



**JOINT FAO/WHO FOOD STANDARDS PROGRAMME
CODEX COMMITTEE ON NUTRITION AND FOODS FOR SPECIAL DIETARY USES**

Fortieth Session

**Berlin, Germany
26 – 30 November 2018**

DISCUSSION PAPER ON NRV-R FOR OLDER INFANTS AND YOUNG CHILDREN

(Prepared by an electronic Working Group Chaired by Ireland, and Co-Chaired by the United States of America and Mexico)

Summary and Recommendations:

1. New scientific evidence exists which can be used to develop NRVs-R for older infants and young children. Without the establishment of specific NRVs-R for older infants and young children, the only values that can be used for this age group are those for the general population (older than 36 months). This work on developing NRVs for older infants and young children was included in the 2007 Project Document (CCNFSDU 29th session - ALINORM 08/31/26, Annex VII; see Appendix 1).
2. The Terms of Reference (ToR) for the work of this eWG are outlined below:

- A. Assess the need and value for the establishment of NRV-R for older infants and young children in Codex texts in relation to:
 - i. the purpose of such NRVs-R in the Guidelines for Nutrition Labelling (CXG 2-1985) and Codex texts for special dietary use for older infants and young children; and
 - ii. the specific age groups to which these NRV-R may applyWhere a need is established under TOR A:
- B. Analyse nutrition labelling provisions in Codex texts under TOR A (i) and, where appropriate develop a request to CCFL to provide advice on the potential for amendments to provide further clarity

Conduct of the eWG

3. The eWG was established in January 2018 and had 39 members (29 Codex Members and 10 Codex Observers).
4. The Chair and Co-Chairs developed the Consultation Paper exploring the issues around establishing NRVs-R for older infants and young children under the ToRs. This included analysis of the labelling provisions in relevant Codex texts.
5. Responses to this consultation were received from 19 eWG members (15 Codex Members and 4 Codex Observers).

Relevant Codex texts and issues identified

6. The identified Codex texts relevant to NRVs-R for older infants and young children and the types of foods they cover are as follows:

Codex Text	Type of foods covered
<i>Guidelines on Nutrition Labelling</i> (CXG 2-1985)	All foods
<i>Processed Cereal-Based Foods for Infants and Young Children</i> (CXS 74-1981)	FSDU
<i>Canned Baby Foods</i> (CXS 73-1981)	FSDU
<i>Guidelines on Formulated Complementary Foods for Older Infants and Young Children</i> (CXG 8-1991)	FSDU
<i>Follow-up Formula</i> (CXS 156-1987; under review)	FSDU
<i>Guidelines for Use of Nutrition and Health Claims</i> (CXG 23-1997)	All foods
<i>Guidelines for Vitamin and Mineral Food Supplements</i> (CXG 55-2005)	Food Supplements

* FSDU = Foods for special dietary uses

7. The eWG has considered NRVs-R for older infants and young children for labelling purposes in the *Guidelines on Nutrition Labelling* to extend the list of existing NRVs-R. However not all Codex Foods for Special Dietary Uses (FSDU) texts targeting this age group apply these Guidelines. Where the Guidelines apply, only NRVs-R for the general population older than 36 months are available.

8. Two Codex texts use %NRVs-R to guide composition (*Guidelines on Formulated Complementary Foods* and *Guidelines for Vitamin and Mineral Food Supplements*) but use different NRVs-R for labelling purposes.

9. The *Guidelines for Use of Nutrition and Health Claims* paragraph 1.4 clearly outlines that such claims “...shall not be permitted for foods for infants and young children except where specifically provided for in relevant Codex standards or national legislation.” There are no specific provisions for nutrition and health claims in Codex texts on FSDU targeting this age group. Therefore, claims are only permitted on foods for infants and young children in jurisdictions where national legislation provides for this. In these circumstances, the reference criteria for such claims are %NRVs-R for the general population (older than 36 months). Despite the lack of provision for nutrition and health claims in most Codex texts on FSDU, a small number apply the *Guidelines for Use of Nutrition and Health Claims*.

10. Finally, there are inconsistencies in how age ranges for older infants and young children are defined in Codex texts.

11. Details on the relevant provisions in these Codex texts relating to these issues, are outlined in Appendix 3.

12. Establishing NRVs-R for older infants and young children in the *Guidelines on Nutrition Labelling*, and amending the relevant Codex texts appropriately, would address these inconsistencies and provide clarity.

Support for establishing NRVs-R for older infants and young children Codex texts

13. The eWG responses to the Consultation Paper reflect a need to establish NRVs-R for older infants and young children in the *Guidelines on Nutrition Labelling* and be relevant to the Codex texts for FSDU targeting older infants and young children. The main reason given by Codex Members and Codex Observers for developing such NRVs-R is to inform consumers about wise food choices on the basis of requirements. In addition, the development of such NRVs-R and the amendment of texts where necessary would address inconsistencies and provide greater clarity.

14. In relation to age groups, there was much stronger support for developing NRVs-R for older infants and young children as separate groups rather than as a combined group. The reasons given concerned the different nutritional needs of these groups due to their differing physiology, growth and development at these life stages.

Therefore the need to establish NRVs-R for older infants and young children in Codex texts has been established under ToR A.

15. An overview of the analysis of labelling provisions in Codex texts under ToR B is outlined in Section 5 and Appendix 3. This identifies areas where amendments have the potential to provide further clarity.

A model of the request to CCFL under ToR B is outlined in Recommendation 7 which concerns a request for advice on the potential for amendments to Codex texts to address the labelling issues identified under ToR A. This recommendation may be amended following the decisions made at CCNFSDU40.

RECOMMENDATIONS**ToR A (ii)***Age groups***RECOMMENDATION 1a**

That a separate set of NRVs-R be established for older infants

RECOMMENDATION 1b

That a separate set of NRVs-R be established for young children

*Standardisation of age ranges***RECOMMENDATION 2a**

That the age range for older infants be standardised throughout all relevant Codex texts to be from 6 months to less than 12 months

RECOMMENDATION 2b

That the age range for young children be standardised throughout all relevant Codex texts to be from 12 months to less than 36 months

ToR A (i)*Nutrient declaration for relevant Codex texts***RECOMMENDATION 3**

That NRVs-R, agreed under Recommendation 1, be established for labelling of nutrient declaration for:

- Guidelines on Nutrition Labelling - *only for foods specifically labelled for the age groups agreed under Recommendation 1*
- Processed Cereal-Based Foods for Infants and Young Children
- Canned Baby Foods
- Formulated Complementary Foods for Older Infants and Young Children
- Follow-up Formula (under review)
- Vitamin and Mineral Food Supplements

*Guiding vitamin and mineral composition for relevant Codex texts***RECOMMENDATION 4**

That NRVs-R, agreed under Recommendation 1, apply as reference criteria for vitamin and mineral composition in:

- Formulated Complementary Foods for older Infants and Young Children
- Vitamin and Mineral Food Supplements

*Location of NRVs-R***RECOMMENDATION 5**

That NRVs-R, agreed under Recommendation 1 and applying to those Codex texts agreed under Recommendation 3, be established in the *Guidelines on Nutrition Labelling*

*NRVs-R provide reference criteria for claims under national legislation***RECOMMENDATION 6**

That NRVs-R, agreed under Recommendation 1, be available to provide reference criteria in the *Guidelines on Use of Nutrition and Health Claims* in jurisdictions where such claims are permitted under national legislation

ToR B*Request to CCFL***RECOMMENDATION 7 - Model questions subject to decisions made on Recommendations 1-6**

