I. Introduction

In the months April, May, June and August 2011, Animals’ Angels carried out three investigations into live animal transports from different EU Member States to Turkey via the Bulgarian/ Turkish border Kapitan Andreevo/ Kapikule. The busy Bulgaria–Turkey border crossing at Kapitan Andreevo is an important point of exit from the EU and all animal transports leaving the Community territory must be viewed at the Border Veterinary Inspection Post1 at Kapitan Andreevo.

During the investigations2 the Animals’ Angels teams spent several days at the above-mentioned Bulgarian/ Turkish border and inspected animal transports while they waited for Turkish border customs’ clearance. Furthermore, Animals’ Angels trailed animal transports coming from the EU to their final destinations in Turkey.

The findings of these investigations are alarming. Enormous animal suffering is regularly caused in the long-distance transports from the EU to Turkey. Too often, animals die after vegetating for days in torturous conditions on board the vehicles.

There are numerous reasons for the severe problems in the transport route from the EU to Turkey: Extremely long distances, long waiting times for customs’ clearances, unreliable contracting parties in Turkey, poor road conditions, lack of infrastructures, inefficient veterinary checks, etc. Many of these conditions are unavoidable and every transporter is exposed to these problems when exporting animals to Turkey.

Apart from the special problems that challenge transporters on their route to Turkey, it is an indisputable fact that long-distance transports of live animals cannot be carried out without causing severe stress and suffering to the animals. Therefore, all stakeholders involved in long-distance transports should at least take all possible measures to minimise animal suffering and to ensure compliance with the relevant legislation. In the majority of the transports inspected by Animals’ Angels on the transport route from the EU to Turkey this was not the case. The transports were regularly carried out violating Council Regulation EC 1/2005 on the Protection of Animals during Transport and the European Convention for the Protection of Animals during International Transport.

Numerous problems that occurred during transport such as hunger, thirst, respiratory distress due to extreme ammonia gases and heat caused by insufficient head space and the lack of bedding material, animals trampling each other due to lack of floor space, young cows giving birth during the journey, etc. could have been avoided:

---

1 Hereafter BVIP
2 29.04. – 06.05.2011; 02.06. – 10.06.2011 and 12.08. – 24.08.2011; detailed reports about the investigations can be requested at info@animals-angels.de
© Copyright Animals’ Angels e.V
Place and Date of the Report: Frankfurt, 25th October 2011
If the transporters and organisers involved had respected the legal requirements and had taken the necessary care

- By efficient and careful veterinary checks at the places of departure in the EU
- By efficient and careful veterinary checks at the EU exit point, BVIP Kapitan Andreevo, Bulgaria.

Without doubt, the attitude of the transport company, the organiser and the veterinary checks at the places of departure are the deciding factors for the quality of a transport. However, the veterinary checks at the EU exit point are equally important. Animals’ Angels is convinced that, if the veterinary service at the EU exit point would carry out strict checks and - where necessary - the corresponding emergency measures, laid down by Council Regulation EC 1/2005, no illegal transport would be presented at the BVIP and no illegal transport would pass through to Turkey. Thus, through effective and strict checks at the EU exit point animal suffering on the transports coming from the EU and going to Turkey could be significantly reduced.

However, during three investigations the Animals’ Angels teams realized that the veterinary checks at BVIP Kapitan Andreevo are deficient, that major problems concerning the animals, the means of transport and the accompanying documents remain undetected during the checks and that no measures are taken in the event of non-compliance with Council Regulation EC 1/2005.

II. Legal Requirements for the Veterinary Checks at the EU Exit points/ Border Inspection Posts laid down by Council Regulation EC 1/2005

Article 21 of Council Regulation EC 1/2005 states that

“1. ... where animals are shown at exit points or border inspection posts, official veterinarians of the Member States shall check that the animals are transported in compliance with this Regulation and in particular:
(a) that transporters have submitted a copy of a valid authorisation as provided for in Article 10(1) or, for long journeys, in Article 11(1);
(b) that drivers of road vehicles transporting domestic Equidae, domestic animals of bovine, ovine, caprine or porcine species or poultry and attendants have presented a valid certificate of competence as provided for in Article 17(2);
(c) that the animals are fit to continue their journey;
(d) that the means of transport by which the animals are to continue their journey complies with Chapter II and where applicable Chapter VI of Annex I;
(e) that, in cases of export, transporters have provided evidence that the journey from the place of departure to the first place of unloading in the country of final destination complies with any international agreement listed in Annex V applicable in the third countries concerned;
(f) whether domestic Equidae and domestic animals of bovine, ovine, caprine and porcine species have been or are to be transported over long journeys.
2. In the case of long journeys for domestic Equidae and domestic animals of bovine, ovine, caprine and porcine species, official veterinarians of exit points and border inspection posts shall perform and record the checks listed in Section 3 "Place of destination" of the journey log in Annex II.”

