Preliminary CSM comments on CFS evaluation documents (10 April 2018):

- 1. Zero draft implementation report
- 2. Implementation of the response to Recommendation 1 (only on Roles and Strategic Objectives)
- 3. Implementation of response to Recommendation 10 (only the table with the monitoring framework)

General remarks on the direction of the process:

CFS members and participants agreed that all discussions on the CFS evaluation should be directed towards the strengthening of the CFS, and that the general direction of the CFS reform will not be diluted, rather reaffirmed and enhanced.

In this sense, we suggested to have a strong and logical sequence between the following four elements: the renewed commitment to the CFS vision and the clarification of its roles, the formulation of strategic objectives and the process for the new MYPOW. If these four elements are well connected to each other, the CFS could make a significant step towards a stronger future and improve its reconnection and responsiveness to the realities and struggles for food security, healthy nutrition and the right to adequate food in the world.

However, we see that this sequence from CFS Vision to Roles to Strategic Objectives to MYPOW in response to the realities in the ground needs to be better reflected in the conceptual structure and the content of the draft implementation report. While the draft report makes some steps into this direction by including important elements, some of them are rather dispersed and remain partly disconnected. These missing links can be illustrated by the following examples:

- the operationalization of the policy coordination function falls short in the strategic objectives. Policy coordination is more than being a platform that sends out political messages. This first function of the CFS needs to be explicitly included into the formulation of the strategic objectives for the period 2020-2023.
- The right to food dimension of the CFS vision is partly well referenced, but it remains unclear how this essential element of the CFS vision is operationalized into the roles and strategic objectives of the CFS. In fact, the right to food is not even mentioned in the table for the clarification of roles or in the strategic objectives and expected outcomes. This needs to be corrected.
- The idea to redefine the monitoring function of the CFS by avoiding the term "monitoring" does not bring a solution to the problem of lack of common understanding around this concept among CFS members and participants. The CFS Reform document defines this role as "promoting accountability and sharing best practices", in which monitoring is undoubtedly an essential element. Moreover, the clarification of roles and strategic objectives exercise needs to build on the CFS decisions taken on this matter that explicitly agreed on an *incremental development of an innovative monitoring mechanism* for the CFS.

The conceptual framework for the breakthrough towards a strengthened CFS needs to overcome these inconsistencies and contradictions. It needs to take into account first and foremost that the CFS has a fundamental role to play in relation to the real world, especially the global response to increasing hunger and malnutrition, to contribute to overcoming their structural and root causes, in response to the hundreds of millions of people who go food insecure and malnourished, who see their human right to adequate food violated throughout the year.

The urgent need for strengthened policy coordination, policy convergence and policy coherence with the right to adequate food is not a theoretical issue. It is an urgent need and fundamental demand also for a strategic, effective and demand-driven CFS. The CFS must be better connected to these realities, these struggles of the people who are first of all rights-holders and not "beneficiaries".

The global food governance architecture, including the CFS and the RBAs, needs to support the actors on the national level with a better use, application and monitoring of policies that are conducive to foster food security and nutrition. Without substantially strengthening the commitments of CFS members and participants and reconnecting to the pressing realities on the ground, the CFS will not be able to respond to the function its was created and reformed for. This implementation report should therefore also serve as a tool to bring along a significant shift towards a culture of commitment that motivates CFS members and participants to join constructively, responsibly and to truly take care of this committee.

A breakthrough for the CFS in this direction is very much needed, and all our following comments aim to contribute to it.

1) Specific remarks on the zero draft implementation report (suggested changes are underlined):

Paragraph 1:_should explicitly include the nature and vision of the CFS (CFS Reform Document paragraph 4):

"The CFS constitutes the foremost inclusive international and intergovernmental platform for a broad range of committed stakeholders to work together in a coordinated manner and in support of country-led processes towards the elimination of hunger and ensuring food security and nutrition for all human beings. The CFS will strive for a world free from hunger where countries implement the voluntary guidelines for the progressive realization of the right to adequate food in the context of national food security."

