



JOINT FAO/WHO FOOD STANDARDS PROGRAMME
CODEX COMMITTEE ON FOOD ADDITIVES
Forty-sixth Session
Hong Kong, China, 17-21 March 2014

RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE ENTRY OF NEW PROVISIONS, INCLUDING THOSE FOR FOOD CATEGORY 16.0 “PREPARED FOODS”, AND FOR REVISION OF EXISTING FOOD ADDITIVE PROVISIONS (BASED ON REPLIES TO CL 2012/5-FA, PART B, POINTS 9 AND 10)

Prepared by an electronic Working Group lead by the United States of America, with the assistance of the European Union, Japan, Iran, Malaysia, Norway, Russia, Spain, Thailand, the United Kingdom, CCTA, EFEMA, ELC, IACM, ICBA, ICGMA, IDF, NATCOL

Background

1. The 44th Codex Committee on Food Additives (CCFA) forwarded a revised title and descriptor for food category 16.0 to the Codex Alimentarius Commission for adoption at Step 8.¹ As a result of this revision, the Committee also recommended revocation or discontinuation of all provisions in food category 16.0.² The 44th CCFA also issued a Circular Letter (CL 2012/5-FA, Part B, point 9) requesting proposals for new provisions for the use of food additives in this food category in order to populate food category 16.0 with provisions appropriate to the revised title and descriptor.³
2. The 44th CCFA issued a Circular Letter (CL 2012/5-FA, Part B, point 10) requesting proposals for new or revised provisions for the General Standard for Food Additives (GSFA) to be submitted according to the *Procedure for Consideration of the Entry and Review of Food Additive Provisions in the General Standard for Food Additives*.⁴
3. Due to time constraints, the 45th CCFA was unable to discuss the proposals for new provisions for inclusion in food category 16.0, nor the proposals for new additive provisions and revisions of existing provisions of the GSFA. As a result, the Committee agreed to request that the electronic working group (e-WG) on the GSFA for the 46th CCFA prepare recommendations for the entry of the new provisions and revision of the existing provisions of the GSFA.⁵

Working Document

4. The e-WG to the 46th CCFA commented on the proposed new provisions for inclusion in the GSFA at Step 2 that were submitted in response to CL 2012/5-FA, Part B, points 9 and 10.⁶ These comments were made in the context that, should the Committee agree with a recommendation for inclusion in the GSFA at Step 2, the provision will be maintained in the GSFA at Step 2 and circulated for full comment at Step 3 at a future date as the Committee's agenda permits. However, should the Committee agree that sufficient information was not provided to support inclusion of the provision in the GSFA at Step 2, the Committee will discard the proposed provision). During compilation of the e-WG comments, it was noted that many comments focused on specific criteria in Section 3.2 of the Preamble to the GSFA. As per the *Procedures for consideration of entry and review of food additive provisions in the General Standard for Food Additives (GSFA)*,⁷ the appropriate step to submit comments on the specific criteria in Section 3.2 is when a proposed draft provision is circulated for comment at Step 3.

¹ REP 12/FA para. 114 and Appendix X.

² REP 12/FA para. 114 and Appendix VII and VIII.

³ REP 12/FA, para. 115.

⁴ REP 12/FA, para. 87.

⁵ REP 12/FA, para. 100.

⁶ CX/FA 13/45/11, CX/FA 13/45/12, FA/45 CRD 6, and FA/45 CRD 12.

⁷ Codex Procedural Manual, 21st Ed. (2013), Section II: Elaboration of Codex Standards and Related Texts, p. 55.

5. Appendix 1 of this document presents recommendations (discard include in the GSFA at step 2) on new provisions proposed for inclusion in the GSFA at Step 2 which were submitted in response to CL 2012/5-FA, Part B, points 9 and 10.⁶ The recommendations presented in Appendix 1 are not based on a consensus approach to the comments of the e-WG. Rather, these recommendations are based upon whether information was provided that the provision meets the minimum requirements for the inclusion of a food additive provision in the GSFA: (i) the additive has an acceptable daily intake (ADI) established by the Joint FAO/WHO Expert Committee on Food Additives (JECFA); (ii) inclusion of the additive in the International Numbering System (INS); and (iii) that the comments to the first circular indicate that the additive is used in international trade (i.e. use of the additive in the food category by several Codex Members).

6. Appendix 1 does not contain the proposals for new provisions or revision of existing provisions in the GSFA which were submitted in response to CL 2012/5-FA, Part B, points 9 and 10, which are scheduled to be discussed by the 46th CCFA as part of other Agenda items. This includes provisions in food category 14.2.3 (Grape wines) and its sub-categories (addressed in Agenda Item 5(c)), provisions for aspartame (INS 951) and aspartame-acesulfame salts (INS 962) (addressed in Agenda Item 5(g)), and provisions for nisin (INS 234) (addressed in Agenda Item 5(f)).

7. The e-WG to the 46th CCFA also commented on the proposals for revision or revocation of existing provisions in the GSFA, submitted in response to CL 2012/5-FA, Part B, point 10.⁸ These comments were made in the context that they will be used to formulate a recommendation to the 46th CCFA as to whether or not the proposal should be included in an Annex that will be maintained until such time that the Committee circulates the recommendation on the existing provision for final comment. Should the Committee agree with inclusion of the recommendation in an Annex, the recommendation for revision or revocation will not be included in the GSFA at this time. Rather, the proposed revisions or revocation will be maintained and updated each year in an Annex to the e-WG Report. The recommended revisions within the Annex will be circulated for final comment by the Committee at a later date as the CCFA agenda permits. Should the Committee agree that not enough information has been provided to support maintaining the proposal for revision or revocation, the Committee will discard the proposal.

8. Appendix 2 of this document presents recommendations (discard, maintain proposal for revision/revocation in a separate Annex) on proposals for revision or revocation of existing provisions in the GSFA, submitted in response to CL 2012/5-FA, Part B, point 10.⁸ The recommendations contained in Appendix 2 are based upon a consensus approach taking into comments from the eWG to the 46th CCFA and comments submitted with the original proposal. These recommendations are based on a "weight of evidence" approach; that is, comments containing justifications were given more weight than comments with no supporting justification

9. The following conventions were used to prepare this document:

- The Appendices are presented in the format of Table 1 of the GSFA (the information is presented alphabetically by food additive name).
- When the proposal is to move a food additive provision from a food subcategory to a parent category, the original provision in the food subcategory will be indicated with ~~strikethrough~~ font and the new provision in the parent food category is in **bold** font with no Step indicated in the "Step/Adopted" column.
- When the proposal is to revise an existing adopted provision, any information in the original provision that is proposed to be revised is indicated with ~~strikethrough~~ font. Any new information that is proposed to be added to an existing provision is in **bold** font.
- When the proposal is to revoke an existing adopted provision, the entire provision is presented in ~~strikethrough~~ font.