Where the competent authority at the EU exit point/ border inspection post considers that animals have been neglected or maltreated during the journey or for any other reason they are not fit to complete their journey, they shall be unloaded, watered, fed and rested and where necessary the measures of Article 23 of Council Regulation EC 1/2005 shall be taken in order to safeguard the welfare of the animals. According to 23 (2), depending on the circumstances each of case these measures may include:

- transferring the consignment or part of it to another means of transport;
- returning the animals to their place of departure by the most direct route (…)
- unloading the animals and holding them in suitable accommodation with appropriate care until the problem is resolved.

© Copyright Animals’ Angels e.V
Place and Date of the Report: Frankfurt, 25th October 2011
Where there is no other means of safeguarding the welfare of the animals, they shall be humanely killed or euthanized.”

III. Observations by Animals’ Angels during investigations carried out in April, May, June and August 2011 concerning the checks performed by the competent veterinary authority at Kapitan Andreevo Border Inspection Post, Bulgaria

The following selection of examples clearly show that the Bulgarian Veterinary Service at the Border Inspection Post Kapitan Andreevo does not carry out proper checks of the animal transports presented for export to Turkey as required by Article 21 of Council Regulation EC 1/2005.

All transports described below that violated the relevant legislation on the protection of animals during transport passed the border veterinary inspection without any corrective measure being taken by the Bulgarian veterinary service. That means that either the Bulgarian veterinary service did not care if the transports complied with the legislation and if the animals were fit to continue their journey or that the Bulgarian veterinary service was not able to detect the existing problems.

Animals’ Angels observed the majority of the transports described in the following examples after they left Kapitan Andreevo BVIP and entered Turkish customs area/territory. Some of the transports were also observed at Ankara and Istanbul customs’ facilities but all transports had previously passed through Kapitan Andreevo BVIP and all the problems described must have already existed at the moment when the transports were shown at the Bulgarian BVIP. One of the transports was checked by Animals’ Angels directly at the BVIP Kapitan Andreevo. Obviously, only those problems are described which could be assessed by the Animals’ Angels’ teams.

1. 29.04.2011, Place of observation by Animals’ Angels: Turkish customs facilities, Kapikule
   Transport company: Klompjan (Netherlands)
   Licence plates: (NL) BVD281; OL67FX,
   Transport of pregnant heifers from Austria to Turkey

   During the journey within the territory of the Community the heifers were unloaded for a 24-hour rest at a private stable in Romania\(^3\) that is not approved as a control post. (The facilities are not listed in the current list of approved control posts published regularly by SANCO EU Commission service)

   This constitutes a violation of Article 12 (3) of Directive 64/432 EEC as amended by Article 34 of Council Regulation EC 1/2005 which stipulates that transporters must ensure that the consignment of animals does not come into contact with animals of lower health status at any time between leaving the holdings or the assembly centre of origin and arriving at their destination. Therefore, during transit animals may only be unloaded at control posts registered and authorised in accordance with Regulation EC 1255/97.

   Thus the animals have not been transported in compliance with Council Regulation EC 1/2005 from the place of departure in the Community (Austria) to presentation at the BVIP Kapitan Andreevo in Bulgaria.

   ***

\(^3\) On request Animals’ Angels received the information, by e-mail dated 22.07.11, by the Romanian contact point, that in Romania there are no registered and authorized control posts.
2. 29.04.2011, Place of observation by Animals’ Angels: Kapikule, Turkey
Transport company: unknown (Bulgaria)
Licence plates: (BG) T3366AC; T2002EE
Transport of lambs from Bulgaria to Turkey

The loading density is exceeded. There is not enough space for all lambs to lie down and to reach the water system of the truck. At least on the first floor, the deck height is insufficient; several animals are touching the upper deck with their heads and even with their backs. Due to the lack of head room the air circulation within the animals’ compartments is hindered. No bedding material is visible. The floor is covered with excrement. There is a strong smell of ammonia inside the animals' compartments. Many lambs are coughing and suffer from nasal discharge.

This constitutes violations of Article 3 (g), Article 6 (3) in connection with Annex I, Chapter II, 1.2, Chapter III, 2.1, 2.6 and Chapter VI, 1.2. of Council Regulation EC 1/2005. Furthermore, it contravenes the requirements of Article 4 (1), Article 6, Article 16 and Article 17 of the European Convention for the Protection of Animals during international transport.

