

SECOND REAL TIME EVALUATION OF FAO's WORK ON HIGHLY PATHOGENIC AVIAN INFLUENZA

REGIONAL REPORT: ECTAD BAMAKO (WEST AND CENTRAL AFRICA)

15-16 OCTOBER 2009

Table of contents

- I. INTRODUCTION
- II. OVERVIEW OF ACTIVITIES
- III. ROLES, RESPONSIBILITIES AND IMPACTS IN THE REGION
- IV. PARTNERSHIPS
- V. CONTRIBUTIONS TO NATIONAL AND REGIONAL INITIATIVES
- VI. SYNTHESIS AND DISCUSSION OF REGIONAL CONTRIBUTIONS
- VII. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

ANNEX 1. List of People Met

ANNEX 2. Documentation Reviewed

ANNEX 3. Terms of Reference ECTAD Sub-regional Units

Acknowledgements

The evaluation team is very grateful to all the FAO staff and partners encountered, and particularly to the ECTAD Regional Manager, Dr Frédéric Poudevigne and his staff, for their candid comments on the regional avian influenza programme and the logistical support provided throughout the mission.

I. INTRODUCTION

When highly pathogenic avian influenza (HPAI) spread to Africa, the Middle East, Central Asia and Europe early in 2006, FAO decided to establish regional ECTAD units in those regions. In Africa and in the Near East, FAO and OIE agreed to jointly establish Regional Animal Health Centres (RAHCs)¹ on the basis of the soon-to-be created FAO ECTAD offices and OIE (sub-) regional representations.

The first regional ECTAD office for Africa was established in Bamako in early 2006. It was set-up following DGB 2004/31² and due to its relatively new creation it was not reviewed in detail by the First Real Time Evaluation (RTE). The first RTE report noted the early start of “regional activities” using TCP funding in Africa and the Near East. The First RTE qualified this move as “a very positive strategy in during that early phase when donors and others are not yet moving, and early in the disease spread when key advice can have a much greater impact.”

¹ ECTAD Functions, Structure and Instruments (2007)

² EMPRES Emergency Centre for Transboundary Animal Disease Operations

Dr Emmanuel Camus from CIRAD and Mr Carlos Tarazona from the FAO Office of Evaluation visited ECTAD Bamako from 15 to 16 October 2009 as part of the Second RTE of FAO's Work on Highly Pathogenic Avian Influenza. In line with the evaluation's terms of reference and the inception report, the focus of the visit was to evaluate the relevance, efficiency, effectiveness, sustainability and likely impact of the assistance provided by ECTAD Bamako in the past few years. The Office of the Regional Manager prepared a programme of meetings (see annex 1), provided documentation and materials relating to the office's work (annex 2) and made logistical arrangements for the mission. In view of the short time available, the second RTE has focused their assessment on the regional activities conducted by ECTAD Bamako (which are the bulk of the office work), and to a lesser extent on the direct support provided to countries in the region (i.e. Cote d'Ivoire and Togo were prioritized as these are the main affected countries and benefit from two of the largest national projects backstopped by ECTAD Bamako). To this end it has taken into account the responsibilities assigned to ECTAD sub-regional units as defined in the ECTAD Functions, Structure and Instruments Charter (see annex 3) and relevant strategic documents and work plans for the region.

II. OVERVIEW OF ACTIVITIES

The Emergency Centre for Transboundary Animal Diseases (ECTAD) for West and Central Africa was officially created in April 2006 in Bamako, Mali. This office (referred to as "ECTAD Bamako") was together with the OIE and AU-IBAR offices in Bamako expected to form the Regional Animal Health Centre (RAHC) for West and Central Africa. The choice for a RAHC in Bamako was made on the basis of potential synergies with these organizations. The office of AU-IBAR has historically played a major role in the sub-region through the Pan African Rinderpest Campaign (PARC) and then through the Pan African Control of Epizootics (PACE), a programme that run between 1999 and 2007, and now through the ongoing SP-INAP project. The OIE Regional Representation for Africa, which was established in Bamako in 2000, was expected to be part of the RAHC in the context of the GF-TAD agreement of 2004 to improve the surveillance and the control of animal diseases at sub-regional level. For reasons beyond FAO control, these three organizations have not yet been able to develop joint work plans. ECTAD Bamako, as probably OIE and AU-IBAR, has its own staff, coverage, strategy and work plan.

Staff: ECTAD Bamako was originally staffed by a project co-ordinator and a regional manager for most of 2006, but since 2007 it has basically kept the same structure with a core group of 5-6 staff members providing technical support on early warning (laboratory capacity building and network development, which are mainly the responsibility of the Laboratory expert), emergency response (animal health strategy and epidemiological networks, which are mainly the responsibility of the regional manager), socio economic & poultry production (including biosecurity, census, safe trade and impact analysis) and communications. At the time of the team's visit there were nine professional staff members including three programme and operations staff. In the past two years the office have also hired four national long-term consultants (based in Senegal, Cote d'Ivoire, Benin and Togo) who to date remain under contract, and ten regional short-term consultants for specialized inputs.