⁸ CX/FA 13/45/12, FA/45 CRD 6, and FA/45 CRD 12.

Appendix 1: New Proposals (including those for Food Category 16.0) for Inclusion in the GSFA at Step 2⁹

Acetic and fatty acid esters of glycerol (INS 472a)						
Food Category No.	Food or Food Category	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Summary of original supporting information submitted with proposal	Comments by e-WG members	e-WG recommendation
06.4.1	Fresh pastas and noodles and like products	GMP		EFEMA, IFAC: as thickener	<p>EU: “as thickener” is not sufficient justification. General permission in food for does not provide information on use in this specific FC. Differences of pastas and noodles should be taken into account.</p> <p>Japan, Russia, Spain, UK: insufficient information provided</p> <p>USA: additive is allowed in the USA in foods in general</p> <p>EFEMA, ELC: supports inclusion in GSFA in step 2. This proposed provision would be in alignment with the EU legislation (INS 472a is authorised for use at QS in noodles according to Regulation (EU) No 1129/2011).</p>	Include in the GSFA at step 2 - Additive is in the INS, has been evaluated by JECFA, and comments indicate that the additive is used in this food category by several Codex Member States

Acetylated distarch adipate (INS 1422)						
Food Category No.	Food or Food Category	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Summary of original supporting information submitted with proposal	Comments by e-WG members	e-WG recommendation
06.4.1	Fresh pastas and noodles and like products	GMP		ICGMA: For use as thickener	EU, Iran, Russia, Spain, UK: insufficient information provided	Discard – no information was provided that the additive is used in this food category by Codex Member States
06.4.2	Dried pastas and noodles and like products	GMP		ICGMA: For use as thickener	<p>EU, Iran, Japan, Spain, UK: insufficient information provided</p> <p>Russia: Supports proposal only for gluten free and/or pasta intended for hypoproteic diets.</p> <p>ELC: supports inclusion in GSFA at step 2</p>	Include in the GSFA at step 2 - Additive is in the INS, has been evaluated by JECFA, and comments indicate that

⁹ This Appendix contains proposals which were submitted in response to CL 2012/5-FA, Part B, points 9 and 10. It does not contain proposals submitted in response to CL 2012/5-FA that will be discussed as part of other items on the Agenda of the 46th CCFA. This includes proposals for provisions in food category 14.2.3 (Grape wines) and its sub-categories (addressed in Agenda Item 5(c)), proposals for provisions for aspartame (INS 951) and aspartame-acesulfame salts (INS 962) (addressed in Agenda Item 5(g)), or proposals for provisions for nisin (INS 234) (addressed in Agenda Item 5(f)).

						the additive is used in this food category by several Codex Member States
--	--	--	--	--	--	---

Acetylated distarch phosphate (INS 1414)						
Food Category No.	Food or Food Category	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Summary of original supporting information submitted with proposal	Comments by e-WG members	e-WG recommendation
06.4.1	Fresh pastas and noodles and like products	GMP		ICGMA: For use as thickener	EU, Iran, Japan, Russia, Spain, UK: insufficient information provided	Discard – no information was provided that the additive is used in this food category by Codex Member States
06.4.2	Dried pastas and noodles and like products	GMP		ICGMA: For use as thickener	EU, Iran, Japan, Spain, UK: insufficient information provided Russia: Supports proposal only for gluten free and/or pasta intended for hypoproteic diets. ELC: supports inclusion in GSFA at step 2	Include in the GSFA at step 2 - Additive is in the INS, has been evaluated by JECFA, and comments indicate that the additive is used in this food category by several Codex Member States

Aluminium sulfate (INS 520)						
Food Category No.	Food or Food Category	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Summary of original supporting information submitted with proposal	Comments by e-WG members	e-WG recommendation
10.2.1	Liquid egg products	100	6 ¹⁰	ICGMA: As emulsifier - Protein Coagulation Suppressant (Crystallization inhibitor.) The aluminum binds with egg proteins to help maintain protein solubility during the pasteurization/heating process. Thailand, Indonesia: discard. The use of aluminium-containing food additives should be decreased.	Iran, Malaysia, Norway, Russia, Spain, Thailand, UK: insufficient information provided. The use of aluminium containing additives should be restricted. Norway: aluminium sulphate does not have the INS tech function "emulsifier". Spain: Proposed maximum level needs to be revised and some restrictions applied.	Include in the GSFA at step 2 - Additive is in the INS, has been evaluated by JECFA, and comments indicate that the additive is used in this food category by several Codex Member States
10.2.2	Frozen egg products	100	6		Aluminium sulphates (E 520-523) are authorised in the EU at 30 mg/kg (as aluminium) "only in egg white" and E 520 is also authorised at 25 mg/kg	Include in the GSFA at step 2 - Additive is in the INS, has been evaluated

¹⁰ **Note 6:** As aluminium.

					(as aluminium) "only in liquid egg white for egg foams".	by JECFA, and comments indicate that the additive is used in this food category by several Codex Member States
--	--	--	--	--	--	--

Ammonium hydroxide (INS 527)

Food Category No.	Food or Food Category	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Summary of original supporting information submitted with proposal	Comments by e-WG members	e-WG recommendation
04.1.1.2	Surface treated fresh fruit	GMP		Brazil: acidity regulators are not generally justified in this FC. However, ammonium hydroxide is necessary for the surface treatment of fresh fruits. The use is concomitant with glazing agents, especially waxes, for which there are several authorized for this subcategory. The technological function "carrier" could be added to INS 527. Brazil will make the proposal for addition of the function "carrier" to INS 527 within the INS eWG,	EU, Norway, UK: if carrier for glazing agent, use could be additive in additive. Decisions should be postponed until discussion of Agenda Item 7(b). Iran, Russia: insufficient information provided Spain: does use comply with "carrier" definition?	Include in the GSFA at step 2 - Additive is in the INS, has been evaluated by JECFA, and comments indicate that the additive is used in this food category by several Codex Member States

Annatto extracts, bixin-based (INS 160b(i))

Food Category No.	Food or Food Category	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Summary of original supporting information submitted with proposal	Comments by e-WG members	e-WG recommendation
16.0	Prepared foods	200	8 ¹¹	ICGMA: Restore yellow color to the prepared food. Color additives are used to standardize the color of the food product or to impart a yellow color to the food. Color for microwavable meal (e.g., beef ravioli in tomato and meat sauce; chicken and noodle composite food; chicken flavored rice and vegetable products; spinach and cheese ravioli). India: Any food additive provisions in food category 16 need to specify the prepared food and not general use. The	EU, Spain: provide information why the use cannot be covered in FCs 1- 15. Does use impart or restore colour? Japan, Russia, UK, Norway: Elaborate on the specific food. Natcol, IACM: Include in the GSFA at step 2	Discard – no information was provided that the additive is used in this food category by Codex Member States

¹¹ **Note 8:** As bixin.