1. Provide advice on the amendments needed to clarify the use of NRVs-R for the age groups agreed under Recommendation 1 for nutrient declaration (and claims where permitted in national legislation) in the following Codex texts:
 - Guidelines on Nutrition Labelling - *only for foods specifically labelled for the age groups agreed under Recommendation 1*
 - Processed Cereal-Based Foods for Infants and Young Children
 - Canned Baby Foods
 - Formulated Complementary Foods for Older Infants and Young Children
 - Follow-up Formula (under review)
 - Vitamin and Mineral Food Supplements
 - Guidelines on Use of Nutrition and Health Claims – *in jurisdictions where such claims are permitted under national legislation*
2. Provide advice on the amendments needed to clarify the use of NRVs-R for the age groups agreed under Recommendation 1 to guide vitamin and mineral composition in the following Codex texts:
 - Formulated Complementary Foods for Older Infants and Young Children
 - Vitamin and Mineral Food Supplements
3. Provide advice on the amendments needed to achieve the outcomes listed below:
 - Outcome 1: Generally, only one set of NRVs-R should appear on food labels – the only exception being foods specifically labelled for both older infants *and* young children
 - Outcome 2: All sets of NRVs (for the age groups agreed under Recommendation 1, and the general population) to be located in the *Guidelines on Nutrition Labelling* with relevant application between these Guidelines and the particular Codex texts agreed under Recommendation 3

16. The Committee is invited to consider Recommendations 1 – 7 above. The full discussion paper is presented below.

Discussion Paper

1. Introduction and Background

At the 39th session of the Codex Committee on Nutrition and Foods for Special Dietary Uses (CCNFSDU), the Committee agreed to establish an electronic Working Group (eWG), working in English and Spanish, on NRVs-R for Older Infants and Young Children.

The work of this eWG is outlined in the Project Document following the 2007 CCNFSDU 29th session (see Appendix 1), proposing new work to revise nutrient reference values of vitamins and minerals. This states that:

“Once the above is completed [updated NRVs for the general population, older than 36 months], the Committee would establish vitamin and mineral NRVs for labelling for individuals 6 months to 36 months of age. The Committee could then begin to work to establish principles that would apply to NRVs for this age group, using as a basis the principles identified for NRVs for the general population and modifying them as appropriate. Once those principles are developed, the NRVs for this age group would be established.”

The work updating the *Guidelines on Nutrition Labelling* with respect to NRVs for the general population (older than 36 months), was led by Australia who offered at the 38th and 39th sessions to assist as a member and mentor/technical advisor of the eWG Chairs. This offer was gratefully accepted by the Chairs who recognised the insight and knowledge that Australia could provide to the work.

2. Conduct of the Electronic Working Group

2.1 Management of eWG work

In January 2018, Codex Members and Codex Observers were invited to participate in the eWG for 2018 through the Codex Platform. The eWG is made up of 29 Codex Members (CMs) and 10 Codex Observers (COs)¹. Responses to this consultation were received from 15 CMs and 4 COs. The following abbreviations have been used throughout the paper:

CM(s) = Codex Member(s)

CO(s) = Codex Observer(s)

Consultation

Due to the time required for translation into Spanish only one round of consultation was carried out.

Working in English and Spanish

The Consultation Paper was posted on the Codex Platform in English and Spanish. Responses were received in English (15) and Spanish (4). Mexico translated all responses so that all feedback to the Consultation Paper was available on the platform for the eWG in both languages.

Liaising with CCFL

The United States of America liaised with the Canadian Secretariat for CCFL to ensure a valid request to CCFL would be developed under ToR B.

2.2 Approach to the Consultation

The tasks undertaken to address the ToRs in the Consultation Paper were as follows:

Definition of NRVs-R and nutrients they apply to

The definition of NRVs-R and the nutrients they apply to were taken from the *Guidelines on Nutrition Labelling*. In these Guidelines, NRVs-R are defined as a set of scientific numerical values associated with nutrient requirements which can be used for nutrition labelling and relevant claims.

¹ Australia, Austria, Brazil, Canada, Chile, China, Colombia, Egypt, European Union, France, Germany, India, Indonesia, Iran, Japan, Malaysia, Mexico, New Zealand, Peru, Republic of Kazakhstan, Republic of Korea, Republic of Macedonia, Russia, Singapore, Switzerland, Thailand, United Kingdom, United States of America, Uruguay, Comité Européen des Fabricants de Sucre, Council for Responsible Nutrition, EU Speciality Food Ingredients, International Alliance of Dietary/Food Supplement Associations, International Council of Grocery Manufacturer Associations, International Dairy Federation, Institute of Food Technologists, International Special Dietary Foods Industries, Specialised Nutrition Europe, World Sugar Research Organisation

The nutrients that NRVs-R apply to are outlined in the Guidelines for declaration of protein, 13 vitamins and 10 minerals. The level of these nutrients in foods can be expressed as a percentage of the NRVs-R to better inform consumers about what the food contains in relation to their requirements. Therefore the purpose of NRVs-R is to help consumers make healthy food choices.

Codex texts explored

The Codex texts identified relevant to NRVs-R for older infants and young children and the types of foods they cover are as follows:

Codex Text	Type of foods covered
<i>Guidelines on Nutrition Labelling (CXG 2-1985)</i>	All foods
<i>Processed Cereal-Based Foods for Infants and Young Children (CXS 74-1981)</i>	Foods for special dietary uses
<i>Canned Baby Foods (CXS 73-1981)</i>	Foods for special dietary uses
<i>Guidelines on Formulated Complementary Foods for Older Infants and Young Children (CXG 8-1991)</i>	Foods for special dietary uses
<i>Follow-up Formula (CXS 156-1987; under review)</i>	Foods for special dietary uses
<i>Guidelines for Use of Nutrition and Health Claims (CXG 23-1997)</i>	All foods
<i>Guidelines for Vitamin and Mineral Food Supplements (CXG 55-2005)</i>	Food Supplements

The *Standard for Infant Formula and Formulas for Special Medical Purposes Intended for Infants (CXS 72-1981)*, proposed by respondents, was excluded. The ToR of this eWG only relates to older infants (>6 months) and this Codex Standard covers formula for infants from birth.

The *Standard for the Labelling of and Claims for Foods for Special Medical Purposes (CXS 180-1991)* was also mentioned as a Codex text to consider. However, this was excluded because NRVs-R for the general population were not considered in relation to this Standard. NRVs-R are for the healthy population and may not be appropriate for older infants and young children requiring foods for special medical purposes.

Nutrition labelling issues identified relevant to NRVs-R for Older Infants and Young Children

This is a summary of the relevant nutrition labelling issues in the *Guidelines on Nutrition Labelling* and other Codex texts considered by this eWG:

- The lack of consistency and clarity in **labelling requirements** relevant to NRVs-R for older infants and young children for food products covered by Codex texts. This is due to the provision of specific nutrition labelling requirements in some Codex texts; reference to the *Guidelines on Nutrition Labelling* in other Codex texts; and a combination of specific labelling requirements *and* reference to Guidelines on Nutrition Labelling in others.
- The lack of clarity around which set of **nutrient reference values** should be used as NRVs-R for older infants and young children. In the *Guidelines for Formulated Complementary Foods*, different sets of nutrient reference values for the same nutrients are used – one to guide composition, and a second to guide labelling. In relation to the *Guidelines for Vitamin and Mineral Food Supplements*, NRVs-R for older infants and young children would provide more relevant references for products specifically labelled for this group.
- The lack of clarity around **age ranges** across Codex texts relevant to older infants and young children. For example, 'up to 3 years' vs. 'up to 36 months' are not the same because 'up to 3 years' could be interpreted as 'up to the end of the third year of life (<48 months)'.

General foods which are specifically labelled for older infants and young children but are not covered by the Codex texts on foods for special dietary uses that address the specific nutritional needs of this age group, was another relevant issue. Such foods fall under the scope of the *Guidelines on Nutrition Labelling* since they apply to all foods; however the current NRVs-R in these Guidelines are not appropriate for older infants and young children because of their lower daily nutritional requirements.

