulsifier, Humectant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	

Category No. 01.4.4 (Cream analogues)

Corresponding commodity standards: None

Horizontal approach for sweeteners (CCFA52 CRD4 Annex 1): The use of sweeteners in this food category is justified on a general basis with Note 477 or 478 as appropriate, and a New Note "For use in flavoured and/or sweetened products only."

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ADVANTAME	969	10	478, add Note 68 "For use in flavoured and/or sweetened products only"	2	Flavour enhancer, Sweetener	Adopt as listed

Category No. 01.5.2 (Milk and cream powder analogues)

Corresponding commodity standards: Codex STAN 251-2006: Lists specific acidity regulators, stabilizers, emulsifiers, antioxidants, and anticaking agents

Horizontal approach for sweeteners (CCFA52 CRD4 Annex 1): The use of sweeteners in this food category is justified on a general basis with Note 477 or 478 as appropriate, Note XS251 and New Note "For use in flavoured and/or sweetened milk powder analogues only."

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ADVANTAME	969	20	478, XS251, New Note "For use in flavoured and/or sweetened milk powder analogues only"	2	Flavour enhancer, Sweetener	Adopt as listed
SUCRALOSE (TRICHLOROGAL ACTOSUCROSE)		400	478, XS251, New Note "For use in flavoured and/or sweetened milk powder analogues only"	3	Flavour enhancer, Sweetener	Adopt as listed

Category No. 01.6.1 (Unripened cheese)

Corresponding commodity standards: **CODEX STAN 221-2001:** Lists specific colours, acidity regulators, stabilizers, thickeners, preservatives, foaming agents, and anticaking agents, **CODEX STAN 262-2007:** Lists specific colours, acidity regulators, stabilizers, thickeners, preservatives, and anticaking agents, **CODEX STAN 273-1968:** Lists specific acidity regulators, stabilizers, and preservatives, **CODEX STAN 275-1973:** Lists specific colours, acidity regulators, stabilizers, thickeners, emulsifiers, preservatives, and foaming agents

Horizontal approach for sweeteners (CCFA52 CRD4 Annex 1): The use of sweeteners in this food category is justified on a general basis with Note 477 or 478 as appropriate, Notes XS221, XS273, XS275, XS262 and Note 201 "For use in flavoured products only".

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ADVANTAME	969	10	478, 201, XS221, XS273, XS275, XS262	2	Flavour enhancer, Sweetener	Adopt as listed

Category No. 01.6.5 (Cheese analogues)

Corresponding commodity standards: None

Horizontal approach for sweeteners (CCFA52 CRD4 Annex 1): No information provided on use of sweeteners in this food category.

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ADVANTAME	969	10		2	Flavour enhancer, Sweetener	Discontinue

Category No. 02.3 (Fat emulsions mainly of type oil-in-water, including mixed and/or flavoured products based on fat emulsions)

Corresponding commodity standards: None

Horizontal approach for sweeteners (CCFA52 CRD4 Annex 1): No information provided on use of sweeteners in this food category.

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ADVANTAME	969	10		2	Flavour enhancer, Sweetener	Discontinue

Category No. 02.4 (Fat-based desserts excluding dairy-based dessert products of food category 01.7)

Corresponding commodity standards: None

Horizontal approach for sweeteners (CCFA52 CRD4 Annex 1): The use of sweeteners in this food category is justified on a general basis with Note 477 or 478 as appropriate.

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ADVANTAME	969	10		2	Flavour enhancer, Sweetener	Adopt, add Note 478

Category No. 04.1.1.2 (Surface-treated fresh fruit)

Corresponding commodity standards: CODEX STAN 143-1985: Lists specific emulsifiers

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ISOMALT (HYDROGENATED ISOMALTULOSE)	953	GMP	16	7	Anticaking agent, Bulking agent, Glazing agent, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	Discontinue
MALTITOL	965(i)	GMP		4	Bulking agent, Emulsifier, Humectant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	
MALTITOL SYRUP	965(ii)	GMP		4	Bulking agent, Emulsifier, Humectant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	
MANNITOL	421	GMP		4	Anticaking agent, Bulking agent, Humectant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	
SORBITOL	420(i)	GMP	16	7	Bulking agent, Humectant, Sequestrant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	
SORBITOL SYRUP	420(ii)	GMP	16	7	Bulking agent, Humectant, Sequestrant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	
XYLITOL	967	GMP	16	7	Emulsifier, Humectant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	

Category No. 04.1.2.1 (Frozen fruit)

Corresponding commodity standards: **CODEX STAN 052-1981:** Lists ascorbic acid and citric acid, **CODEX STAN 069-1981:** No food additives permitted, **CODEX STAN 075-1981:** Lists ascorbic acid and citric acid, **CODEX STAN 076-1981:** No food additives permitted, **CODEX STAN 103-1981:** No food additives permitted

Horizontal approach for sweeteners (CCFA52 CRD4 Annex 1): The use of sweeteners in this food category is justified on a general basis with Note 477 or 478 as appropriate, and New Note "For use in products in a syrup or juice only."

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
----------	-----	-------------------	-------	----------------	----------------------	--------------------

ADVANTAME	969	20	478, New Note: For use in products in a syrup or juice only”	2	Flavour enhancer, Sweetener	Adopt as listed
STEVIOL GLYCOSIDES	960a, 960b(i)	40	26, 464, 477, New Note: For use in products in a syrup or juice only”	3	Sweetener	Adopt as listed

Category No. 04.1.2.2 (Dried fruit)

Corresponding commodity standards: CODEX STAN 067-1981: Lists sulphur dioxide, mineral oil, and sorbitol, CODEX STAN 130-1981: Lists sorbic acid and its sodium and potassium salts, CODEX STAN 177-1991: Lists sulphur dioxide

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ADVANTAME	969	20		2	Flavour enhancer, Sweetener	Discontinue

Category No. 04.1.2.3 (Fruit in vinegar, oil, or brine)

Corresponding commodity standards: CODEX STAN 260-2007: Acidity regulators, antifoaming agents, antioxidants, colours, colour retention agents, firming agents, flavour enhancers, preservatives, sequestrants, stabilizers and sweeteners used in accordance with Tables 1 and 2 of the General Standard of Food Additives (CXS 192-1995) in the food category in which the individual pickled fruit or vegetable fall into (i.e., one of the following categories: 04.1.2.3, 04.1.2.10, 04.2.2.3, and 04.2.2.7) or listed in Table 3 of the General Standard are acceptable for use in foods conforming to this Standard.

Horizontal approach for sweeteners (CCFA52 CRD4 Annex 1): The use of sweeteners in this food category is justified on a general basis with Note 144 (“For use in sweet and sour products only”).

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ADVANTAME	969	3	144	2	Flavour enhancer, Sweetener	Adopt as listed

Category No. 04.1.2.4 (Canned or bottled (pasteurized) fruit)

Corresponding commodity standards: CODEX STAN 017-1981: Lists specific acidifying agents, antioxidants, and flavourings, **CODEX STAN 042-1981:** Lists specific flavours, acidifying agents, and anti-foaming agents, **CODEX STAN 060-1981:** Lists specific colours, **CODEX STAN 061-1981:** Lists specific acidifying agents and colours (permitted only in special holiday packs), **CODEX STAN 062-1987:** Lists specific acidifying agents, colours, and firming agents, **CODEX STAN 078-1981:** Lists specific colours, flavourings, and antioxidants, **CODEX STAN 099-1981:** Lists specific colouring matter, flavourings, antioxidants, acidifying agents, and firming agents, **CODEX STAN 159-1987:** Lists specific colour, acidifying agent, antioxidant, and firming agents, **CODEX STAN 242-2003:** Lists specific acidifying agents, antioxidants, colours, and flavourings, **CODEX STAN 254-2007:** Acidity regulators and firming agents used in accordance with Tables 1 and 2 of the General Standard of Food Additives (CODEX STAN 192-1995) in food category 04.1.2.4 (Canned or bottled (pasteurized) fruit) or listed in Table 3 of the General Standard for Food Additives are acceptable for use in foods conforming to this Standard.

Horizontal approach for sweeteners (CCFA52 CRD4 Annex 1): The use of sweeteners in this food category is justified on a general basis with Note 477 or 478 as appropriate.

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ADVANTAME	969	10	478	2	Flavour enhancer, Sweetener	Adopt as listed

Category No. 04.1.2.7 (Candied fruit)

Corresponding commodity standards: None

Horizontal approach for sweeteners (CCFA52 CRD4 Annex 1): The use of sweeteners in this food category is justified on a general basis with Note 477 or 478 as appropriate

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ADVANTAME	969	20	478	2	Flavour enhancer, Sweetener	Adopt as listed

Category No. 04.1.2.11 (Fruit fillings for pastries)

Corresponding commodity standards: None

Horizontal approach for sweeteners (CCFA52 CRD4 Annex 1): The use of sweeteners in this food category is justified on a general basis with Note 477 or 478 as appropriate

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ADVANTAME	969	10	478	2	Flavour enhancer, Sweetener	Adopt as listed

Category No. 04.2.1.2 (Surface-treated fresh vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds)

Corresponding commodity standards: CODEX STAN 330-2018 (does not discuss food additives)

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ISOMALT (HYDROGENATED ISOMALTULOSE)	953	GMP	16	7	Anticaking agent, Bulking agent, Glazing agent, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	Discontinue
MALTITOL	965(i)	GMP		4	Bulking agent, Emulsifier, Humectant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	
MALTITOL SYRUP	965(ii)	GMP		4	Bulking agent, Emulsifier, Humectant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	
MANNITOL	421	GMP		4	Anticaking agent, Bulking agent, Humectant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	
SORBITOL	420(i)	GMP	16	7	Bulking agent, Humectant, Sequestrant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	
SORBITOL SYRUP	420(ii)	GMP	16	7	Bulking agent, Humectant, Sequestrant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	
XYLITOL	967	GMP	16	7	Emulsifier, Humectant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	

Category No. 04.2.2.1 (Frozen vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds and nuts and seeds)

Corresponding commodity standards: **CODEX STAN 038-1981:** Lists acetic acid, lactic acid, citric acid, and ascorbic acid, **CODEX STAN 041-1981:** Lists natural flavours and their identical synthetic equivalents except those which are known to represent a toxic hazard, **CODEX STAN 077-1981:** No food additives permitted, **CODEX STAN 104-1981:** No food additives permitted, **CODEX STAN 110-1981:** No food additives permitted, **CODEX STAN 111-1981:** Citric acid or malic acid, as processing aids for use in the blanching or cooling water in accordance with GMP, **CODEX STAN 112-1981:** No food additives permitted, **CODEX STAN 113-1981:** No food additives permitted, **CODEX STAN 114-1981:** Lists specific sequestrants and processing aids, **CODEX STAN 132-1981:** Citric or malic acid, as processing aids for use in the blanching or cooling water in accordance with GMP, **CODEX STAN 133-1981:** Citric or malic acid, as processing aids for use in the blanching or cooling water in accordance with GMP, **CODEX STAN 140-1983:** Lists specific processing aids

Horizontal approach for sweeteners (CCFA52 CRD4 Annex 1): No information provided on use of sweeteners in this food category.

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ADVANTAME	969	10		2	Flavour enhancer, Sweetener	Discontinue
STEVIOL GLYCOSIDES	960a, 960b(i)	40	26	3	Sweetener	Discontinue

Category No. 04.2.2.2 (Dried vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds)

Corresponding commodity standards: **CODEX STAN 038-1981:** Lists acetic acid, lactic acid, citric acid, and ascorbic acid, **CODEX STAN 039-1981:** No food additives permitted, **CODEX STAN 295R-2009:** No food additives permitted

Horizontal approach for sweeteners (CCFA52 CRD4 Annex 1): The use of sweeteners in this food category is justified on a general basis with Note 144 ("For use in sweet and sour products only") and new Note "For general use in dried seaweed only."

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ADVANTAME	969	10	144, New Note: "For general use in dried seaweed only"	2	Flavour enhancer, Sweetener	Adopt as listed

Category No. 04.2.2.3 (Vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds in vinegar, oil, brine, or soybean sauce)

Corresponding commodity standards: None

Horizontal approach for sweeteners (CCFA52 CRD4 Annex 1): The use of sweeteners in this food category is justified on a general basis with Note 144 (“For use in sweet and sour products only”).