				<p>proposal for inclusion of annatto extracts in food category 16 should be linked to the specific prepared foods for which use is proposed.</p> <p>African Union: We support the proposed list of food additives for use in the prepared foods category and evaluation of the proposed MLs. We will consider MLs after JECFA has made evaluation and recommendations. More scientific data is needed to justify the proposed MLs.</p>		
--	--	--	--	---	--	--

Annatto extracts, norbixin-based (INS 160b(ii))						
Food Category No.	Food or Food Category	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Summary of original supporting information submitted with proposal	Comments by e-WG members	e-WG recommendation
16.0	Prepared foods	200	185 ¹²	<p>ICGMA: Restore yellow color to the prepared food. Color additives are used to standardize the color of the food product or to impart a yellow color to the food. Color for microwavable meal (e.g., beef ravioli in tomato and meat sauce; chicken and noodle composite food; chicken flavored rice and vegetable products; spinach and cheese ravioli).</p> <p>India: Any food additive provisions in food category 16 need to specify the prepared food and not general use. The proposal for inclusion of annatto extracts in food category 16 should be linked to the specific prepared foods for which use is proposed.</p> <p>African Union: We support the proposed list of food additives for use in the prepared foods category and evaluation of the proposed MLs. We will consider MLs after JECFA has made evaluation and recommendations. More</p>	<p>EU, Spain: provide information why the use cannot be covered in FCs 1- 15. Does use impart or restore colour? The ADI for norbixin and its salts is 0 – 0.6 mg/kg and the use in “prepared foods” too wide</p> <p>Japan, Russia, UK, Norway: Elaborate on the specific food.</p> <p>Natcol, IACM: Include in the GSFA at step 2</p>	<p>Discard – no information was provided that the additive is used in this food category by Codex Member States</p>

¹² **Note 185:** As norbixin.

				scientific data is needed to justify the proposed MLs.		
--	--	--	--	--	--	--

Brown HT (INS 155)						
Food Category No.	Food or Food Category	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Summary of original supporting information submitted with proposal	Comments by e-WG members	e-WG recommendation
08.4	Edible casings (e.g., sausage casings)	5000		<p>EU: To deliver effective amount of colour. Used only in casings for particular sausages.</p> <p>Mali, African Union: We support the establishment of MLs for food additives in line with Codex procedures. The ML for Brown HT (INS 155) of 5000 mg/kg for use in edible casings should be withheld. The wide use of additives in different food products should take into consideration the possibility that the acceptable level of ingestion (TDI) may be exceeded, particularly for vulnerable groups. The proposed ML for edible casings should take in consideration that the encased food may contain the same additive and therefore the proposed ML for edible casings should be withheld pending the conclusion of the food additive in food category 08.0 at step 7.</p> <p>Indonesia: Does not agree to use the additive in food category 08.4.</p> <p>General Information: The GSFA currently contains a provision in food category 08.0 (Meat and meat products, including poultry and game) at 500 mg/kg, with Note 16 ("For use in glaze, coatings or decorations for fruit, vegetables, meat or fish.") at Step 7.</p>	<p>EU, Spain, UK: Include in the GSFA at step 2. A more detailed technological justification provided in CX/FA 13/45/12.</p> <p>Iran, Malaysia: discard</p> <p>Russia: supports ML of 500 mg/kg only in decorations and coatings.</p> <p>Thailand: does not support ML of 5000 mg/kg - a high amount of colour in edible casings may mislead the consumer.</p> <p>Malaysia: provision should be held pending decision on use of food additive in FC 08.0 (currently at step 7).</p> <p>CCTA: Development of ever thinner casings requires higher concentrations on a w/w basis of colours as there is less casing. The colours are used only for specific applications to enhance the consumer experience. The casing represents less than 1% of the final sausage.</p> <p>IACM: supports inclusion in the GSFA at step 2.</p>	<p>Include in the GSFA at step 2 - Additive is in the INS, has been evaluated by JECFA, and comments indicate that the additive is used in this food category by several Codex Member States</p>

Calcium sulfate (INS 516)						
Food Category No.	Food or Food Category	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Summary of original supporting information submitted with proposal	Comments by e-WG members	e-WG recommendation
10.2.1	Liquid egg products	GMP		ICGMA: as thickener	EU, Iran: not enough information on use provided. Norway, Spain: Calcium sulfate does not have the INS technological function “thickener”. Russia, UK, Malaysia, ELC: supports inclusion in the GSFA at step 2.	Include in the GSFA at step 2 - Additive is in the INS, has been evaluated by JECFA, and comments indicate that the additive is used in this food category by several Codex Member States

Carrageenan (INS 407)						
Food Category No.	Food or Food Category	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Summary of original supporting information submitted with proposal	Comments by e-WG members	e-WG recommendation
01.2.1.2	Fermented milks (plain), heat-treated after fermentation	GMP		Marinalg: For consistency with Codex Standard 243-2003 Indonesia: Agrees with the proposal.	EU, Japan, Malaysia, Russia, Spain, UK, ELC, IDF, Marinalg: supports inclusion in the GSFA at step 2. Iran: not enough information on use provided.	Include in the GSFA at step 2 - Additive is in the INS, has been evaluated by JECFA, and comments indicate that the additive is used in this food category by several Codex Member States

Citric and fatty acid esters of glycerol (INS 472c)						
Food Category No.	Food or Food Category	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Summary of original supporting information submitted with proposal	Comments by e-WG members	e-WG recommendation
06.4.1	Fresh pastas and noodles and like products	GMP		EFEMA, IFAC: as thickener	EU, Iran, Japan, Russia, Spain, UK: not enough information on use provided. Norway: This food additive does not have the INS technological function “thickener”. Spain: needed in pasta or only in noodles? EFEMA, ELC supports this proposal for inclusion into the GSFA.INS 472c is used in noodles in some Codex member states. In addition, this proposed provision would be in	Include in the GSFA at step 2 - Additive is in the INS, has been evaluated by JECFA, and comments indicate that the additive is used in this food category by several Codex Member States

					alignment with the EU legislation (INS 472c is authorised for use at QS in noodles according to Regulation (EU) No 1129/2011).	
--	--	--	--	--	--	--

Dextrins, roasted starch (INS 1400)						
Food Category No.	Food or Food Category	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Summary of original supporting information submitted with proposal	Comments by e-WG members	e-WG recommendation
06.4.2	Dried pastas and noodles and like products	GMP		ICGMA: For use as thickener Indonesia: Agrees with the proposal.	EU, Iran, Japan, Spain, UK: not enough information on use provided. Provision should specify if use in both pasta and noodles. Russia: Agrees with the proposal only for dried pastas and noodles and like products from soft wheat flour EFEMA, ELC supports this proposal for inclusion into the GSFA at step 2.	Include in the GSFA at step 2 - Additive is in the INS, has been evaluated by JECFA, and comments indicate that the additive is used in this food category by several Codex Member States
10.2.1	Liquid egg products	GMP		ICGMA: For use as thickener Indonesia: Agrees with the proposal.	EU: not enough information on use provided Malaysia, Russia, Spain, UK, ELC: supports this proposal for inclusion into the GSFA at step 2.	
10.2.2	Frozen egg products	GMP		ICGMA: For use as thickener Indonesia: Agrees with the proposal.	EU: not enough information on use provided Malaysia, Russia, Spain, UK, ELC: supports this proposal for inclusion into the GSFA at step 2.	

