



Agenda Item 5

CX/FFP 14/33/7 Add.1

**JOINT FAO/WHO FOOD STANDARDS PROGRAMME
CODEX COMMITTEE ON FISH AND FISHERY PRODUCTS**

Thirty-third Session

Bergen, Norway

17 – 21 February 2014

**DRAFT STANDARD FOR RAW, FRESH AND QUICK FROZEN SCALLOP PRODUCTS
(At Step 6 of the Procedure)**

Comments submitted by Canada, Kenya, New Zealand

CANADA

GENERAL COMMENTS

- Frozen scallop products with added solution of water and phosphates are described inconsistently throughout the standard. In the case of the wording “Quick Frozen Scallop Meat or Roe-on Scallops with added water and/or solutions of water and phosphates”, this description can be misunderstood as including frozen scallop products with added water only which is not included in the scope of the standard.

Canada proposes the following revision for clarification and consistency to sections 2.1.3, 2.2.2 and 3.2 of the standard:

Revise to read: “Quick Frozen Scallop Meat or Roe-on Scallops Processed with added ~~water and/or~~ solution of water and phosphates”.

- Canada opposes the inclusion of fresh scallop products with added water within the standard because of the lack of technological justification for intentionally adding water. The flesh of scallops is susceptible to water absorption and the addition of water serves only to add weight to a relatively expensive product. The labelling requirements proposed (% meat and/or % added water) to protect consumers from fraud by informing them that water was added may not be practical because a large market of fresh scallops is sold at the retail level is not prepackaged.

Specific comments regarding this have been made to sections 1(iv); 2.1.4; 2.2.3; 3.3; 4 and 7.1.2) which refer to fresh scallop meat or Roe-on scallops with added water.

SPECIFIC COMMENTS

Section 1 Scope

- Delete : ~~iv) fresh scallop meat with or without roe with added water.~~

Reason: Canada opposes the inclusion of fresh scallop products with added water within the scope of the standard.

- Revise first sentence to read: “This standard applies to **the following raw products of the** bivalve species of the *Pectinidae* family in the following product categories: “

Reason: We suggest including the word “raw” in the first sentence of the Section 1 Scope in order to bring clarity to the products included in this standard and to be in line with the title of this standard.

- Revise the product categories to read:

- i) Fresh or quick frozen “Scallop Meat”, ~~which is the scallop adductor muscle meat remaining after the shell and all the viscera (including the roe) have been completely removed.~~
- ii) Fresh or quick frozen “Roe-on Scallops”, ~~which is the scallop adductor muscle meat remaining after the shell and all other viscera have been completely removed.~~ “

Reason: The product definitions are described in section 2.1 “Product Definition” therefore they do not need to be repeated in this section.

2. Description

- ~~Delete: 2.1.4 Fresh Scallop meat, Roe-on Scallops with added water~~

~~Fresh scallop meat or roe on scallops with added water contain the products defined in 2.1.1, 2.1.2 and added water.~~

Reason: Canada opposes the inclusion of fresh scallop products with added water in the standard.

Section 2.2 Process Definition

- ~~Revise first sentence of section 2.2.1, 2.2.2 to read: “After removal of the shell, viscera, and roe (as applicable)– the preparation of Scallop Meat or Roe-on Scallops under good hygiene practices, the products are ...”~~

Reason: There is no need to repeat “removal of the shell, viscera, and roe (as applicable)” as this is described in the definition already.

~~Delete: 2.2.3 Fresh Scallop Meat Processed with Added Water~~

~~After removal of the shell, viscera, and roe as applicable, under good hygiene practices, the product is rinsed and stored with a method that minimizes absorption of water to the extent that is technologically practicable. The fresh product shall be kept at or below 4°C. The product is subject to the addition of water (e.g., soaked, sprayed). The amount of added water shall be controlled and accurately measured for labelling purposes.~~

Reason: Canada opposes the inclusion of fresh scallop products with added water in the standard.