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ADVANTAME	969	3	144	2	Flavour enhancer, Sweetener	Adopt as listed

Category No. 04.2.2.4 (Canned or bottled (pasteurized) or retort pouch vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds)

Corresponding commodity standards: None

Horizontal approach for sweeteners (CCFA52 CRD4 Annex 1): The use of sweeteners in this food category is justified on a general basis with Note 477 or 478 as appropriate.

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ADVANTAME	969	10	478	2	Flavour enhancer, Sweetener	Adopt as listed

Category No. 04.2.2.5 (Vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed purees and spreads (e.g. peanut butter))

Corresponding commodity standards: CODEX STAN 057-1981: Lists specific acidity regulators

Horizontal approach for sweeteners (CCFA52 CRD4 Annex 1): The use of sweeteners in this food category is justified on a general basis with Note 477 or 478 as appropriate.

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ADVANTAME	969	10	478	2	Flavour enhancer, Sweetener	Adopt as listed, add Note XS57 Refer matter of adding XS57 to other provisions in FC 04.2.2.5 to Alignment WG.

Category No. 04.2.2.6 (Vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed pulps and preparations (e.g. vegetable desserts and sauces, candied vegetables) other than food category 04.2.2.5))

Corresponding commodity standards: CODEX STAN 038-1981: Lists acetic acid, lactic acid, citric acid, and ascorbic acid, **CODEX STAN 057-1981:** Lists specific acidity regulators, **CODEX STAN 259R-2007:** No food additives listed, **CODEX STAN 308R-2011:** No food additives permitted, **CODEX STAN 321-2015:** No food additives permitted

Horizontal approach for sweeteners (CCFA52 CRD4 Annex 1): The use of sweeteners in this food category is justified on a general basis with Note 477 or 478 as appropriate.

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ADVANTAME	969	10	478	2	Flavour enhancer, Sweetener	Adopt as listed, add Notes XS38, XS57, XS259R, XS308R, XS321 Refer matter of adding XS38, XS57, XS259R, XS308R, XS321 to other provisions in FC 04.2.2.6 to Alignment WG.

Category No. 04.2.2.7 (Fermented vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and seaweed products, excluding fermented soybean products of food categories 06.8.6, 06.8.7, 12.9.1, 12.9.2.1 and 12.9.2.3)

Corresponding commodity standards: None

Horizontal approach for sweeteners (CCFA52 CRD4 Annex 1): The use of sweeteners in this food category is justified on a general basis with Note 144 (“For use in sweet and sour products only”).

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ADVANTAME	969	25	144	2	Flavour enhancer, Sweetener	Adopt as listed
ISOMALT (HYDROGENATED ISOMALTULOSE)	953	50000	144	4	Bulking agent, Flavour enhancer	Discontinue
LACTITOL	966	10000	144	4	Emulsifier, Sweetener, Thickener	Discontinue
MALTITOL	965(i)	100000	144	4	Bulking agent, Emulsifier, Humectant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	Discontinue

MALTITOL SYRUP	965(ii)	100000	144	4	Bulking agent, Emulsifier, Humectant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	Discontinue
SORBITOL	420(i)	70000	144	4	Bulking agent, Humectant, Sequestrant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	Discontinue
SORBITOL SYRUP	420(ii)	70000	144	4	Bulking agent, Humectant, Sequestrant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	Discontinue
THAUMATIN	957	GMP	144	4	Flavour enhancer, Sweetener	Adopt as listed. Sweeteners are allowed in this FC with Note 144, Thaumatin is a Table 3 additive, and no specific concerns have been raised as to why a numeric use level would be necessary.
XYLITOL	967	10000	144	4	Emulsifier, Humectant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	Discontinue

Category No. 04.2.2.8 (Cooked or fried vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds)

Corresponding commodity standards: None

Horizontal approach for sweeteners (CCFA52 CRD4 Annex 1): The use of sweeteners in this food category is justified on a general basis with Note 477 or 478 as appropriate; existing Note 144 (“For use in sweet and sour products only”), and New note “For use in curried products only”.

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ADVANTAME	969	10	478, 144, Note 345 “for use in curried products only”	2	Flavour enhancer, Sweetener	Adopt as listed

Category No. 05.1.2 (Cocoa mixes (syrops))

Corresponding commodity standards: None

Horizontal approach for sweeteners (CCFA52 CRD4 Annex 1): The use of sweeteners in this food category is justified on a general basis with Note 477 or 478 as appropriate.

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ADVANTAME	969	10	478	2	Flavour enhancer, Sweetener	Adopt as listed, add Note 97 "on the final cocoa or chocolate product basis"

Category No. 05.1.5 (Imitation chocolate, chocolate substitute products)

Corresponding commodity standards: None

Horizontal approach for sweeteners (CCFA52 CRD4 Annex 1): The use of sweeteners in this food category is justified on a general basis with Note 477 or 478 as appropriate

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ADVANTAME	969	30	478	2	Flavour enhancer, Sweetener	Adopt as listed

Category No. 06.4.1 (Fresh pastas and noodles and like products)

Corresponding commodity standards: None

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
SORBITOL	420(i)	35000		4	Bulking agent, Humectant, Sequestrant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	Discontinue
SORBITOL SYRUP	420(ii)	35000		4	Bulking agent, Humectant, Sequestrant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	Discontinue

Category No. 06.4.2 (Dried pastas and noodles and like products)

Corresponding commodity standards: None

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ISOMALT (HYDROGENATED ISOMALTULOSE)	953	GMP		7	Anticaking agent, Bulking agent, Glazing agent, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	Discontinue
LACTITOL	966	GMP		7	Emulsifier, Sweetener, Thickener	
MALTITOL	965(i)	GMP		7	Bulking agent, Emulsifier, Humectant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	
MALTITOL SYRUP	965(ii)	GMP		7	Bulking agent, Emulsifier, Humectant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	
SORBITOL	420(i)	GMP		7	Bulking agent, Humectant, Sequestrant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	
SORBITOL SYRUP	420(ii)	GMP		7	Bulking agent, Humectant, Sequestrant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	
STEVIOL GLYCOSIDES	960a, 960b(i)	200	26	3	Sweetener	Discontinue
XYLITOL	967	GMP		7	Emulsifier, Humectant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	Discontinue

Category No. 06.5 (Cereal and starch based desserts (e.g. rice pudding, tapioca pudding))

Corresponding commodity standards: None

Horizontal approach for sweeteners (CCFA52 CRD4 Annex 1): The use of sweeteners in this food category is justified on a general basis with Note 477 or 478 as appropriate

Additive	INS	Max Level	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
----------	-----	-----------	-------	----------------	----------------------	--------------------

		(mg/kg)				
ADVANTAME	969	10	478	2	Flavour enhancer, Sweetener	Adopt as listed

Category No. 07.2 (Fine bakery wares (sweet, salty, savoury) and mixes)

Corresponding commodity standards: None

Horizontal approach for sweeteners (CCFA52 CRD4 Annex 1): The use of sweeteners in this food category is justified on a general basis with Note 477 or 478 as appropriate

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ADVANTAME	969	17	165, 478	2	Flavour enhancer, Sweetener	Adopt as listed
STEVIOL GLYCOSIDES	960a, 960b(i)	350	26, 477	3	Sweetener	Adopt as listed

Category No. 08.1 (Fresh meat, poultry, and game)

Corresponding commodity standards: None

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
LACTITOL	966	GMP		4	Emulsifier, Sweetener, Thickener	Discontinue
MALTITOL	965(i)	GMP		4	Bulking agent, Emulsifier, Humectant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	
MALTITOL SYRUP	965(ii)	GMP		4	Bulking agent, Emulsifier, Humectant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	

Category No. 08.1.1 (Fresh meat, poultry, and game, whole pieces or cuts)

Corresponding commodity standards: None

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ISOMALT (HYDROGENATED ISOMALTULOSE)	953	GMP	16	7	Anticaking agent, Bulking agent, Glazing agent, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	Discontinue
SORBITOL	420(i)	GMP	16	7	Bulking agent, Humectant, Sequestrant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	
SORBITOL SYRUP	420(ii)	GMP	16	7	Bulking agent, Humectant, Sequestrant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	
XYLITOL	967	GMP	16	7	Emulsifier, Humectant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	

Category No. 08.1.2 (Fresh meat, poultry, and game, comminuted)

Corresponding commodity standards: None

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ISOMALT (HYDROGENATED ISOMALTULOSE)	953	GMP		7	Anticaking agent, Bulking agent, Glazing agent, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	Discontinue
SORBITOL	420(i)	5000		7	Bulking agent, Humectant, Sequestrant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	
SORBITOL SYRUP	420(ii)	5000		7	Bulking agent, Humectant, Sequestrant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
XYLITOL	967	GMP		7	Emulsifier, Humectant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	

Category No. 08.2 (Processed meat, poultry, and game products in whole pieces or cuts)

Corresponding commodity standards: None; Corresponding commodity standard to subcategory 08.2.2 (CODEX STAN 96-1981, CODEX STAN 97-1981)

Horizontal approach for sweeteners – subcategory 08.2.2 (CCFA52 CRD4 Annex 1): The use of additives for sweetener function in this food category **is not** justified on a general basis. The use of additives for flavour enhancer function that also have associated sweetener function in this food category is justified on a general basis with Notes XS88, XS89, XS98, and new note “For use as flavour enhancer only.”

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
STEVIOL GLYCOSIDES	960a, 960b(i)	80	26 & 200	3	Sweetener	Discontinue

Category No. 09.1 (Fresh fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms)

Corresponding commodity standards: None; Corresponding commodity standard to subcategory 09.1.2 (CODEX STAN 292-2008, CODEX STAN 312-2013, CODEX STAN 315-2014)

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ISOMALT (HYDROGENATED ISOMALTULOSE)	953	GMP	16	7	Anticaking agent, Bulking agent, Glazing agent, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	Discontinue
LACTITOL	966	GMP		4	Emulsifier, Sweetener, Thickener	

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
MALTITOL	965(i)	GMP		4	Bulking agent, Emulsifier, Humectant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	
MALTITOL SYRUP	965(ii)	GMP		4	Bulking agent, Emulsifier, Humectant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	
SORBITOL	420(i)	GMP	16	7	Bulking agent, Humectant, Sequestrant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	
SORBITOL SYRUP	420(ii)	GMP	16	7	Bulking agent, Humectant, Sequestrant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	
XYLITOL	967	GMP	16	7	Emulsifier, Humectant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	

Category No. 09.2 (Processed fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms)

Corresponding commodity standards: None; Corresponding commodity standard to subcategory 09.2.1, 09.2.2, and 09.2.5 (CODEX STAN 36-1981, CODEX STAN 92-1981, CODEX STAN 95-1981, CODEX STAN 165-1989, CODEX STAN 190-1995, CODEX STAN 191-1995, and CODEX STAN 165-1989)

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ADVANTAME	969	3	144	2	Flavour enhancer, Sweetener	Adopt as listed
ERYTHRITOL	968	200000		4	Flavour enhancer, Humectant, Sweetener	Discontinue
ISOMALT (HYDROGENATED ISOMALTULOSE)	953	100000		4	Anticaking agent, Bulking agent, Glazing agent, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
LACTITOL	956	20000		4	Emulsifier, Sweetener, Thickener	
SORBITOL	420(i)	500		4	Bulking agent, Humectant, Sequestrant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	Move to FC 09.2.4. Adopt as listed with Note 144, 322, 241, and New Note: "Except for use in octopus with wasabi at 50,000 mg/kg" and new note "For use in cooked molluscs only".
SORBITOL SYRUP	420(ii)	500		4	Bulking agent, Humectant, Sequestrant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	Discontinue

Category No. 09.2.1 (Frozen fish, fish fillets, and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms)

Horizontal Approach (FA/45 CRD2 Appendix IV, FA/46 CRD 2 Appendix II): Acidity regulators justified on a case-by-case basis, ES&T are justified with Note 29 "For non-standardized food only"