Thus the animals have not been transported in compliance with Council Regulation EC 1/2005 from the place of departure in the Community (Bulgaria) to the presentation at Kapitan Andreevo BVIP in Bulgaria and the means of transport did not comply with the requirements of Chapter II and Chapter VI of Annex I to the Regulation. Furthermore, the transport will also not comply with the European Convention for the Protection of animals during international transport until the first place of unloading in Turkey.

Additionally, according to the information given by the Turkish forwarding agent responsible for this transport, the accompanying documents were lacking the list of ear tags of the lambs loaded on the fourth floor.

N.B.: At least two lambs die during this long distance transport

---

4 Please note: In the case of the transports from Bulgaria to Turkey some of them possibly do not go over a distance of more than 560 km and thus only taking into consideration the distance would not exceed the eight hours journey time. However, the different steps of customs’ clearance have to be added to the driving. According to the observations by Animals’ Angels and according to the information received, the time needed for customs’ clearance at Kapikule is absolutely not calculable. In the very best cases transports are “only” detained for half a day at Kapikule border but regularly it happens that customs’ clearance takes more than one day including several days without that the transporter has an idea where the problem is (please see also Annex to Animals’ Angels report “Transport of Animals from EU – Member States to Turkey, August 2011”). The time for the EU exit checks, main customs' clearance in Turkey and loading and unloading must also be added. Therefore, all transports that departed from Bulgaria even when the journey is shorter than 560 km must be considered as long distance transports.
Insufficient head space and exceeded loading density on truck with licence plates:
(BG) T3366AC ; T2002EE

3. 01.05.2011, Place of observation by Animals’ Angels: Turkish customs’ facilities, Kapikule
Transport company: Agrosped (Hungary)
Licence plates: (H) JWC 534; XUZ 832
Transport of lambs from Hungary to Turkey

The truck is equipped with an unsuitable water system. The drinking devices consist of buttons and in order to make water come out, it is necessary to apply strong pressure on the buttons. In order to drink directly from the device the lambs would have to take the device into their mouth and press it with the tongue. This is definitely impossible for them as the pressure required to initiate the water flow is too strong. Therefore, the lambs cannot be adequately supplied with water.

On the truck there is no food stored for the animals. The partitions placed between the animals’ compartments are partly inadequate. The Animals’ Angels team observes three times that lambs get stuck with their heads between a divider and the side wall of the truck on the 2nd deck. The drivers manage to free the lambs, which is an acrobatic undertaking because the truck is not equipped with a ladder to reach the upper decks. Insufficient amount of bedding material is used. There is an extreme smell of ammonia and many of the lambs are coughing and suffer from nasal discharge.

When Animals’ Angels first checks the truck at Kapikule customs area, the team spots one dead lamb on board the truck. When the team detects the dead animal the truck has already been in the Turkish customs area for some hours. Therefore it is not possible to tell whether the lamb was already dead when the truck was presented at Kapitan Andreevo BVIP. However, it is most likely that the animal was not in a satisfactory condition when the veterinary service at the BVIP carried out its check.

This constitutes violations of Article 3, Article 6 (3) in connection with Annex I, Chapter I, 1. and 4., Chapter II, 1.1. (a) and (f), 2.1, Chapter VI, 1.2. and 1.3., 2.1. and 2.2 of Council Regulation EC 1/2005. Furthermore, it contravenes the requirements of Article 4 (1), Article 6 (1) and (8), Article 7 (5), Article 16, Article 20, Article 24 and Article 25 of the European Convention for the Protection of Animals during international transport.

Thus the animals have not been transported in compliance with Council Regulation EC 1/2005 from the place of departure in the Community (Hungary) to the presentation at Kapitan Andreevo BVIP in Bulgaria and the means of transport did not comply with the requirements of...
Chapter II and Chapter VI of Annex I to the Regulation. Furthermore, it is most likely that at the moment of the presentation of the transport to the BVIP at least one of the animals was unfit to continue the journey or already dead. Finally, the transport will also not comply with the European Convention for the Protection of Animals during international transport until the first place of unloading in Turkey.

N.B.: Animals' Angels follows this transport to its final destination in Turkey. The total transport time is 5 days. In these 5 days the animals are not unloaded for resting, they do not receive any food and only utterly inadequate amounts of water. The result of this illegal transport is 42 dead lambs.

Unloading of the truck with licence plates (H) JWC 534; XUZ 832 at its final destination Turkey

Inadequate watering devices in the truck with licence plates (H) JWC 534; XUZ 832

***

4. 01.05.2011, Place of observation by Animals’ Angels: Turkish customs’ facilities, Kapikule
Transport company: unknown (Lithuania)
Licence plates: (LT) FGU 710 / DR 620
Transport of unweaned calves from Lithuania to Turkey

The Animals’ Angels team checks this transport shortly after it left BVIP Kapitan Andreevo. 230 unweaned calves (average weight per calf: 65 kg) are loaded on three decks. On board the truck there is a sick calf (ear tag: LT 05806759). The official Bulgarian veterinary service at BVIP Kapitan Andreevo did not intervene and let the transport proceed to Turkey with a sick animal on board.