Paragraph 5: should refer to emerging, urgent and critical issues and point to the role of the CFs I a changing global food governance architecture:

"With more and more <u>critical</u>, <u>urgent and</u> emerging issues and development growing complexities in FSN areas, CFS also encountered difficulties and challenges in <u>playing its role in</u> a changing the global food governance architecture "

Paragraph 6:

- 1) DIRECTION Providing more strategic direction to guide CFS work towards its vision
- 2) DEMAND DRIVEN- Ensuring CFS work is guided by the needs <u>and rights of the most affected</u> by food insecurity and malnutrition of beneficiaries and linked to realities on the ground
- 3) PRIORITIZATION Prioritizing critical, and emerging and urgent FSN issues which can directly contribute to achieving the strategic objectives of the next four-year MYPoW (SOs) and CFS vision, considering their potential impact on people most affected by food insecurity and malnutrition.
- 6) UPTAKE <u>AND MONITORING</u>: Enhancing awareness of CFS, and promoting the dissemination, use, and application, and monitoring of CFS products at national, regional and global levels.

Paragraph 7: this paragraph should explicitly reaffirm that the reform of the CFS will be kept and that this implementation report aims to strengthen the CFS in the spirit of its reform

Chapeau Direction: Providing more strategic direction to guide CFS work <u>towards its vision</u>

Paragraph 9: delete the second part:

In order to provide more strategic direction to guide its work, CFS has developed strategic objectives and expected outcomes that will set the focus of CFS activities for the next 4 year MYPoW, clarifying the CFS six roles set out in the Reform Document and how and by whom they should be performed—or the next MYPoW, CFS as a Committee should focus its resources on performing Roles 1 and 2 in a more demand driven way and with greater efficiency and effectiveness as well as the lessons sharing part of Role 5 and Role 6. Roles 3, 4 and the accountability part of Role 5 were mostly beyond the direct control of CFS as a Committee and relied on partnerships with RBAs, other UN bodies and other entities that have an implementation role at national and regional levels.

The deletion is proposed for several reasons: a) these sentences do not describe adequately the roles of the CFS as a Committee and the roles of its members and participants; b) they do not describe adequately the interconnections between the roles of the CFS; and c) they misinterpret the role of the CFS regarding 3, 4 and 5. For more details, see our remarks on the table regarding the clarification of roles below (section 2).

Paragraph 10: see detailed CSM comments on the strategic objectives in our remarks on the implementation response to Recommendation 1 below (section 2)

Between paragraph 10 and 11, we strongly suggest including a new paragraph as a crosscutting strategic objective, to incorporate the CFS 44 decision which <u>"Emphasized the importance of mainstreaming gender equality, women's and girls' rights and women's empowerment in the context of food security and nutrition in all CFS work streams, products and documents" (CFS 44 Final report 27e)</u>

Paragraph 11: (...) The MYPoW strategic objectives will promote the recognition of CFS as the leading and most inclusive global platform for FSN and keep FSN and the CFS vision high on the global agenda.

Chapeau Demand-Driven: delete "the needs of beneficiaries", replace by the "needs and rights of the most affected by food insecurity and malnutrition";

Paragraph 13 reference to SDGs should either be kept general or say <u>SDG 2</u> and other <u>FSN related SDGs</u> (not singling out SDG 17): there are many SDGs relevant to FSN, some of them more important to FSN than SDG17.

Paragraph 14: emphasis to the need of prioritizing activities that address critical, and emerging and urgent issues in the field of FSN replace the language "the most vulnerable and marginalized" by "with a focus on the most affected by food insecurity and malnutrition, especially smallholder family farmers, artisanal fisherfolk, herders/pastoralists, landless, urban poor, agricultural and food workers, women, youth, consumers and indigenous peoples" (language from CFS Reform document paragraph 7 and 11).

We believe that these sectors should be explicitly mentioned at least once in the implementation report. They are the most relevant people behind the concepts of FSN and right to adequate food. (same comment for paragraph 16)

Paragraph 18: The various CFS activities aim at producing different types of outputs, namely policy messages recommendations from inclusive discussions, global policy guidance convergence and coordination, the Global Strategic Framework, and communication and outreach.

Last sentence - ...the CFS should not engage in more than one <u>major</u> policy convergence process at a time and delays in the finalization of a negotiation process would automatically postpone the beginning of a new <u>major</u> one.

Paragraph 19: the MYPOW process should be open and inclusive and therefore conducted through an OEWG on MYPOW, not only the Bureau and AG. The Bureau and AG, however, should have the last discussion on it, before it goes to Plenary.