Corresponding commodity standards: **CODEX STAN 36-1981:** Lists specific antioxidants; **CODEX STAN 92-1981, CODEX STAN 95-1981:** Lists specific humectants, preservatives and antioxidants; **CODEX STAN 165-1989:** Lists specific humectants, antioxidants, acidity regulators and thickeners; **CODEX STAN 190-1995:** Lists specific humectants and antioxidants; **CODEX STAN 191-1995:** No additives permitted; **292-2008:** No additives permitted in Live Bivalve Molluscs, Raw Bivalve Molluscs allows antioxidants from FC 09.1.2 and 09.2.1; **CODEX STAN 312-2013:** No additives permitted; **CODEX STAN 315-2014:** No additives permitted except Phosphates in Quick Frozen Scallop Meat and Quick Frozen Roe-on Scallop Meat Processed With Phosphates

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ISOMALT (HYDROGENATED ISOMALTULOSE)	953	GMP		7	Anticaking agent, Bulking agent, Glazing agent, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	Discontinue
LACTITOL	956	GMP		7	Emulsifier, Sweetener, Thickener	
MALTITOL	965(i)	GMP		7	Bulking agent, Emulsifier, Humectant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
MALTITOL SYRUP	965(ii)	GMP		7	Bulking agent, Emulsifier, Humectant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	
SORBITOL	420(i)	GMP		7	Bulking agent, Humectant, Sequestrant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	
SORBITOL SYRUP	420(ii)	GMP		7	Bulking agent, Humectant, Sequestrant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	
XYLITOL	967	GMP		7	Emulsifier, Humectant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	

Category No. 09.2.2 (Frozen battered fish, fish fillets, and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms)

Horizontal Approach (FA/45 CRD2 Appendix IV, FA/46 CRD 2 Appendix II): Acidity regulators are justified; ES&T are justified with Note 29 “For non-standardized food only”

Corresponding commodity standards: CODEX STAN 166-1989: Lists specific humectants, antioxidants, acidity regulators, thickeners, raising agents, flavour enhancers, colours and emulsifiers

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ISOMALT (HYDROGENATED ISOMALTULOSE)	953	GMP	16	7	Anticaking agent, Bulking agent, Glazing agent, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	Discontinue
MALTITOL	965(i)	GMP		4	Bulking agent, Emulsifier, Humectant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	
MALTITOL SYRUP	965(ii)	GMP		4	Bulking agent, Emulsifier, Humectant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
SORBITOL	420(i)	GMP	16	7	Bulking agent, Humectant, Sequestrant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	
SORBITOL SYRUP	420(ii)	GMP	16	7	Bulking agent, Humectant, Sequestrant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	
XYLITOL	967	GMP	16	7	Emulsifier, Humectant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	

Category No. 09.2.3 (Frozen minced and creamed fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms)

Horizontal Approach (FA/45 CRD2 Appendix IV, FA/46 CRD 2 Appendix II): Acidity regulators are justified; ES&T are justified

Corresponding commodity standards: None

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ISOMALT (HYDROGENATED ISOMALTULOSE)	953	GMP	16	7	Anticaking agent, Bulking agent, Glazing agent, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	Discontinue
MALTITOL	965(i)	GMP		4	Bulking agent, Emulsifier, Humectant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	
MALTITOL SYRUP	965(ii)	GMP		4	Bulking agent, Emulsifier, Humectant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	
SORBITOL	420(i)	GMP	16	7	Bulking agent, Humectant, Sequestrant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	Adopt with Note 241 "For use in surimi products only".

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
SORBITOL SYRUP	420(ii)	GMP	16	7	Bulking agent, Humectant, Sequestrant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	Adopt with Note 241 "For use in surimi products only".
XYLITOL	967	GMP	16	7	Emulsifier, Humectant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	Discontinue

Category No. 09.2.4 (Cooked and/or fried fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms)

Horizontal Approach (FA/45 CRD2 Appendix IV, FA/46 CRD 2 Appendix II): Acidity regulators are justified, ES&T are not justified

Corresponding commodity standards: None

Horizontal approach for sweeteners – subcategory 09.2.4.1 (CCFA52 CRD4 Annex 1): The use of additives for sweetener function in this food category is justified on a general basis with Note 477 or 478 as appropriate, and new note "For use in cooked products boiled with soy sauce only."

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
MALTITOL	965(i)	GMP		4	Bulking agent, Emulsifier, Humectant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	Discontinue
MALTITOL SYRUP	965(ii)	GMP		4	Bulking agent, Emulsifier, Humectant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	

Category No. 09.2.4.1 (Cooked fish and fish products)

Corresponding commodity standards: None

Horizontal approach for sweeteners (CCFA52 CRD4 Annex 1): The use of additives for sweetener function in this food category is justified on a general basis with Note 477 or 478 as appropriate, and new note "For use in cooked products boiled with soy sauce only."

Additive	INS	Max Level	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
----------	-----	-----------	-------	----------------	----------------------	--------------------

		(mg/kg)				
ISOMALT (HYDROGENATED ISOMALTULOSE)	953	GMP	478, Note 322 “For use in cooked products boiled with soy sauce only”	7	Bulking agent, Flavour enhancer	Adopt as listed
SORBITOL	420(i)	35000	477, Note 322 “For use in cooked products boiled with soy sauce only”	7	Bulking agent, Humectant, Sequestrant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	Discontinue (see recommendation in FC 09.2 to move provision and adopt in FC 09.2.4).
SORBITOL SYRUP	420(ii)	35000	477, Note 322 “For use in cooked products boiled with soy sauce only”	7	Bulking agent, Humectant, Sequestrant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	Discontinue
STEVIOL GLYCOSIDES	960a, 960b(i)	70	26, 208, 477, Note 322: “For use in cooked products boiled with soy sauce only”	3	Sweetener	Adopt at 240 mg/kg, with Notes 26, 477, 322, and 241 “For use in surimi products only”, and remove Note 208
XYLITOL	967	GMP	477, New Note: “For use in cooked products boiled with soy sauce only”	7	Emulsifier, Humectant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	Discontinue

Category No. 09.2.4.2 (Cooked mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms)

Horizontal Approach (FA/45 CRD2 Appendix IV, FA/46 CRD 2 Appendix II): Acidity regulators are justified, ES&T are not justified

Corresponding commodity standards: None

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ISOMALT (HYDROGENATED ISOMALTULOSE)	953	GMP		7	Anticaking agent, Bulking agent, Glazing agent, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	Discontinue
SORBITOL	420(i)	GMP		7	Bulking agent, Humectant, Sequestrant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	Discontinue – see recommendation in FC 09.2 to move and adopt in FC 09.2.4
SORBITOL SYRUP	420(ii)	GMP		7	Bulking agent, Humectant, Sequestrant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	Adopt with new note “for use in cooked molluscs only”
STEVIOL GLYCOSIDES	960a, 960b(i)	165	26, 208	3	Sweetener	Adopt as listed; remove note 208.
XYLITOL	967	GMP		7	Emulsifier, Humectant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	Discontinue

Category No. 09.2.4.3 (Fried fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms)

Horizontal Approach (FA/45 CRD2 Appendix IV, FA/46 CRD 2 Appendix II): Acidity regulators are justified; ES&T are justified with the Note 41 “For use in breading or batter coatings only”.

Corresponding commodity standards: None

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ISOMALT (HYDROGENATED ISOMALTULOSE)	953	GMP	16	7	Anticaking agent, Bulking agent, Glazing agent, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	Discontinue
SORBITOL	420(i)	GMP	16	7	Bulking agent, Humectant, Sequestrant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	Discontinue – see recommendation in FC 09.2 to move and adopt in FC 09.2.4

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
SORBITOL SYRUP	420(ii)	GMP	16	7	Bulking agent, Humectant, Sequestrant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	Discontinue
STEVIOLE GLYCOSIDES	960a, 960b(i)	250		4	Sweetener	Adopt as listed, Add Notes 26 and 241.
XYLITOL	967	GMP	16	7	Emulsifier, Humectant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	Discontinue

Category No. 09.2.5 (Smoked, dried, fermented, and/or salted fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms)

Horizontal Approach (FA/45 CRD2 Appendix IV, FA/46 CRD 2 Appendix II): Acidity regulators are justified, with note 267 “Excluding products conforming to the Standard for Salted Fish and Dried Salted Fish of the Gadidae Family of Fishes (CODEX STAN 167-1989), the Standard for Dried Shark Fins (CODEX STAN 189-1993), the Standard for Crackers from marine and Freshwater Fish, Crustaceans and Molluscan Shellfish (CODEX STAN 222-2001) and the Standard for Boiled Dried Salted Anchovies (CODEX STAN 236-2003)”; ES&T justified with the note 300 “For use in salted squid only”.

Corresponding commodity standards: **CODEX STAN 167-1989:** Lists Sorbates with the function of preservatives; **CODEX STAN 189-1993:** No additives permitted; **CODEX STAN 222-2001:** Lists specific sequestrants and flavour enhancers; **CODEX STAN 236-2003:** No additives permitted; **CODEX STAN 244-2004:** Lists specific acidity regulators and preservatives; **CODEX STAN 311-2013:** Lists specific acidity regulators, antioxidants, colours, packaging gases and preservatives in Smoked fish and Smoke-flavoured fish, No additives permitted in Smoked-Dried Fish

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ISOMALT (HYDROGENATED ISOMALTULOSE)	953	GMP		7	Anticaking agent, Bulking agent, Glazing agent, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	Discontinue
MALTITOL	965(i)	GMP		4	Bulking agent, Emulsifier, Humectant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	Adopt as listed, Add New Note: “For use in dried shredded squid and smoked squid only”
MALTITOL SYRUP	965(ii)	GMP		4	Bulking agent, Emulsifier, Humectant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	Adopt as listed, Add New Note: “For use in dried shredded squid and smoked squid only”

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
SORBITOL	420(i)	GMP		7	Bulking agent, Humectant, Sequestrant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	Adopt as listed
SORBITOL SYRUP	420(ii)	GMP		7	Bulking agent, Humectant, Sequestrant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	Adopt as listed.
STEVIOL GLYCOSIDES	960a, 960b(i)	165	26 & 208	3	Sweetener	Adopt as listed
XYLITOL	967	GMP		7	Emulsifier, Humectant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	Discontinue

Category No. 09.3 (Semi-preserved fish and fish products, including molluscs, crustaceans, and echinoderms)

Corresponding commodity standards: None

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ADVANTAME	969	3	144	2	Flavour enhancer, Sweetener	Adopt as listed, add XS291

Category No. 09.3.2 (Fish and fish products, including molluscs, crustaceans, and echinoderms, pickled and/or in brine)

Corresponding commodity standards: None

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
STEVIOL GLYCOSIDES	960a, 960b(i)	120	144	4	Sweetener	Discontinue as there is already an adopted provision for Steviol Glycosides in this FC with ML of 165 mg/kg and Note 26 "as steviol equivalents".

Food Category No. 09.3.3 Salmon substitutes, caviar, and other fish roe products

Corresponding commodity standards: 291-2010: Additives permitted except colours and texturizing agents, permit acidity regulators, antioxidants and preservatives listed in Table 3

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
STEVIOL GLYCOSIDES	960a, 960b(i)	120	144	4	Sweetener	Discontinue as already adopted provision in this FC.

Category No. 09.4 (Fully preserved, including canned or fermented fish and fish products, including molluscs, crustaceans, and echinoderms)

Corresponding commodity standards: None

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ADVANTAME	969	3	144	2	Flavour enhancer, Sweetener	Adopt as listed

Category No. 10.2.2 (Frozen egg products)

Horizontal approach: (FA/45 CRD2 Appendix IV, FA/46 CRD 2 Appendix II): The use of acidity regulators, emulsifiers, stabilizers, and thickeners is justified in this food category on a general basis.