This constitutes violations of Article 3, Article 6 (3) in connection with Annex I, Chapter I, 1. and 4 of Council Regulation EC 1/2005. Furthermore, it contravenes the requirements of Article 4 (1) Article 9 and Article 25 of the European Convention for the Protection of Animals during international transport.

Thus the animals have not been transported in compliance with Council Regulation EC 1/2005 from the place of departure in the Community (Hungary) to the presentation at Kapitan Andreevo BVIP in Bulgaria. Furthermore, it is most likely that at the moment of the presentation of the transport to the BVIP at least one of the animals was unfit to continue the journey. The
transport will also not comply with the European Convention for the Protection of Animals during international transport until the first place of unloading in Turkey.

5. 01.05.2011, Place of observation by Animals’ Angels: Turkish Customs’ facilities, Kapikule
Transport company: unknown (Croatia)
Licence plates: (HR) ZG 5181 EE
Transport of calves from Hungary to Turkey

The means of transport used for a long distance transport of bovines to a Third Country is not equipped with a water system for this species.

This constitutes violations of Article 3, Article 6 (3) in connection with Annex I, Chapter VI, 2.1. and 2.2. of Council Regulation EC 1/2005. Furthermore, it contravenes the requirements of Article 4 (1) and Article 20 of the European Convention for the Protection of Animals during international transport.

Accordingly the animals have not been transported in compliance with Council Regulation EC 1/2005 from the place of departure in the Community (Hungary) to the presentation at Kapitan Andreevo BVIP in Bulgaria and the means of transport did not comply with the requirements of Annex I, Chapters II and VI to the Regulation. The transport will also not comply with the European Convention for the Protection of Animals during international transport until the first place of unloading in Turkey.
6. 01.05.2011, Place of observation by Animals’ Angels: Turkish Customs’ facilities, Kapikule
Transport company: Keus & Mollink (Germany and Netherlands)
Licence plates: (NL) OL 27 FP
Transport of bulls from Hungary to Turkey.

The bulls are loaded on two decks. The compartments of the lower deck are not equipped with watering devices for bovines. On the first deck, there are only watering devices for pigs which are not useable for cattle. Furthermore, the water system is leaking and a lot of water runs into the animals’ compartments. As a consequence the floor becomes extremely wet.

This constitutes violations of Article 3, Article 6 (3) in connection with Annex I, Chapter VI, 2.1. and 2.2. of Council Regulation EC 1/2005. Furthermore, it contravenes the requirements of Article 4 (1) and Article 20 of the European Convention for the Protection of Animals during international transport.

Accordingly the animals have not been transported in compliance with Council Regulation EC 1/2005 from the place of departure in the Community (Hungary) to the presentation at Kapitan Andreevo BVIP in Bulgaria and the means of transport did not comply with the requirements of Annex I, Chapters II and VI to the Regulation. The transport will also not comply with the European Convention for the Protection of Animals during international transport until the first place of unloading in Turkey.

---

7. 03.05.2011, Place of observation by Animals’ Angels: Istanbul customs’ facilities
Transport company: unknown (Bulgaria)
Licence plates: (BG) T8881XT; T4090EE
Transport of lambs from Bulgaria to Turkey

The head space above the animals is insufficient. Many animals are touching the ceiling with their heads and even with their backs. The air circulation within the animals’ compartments is hindered.
This constitutes a violation of Article 3 (g), Article 6 (3) in connection with Annex I, Chapter II, 1.2. of Council Regulation EC 1/2005. Furthermore, it contravenes the requirements of Article 4 (1), Article 6 and Article 17 of the European Convention for the Protection of Animals during international transport.

Thus the animals have not been transported in compliance with Council Regulation EC 1/2005 from the place of departure in the Community (Bulgaria) to the presentation at Kapitan Andreevo BVIP in Bulgaria and the means of transport did not comply with the requirements of Annex I, Chapters II and VI to the Regulation. The transport will also not comply with the European Convention for the Protection of Animals during international transport until the first place of unloading in Turkey.

8. 03.06.2011, Place of observation by Animals’ Angels: Turkish customs’ area, Kapikule
Transport company: unknown (Bulgaria)
Licence plates: (BG) T8388XT; T1314EE
Transport of lambs from Bulgaria to Turkey

The animals are loaded on four decks. The means of transport is equipped with water nipples for pigs. The water system is turned on but a large number of nipples are not working. Thus, not all animals can be supplied with water. On the second deck, on both sides, there are no ventilation openings. Thus no airflow is possible in the compartments of the second deck.