As a <u>The</u> result of an inclusive process <u>within an OEWG on MYPOW</u> should be brought to the <u>attention of</u> the CFS Bureau <u>which</u>, in consultation with the Advisory Group on the technical details and feasibility of pursuing suggested activities, will finalize the MYPoW that will be presented to the CFS Plenary for consideration and endorsement.

Paragraph 21: the role and function of the HLPE for the inclusive policy making process in the CFS should be correctly described, its independence acknowledged. We therefore suggest replacing the first sentence by the following:

The High-Level Panel of Experts on Food Security and Nutrition (HLPE) as the science-policy interface of the CFS, aims to improve the robustness of inclusive policy making by providing independent, evidence-based analysis and advice at the request of CFS. HLPE activities should be relevant to the work of CFS and their selection should be based on a clear understanding of how they are intended to contribute to the objectives of the Committee and feed into its processes.

Paragraph 24: the CFS plenary should be open to discuss critical, urgent and emerging issues.

.....Plenary should have an attractive agenda reflecting <u>discussions on critical, urgent and emerging issues and</u> an interesting MYPoW

The High-level ministerial participation should be accompanied with the inclusiveness of the CFS through the voices of the constituencies of the most important contributors to FSN who are often as well the most affected by food security and malnutrition.

Chapeau Uptake should read: UPTAKE <u>AND MONITORING</u>: - Enhancing awareness of CFS, and promoting the dissemination, use, and application, <u>and monitoring</u> of CFS products at national, regional and global levels.

Paragraph 30 : add in the last sentence : and support and facilitate collaboration between the Committee and the RBAs and other UN bodies.

Paragraph 32: Monitoring function of the CFS must be considerably strengthened here, in line with the CFS decisions taken on that matter. See the more detailed comments on the table for the innovative monitoring mechanism (see below, section 3).

The key comments here include:

CFS will also promote accountability and share best practices at all levels, including through the follow-up and review of both global and country/region specific FSN and <u>Right to Food</u> situations; trends, progress, <u>challenges</u> and sharing lessons; assessing the effectiveness of CFS; and <u>monitoring</u> and reviewing the use <u>and application</u> of its policy guidelines and recommendations. and facilitate

advice regarding recommended approaches to country/regional monitoring of FSN objectives. CFS will continue to hold Global Thematic Events in Plenary every 2 years [Ref]. All Member states are encouraged to organize national and regional events to monitor the use and application of CFS policy outcomes have voluntary inclusive event multistakeholder dialogues and conduct in-depth country assessments to monitor progress towards their FSN objectives. These assessments should be reported back to the CFS and allow the CFS to help countries and regions, as appropriate, address the questions of whether objectives are being achieved and how food insecurity and malnutrition can be reduced more quickly and effectively.

Paragraph 37-39: we are afraid that these paragraphs will not be sufficient to change the current unsustainable funding structure of the CFS and its components; Paragraph 39 should at least include an additional sentence which would say:

- 39. CFS Members will request the Governing Bodies of the RBAs to adjust their contribution in a sustainable way to cover the core budget for CFS Plenary and Workstreams starting from the 2020-21 biennium, and to consider a significant increase of RBAs contributions to the CFS overall budget for the MYPOW period 2020-2023.
- 2) Implementation of the response to Recommendation 1 (only on Roles and Strategic Objectives)

See below the proposed changes market as track changes

Table 1: Contribution of CFS roles to CFS vision and modalities of implementation

Note: "Rrecom x" means "Response to recommendation x"

Roles	Contribution to CFS vision	How the role is/ should be performed	By whom it is/ should be performed
Role 1: Coordination at global level	- The role, through provision of a platform for policy coordination and exchange, is essential for (i) CFS to serve as the FSN world's leading platform to discuss FSN issues in an inclusive setting; (ii) keeping FSN high on the global agenda, harnessing the convening power of CFS; and (iii) coordination and fostering collaborative action amongst its stakeholders - Connected to Role 2, 3, 4, and 6 as the CFS as policy coordination platform is fundamental for inclusive exchange leading to consensus on FSN policy guidance, convergence, coherence and coordination on all levels	- Inclusive discussions on experiences in applying FSN policies,FSN trends and critical, urgent and emerging issues leading to the identification of policy messages and recommendations in a timely way for policy-makers' attention - Advocacy to keep FSN high on the global agenda	CFS as a Committee, with active participation of its members and participants

