International Agri-Food Network

CFS Policy Convergence Process- Rapporteur's Proposal

Sustainable agricultural development for food security and nutrition, and the roles for livestock

Comments from the Private Sector Mechanism (PSM) submitted to the Rapporteur
2 September 2016

Clause	Original text	New proposed text	Rationale
0	NEW CHAPEAU	Livestock is vital for ensuring food and nutrition security and to achieving the Sustainable Development Goals. It performs critical development functions through its contribution to nutritious diets, economic growth, poverty alleviation, and improved rural livelihoods. No other economic sector is more important to the lives and livelihoods of the poor. In addition to nutritious food, livestock also provides asset savings, fiber, leather, traction, manure for fuel and fertilizers. Demand for animal-source products is expected to grow approximately twofold globally, particularly in low-income and emerging economies. To be sustainable in its growth, the livestock sector needs to support livelihoods, contribute to enhancing economic and social well-being, protect public and animal health through the reduction of health threats to and from livestock, sustain natural resources and contribute to climate change mitigation.	The HLPE report starts off with "The livestock sector is a powerful engine for the development of agriculture and food systems. It drives major economic, social and environmental changes in food systems worldwide, and provides an entry point for understanding the issues around sustainable agricultural development as a whole". P13.
1 b)	Build on the guidance from existing initiatives and multi-stakeholder	Build on the guidance from existing initiatives and multi-stakeholder platforms, **partnerships** and	The footnoted examples seem to miss the Private Sector initiatives that can potentially

	platforms and guidance which are dedicated to sustainable agricultural development and livestock specific issues1; (*Rec1,3*) FOOTNOTE: Examples include but are not limited to the Global Plan of Action for Animal Genetic Resources and the Interlacken Declaration; the Global Agenda for Sustainable Livestock (GASL); the Livestock Environmental Assessment and Performance Partnership (LEAP); the FAO 2014 Common Vision for Agriculture; the OIE Guidelines for Animal Disease Control; the Global Plan of Action on Antimicrobial Resistance; the WHO's One Health Initiative; the Multi-stakeholder Feed Safety Partnership; the Domestic Animal Diversity Information System; and Codex Alimentarius, among others.	guidance which are dedicated to sustainable agricultural development and livestock specific issues1;	have a higher level of impact than those listed. Many of those listed in the footnote are about providing methodologies/scientific basis though it is the private sector initiatives that can implement and provide the appropriate pathway to tangible outcomes. Although the private sector does contribute to many of the listed initiatives, it is not leading them. We think it would be important to therefore add the notion of "partnerships" in 4b) and add to the footnote several private sector initiatives, here are a few examples: • The DSF – www.dairysustainabilityframework.org (industry (global) wide) • Nestle Milk District model - http://www.nestle.com/brands/dairy/dairycsv - (Individual company) • FrieslandCampina Dairy Development Program - https://www.frieslandcampina.com/en/sustainability/dairy-development-programme/ (cooperative) • Land O' lakes - http://www.landolakes.org/Where-We-Work/Africa/Rwanda/Dairy-Competitiveness-Program-II (Cooperative international development) • Eland working with Heifer International - http://www.heifer.org/about-heifer/press/press-releases/2015/elanco-supports-east-africa-dairy-development-project-with-15-million-matching-challenge-.html (collaborative efforts)

2. bis	2. a) Encourage the appropriate intake of animal source food for healthy diets and nutrition, avoiding overconsumption, and managing increasing demand by promoting more sustainable agricultural development; *(Comments)*	***(This is a new clause we recommended adding in)*** **NEW CLAUSE to fit under 2 a)**: Recognize the important role that animal protein, including dairy products, can play in early childhood brain development and stature.	SDG2.2 clearly calls for a focus on young children's nutrition: *2.2 by 2030 end all forms of malnutrition, including achieving by 2025 the internationally agreed targets on stunting and wasting in children under five years of age, and address the nutritional needs of adolescent girls, pregnant and lactating women, and older persons* There is good evidence that livestock products are necessary for preventing micronutrient deficiency in vulnerable population groups, particularly in the first 1000 days. Animal source foods (ASF), including meats (including poultry), fish, eggs, milk and dairy products are rich sources of micronutrients. Low intakes of ASF are associated with deficiencies of iron, zinc, calcium, riboflavin, vitamin A and vitamin B12 as well as with less stunting, particularly in infants, children, pregnant and lactating women This is because absorption of iron and zinc are higher from ASF, in particular meats, than from plant foods. In addition, vitamins B12, D and preformed vitamin A are only found in ASF. Dairy foods are a major contributor to calcium in the diet worldwide and its bioavailability is high compared with the bioavailability of calcium from other foods in the diet.
2 c)	Ensure that the working and living conditions of workers at all stages of production, transformation and distribution, especially women and temporary and migrant workers, meet	**Specify provisions made by ILO Convention on child labor about agricultural labor and family farms**	