Coverage: The office currently serves twenty three countries³ of varying characteristics (most are francophone but there are also a few anglophone and lusophone countries). ECTAD Bamako supervises activities in all these countries with the exception of Nigeria, which is supervised directly from Rome. Although direct assistance has been provided to numerous countries with greater attention reportedly given to countries with greatest needs such as Sierra Leone and Liberia, regional activities have mostly targeted francophone countries of West Africa, partially because they are the most numerous but also because they were those most affected by the disease (with the exception of Nigeria) and are easier to reach from Bamako. In the past three years eight countries (six francophone: Benin, Togo, Cote d'Ivoire, Burkina Faso, Cameroon and Niger; and two anglophone: Nigeria and Ghana) had reported infection with only one human casualty recorded (Nigeria). The last outbreak in the region was reported by Togo in September 2008.

Strategy and work plan: In the first year of operations (early 2006-early 2007), activities were mainly driven by the urgent need to support countries affected by the disease while strengthening preparedness of those not yet infected. In late 2007 FAO developed a strategy (also called "programme") for West and Central Africa for the period 2008-09, which is based on the FAO/OIE Global Strategy for Prevention and Control of H5N1 Highly Pathogenic Avian Influenza and the FAO's regional strategy for Africa developed in 2006. According to this strategy, ECTAD Bamako global objective for the biennium is to "contribute to poverty reduction through sustainable development of the livestock sector in west and central Africa". To this end, three specific objectives (with expected results and activities) were defined:

- Support prevention, control and eradication of HPAI in west and central Africa;
- Strengthen National Veterinary Services; and,
- Promote safe and sustainable animal production.

FAO has developed an annual programme of work to operationalizing the above strategy. The work plan provides clear linkages between the strategy's global and specific objectives and expected results with the activities and inputs undertaken through regional and national projects. The evaluation team considers the strategy and work programme developed as very positive and potentially useful managerial tools. It is early to assess the strategy's effectiveness in aligning ECTAD Bamako work to regional demands and context, but it is noticeable that the existence of the strategy is bringing and forcing people to plan ongoing activities in a more strategic way.

Regional Projects. Around US\$ 12.5 m (see table 1) have been budgeted for regional projects during the period 2005-2009. ECTAD Bamako has had a leading role in their implementation. These have been funded by a number of donors (FAO, Sweden, UK, Canada, France and USA) and channelled mainly through SFERA. The latter has provided some flexibility for preparing, within the limits imposed by the different donors, a comprehensive work plan; the drawbacks being that funding decisions and overall fundraising have been done mostly outside Bamako, and that given the source of funding, activities, most of which of a non-emergency nature (e.g. such as development of networks), had to be (re-)planned on a short-term (annual but sometimes also monthly) basis.

³ Benin, Burkina Faso, Cameroon, Cape Verde, Central African Republic, Chad, Democratic Republic of the Congo, Côte d'Ivoire, Equatorial Guinea, Gabon, Gambia, Ghana, Guinea, Guinea-Bissau, Liberia, Mali, Niger, Nigeria, Sao Tome and Principe, Senegal, Sierra Leone, Togo

Table 1. Regional Avian Influenza Projects in West and Central Africa (2005-09)

Project symbol	Project Title	Donor	Total budget	Delivery	EOD	NTE	Beneficiary countries
TCP/RAF/3016	Emergency assistance for early detection and prevention of avian influenza in Western Africa	FAO	402,815	402,815	1/11/05	30/6/07	All West and Central African countries
OSRO/GLO/504/MUL Baby 4	Emergency assistance for the control and prevention of avian influenza	France	1,976,807	1,956,650	1/1/06	30/4/07	All West and Central African countries
OSRO/GLO/601/SWE Baby 2	Emergency assistance for the control and prevention of avian influenza- AI activities in Africa South of Sahara	Sweden	1,139,349	1,136,129	28/4/06	31/12/09	All West and Central African countries
OSRO/GLO/604/UK Child	To support the implementation of the "Avian Influenza Response Programme" through the "Special Fund for Emergency and Rehabilitation Activities (SFERA)" in the countries affected by the epizooty	UK	1,796,218	1,479,962	29-Mar-07	31-Mar-10	All West and Central African countries
OSRO/GLO/702/CAN Child	Contribution of the Government of Canada to FAO's global programme for HPAI control and eradication in support to Africa other regions	Canada	2,609,120	1,732,648	14-Mar-07	13-Apr-10	Regional for all West and Central African countries
OSRO/GLO/706/FR	Appui au système d'alerte précoce mondial et aux initiatives des réseaux régionaux pour la prévention et le contrôle de l'Influenza Aviaire en Afrique Centrale et de l'Ouest	France	705,490	706,168	01-Dec-2007	31-Dec-2008	All Western Africa
OSRO/RAF/612/USA Baby 3	Support FAO's Global Avian Influenza and Eradication Programme for Regional Activities in West Africa	USA	225,000	205,995	1/6/07	30/3/09	Regional for all West and Central African countries
OSRO/RAF/717/USA	HPAI Early Warning, Early response and preparedness strategy support in Western and Central Africa	USA	1,432,000	823,140	1/3/08	31/3/10	All West and Central African countries
OSRO/RAF/722/SWE	Support for the control of HPAI in Sub-Saharan Africa	Sweden	2,246,215	1,552,395	28/11/07	31/12/09	All West and Central African countries
Total			12,533,014	9,995,902			