Rationale for questions posed in the Consultation Paper

Having identified the issues in the relevant Codex texts, questions were posed on the need and importance/value of establishing NRVs-R for older infants and young children.

Given the inconsistencies and lack of clarity that exists in relation to NRVs-R for older infants and young children, questions were also posed on what regulations are in place in various Codex Members' jurisdictions on foods for this age group. The purpose of these questions was to gain insight and background to work in this area.

Finally, questions were posed to clarify interpretation of the various age ranges of older infants and young children in these Codex texts.

Developing a request to CCFL under ToR B

A request to CCFL was developed on the basis of analysis of nutrition labelling provisions in Codex texts identified under ToR A. In addition, the potential amendments to labelling provisions in Codex texts were informed by details given by respondents.

3. Feedback from Consultation

2.3 Responses to Consultation Paper

The Chairs received responses to the Consultation Paper from 19 eWG members (15 CMs and 4 COs). The majority of respondents were in favour of having:

- NRVs-R established for older infants and young children applicable to the Codex texts explored
- NRVs-R apply to older infants and young children as two separate groups

2.4 Approaches to analysis

A stepwise approach was applied by the Chair.

First, all responses on each Codex text were considered separately. This identified specific issues that related to each particular text.

Second, responses were considered together for Codex texts where NRVs-R for older infants and young children have similar application e.g. for providing more specific labelling information; or as reference criteria for composition; or, where permitted, as reference criteria for claims. This enabled identification of common issues that applied across Codex texts.

Recommendations were then developed under the ToRs for consideration at CCFSDU40.

The following outlines the reasons for considering some Codex texts separately and for combining others:

1. **The Guidelines on Nutrition Labelling was considered separately.** This emerged as the key Codex text for the establishment of NRVs-R for older infants and young children for two reasons:
 - a. These Guidelines contain the definition for NRVs-R and list values for NRVs-R that have been established for the general population (older than 36 months).
 - b. These Guidelines apply to the nutrition labelling of **all** foods. This includes foods for special dietary uses - although some of these FSDU standards may have more detailed provisions developed.
 - c. The NRVs-R values listed in these Guidelines are used as reference criteria for nutrition and health claims. This has relevance in jurisdictions where claims are permitted under national legislation on foods specifically labelled for older infants and young children.
2. **The Codex texts where NRVs-R for older infants and young children would provide more specific labelling information.** These Codex texts (Processed Cereal-based Foods, Canned Baby Foods, Formulated Complementary Foods, Follow-up Formula (currently under review) and Vitamin and Mineral Food Supplements) were considered together for the following reasons:
 - a. All refer to different types of food required by older infants and young children.
 - b. For labelling purposes, some of these texts refer to the *Guidelines on Nutrition Labelling* and some do not. If NRVs-R are to be established for older infants and young children, these may be relevant in all of these Codex texts for labelling purposes.

- c. If the NRVs-R for older infants and young children are established and listed in the *Guidelines on Nutrition Labelling* this would require each of these Codex texts to reference these guidelines. If so, the need for the current specific provisions for declaration of nutritive value in these standards would need to be assessed.
 - d. Nutrition and health claims are not permitted for foods described in these texts except where specifically provided for in national legislation (*Guidelines for Use of Nutrition and Health Claims*).
3. **Codex texts where NRVs-R for older infants and young children provide reference criteria for compositional purposes.** These Codex texts (*Guidelines on Formulated Complementary Foods for Older Infants and Young Children* and *Guidelines for Vitamin and Mineral Food Supplements*) may refer to newly established NRVs-R for older infants and young children as reference levels for vitamins and minerals for compositional purposes.
 4. **The *Guidelines on the Use of Nutrition and Health Claims* was considered separately.** In jurisdictions where claims on foods specifically labelled for older infants and young children are permitted under national legislation, NRVs-R for older infants and young children may be used as reference criteria for such claims.

The following section outlines the main findings from this analysis.

2.5 *Guidelines on Nutrition Labelling*

A significant majority of CMs (67%) and all COs (100%) were in favour of establishing NRVs-R for older infants and young children in the *Guidelines on Nutrition Labelling*. The main reasons given were that this would be useful as guidance for consumers to help them make informed choices. Two CMs in favour commented that Codex should consider applying such NRVs-R only to young children and not older infants. Almost all (13 out of 15) CMs and all COs were in favour of amendments to these Guidelines to clarify precedence of labelling requirements in Codex texts.

As described earlier, foods that are specifically labelled for older infants and young children but are not covered by Codex texts on foods for special dietary uses are referred to as 'general foods'. Almost all (13 out of 15) CMs report having such foods for sale in their jurisdictions. These 'general foods' varied greatly among jurisdictions – see Table 1 Appendix 2 where the foods are described along with the relevant age groups (older infants vs. young children vs. older infants and young children combined).

A minority (2 CMs) were not in favour - one citing concerns about too much information on the label. This aspect would need clarification -

The intention at this stage is that only one set of NRVs-R should appear on food labels – the only exception being foods specifically labelled for both older infants *and* young children.

Based on the views of the eWG, it is anticipated that most internationally traded foods for this age groups are labelled for either older infants or young children. However, responses to the Consultation Paper indicate there are infrequent situations where a food is specifically labelled for both older infants *and* young children. In these cases, two sets of NRVs-R may apply.

A summary of how this approach would work is outlined in the table below:

All foods – except those specifically labelled for older infants or young children	Foods specifically labelled for older infants	Foods specifically labelled for young children	Foods specifically labelled for both older infants <i>and</i> young children
NRVs-R for the general population (older than 36 months)	NRVs-R for older infants	NRVs-R for young children	NRVs-R for older infants and NRVs-R for young children

The responses to the questions posed on the *Guidelines on Nutrition Labelling* are summarised in Table 2 in Appendix 2.

2.6 Codex texts where NRVs-R for older infants and young children would provide more specific labelling information (*Processed Cereal-Based Foods for Infants and Young Children, Canned Baby Foods, Guidelines on Formulated Complementary Foods for Older Infants and Young Children, Follow-up Formula (under review) and Guidelines for Vitamin and Mineral Food Supplements*)

For labelling purposes, some of these texts (*Processed Cereal-Based Foods*, *Formulated Complementary Foods* and *Follow-up Formula* – currently under review) refer to the Guidelines on Nutrition Labelling and others do not (Canned Baby Foods). If NRVs-R are to be established for older infants and young children, these would be relevant in all of these Codex texts for labelling purposes.

All CMs responded to questions on Processed Cereal-based Foods and Canned Baby Foods, while only 67% responded to questions on Formulated Complementary Foods. This is likely to be due to the minority of CMs (6 out of 15) that have Formulated Complementary Foods for sale specifically labelled for this age group. Formulated Complementary Foods differ in that they are specifically formulated to provide additional energy and nutrients to complement family foods.

There was strong support among CMs (80%) and COs (75%) for establishing NRVs-R for older infants and young children in the *Guidelines on Nutrition Labelling* and applying to the Codex texts on Processed Cereal-based Foods and Canned Baby Foods. The majority of CMs (7 out of 10) who responded on Formulated Complementary Foods and COs (75%) were also in support.

A significant majority of CMs (excess of 73%) and COs (75%) supported developing NRVs-R for older infants and young children as reference criteria for claims on Processed Cereal-based Foods and Canned Baby Foods in jurisdictions where permitted in national legislation. The majority of CMs (5 out of 7) who responded on Formulated Complementary Foods and COs (75%) were also in support.

Regarding vitamin and mineral food supplements, the majority of CMs who responded (7 out of 8) and COs (75%), also supported the development of these NRVs-R so that they can apply to the labelling of these products.