	ILO conventions and are protected by domestic laws;(14, 4)		
3 b)	Attract youth, and develop their capacity, to be drivers of improvement in sustainable agriculture development. *(Comments).*	Attract youth, and develop their capacity, to be drivers of improvement in sustainable agriculture development; **promote youth involvement at all levels of the production systems.**	We believe that there is more needed than 'attracting youth'. We need to find ways to manage succession planning and opportunities for youth to both enter the livestock sector and become farmers not just labourers for others. The way this clause is currently written it could be interpreted as 'getting youth for labour on others farms.
4 a)	Promote models of production, including through the use of sustainable intensification, and agro-ecological and organic approaches, that preserve biodiversity and ecosystem services, minimize harmful environmental externalities, and mitigate greenhouse gas emissions;*(Comments)*	Promote **appropriate** models of production that preserve biodiversity and **promote** ecosystem services, minimize harmful environmental externalities, and mitigate greenhouse gas emissions; **DELETE:** including through the use of sustainable intensification, and agro-ecological and organic approaches	Ecosystem services cannot be "preserved" but they can be "promoted". Given the breadth of models of production, PSM would recommend avoiding a list of different modes that can be very long: it could include "rotation grazing, pasture management, permaculture, integrated agro-forestry"
4 b)	Protect native forests from deforestation caused by agricultural encroachment, and promote integrated forms of land and water use; *(13)*	Protect native forests from deforestation caused by agricultural encroachment, and promote integrated **agricultural systems, making a better use of natural resources.**	When protecting native forest from deforestation, there are two scenarios. The first one is to protect native forest from deforestation regarding new areas to be intervened. The second one is to restore areas already deforested. For the second one, which is mostly the case of many regions, livestock production systems could be one of the main options to adopt in order to partially recover areas from deforestation, minimizing social impact and promoting native forest recovery.
4 c)	Protect and use animal genetic resources, and consider access and benefit-sharing for genetic resources	Protect and **adopt appropriate** animal genetic resources, and consider access and benefit-sharing for genetic resources for food and	

	for food and agriculture, in line with existing treaties and internationally agreed action plans; *(Rec 7)*	agriculture, in line with existing treaties and internationally agreed action plans;	
4 d)	Identify options for improving efficiency throughout food systems, while minimizing negative environmental impacts and excessive use of energy, water, nitrogen and other natural resources*;(14)*	Identify options for improving efficiency throughout **agricultural systems and the other components of the food systems**, while minimizing negative environmental impacts and **maximize the efficient use** of energy, water, nitrogen and other natural resources*;*	Regarding natural resource use efficiency (NRUE), the concept used here is too wide (applied to food systems). The main role from improving NRUE is at the field level (agricultural systems) and therefore, this should be stressed. The excessive use is difficult to determine: who determines what is excessive and according to which criteria: per unit of production, per farm size? This determination seems too arbitrary. We propose to instead encourage to maximize the efficient use.
4 e)	Reduce food loss and waste by supporting the improvement of infrastructure and cold chain development, and through the dissemination of best practices. *(Comments)*	Reduce food loss and waste by supporting the improvement of infrastructure and cold chain development, and through the dissemination of best practices, **in particular through consumer education**.	
5 c)	Develop policies and tools and provide extension services and capacity building, to manage market risks and volatility; *(Rec 6,)*	Develop policies and tools and provide extension services and capacity building **to advance animal husbandry, disseminate good farm management practices and provide access to markets**, **DELETE**: "to manage market risks and volatility"	Extension services are necessary for farmers in all aspects of livestock not just to manage market risks and volatility.
5 d)	Improve disease surveillance in order to foster early-warning and early action. *(8)*	Improve disease surveillance in order to foster early-warning and early action **in combination with preventive approaches at farm level**.	Surveillance is only part of the picture and is often too late. This needs to be combined with models of proactivity in livestock health management – The concept of vaccination is not only good for livestock health, it also has a considerable impact