This constitutes violations of Article 3 (c) and (h), Article 6 (3) in connection with Annex I, Chapter II, 2.6. and Chapter VI 2.1. and 2.2. of Council Regulation EC 1/2005. Furthermore, it contradicts the requirements of Article 4 (1) and Article 6 (1) and (3 b) and Article 20 of the European Convention for the Protection of Animals during international transport.

Thus the animals have not been transported in compliance with Council Regulation EC 1/2005 from the place of departure in the Community (Bulgaria) to the presentation at Kapitan Andreevo BVIP in Bulgaria and the means of transport did not comply with the requirements of Chapter II and Chapter VI of Annex I to the Regulation The transport will also not comply with the European Convention for the Protection of Animals during international transport until the first place of unloading in Turkey.
9. 03.06.2011, Place of observation by Animals’ Angels: Turkish customs’ facilities, Kapikule
Transport Company: Agrosped (Hungary)
Licence plate: (H) JWC534; XUZ832
Transport of lambs from Hungary to Turkey

The **space above the animals is insufficient.** Many animals are touching the upper decks/ceiling with their heads or even with their backs. The airflow within the animals’ compartments is hindered. Additionally, very little amount of bedding material is used and the there is an extreme smell of ammonia. The truck is equipped with an unsuitable water system; the lambs definitely are not able to use it properly. The drinking devices consist of buttons – in order to make water come out, it is necessary to apply strong pressure on the buttons. In order to drink directly from the device the lambs would have to take the device into their mouth and press it with the tongue. This is definitely impossible as the pressure required to initiate the water flow is too strong. Therefore, the **lambs cannot be adequately supplied with water.**

This constitutes violations of Article 3, Article 6 (3) in connection with Annex I, Chapter II, 1.2., Chapter III, 2.6, Chapter VI 1.2., 2.1. and 2.2 of Council Regulation EC 1/2005. Furthermore, it contradicts the requirements of Article 4 (1), Article 6 (3), Article 6, Article 7 (5), Article 16, Article 17 and Article 20 of the European Convention for the Protection of Animals during international transport.

Accordingly the animals have not been transported in compliance with Council Regulation EC 1/2005 from the place of departure in the Community (Hungary) to the presentation at Kapitan Andreevo BVIP in Bulgaria and the means of transport did not comply with the requirements of Chapter II and Chapter VI of Annex I to the Regulation. The transport will also not comply with the European Convention for the Protection of Animals during international transport until the first place of unloading in Turkey.

***

10. 03.06.2011, Place of observation by Animals’ Angels: Turkish customs’ facilities, Kapikule
Transport company: unknown (Bulgaria)
Licence plates: (BG) E6062EA; E7944BX
Transport of lambs from Bulgaria to Turkey
The **loading density is too high**. There is not sufficient space for all animals to lie down at the same time. Due to the crowded situation inside the animals’ compartments, **not all animals can reach the watering devices**. In the main body of the truck close to the divider from the gooseneck, there is a **dead lamb** (ear tag BG14D0137594). It is impossible to say if the lamb was already dead when the transport was presented at the Kapitan Andreevo BVIP. However, it is most likely that the animal was not in a satisfactory condition at the time of the check by the Bulgarian veterinary service.

This constitutes violations of Article 3, Article 6 (3) in connection with Annex I, Chapter I, 1. and 2, Chapter III, 2.1. of Council Regulation EC 1/2005. Furthermore, it contravenes the requirements of Article 4 (1), Article 9, Article 17 of the European Convention for the Protection of Animals during international transport.

Thus the animals have not been transported in compliance with Council Regulation EC 1/2005 from the place of departure in the Community (Bulgaria) to the presentation at Kapitan Andreevo BVIP in Bulgaria and the means of transport did not comply with the requirements of Chapter II and Chapter VI of Annex I to the Regulation. Furthermore, it is most likely that at the moment of the presentation of the transport to the BVIP at least one of the animals was unfit to continue the journey or was already dead. Finally, the transport will also not comply with the European Convention for the Protection of Animals during international transport until the first place of unloading in Turkey.

![Dead lamb – the Animals’ Angels team calls the animal Matthias – on truck with licence plates (BG) E6062EA/E7944BX](image-url)

### 11. 04.06.2011, Place of observation by Animals’ Angels: Ankara customs’ facilities
- **Transport company:** Thomas Nocke (Germany)
- **Licence plate:** (D) KGNT80
- **Transport of heifers from Austria to Turkey**

During the journey within the territory of the Community the **heifers were unloaded for a 24-hour rest at a private stable in Romania that is not approved as a control post**. (The facilities are not listed in the current list of approved control posts published regularly by SANCO EU Commission Service)

This constitutes a violation of Article 12 paragraph 3 of Directive 64/432 EEC as amended by Article 34 of Council Regulation EC 1/2005 which stipulates that transporters must ensure that
the consignment of animals does not come into contact with animals of lower health status at any time between leaving the holdings or the assembly centre of origin and arriving at their destination. Therefore, during transit animals may only be unloaded at control posts registered and authorised in accordance with Regulation EC 1255/97.