Corresponding commodity standards: None

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
MALTITOL	965(i)	GMP		4	Bulking agent, Emulsifier, Humectant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	Discontinue
MALTITOL SYRUP	965(ii)	GMP		4	Bulking agent, Emulsifier, Humectant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	Adopt as listed with new note "For purpose other than sweetening"
SORBITOL	420(i)	GMP		7	Bulking agent, Humectant, Sequestrant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	Discontinue

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
SORBITOL SYRUP	420(ii)	GMP		7	Bulking agent, Humectant, Sequestrant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	Adopt as listed with new note "For purpose other than sweetening"

Food Category No. 11.3 Sugar solutions and syrups, also (partially) inverted, including treacle and molasses, excluding products of food category 11.1.3

Horizontal approach: (FA/45 CRD2 Appendix IV, FA/46 CRD 2 Appendix II): The use of acidity regulators, emulsifiers, stabilizers, and thickeners is **not** justified in this food category on a general basis.

Corresponding commodity standards: None

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ISOMALT (HYDROGENATED ISOMALTULOSE)	953	GMP		4	Anticaking agent, Bulking agent, Glazing agent, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	Discontinue

Category No. 11.4 (Other sugars and syrups (e.g. xylose, maple syrup, sugar toppings))

Corresponding commodity standards: None

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ADVANTAME	969	30	159, 478	2	Flavour enhancer, Sweetener	Adopt, remove Note 159 and add Note 258 "excluding maple syrup"
ISOMALT (HYDROGENATED ISOMALTULOSE)	953	GMP	478	7	Bulking agent, Flavour enhancer	Adopt, add Note 258 "excluding maple syrup"
LACTITOL	966	GMP	477	4	Emulsifier, Sweetener, Thickener	Adopt, add Note 258 "excluding maple syrup"

MALTITOL	965(i)	GMP	477	4	Bulking agent, Emulsifier, Humectant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	Adopt, add Note 258 “excluding maple syrup”
MALTITOL SYRUP	965(ii)	GMP	477	4	Bulking agent, Emulsifier, Humectant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	Adopt, add Note 258 “excluding maple syrup”
SORBITOL	420(i)	GMP	477	7	Bulking agent, Humectant, Sequestrant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	Adopt, add Note 258 “excluding maple syrup”
SORBITOL SYRUP	420(ii)	GMP	477	7	Bulking agent, Humectant, Sequestrant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	Adopt, add Note 258 “excluding maple syrup”
THAUMATIN	957	500	478	7	Flavour enhancer, Sweetener	Adopt at GMP with Note 478, add Note 258 “excluding maple syrup”
XYLITOL	967	GMP	477	7	Emulsifier, Humectant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	Adopt, add Note 258 “excluding maple syrup”

Food Category No. 11.6 Table-top sweeteners, including those containing high-intensity sweeteners

Corresponding commodity standards: None

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ADVANTAME	969	GMP		2	Flavour enhancer, Sweetener	Adopt as listed

Category No. 12.1.2 (Salt Substitutes)

Corresponding commodity standards: None

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ERYTHRITOL	968	200000		4	Flavour enhancer, Humectant, Sweetener	Discontinue

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ISOMALT (HYDROGENATED ISOMALTULOSE)	953	GMP		7	Anticaking agent, Bulking agent, Glazing agent, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	
LACTITOL	966	GMP		4	Emulsifier, Sweetener, Thickener	
MALTITOL	965(i)	50000		4	Bulking agent, Emulsifier, Humectant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	
MALTITOL SYRUP	965(ii)	50000		4	Bulking agent, Emulsifier, Humectant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	
SORBITOL	420(i)	GMP		7	Bulking agent, Humectant, Sequestrant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	
SORBITOL SYRUP	420(ii)	GMP		7	Bulking agent, Humectant, Sequestrant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	
THAUMATIN	957	400	51	7	Flavour enhancer, Sweetener	
XYLITOL	967	GMP		7	Emulsifier, Humectant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	Discontinue

Category No. 12.3 (Vinegars)

Corresponding commodity standards: None

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
----------	-----	-------------------	-------	----------------	----------------------	--------------------

ADVANTAME	969	30	478, Note 277 “For use in flavored vinegar and in rice vinegar only”	2	Flavour enhancer, Sweetener	Adopt as listed
-----------	-----	----	--	---	-----------------------------	-----------------

Category No. 12.4 (Mustards)

Corresponding commodity standards: None

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ADVANTAME		3.5		2	Flavour enhancer, Sweetener	Adopt as listed

Category No. 12.6 (Sauces and like products)

Corresponding commodity standards: None, Corresponding commodity standard to subcategory 12.6.2 and 12.6.4 (CODEX STAN 306R-2011 and CODEX STAN 302-2011)

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ADVANTAME		3.5		2	Flavour enhancer, Sweetener	Adopt as listed

Category No. 12.7 (Salads (e.g. macaroni salad, potato salad) and sandwich spreads excluding cocoa-and nutbased spreads of food categories 04.2.2.5 and 05.1.3)

Corresponding commodity standards: None

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ADVANTAME	969	3.5	166, 478	2	Flavour enhancer, Sweetener	Adopt as listed

Food Category No. 13.2 (Complementary foods for infants and young children)

Horizontal approach (FA/45 CRD2 Appendix IV, FA/46 CRD 2 Appendix II): The use of acidity regulators, emulsifiers, stabilizers, and thickeners is on a case-by-case basis

Corresponding commodity standards: CODEX STAN 73-1981: allows specific thickening agents, emulsifiers, pH adjusting agents, antioxidants and flavours; **CODEX STAN 74-1981:** allows specific emulsifiers, acidity regulators, antioxidants, raising agents, thickeners, anticaking agents and packaging gases.

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ISOMALT (HYDROGENATED ISOMALTULOSE)	953	100000		4	Anticaking agent, Bulking agent, Glazing agent, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	Discontinue
LACTITOL	956	GMP		7	Emulsifier, Sweetener, Thickener	
MALTITOL	965(i)	GMP		7	Bulking agent, Emulsifier, Humectant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	
MALTITOL SYRUP	965(ii)	GMP		7	Bulking agent, Emulsifier, Humectant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	
SORBITOL	420(i)	GMP		7	Bulking agent, Humectant, Sequestrant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	
SORBITOL SYRUP	420(ii)	GMP		7	Bulking agent, Humectant, Sequestrant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	
THAUMATIN	957	GMP		4	Flavour enhancer, Sweetener	Adopt at 2 mg/kg, add Note 478.
XYLITOL	967	GMP		7	Emulsifier, Humectant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	Discontinue

Category No. 13.3 (Dietetic foods intended for special medical purposes (excluding products of food category 13.1))

Corresponding commodity standards: CODEX STAN 118-1979 (does not discuss food additives)

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ADVANTAME	969	10		2	Flavour enhancer, Sweetener	Adopt as listed, add Note 478

Category No. 13.4 (Dietetic formulae for slimming purposes and weight reduction)

Corresponding commodity standards: CODEX STAN 181-1991: allows food additives generally; CODEX STAN203-1995: allows food additives generally

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ADVANTAME	969	8		2	Flavour enhancer, Sweetener	Adopt as listed, add Note 478

Category No. 13.5 (Dietetic foods (e.g. supplementary foods for dietary use) excluding products of food categories 13.1 - 13.4 and 13.6)

Corresponding commodity standards: None

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ADVANTAME	969	10		2	Flavour enhancer, Sweetener	Adopt as listed, add Note 478

Category No. 13.6 (Food supplements)

Corresponding commodity standards: None

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ADVANTAME	969	55		2	Flavour enhancer, Sweetener	Adopt as listed, add Note 478

Category No. 14.1.3.1 (Fruit nectar)

Corresponding commodity standards: CODEX STAN 247-2005: Food additives listed in Tables 1 and 2 of the Codex General Standard for Food Additives in Food Categories 14.1.2.1 (Fruit juice), 14.1.2.3 (Concentrates for fruit juice), 14.1.3.1 (Fruit nectar) and 14.1.3.3 (Concentrates for fruit nectar) may be used in foods subject to this Standard.

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ADVANTAME	969	6		2	Flavour enhancer, Sweetener	Adopt as listed, add Note 478
NEOTAME	961	65		2	Flavour enhancer, Sweetener	Adopt as listed, add Note 478

Category No. 14.1.3.2 (Vegetable nectar)

Corresponding commodity standards: None

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ADVANTAME	969	6	478	2	Flavour enhancer, Sweetener	Adopt as listed, add Note 478

Category No. 14.1.3.3 (Concentrates for fruit nectar)

Corresponding commodity standards: CODEX STAN 247-2005: Food additives listed in Tables 1 and 2 of the Codex General Standard for Food Additives in Food Categories 14.1.2.1 (Fruit juice), 14.1.2.3 (Concentrates for fruit juice), 14.1.3.1 (Fruit nectar) and 14.1.3.3 (Concentrates for fruit nectar) may be used in foods subject to this Standard.

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ADVANTAME	969	6	127	2	Flavour enhancer, Sweetener	Adopt as listed, add Note 478
NEOTAME		65		2	Flavour enhancer, Sweetener	Adopt, add Notes 478 and 127 "On the served to the consumer basis."

Category No. 14.1.3.4 (Concentrates for vegetable nectar)

Corresponding commodity standards: None

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ADVANTAME	969	6	127, 478	2	Flavour enhancer, Sweetener	Adopt as listed
SACCHARINS	954(I)-(iv)	80	127, 464-477	6	Sweetener	Adopt as listed

Category No. 14.2.1 (Beer and malt beverages)

Corresponding commodity standards: None

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
STEVIOL GLYCOSIDES	960a, 960b(i)	50	26	3	Sweetener	Adopt at 70 mg/kg with Note 26

Category No. 14.2.2 (Cider and perry)

Corresponding commodity standards: None

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
STEVIOL GLYCOSIDES	960a, 960b(i)	50	26	3	Sweetener	Discontinue

Category No. 14.2.3 (Grape wines)

Corresponding commodity standards: None

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
STEVIOLE GLYCOSIDES	960a, 960b(i)	160	26	3	Sweetener	Discontinue

Category No. 14.2.4 (Wines (other than grape))

Corresponding commodity standards: None

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
STEVIOLE GLYCOSIDES	960a, 960b(i)	160	26	3	Sweetener	Discontinue

Category No. 14.2.5 (Mead)

Corresponding commodity standards: None

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
STEVIOLE GLYCOSIDES	960a, 960b(i)	160	26	3	Sweetener	Discontinue

Category No. 14.2.6 (Distilled spirituous beverages containing more than 15% alcohol)

Corresponding commodity standards: None

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
STEVIOLE GLYCOSIDES	960a, 960b(i)	160	26	3	Sweetener	Adopt as listed, add Note 477

Category No. 14.2.7 (Aromatized alcoholic beverages (e.g. beer, wine and spirituous cooler-type beverages, low-alcoholic refreshers))

Corresponding commodity standards: None

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ADVANTAME	969	6	478	2	Flavour enhancer, Sweetener	Adopt as listed

Category No. 15.0 (Ready-to-eat savouries)

Corresponding commodity standards: None

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ADVANTAME	969	5	478	2	Flavour enhancer, Sweetener	Adopt as listed

Topic D: Horizontal approach to replace Note 161 in FCs 05.1.1, and 07.1 and 12.2 and their subcategories

Background: The 42nd session of the Codex Alimentarius Commission replaced Note 161 with alternative notes 477 and 478 in provisions for sweeteners in specific food categories in the GSFA. Notes 477 and 478 were utilized by CCFA51 and CCFA52 to replace Note 161 in specific food categories. In other food categories, CCFA52 limited the use of sweeteners to specific types of food in those food categories.

Note 477: Some Codex Members allow use of additives with sweetener function in all foods within this Food Category while others limit additives with sweetener function to those foods with significant energy reduction or no added sugars

Note 478: Some Codex Members allow use of additives with sweetener function in all foods within this Food Category while others limit additives with sweetener function to those foods with significant energy reduction or no added sugars. This limitation may not apply to the appropriate use as a flavour enhancer.