			on economics (insurance), wastage and importantly GHG emissions.
6 a)	Promote global collaboration for collection and dissemination of sexdisaggregated data, participatory and integrated research and knowledge transfer *(9,),* with specific efforts to address gender asymmetries and other areas lacking data and evidence such as grasslands; *(4)*	Promote global collaboration for collection and dissemination of sexdisaggregated data, participatory and integrated research and knowledge transfer *(9,),* with specific efforts to address gender asymmetries and other areas lacking data and evidence; **DELETE**: "such as grasslands"	We do not understand why grasslands is 'lacking in data evidence' and why it has been singled out as an example – we suggest removing this reference.
6 b)	Support the protection and strengthening of traditional knowledge systems and valuing of experiential knowledge in research and development *(Comments)*	**Promote development and access to innovation and new technologies and support** the protection and strengthening of traditional knowledge systems and **value** experiential knowledge in research and development	RAI clause 24 iii: Promoting development and access to innovation and new technologies, combined with traditional knowledge, to attract and enable youth to be drivers of improvement in agriculture and food systems http://www.fao.org/fileadmin/templates/cfs/Docs1314/rai/CFS_Principles_Oct_2014_EN.pdf Sometimes 'tradition' can be a limiting factor in progress. Therefore, this needs to be balanced with the adoption of new scientifically proven best practices. In this context, we cannot only promote innovation and research and development from "traditional knowledge systems and experiential knowledge". We can use / support / be based on them, when this can prove, together with scientific evidence, that it is useful.
6 c)	Assess the use of digital technologies in addressing resource and climate constraints and accelerate their application for sustainable agricultural development; *(Comments)*	**Apply** digital technologies **where appropriate** in addressing resource and climate constraints and accelerate their application for sustainable agricultural development;	

7 a)	Improve biosecurity, particularly focusing on infectious diseases, zoonosis and responsible use of antimicrobials, by following One Health approaches, and securing access to veterinary services; *(8, 14)*	Improve biosecurity **(including enforcing robust standards for the movement of live animals)**, particularly focusing on infectious diseases, **decreasing exposure to pathogens from environmental sources,** zoonosis and responsible use of antimicrobials, by following One Health approaches, and securing access to veterinary services.	PSM feels the importance of controlling the trade of live animals warrants its inclusion in these recommendations. In order to prevent disease and secure animal welfare the massive movement of living material (both animals and plants) around the world should be controlled. Having a biosecurity plan in place for screening and isolation if necessary of any newly purchased animals is essential. Purchase of animals will always take place and having a proactive plan in place for this is not to be ignored. Given the concepts behind One Health and the usual sources of pathogens that affect Animal Welfare, PSM recommends including in that sentence: "Decrease the exposure to pathogens of environmental sources".
7 b)	Improve animal welfare delivering on the five freedoms2, including through capacity building programs and investment.*(8,14)* *Note on 5 freedoms*	Improve animal welfare delivering on the five freedoms[2], including through capacity building programs**,** ~~and~~ investment **and the livestock sector's voluntary actions.** **FOOTNOTE EDIT:** [2] Five Freedoms include 1) Freedom from hunger or thirst; 2) Freedom from discomfort; 3) Freedom from pain, injury or disease; 4) Freedom to express (most) normal behavior; 5) Freedom from fear and distress. See OIE Guiding Principles on Animal Welfare, http://www.oie.int/en/animalwelfare/animal-welfare-at-a-glance/ **and the IDF Guide to Good Animal Welfare in Dairy Production (2008) (**http://www.fil-	PSM feels that it would be important to highlight the many voluntary actions the livestock sector is doing to improve animal welfare. Therefore would request Member States to reference the voluntary actions in the text and to provide additional examples in the footnote of these actions such as the IDF Guide to Good Animal Welfare in Dairy Production in the footnote.

		idf.org/Files/media/IDF.ORG/Publications/Freeofcharge/Guide-to-Good-Animal-Welfare-in-Dairy-Production.pdf)	
7 c)	NEW CLAUSE	Recognize the importance of good animal feed for productivity and for the wellbeing of livestock to support further research into improved feeding practices, access to good quality feed and training for farmers	Develop new management and feed solutions that can increase efficiency and decrease the environmental (including carbon) footprint of the livestock industry. Efficiency improvements in many systems have greatly reduced the amount of feed required per kg animal product. However, a large number of the world's producers rely on practices that are inefficient in their use of natural resources. This is particularly true for grasslands that show a high incidence of poverty and low land productivity and important environmental degradation
8 a)	Enhance the vital role of pastoral systems in poverty alleviation by reducing conflicts caused over resource use, enabling pastoralists' mobility, including transboundary passage, and through improving their market access, adaptive land management, and secured access to land, water and services;*(11, 12)*	We would move this clause outside of the section on grazing systems as this applies to all production systems are not limited to the exclusive roles of grazing systems.	These concepts seem to be limited to being the exclusive role of grazing systems – all productions systems should have these requirements.
8 b)	Enhance the role of commercial grazing system in the provision of ecosystem services, including biodiversity and water conservation, and reduce their contribution to climate change by improving natural resource management;	We would move this clause outside of the section on grazing systems as this applies to all production systems are not limited to the exclusive roles of grazing systems.	These concepts seem to be limited to being the exclusive role of grazing systems – all productions systems should have these requirements.