3. ESSENTIAL COMPOSITION AND QUALITY FACTORS

- ~~Delete: 3.3 Fresh scallop meat, or roe on scallops, with added water~~

~~The product shall be prepared from sound and wholesome scallops which are of a quality suitable to be sold fresh for direct human consumption. Added water and/or salt are permitted to the extent that the added water uptake is accurately measured and labelled and their use is acceptable in accordance with the law or custom of the~~

~~country in which the product is sold. Water shall be of potable quality and salt shall comply with the *Standard for Food Grade Salt* (CODEX STAN 150-1985).~~

Reason: Canada opposes the inclusion of fresh scallop products with added water in the standard.

4. FOOD ADDITIVES

~~Revise: 4.1 Fresh Scallop Meat and Roe-on Scallops with or without added water~~

Reason: Canada opposes the inclusion of fresh scallop products with added water in the standard.

Section 5 - Contaminants

- ~~Delete:~~ The superscript number “4” in section 5.2.

Reason: The footnote 4 has been deleted and incorporated as text in section 5.2.

6. HYGIENE AND HANDLING

~~Revise: 6.2~~ Roe on scallops ~~with added water~~ shall comply with the hygiene controls set out in Section I-6.4 and I-6.5 of the *Standard for Live and Raw Bivalve Molluscs* (CODEX STAN 292-2008) and sampled and analyzed in accordance with the same Standard.

Reason: This requirement applies to all Roe-on scallop products and not just those with added water.

Section 7 – Labelling

Section 7.1 Name of the Food

- Revise: 7.1.1 Scallop Meat or ~~Roe-on Scallops~~

“X¹ Scallops” if it conforms with the product description outlined in 2.1.1 ~~or~~

- Delete: **7.1.2 Scallop Meat, or roe-on scallops, with Added Water**

~~“ X scallops with added water”, ‘Preparation of X scallops with added water’, or a like name as allowed in the country of sale, which differentiates the product from scallop meat and is not misleading to the consumer if it conforms with the product description outlined in 2.1.2. “X” in 7.1.1 and 7.1.2 being the common or usual name of the species of scallops according to the law, custom and practice in the country in which the product is to be distributed in a manner not to mislead the consumer.~~

Reason: Canada opposes the inclusion of fresh scallop products with added water in the standard.

- New section: **7.1.2 Roe-on Scallops**

Products that conform with the product description outlined in section 2.1.2 are named “X¹ Roe-on Scallops”.

- New section: **7.1.3 Scallop Meat or Roe-on Scallops with added solution of water and phosphates**

Products that conform with the product description outlined in section 2.1.3 are named “X¹ scallops with added solution of water and phosphates”, “Preparation of X¹ scallops with added solution of water and phosphates”, or a like name as allowed in the country of sale which differentiates the product from Scallop Meat or Roe-on Scallops and is not misleading to the consumer.

- Revise: ~~7.1.3~~ **7.1.4** In addition to the name identified in 7.1.1, **7.1.2, 7.1.3**, the product shall be identified by common and/or scientific names as determined by the competent authority. The country where the product is sold can determine if the scientific name must be indicated on the label. “

- Revise: 7.3 **The percentage of scallop meat and of Wwater and phosphate** added as an ingredient to scallop products shall be declared in the list of ingredients and the percentage of scallop meat and percentage of added water shall **be** clearly **declared** appear on the label.

- Add footnote: **1. “X” being the common or usual name of the species of scallops according to the law, custom and practice in the country in which the product is to be distributed in a manner not to mislead the consumer.**

Reason: To provide clarity on the specific labeling requirements for each product within the scope of the standard and ensure that consumers are well informed, beyond the list of ingredients, that the product contains added water and phosphates.

Section 8 - SAMPLING, EXAMINATION AND ANALYSIS

Section 8.6 Determination of the presence of viscera

- Revise title to read: “Determination of the presence of viscera **and roe**”

Revise text to read: “ “Scallop meat” and “Roe-on scallops” is **Scallop products are** examined for the presence of visible **remaining** viscera attached to the adductor muscle or loose in the package (~~such as remains of gills, mantle, hepatopancreas, intestinal tract and roe, if applicable~~) **and remaining roe (Scallop Meat only).**

Reason: Viscera and Roe have been defined in the Codex Draft Code of Practice of Raw, Fresh and Quick Frozen Scallop Products. For clarification purposes, roe is not included in the definition of viscera.