Category No. 05.1.1 (Cocoa mixes (powders) and cocoa mass/cake)

Corresponding commodity standards: CODEX STAN 105-1981: General Reference to GSFA for acidity regulators, emulsifiers, stabilizers, flavouring agents, anticaking agents, bulking agent, sweeteners, and thickeners; **CODEX STAN 141-1983:** General reference to GSFA for acidity regulators, emulsifiers, flavourings

General Background: This FC was not discussed by the EWG on Note 161. There are 2 commodity standards that correspond to this FC. CXS 141-1983 does not allow sweeteners, while CXS 105-1981 has a general reference to the GSFA that allows sweeteners listed in Tables 1 and 2, as well as those specifically listed in Table 3 of the GSFA. Previous to alignment CXS 105-1981 listed specific sweeteners. In FC 05.1.1 there are:

- adopted provisions for acesulfame potassium and aspartame (both originally adopted in 2007) that do not have Note 161, and an adopted provision for saccharin (adopted in 2008) that has Note 161 attached to it. All three were individually listed in CXS 105 prior to alignment.
- Draft provisions for advantame and steviol glycosides. Although CXS 105-1981 allowed the use of sweeteners, both of these additives were evaluated by JECFA after the additives list in CXS 105-1981 was formulated. For this reason, the use of advantame and steviol glycosides in foods conforming to CXS 105-1981 could not be considered by the Codex Committee on Cocoa Products and Chocolate (CCCPC). Since CCCPC has been adjourned *sine die* the use of advantame and steviol glycosides in foods conforming to CXS 105-1981 is under the purview of CCFA.

Chair's summary of comments to first and second circular: All comments submitted to the first circular were in favour of a horizontal approach to sweeteners in FC 05.1.1 where Note 161 is replaced with alternative notes 477 and 478 as appropriate (see comment compilation below). For the Second circular EWG Members were invited to comment on proposals which applied the horizontal approach to provisions for sweeteners in the step process in FC 05.1.1. All comments provided to the second circular agreed with the proposals.

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ADVANTAME	969	30	97	2	Flavour enhancer, Sweetener	Adopt with notes 97, 478, and XS141

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
SACCHARINS	954(i) – (iv)	100	97, 161, XS141	2016	Sweetener	Revise Adopted, Replace Note 161 with Note 477
STEVIOL GLYCOSIDES	960a, 960b(i)	350	26	3	Sweetener	Adopt with Notes 26, 97, 477, and XS141

Category No. 07.1 (Bread and ordinary bakery wares)

Corresponding commodity standards: None

General Background: The use of sweeteners in FC 07.1 and its subcategories were extensively discussed by the EWG on Note 161 to CCFA52 across four circulars. These circulars requested information on the use of sweeteners generally in FC 07.1, as well as in specific foods corresponding to specific subcategories. An analysis of comments submitted to those circulars indicates that the use of sweeteners is not limited to specific foods in specific subcategories, but rather sweeteners are used in products across FC 07.1 and its subcategories, including products are in international trade. Several EWG members opposed to the use of sweeteners in foods corresponding to FC 07.1 questioned the technological need as in their opinion these foods are not “sweet” products and therefore the use of added sugars is limited and cannot be wholly replaced by sweeteners as sugars are necessary substrate for yeasts and contribute to flavor and darkening of crusts through the Maillard reaction. These comments also raised exposure concerns as bread is a staple food consumed in high amounts. However, other members were in favor of the use of sweeteners in FC 07.1 and its subcategories. This Members claim there is sufficient technological justification for the use of sweeteners as partial replacement of sugar can still result in reduced calorie content without interfering with the technological need for sugar in this FC. These comments also compared exposure for select sweeteners from their use in this FC to the JECFA ADI to address concerns related to exposure.

First circular request and comment compilation:

First circular proposal for horizontal approach for sweeteners in FC 07.1 and subcategories:

- 1) Replace Note 161 with the new note: *“Some Codex Members do not allow the use of additives with sweetener function in foods within this Food Category based upon concerns related to technological justification.”*
 - EWG Members, and in particular those who would not agree with the above proposal on the wording of the alternative note are invited to provide a rationale for their disagreement and to suggest revisions to the above proposal.
- 2) Previous alternative notes have made exceptions for the use of additives with both sweetener and flavour enhancer function for their use as flavour enhancers (see for example Note 478). For those additives replace Note 161 with the above note, and the additional text: *“This may not apply to the appropriate use as a flavour enhancer”*.
 - EWG Members, and in particular those who do not agree with the use of sweeteners in foods corresponding to FC 07.1 and its subcategories, are invited to discuss if:
 - i. additives with both sweetener and flavour enhancer function are justified for use in FC 07.1 as flavour enhancers; and

- ii. if the above proposal on the wording of additional text to be added to the alternative note is sufficient to address an additive's use as a flavour enhancer, or to provide a rationale for their disagreement and to suggest revisions to the above proposal.

EWG Member comments on First Circular Proposal:

Australia (General Comment): Has serious reservations about this new proposed note. Codex food additive standards are intended to represent the global consensus and be globally applicable. This note appears to be providing an 'opt out' to the Codex standards in a similar way that was the case with Note 161. We believe that this could set an unfortunate precedent and the note is not supported.

In addition, we do not believe that the concerns previously expressed by some delegations in relation to sweeteners can be solely described as "relating to technological justification".

Intense sweeteners are permitted for this food category in Australia.

EU: The EU agrees with the analysis of the issue and thanks for a constructive suggestion for a note capturing the situation. The wording of the note is acceptable to the EU. The EU is not aware that flavour enhancers would be used and technologically justified in products falling within FC 07.1.

Indonesia: Indonesia supports 1st circular proposal

Japan: Japan supports the proposal to replace Note 161 with new note and the additional text for flavour enhancer. The use of sweeteners in FC 07.1 are technological justified as mentioned above.

Sucralose is used in food products within the Food Category 7.1.1. in Japan. In addition to calorie reduction, Sucralose is used to add a subtle sweetness to bread and to enhance the flavour of bread.

USA: the US does not support the 1st circular proposal. The adoption of a provision into the GSFA indicates that consensus has been reached within CCFA on the use of the additive in foods corresponding to that food category. The attachment of a note to an adopted provision which states that some members do not allow the use of the additive in the food category is not appropriate as it instead states that consensus has not been reached within the Committee and is in direct contradiction to the purpose of an adopted provision. The USA requests that the EWG continue discussion in the context of section 3.2 of the preamble of the GSFA on the use of sweeteners in FC 07.1 so that consensus can be reached on the appropriate use of sweeteners in this food category.

CCC: CCC does not agree with the proposals outlined above. Codex provisions and related notes are intended to reflect consensus reached by the Committee. The proposed language does not reflect a consensus position and is in conflict with Codex principles. CCC believes the use of sweeteners and flavour enhancers in FC 07.1 is justified and supports utilizing Notes 477 and 478. If consensus cannot be reached on the use of these alternative notes, CCC supports continued discussion around finding consensus wording.

IFAC: The International Food Additives Council (IFAC) does not support the proposed alternative notes to replace Note 161 in FC 07.1 and its subcategories (Annex 4). A key component of Codex is the adoption of consensus positions. The proposed new note wording implies a lack of consensus and creates a precedent that could impact other FCs and groups of additives. IFAC supports continued discussion within the EWG on other options.

ISC: ISC does not agree with the proposal as outlined above. ISC considers that the use of steviol glycosides in this food category is justified and it supports the use of the Notes 477 and 478. The Notes 477 and 478 represent the consensus reached at CCFA level as alternative notes

to Note 161. Codex provisions and related notes are intended to reflect consensus reached by the Committee, as per Codex principles. If consensus cannot be reached on the use of the Note 477 and 478 in this food category, ISC supports continued discussion around finding consensus wording.

Chair's Summary of EWG comments to first circular: The first circular proposed to replace Note 161 in provisions for sweeteners in FC 07.1 and its subcategories with a new note that acknowledge that some Members do not allow the use of sweeteners in these foods. This was based upon the above background analysis of comments received by the EWG on Note 161 to CCFA52 some are Members opposed to use of sweeteners in these foods regardless of energy reduction, so Notes 477 and 478 are not a solution to achieve consensus. Although some comments to the first circular indicated agreement with the text of the proposed new note, other comments objected on the basis that the proposed text indicates that a consensus on the use of sweeteners in these foods has not been reached (see above comment compilation).

For the second circular: EWG members are invited to further discuss text for a potential consensus note to replace Note 161 in FC 07.1 and its subcategories. The adopted provisions as well as provisions in FC 07.1 and its subcategories are provided below for context. All provisions for sweeteners are in the parent food category 07.1, with the exception of a provision for Advantame (INS 969) in FC 07.1.5. In the second circular EWG members also are requested to comment if the use of advantame (INS 969) is limited to FC 07.1.5 or used more broadly across FC 07.1

Second circular request for discussion: as requested in the first circular, EWG Members are invited to suggest revisions to the proposed replacement note, or propose other approaches to be considered by the EWG in the third circular

EWG Member comments on Second Circular Proposal:

Australia: Australia repeats its earlier opposition to the proposed note(s) suggested in the 1st circular for the reasons given. It further notes similar responses in other submissions as well as the Chair's summary comments above.

Australia does not have a proposed alternative note, noting the comments that the earlier alternative notes 477 & 478 are not appropriate for this category and subcategories.

Australia does permit the use of intense sweeteners in breads and bakery products.

It does not consider a shorter note "*Some Codex Members do not allow the use of additives with sweetener function in foods within this Food Category*" is useful or appropriate. This is despite noting that the inclusion of a note is important to some EWG members.

EU: does not have an alternative suggestion for the moment, however, supports further discussion on this matter.

US: To the previous EWG, the US provided examples of products in this food category that use sweeteners (USA Product examples). The use of sweeteners in this food category is technologically justified by taking into account the product examples provided, which include products in international trade. The US welcomes suggestions from the EWG on how to consensus.

CCC: CCC supports an increase of the maximum level up to 300 mg/kg as this is the level needed in the products covered by this category for the technological justification. First, baked goods need a high level of sweetening agent to provide the adequate sweetness due to complex matrix in the baked goods. Secondly, due to the variability in mastication process of such products in the mouth, the proposed new level of SGs would provide the adequate sweetness perception and control the color generated during the baking process. A lower level of steviol glycosides would not be able to achieve the desired sensory characteristics of the products.

The proposed maximum use level is aligned to the one already approved in this category in several Codex countries, such as Canada, Australia, New Zealand, Indonesia, China, USA.

Baked good use levels: Canada (350 mg/kg); China (GMP); USA (GMP); Indonesia (165 mg/kg); Australia & NZ (160 mg/kg).

CCC supports the adoption of Note 477 in this category. Note 477 is the Note agreed by CCFA to replace Note 161.

ISA: Similarly, to the approach in the first circular letter, ISA does not agree with the proposal to replace note 161 in FC 7.1 with a new alternative note. The language proposed for the alternative note does not reflect a consensus position reached by CCFA. ISA believes the use of sweeteners and flavour enhancers in FC 07.1 is justified and supports using Notes 477 and 478. If consensus cannot be reached on the use of these alternative notes, ISA supports continued discussion in order to find consensus wording.

With regard to the below levels of steviol glycosides ISA supports the position of the International Stevia Council.

ISC: Supports an increase of the maximum level up to 300 mg/kg as this is the level needed in the products covered by this category for the technological justification. First, baked goods need a high level of sweetening agent to provide the adequate sweetness due to complex matrix in the baked goods. Secondly, due to the variability in mastication process of such products in the mouth, the proposed new level of SGs would provide the adequate sweetness perception and control the colour generated during the baking process. A lower level of steviol glycosides would not be able to achieve the desired sensory characteristics of the products.

The proposed maximum use level is aligned to the one already approved in this category in several Codex countries, such as Canada, Australia, New Zealand, Indonesia, China, USA.

Baked good use levels: Canada (350 mg/kg); China (GMP); USA (GMP); Indonesia (165 mg/kg); Australia & NZ (160 mg/kg).

ISC supports the adoption of Note 477 in this category. Note 477 is the Note agreed by CCFA to replace Note 161.

3rd Circular proposal: Due to concerns with the specific text of the note proposed in the first circular, the Chair of the EWG proposes the following revision:

“Some Codex Members restrict the use of additives with sweetener function in foods within this Food Category”

EWG Member comments on Third Circular Proposal:

Australia: Australia appreciates the effort the Chair has undertaken to try and reach consensus on an alternative note. However, it does not believe the alternative is acceptable, as it is still comparable to the earlier suggestion. It does not have an alternative note though it wonders why notes 477 and 478 which were agreed earlier for other FCs could not also be agreed for this FC.