Table 2. National Projects in West and Central Africa backstopped by ECTAD Bamako (2006-09)

Project symbol	Project Title	Donor	Total budget	Delivery	EOD	NTE	Beneficiary countries
OSRO/BKF/601/USA	Intervention d'urgence pour la lutte contre l'influenza aviaire hautement pathogène au Burkina Faso	USA	130,000	115,067	1/5/07	30/3/09	Burkina Faso
OSRO/NIR/601/MUL	Technical Assistance to the Government of Nigeria for Control and Eradication of Highly Pathogenic Avian Influenza	USA/UNDP	1,725,520	1,657,989	06/11/06	31/01/09	Nigeria
OSRO/NIR/602/EC	Active Avian Influenza Surveillance Study in Nigeria	EC	953,274	931,568	01/08/06	31/12/07	Nigeria
NIR/08/002/01/12	Capacity Building for National Prevention and Preparedness for Avian and Human Influenza Pandemic beyond Emergency.	UNDP	311,000	24,997	03/04/09	02/04/10	Nigeria
OSRO/IVC/603/EC	Intervention d'urgence pour la prévention, la détection précoce et la lutte contre la grippe aviaire en Côte d'Ivoire	EC	734,537	660,625	1/7/06	30/4/08	Ivory Coast
OSRO/NER/603/USA	Surveillance et contrôle de l'influenza aviaire au Niger	USA	200,000	183,312	1/8/06	30/3/09	Niger
TCP/SIL/3103	Support to Strengthening the Veterinary Services	FAO	304,000	288,928	1/6/07	31/5/09	Sierra Leone
TCP/GAB/3102	Renforcement des services vétérinaires et des mécanismes de coordination nationale pour la prévention de la grippe aviaire	FAO	237,000	242,678	1/7/08	30/6/09	Gabon
OSRO/CHD/602/EC	Intervention d'urgence pour la prévention, la détection précoce et la lutte contre l'influenza aviaire hautement pathogène au Tchad	EC	5,371,479	2,267,870	1/12/07	30/11/10	Chad
OSRO/TOG/801/EC	Assistance au Gouvernement du Togo dans la prévention et le contrôle de l'Influenza Aviaire Hautement Pathogène (IAHP)	EC	2,512,953	461,929	13/11/08	13/11/11	Togo
OSRO/GAB/801/EC	Intervention d'urgence pour la prévention, la détection précoce et la lutte contre la grippe aviaire au Gabon	EC	1,466,380	382,742	16/12/08	16/6/10	Gabon
Total			<u>13,946,143</u>	<u>7,217,705</u>			

National projects: Including the Nigeria country programme, around US\$ 13.9 million (see table 2 in the previous page) have been budgeted for national projects on avian influenza. ECTAD Bamako also support two projects in other transboundary animal diseases (AHS in Senegal and Anthrax in Togo). ECTAD Bamako has provided technical backstopping to these interventions while ECTAD Rome and the FAORs generally led the fundraising process. Most of the projects were indeed negotiated at HQ or country level and have largely been funded by the European Commission, USAID or FAO. Another characteristic of the national projects is that two of the biggest project targeted avian influenza prevention in non-affected countries (Chad and Gabon).

A detailed analysis of the activities funded by the regional projects with an emphasis on the networks established as well as a brief analysis of the support provided by ECTAD Bamako to national projects in affected countries (e.g. Togo and Cote d'Ivoire) can be found below.

III. ROLES, RESPONSIBILITIES AND IMPACTS IN THE REGION

Roles: The technical role of ECTAD Bamako in the region is mainly conducted through networks on epidemio-surveillance (RESEPI), socio-economics and production network for animal health (RESECOP), communication (RESOCOM) and laboratory capacity development (RESOLAB) as well as direct support to national projects.

RESEPI is a network on epidemio-surveillance. Regional work has been mainly funded by project OSRO/GLO/702/CAN and OSRO/RAF/717/USA whereas country level pilots have been funded through the national EC funded projects. RESEPI is functional in West Africa only and has been designed to incorporate reporting to GLEWS and WAHIS. Some of the activities conducted include a workshop with members of national epidemiology networks to facilitate exchange of disease information and promote better cooperation and consistency among countries on their approaches to disease control. To this end regional desk top simulation exercises were carried out in Bamako (Mali), Accra (Ghana) and Praia (Cap verde) and national field simulation in Somone (Senegal) and Segou (Mali) and cross border meetings organized in cooperation with ECOWAS and UEMOA to address trade related issues (traceability and biosecurity). Another important activity has been the deployment of TADinfo software in Nigeria, Ghana, Burkina Faso, Benin, Mali, Niger, Togo, the Gambia and Guinea Bissau to increase disease reporting capabilities.