Therefore the animals have not been transported in compliance with Council Regulation EC 1/2005 from the place of departure in the Community (Austria) to the presentation at the BVIP of Kapitan Andreewo in Bulgaria.

***

12. 06.06.2011, Place of observation by Animals’ Angels: Ankara customs’ facilities
Transport company: Keus & Mollink (Germany and Netherlands)
Licence plates: (D) STKM216; STKM144
Transport of calves from Hungary to Turkey

The transport is carried out with a double-deck one-compartment truck. In the back compartments of the main body of the truck, on both decks, there are no automatic water troughs. Thus the animals put in these compartments have no access to the water system on the truck.

This constitutes violations of Article 3, Article 6 (3) in connection with Annex I, Chapter VI, 2.1. and 2.2. of Council Regulation EC 1/2005. Furthermore, it contravenes the requirements of Article 4 (1) and Article 20 of the European Convention for the Protection of Animals during international transport.

Accordingly the animals have not been transported in compliance with Council Regulation EC 1/2005 from the place of departure in the Community (Hungary) to the presentation at Kapitan Andreewo BVIP in Bulgaria and the means of transport did not comply with the requirements of Annex I, Chapters II and VI to the Regulation. The transport will also not comply with the European Convention for the Protection of Animals during international transport until the first place of unloading in Turkey.

***

13. 10.06.2011, Place of observation by Animals’ Angels: BIP Kapitan Andreewo, Bulgaria and Turkish Customs facilities, Kapikule
Transport company: Bardy Bresse (France)
Licence plates: (F) BN462GW; 7001ZC25
Transport of heifers from Austria to Turkey

The indications made in the journey log accompanying this transport are not realistic and do not indicate compliance with Council Regulation EC 1/2005. In particular, the journey time indicated is totally unrealistic: For a journey over 2,765 km, from Oberwart (Austria) to Gaziantep (Turkey), a journey time of 29 hours is indicated. Realistically, for the driving time only 39.5 hours should have been estimated plus the time for loading and unloading, feeding and watering rests and customs clearances. Furthermore, a 48-hour unloading at a resting stable in Turkey is indicated. According to the information received, the stable indicated in the journey log does not exist and moreover, the drivers do not know anything about this planned 48-hour unloading.

This constitutes a violation of Article 5 (3) and Article 14 of Council Regulation EC 1/2005.
Accordingly, the animals have not been transported in compliance with Council Regulation EC 1/2005 from the place of departure in the Community (Austria) to the presentation at the BVIP Kapitan Andreevo in Bulgaria.

14. 10.06.2011, Place of observation by Animals’ Angels: BIP Kapitan Andreovo
Transport company: Keus & Mollink (Germany and Netherlands)
Licence plate: (D) STKM274
Transport of calves from Hungary to Turkey

The ceiling height on the first deck is too low. One animal is touching the upper deck with its back. When the truck leaves the BVIP area the Animals’ Angels team asks the driver to lift up the decks. He does so, but states that the Bulgarian official veterinarian who inspected the truck had no query about the deck height.

This constitutes violations of Article 3, Article 6 (3) in connection with Annex I, Chapter II, 1.2. of Council Regulation EC 1/2005. Furthermore, it contravenes the requirements of Article 4 (1), Article 6 (3), Article 17 (1) of the European Convention for the Protection of Animals during international transport.

Thus the animals have not been transported in compliance with Council Regulation EC 1/2005 from the place of departure in the Community (Hungary) to the presentation at Kapitan Andreevo BVIP in Bulgaria and the means of transport did not comply with the requirements of Chapter II and Chapter VI of Annex I to the Regulation.

15. 10.06.2011, Place of observation by Animals’ Angels: Turkish customs’ facilities: Kapikule
Transport company: Agrosped (Hungary)
Licence plate: (H) JWC531; XYJ280
Transport of lambs from Hungary to Turkey
The lambs are loaded on four decks. The deck height is insufficient and the animals are touching the ceiling with their backs. Therefore the air flow within the animals’ compartments is hindered and there is an extreme smell of ammonia inside the truck.

This constitutes a violation of Article 3 (g), Article 6 (3) in connection with Annex I, Chapter II, 1.2. of Council Regulation EC 1/2005. Furthermore, it contradicts the requirements of Article 4 (1) and Article 17 of the European Convention for the Protection of Animals during international transport.