On age groups, there was much stronger support for developing NRVs-R for older infants and young children as separate groups. The reasons given concerned the different nutritional needs due to their differing physiology, growth and development at these times.

The *Standard for Follow-up Formula* is currently under review. The majority of CMs (60%) and COs (75%) were in favour of the development of NRVs-R in the *Guidelines on Nutrition Labelling* to apply to [Name of Product] for young children. However, there was far less support among CMs (47%) for this to apply to follow-up formula for older infants.

The responses to the questions posed on these Codex texts are summarised in Tables 3-7 in Appendix 2.

2.7 Codex texts where NRVs-R for older infants and young children provide reference criteria for compositional purposes (*Guidelines on Formulated Complementary Foods for Older Infants and Young Children and Guidelines for Vitamin and Mineral Food Supplements*)

Currently, two different sets of NRVs-R are referred to within the *Guidelines on Formulated Complementary Foods for Older Infants and Young Children*. The first purpose is for nutrition labelling and this has been addressed in section 3.4 above. The second purpose is compositional where reference values (INL₉₈) for vitamins and minerals are listed in a table in the Annex to those Guidelines.

The majority of those who responded to questions on Formulated Complementary Foods in the Consultation Paper did not see a need for two sets of NRVs-R in these Guidelines.

Similar to Formulated Complementary Foods, the *Guidelines for Vitamin and Mineral Food Supplements* refer to two different sets of NRVs-R. The first set are for labelling purposes and are the NRVs-R for the general population in the *Guidelines on Nutrition Labelling*. The second set are used as reference criteria for vitamin and mineral composition and are the FAO/WHO recommended daily intakes. If NRVs-R are developed for older infants and young children in the *Guidelines on Nutrition Labelling* these should be used for both labelling and compositional purposes.

The responses to the questions posed on these Codex texts are summarised in Tables 5 and 7 in Appendix 2.

2.8 The Guidelines on the Use of Nutrition and Health Claims

There was strong support among CMs (80%) and all COs (100%) in favour of developing NRVs-R for older infants and young children in the *Guidelines on Nutrition Labelling* and be used as a reference for criteria for nutrition and health claims for general foods directed to this age group in national legislation where permitted. The main reason given was that it would provide useful guidance for countries setting criteria for claims.

In relation to age groups, there was much stronger support for developing NRVs-R for older infants and young children as separate groups because they have very different nutritional needs due to their differing physiology, growth and development at these times.

The responses to the questions posed on these Codex texts are summarised in Table 8 in Annex II.

2.9 Age Ranges

There are inconsistencies in how age ranges for older infants and young children are defined in Codex texts.

Almost all CMs (13 out of 15) and all COs (100%) welcomed the opportunity to standardise the age ranges across Codex texts. The main reasons given were that such standardisation would provide clarity and consistency and avoid confusion. There was agreement that the age range for:

- older infants is the period from 6 to 12 months, and
- young children is from 12 to 36 months

The exact cut-offs for these age ranges needs to be standardised. Opinions varied on whether the 12th month should be included in the age range for older infants or young children. There was also inconsistency on inclusion of the 36th month in defining the age range for young children. From the comments received these cut-offs need to be clearly defined and agreed.

A significant majority of respondents (73-80% of CMs and 75% of COs) supported amending the *Guidelines for Nutrition Labelling* and the Codex texts on foods for special dietary uses to standardise age ranges for older infants and young children.

The responses to the questions posed on this issue are summarised in Table 9 in Appendix 2.

3. Support in eWG for establishing NRVs-R for older infants and young children in Codex texts

The eWG responses to the Consultation Paper reflect a need to establish NRVs-R for older infants and young children in the *Guidelines for Nutrition Labelling* and the Codex texts for special dietary use for older infants and young children. As outlined in Section 3, the majority of CMs and COs support the development of such NRVs-R to inform consumers about wise food choices on the basis of requirements. In addition, examination of relevant Codex texts by the eWG demonstrates that the development of such NRVs-R and amendment of texts where necessary would provide greater clarity.

Therefore the need to establish NRVs-R for older infants and young children in Codex texts has been established under ToR A.

4. ToR B

Where a need is established under TOR A:

- B. Analyse nutrition labelling provisions in Codex texts under TOR A (i) and, where appropriate, develop a request to CCFL to provide advice on the potential for amendments to provide further clarity

4.1 Rationale for request to CCFL

Given the level of support under ToR A, it is appropriate to request advice from CCFL. The overall request to CCFL is to determine how best CCFSDU and CCFL can collaborate to complete this work should this be agreed at CCFSDU40.

The following section provides insight to CCFL on the type and extent of changes that may be needed. This outlines the desired outcomes identified by the eWG regarding the establishment of NRVs-R for older infants and young children:

Outcome 1: Generally, only one set of NRVs-R should appear on food labels – the only exception being foods specifically labelled for both older infants *and* young children.

Therefore, although several sets of NRVs-R will be available for food labelling² the NRVs-R for the general population (older than 36 months) should be used on all foods, except those that are specifically labelled for older infants *or* young children. The only exception to this is the infrequent situations where a food is specifically labelled for both older infants *and* young children.

Outcome 2: All agreed sets of NRVs should be located in one primary Codex text.

This will allow for any amendments to be made to one primary text that governs labelling and relevant compositional provisions in other Codex texts. For example, if a NRV-R should need to be updated based on new scientific evidence, an amendment could be made to the *Guidelines on Nutrition Labelling* and then other texts that reference the Guidelines on Nutrition Labelling would automatically incorporate the updated value.

² NRVs-R for older infants; NRVs-R for young children; and NRVs-R for the general population (older than 36 months)

4.2 Specific questions that need to be addressed include:

1. Where NRVs-R for older infants and young children should be located?

There are two possible approaches for CCFL to consider:

Approach 1: Put NRVs-R for older infants and young children in the *Guidelines on Nutrition Labelling*. This approach would satisfy both outcomes.

Approach 2: Put NRVs-R for older infants and young children in each Codex text relevant to this age group. This option would not satisfy outcome 2 in that any updates to NRVs-R will require amendment of several texts.

Having developed this Discussion Paper, it is the view of the Chair and Co-Chairs that the best option is outlined in *Approach 1* (see above) where NRVs-R for older infants and young children are inserted in the *Guidelines on Nutrition Labelling*. This has the following advantages:

- This allows for any amendments to be made to one overarching primary text that other Codex texts can refer to. The Chair has received clarification from the Codex Secretariat this is provided for as outlined in paragraph 3.2.7 of the *Guidelines on Nutrition Labelling*³. However clarification is needed on whether the sections in the FSDU standards agreed under Recommendation 3 relating to *declaration of nutritive value* would still be required if the FSDU standard applies the *Guidelines on Nutrition Labelling*. If they are still required, would %NRVs need to be mentioned in those declarations of nutritive value sections.
- The NRVs-R for general population and NRV-NCD are already in the *Guidelines* and it would make sense to have the NRVs for older infants and young children also in the same *Guidelines*
- This new work, as outlined in the 2007 project document, is about the revision of *Guidelines on Nutrition Labelling*. This implies that the on-going work is to include these NRVs (including any other text on supporting principles etc.) in the *Guidelines on Nutrition Labelling*.

2. What types of products will NRVs-R for older infants and young children apply to?

- a. This requires text to explain that these values would be used on packaged foods that are specifically intended for older infants and young children.
- b. This text must clarify that only one set of NRVs-R should appear on food labels – the only exception being foods specifically labelled for both older infants *and* young children.