RESOLAB is a network of avian influenza reference laboratories. Regional work has been funded by projects OSRO/GLO/702/CAN and OSRO/RAF/717/USA and with contributions from USDA whereas country level work has been funded through national projects. RESOLAB was developed two years ago to improve and link veterinary laboratories in West and Central Africa. The network is closely associated with the Padova OIE/FAO international reference laboratory and two national laboratories (Dakar in Senegal for French speaking countries and Vom in Nigeria for anglophone countries) have been designated as Regional Laboratories for avian influenza so that they can receive and analyse samples from neighbouring countries and provide training whether in their own accommodations or by sending experts. Although support has generally been provided at regional level, some priority was given to renovate laboratories in the least developed places (such as Liberia and Sierra Leone). Trainings have been organized for more than 70 laboratory staffs coming from 23 countries on diagnosis for avian influenza and Newcastle Disease and on advanced molecular and sequencing diagnosis in Padova. Equipments and reagents were supplied to every laboratory and a bank of reagents was set up in Bamako to rapidly respond to any

urgent request. Some successes include reduction in testing times (from 30 days in 2006 to 1 day in Nigeria) and the conduct of the inter-laboratory proficiency testing which are being carried out for the first time in the region.

RESECOP is a platform to exchange information and experiences between actors and countries on animal production and its socio-economic aspects, and to promote and enhance the consultation processes among these stakeholders in relation to themes such as biodiversity preservation, biosecurity improvement, improvement of health status of domestic animals, socio-economic impact of bird flu, etc. Regional work has been funded by projects OSRO/RAF/722/SWE and OSRO/RAF/717/USA whereas country level work has been funded by the relevant national project. Other activities include the development of capacity and strengthening of the role of socio-economics and poultry production disciplines at regional and national levels particularly through pilot work in 4 countries (Togo, Burkina Faso, Ghana and Cote d'Ivoire) and supporting national programmes and specific regional activities e.g. on bio-security.

RESOCOM is a network on communication. Its work has largely been funded through e OSRO/RAF/722/SWE. It has organized several training workshops in the region. A recent Regional Planning and Skills-Building Workshop for West Africa on HPAI Communication in Dakar with 60 participants concluded that there was a need to focus messages on animal health aspects and a need to use RESOCOM for improving communication activities in the region.

ECTAD Bamako has also supported other aspects of communication work such as: i) dissemination of technical information via internet (www.fao-ectad-bamako.org); and ii) changing risky attitudes through awareness raising activities. With regards to the latter, besides the Website, CD/DVDs, badges, leaflets, manuals and films containing a variety of technical information has been produced. Regarding the former, several workshops (in Dakar and Bamako) as well as pilot communication projects at national level have been conducted. Field activities have recently been suspended as the post for a communications officer became vacant. RESOCOM also produced two films on simulation exercises, one in French in Mali and the other one in English in Ghana.

The role of ECTAD “in containing HPAI...and in elaborating the surveillance and preparedness plans for the region...” and of RESOLAB “in dealing with outbreaks of AI in the region and establishing links with international reference laboratories” was appreciated by ALive experts in their evaluation of Laboratory Networks in Africa (February 2009) and of Epidemiology Networks (May 2009).

ECTAD Bamako has also played a major role providing direct technical assistance to countries in West and Central Africa. Assistance (in the form of backstopping missions) has focused on affected countries such as Togo and Cote d'Ivoire) but also on non affected countries with substantial resources for avian influenza prevention such as Chad and Gabon. A common denominator in these countries has been the presence of national projects to pay for ECTAD Bamako services. Nevertheless, most countries in the region are still eligible and benefit from direct technical support as they are considered to be “at risk of re-infection” basically because of their proximity to Nigeria⁴.

⁴ Report Exercise on Highly Pathogenic Avian Influenza: FAO contribution to the UNSIC report (2008)

In this regard, the role of national experts deserves a separate mention. As seen in Cote d'Ivoire, they are an important link between local Veterinary Services, FAO country representatives and ECTAD offices (in this case, Bamako). Having a national consultant on call is a cost-effective strategy to follow-up on prevention activities (e.g. biosecurity in live bird markets; preparedness plans; disease surveillance), to manage national projects but most importantly, to channel emergency assistance and allowing rapid disease reporting following suspect disease outbreaks.

The evaluation team was informed that although levels of preparedness greatly vary among countries, some are now considered to have made much progress. The simulation exercises conducted by FAO in the past three years indeed show that countries such as Ghana, Senegal and Mali have all strengthened their response capacity and would be able to rapidly contain minor outbreaks, whereas countries such as Cote d'Ivoire, Liberia, Sierra Leone, Guinea and Guinea Bissau, all recently affected by civil wars, and least developed countries such as Togo do still need major support, to re-build the whole or specific parts of their animal health response systems.

Given the limited technical expertise often available at country representations, the combination of national experts and direct technical support from Bamako is a cost-effective way to increase the technical base of FAO country offices on animal health issues. A practical example of ECTAD Bamako support to affected countries (in this case Togo) and the role played by the national consultant is given below.