Distarch phosphate (INS 1412)						
Food Category No.	Food or Food Category	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Summary of original supporting information submitted with proposal	Comments by e-WG members	e-WG recommendation
08.1	Fresh meat, poultry, and game	GMP		ICGMA: Modified food starches are used as thickeners with fresh meats to manage texture (thickener), in injected and tumbled poultry, and in sausage-type products.	EU, Spain, Iran, UK: discard. Use of additives in fresh meat should be limited. Japan: The provision is in an incorrect food category. the poultry and sausage-type products in which modified starches are used as thickener are not covered by food category 08.1. Russia: not enough information provided.	Discard – no information was provided that the additive is used in this food category by Codex Member States

Hydroxypropyl distarch phosphate (INS 1442)						
Food Category No.	Food or Food Category	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Summary of original supporting information submitted with proposal	Comments by e-WG members	e-WG recommendation
08.1	Fresh meat, poultry, and game	GMP		ICGMA: Modified food starches are used as thickeners with fresh meats to manage texture (thickener), in injected and tumbled poultry, and in sausage-type products.	EU, Spain, Iran, UK: discard. Use of additives in fresh meat should be limited. Japan: The provision is in an incorrect food category. the poultry and sausage-type products in which modified starches are used as thickener are not covered by food category 08.1. Russia: not enough information provided.	Discard – no information was provided that the additive is used in this food category by Codex Member States

Lactic and fatty acid esters of glycerol (INS 472b)						
Food Category No.	Food or Food Category	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Summary of original supporting information submitted with proposal	Comments by e-WG members	e-WG recommendation
06.4.1	Fresh pastas and noodles and like products	GMP		EFEMA, IFAC: For use as thickener	EU, Japan, Russia, Spain, UK: not enough information on use provided. Provision should specify if used in both pasta and noodles. EFEMA, ELC supports this proposal for inclusion into the GSFA at step 2. This proposed provision would be in alignment with the EU legislation (INS 472b is authorised for use at QS in noodles according to Regulation (EU) No 1129/2011).	Include in the GSFA at step 2 - Additive is in the INS, has been evaluated by JECFA, and comments indicate that the additive is used in this food category by several Codex Member States

Lauric Arginate Ethyl Ester (INS 243)						
Food Category No.	Food or Food Category	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Summary of original supporting information submitted with proposal	Comments by e-WG members	e-WG recommendation
08.2.1	Non-heat treated processed meat, poultry, and game products in whole pieces or cuts	200		USA: Inhibits growth of microorganisms in processed meat and poultry products.	EU, Norway, UK: Additive not currently permitted in these countries. Russia: Not enough information. USA: Yes, the additive is used for this purpose in the USA. ELC, ICGMA: supports inclusion in the GSFA at step 2	Include in the GSFA at step 2 - Additive is in the INS, has been evaluated by JECFA, and comments indicate that the additive is used in this food category by several Codex Member States
08.2.2	Heat-treated processed meat, poultry, and game products in whole pieces or cuts	200		USA: Inhibits growth of microorganisms in processed meat and poultry products.		

08.3.1	Non-heat treated processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	200		USA: Inhibits growth of microorganisms in processed meat and poultry products.		
08.3.2	Heat-treated processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	200		USA: Inhibits growth of microorganisms in processed meat and poultry products.		

Lecithin (INS 322(i))

Food Category No.	Food or Food Category	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Summary of original supporting information submitted with proposal	Comments by e-WG members	e-WG recommendation
01.8.2	Dried whey and whey products, excluding whey cheese	30000		IFAC: Lecithin is currently widely used on whey protein concentrate and whey protein isolate for instantizing at a rate of 0.3-2.0%. The instantizing function of lecithin is required in this application to disperse the dried whey and to provide stabilizing and thickening properties. China: Approved in China in 01.08. Other dairy products (such as whey powder and casein protein powder) at GMP. Support adoption of the provision. Indonesia: Agrees with the proposal.	Iran: discard Russia, UK, ELC, IFAC: supports inclusion in the GSFA at step 2. IDF: requests further information	Include in the GSFA at step 2 - Additive is in the INS, has been evaluated by JECFA, and comments indicate that the additive is used in this food category by several Codex Member States

Mono- and di-glycerides of fatty acids (INS 471)

Food Category No.	Food or Food Category	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Summary of original supporting information submitted with proposal	Comments by e-WG members	e-WG recommendation
01.2.1.2	Fermented milks (plain), heat-treated after fermentation	GMP		EFEMA: For alignment with EU legislation and Codex Standard 243-2003. Emulsifiers are advantageous in fermented dairy products for stabilization of the protein prior to heat treatment and optimization of viscosity, preventing physical spoilage during transport and storage, all while improving mouthfeel, cooking and baking stability.”	EU, Iran, Malaysia, Russia, Spain, UK, EFEMA, ELC, IFAC: supports inclusion in the GSFA at step 2. IDF: Agrees with the proposal for the inclusion of the food additive only as a stabilizer or thickener.	Include in the GSFA at step 2 - Additive is in the INS, has been evaluated by JECFA, and comments indicate that the additive is used in this food category by several Codex Member States

				<p>China: Approved in China in 01.02.01 (Fermented milk) with maximum usage level of 5 g/kg (5000 mg/kg). Support adoption of the provision.</p> <p>Indonesia: Proposes a ML of 5000 mg/kg because it is already sufficient for intended technological need.</p>		
10.2.1	Liquid egg products	GMP		<p>ICGMA: For use as thickener</p> <p>China: Approved in China in 10.03.04 (Liquid egg) at GMP. Support adoption of the provision.</p>	<p>EU: technological justification requested</p> <p>Malaysia, Russia, Spain, UK, ELC: supports inclusion in the GSFA at step 2.</p>	<p>Include in the GSFA at step 2 - Additive is in the INS, has been evaluated by JECFA, and comments indicate that the additive is used in this food category by several Codex Member States</p>

Monostarch phosphate (INS 1410)