Roles	Contribution to CFS vision	How the role is/ should be performed	By whom it is/ should be performed
Role 2: Policy convergence	- The role contributes to promoting policy convergence/ coherence among stakeholders (countries, organizations, others) and across sectors at all levels in ensuring-FSN and the progressive realization of the right to adequate food - Connected to Roles 1 and 6 as these three roles contribute to CFS outcome at global level; also connected to Role 5 as policy guidance should promote accountability and the sharing of is based interalia on good practices	- Formulation of negotiated global policy products and recommendations through inclusive, evidence- and consensus-based processes - Selection of topics driven by MYPOW criteria on the needs of food insecure and malnourished people	cFS as a Committee with active participation of its members and participants
Role 3: Support and advice to countries and regions	- The role consists in facilitating support and/or advice at country's and/or region's request through the use and application of CFS policy products on the national and regional level, (including the practical application of the Voluntary Guidelines for the Right to Food (see Reform Document, para 5 iii)) partnerships with stakeholders that have an implementing role at local level - Connected to Roles 4 and 5 (related to sharing of good practices) as the three roles contribute to the use, application and monitoring of CFS outcome at national and regional levels	- Revision of communication and outreach strategy (A11.1) to raise awareness of CFS and support the dissemination, use and application of CFS policy products and recommendations - Development of communication and outreach materials (Rrecom 7) - Help countries to contextualize CFS global products and recommendations, considering local specificities and on-going related processes at national and regional levels Suggested elements in the response to Rrecoms 7, 10 & 11 that might be confirmed in the implementation (will be cancelled if not confirmed) - Provision of advice and technical support at national and regional levels, at countries' request, drawing upon various resources including CFS products (Rrecom 11), including through work programs and partnerships agreements with countries and stakeholders (Rrecom7) - Nomination by CFS members of CFS focal point at country level to promote CFS and its products (Rrecom 7)	CFS as a Committee with active participation of its members and participants and support from- CFS secretariat with advice fromand RBAs - CFS in partnership with RBAs and other UN bodies and stakeholders that have implementation role at national and regional levels (Rrecom 7 and 11) - RBAs and their country offices to be engaged and support, where feasible and suitable, FSN platforms and structures at regional and country levels (Rrecom 7) Note: CFS, as a Committee, has neither mandate nor capacity for implementing

Roles	Contribution to CFS vision	How the role is/ should be performed	By whom it is/ should be performed
		- Development of capacity in particular in developing and least developed countries (Rrecom 7); also links to Rrecom 10 - Establishment and strengthening of links and interaction with or leveraging on existing FSN multistakeholder platforms	actions at national and regional levels
Role 4: Coordination at national and regional levels	- The role promotes coordination and alignment of actions at and with the national and regional levels and reinforces the links to realities on the ground - Connected to Roles 1, 3 and 5 and 6 (related to sharing of good practices) as the five three-roles contribute to the effectiveness and relevance of CFS outcomes at national and regional levels	Suggested elements in the response to Rrecom 7 that might be confirmed in the implementation (will be cancelled if not confirmed): - Strengthening of the links between CFS policy processes and outcomes and ongoing initiatives and agendas of regional intergovernmental mechanisms and organizations - Establishment and strengthening of links and interaction with or leveraging on existing FSN multistakeholder platforms	-CFS as a Committee with active participation of its members and participants and support from the RBA, particularly their regional and country offices, and CFS members and regional organizations -RBAs and their country offices to be engaged and support, where feasible and suitable, FSN platforms and structures at regional and country levels (Rrecom 7) Note: CFS has no mandate for coordination at national and regional levels