Box 1. ECTAD Bamako support to Togo's avian influenza response

In September 2008, and following an outbreak of avian influenza diagnosed in 3 farms close to Lomé, ECTAD Bamako fielded three experts to the country with the objective of providing critical support to the veterinary services in a wide array of activities.

The FAO team, which also brought critical materials and supplies (e.g. reagents, PPPs, etc.), organized together with the Veterinary services the culling of 8,000 poultry, as well as compensation and disinfection of farms. They also supported the conduct of an epidemiological survey, the establishment of active surveillance of farms in the infected region; monitoring of quarantine in affected farms; a ban for movement of poultry and live birds markets; the setting up of border movement control; reinforcement of laboratory capacity (through RESOLAB); development of an emergency plan and a pilot project for development of the poultry sector.

The FAO team also supported regular contacts with the press on the disease situation and prepared a plan on how to deal with the media. Similar to Cote d'Ivoire, this process was facilitated by the full participation of national staff.

Although the outbreak was successfully controlled, much remained to be made to prevent and detect disease incursion. Following an official request from the Government of Togo, ECTAD Bamako prepared 2 projects for disease surveillance and control of Anthrax and African swine fever. These two projects were funded by FAO and a donor, and now a project proposal on Newcastle Disease has recently been prepared and submitted for funding to FAO HQ.

Responsibilities: A specific objective of ECTAD Bamako includes “support the prevention, control and eradication of HPAI in West and Central Africa”. In this regard, ECTAD Bamako was responsible for supporting prevention activities such as:

- Increased cross border movement control through better knowledge of trade flows, holding of cross-border meetings, provision of equipment and training of check-point staff.
- Improvement of bio-security, safe production and trade through value chain analysis, socio-economic studies, training on good practices and pilot bio-security work in live birds markets.
- Increased surveillance and laboratory training and equipment.

Regarding preparedness and control, ECTAD Bamako has:

- Contributed to the preparation of the Integrated National Avian Influenza Plan (INAP) as well as several emergency contingency plans and needs assessments.
- Developed and advocated for compensation plans.
- Carried out simulation exercises.
- Provided timely response to outbreaks in collaboration with the CMC-Animal Health and conducted follow up missions as appropriate.

The evaluation team noted the ample spectrum of expertise needed by the office to carry out their responsibilities. It was acknowledged that technical work conducted in support of the above elements has been successfully conducted but more work was still needed to improve institutional (rather than just individual and organizational) capacity. To sustain these efforts ECTAD Bamako was also charged with mobilizing resources for animal health activities. This function is perhaps the one much appreciated by countries. The evaluation team however noted that fund-raising has mainly taken place at HQ or country level, with potential regional donors or partners not having been sufficiently involved or approached. Even if regional donors are not numerous, a noticeable one is the European Union, which can and must be mobilized for regional activities. Another possibility is to mobilize international donors at regional level through projects prepared at ECTAD Bamako level but discussed/negotiated at international level by FAO HQ. For real long-term regional projects it would probably be necessary to have dedicated staffing (i.e. not just operations but also programming/resource mobilization expertise) in Bamako.

On the programming/operational side the evaluation team was informed of past difficulties regarding the somewhat lengthy process at HQ to clear some specific technical, managerial or financial decisions. The evaluation team noted that most of the issues raised happened in the early days and that in recent times more authority, particularly for technical decisions, has been delegated to the office (e.g. full oversight of and clearance of national projects reports). Also, the team noted that the issue of having a greater say in the management of regional and national projects was largely resulting from HQ, and not ECTAD Bamako, being responsible for funding allocations and being ultimately accountable to donors for the funding.

Impact: The evaluation team was not able to assess or gather evaluative information on the likely impact of the work conducted by ECTAD Bamako in the region. The team was however made aware that the institutional sustainability of the centre is still far from being guaranteed for a number of reasons (e.g. lack of a formal agreement between FAO and AU-IBAR; limited involvement of OIE in RAHCs; weak fundraising capacity at regional level; uncertainty of funding for regional activities, etc). Another key stakeholders in terms of institutional (and financial) sustainability are ECOWAS and UEMOA, but as it is discussed

below there are no firm collaborative agreements reached yet with this or any other regional partner or donor to assure long-term funding and support to ECTAD Bamako.

IV. PARTNERSHIPS

As indicated earlier, FAO does collaborate with a number of regional organizations such as AU-IBAR, OIE, UEMOA and ECOWAS (CEDEAO in French) but so far and mainly due to internal constraints of each organization this collaboration has mainly taken place in an informal or ad-hoc basis e.g. FAO/AU-IBAR/OIE co-financing the publication of a field manual, sharing information about the SP-INAP project activities with AU-IBAR, supporting the development of zoo-sanitary certificates for intra-regional trade with ECOWAS, or holding joint workshops with OIE).

FAO and ECTAD Bamako in particular are still committed to foster collaborative arrangements and there are partners who are very receptive to this. For example with ECOWAS an Action Plan is being developed to strengthen cooperation between the two organizations. The development of the action plan follows findings from a Feasibility Study on Epidemiology Networks in Africa conducted by the World Bank sponsored ALIVE platform which concluded that “there is clear interest at the ECOWAS Secretariat in the work of the RAHC [ECTAD] Bamako” and that “it is also appreciated that the current efforts to widen the scope of the network to a wider aspect of TADs and zoonoses will be beneficial to the region.”