Food Category No.	Food or Food Category	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Summary of original supporting information submitted with proposal	Comments by e-WG members	e-WG recommendation
08.1	Fresh meat, poultry, and game	GMP		<p>ICGMA: Modified food starches are used as thickeners with fresh meats to manage texture (thickener), in injected and tumbled poultry, and in sausage-type products.</p>	<p>EU, Spain, Iran, UK: Discard. Use of additives in fresh meat should be limited.</p> <p>Japan: The provision is in an incorrect food category. the poultry and sausage-type products in which modified starches are used as thickener are not covered by food category 08.1.</p> <p>Russia: not enough information provided.</p>	<p>Discard – no information was provided that the additive is used in this food category by Codex Member States</p>

Neotame (INS 961)

Food Category No.	Food or Food Category	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Summary of original supporting information submitted with proposal	Comments by e-WG members	e-WG recommendation
14.1.3.1	Fruit nectars	65		<p>CCC: Improves taste without adding calories.</p> <p>ISA: Products are typically heat-treated, and neotame has greater thermal stability, so that less sweetener is added later in the process.</p>	<p>EU, Norway, Russia, Spain: Could support only with Note 145 “products are energy-reduced or with no added sugar” at 20 mg/kg.</p> <p>Malaysia, ICBA, ELC: supports inclusion in the GSFA at step 2</p>	<p>Include in the GSFA at step 2 - Additive is in the INS, has been evaluated by JECFA, and comments indicate that the additive is used in this food category by several Codex Member States</p>
14.1.3.3	Concentrates for fruit nectars	65				

Pectins (INS 440)						
Food Category No.	Food or Food Category	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Summary of original supporting information submitted with proposal	Comments by e-WG members	e-WG recommendation
14.1.2	Fruit and vegetable juices	3000		<p>Costa Rica, ICGMA: used to thicken and adjust mouth feel and to stabilize</p> <p>China: Approved in China in Fruit and vegetable juices and nectars with maximum usage level of 3 g/kg (3000 mg/kg). Support adoption of the provision.</p> <p>Indonesia: Proposes GMP for the ML of this additive.</p>	<p>EU, Russia, UK: Justified only in vegetable juices and pineapple and passion fruit juices.</p> <p>Iran: discard</p> <p>Japan, ELC, ICBA: supports entry into the GSFA at step 2 (Japan: additive prevents precipitation).</p> <p>Spain: questions if provision is new or a revision of existing provisions? Note pectin is already adopted at GMP in fcs 14.1.2.1, 14.1.2.3, 14.1.3.1, & 14.1.3.3.</p>	<p>Include in the GSFA at step 2 - Additive is in the INS, has been evaluated by JECFA, and comments indicate that the additive is used in this food category by several Codex Member States</p>
14.1.3	Fruit and vegetable nectars	3000				

Phosphated distarch phosphate (INS 1413)						
Food Category No.	Food or Food Category	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Summary of original supporting information submitted with proposal	Comments by e-WG members	e-WG recommendation
08.1	Fresh meat, poultry, and game	GMP		<p>ICGMA: Modified food starches are used as thickeners with fresh meats to manage texture (thickener), in injected and tumbled poultry, and in sausage-type products.</p>	<p>EU, Spain, Iran, UK: Discard. Use of additives in fresh meat should be limited.</p> <p>Japan: The provision is in an incorrect food category. the poultry and sausage-type products in which modified starches are used as thickener are not covered by food category 08.1.</p> <p>Russia: not enough information provided.</p>	<p>Discard – no information was provided that the additive is used in this food category by Codex Member States</p>

Phosphates (INS 339(i), (ii), (iii); 340(i), (ii), (iii); 341(i), (ii), (iii); 342(i), (ii); 343(i), (ii), (iii); 450(i), (ii), (iii), (v), (vi); 451(i), (ii); 452(i), (ii), (iii), (iv), (v); 542)						
Food Category No.	Food or Food Category	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Summary of original supporting information submitted with proposal	Comments by e-WG members	e-WG recommendation
16.0	Prepared foods	2600	33 ¹³ & AA ¹⁴	<p>ICGMA: Sodium phosphate (Trisodium phosphate) is used as a protein stabilizer. It swells the proteins to give a</p>	<p>EU, Spain: provide information why the use cannot be covered in FCs 1- 15.</p> <p>Japan, Russia, UK: Elaborate on the specific</p>	<p>Discard – no information was provided that the additive is used in this</p>

¹³ **Note 33:** As phosphorus.

¹⁴ **Note AA:** INS 339(iii) (trisodium phosphate) only, for use as a stabilizer.

				<p>mouth feel to mimic that of fat and cheese ravioli).</p> <p>India: Any food additive provisions in food category 16 need to specify the prepared food and not general use. The proposal for inclusion of annatto extracts in food category 16 should be linked to the specific prepared foods for which use is proposed.</p> <p>African Union: We support the proposed list of food additives for use in the prepared foods category and evaluation of the proposed MLs. We will consider MLs after JECFA has made evaluation and recommendations. More scientific data is needed to justify the proposed MLs.</p>	food.	food category by Codex Member States
--	--	--	--	---	-------	--------------------------------------

Starches, enzyme treated (INS 1405)

Food Category No.	Food or Food Category	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Summary of original supporting information submitted with proposal	Comments by e-WG members	e-WG recommendation
08.1	Fresh meat, poultry, and game	GMP		ICGMA: Modified food starches are used as thickeners with fresh meats to manage texture (thickener), in injected and tumbled poultry, and in sausage-type products.	EU, Spain, Iran, UK: Discard. Use of additives in fresh meat should be limited. Japan: The provision is in an incorrect food category. the poultry and sausage-type products in which modified starches are used as thickener are not covered by food category 08.1. Russia: not enough information provided.	Discard – no information was provided that the additive is used in this food category by Codex Member States

Starch acetate (INS 1420)

Food Category No.	Food or Food Category	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Summary of original supporting information submitted with proposal	Comments by e-WG members	e-WG recommendation
06.4.1	Fresh pastas and noodles and like products	GMP		ICGMA: For use as thickener	EU, Japan, Russia, Spain, UK: “as thickener” is not sufficient justification. Differences of pastas and noodles should be taken into account.	Discard – no information was provided that the additive is used in this food category by Codex Member States

06.4.2	Dried pastas and noodles and like products	GMP		ICGMA: For use as thickener	EU, Japan, Russia, Spain, UK: "as thickener" is not sufficient justification. Differences of pastas and noodles should be taken into account.. ELC: supports inclusion in GSFA at step 2	Discard – no information was provided that the additive is used in this food category by Codex Member States
08.1	Fresh meat, poultry, and game	GMP		ICGMA: Modified food starches are used as thickeners with fresh meats to manage texture (thickener), in injected and tumbled poultry, and in sausage-type products.	EU, Spain, UK: Discard. Use of additives in fresh meat should be limited. Japan: The provision is in an incorrect food category. the poultry and sausage-type products in which modified starches are used as thickener are not covered by food category 08.1. Russia: not enough information provided.	Discard – no information was provided that the additive is used in this food category by Codex Member States