8 bis	NEW CLAUSE	Improve natural resource use efficiency for livestock production systems	There is no mention to NRUE in general for livestock production systems. All production systems will have to follow the approach of using alternatives /options/ best practices, for improving NRUE. The way the proposal is drafted, it seems that only by grazing systems, sustainability can be achieved. Any and all production system would need a NRUE approach.
9 a)	Strengthen integration of livestock with crops and forests at different scales, including on farm, across watersheds and regional areas to improve efficiency in natural resource use as well as improved landscape management and regional integration, and provide on-farm benefits in terms of fertilizer and draught power*;(13)*	Strengthen integration of livestock with crops and forests at different scales, including on farm, across watersheds and regional areas to improve efficiency in natural resource use as well as improved landscape management and regional integration, and provide on-farm benefits. **DELETE** "in terms of fertilizer and draught power"	We do not follow the last bit of the last sentence - 'on-farm benefits in terms of fertiliser and draught power' - in the context of this section, on-farm benefits, should be more than these and manure/crop fertilization by products are already mentioned elsewhere.
10 TITLE	**Address externalities of industrial systems**	**Optimize production systems to manage resources**	The title "Address externalities of industrial systems" seems misleading and derogatory to commercial scale systems. The recommendations should apply to all livestock production systems globally regardless of size, location, or intensification. The title denigrates the vital role of scale systems in feeding the world's population with healthy nutritious and affordable food. PSM would feel that a more appropriate title is to recognize the need to supply adequately ASF to face growing demand while improving the environmental footprint of modern system. This section is mostly about the role of livestock in a "food system".

10 a)	Enhance management of wastes and use of co and by-products to reduce pollution, competition with food and pressure on resources; *(14)*	Enhance management of wastes and use of co and by-products to reduce pollution and pressure on resources; *(14)* **DELETE** "competition with food"	Is this implying that there is competition for human food? It does not recognize the vital role of livestock in consuming by products and waste from the human food supply and in doing so turning it into highly nutritious human consumable food.
10 b)	Ensure that working and living conditions meet national and international standards and reduce occupational hazards, especially at processing level. *(14)*	**DELETE ENTIRE SECTION**	This text repeats exactly what is 5 "Ensure that the working and living conditions of workers at all stages of production, transformation and distribution, especially women and temporary and migrant workers, meet ILO conventions and are protected by domestic laws;(14, 4) It is important for the PSM to note that ILO has specific clauses on child labour in the context of family labor on a farm: **International Labor Organization Conventions on Child Labor in Agriculture** **The ILO Minimum Age Convention No. 138 (1973)**, sets the minimum age for children to work generally at 15 years of age and not lower than the end of compulsory education, and for work considered hazardous, the minimum age is 18 years. Article 53, paragraph 3, establishes that the provisions of the Convention shall be applicable as a minimum to the following: mining and quarrying; manufacturing; construction; electricity, gas and water; sanitary services; transport, storage and communication; and plantations and **other agricultural undertakings mainly producing for commercial purposes, but excluding family**

			and small-scale holdings producing for local consumption and not regularly employing hired workers. Lastly, I thought it would be useful to have in mind the **UN Convention on the Rights of the Child (CRC)** (1989), article 32. It defines child labour **as a child performing any work that is likely to be hazardous or to interfere with the child's education, or to be harmful to the child's health or physical, mental, spiritual, moral or social development.** It is important to note that not all work done by children is considered child labour. Child labour consists of work for which the child is either too young (work done below the required minimum age) or work which, because of its nature or conditions, is considered unacceptable for children and should be prohibited (Food and Agriculture Organization, 2013, *Children's work in the livestock sector: Herding and beyond,* http://www.fao.org/docrep/017/i3098e/i3098e.pdf)
10 c)	NEW CLAUSE	**VGGT: Clause 17.1: ADD FOR LIVESTOCK: States should provide systems (such as registration, cadastre and licensing systems) to record individual and collective tenure rights for livestock production in order to improve security of tenure rights and right to farm, including those held by the State and public sector, private sector, and indigenous peoples and other communities with**	VGGT Clause 17 Administration of tenure: http://www.fao.org/docrep/016/i2801e/i2801e.pdf **VGGT: Clause 17.1: ADD FOR LIVESTOCK** **States should provide systems (such as registration, cadastre and licensing systems) to record individual and collective tenure rights in order to improve security of tenure rights, including those held by the State and**

		customary tenure systems; and for the functioning of local societies and of markets.	**public sector, private sector, and indigenous peoples and other communities with customary tenure systems; and for the functioning of local societies and of markets. Such systems should record, maintain and publicize tenure rights and duties, including who holds those rights and duties, and the parcels or holdings of land, fisheries or forests to which the rights and duties relate** **Right to farm laws** in the United States deny nuisance lawsuits against farmers who use accepted and standard farming practices and have been in prior operation even if these practices harm or bother adjacent property owners or the general public. Agricultural nuisances may include noise, odors, visual clutter and dangerous structures. All fifty states have some form of Right to Farm law.