3. How will NRVs-R for older infants and young children be used

This requires text to explain that these values will be used for:

- i. Nutrition labelling purposes
- ii. Reference criteria for vitamin and mineral composition where required
- iii. Only in those jurisdictions where permitted under national legislation – as reference criteria for claims on foods specifically labelled for this age group

4.3 Details of the analysis of nutrition labelling provisions in Codex texts relevant to NRVs-R for older infants and young children

The specific areas of Codex texts requiring work to address inconsistencies and provide clarity for NRVs-R for older infants and young children are outlined in Appendix 3. This table summarises the specific provisions in Codex texts for consideration in the development of NRVs-R for older infants and young children.

4.4 Request to CCFL

The request to CCFL is outlined in Recommendation 7.

5. Future Work and Next Steps

Assuming CCNFSDU40 agrees to Recommendations 1-7, this section considers the future work that needs to be undertaken. The following lists all areas that need to be completed before this work on NRVs-R is accomplished:

³"In the case where a product is subject to labelling requirements of Codex Standard, the provisions for nutrient declaration set out in that standard should take precedence over but not conflict with the provision of Sections 3.2.1 to 3.2.6 of these *Guidelines*."

- Develop principles for establishing NRVs-R for older infants and for young children
- Determine which nutrients require NRVs-R for (a) older infants and (b) young children
- Decide the Codex texts to which the NRVs-R apply and for which nutrients
- Amend text and develop new text where necessary in relevant Codex Standards and Guidelines to outline:
 - What foods will the NRVs-R for older infants and young children apply to
 - What these NRVs-R will be used for (nutrient declaration, to guide vitamin and mineral composition, and as reference criteria for claims where permitted under national legislation)

Send CCNFSDU recommended text to CCFL for consideration, amendment if necessary, and endorsement

- Decide how to establish values for NRVs-R for (a) older infants and (b) young children for the agreed nutrients
 - Review the basis for establishing NRVs-R from values given in RASBs – e.g. should the NRVs-R for older infants and young children be derived from the same RASB as the source of the general population NRV-R? This would maintain the appropriate difference between population groups for the same vitamin or mineral.
- Determine whether these NRVs-R values should be decided by:
 - CCNFSDU (eWG/pWG)
 - Or
 - a request to JEMNU to provide these values according to the agreed principles determined by CCNFSDU
- Regularly liaise with CCFL to progress amendments to labelling provisions in relevant Codex texts

A detailed outline of work that could be undertaken in 2019 is provided below (to be amended according to decisions on Recommendations 1-7):

1. Develop principles for establishing NRVs for older infants and for young children⁴.
2. List the nutrients for which NRVs-R should be established for separate groups of older infants and young children.
3. Consider the list of nutrients requiring NRVs-R in each of the relevant Codex texts.
4. Liaise with CCFL to progress amendments to labelling provisions in relevant Codex texts.

⁴ Use The *General Principles for Establishing NRVs for the General Population in the Annex to the Guidelines on Nutrition Labelling* (CXG 2-1985) as a basis - modify as appropriate.

Reference will also be made to sections 7 and 8 of CX/NFSDU 15/37/4 (37th session CCNFSDU, 2015) containing deferred recommendations for draft principles for NRVs-R for older infants and young children.

Developing the principles will include determining how to establish values for NRVs-R for (a) older infants and (b) young children for the agreed nutrients.

APPENDIX 1**PROJECT DOCUMENT OF A PROPOSAL FOR NEW WORK TO REVISE NUTRIENT
REFERENCE VALUES OF VITAMINS AND MINERALS (CAC/GL 2-1985)**

ALINORM 08/31/26, APPENDIX VII

1. PURPOSE AND THE SCOPE OF THE PROPOSED NEW WORK

Section 3.4.4 of the Codex Guidelines for Nutrition Labelling (CAC/GL 2-1985, Rev. 1-1993) provides that numerical information on vitamins, minerals and protein should be expressed as a percentage of the reference labelling value referred to as "Nutrient Reference Value" (NRV). Since the first introduction of this guideline in 1985, Section 3.4.4 was amended once in 1993 following the Report of a Joint FAO/WHO Consultation on Recommended Allowances of Nutrients for Food Labelling Purposes (Helsinki, Finland, 12-16 September 1988). At that time, it was indicated that the definition and review of these values was on-going process, subject to revision according to new scientific data by the Committee of Food Labelling (CCFL). The CCFL also recognized a need for general principles to guide the choice and amendment of NRVs, and had requested the advice of the Committee on Nutrition and Foods for Special Dietary Uses in this respect (ALINORM 93/40).

Currently the list of NRVs in Codex Guidelines for Nutrition Labelling covers 9 vitamins (A, D, C, thiamin, riboflavin, niacin, B6, folic acid and B12), 5 minerals (Calcium, Magnesium, Iron, Zinc, Iodine) and protein, which were in general based on the Reference RDAs for adult men. These values are indicated as a basis for expressing nutrient content in nutrition labelling of food supplements in the Codex Guidelines for Vitamin and Mineral Food Supplements (CAC/GL 55-2005). Also the Codex Guidelines for Use of Nutrition and Health Claims (CAC/GL 23-1997, Rev. 1-2004) indicates NRVs as a basis for criteria for nutrition and health claims.

At the 25th Session of the Codex Committee on Nutrition and Foods for Special Dietary Uses (CCNFSDU) agreed that the current list of NRVs in the Codex Guidelines for Nutrition Labelling was incomplete and required additions and updates. It was also pointed out that a set of principles should be developed for the establishment of NRVs taking into account the experience of member countries in the establishment of reference values for the purpose of labelling.

The purpose of the proposed new work is to develop the science-based general principles for establishing NRVs and to revise the list of NRVs in the Codex Guidelines for Nutrition Labelling, taking full account of the prior work related to nutrient reference values.

2. ITS RELEVANCE AND TIMELINES

WHA Resolution 57.17 endorsing the Global Strategy requested the Codex Alimentarius Commission to continue to give full consideration within the framework of its operational mandate, to measures which it might take to contribute towards the improvement of health standards of foods consistent with the aims and objectives of the Global Strategy.

Accordingly, the 28th Session of the Commission agreed to ask WHO and FAO to prepare a document focused on actions that could be taken by Codex including specific proposals for new work for consideration by the CCNFSDU and the CCFL. At its 29th Session of the Commission, it was agreed to complete a document containing concrete proposals for possible actions by Codex and to circulate for comments and consideration by the CCNFSDU and CCFL.

The CCNFSDU and CCFL had discussed extensively the proposals for actions and both Committees agreed for CCNFSDU to revise the NRVs of vitamins and minerals in the Guidelines for Nutrition Labelling (ALINORM 07/30/26). Therefore the proposal of this new work is timely as well as relevant.

3. THE MAIN ASPECTS TO BE COVERED

This work would involve a process to develop the general principles for establishment of vitamin and mineral NRVs for the general population as a first step.

The next step would be a process to review all available reference values and their scientific basis by the principles agreed upon and, if appropriate, update and extend the current list of vitamin and mineral NRVs in the Guidelines for the Nutrition Labelling.

Once the above is completed, the Committee would establish vitamin and mineral NRVs for labelling for individuals 6 months to 36 months of age. The Committee could then begin to work to establish principles that would apply to NRVs for this age group, using as a basis the principles identified for NRVs for the general population and modifying them as appropriate. Once those principles are developed, the NRVs for this age group would be established.

4. AN ASSESSMENT AGAINST THE CRITERIA FOR THE ESTABLISHMENT OF WORK PRIORITIES

Consumer protection from the point of view of health, food safety, ensuring fair practices in the food trade and taking into account the identified needs of developing countries: This proposed new work would provide Codex and national/regional authorities principles to be used in establishing NRVs, thus assisting in establishing appropriate level of protection for consumers. The project could particularly assist countries that have limited experience with NRVs, particularly for selecting NRVs for labelling purposes.