Roles	Contribution to CFS vision	How the role is/ should be performed	By whom it is/ should be performed
Role 5-(i): Promotion of accountability and sharing best practices Role 5-(ii): Sharing of good practices	- The role promotes countries' accountability, informing CFS of the uptake of its products and recommendations through the monitoring of , and constraints for their use and application and through sharing challenges and best practices them - Connected to Roles 1, 2, 3, 4 and 6 (informs about the degree of effectiveness of the CFS and its policy products for policy coordination, convergence and coherence on all levels policy convergence) - The role contributes through the provision of inputs (i) to inclusive discussions (Role 1) and policy products and recommendations (Role 2); (ii) as advice and technical support at local level (Role 3); (iii) to support coordination at local level (Role 4); and (iv) to report on progress (Role 5 (ii))	- Activities pending the outcomes of implementation of Rrecom 10 - Annual contributions to HLPF taking into account SOFI results - Participation in Voluntary National Reviews (VNRs) on country progress towards achieving the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development - Review of alignment of national policies with CFS policy products and recommendations - Holding of events during plenary or intersessional periods (including Global Thematic Events) - Other activities to be updated pending the outcomes of implementation of Rrecom 10	-CFS as a Committee with active participation of its members and participants and support from CFS secretariat and RBAs This will be updated pending outcomes of the implementation of Rrecom 10 Member countries -CFS Secretariat with inputs from member countries and participants - This will be updated pending outcomes of the implementation of Rrecom10
Role 6: Global Strategic Framework (GSF)	- The role supports coordination and synchronized action of stakeholders - Connected to Role 1, 2, 3, 4 and 5 as the GSF includes all policy products and recommendations	- Regular updating of the GSF, providing guidance through recommendations for FSN strategies, policies and actions - Support to the dissemination, use, application and monitoring of all CFS policy outcomes	CFS as a Committee with active participation of its members and participants and support from CFS secretariat and RBAs

Comments on Strategic Objectives and Expected Outcomes

See below the proposed changes market as track changes

2) Strategic objectives for the next MYPoW and expected results/outcomes

1. Three interlinked strategic objectives are proposed to help channel CFS energy and resources for the next four-year MYPoW to activities that will contribute to achieving CFS' vision. This description of strategic objectives is based on the six roles as described in the CFS Reform Document, but does not replace the agreed language as approved by CFS in 2009. The strategic

objectives will also promote the recognition of CFS as the leading and most inclusive global platform for FSN and keep FSN high on the global agenda.

- 2. SDGs and Gender as crosscutting issues: CFS will support country-led implementation of the 2030 Agenda for sustainable development, in particular SDG2 on ending hunger and all FSN related SDGs. CFS also emphasizes the importance of mainstreaming gender equality, women's and girls' rights and women's empowerment in the context of food security and nutrition in all CFS work streams, products and documents" SDG17 on revitalizing global partnerships for implementation through:
 - Strategic Objective 1 PLATFORM: Serve as the world-leading and foremost inclusive policy coordination platform to foster collaborative action and develop global policy debates and recommendations/ messages in response to critical, urgent and emerging on-FSN issues
- 3. CFS will further harness the convening power of its platform through inclusive and evidence-based exchange/ discussions on global FSN developments, trends, challenges-regarding the realization of the right to adequate food in the world, and critical, urgent and emerging issues, with the aim of bringing messages and recommendations to policy-makers' timely attention and fostering coordinated action amongst its committed stakeholders.

4. Outcomes:

- (i) CFS is recognized as the leading and most inclusive policy coordination platform on FSN on the global level stakeholders are aware and understand FSN developments, trends and issues (ii) CFS members and participants have strengthened their coordination and collaborative action are coordinated at the global level, leading to collaborative action amongst stakeholders, with significant expected positive impact at regional and national levels (iii) CFS Debates and policy messages have been used by its members and participants to address the critical, urgent and emerging FSN issues on the global, regional and national level Reference is made to CFS policy messages by CFS stakeholders, improving policy convergence and coherence at all levels
- Strategic Objective 2 POLICY: Develop global policy <u>guidance analysis</u>, recommendations <u>and guidelines for policy convergence</u> and coherence to <u>ensure address FSN issues and promote the progressive realization of the right to adequate food</u>
- 5. CFS will develop global policy guidance for policy convergence and coherence at all levels, addressing the root causes of food insecurity and malnutrition, with the best possible impact on food security and nutrition and the progressive realization of the right to adequate food of those most affected by food insecurity and mal nutrition-impacting the greatest number of people. CFS will develop global policy guidance through inclusive, evidence and consensus-based processes. CFS will encourage its members and participants that have an implementation role at national and regional levels to assist countries and regions at their request to use and apply CFS products and recommendations.
- 6. The selection of issues will take into account global priorities (2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development and UN Decade of Action on Nutrition), HLPE Notes on Critical and Emerging Issues, CFS' comparative advantages and potential added value, and complement efforts of UN bodies working on FSN, especially the three Rome Based Agencies.
- 7. The HLPE will continue to support policy discussions by providing evidence-based information, advice and focused interventions on substantive issues at the request of CFS, through its

thematic reports and possibly other contributions the CFS may wish to request. as a complement to the main HLPE products (thematic reports).

