



Food and Agriculture  
Organization of the United  
Nations

## Office of Evaluation

---

### **Independent Evaluation of Project Development Assistance to Farmers in Remote Areas of Kosovo and Montenegro - GCP/RER/019/LUX**

*Follow-up report to the management response*

March 2013  
Final

# Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations

## Office of Evaluation (OED)

This report is available in electronic format at: <http://www.fao.org/evaluation>

*The designations employed and the presentation of material in this information product do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of the Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (FAO) concerning the legal or development status of any country, territory, city or area or of its authorities, or concerning the delimitation of its frontiers or boundaries. The mention of specific companies or products of manufacturers, whether or not these have been patented, does not imply that these have been endorsed or recommended by FAO in preference to others of a similar nature that are not mentioned.*

*The views expressed in this information product are those of the author(s) and do not necessarily reflect the views or policies of FAO.*

© FAO 2013

*FAO encourages the use, reproduction and dissemination of material in this information product. Except where otherwise indicated, material may be copied, downloaded and printed for private study, research and teaching purposes, or for use in non-commercial products or services, provided that appropriate acknowledgement of FAO as the source and copyright holder is given and that FAO's endorsement of users' views, products or services is not implied in any way.*

*All requests for translation and adaptation rights, and for resale and other commercial use rights should be made via [www.fao.org/contact-us/licence-request](http://www.fao.org/contact-us/licence-request) or addressed to [copyright@fao.org](mailto:copyright@fao.org).*

For further information on this report, please contact:

Director, OED  
Viale delle Terme di Caracalla 1, 00153  
Rome, Italy  
Email: [evaluation@fao.org](mailto:evaluation@fao.org)

**Management response to the Independent Evaluation of Project Development Assistance to Farmers in Remote Areas  
of Kosovo and Montenegro - GCP/RER/019/LUX**

Follow-up report

The project has changed the work plan for no-cost extension period based on the evaluation's recommendation. The project has recruited an international M&E specialist and two national M&E consultants. Recruitment process of monitoring and media specials is at the moment on-going, the purpose is to make all projects results available for wider audiences. The project is going to strength governments extension services through various workshops with a goal to make project more sustainable and transferable to the other regions. Success stories will be written and published on the FAO website. The project website will be created and uploaded with project documents, publication, ppt and other useful information, will be available for all in the region in next few years.

Follow-up report of the Management response to the Independent Evaluation of Project Development Assistance to Farmers in Remote Areas of Kosovo and Montenegro - GCP/RER/019/LUX			8 March 2013
Evaluation recommendation	Action Agreed	Comments on actions taken, including reasons for actions not taken	Impact (changes) of actions taken in terms of programme, policies and/or procedures
Recommendation 1 to FAO: FAO should ensure that the recommendations made in this evaluation are taken into consideration for the proposed 14-month extension of the project. A proposal for extension of the project was submitted prior to this evaluation, and it is understood that approval by the donor, the Grand Duchy of Luxembourg, is independent of this evaluation. Nevertheless, it is in the interests of the sustainability of the technologies and innovations introduced by the project, and the broader application of the approaches taken to government strategies within Montenegro and Kosovo, that the recommendations made below are incorporated into the planning and execution of the extension phase.	Incorporate the recommendations into the planning and execution of the extension phase. Revision of the workplan and the budget are required.	The work programme was revised based on the evaluation report at a strategic planning meeting in Budapest in March 2012. In December 2012 two workshops, one in Montenegro and one in Kosovo, originally planned as final workshops of the project took place. As the project has been extended until 31 July these workshops were instead a forum to get the views of stakeholders and counterparts on the activities implemented so far and to be implemented in 2013.	Based on the evaluation's recommendation, the project team has adjusted the work plan of the project in early 2012 to address the issues raised in the evaluation report.
Recommendation 2 to FAO on project framework: <b>Rationalise the key products of the project.</b> This project is characterised by practical on-the-ground interventions at farmer level aimed at the feeding, health and breeding of	Prepare the recommended framework for scaling-up of impacts to other municipalities and communities in Montenegro	Meetings were held with government, extension services and universities to upscale the activities. The information products prepared since 2006 will be	Capacity for extension, government and university staff built, to up-scale the projects activities to other regions.