Diversification of national legislations and apparent resultant or potential impediments to international trade: This proposed new work would provide internationally-recognized scientific general principles that Codex and national/regional authorities may use to carry out establishing NRVs for labelling purposes. Such internationally-agreed principles can help ensure consistent approaches for establishing NRVs for labelling purposes.

Scope of work and establishment of priorities between the various sections of the work: The scope of the work relates to work previously undertaken by Codex on a high priority basis.

Work already undertaken by other organizations in this field: This proposed new work is consistent with, complements, and builds upon work already undertaken by CCFL.

5. RELEVANCE TO THE CODEX STRATEGIC OBJECTIVES

This proposal is consistent with the following strategic goals presented in the Codex Strategic Plan 2008-2013:

Promoting Sound Regulatory Frameworks (Activity 1.3);

Promoting Widest and Consistent Application of Scientific Principles and Risk Analysis (Activities 2.3).

6. INFORMATION ON THE RELATION BETWEEN THE PROPOSAL AND OTHER EXISTING CODEX DOCUMENTS

The Codex Guidelines on Nutrition Labelling (CAC/GL 2-1985, Rev. 1-1993) and Codex Guidelines for Vitamin and Mineral Food Supplements (CAC/GL 55-2005) indicate the NRVs as a basis for expressing nutrient content in nutrition labelling of all foods including conventional foods and food supplements. The Codex Guidelines for Use of Nutrition and Health Claims (CAC/GL 23-1997, Rev. 1-2004) also indicates NRVs as a basis for criteria for nutrition and health claims.

7. IDENTIFICATION OF ANY REQUIREMENT FOR AND AVAILABILITY OF EXPERT SCIENTIFIC ADVICE.

Scientific advice from FAO/WHO could be identified at a later stage.

8. IDENTIFICATION OF ANY NEED FOR TECHNICAL INPUT TO THE STANDARD FROM EXTERNAL BODIES SO THAT THIS CAN BE PLANNED FOR

None foreseen.

9. THE PROPOSED TIME-LINE FOR COMPLETION OF THE NEW WORK, INCLUDING THE START DATE, THE PROPOSED DATE FOR STEP 5 AND THE PROPOSED DATE FOR ADOPTION BY THE COMMISSION: THE TIME FRAME FOR DEVELOPING GUIDELINE SHOULD NOT NORMALLY EXCEED FIVE YEARS

Activity	Step/date
The CCNFSDU agrees the work to be undertaken	Nov, 2007
Commission approves New Work	July 2008
Step 5	2009/2010
Adoption by the Commission	2011/2012

Appendix 2 – ANALYSIS OF FEEDBACK FROM EWG**1. Guidelines on Nutrition Labelling (CXG 2-1985)**

Types of General Foods reported for sale in 92% (12) CMs and age ranges targeted	CMs (42%) having this type of food for Older Infants separately % (n)	CMs (92%) having this type of food for Young Children separately % (n)	CMs having this type of food for Older Infants & Young Children combined (6-36 months) (58%) (unsure of specific age group) (50%) % (n)
• Meat (including strained)	60 (3)	28 (3)	15 (2)
• Vegetables	80 (4)	36 (4)	23 (3)
• Fruit (including purees/stewed/compote)	80 (4)	55 (6)	54 (7)
• Dried fruit	0	9 (1)	0
• Cereal & cereal-based products (including bakery products)	80 (4)	45 (5)	46 (6)
• Biscuits/crackers/rusks (including infant snacks)	100 (5)	45 (5)	23 (3)
• Milk & Dairy Products	40 (2)	82 (9)	38 (5)
• Combination dishes	40 (2)	28 (3)	0
• Fruit juices/ drinks	40 (2)	28 (3)	38 (5)
• Food supplements	40 (2)	18 (2)	8 (1)
• Toddler snacks (puffs)	20 (1)	45 (5)	0
• Baby & Infant foods (cans/weaning/pouches/jars)	60 (3)	28 (3)	38 (5)
• Young child Formula	0	9 (1)	0
• Infant formula	0	9 (1)	0
• Follow-on formula	40 (2)	9 (1)	8 (1)

Table 1. Types of 'General foods for Older Infants and Young Children' 92% (12) Codex Members (CMs) participating in eWG and children targeted (Older Infants separately, Young Children separately, Older Infants & Young Children combined)

Table 2. Feedback from Codex Members (CMs) and Codex Observers (COs) on the establishment of NRVs-R for older infant and young children in the *Guidelines on Nutrition Labelling*

*'general foods' are foods which target older infants and young children but are not covered by the Codex texts on foods for special dietary uses that address the specific nutritional needs of this age group

	CMs % (n)	COs % (n)
Q1a. Should Codex allow for declaration of protein, vitamin and mineral content expressed as %NRVs-R for 'general foods'* targeting older infants and young children		
Yes	67 (10)	100 (4)
No	13 (2)	0
Yes & No	7 (1)	0
Don't know	7 (1)	0
No answer given	7 (1)	0
Q1b. If yes, should NRVs-R be established for OIYC in CAC/GL 2-1985		
Yes	67 (10)	100 (4)
Yes & No	7 (1)	0
Don't know	7 (1)	0
No answer given	20 (3)	0

2. Processed Cereal-Based Foods for Infants and Young Children (CXS 74-1981)

Table 3. Feedback from Codex Members (CMs) and Codex Observers (COs) on the need and importance to apply NRVs-R for older infants and young children in the Guidelines on Nutrition Labelling to nutrition labelling of Processed Cereal-Based Foods for Infants and Young Children

	CMs % (n)	COs % (n)
Q1a. Should NRVs-R be developed for OIYC in CAC/GL 2-1985 and apply to Processed Cereal- Based Foods for OIYC		
Yes	80 (12)	75 (3)
No	0	0
Don't know	13 (2)	0
No answer given	7 (1)	25 (1)
Q1b. If yes, which age groups should these apply to		
OI as separate group	80 (12)	75 (3)
YC as separate group	80 (12)	75 (3)
OI & YC combined	13 (2)	0
Q2a. Should Codex nutrition labelling provide NRVs-R for OIYC as reference criteria for claims on Processed Cereal- Based Foods in national legislation where permitted		
Yes	73 (11)	75 (3)
No	13 (2)	0
Don't know	7 (1)	0
No answer given	7 (1)	25 (1)
Q2b. If yes, which age groups should these apply to		
OI as separate group	73 (11)	75 (3)
YC as separate group	80 (12)	75 (3)
OI & YC combined	20 (3)	0

3. Canned Baby Foods (CXS 73-1981)

Table 4. Feedback from Codex Members (CMs) and Codex Observers (COs) on the need and importance of NRVs-R for older infants and young children (OIYC) for nutrition labelling of Canned Baby Foods

	CMs % (n)	COs % (n)
Q1a. Should NRVs-R be developed for OIYC in CAC/GL 2-1985 and apply to Canned Baby Foods		
Yes	80 (12)	75 (3)

No	7 (1)	0
Don't know	7 (1)	0
No answer given	7 (1)	25 (1)
Q1b. If yes, which age groups should these apply to		
OI as separate group	80 (12)	75 (3)
YC as separate group	80 (12)	75 (3)
OI & YC combined	13 (2)	0
Q2a. Should Codex nutrition labelling provide NRVs-R for OIYC as reference criteria for claims on Canned Baby Foods in national legislation where permitted		
Yes	73 (11)	75 (3)
No	13 (2)	0
Don't know	7 (1)	0
No answer given	7 (1)	25 (1)
Q2b. If yes, which age groups should these apply to		
OI as separate group	80 (12)	75 (3)
YC as separate group	80 (12)	75 (3)
OI & YC combined	20 (3)	0

4. Guidelines on Formulated Complementary Foods for older Infants and Young Children (CXG 8-1991)

Table 5. Feedback from Codex Members (CMs) and Codex Observers (COs) on the need and importance of NRVs-R for older infants and young children (OIYC) being applied to the Guidelines on Formulated Complementary Foods for Older infants and Young Children