Brazil: Brazil considers that the proposed note would represent an unfortunate precedent that could be used indiscriminately in different situations in which consensus is not reached.

Chile: supports the proposed note: *“Some Codex Members restrict the use of additives with sweetener function in foods within this Food Category”*

EU: EU prefers the wording suggested in the First Circular “Some Codex Members do not allow the use of additives with sweetener function in foods within this Food Category...”

Nevertheless, the EU is open to consider other wording on which there would be a consensus and understanding that it also covers the situation when a food additive is not allowed for use.

UK: The UK is happy to support the addition of a revised note to indicate that some members allow this additive use within the food category whilst others do not or restrict.

USA: The use of sweeteners in this food category is technologically justified; however, to reach consensus we can support the 3rd Circular proposal. The USA is hopeful that this wording can accommodate the viewpoints of all Codex Members and allow the Committee to reach consensus on the provisions for sweeteners under consideration in FC 07.1.

CCC: CCC does not support the revised note as it does not align to Codex principles and implies a lack of consensus. Unless consensus can be reached on the existing alternative notes for Note 161 (i.e., 477 and 478), CCC supports further discussion in the Working Group.

ISA: ISA still cannot agree with the proposal to replace note 161 in FC 7.1 with a new amended note. The language proposed for the alternative note does not reflect a consensus position reached by CCFA. ISA believes the use of sweeteners and flavour enhancers in FC 07.1 is justified and supports using Notes 477 and 478. If consensus cannot be reached on the use of these alternative notes, ISA supports continued discussion in order to find consensus wording.

ISC: ISC does not support the proposed text of the new note.

ISC supports the adoption of Note 477 in this category. Note 477 is the Note agreed by CCFA to replace Note 161.

However, should an agreement not be reached on the application of Note 477 on this category, ISC proposes an open and transparent discussion amongst CCFA members and observers in relation to any new note, as it has been the case for the note replacing Note 161.

Final EWG Proposal:

Discuss further. Consensus could not be reached on an alternative note to replace Note 161 in this food category.

Category No. 07.1 (Bread and ordinary bakery wares)

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class
ACESULFAME-POTASSIUM	950	1000	161, 188	2008	Flavour enhancer, Sweetener
ASPARTAME	951	4000	161, 191	2008	Flavour enhancer, Sweetener
ASPARTAME-ACESULFAME SALT	962	2270	113	3	Sweetener
NEOTAME	961	70	161	2008	Flavour enhancer, Sweetener
STEVIOLE GLYCOSIDES	960a, 960b(i)	50	26	3	Sweetener

Category No. 07.1.5 (Steamed breads and buns)

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ADVANTAME	969	40		2	Flavour enhancer, Sweetener	Move provision to parent FC 07.1.

Category No. 12.2 (Herbs, spices, seasonings and condiments (e.g. seasoning for instant noodles))

Corresponding commodity standards – specific to FC 12.2.1 only: CODEX STAN 326-2017: Lists specific preservatives are used green peppers only; **CODEX STAN 327-2017, 328-2017, 347-2019:** in powdered form only - Anticaking agents as listed in Table 3 of the GSA.

FC 12.2 - Descriptor: *This category describes items whose use is intended to enhance the aroma and taste of food*

FC 12.2.1 (Herbs and spices) – Descriptor: *Herbs and spices are usually derived from botanical sources, and may be dehydrated, and either ground or whole. Examples of herbs include basil, oregano and thyme. Examples of spices include cumin and caraway seeds. Spices may also be found as blends in powder or paste form. Examples of spice blends include chilli seasoning, chilli paste, curry paste, curry roux, and dry cures or rubs that are applied to external surfaces of meat or fish.*

FC 12.2.2 (Seasonings and condiments) – Descriptor: *Condiments include seasonings such as meat tenderizers, onion salt, garlic salt, Oriental seasoning mix (dashi), topping to sprinkle on rice (furikake, containing, e.g. dried seaweed flakes, sesame seeds and seasoning), and seasoning for noodles. The term “condiments” as used in the Food Category System does not include condiment sauces (e.g. ketchup, mayonnaise, mustard) or relishes.*

General Background: The use of sweeteners in FC 12.2 and its subcategories were extensively discussed by EWGs on Note 161 to CCFA46 (CX/FA 14/46/14), CCFA47 (CX/FA 15/47/13), as well as the EWG on Note 161 to CCFA52 which discussed this use across four circulars. Among the comments submitted to these various EWGs there appeared to be general consensus that herbs and spices are “pure” products in which the use of food additives should be limited. These same comments also noted that the use of additives may be justified in “seasonings” that are not justified in herbs and spices. There was also general consensus that there is overlap of products captured in FC 12.2.1 and 12.2.2. Several members provided technological justification for the use of sweeteners including sugar replacement (calorie reduction), to reduce osmotic pressure allowing seasoning solutions to be absorbed more easily through cell membranes in, and to lower water uptake by dry seasoning mixes. Although many comments were in favor of including provisions for sweeteners in FC 12.2.2, one EWG member asserted that the use of sweeteners in seasonings should be addressed by reverse carryover rather than provisions for sweeteners in FC 12.2.2

First circular request and comment compilation:**First circular proposal - Factors to be considered in the revision of the descriptors for both FCs 12.2.1 and 12.2.2:**

An analysis of discussion in previous EWGs indicates that, while there is a clear distinction in the perception of EWG Members between the products that correspond to the titles of FC 12.2.1 and 12.2.2, there is overlap in the types of products that are listed in the descriptors for

these FCs. More specifically, examples listed in the descriptor for FC 12.2.1 (e.g. *chilli seasoning...*) may in some cases be considered to be included under FC 12.2.2. In addition, further clarity on the scope of products covered under FC 12.2.2 is necessary.

CX/FA 15/47/13 noted the issue of whether a product should be classified as a 'spice blend' or a 'seasoning', noting that there are many products on the market that are mixtures of herbs and spices together with other food ingredients (such as salt, vinegar, lemon juice, molasses, honey or sugar – and hence products where sweeteners have been used to replace sugar) and questioned whether such products would be better considered as "seasonings". The discussion in the EWG on Note 161 to CCFA52 focused mainly on fitting the use of sweeteners under FC 12.2.2.

First circular proposal:

Based on the factors to be considered discussed above, the EWG is invited to discuss the combined proposed revisions to the descriptors for both FCs 12.2.1 and 12.2.2:

- 1) Remove the list of examples from the descriptor for FC 12.2.1 to remove confusion of overlap between FC 12.2.1 and 12.2.2. The text proposed to be removed is shown in ~~striketrough~~ font.
 - ~~Descriptor for FC 12.2.1: Herbs and spices are usually derived from botanical sources, and may be dehydrated, and either ground or whole. Examples of herbs include basil, oregano and thyme. Examples of spices include cumin and caraway seeds. Spices may also be found as blends in powder or paste form. Examples of spice blends include chilli seasoning, chilli paste, curry paste, curry roux, and dry cures or rubs that are applied to external surfaces of meat or fish.~~
 - EWG Members, and in particular those who would not agree with the above proposal are invited to provide a rational for their disagreement and to suggest revisions to the above proposal.
- 2) Add additional text to the descriptor for FC 12.2.2 to provide more clarity on what constitutes a "seasonings". Text based on the description of products provided in CX/FA 15/47/13 (mentioned in the "factors to be considered" section above) could be used as a starting point for discussion. The text proposed to be removed is shown in ~~striketrough~~ font and text proposed to be added is shown in **bolded** font.
 - ~~Descriptor for FC 12.2.2: Condiments~~ **and include seasonings are mixtures of herbs and spices together with other food ingredients (such as salt, vinegar, lemon juice, molasses, honey or sugar, and sweeteners). Examples include** ~~such as meat tenderizers, onion salt, garlic salt, Oriental seasoning mix (dashi), topping to sprinkle on rice (furikake, containing, e.g. dried seaweed flakes, sesame seeds and seasoning), and seasoning for noodles. The term "condiments" as used in the Food Category System does not include condiment sauces (e.g. ketchup, mayonnaise, mustard) or relishes.~~
 - EWG Members, and in particular those who would not agree with the above proposal are invited to provide a rational for their disagreement and to suggest revisions to the above proposal.

EWG Member comments on First Circular Proposal:

Chile: Chile believes that in the new description of category 12.2.1 the word pasta should be deleted, that is, Food Category Descriptor 12.2.1: Herbs and spices are usually derived from botanical sources, and may be dehydrated, and either ground or whole. Examples of herbs include basil, oregano and thyme. Examples of spices include cumin and caraway seeds. Spices may also be found as blends in powder form.

Chile agrees with the new description for FC 12.2.2

EU: the EU supports the revision of the descriptors of FCs 12.2.1 and 12.2.2 to address the overlap of products of both food categories and differences in the technological need for the use of food additives.

The EU supports the proposed revision of FC 12.2.1. As regards FC 12.2.2, the EU supports the proposed revision with the exception of the word 'sweeteners'. The EU notes that the use of sweeteners is subject to this ongoing discussion and thus it is not appropriate to add the word 'sweeteners' without having consensus on the use of sweeteners in FC 12.2.2.

Indonesia, USA, ISA: Supports 1st circular proposal

Japan: Japan supports the revision of the descriptors to classify the products by presence of other food ingredients. Japan proposes to add at the end of FC 12.2.1 descriptor for clarification as follows: "Excludes herbs and spices with other food ingredients (category 12.2.2)".

First circular question on horizontal approach for FC 12.2.2: In light of the discussion above on revision to the descriptors of FCs 12.2.1 and 12.2.2, is an alternative note for Note 161 necessary in FC 12.2.2? If so, can consensus be reached on the use of Notes 477 and 478? EWG Members, and in particular those who are of the opinion that an alternative note for Note 161 is necessary in FC 12.2.2 but are not in agreement with the use of Note 477 and 478, are invited to provide a rationale for their disagreement and to suggest revisions to the above proposal

EWG Member comments on First Circular Proposal:

Chile, Indonesia, CCC, FoodDrinkEurope, ISC: Chile agrees to replace note 161 with notes 477 or 478.

EU: The EU is open to consider the use of Note 477 and 478 (subject to further internal discussion) as an alternative to Note 161. Alternatively, in case of lack of consensus a similar approach as suggested for FC 07.1 (i.e. a note indicating that *Some Codex Members do not allow the use of additives with sweetener function...*) could be pursued.

Japan: Japan supports to replace Note 161 with Note 477 and 478 in provisions for sweeteners in FC 12.2.2. Sweeteners are used in products in FC 12.2.2 to impart sweet flavor by adding small amount and the use of sweeteners in FC 12.2.2 is technological justified. Sweeteners such as Sucralose have been also used as a flavour enhancer in food products within the Food Category 12.2.2.

USA: can support with approach (no note or the use of Note 477 or 478 as appropriate).

Chair's Summary of comments to first circular: For the first circular the Chair noted that it appeared that consensus could be reached if a clear distinction can be made in the FC descriptors between spices and herbs in FC 12.2.1 and seasonings and condiments in 12.2.2. For this reason the first circular requested comment on proposed revisions of the descriptors for both of these food categories. For FC 12.2.1 the first circular proposed to removed examples of spice blends from the descriptor, as many of the listed products many consist solely of spices or herbs and may commonly be thought of as seasonings rather than spice blends. For FC 12.2.2 the first circular proposed revisions to the descriptor to more clearly identify that condiments and seasonings include other food ingredients. In the context of the proposed descriptors the first circular also requested comment on whether a replacement note for Note 161 was necessary for FC 12.2.2, or if Note 161 could simply be removed from provisions for sweeteners in that FC.

Comments submitted in response to the first circular were all in agreement with the proposed revisions to the descriptors for FC 12.2.1 and FC 12.2.2, although one EWG member requested further time to consider the use of sweeteners in the revised FC 12.2.2 before agreeing to the listing

of “sweeteners” in the revised descriptor for FC 12.2.2. All comments submitted to the first circular agreed to replacing Note 161 in FC 12.2.2 with Note 477 and 478 as appropriate, provided consensus could be reached on the use of sweeteners in FC 12.2.2 (see comment compilation below).