Follow-up report of the Management response to the Independent Evaluation of Project Development Assistance to Farmers in Remote Areas of Kosovo and Montenegro - GCP/RER/019/LUX			8 March 2013
Evaluation recommendation	Action Agreed	Comments on actions taken, including reasons for actions not taken	Impact (changes) of actions taken in terms of programme, policies and/or procedures
livestock, and the marketing of emerging commodities. During the extension phase it is recommended that the key project outputs are synthesised and rationalised into a framework that can be used for the strategic scaling-up of impacts to other municipalities and communities in Montenegro and Kosovo.	and Kosovo	revised to include the experience of the project beneficiaries and the adjustments made. The visibility strategy of the project will be synchronized with the Delivery as One in Montenegro and the UNDAF in Kosovo. The project is strengthening government extension service capacities based on their needs. The project booklets will be updated to include the experience of the project until now, The project will create a project website where useful documents, powerpoint presentations and information will be available.	
Recommendation 3 to FAO on monitoring of projects: <b>Develop an internal monitoring and evaluation system.</b> The project, its extension, and, indeed, any future application of this model, require an effective monitoring and evaluation system to document the relationship between project inputs, productivity changes (at the animal, feed, health, breeding and marketing levels) and the broader outputs and outcomes of its activities. The strengthening of the project's design, containing clear objectives, sound performance indicators and the establishment of measurable targets, should be considered as the reference to construct this system.	Identify and hire M&E specialists for the extension phase of the project making funds available by reallocating funds.	An International M&E expert has been hired although delayed in November 2012. He is supported by two national M&E consultants.	The project started to work on setting up a system for monitoring and evaluation.. The final report is expected in May/June 2013
Recommendation 4 to FAO, to the respective Governments as well as to donors on partnership development: <b>Widen the portfolio of partnerships.</b> The project has undertaken a rather unique approach to promoting livestock development through direct engagement with selected farmers. As a result, the project will be sorely missed as government and other extensions services will not effectively fill the gap on the departure of FAO. It is therefore recommended that during the proposed 14-month extension, the project explores aggressively the potential for other government, donor and NGO initiatives, both current and	Continue the implementation with involving all stakeholders.	This recommendation has been taken into consideration in the past year and is included in the workplan for the coming 6 months.  A Farmers' Day was organized in October 2012 together with the Biotechnical faculty. Farmers from other regions of Montenegro participated raising awareness of new technologies	Ownership of stakeholder related to project implementation increased.  The Farmer's Day has further raised the awareness of farmers and other stakeholders.

Follow-up report of the Management response to the Independent Evaluation of Project Development Assistance to Farmers in Remote Areas of Kosovo and Montenegro - GCP/RER/019/LUX			8 March 2013
Evaluation recommendation	Action Agreed	Comments on actions taken, including reasons for actions not taken	Impact (changes) of actions taken in terms of programme, policies and/or procedures
planned, to contribute both philosophically and practically to the farmer and market focussed ideal of the project in different ways.		<p>and income opportunities.</p> <p>The staff on the ground has been in continuous dialogue with the governments, extension services and the donor. New project initiatives and activities included in line with interest of stakeholders and to the extent staff time allowed. The project staff has agreed with extension services representatives to extend some of the project activities to farmers outside the project region, based on farmers requests.</p> <p>In addition to staff and consultants the projects regularly engages municipal staff in workshops in order to create links between farmer associations and individual farmers and municipal staff to continue with the cooperation after the completion of the project.</p> <p>The construction of the livestock market in Decani is a joint activity with municipality and the Central Government (Ministry of Environment and Spatial Planning).</p>	<p>Department of Extension Service was created in Ministry of Agriculture in Kosovo at the end of 2012.</p> <p>Links with the Government at different levels including extension service strengthened.</p> <p>Farmers will be able to sell and buy livestock based on an organized and transparent structure and the relevant infrastructure will have been provided.</p>
Recommendation 5 to FAO on sustainability: <b>Strengthen the market access drivers of the project.</b> The project has sought to support the development of market opportunities for emerging commodities. It is recommended that during the proposed 14 month extension, much more effort is placed on exploring wider market opportunities for cheese (both local and semi-hard Pirot), wool and lamb, in particular. This is likely best undertaken through consultancies, potentially building on the project model of	Explore during the implementation of the extension phase wider market opportunities for cheese, wool and lamb, in particular	<p>Negotiations with wool buyers have continued, including sending of samples to prospective buyers. The project set up contact with UK wool company Curtis Wool Direct Ltd with a goal to establish long term contact and contracts with the project cooperatives</p> <p>For cheese and lamb it was concluded</p>	Export probability to the UK created and thus income generation for the farmers facilitated