Starch sodium octenyl succinate (INS 1450)

Food Category No.	Food or Food Category	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Summary of original supporting information submitted with proposal	Comments by e-WG members	e-WG recommendation
10.2.1	Liquid egg products	GMP		ICGMA: For use as thickener	EU: not enough information on use provided Russia, Spain, UK, ELC: supports this proposal for inclusion into the GSFA at step 2.	Include in the GSFA at step 2 - Additive is in the INS, has been evaluated by JECFA, and comments indicate that the additive is used in this food category by several Codex Member States
10.2.2	Frozen egg products	GMP		ICGMA: For use as thickener		
14.1.5	Coffee, coffee substitutes, tea, herbal infusions, and other hot cereal and grain beverages, excluding cocoa	GMP		ICGMA: For use as thickener	EU: technological justification requested Japan: Supports the proposal. Additive prevents separation of milk fat in coffee with milk. Russia: Agrees with the proposal, excluding cocoa, coffee and coffee extracts. Spain, UK: the technological need for this additive in leaf tea, ground coffee and coffee extracts needs to be further elaborated.	Include in the GSFA at step 2 - Additive is in the INS, has been evaluated by JECFA, and comments indicate that the additive is used in this food category by several Codex Member States

Tartrates (INS 334; 335(i), (ii); 336(i), (ii); 337)						
Food Category No.	Food or Food Category	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Summary of original supporting information submitted with proposal	Comments by e-WG members	e-WG recommendation
16.0	Prepared foods	2600	45 ¹⁵ & BB ¹⁶	<p>ICGMA: L(+)-tartaric acid is used as a flavour synergist (e.g., in the microwavable meal “beef steak and peppers”) where it has a flavour softening effect in products that might use salt/sodium substitutes which could impart harsh notes.</p> <p>India: Any food additive provisions in food category 16 need to specify the prepared food and not general use. The proposal for inclusion of annatto extracts in food category 16 should be linked to the specific prepared foods for which use is proposed.</p> <p>African Union: We support the proposed list of food additives for use in the prepared foods category and evaluation of the proposed MLs. We will consider MLs after JECFA has made evaluation and recommendations. More scientific data is needed to justify the proposed MLs.</p>	<p>EU: Discard. Flavour synergist is a technological purpose falling under the function “flavour enhancer”. Flavour enhancers enhance the existing taste and/or odour of a food. The additive has an opposite effect and “flavour softener” is not an INS functional class.</p> <p>Japan, UK: Elaborate on the specific food.</p> <p>Russia, ELC: support inclusion in the GSFA at step 2.</p> <p>Spain: provide information why the use cannot be covered in FCs 1- 15.</p>	<p>Discard – no information was provided that the additive is used in this food category by Codex Member States</p>

Tartrazine (INS 102)						
Food Category No.	Food or Food Category	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Summary of original supporting information submitted with proposal	Comments by e-WG members	e-WG recommendation
08.4	Edible casings (e.g., sausage casings)	300		<p>EU: To deliver effective amount of colour. Used only in casings for particular sausages.</p> <p>Mali, African Union: We support the establishment of MLs for food additives in line with Codex procedures. The ML for Tartrazine (INS 012) at 300 mg/kg</p>	<p>EU, Russia, Spain, UK: Include in the GSFA at step 2. A more detailed technological justification provided in CX/FA 13/45/12.</p> <p>Iran, Malaysia: Discard</p> <p>Thailand: does not support - a high amount of colour in edible casings may mislead the consumer.</p>	<p>Include in the GSFA at step 2 - Additive is in the INS, has been evaluated by JECFA, and comments indicate that the additive is used in this food category by several</p>

¹⁵ **Note 45:** As tartaric acid.

¹⁶ **Note BB:** INS 334 (L(+)-tartaric acid) only, for use as a flavour synergist.

				<p>should be withheld. The wide use of additives in different food products should take into consideration the possibility that the acceptable level of ingestion (TDI) may be exceeded, particularly for vulnerable groups. The proposed ML for edible casings should take in consideration that the encased food may contain the same additive and therefore the proposed ML for edible casings should be withheld pending the conclusion of the food additive in food category 08.0 at step 7.</p> <p>General information: The GSFA currently contains a provision in food category 08.0 (Meat and meat products, including poultry and game) at 500 mg/kg, with Note 4 (“For decoration, stamping, marking or branding the product.”) and Note 16 (“For use in glaze, coatings or decorations for fruit, vegetables, meat or fish.”) at Step 70</p>	<p>Malaysia: provision should be held pending decision on use of food additive in FC 08.0 (currently at step 7). CCTA: Development of ever thinner casings requires higher concentrations on a w/w basis of colours as there is less casing. The colours are used only for specific applications to enhance the consumer experience. The casing represents less than 1% of the final sausage. IACM: supports inclusion in the GSFA at step 2.</p>	Codex Member States
--	--	--	--	---	--	---------------------

Xanthan gum (INS 415)						
Food Category No.	Food or Food Category	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Summary of original supporting information submitted with proposal	Comments by e-WG members	e-WG recommendation
14.1.2	Fruit and vegetable juices	3000		<p>Costa Rica, ICGMA: used to thicken and adjust mouth feel and to stabilize</p> <p>China: Approved in China in Fruit and vegetable juices and nectars with maximum usage level of 3 g/kg (3000 mg/kg). Support adoption of the provision.</p>	<p>EU: Justified only in vegetable juices. Iran: Discard Spain, Russia, UK: more information needed ELC: supports entry into the GSFA at step 2</p>	<p>Include in the GSFA at step 2 - Additive is in the INS, has been evaluated by JECFA, and comments indicate that the additive is used in this food category by several Codex Member States</p>
14.1.3	Fruit and vegetable nectars	3000				

Appendix 2: Proposals for Revision or Revocation of Existing Provisions in the GSFA ^{17, 18}

Ascorbyl Esters (INS 304, 305)							
Food Category No.	Food or Food Category	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step	Summary of original supporting information submitted with proposal	Comments by e-WG members	e-WG recommendation
13.2	Complementary foods for infants and young children	100 200	10 ¹⁹ , 15 ²⁰ & ZZ ²¹	Adopted 2010	Brazil: INS 304 only for conformity with CODEX STAN 74-1981. Increases adopted ML of 200 mg/kg. Indonesia: Agrees with new ML and Note ZZ.	Japan, Malaysia, Spain, UK, ELC: maintain proposal for revision in a separate Annex. Russia: Discard Thailand: Maintain the ML as 100 mg/kg. Proposes add new note "200 mg/kg for products conforming to CODEX STAN 74-1981"	Maintain proposal for revision in a separate Annex to the e-WG for circulation for comment at a later date.