FAO has also reached out to other partners such as USDA-APHIS and USAID (and their implementing partners: STOP-AI, ILRI, AI-COM). FAO has carried out joint activities on biosecurity with both partners. FAO has also made use of EISMV expertise in a number of regional and country activities. ECTAD Bamako also keeps working relations with donors such as SIDA, European Union (particularly in the case of national projects), the World Bank and the UN system (WHO, OCHA and UNICEF)

The evaluation team overall noted that regional and country level stakeholders were increasingly interested in partnering with ECTAD Bamako to develop programmes for other Transboundary animal diseases like PPR, ASF, CBPP, FMD, etc. This indeed represents an opportunity for FAO to use, and by doing so sustain the networks established and the capacities created to deal with avian influenza in the region.

V. CONTRIBUTION TO NATIONAL AND REGIONAL INITIATIVES

At national level, ECTAD Bamako most noticeable contribution are the technical support to national initiatives including projects in Togo, Cote d’Ivoire, Chad, Gabon, etc. In Togo ECTAD prepared the national project, started the activities during a workshop grouping all stakeholders, appointed the project staff, followed and supported the activities including the administrative and financial management and organized several trainings for stakeholders.

In the above countries, national projects are lead by FAO consultants, two nationals and one international, under the supervision and back-up of ECTAD Bamako. Links are strong and national projects would be, if not impossible, at least very difficult to carry out without ECTAD Bamako.

At regional level, ECTAD Bamako has contributed to different collaborative arrangements such as:

- Collaborative work with external partners: ECTAD Bamako has developed excellent collaboration between RESOLAB and the International FAO/OIE reference laboratory of Padova. A regional organization on livestock (UOFA) is also developing collaboration with ECTAD. For other partners see section IV on Partnership.
- Collaborative Work with FAO Office in the region: The FAO sub-regional office for West Africa in Accra is working more on animal production issues and there is a good complementarity with ECTAD Bamako which focuses on animal health (and also on poultry production); it is not really collaborative work.
- Collaborative work with UEMOA and ECOWAS - Discussions to sustain the network through a Steering Committee and through ECOWAS activities and funding. Private Public Partnership at a regional level with the future organization of a Regional Poultry Association modelled in UFA/UEMOA Association.

This collaborative and transparent approach has also improved several aspects of avian influenza prevention and control programmes e.g. for the first time identification of two regional laboratories in Dakar (Senegal) and Vom (Nigeria) able to receive samples to confirm HPAI from countries which can only suspect HPAI was reached. The approach followed has also created trust: Regional and bilateral meetings between CVOs to exchange information and experiences and networks of expertise have started to take place.

VI. SYNTHESIS AND DISCUSSIONS OF REGIONAL ECTAD'S CONTRIBUTIONS

Co-ordination of regional and country activities;

ECTAD Bamako has played, and continues to play, a central role in the coordination of regional and country activities through the development of networks, projects, national programmes, training, workshops, and provision of expertise, information and communication. This is built on the excellent relationship between the FAO staff in Bamako and other stakeholders in the region. The appointment of national and international consultants to manage large projects in Togo, Cote d'Ivoire and Chad also facilitates the coordination.

Formulation and implementation of regional programmes/projects;

ECTAD Bamako contributed to the formulation and implemented national and regional projects. The most noticeable projects are:

- Assistance to the Government of Togo in the prevention and control of HPAI, funded by EC, for 2 million Euros over three 3 years
- Emergency intervention for the prevention, early detection and control of HPAI in Chad, funded by EC for 3.88 million Euros over 3 years
- Backstopping to the control of HPAI in Gabon, funded by EC for 1 million Euros over 2 years

Promotion and coordination of regional networks;

Four very active regional networks were developed for epidemiological (RESEPI), laboratory (RESOLAB), socio-economics & production (RESECOP) and communication (RESOCOM) activities. They have and remain largely coordinated by ECTAD Bamako. Some (RESOLAB

in particular) are more matured than others, but in the absence of real buy-in and ownership from countries they still require FAO championing and promotion.

Advocacy and fund-raising for HPAI and Transboundary Animal Diseases interventions;

The fund-raising is probably the most questionable and challenging aspect of ECTAD, Bamako. Most of the projects, even the regional ones, were discussed and negotiated between FAO HQ and donors. There is probably a way for ECTAD Bamako, particularly through the TADs prioritized by country, to discuss together with countries and with regional donors like the EU and/or in partnership with Regional Economy Commissions (RECs) such as UEMOA and ECOWAS. It is not only a matter of financial sustainability but also of recognition.

The institutional and financial sustainability of the (sub-) regional ECTADs

The institutional sustainability of ECTAD Bamako: The evaluation team assigns a high priority to this action, and considers that FAO could, through an official agreement together with OIE and AU-IBAR, begin a real RAHC and not only a FAO ECTAD. It should be one priority for the ECTAD coordinator and FAO in the region. At the time of the evaluation mission it seems that there was already an agreement with OIE to clarify, and that AU-IBAR would be ready for such an agreement.