	CMs % (n)	COs % (n)
Q1a. Should NRVs-R be developed for OIYC in CAC/GL 2-1985 and apply to Formulated Complementary Foods to allow for declaration of nutrients expressed as % NRVs-R		
Yes	47 (7)	75 (3)
No	7 (1)	0
Don't know	13 (2)	0
No answer given	33 (5)	25 (1)
Q1b. If yes, which age groups should these apply to		
OI as separate group	53 (8)	75 (3)
YC as separate group	53 (8)	75 (3)
OI & YC combined	0	0
Q2a. Should Codex nutrition labelling provide NRVs-R for OIYC as reference criteria for claims on Formulated Complementary Foods in national legislation where permitted		
Yes	33 (5)	75 (3)
No	13 (2)	0
Don't know	13 (2)	0
No answer given	40 (6)	25 (1)
Q2b. If yes, which age groups should these apply to		
OI as separate group	40 (6)	75 (3)
YC as separate group	40 (6)	75 (3)
OI & YC combined	0	0
Q3. Is there a need for two sets of NRVs-R in CAC/GL 8-1991		
Yes	13 (2)	7 (1)
No	33 (5)	0
Don't know	27 (4)	7 (1)
No answer given	27 (4)	13 (2)

5. Follow-up Formula (CXS 156-1987; under review)

Table 6. Feedback from Codex Members (CMs) and Codex Observers (COs) on the need and importance of NRVs-R for older infants and young children (OIYC) in the Guidelines on Nutrition Labelling in terms of nutrition labelling in Follow-up Formula products

	CMs % (n)	COs % (n)
Q1. Number of CMs and COs welcoming development of NRVs-R in CAC/GL 2-1985 allowing nutrient declaration in FuF for older infants		
Yes	47 (7)	75 (3)
No	40 (6)	0
Don't know	13 (2)	0
No answer given	0	25 (1)
Q2. Number of CMs and COs welcoming development of NRVs-R in CAC/GL 2-1985 allowing nutrient declaration in [Name of Product] for young children		
Yes	60 (9)	75 (3)
No	7 (1)	0
Don't know	27 (4)	0
No answer given	7 (1)	25 (1)

6. Guidelines for Vitamin and Mineral Food Supplements (CXG 55-2005)

Table 7. Feedback from Codex Members (CMs) and Codex Observers (COs) on the need and importance of NRVs-R for Older Infants and Young Children in Guidelines for Vitamin and Mineral Food Supplements

	CMs % (n)	COs % (n)
Q1a. Should NRVs-R be developed for OIYC in CAC/GL 2-1985 and apply to Vitamin and Mineral Food Supplements to allow for declaration of nutrients expressed as % NRVs-R		
Yes	47 (7)	75 (3)
No	0	0
Don't know	7 (1)	0
No answer given	47 (7)	25 (1)
Q1b. If yes, which age groups should these apply to		
OI as separate group	47 (7)	75 (3)
YC as separate group	47 (7)	75 (3)
OI & YC combined	7 (1)	0
Q2a. Should Codex nutrition labelling provide NRVs-R for OIYC as reference criteria for claims on Vitamin and Mineral Food Supplements in national legislation where permitted		
Yes	40 (6)	75 (3)
No	0	0
Don't know	7 (1)	0
No answer	53 (8)	7 (1)
Q2b. If yes, which age groups should these apply to		
OI as separate group	40 (6)	75 (3)
YC as separate group	40 (6)	75 (3)
OI & YC combined	7 (1)	0

7. Guidelines on Use of Nutrition and Health Claims (CXG 23-1997)

Table 8. Feedback from Codex Members (CMs) and Codex Observers (COs) on the need and importance of NRVs-R for older infants and young children (OIYC) being applied to the Guidelines for Use of Nutrition and Health Claims

	CMs % (n)	COs % (n)
Q1a. Should NRVs-R be developed for OIYC in CAC/GL 2-1985 for use as reference criteria for claims in national legislation where permitted		
Yes		
No	80 (12)	100 (4)
Don't know	7 (1)	0
No answer given	7 (1)	0
Q1b. If yes, which age groups should these apply to	7 (1)	0
OI as separate group		
YC as separate group	67 (10)	100 (4)

OI & YC combined	67 (10) 13 (2)	100 (4) 0
------------------	-------------------	--------------

8. Age Ranges

Table 9. Feedback from Codex Members (CMs) and Codex Observers (COs) on Age Ranges

	CMs % (n)	COs % (n)
Q1a. Number of CMs and COs welcoming opportunity to standardise expression of age ranges across Codex texts		
Yes	87 (13)	100 (4)
No	13 (2)	0
Q1b. If yes, how should age ranges be standardised for older infants:		
6 months to < 13 months (from 6 months up to and including 12 months)	40 (6)	0
6 months to < 12 months (from 6 months up to and not including 12 months)	33 (5)	0
Other	27 (4)	100 (4)
Q1c. If yes, how should age ranges be standardised for young children:		
From upper age limit of older infants to <37 months (up to and including 36 months)	33 (5)	0
From upper age limit of older infants to <36 months (up to and not including 36 months)	20 (3)	0
Other		
No answer given	47 (7) 13 (2)	75 (3) 25 (1)
Q2. Which Codex texts should be amended to standardise age ranges for OIYC		
CXG 2-1985	80 (12)	75 (3)
CXG 23-1997	40 (6)	25 (1)
CXS 74-1981	73 (11)	75 (3)
CXS 73-1981	73 (11)	75 (3)
CXG 8-1991	73 (11)	75 (3)
CXS 156-1987	73 (11)	75 (3)
CXG 55-2005	33 (5)	25 (1)

APPENDIX 3 - SUMMARY OF SPECIFIC PROVISIONS IN CODEX TEXTS FOR CONSIDERATION IN THE DEVELOPMENT OF NRVS-R FOR OLDER INFANTS AND YOUNG CHILDREN

Codex text	Specific reference to other Codex texts relating to NRVs-R	References to nutrients relevant to NRVs-R (labelling declarations and claims)	Applicable age range	Comments
Guidelines on Nutrition Labelling (CXG 2 -1985)	<p>Para 3.2.7; where products are subject to labelling requirements of a Codex standard, the provisions for nutrient declaration set out in that standard should take precedence over but not conflict with the provisions outlined in sections 3.2.1 - 3.2.6</p> <p>Para 3.5; where products are subject to a Codex standard, requirements for tolerances for nutrient declaration by the standard should take precedence</p> <p>Para 4.1; General Standard for the Labelling of Pre-packaged Foods (CXS 1-1985) sections 8.1.1, 8.1.2, 8.1.3, 8.2</p>	<p>Para 3.2; mandatory listing of protein (para 3.2.1) and vitamins and minerals when a claim is made (para 3.2.1 and possibly 3.2.2 and 3.2.4)</p> <p>Para 3.2.6; voluntary listing of vitamins and minerals is described</p> <p>Para 3.4 Presentation of nutrient content; para 3.4.4 – NRVs-R are described, para 3.4.4.1 - the established NRVs-R for general population older than 36 months for protein, vitamins and minerals are outlined</p>	General population older than 36 months	Revisions - should NRVs-R be developed for older infants and young children - it would be expected they would be listed in this Codex Guideline
Guidelines for Use of Nutrition and Health Claims (CXG 23 – 1997)	<p>Para 1.4; describes how nutrition and health claims shall not be permitted for foods for infants and young children except where specifically provided for in relevant Codex texts or in national legislation</p> <p>Para 3; any food with a nutrition or health claim should be labelled with a nutrient declaration in accordance with section 3 of the <i>Guidelines on Nutrition Labelling (CXG 2 -1985)</i></p> <p>Para 4.1; only nutrition claims permitted shall be those relating to nutrients for which NRVs have been laid down in the <i>Codex Guidelines on Nutrition Labelling (CXG 2 -1985)</i> these only provide for individuals older than 36 months</p>	<p>Para 7.1.4; the use of NRVs to underpin claim benefits of constituents in food that have NRV established</p> <p>Para 7.1.5; NRVs used to identify nutrients which can be the subject of a nutrient function claim</p> <p>Para 8.6; table of conditions for nutrient content claims and outlines how NRVs are used to set conditions for 'source' and 'high' nutrient content claims for protein, vitamins and minerals</p>	Para 1.4 excludes nutrition and health claims on foods for older infants and young children except where specifically provided for in Codex texts or national legislation	No Codex standards, governing foods for special dietary uses, provide for claims. Therefore the need for NRVs-R for older infants and young children as a basis for claims is only relevant in jurisdictions where national legislation provides for claims on foods targeting these age groups