For the second circular: EWG members are invited to provide further comment on the proposed revision to the descriptors of FC 12.2.1 and 12.2.2, in particular, those EWG members whom requested further time to consider the use of sweeteners in the revised FC 12.2.2 are invited to provide comment. As the majority of comments were in agreement with the proposed revisions, and the inclusion of sweeteners in FC 12.2.2 with the addition of Note 477 and 478 as appropriate, EWG members are also invited to comment on recommendations for specific provisions for sweeteners in FCs 12.2, 12.2.1, and 12.2.2. The second circular recommendations for specific provisions are dependent on consensus being reached on the use of sweeteners in the revised FC 12.2.2.

Second circular request for discussion: comment on the proposed revision to the descriptors of FC 12.2.1 and 12.2.2 (if in agreement, comment is not necessary). If proposing revisions, please provide support for the proposed revision.

Proposed revised descriptor for FC 12.2.1: Herbs and spices are usually derived from botanical sources, and may be dehydrated, and either ground or whole. Examples of herbs include basil, oregano and thyme. Examples of spices include cumin and caraway seeds. Spices may also be found as blends in powder or paste form.

Proposed revised descriptor for FC 12.2.2: Condiments and seasonings are mixtures of herbs and spices together with other food ingredients (such as salt, vinegar, lemon juice, molasses, honey or sugar, and sweeteners). Examples include meat tenderizers, onion salt, garlic salt, Oriental seasoning mix (dashi), topping to sprinkle on rice (furikake, containing, e.g. dried seaweed flakes, sesame seeds and seasoning), and seasoning for noodles. The term “condiments” as used in the Food Category System does not include condiment sauces (e.g. ketchup, mayonnaise, mustard) or relishes.

EWG Member comments on Second Circular Proposal:

Chile: Chile believes that in the new description of category 12.2.1 the word paste should be deleted, that is, Food Category Descriptor 12.2.1: Herbs and spices are usually derived from botanical sources, and may be dehydrated, and either ground or whole. Examples of herbs include basil, oregano and thyme. Examples of spices include cumin and caraway seeds. Spices may also be found as blends in powder or paste form.

Chile agrees with the new description for FC 12.2.2

EU: Supports the proposed amendments to the descriptors. The EU also welcome moving the food additive provisions from FC 12.2 and 12.2.1.

In the EU’s view more additive uses are justified in FC 12.2.2 than in FC 12.2.1.

As regards the proposed provisions for FC 12.2.2, the EU is open to consider the use of Note 477 and 478 (subject to further internal discussion).

Japan: Japan supports the proposed revision of the descriptor.

USA: US agrees with the proposed revisions to descriptors for FC 12.2.1 and FC 12.2.2. “Natural” products would be protected in FC 12.2.1 and the revisions should segregate the use of sweeteners to FC 12.2.2. Products such as condiments and seasonings where consumers expect other additives, including sweeteners, would be limited to FC 12.2.2. The categories differ sufficiently so that consumers would not be misled about their contents.

Final EWG Proposal:

Revise the descriptor to the Food Categories 12.2.1 and 12.2.2 to the following:

Descriptor for FC 12.2.1: Herbs and spices are usually derived from botanical sources, and may be dehydrated, and either ground or whole. Examples of herbs include basil, oregano and thyme. Examples of spices include cumin and caraway seeds. Spices may also be found as blends in powder or paste form.

Descriptor for FC 12.2.2: Condiments and seasonings are mixtures of herbs and spices together with other food ingredients (such as salt, vinegar, lemon juice, molasses, honey or sugar, and sweeteners). Examples include meat tenderizers, onion salt, garlic salt, Oriental seasoning mix (dashi), topping to sprinkle on rice (furikake, containing, e.g. dried seaweed flakes, sesame seeds and seasoning), and seasoning for noodles. The term "condiments" as used in the Food Category System does not include condiment sauces (e.g. ketchup, mayonnaise, mustard) or relishes.

Category No. 12.2 (Herbs, spices, seasonings and condiments (e.g. seasoning for instant noodles))

*Provisions with a proposal to move to FC 12.2.2 are marked in ~~strikethrough~~ font.

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ACESULFAME-POTASSIUM	950	2000	161, 488	2008	Flavour enhancer, Sweetener	Consider provision in FC 12.2.2, replace Note 161 with note 478
NEOTAME	964	32	161	2008	Flavour enhancer, Sweetener	Consider provision in FC 12.2.2, replace Note 161 with note 478

Category No. 12.2.1 (Herbs and spices)

*Provisions with a proposal to move to FC 12.2.2 are marked in ~~strikethrough~~ font.

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ERYTHRITOL	968	200000	51	4	Flavour enhancer, Humectant, Sweetener	Consider provision in FC 12.2.2, change ML to GMP, remove note 51 and add note 47

ISOMALT (HYDROGENATED ISOMALTULOSE)	953	GMP	51	7	Anticaking agent, Bulking agent, Glazing agent, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	Consider provision in FC 12.2.2, remove note 51 and add note 478
LACTITOL	966	GMP	51	4	Emulsifier, Sweetener, Thickener	Consider provision in FC 12.2.2, remove Note 51 and add Note 477.
MALTITOL	965(i)	50000	51	4	Bulking agent, Emulsifier, Humectant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	Consider Provision in FC 12.2.2, remove Note 51, add Note 477
MALTITOL SYRUP	965i(ii)	50000	51	4	Bulking agent, Emulsifier, Humectant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	Consider Provision in FC 12.2.2, remove Note 51, add Note 477
SORBITOL	420(i)	GMP	51	7	Bulking agent, Humectant, Sequestrant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	Consider Provision in FC 12.2.2, remove Note 51, add Note 477
SORBITOL SYRUP	420(ii)	GMP	51	7	Bulking agent, Humectant, Sequestrant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	Consider Provision in FC 12.2.2, remove Note 51, add Note 477

SUCRALOSE (TRICHLOROGAL ACTOSUCROSE)	955	400	161	2008	Flavour enhancer, Sweetener	Revoke – there is already and adopted provision for INC 955 in FC 12.2.2
XYLITOL	967	GMP	51	7	Emulsifier, Humectant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	Consider Provision in FC 12.2.2, remove Note 51, add Note 477

Category No. 12.2.2 (Seasonings and condiments)

*Provisions with a proposal to move to FC 12.2.2 from another FC are marked in **bold font**

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
ADVANTAME	969	20		2	Flavour enhancer, Sweetener	Adopt, Add note 478
ASPARTAME	951	2000	161, 191	2008	Flavour enhancer, Sweetener	Revise Adopted, Replace Note 161 with note 478
ASPARTAME- ACESULFAME SALT	962	3100	113	3	Sweetener	Adopt at 2000 mg/kg with Note 119, and Note 477
ACESULFAME- POTASSIUM	950	2000	161, 188	2008	Flavour enhancer, Sweetener	Move from FC 12.2, Adopt in FC 12.2.2 - Replace Note 161 with note 478
NEOTAME	961	32	161	2008	Flavour enhancer, Sweetener	Move from FC 12.2, Adopt in FC 12.2.2 - Replace Note 161 with note 478
ERYTHRITOL	968	200000	51	4	Flavour enhancer, Humectant, Sweetener	Move from FC 12.2.1, Adopt in FC 12.2.2 - Revise to GMP, Remove Note 51 and add note 478.

ISOMALT (HYDROGENATE D ISOMALTULOSE)	953	GMP	51	7	Anticaking agent, Bulking agent, Glazing agent, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	Move from FC 12.2.1, Adopt in FC 12.2.2 - Remove Note 51 and add note 477.
LACTITOL	966	GMP	51	4	Emulsifier, Sweetener, Thickener	Move from FC 12.2.1, Adopt in FC 12.2.2 - Remove Note 51 and add note 477.
MALTITOL	965(i)	50000	51	4	Bulking agent, Emulsifier, Humectant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	Move from FC 12.2.1, Adopt in FC 12.2.2 - Revise to GMP, Remove Note 51 and add note 478.
MALTITOL SYRUP	965i(ii)	50000	51	4	Bulking agent, Emulsifier, Humectant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	Move from FC 12.2.1, Adopt in FC 12.2.2 - Revise to GMP, Remove Note 51 and add note 478.
SORBITOL	420(i)	GMP	51	7	Bulking agent, Humectant, Sequestrant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	Move from FC 12.2.1, Adopt in FC 12.2.2 - Remove Note 51 and add note 477.
SORBITOL SYRUP	420(ii)	GMP	51	7	Bulking agent, Humectant, Sequestrant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	Move from FC 12.2.1, Adopt in FC 12.2.2 - Remove Note 51 and add note 477.

SUCRALOSE (TRICHLOROGAL ACTOSUCROSE)	955	700	161	2008	Flavour enhancer, Sweetener	Revise Adopted, Replace Note 161 with note 478
XYLITOL	967	GMP	51	7	Emulsifier, Humectant, Stabilizer, Sweetener, Thickener	Move from FC 12.2.1, Adopt in FC 12.2.2 - Remove Note 51 and add note 477.

Appendix 5: Proposed draft provision in the GSFA for propylene glycol alginate (INS 405) in FC 01.1.2; and provisions entered into the step process as a result of CX/FA 21/52/8

1. Among several topics, the 52nd CCFA requested the EWG on the GSFA to CCFA53 to consider:¹
 - The provision for propylene glycol alginate (INS 405) in FC 01.1.2 “*Other fluid milks plain*” for comment on the specific use level and technological justifications for the use level; and
 - provisions entered into the step process as a result of CX/FA 21/52/8

Introduction:

Provision for Propylene glycol alginate (INS 405) in FC 01.1.2

2. CCFA48 revised the structure, title and descriptor of food category 01.1 (*Fluid milk and milk products*) and its subcategories. CCFA48 noted that the scope of the new food category 01.1.2 (*Other fluid milks (plain)*) did not correspond to the scope of a historical food category and therefore there were no provisions for the use of food additives in this food category. CCFA48 subsequently requested that proposals for inclusion of food additive provisions in the new food category 01.1.2 be submitted in response to the circular letter requesting proposals for new and/or revision of adopted food additive provisions.² CCFA49 included specific proposed new provisions into the GSFA at step 2, and these provisions were circulated for comment and discussed at CCFA50 and CCFA51.^{3, 4}
3. The pWG on the GSFA to CCFA51 reached consensus on an approach to provisions for the use of additives with emulsifier, stabilizer, thickener function in FC 01.1.2 in that such products were technologically justified only in mineral or vitamin fortified products and at levels at which the additive would have only emulsifier or stabilizer function.⁵ CCFA51 submitted to CAC42 those provisions in FC 01.1.2 for food additives with emulsifier, stabilizer, thickener function and a JECFA acceptable daily intake (ADI) of “not specified” for adoption with Note 407 “Excluding all fluid milks that are not mineral or vitamin fortified” and Note 438 “For use as emulsifier or stabilizer only.” However, the pWG on the GSFA to CCFA51 noted that although Propylene glycol alginate (INS 405) has a numerical ADI, a numeric ML for the provision for propylene glycol alginate was not discussed. As such CCFA51 held this provision to further examine the proposed use level for discussion during CCFA52.⁶
4. During the pWG on the GSFA to CCFA52 discussion on the provision for Propylene glycol alginate (INS 405) in FC 01.1.2 “*Other fluid milk (plain)*” it was noted that the use level is higher than the adopted use level in food category 01.1.4 “*Flavoured fluid milks*” and several members expressed the opinion that the proposed maximum use level was too high. It was also noted that technological justification on the specific use level was not provided.⁷
5. The 52nd CCFA endorsed the recommendation to hold the draft provision for propylene glycol alginate (INS 405) in FC 01.1.2 “*Other fluid milks (plain)*” and recirculate for comment on the specific use level and technological justification for the use level.⁸

Proposals to revise adopted provisions of the GSFA entered into the step process as a result of CX/FA 19/51/8

6. The pWG on the GSFA to CCFA52 considered submissions received in reply to the Circular Letter requesting proposals for new and/or revision of food additive provisions of the GSFA (CL 2019/40-FA) and made recommendations as to which proposals to revise adopted provisions in the GSFA should be included in the GSFA

¹ REP 21/FA, para. 183(v), (x)

² Rep 16/FA, para. 86.