Follow-up report of the Management response to the Independent Evaluation of Project Development Assistance to Farmers in Remote Areas of Kosovo and Montenegro - GCP/RER/019/LUX			8 March 2013
Evaluation recommendation	Action Agreed	Comments on actions taken, including reasons for actions not taken	Impact (changes) of actions taken in terms of programme, policies and/or procedures
engaging regional expertise with an understanding of both informal market strengthening (predominant in the cheese markets), as well as the demands and opportunities of new EU markets. This initiative should adopt a value chain approach to explore widening the livelihood benefits to other actors in the chain.		<p>that no market constraints exist. For example, price of lamb in Kosovo is at least 30% higher than in the region and the market for the sale of lamb has shown not to be a problem</p> <p>The cheese unit in Montenegro has achieved all required standards to sell cheese to supermarkets. On the supply side, for the six months no-cost extension investments in milk collection points and milk processing in new project region have been included in the budget.</p>	All cheese produced can be marketed.
Recommendation 6 to FAO on sustainability: <b>Facilitating access to credit for producer and processing enterprises.</b> While it is acknowledged that the project staff has provided support to some individual farmers in their application for credit facilities, it is recommended that a much broader and more strategic approach be taken to this role. In particular, it is recommended that direct engagement is made with the World Bank initiatives in both countries to explore how the sustainability of processing and marketing initiatives established by the project can be strengthened through successful credit applications supported by the project.	Project staff and Lead Technical Officer should engage with the World Bank initiatives in both countries to explore how the sustainability of processing and marketing initiatives established by the project can be strengthened	<p>The project management concluded that the most effective way of collaboration would be to support farmers, who would like to apply for funding as the World Bank will be providing the funds to the Ministry's paying agency. The World Bank itself is not involved providing grants or subsidies to farmers neither does it support individual projects. The World Bank project (MIDAS) has opened in February the fourth call for application (investment in agriculture). The project livestock consultant has participated in the related training. He will take the lead role on behalf of the project to help farmers who would like to apply.</p> <p>The project during November 2012 has organized a special workshop at which senior staff of Kosovo MAFRD explained the different funding options</p>	Farmers capacity to apply for funds has been increased.

Follow-up report of the Management response to the Independent Evaluation of Project Development Assistance to Farmers in Remote Areas of Kosovo and Montenegro - GCP/RER/019/LUX			8 March 2013
Evaluation recommendation	Action Agreed	Comments on actions taken, including reasons for actions not taken	Impact (changes) of actions taken in terms of programme, policies and/or procedures
		available and the application forms and process.	
Helping Recommendation 7 to FAO on sustainability: <b>Developing closer and more functional partnerships with extension services.</b> It is recommended that during the proposed 14-month extension, a much closer and more practical partnership is developed between project staff and the municipal extension services. It is recognised that funds may need to be assigned to ensure this takes place. This is to ensure that the capacity of extension services is enhanced in all the techniques, procedures and initiatives being undertaken by the project in the interests of sustainability and institutionalization of the project's model.	Include the capacity development activity into the plan of execution of extension phase and indicate this task into the TORs of the relevant consultants.	Regular training were carried out in 2012, some with extension service staff as appropriate. Further training of extension services and university students are planned for the first quarter of 2013.	Capacity for extension, government and university staff has been increased.
Recommendation 8 to FAO on up-scaling: <b>The development of thematic synthesis reports.</b> It is recommended that a series of strategic thematic synthesis reports be developed over the next 14 months which provide overviews and assessments of key successes of the project, presented in a balanced and objective manner and supported by empirical evidence. These are considered an essential legacy of the project, and also a valuable tool for widening the impacts of the project's achievements. Examples include, but are not limited to, forage crop production for winter feeding of dairy cows; silage production; incentives for the formation and durability of livestock farmers' groups, etc.	Take-up the preparation of these reports during implementation of extension phase and indicate this task into the TORs of the consultants.	The technical reports are presently being revised and will be published in hard and soft copies. A project website to remain after the end of the project is being designed.	Best practices will be made available to a wider audience and can be replicated by other actors.
Recommendation 9 on sustainability and impact: In line with FAO's Strategic Objective K, greater consideration should be given as to how best to mainstream gender equity within the farmers' groups, commodity processing, marketing cooperatives and YFCs. It is considered that there will be particular opportunities for this in the processing and marketing of cheese products, but all opportunities should be explored.	Take-up this recommendation during implementation of extension phase and indicate this task into the TORs of the consultants.	Training activities paying attention to the gender specific aspects. In addition, the YFC promoting the inclusion of girls in the programme. Support is specifically provided to the business, who are headed by women in the project area as a basis for promoting female activities as examples.	30% of the YFC members in Montenegro are girls.