Therefore the animals have not been transported in compliance with Council Regulation EC 1/2005 from the place of departure in the Community (Bulgaria) to the presentation at Kapitan Andreevo BVIP in Bulgaria and the means of transport did not comply with the requirements of Chapter II and Chapter VI of Annex I to the Regulation. The transport will also not comply with the European Convention for the Protection of Animals during international transport until the first place of unloading in Turkey.

There is a new-born calf on board this truck. The animal seems to be only a few hours old. The animal must have been born a short time before the inspection by the Bulgarian veterinary service at Kapitan Andreevo BVIP. The drivers buy milk for the baby calf and separate it from the mother. Due to the lack of space in the Croatian truck the calf is transferred to another truck which has a free compartment where hay was stored.

This constitutes a violation of Article 3, Article 8 (1), Article 6 (3) in connection with Annex I, Chapter I, 2. (c) and (e) and 4. of Council Regulation EC 1/2005. Furthermore, it contravenes the requirements of Article 4 (1) and Article 9 (3) and 25 of the European Convention for the Protection of Animals during international transport.

Accordingly the animals have not been transported in compliance with Council Regulation EC 1/2005 from the place of departure in the Community (Hungary) to the presentation at Kapitan Andreevo BVIP in Bulgaria. Both mother and calf were not fit to continue their journey and should have been unloaded for resting and adequate supply and eventually treatment.
transport will also not comply with the European Convention for the Protection of Animals during international transport until the first place of unloading in Turkey.

New-born calf born during transport on vehicle with licence plate KT743DE

***

17. 15.08.2011, Place of observation by Animals’ Angels: Turkish customs’ facilities, Kapikule
Transport Company: Agrospeed (Hungary)
Licence plates: (H) KXW 131; XWL 838
Transport of sheep from Hungary to Turkey

The space above the animals is insufficient. The air circulation within the truck is hindered due to the lack of head room.

This constitutes a violation of Article 3 (g), Article 6 (3) in connection with Annex I, Chapter II, 1.2. of Council Regulation EC 1/2005. Furthermore, it contravenes the requirements of Article 4 (1), Article 6 and Article 17 of the European Convention for the Protection of Animals during international transport.

Therefore the animals have not been transported in compliance with Council Regulation EC 1/2005 from the place of departure in the Community (Bulgaria) to the presentation at Kapitan Andreevo BVIP in Bulgaria and the means of transport did not comply with the requirements of Chapter II and Chapter VI of Annex I to the Regulation. The transport will also not comply with the European Convention for the Protection of Animals during international transport until the first place of unloading in Turkey.

N.B.: On 16.08.2011, this truck is still at Kapikule. The Animals’ Angels team observes two dead sheep on board the truck.

***

18. 15.08.2011, Place of observation by Animals’ Angels: Turkish customs’ facilities, Kapikule
Transport company: unknown (Bulgaria)
Licence plate: (BG) CT 8288 AT; CT8860 EX;
Transport of sheep from Bulgaria to Turkey

The transport is severely overcrowded. There is no space for all animals to lie down and due to the crowded situation not all animals can reach the watering devices of the vehicle.
There is no headroom. The animals are touching the ceiling/upper decks with their backs and heads. The air circulation within the animals’ compartment is nearly blocked due to the lack of back space.

This constitutes a violation of Article 3 (g), Article 6 (3) in connection with Annex I, Chapter II, 1.2. and Chapter III, 2.1. of Council Regulation EC 1/2005. Furthermore, it contravenes the requirements of Article 4 (1), Article 6 and Article 17 (1) of the European Convention for the Protection of Animals during international transport.

Therefore the animals have not been transported in compliance with Council Regulation EC 1/2005 from the place of departure in the Community (Bulgaria) to the presentation at Kapitan Andreevo BVIP in Bulgaria and the means of transport did not comply with the requirements of Chapter II and Chapter VI of Annex I to the Regulation. The transport will also not comply with the European Convention for the Protection of Animals during international transport until the first place of unloading in Turkey.

Insufficient deck height in truck with licence plates:
(BG) CT8288AT; CT8860EX

19. 18.08.2011, Place of observation by Animals’ Angels: Turkish customs’ facilities, Kapikule
Transport company: Agrospeed (Hungary)
Licence plates: (H) LX939; XUZ333
Transport of sheep from Hungary to Turkey

The head room is insufficient; the sheep are touching the ceiling/upper decks with their backs. The air circulation within the animals’ compartments is nearly blocked. Inside the truck, the Animals’ Angels team spots one dead sheep. The body is already bloated. When the Animals’ Angels team inspects the truck ten hours have already passed since the truck was presented at Kapitan Andreevo BVIP. Therefore, it is unclear if the animal was already dead at the moment the Bulgarian veterinarian checked the transport. However, it is most likely that the animal was not in a satisfactory condition at the moment the transport was presented to the veterinary service of the BVIP.