³ REP 17/FA paras 88 and 109.

⁴ CX/FA 18/50/7, Appendix 6.

⁵ FA/51, CRD2

⁶ REP 19/FA, para. 80 (ii)

⁷ FA/52 CRD2

⁸ REP 19/FA, para. 132

at Step 2. CCFA52 agreed to include those provisions in the GSFA at Step 2 and to circulate those provisions for comment.⁹

Working Document:

7. The EWG on the GSFA issued three circulars for this Appendix requesting comments on actual use levels and/or technological and justification for the draft and proposed draft provisions under discussion.
8. The current document presents proposals for each provision under discussion (adopt, adopt with revision, discontinue) in the format of the food categories listed in Table 2 of the GSFA.
9. These proposals are based upon a consensus approach taking into account the following information:
 - Information on corresponding Codex commodity standards and the use of food additives in those commodity standards is provided for each food category;
 - Historical discussions on the provision in previous sessions of CCFA; and
 - Comments provided by EWG members.
10. These recommendations are based on the “weight of evidence”; that is, comments containing justifications were given more weight than comments with no supporting justification.

⁹ REP 21/FA para 160.

Category No. 01.1.2 (Other fluid milks (plain))**Corresponding commodity standards:** None

General Note: CCFA51 agreed that the use of additives with emulsifier, stabilizer and thickener function, was technologically justified in this food category with Notes 407 “Excluding “Excluding all fluid milks that are not mineral or vitamin fortified” and Note 438 “For use as emulsifier or stabilizer only.” The provision for propylene glycol alginate was held for discussion of the maximum use level.

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
PROPYLENE GLYCOL ALGINATE	405	4000		7	Emulsifier, Stabilizer, Thickener	<p>Chair’s note: While comments generally support the use of INS 405 at 3,000 mg/kg, no information was received in the context of the JECFA ADI, as to why there are or are not safety concerns for this use level in this food category. Also, no information was requested why higher levels of INS 405 are needed for products covered under FC 01.1.2 in light of the use levels in the other fluid drinks food categories.</p> <p>INS 405 is used in products covered under FC 01.1.4 at a level of 1300 mg/kg and in products covered under FCs 14.1.4.1, 14.1.4.2, and 14.1.4.3 and FC 14.1.5 at a level of 500 mg/kg.</p> <p>Adopt at 1300 mg/kg</p>

Comments by EWG Members to EWG on GSFA to CCFA52 (CX/FA 20/52/7 Appendix 4):

China, Dominican Republic, ECOWAS, India, Nigeria: supports adoption at 4000 mg/Kg with Notes 407, 438

EU: can it be clarified why this particular additive is needed? What is the effect and why it cannot be achieved with other additives having ADI not specified? (for 20kg child the JECFA ADI will be reached by drinking 350ml of milk; according to GSFA Annex A the acceptable MLs, provided 50% of exposure to a additive comes from beverages, ranges between 350 ppm (guideline 10) to 2800 ppm. ML above 2800 ppm is acceptable only for products where calculation of potential intake will show that exceeding the ADI is unlikely (e.g. strong alcoholic beverages) (guideline 14).

It is not authorized in milk in the EU, however, in GSFA it is authorized for example in flavoured drinks at 500 ppm and in flavoured fluid milk drinks at 1300 ppm. The proposed ML seems to be excessive.

EU supports addition of Note 407 & 438 and in addition suggests Note 410.

India, Colombia, Guatemala, Malaysia, Zambia, IFAC: Supports proposal

RU: agrees with the proposal with note 410: For use in non-flavoured vitamin and mineral other fluid milks (plain)) only

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
<p>USA: For use in food in general at ML 3000</p> <p>IFAC: Supports at GMP. IN Canada it is approved at GMP in unstandardized foods</p>						
<p>Comments by EWG Members to EWG on GSFA to CCFA53 on the First Circular:</p> <p>Australia: Supports in general the proposal for propylene glycol alginate (INS 405) in FC 01.1.2 with notes 407 and 438. The food additive is considered a GMP food additive for many food categories in Australia though there is not such a specific food category as FC 01.1.2. It is permitted at GMP in liquid milk products and flavoured liquid milk in Australia. Australia has no comments on an appropriate ML.</p> <p>EU: Reiterate comments from EWG on GSFA to CCFA52 (CX/FA 20/52/7 Appendix 4)</p> <p>IDF: Based on feedback from IDF members, IDF proposes a usage level of 3,000 mg/kg in products falling within the GSFA food category 1.1.2. PGA is very effective when used primarily as a stabilizer and emulsifier to reduce the possible formation of precipitates caused by the various processing steps to produce plain recombined fluid milks, plain reconstituted fluid milks, plain composite milks, non-flavoured vitamin and mineral fortified fluid milks, protein adjusted milks, lactose reduced milk, and plain milk-based beverages.</p>						
<p>Comments by EWG Members to EWG on GSFA to CCFA53 on the Second Circular (Revise ML to 3000 mg/kg. Request information, in the context of the JECFA ADI, why there are or are not safety concerns for this use level in this food category.):</p> <p>Australia, Colombia, FoodDrinkEurope, IDF: Supports the proposal.</p> <p>EU: the JECFA's assessment establishing the ADI dates back to 1993. It is not clear what uses and use levels were taken into account in the exposure estimates. The EU assumes that 'other fluid milks' were not covered in the exposure estimates (the food category structure changed more recently and it is questionable whether in 1993 such products existed). Nevertheless, JECFA concluded that the contribution of propylene glycol alginate (ADI 70 mg/kg bw/d) to total dietary propylene glycol intake from all sources should be included in the ADI for propylene glycol, which was allocated an ADI of 0-25 mg/kg. It is not clear to the EU whether this has been done.</p> <p>In the absence (of knowledge) of any refined exposure estimates the EU used the GSFA Annex A to calculate the acceptable ML, which is significantly below the proposed ML. It is also not clear why a higher ML is needed than the ML in flavoured drinks (500 ppm) or flavoured fluid milk drinks (1300 ppm).</p> <p>UK: Support the proposal to request further information, in the context of the JECFA ADI, as to why there are no safety concerns for this use level in this category.</p>						
<p>Comments by EWG Members to EWG on GSFA to CCFA53 on the Third Circular (Information is requested why higher levels of INS 405 are needed for products covered under FC 01.1.2 in light of the use levels in the other fluid drinks food categories.):</p> <p>EU: EU has no information on the technological need for INS 405 in FC 01.1.2. The EU believes that there is no reason why the ML should be higher than in other fluid drinks food categories. The potential exposure vis-à-vis the ADI should be taken into account as well.</p> <p>UK: We would refer to our previous comment. We feel further investigation is needed to understand the technical need for this higher ML in this category and evidence as to why this technical use cannot be achieved at lower levels or with another additive, This is a food category where children may have high exposure and the ADI could be exceeded regularly.</p>						

Category No. 01.6.2.1 (Ripened Cheese, including rind)

Corresponding commodity standards: CODEX STAN 283-1978: (General standard for cheese): Refers to **CODEX STAN 208-1999** for cheeses in brine, lists specific additives that can be used in all other ripened cheeses; **CODEX STAN 208-1999** (Group standard for cheeses in brine): INS 270 & 575; Specific **CODEX STANs 263-1966, 264-1966, 265-1966, 266-1966, 267-1966, 268-1966, 269-1967, 270-1968, 271-1968, 272-1968, 274-1969, 276-1973, 277-1973:** lists specific additives, most do not allow additives on the rind; **CODEX STAN 278-1978:** does not list food additives

General Note: Information provided by Australia in CX/FA 21/52/8

- **Revise adopted provision:** Submitted by Australia at CCFA52 (CX/FA 21/52/8). Proposal is to remove XS Notes from the adopted provision in FC 01.6.2.1 of the GSFA and revise the food additive listings in corresponding commodity standards to allow the use of the additive in products covered by those standards.
- **Justification:** Lauric arginate ethyl ester (LAEE) serves a preservative function. Request is to revise commodity standards for cheeses that currently already allow for the use of preservatives such as lysozyme, sorbates, etc to provide for the use of LAEE for the same function. The use of LAEE provides an effective alternative to the use of such preservatives in products falling under these standards (further justification provided in CX/FA 21/52/8).
- **Safety:** The use of LAEE in cheese as well as its use in a broad range of other foods was considered by JECFA in 2009.
- **Mislead Consumer:** These standards already allow for the use of other preservatives. The use of LAEE would be on the list of ingredients appearing on the product label.

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
LAURIC ARGINATE ETHYL ESTER	243	200	XS263, XS264, XS265, XS266, XS267, XS268, XS269, XS270, XS271, XS272, XS274, XS276, XS277	Adopted	Preservative	Revise Adopted
LAURIC ARGINATE ETHYL ESTER	243	200	XS274 XS276 XS277	2	Preservative	Discontinue

Comments by EWG Members to EWG on GSFA to CCFA53 on the First Circular:

Australia: Supports its earlier request to remove XS Notes from the adopted provision in FC 01.6.2.1 of the GSFA and revise the food additive listings in corresponding commodity standards to allow the use of lauric arginate ethyl ester (LAEE) as a preservative in products covered by those standards.

Canada: Supports the proposal as Canada also allows LAEE in a variety of cheeses as a preservative, at 200 ppm (albeit on the basis of ethyl-N-alpha-dodecanoyl L-arginate hydrochloride).

UK: Supports revision of the provision.

IDF: Agrees to the proposed revision (allows use in standardized Ripened cheeses (CS 263, 264, 265, 266, 267, 268, 269, 270, 271, 272) and removal of the notes as LAEE is an effective inhibitor of Listeria monocytogenes which has been found in some instances in ripened cheeses from many countries.

Comments by EWG Members to EWG on GSFA to CCFA53 on the Second Circular (Discontinue):

Australia, Chile, Colombia, FoodDrinkEurope, IDF: Supports the proposal

Category No. 07.2 (Fine Bakery Wares)

Corresponding commodity standards: None

General Note: Information provided by FoodDrinkEurope in CX/FA 21/52/8

- **Revise adopted provision.** Submitted by FoodDrinkEurope at CCFA52 (CX/FA 21/52/8). The current adopted provision has Note 165 which limits the use to products for special nutritional use only. The proposal would add a note to also allow the use in wafer paper without restriction.
- **Justification:** Using sugar to produce wafer paper is not possible because sugar will cause the wafer paper to stick to the baking plates during baking. Sweeteners must be used in the baking of wafer paper and sucralose is the most suitable sweetener for wafer paper.
- **Safety:** Wafer paper is a niche product so the use will not have significant contribution to the ADI for sucralose even for “high level” consumers. Sucralose has been evaluated by JECFA.
- **Mislead Consumer:** There are no sugar sweetened wafer papers on the market. The use of sucralose will be listed on the label.

Additive	INS	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step / Adopted	INS Functional Class	Final EWG Proposal
SUCRALOSE (TRICHLOROGALACTOSUCROSE)	955	700	165, 478	Adopted	Sweetener	Revise Adopted provision with Note 165, 478 and New Note: “For wafer paper products only: use not restricted to special nutritional products.”
SUCRALOSE (TRICHLOROGALACTOSUCROSE)	955	700	165, 478 New Note: “wafer	2	Sweetener	Discontinue

			paper only”			
<p><u>Comments by EWG Members to EWG on GSFA to CCFA53 on the First Circular:</u></p> <p><u>Canada:</u> Supports the provision in general. However, we are concerned that the application of two “only” notes (165 and the New Note) is confusing and would effectively be read together as “for use in wafer paper for special nutritional use only”. Canada recommends removing Note 165 and revising the New Note to the effect of, “For use in wafer paper or products for special nutritional use only”</p> <p><u>EU:</u> Accepts the proposed revision</p> <p><u>UK:</u> Supports adoption of the revised provision.</p> <p><u>CCC:</u> Supports the revised provision.</p> <p><u>ISA:</u> Supports the proposal</p>						
<p><u>Comments by EWG Members to EWG on GSFA to CCFA53 on the Second Circular</u> (Discontinue):</p> <p><u>Australia, Colombia, EU, FoodDrinkEurope, IDF, ISA:</u> Supports the proposal.</p>						