The financial sustainability of ECTAD Bamako depends on projects, national (supported from Bamako) and regional. Next year the last regional projects will finish. There is an urgent need to develop new ones with the support of FAO HQ. Some could be funded by regional donors such as the EU and some by international donors identified with FAO HQ support. Beside this short to medium term perspective, a longer term one should be sought by identifying activities that could be transferred to regional organizations. RESOLAB and RESEPI for instance are typically activities that could be handled by UEMOA or ECOWAS. Such activities should be anchored to African regional sustainable organizations otherwise there is a risk that, like in the PACE program, every activity stops when the funded projects stop. And it should be considered, discussed and decided rapidly, before it is too late.

The efficiency and adequacy of working arrangements within FAO (with HQ, regional and country offices)

The clearance from FAO HQ of some technical, managerial and financial decisions seems now easier and faster than it has been in the past, particularly when ECTAD Bamako started. As noted in Cote d'Ivoire in case of disease emergency there is a good complementarity and a rapid sharing of information and decision making between FAO country office, ECTAD and CMC-AH at FAO HQ. The role of FAO regional offices with ECTAD needs to be clarified; so far the interactions seem limited to exchange of information. Is there a role for these regional offices in the fund-raising for HPAI and TADs?

In conclusion, the evaluation team found several positive points regarding FAO ECTAD Bamako's work:

- Good organization and management. Excellent team with multidisciplinary expertise on: animal health, laboratory, epidemiology, socio-economics, animal production, data management, communication, operations and administration.

- More than 3 years of field experience.
- Emergency interventions with ECTAD experts in the different neighbouring countries
- Active regional networks: RESEPI (epidemiology), RESOLAB (laboratory), RESECOP (socio-economics & production), RESOCOM (communication).
- RESEPI: coordination, facilitation, stimulation, harmonization and auto-evaluation of national epidemio-surveillance networks.
 - Good background of activities with the PACE Programme.
 - Extension of surveillance beyond HPAI to other important TAD.
- RESOLAB: rehabilitation, upgrading, training of 25 national laboratories.
 - Providing equipment and reagents in particular with a bank of reagents organized in Bamako.
 - Development of Quality Assurance.
- RESECOP: Development since 2007 of activities on socio-economic & production aspects: identification of poultry farms, description of the poultry sector in each country, reflexion on a regional strategic plan to develop the poultry sector.
- RESOCOM: development of various tools of communication in partnership with countries, like leaflets, movies, websites and organization of trainings.
- Organization of simulation exercises filmed and discussed to identify weaknesses in the National Strategic Plans.
- Management and/or coordination of many regional and national projects including support to the survey on the epidemiology of avian influenza in Africa led by FAO HQ.
- Data management through the implementation of TADinfo in 11 countries.

On this basis, the evaluation team recommends FAO the following priority actions:

At regional level

- Pursue discussions with OIE and AU-IBAR to obtain a legal status for the RAHC Bamako, and in particular by signing an agreement with AU-IBAR. This agreement should not just elicit responsibilities and roles but also clearly define areas of joint work. As part of the discussions FAO should clarify with OIE eventual duplications between FAO RESOLAB and OIE regional activities on twining and networking of laboratories.
- Continue discussions with UEMOA and ECOWAS concerning long-term funding and location of regional networks and involve other potential partners on specialized areas of work (such as FAO/IAEA Joint Division on laboratory issues, ILRI on socio-economic research, CIRAD on wild birds research, etc.)
- Enhance mobilization of resources from regional donors such as the EU if possible in partnership with regional economic consortia (RECs). The appointment of a programming/ fundraising officer to help designing projects in the right format for each donor should also be considered. Depending on the success in fundraising, consider in consultation with FAO offices in the region the setting up of a new ECTAD unit for Central Africa given the high number of countries covered by ECTAD Bamako.
- Review the effectiveness of some modalities of assistance, such as Training of Trainers (ToT) or Workshops, with a focus to increase follow-up and uptake at national level.
- Explore possibilities of giving a greater role, responsibilities and say to countries participating in the different networks. This process can be easier to follow in case of a transition of networking functions to RECs in the more mature and relevant areas.
- Improve management of human resources; and particularly avoid the use of experts for very brief assignments when the activity is planned for a relatively long term.

At national level:

- Continue supporting and technically backstopping projects in the region (Chad, Gabon, Togo), but giving higher priority to mobilizing resources for countries in most need of assistance (e.g. those affected by wars) and those deemed to be at higher risk of infection.
- Support the development of links between TADinfo and OIE information system for official declarations of diseases.
- Support the application of risk analysis in the different countries together with the National Veterinary Services (only being undertaken completely in Senegal).