8. Outcome:

- (i) CFS global policy guidance contributes to improved policy convergence and coherence on key food security, and nutrition and right to food issues horizontally (among countries, organizations and stakeholders and across sectors) as well as vertically (from local to global levels and vice versa).
- Strategic Objective 3 UPTAKE and ACCOUNTABILITY: Foster the uptake of CFS policy outcomes through enhanced dissemination, use, application and monitoring work on FSN at all levels
- 9. CFS will <u>foster further support</u> the uptake of its policy <u>outcomes work</u>, through strengthening awareness, communication and outreach, <u>enhanced collaboration between its members</u>, <u>CFS secretariat and participants</u>, <u>particularly the RBAs</u>. <u>sharing good practices and partnering at all levels</u>, taking stock of the results in using and applying policy products and recommendations.
- 10. CFS will step up its efforts to promote accountability and sharing best practices through and support stakeholders in raising awareness and knowledge about of CFS and the use and application of its CFS policy products and recommendations, through sharing experiences, challenges and best practices, and through monitoring of the use and applications of CFS policy outcomes at all levels. through its communication and outreach activities including leveraging on FSN multi-stakeholder platforms, subject to available resources. CFSIt will continue to report to global bodies such as ECOSOC and share information with other UN bodies as appropriate.

11. Outcomes:

- (i) CFS' global-policy products and recommendations are known, used and applied by many members and participants convergence and coherence work is widely known at all levels (ii) The CFS monitoring efforts provide a periodic overview about the progress, achievements, gaps and challenges in the use and application of CFS policy outcomes and their contributions to national, regional and global FSN policies and objectives Countries and regions use and apply CFS policy convergence and coherence work in regional and national actions
- 3) Implementation of response to Recommendation 10 (only the table with the monitoring)

See extra sheet with revised monitoring table

	FSN and RtAF situation and trends	Assessment of CFS Effectiveness	Monitoring the use and application of CFS Outcomes
innovative monitoring me	Follow-up and Review (FuR) of "the situation and trends in food insecurity in the world" • Annual discussion on SOFI Report (Based on "monitoring" done by RBAs+WHO+UNICEF) • Periodic discussions based on HLPE Note on Critical and Emerging Issues Follow-up and Review (FuR) of the situation of the Right to Adequate Food (RtAF) • Annual report on the Right to Food by the UN Special Rapporteur on the Right to Food during CFS Plenary Sessions (Presentation of annual thematic report) • Reports from Geneva based Human Rights bodies, particularly CESCR, OHCHR, CEDAW on the state of the right to adequate food	Periodic Assessment of CFS effectiveness through: • Annual tracking of CFS decisions (By CFS Secretariat) (CFS Plenary Annual progress reports) • Self-assessment or independent evaluation on CFS effectiveness, complemented through Periodic opinion surveys, and other feedback mechanisms to the CFS to strengthen its relevance,	Monitoring the use and application of CFS Outcomes at national, regional and global level: ToRs to share experiences and good practices in applying CFS Decisions and Recommendations through organizing Events on national, regional and global levels. The outcomes of these events contribute to the biennial GTE at CFS Plenaries in October Biennial Global Thematic Events on CFS more comprehensive policy outcomes
	Follow-up and Review (FuR) of country/region FSN Progress (in line with 2030 Agenda and other global framework targets and indicators, esp. SDGs and ICN2) • Annual VNRs and others, e.g. nutrition (based on "monitoring" done by countries supported by RBAs, UN systems, others)	efficiency and effectiveness in ensuring FSN	 Ad hoc events/side-events on more specific policy recommendations (TOR to be developed) Voluntary in-depth country assessments on the use and application of CFS policy outcomes (TOR to be developed)

The proposed changes are marked in blue and suggest restructuring/ reordering of the three columns and adding some specific elements.