Calcium Hydroxide (INS 526)							
Food Category No.	Food or Food Category	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step	Summary of original supporting information submitted with proposal	Comments by e-WG members	e-WG recommendation
02.2.4	Butter	GMP		Adopted 2008	EU: Revoke. No technological justification for use of acidity regulators in butter.	Iran: disagrees with the proposal. Russia, UK, Spain: maintain proposal for revocation in a separate Annex. IDF: Discard. Acidity regulators are already permitted in the Codex Standard for Butter.	Maintain proposal for revocation in a separate Annex to the e-WG for circulation for comment at a later date.

¹⁷ Submitted in response to CL 2012/5-FA, Part B, point 10.

¹⁸ This Appendix contains proposed revisions to food additive provisions currently in the GSFA. Revisions to which the p-WG agrees will NOT be included in the GSFA at this time, but will be maintained and updated each year in an Annex to the eWG Report for information purposes. The revised provisions will be circulated for full comment at a future date as the CCFA agenda permits.

¹⁹ **Note 10:** As ascorbyl stearate.

²⁰ **Note 15:** Fat or oil basis

²¹ **Note ZZ:** INS 304 (ascorbyl palmitate only).

Carmines (INS 120)							
Food Category No.	Food or Food Category	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step	Summary of original supporting information submitted with proposal	Comments by e-WG members	e-WG recommendation
08.4	Edible casings (e.g., sausage casings)	500 10000	16 ²²	Adopted 2005	EU: Increase ML. To deliver effective amount of colour. Used only in casings for particular sausages. Indonesia: Proposes a ML of 2000 mg/kg for category 08.4. Exposure with ML of 2000 mg/kg in children is < 50% (ADI 5 mg/kg bw).	Iran: Discard Malaysia, Russia, Spain, UK, CCTA, ELC, IACM, NATCOL: Maintain proposal for revision in a separate Annex Iran, Malaysia: Discard Thailand: Discard - a high amount of colour in edible casings may mislead the consumer. CCTA: Development of ever thinner casings requires higher concentrations on a w/w basis of colours as there is less casing. The colours are used only for specific applications to enhance the consumer experience. The casing represents less than 1% of the final sausage. The requirements for colour are requested by some specific sausage producers to improve the consumer experience by linking a colour to a process, such as smoke or flavour. As collagen casings have become thinner they represent a smaller proportion of the final sausage, therefore, to have an effective colour impact requires higher colour concentrations w/w in the casing. This change does not represent increased level in the final sausage	Maintain proposal for revision in a separate Annex to the e-WG for circulation for comment at a later date.

Carotenoids (INS 160a(i), 160a(iii), 160e, 160f)							
Food Category No.	Food or Food Category	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step	Summary of original supporting information submitted with proposal	Comments by e-WG members	e-WG recommendation
08.4	Edible casings (e.g., sausage casings)	400 10000		Adopted 2011	EU: Increase ML. To deliver effective amount of colour. Used only in casings for particular sausages. Indonesia: Proposes a ML of 2000 mg/kg for category 08.4. Exposure with ML of 2000 mg/kg in children is < 50% (ADI 5 mg/kg bw).	Malaysia, Russia, Spain, UK, CCTA, ELC, IACM, NATCOL: Maintain proposal for revision in a separate Annex Iran, Malaysia: Discard Thailand: Discard - a high amount of colour in edible casings may mislead the consumer. CCTA: Development of ever thinner casings requires higher concentrations on a w/w basis of colours as there is less casing. The colours are	Maintain proposal for revision in a separate Annex to the e-WG for circulation for comment at a later date.

²² **Note 16:** For use in glaze, coatings or decorations for fruit, vegetables, meat or fish.

						used only for specific applications to enhance the consumer experience. The casing represents less than 1% of the final sausage. The requirements for colour are requested by some specific sausage producers to improve the consumer experience by linking a colour to a process, such as smoke or flavour. As collagen casings have become thinner they represent a smaller proportion of the final sausage, therefore, to have an effective colour impact requires higher colour concentrations w/w in the casing. This change does not represent increased level in the final sausage	
--	--	--	--	--	--	---	--

Curcumin (INS 100(i))							
Food Category No.	Food or Food Category	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step	Summary of original supporting information submitted with proposal	Comments by e-WG members	e-WG recommendation
08.4	Edible casings (e.g., sausage casings)	500 2000	16	7	<p>EU: Increase ML. To deliver effective amount of colour. Used only in casings for particular sausages.</p> <p>Indonesia: Proposes a ML of 1000 mg/kg for category 08.4. Exposure with ML of 1000 mg/kg in children is < 50% (ADI 5 mg/kg bw).</p>	<p>Malaysia, Russia, Spain, UK, CCTA, ELC, IACM, NATCOL: Maintain proposal for revision in a separate Annex</p> <p>Iran, Malaysia: Discard</p> <p>Thailand: Discard - a high amount of colour in edible casings may mislead the consumer.</p> <p>CCTA: Development of ever thinner casings requires higher concentrations on a w/w basis of colours as there is less casing. The colours are used only for specific applications to enhance the consumer experience. The casing represents less than 1% of the final sausage. The requirements for colour are requested by some specific sausage producers to improve the consumer experience by linking a colour to a process, such as smoke or flavour. As collagen casings have become thinner they represent a smaller proportion of the final sausage, therefore, to have an effective colour impact requires higher colour concentrations w/w in the casing. This change does not represent increased level in the final sausage</p>	Maintain proposal for revision in a separate Annex to the e-WG for circulation for comment at a later date

Iron Oxides (INS 172(i), (ii), (iii))							
Food Category No.	Food or Food Category	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step	Summary of original supporting information submitted with proposal	Comments by e-WG members	e-WG recommendation
08.4	Edible casings (e.g., sausage casings)	1000 5000	72 ²³	Adopted 2005	EU: Increase ML. To deliver effective amount of colour. Used only in casings for particular sausages.	Malaysia, Russia, Spain, UK, CCTA, ELC, IACM, NATCOL: Maintain proposal for revision in a separate Annex Iran, Malaysia: Discard Thailand: Discard - a high amount of colour in edible casings may mislead the consumer. USA: Allowed in the USA in sausage casings up to 1000 mg/kg. CCTA: Development of ever thinner casings requires higher concentrations on a w/w basis of colours as there is less casing. The colours are used only for specific applications to enhance the consumer experience. The casing represents less than 1% of the final sausage. The requirements for colour are requested by some specific sausage producers to improve the consumer experience by linking a colour to a process, such as smoke or flavour. As collagen casings have become thinner they represent a smaller proportion of the final sausage, therefore, to have an effective colour impact requires higher colour concentrations w/w in the casing. This change does not represent increased level in the final sausage	Maintain proposal for revision in a separate Annex to the e-WG for circulation for comment at a later date.