Codex text	Specific reference to other Codex texts relating to NRVs-R	References to nutrients relevant to NRVs-R (labelling declarations and claims)	Applicable age range	Comments
Processed cereal-based food for infants and young children (CXS 74-1981)	<p>Para 8.1.1; refers to Guidelines on Nutrition Labelling (CXG 2-1985), Guidelines for Use of Nutrition and Health Claims (CXG 23-1997), and General Standard for the Labelling of Pre-packaged Foods (CXS 1-1985)</p> <p>Para 8.1.2 notes para 1.4 of Guidelines for Use of Nutrition and Health Claims may be permitted under national legislation</p> <p>Other Codex texts not relating to NRVs-R are also referred to in this Codex Standard⁵</p>	<p>Section 8.4 refers to declaration protein; calcium, vitamins B1, A and D; and other nutritional information required by national legislation (may include other vitamins and minerals which have NRVs-R established)</p> <p>No specific mention of NRVs-R</p>	<p>Para 1; No minimum age but scope refers to generally from 6 month</p> <p>Para 2.2.1; 'Infant means a person of not more than 12 months'</p> <p>Para 2.2.2; 'Young children means persons from the age of more than 12 months up to age of 3 years (36 months)'</p>	<p>Minimum B1, calcium, vitamin A and D requirements may not align with min 5% NRV-R declaration for content claims in Guidelines on Nutritional Labelling requirements if adopted in national legislation.</p> <p>However, section 8.4 does not reference NRVs-R</p>
Canned Baby Foods (CXS 73-1981)	<p>No references to Codex texts relating to NRVs - R</p> <p>Other Codex texts not relating to NRVs-R are referred to in this Codex Standard⁶</p>	<p>Para 3.1.2; Addition of vitamins and minerals according to national legislation</p> <p>Para 9.3; outlines declaration of nutritive value, does not refer to NRVs-R</p>	<p>Para 1.1; No minimum age but scope refers to use in infant's weaning period. 'Infant means person of not more than 12 months'</p> <p>'Young children means persons of more than 12 months up to age of 3 years'</p>	<p><i>For the purposes of exploring NRVs-R in Canned Baby Foods (CXS 73-1981), please consider other forms of packaging used for these foods (e.g. pouches, jars, cartons, boxes etc.)</i></p> <p>Para 9.3 sets out requirements for declaration of nutrition information and does not refer to NRVs-R</p>
Follow-up Formula (CXS 156-1987)	Under review		<p>Older infant means a person from the age of 6 months and not more than 12 months of age.</p> <p>Young child means a person from the age of more than 12 months up to the age of three years (36 months)</p>	<p>Para 9.3 sets out requirements for declaration of nutrition information but does not refer to NRVs-R</p>

⁵ *Advisory lists of nutrient compounds for use in foods for special dietary uses intended for infants and children (CXG 10-1979), General Standard for Food Additives (CXS 192-1995), Principles and Guidelines for the Establishment and Application of Microbiological Criteria related to Foods (CXG 21-1997) and General Principles of Food Hygiene (CXC 1 1969) and other relevant Codex texts such as codes of hygienic practice and codes of practice.*

⁶ As per footnote 1 but also including *Recommended Methods of Analysis and Sampling (CXS 234 – 1999)*.

Codex text	Specific reference to other Codex texts relating to NRVs-R	References to nutrients relevant to NRVs-R (labelling declarations and claims)	Applicable age range	Comments
Formulated Complementary Foods for Older Infants and Young Children (CXG 8-1991)	<p>Footnote 1; Standard for Processed cereal-based food for infants and young children (CXS 74-1981)</p> <p>Footnote 2; Standard for Canned Baby Foods (CXS 73-1981)</p> <p>Footnote 15 and para 10.1; Guidelines on Nutrition Labelling (CXG 2-1985)</p> <p>Para 10.1; General Standard for the Labelling of claims for Pre-packaged Foods for Special Dietary Uses (CXS 146-1985) and the Guidelines for Use of Nutrition and Health Claims (CXG 23-1997)</p> <p>Other Codex texts not relating to NRVs-R are referred to in this Codex Standard⁷</p>	<p>Para 10.2.3 outlines declaration of nutritive value</p> <p>Table in Annex lists INL₉₈ values as a guide for selection and amounts of vitamins and minerals to be added to a Formulated Complementary Food (suggested total quantity of each of these vitamins and or minerals in a daily ration of a Formulated Complementary Food is at least 50% of the INL₉₈. These values are derived from a range of sources (see table footnotes). These values are different to NRVs- R in the Guidelines in Nutrition Labelling (CXG 2-1985)</p>	<p>'Older infants means persons from the age of 6 months and not more than 12 months of age'</p> <p>'Young children means persons from the age of more than 12 months up to the age of three years (36 months)'</p> <p>Para 10.2.4.1; label must clearly indicate the age the product is recommended for. This age must not be less than 6 months for any product</p>	<p>According to these Guidelines it is recommended that nutrition labelling be in accordance with the Guidelines on Nutrition Labelling (CXG 2-1985) and Guidelines on Nutrition and Health Claims (CXG 23-1997) with specific requirements outlined in para 10.2.3 which do not reference NRVs-R in para 3.4.4 in the Guidelines on Nutrition Labelling (CXG 2-1985).</p> <p>Therefore the set of NRVs-R outlined in the Annex of this Codex text may differ from any NRVs-R established for older infants and young children in the Guidelines on Nutrition Labelling. CCNFSDU may wish to consider how these could be aligned</p>
Vitamin and mineral food supplements (CXG 55-2005)	<p>Para 1.4; General Standard for the Labelling of and Claims for Pre-packaged Foods for Special Dietary Uses (CXS 146-1958) – see comments</p> <p>Para 5.1; Codex Standard for Labelling of Pre-packaged Foods (CXS 1-1995) and General Guidelines on Claims (CXG 1-1979)</p> <p>Para 5.3; Guidelines on Nutrition Labelling (CXG 2-1985)</p>	<p>Para 5.5; information on vitamins and minerals should also be given as a percentage of NRVs as outlined in the Guidelines on Nutrition Labelling</p>	No age referred to	<p>'General foods for older infants and young children' are foods that target this age group but are not foods for special dietary uses covered by Codex texts – vitamin and mineral food supplements represent such general foods in some jurisdictions</p>

⁷ As per footnote 1 but also including Vegetable Protein Products (CXS 174-1989), Soy Protein Products (CXS 175-1989), Wheat protein products including wheat gluten (CXS 163-1987)

Codex text	Specific reference to other Codex texts relating to NRVs-R	References to nutrients relevant to NRVs-R (labelling declarations and claims)	Applicable age range	Comments
				If NRVs-R are not developed for older infants and young children, the values for individuals older than 36 months will be used for general foods such as vitamin and mineral food supplements targeting this age group