ANNEX 1. List of People Met

Frédéric POUDEVIGNE, ECTAD regional manager
Boubacar SECK, coordinator of FAO RESOLAB
Youssef KABORE, RESOLAB expert
Olivier ADIER, FAO communication expert
Felicia ZAENGEL, FAO administrative officer
Fallou GUEYE, FAO Animal Production expert
Cecile SQUARZONI, FAO Chad expert
Jean HOUNKALI, FAO Togo expert
Sadibu FALL, FAO Senegal expert
Sophie MOLIA, Cirad expert on HPAI
Mamadou NIANG, LCV, Central Veterinary Laboratory
Oumou SANGARE, regional coordinator of AU-IBAR
Zacharie CAMPAORE, coordinator of SPINAP
Yaya DOLO, president of National Poultry Association
Alphonse TEME, deputy CVO of Mali

ANNEX 2. Documentation Reviewed

Abidjan 3-5 Septembre 2008, B.Seck et C.Squarzoni

Alerte à Ségou. Un exercice de simulation pour la maîtrise d'un foyer de Grippe Aviaire, 25-27 juin 2009

Alive feasibility study on Epidemiological Networks in Africa, M.Rweyemamu, M.Fanikiso, P.Seck, Dec 2009

ALive feasibility study on Laboratory Network in Africa, G.Cattoli, C.R.Wilks & Y.Thiongane, Feb 2009

Atelier sur l'Assurance Qualité dans le Laboratoire de Diagnostic Vétérinaire, Douala, 14-18 septembre 2009

Epidemiology of Avian Influenza in Africa (EPIAAF) Survey. Final report, LOA PR 37212 between FAO and Cirad, October 2008.

Global HPAI Status. African outbreaks characteristics. Atelier Togo 12-14 octobre 2007, B.Seck et C.Squarzoni

HPAI: Current Status. Atelier transfrontalier sur le renforcement de la collaboration pour la surveillance, la prévention et le contrôle de l'IAHP en Afrique de l'Ouest et du Centre.

La lutte contre l'IAHP en Afrique : Sommaire régional. Conf.Vaccination/ a tool for the control of HPAI. Verona, Italy, B.Seck, C.Squarzoni & J.Litamoi

Situation sur la Grippe Aviaire au Togo et point sur les activités ECTAD/FAO du CRSA Bamako, Y.J.Hounkanli, Oct 2009

Strategies for Poultry Sectors Revival in West Africa, 28-30 Sept 2009, Bamako, Mali

Synthèse des activités de l'Unité ECTAD Bamako au CRSA Afrique de l'Ouest et Centre, Oct 2009

Unité Régionale FAO/ECTAD au CRSA Bamako : Plan de travail, Oct 2009

West and Central Africa Network of Diagnostic Veterinary Laboratory for AI and others TADs. Second Action Plan 2009, B.Seck

Plus more than twenty FAO Project documents (both regional and national) and reports of regional workshops and events organized by ECTAD Bamako.

ANNEX 3: Terms of Reference ECTAD Sub-regional Units

The terms of reference of ECTAD (sub-)regional units include the following responsibilities:

- ensure establishment of operational and technical capacities at regional, subregional and country level through efficient decentralized mechanisms;
- assist the heads of FAO Decentralized Offices with mainstreaming HPAI and TADs concerns into FAO's national, subregional and regional priority frameworks;
- gather and consolidate information on HPAI and other TADs and support, in close collaboration with the FAO Representative, country needs assessments;
- advise the CVO, with copy to the concerned heads of FAO Decentralized Offices, on the disease situation in the region including strategic recommendations on FAO's response;
- in consultation with the concerned FAO Representative, maintain links with member countries and advise the governments on the formulation of relevant response strategies;
- in close cooperation with concerned heads of FAO Decentralized Offices, (sub)regional institutions and partners develop a (sub)regional programme based on a (sub)regional strategy to be updated on a yearly basis;
- promote and foster, in collaboration with the concerned head of FAO Office, regional networks (epidemiology, surveillance, laboratories, wildlife and socio-economics and production);
- building on FAO's multidisciplinary and in consultation with the concerned heads of FAO Decentralized Offices, ECTAD Programming Unit, EMPRES and with partners, assist in the formulation of relevant programmes and projects;
- design and implement, in collaboration with heads of FAO Offices, a regional fund raising strategy and support FAO Representatives with country level fund raising initiatives concerning HPAI and TADs; promoting ECTAD programmes in the region with government partners, UN Agencies, NGOs and donors and facilitating partnerships;
- facilitate at regional and subregional level the programming of donors resources; take the lead for the development and implementation of Standard Operating Procedures for management of ECTAD operations at regional and country level;
- take direct responsibility for implementation (including reporting) of regional and subregional projects as well as projects in countries with no FAO Representative;
- carry out backstopping missions in support to country operations;
- continuously Monitor implementation of HPAI and other TADs operations in the region; contribute to the mobilization of CMC/AH missions and collaborate with them in taking follow-up measures upon completion of the mission.
- participate, with guidance of the head of FAO Decentralized office, in interagency/donor coordination meetings and programming exercises concerning HPAI/TADs;
- prepare regularly updated briefs, for concerned Headquarters units and heads of FAO Decentralized Offices, on regional/subregional projects and on country projects for countries where there is no ECTAD country team.