Section 8.7 Determination of added water

- Canada agrees with the text in brackets in principle but suggests the following amendments:

Revise text to read: “In order to ~~check~~ **verify** the conformity with subsections 3.1, ~~3.2 and 3.3~~ **and 7.3**, a country may establish a scientifically supported criterion **for the natural level of moisture in the meat of scallop species harvested.** Where a country has relevant scientific information on the characteristics of the scallop species it exports, it may approach an importing country to discuss the implementation of this criterion on a species by species basis.

Reason: Further elaboration is necessary to provide clarification on the criterion. A criterion is necessary in order to be able to verify whether undeclared water was added as well as the accuracy of the quantity of added water declared.

Section 9 - DEFINITION OF DEFECTIVES

Section 9.4 Parasites

- **Remove the brackets:** ~~{The presence of readily visible parasites at an objectionable level.}~~

Reason: Canada is not opposed to the statement suggested but would support further discussion for clarity and consistency as “objectionable level” is subject to interpretation and is not in line with other Codex Fish Standards, where an upper limit of 5% is applied for a defect.

Section 9.6:

- **Delete:** ~~[Section 9.6 Exceeding level of added water~~

~~Level of added water exceeding that declared in the label]~~

Reason: Incorrect declaration of added water and phosphates is a labeling issue and does not belong under Section 9. Defects). It is better placed under section 10. Lot acceptance.

10. Lot Acceptance

- **New:** **iv) the level of added water and phosphate solution is not more than that declared on the label.**
- **Revise:** ~~iv) v) the essential composition and quality...~~

Reason: Accurate declaration of added water and phosphate solutions is verified to determine lot acceptability and therefore needs to be added in this section.

KENYA

[7.3 Water added as an ingredient to scallop meat shall be declared in the list of ingredients and the percentage of scallop meat shall clearly appear on the label.]

Comment

We propose that the weight of the fresh scallop meat be declared before addition of water and if water is used as an ingredient it should be declared as per CODEX STAN 1-1985, 4.2.1.5 and 5.1.2.

9.4 Parasites

[The presence of visible parasites on the near surface of the scallop adductor muscle shall not exceed 20 % of individuals in the sample.]

Comment

We are aware that zero parasites are not practicable, we would suggest modifying the sentence as follows: **Products covered by this Standard shall not contain readily visible objectionable level of parasites and it is not easy to quantify the 20%.**

We have no objection in i) indicated below, but would like to modify ii) as indicated below

9.5 Objectional matter

Comment

i) We propose to retain the percentage mentioned below since they are not food safety issues.

Objectional parts of scallops (such as remains of gills, mantle, hepatopancreas, viscera, intestinal tract or fragments of shell), affecting more **than** 10% of the sample by weight, provided the toxicity associated with the objectionable parts of scallops have met section 5.2 of this Standard;

ii) We propose that sand or other similar particles that is visible in the thawed state or detected by chewing during sensory examination, [affecting more than ~~10%~~ **5% of the** sample by weight].

The ~~10%~~ **5%** is too high considering the sand is foreign matter and this is a food safety issue.

NEW ZEALAND

New Zealand notes concerns raised in country comments (CX/FFP 14/33/7) about the potential for roe-on scallops to contain contaminants from growing areas. In New Zealand's view these contaminants are limited to marine biotoxins. No evidence of microbiological problems has been presented to support the view that an E. coli limit is necessary for the roe-on product. New Zealand recommends that the CCFFP require evidence of roe-on product having microbiological problems due to growing area contamination before considering the need for an E. coli limit for roe-on scallops.

The restriction of the E.coli limit to the water added product was primarily due to concerns about the water introducing contamination and/or changing the shellfish matrix such that E coli survival and growth might be greater than normal. No evidence was presented to support this.

New Zealand notes further that it is not aware of any water added product in international trade and remains unconvinced of the need for the inclusion of this category of product.

New Zealand therefore supports leaving the text of section 6 as it is, or, in the alternative, deleting section 6.2 if the Committee determines that there is no need for a "water added" product category.