This constitutes violations of Article 3, Article 6 (3) in connection with Annex I, Chapter I, 1. and 4, Chapter II, 1.2 of Council Regulation EC 1/2005. Furthermore, it contravenes the requirements of Article 4 (1), Article 6, Article 9 and Article 17 of the European Convention for the Protection of Animals during international transport.

Therefore the animals have not been transported in compliance with Council Regulation EC
1/2005 from the place of departure in the Community (Hungary) to the presentation at Kapitan Andreevo BVIP in Bulgaria and the means of transport did not comply with the requirements of Chapter II and Chapter VI of Annex I to the Regulation. Furthermore, it is most likely that at the moment of the presentation of the transport to the BVIP at least one of the animals was not fit to continue the journey or already dead. Finally, the transport will also not comply with the European Convention for the Protection of Animals during international transport until the first place of unloading in Turkey.

N.B.: 14 sheep are dead after the transporter left the border Kapikule and further eight sheep are dead on arrival at the destination. Additionally, one sheep is so sick at arrival at the destination that it has to be emergency slaughtered (acc. to Muslim rituals without pre-stunning).

Dead sheep (18.08.) and insufficient head space on truck with licence plate (H) LXA939; XUZ833

20. 18.08.2011, Place of observation by Animals’ Angels: Turkish customs’ facilities, Kapikule
Transport company: unknown (Lithuania)
Licence plates: (LT) CD059; BDH781
Transport of heifers from Latvia to Turkey

The Animals’ Angels’ team inspects this transport shortly after the transport left Kapitan Andreevo BVIP. On board the truck there is a new-born calf. The Animals’ Angels team estimates that the baby calf is not more than a day old. Ear tag number of the mother: LV04025961281.

This constitutes a violation of Article 3, Article 8 (1), Article 6 (3) in connection with Annex I, Chapter I, 2. (c) and (e) and 4. of Council Regulation EC 1/2005. Furthermore, it contravenes the requirements of Article 4 (1), Article 9 (3) and Article 25 of the European Convention for the Protection of Animals during international transport.

Therefore the animals have not been transported in compliance with Council Regulation EC 1/2005 from the place of departure in the Community (Latvia) to the presentation at the Kapitan Andreevo BVIP in Bulgaria. Both mother and calf were not fit to continue their journey and should have been unloaded for resting and adequate supply and eventually treatment. The transport will also not comply with the European Convention for the protection of animals during international transport until the first place of unloading in Turkey.
21. Further evidence

On 10th June, Animals’ Angels holds a conversation with the veterinary service at Kapitan Andreevo BVIP. The veterinary officer on duty states that the veterinary service at the BIP does not check all live animal transports presented at the BIP for export. He says that accompanying documents have priority.

The Animals’ Angels teams also speak to many drivers whose transports had passed Kapitan Andreevo veterinary checks. They all declare that the veterinary checks at Kapitan Andreevo BIP are fast and no significant delays are caused but that the Bulgarian veterinary service normally does not check the animals and he transport conditions.

IV. Conclusion

In long-distance transports of live animals the relevant legislation on the protection of animals during transport is regularly ignored by the transporters and organisers or avoided wherever possible. The reason why is simple: where there is the possibility of financial advantage, animal welfare falls behind or is totally neglected. The authorities seem to be incapable of closing this gap. The practise shows again and again that they are clearly unable to cope with the control tasks that long-distance transports of live animals require.

The BVIP Kapitan Andreevo is the last control body for transports of live animals that leave the EU. The above-listed examples show that the veterinary service of the BVIP does not carry out proper checks as required by the relevant legislation.

The observations as described in the present report show once again that the minimum principles of protection of animals cannot be guaranteed during long-distance transports, in particular if these are to third party countries.
It is time that the EU put into practice its objectives of animal protection and put an end to long-distance transports of live animals. On the way to achieving this goal, the authorities involved should do everything possible to reduce animal suffering on long-distance transports as far as possible. In the case of the Bulgarian veterinary service at Kapitan Andreevo BIVP this means starting to carry out efficient checks of all animal transports presented to the BIVP. This includes imposing sanctions where the pertinent legislation is violated, notifying infractions observed to the competent authorities at origin and taking the legally required emergency measures in order to safeguard the welfare of the animals.

Animals’ Angels calls upon the European Parliament and the European Council to limit the transport time for commercial transports of live animals to an absolute maximum of 8 hours!

www.8hours.eu