Lauric Arginate Ethyl Ester (INS 243)							
Food Category No.	Food or Food Category	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step	Summary of original supporting information submitted with proposal	Comments by e-WG members	e-WG recommendation
08.2.3	Frozen processed meat, poultry, and game products in whole pieces or cuts	200	3 ²⁴	3	USA: Inhibits growth of microorganisms in processed meat and poultry products.	Russia: not included in the Russian list of additives. UK, USA, ELC, ICGMA: Maintain proposal for revision in a separate Annex. USA: GRAS in the USA for use as an	Maintain proposal for revision in a separate Annex to the e-WG for circulation for comment at a later

²³ **Note 72:** Ready-to-eat basis.

²⁴ **Note 3:** Surface treatment.

						antimicrobial in meat and poultry products at 200 mg/kg.	date.
08.3.3	Frozen processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	200	3	3	USA: Inhibits growth of microorganisms in processed meat and poultry products.	Russia: not included in the Russian list of additives. UK, USA, ELC, ICGMA: Maintain proposal for revision in a separate Annex. USA: GRAS in the USA for use as an antimicrobial in meat and poultry products at 200 mg/kg.	Maintain proposal for revision in a separate Annex to the e-WG for circulation for comment at a later date.

Pectins (INS 440)							
Food Category No.	Food or Food Category	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step	Summary of original supporting information submitted with proposal	Comments by e-WG members	e-WG recommendation
01.2	Fermented and renneted milk products (plain), excluding food category 01.1.2 (dairy-based drinks)	GMP					Maintain proposal for revision in a separate Annex to the e-WG for circulation for comment at a later date.
01.2.1.1	Fermented milks (plain), not heat-treated after fermentation	GMP	Notes 234 ²⁵ & 235 ²⁶	Adopted 2013	IFAC: Pectins are approved at GMP in all sub-categories. China: Approved in China in 01.2.1 (Fermented milk) at GMP. Support adoption of the provision. Indonesia: Agrees with the proposal.	EU, Spain: If the provision is transferred to the parental food category the notes 234 and 235 (in FC 01.2.1.1) should be still retained to be consistent with CODEX STAN 243-2003. Iran: Discard UK, IDF, ELC: Maintain proposal for revision in a separate Annex Russia: not enough information provided	Maintain proposal for revision in a separate Annex to the e-WG for circulation for comment at a later date.
01.2.1.2	Fermented milks (plain), heat-treated after fermentation	GMP	Note 234	Adopted 2013			Maintain proposal for revision in a separate Annex to the e-WG for circulation for comment at a later date.
01.2.2	Renneted milk (plain)	GMP		Adopted 2013			Maintain proposal for revision in a separate Annex to the e-WG for circulation for comment at a later date.

²⁵ **Note 234:** For use as stabilizer or thickener only.

²⁶ **Note 235:** Use restricted to reconstitution and recombination only.

Sodium Carbonate (INS 500(i))							
Food Category No.	Food or Food Category	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step	Summary of original supporting information submitted with proposal	Comments by e-WG members	e-WG recommendation
02.2.1	Butter	GMP	Note CC ²⁷	Adopted 2008	EU: No technological justification for use of acidity regulators in butter. Sodium carbonates may be used to stabilize pH of specific products (e.g., soured cream butter). Indonesia: Agrees with the proposed note.	Iran, IDF: Discard Russia, UK, Spain: Maintain proposal for revision in a separate Annex	Maintain proposal for revision in a separate Annex to the e-WG for circulation for comment at a later date.

Sodium Hydrogen Carbonate (INS 500(ii))							
Food Category No.	Food or Food Category	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step	Summary of original supporting information submitted with proposal	Comments by e-WG members	e-WG recommendation
02.2.1	Butter	GMP	Note CC	Adopted 2008	EU: No technological justification for use of acidity regulators in butter. Sodium carbonates may be used to stabilize pH of specific products (e.g., soured cream butter).	Iran, IDF: Discard Russia, UK, Spain: Maintain proposal for revision in a separate Annex	Maintain proposal for revision in a separate Annex to the e-WG for circulation for comment at a later date.

Sodium Hydroxide (INS 524)							
Food Category No.	Food or Food Category	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step	Summary of original supporting information submitted with proposal	Comments by e-WG members	e-WG recommendation
02.2.1	Butter	GMP		Adopted 2008	EU: Revoke. No technological justification for use of acidity regulators in butter. Indonesia: Does not agree to revoke the use of this	Iran, IDF: disagrees with the proposal Russia, UK, Spain: Maintain proposal for revocation in a separate Annex	Maintain proposal for revision in a separate Annex to the e-WG for circulation for comment at a later

²⁷ **Note CC:** Use as a pH stabilizer in soured cream butter only.

					additive in category 02.2.1 because the additive is still needed by the industry.		date.
--	--	--	--	--	---	--	-------

Sorbates (INS 200, 201, 202, 203)							
Food Category No.	Food or Food Category	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step	Summary of original supporting information submitted with proposal	Comments by e-WG members	e-WG recommendation
08.4	Edible casings (e.g., sausage casings)	200 10000	42 ²⁸ & 222 ²⁹ 222REV 30	7	EU: Increase ML. Potassium sorbate (INS 202) only is used to prevent mold growth on the casing; no function in the final sausage.	Malaysia, Russia, Spain, UK, CCTA, ELC: Maintain proposal for revision in a separate Annex	Maintain proposal for revision in a separate Annex to the e-WG for circulation for comment at a later date.

Sucralose (Trichlorogalactosucrose) (INS 955)							
Food Category No.	Food or Food Category	Max Level (mg/kg)	Notes	Step	Summary of original supporting information submitted with proposal	Comments by e-WG members	e-WG recommendation
01.5.2	Milk and cream powder analogues	400 580		3	CCC: 580 mg/kg. Sweetens without added carbohydrates and calories. Added carbohydrates may result in browning reactions that impair the appearance of the product. Intense sweeteners may be used in this food category. ML based on Japanese standard. ISA: 400 mg/kg. Sweetens without added carbohydrates and calories. Added carbohydrates may result in browning reactions that impair the appearance of the product. Intense sweeteners may be used in this food category.	Iran, Spain: Discard Russia: Discard, increased ML could lead to browning UK: Discard. Sweeteners not permitted in the corresponding commodity standards. Technological justification for non-standardised products should be given.	Discard. Comments indicate that there is no support from Codex Member States for the proposed revision.

²⁸ **Note 42:** As sorbic acid

²⁹ **Note 222:** For use in collagen-based casings with a water activity greater than 0.6 only.

³⁰ **Note 222REV:** INS 202 (Potassium sorbate) only for use in collagen-based casings with a water activity greater than 0.6 only.