

Impact evaluation of social protection programs in Africa: the Transfer Project

Benjamin Davis

Food and Agriculture Organization of the UN

Pulling together – the 2012 ESAR Social Policy Network Meeting
South Africa
March 6, 2012



1st and 2nd generation cash transfer program impact evaluations in Sub Saharan Africa (20 in 14)

- Malawi SCT
 - Mchinji pilot, 2008-2009
 - Expansion, 2012-2013
- Kenya
 - CT OVC, Pilot 2007, 2009, 2011
 - CT OVC, Expansion, 2012-2013
 - HSNP, Pilot 2010-2011
- Mozambique PSA
 - Expansion, 2008-2009
- Zambia
 - Monze pilot, 2007-2010
 - Expansion and child grant, 2010-2013
- South Africa CSG
 - Retrospective, 2010
- Burkina Faso
 - Experiment, 2008, 2009, 2010
- Sierra Leone
 - Pilot, 2011-2012
- Ethiopia
 - PNSP, 2006-2010
 - Tigray SPP, 2012-2014
- Ghana LEAP
 - Pilot, 2010-2012
- Lesotho, CSP
 - Pilot, 2011-2012
- Uganda, SAGE
 - Begins in 2012
- Zimbabwe, SCT
 - Begins in 2012
- Tanzania, TASAF
 - Pilot, 2010-2011
 - Expansion, 2012-2011?
- Niger
 - Begins in 2012



Cash transfer program impact evaluations where UNICEF plays a role (15 in 12)

- Malawi SCT
 - Mchinji pilot, 2008-2009
 - Expansion, 2012-2013
- Kenya CT-OVC
 - Pilot 2007, 2009, 2011
 - Expansion, 2012-2013
- Mozambique PSA
 - Expansion, 2008-2009
- Zambia
 - Monze pilot, 2007-2010
 - Expansion and child grant, 2010-2013
- South Africa CSG
 - Retrospective, 2010
- Sierra Leone
 - Pilot, 2011-2012
- Ethiopia
 - Tigray SPP, 2012-2014
- Ghana LEAP
 - Pilot, 2010-2012
- Lesotho, CSP
 - Pilot, 2011-2013
- Uganda, SAGE
 - Begins in 2012
- Zimbabwe, SCT
 - Begins in 2012
- Tanzania, TASAF
 - Expansion, 2012-201?



A great UNICEF success story

- Systematic, rigorous impact evaluation of 15 cash transfer programs in 12 countries
- Consistent, rigorous methodology producing body of policy-relevant evidence on specific policy area
- Led by country offices
 - Child protection/social policy
 - Managing, coordinating, technical advice
 - Feeding into country policy processes
- Facilitated by the Transfer Project
 - Regional coordination and learning
 - Technical assistance to COs and government counterparts



Main evaluation topics in the 1st generation

1. Food security and consumption
2. Health: use of services, morbidity, nutritional status
3. Education: enrollment, attendance, age of entry to school
4. Targeting





What's newish in the 2nd generation

1. Mitigation of HIV risk
 - a. Sexual behavior and perceptions
2. Psycho-social status (PSS), mental health, preferences
3. Conditionality
4. Productive activities and economic growth
 - a. Household and community level
 - b. Simulation modeling
5. Networks of reciprocal exchange



Who is coordinating the regional effort

- The Transfer Project
 - UNICEF, SCUK, UNC and FAO
 - National government and research partners
 - No funding so far: an informal grouping
 - <http://www.cpc.unc.edu/projects/transfer>
- From Protection to Production Project (PtoP)
 - FAO and UNICEF
 - Primarily funded by DFID and FAO, with contributions by EU and World Bank
 - <http://www.fao.org/economic/PtoP/en/>



Transfer Project: objectives

- **Provide evidence** on the effectiveness of cash transfer programs in achieving impacts for children
- **Inform** the development and design of social cash transfer **policy** and programs
- **Promote learning** across the continent on the design and implementation of cash transfer evaluations and research



Transfer Project: The 3 Pillars

1. Regional learning, information exchange and network/ community of practice
2. Technical assistance on design and implementation of impact evaluation and identification of research areas
 - Supervise to get what you want
 - Understand what you want to get
 - Know if you are getting it
3. Synthesis of regional lessons on programme design



Transfer Project: The 2 Arms

1. Operations

- CoP: UNICEF (with recent collaboration with The World Bank)
 - First implementers conference in Lesotho September, 2010
 - Implementers listserv to exchange ideas and experiences
 - Virtual exchange among ‘mature’ programs organized by WB as of December, 2011

2. Research

- Network
 - Annual workshop (January 2011 , February 2012, planned in 2013)
 - Virtual network
 - Website (tools, reports, data, etc)
- Impact evaluations
 - UNC in Kenya, Ghana and Zambia; 3ie proposals in Malawi and Zimbabwe
 - PtoP in Kenya, Ghana, Ethiopia, Malawi, Lesotho , Zambia and Zimbabwe
 - Only piece of funded cross country, thematic research, so far



From Protection to Production project FAO–UNICEF

- Focus on understanding economic impacts of cash transfer programs
 - Providing technical and analytical assistance to government agencies carrying out impact evaluations
 - Guiding principle: piggy-back on/add value to existing impact evaluations
 - Financing marginal cost of collecting additional information
 - Formally working with government and development partners in 7 countries in Sub Saharan Africa
 - UNICEF country offices are key partner
 - Will provide support to any government administered CT who requests it

- Three levels of analysis



1. Analysis of household decision making

- Focus on:
 - Asset accumulation, productive activities and labor allocation
 - Risk coping strategies
 - Time use
 - Social networks/reciprocal exchange
 - Climate change adaptation
- Preparation of methodological guidelines
- Design, pilot and supervise implementation of additional modules in household surveys
- Taking advantage of experimental design and panel data, carry out household analysis
 - FAO team will lead data analysis



2. Simulation of local economy impacts

- Construct village SAM/CGE models for cash transfer program areas in each country
- Preparation of methodological guidelines
- Insert economic linkages questions throughout household questionnaire
 - to/from whom and where
- Implement business enterprise surveys in program communities
- Analytical work led by Prof Ed Taylor and team at UC Davis
- Joint funding and dissemination with World Bank



3. Complement with qualitative methods

- Implement complementary qualitative field work in each country
- Focus on economic activities, and social networks
- Integration with quantitative analysis
- Preparation of methodological guidelines
- Qualitative work will be led by OPM



What next for the Transfer Project?

- Very short term (3 months)
 - Five papers from the 2011 research conference forthcoming in special issue of *J of Development Effectiveness* March 2012
 - Malawi SCT, Kenya CT-OVC, targeting, CGE comparing scaled up SCT/LEAP with fertilizer subsidies
 - Presenting results to Kenyan government
- Short term (6 months)
 - Series of policy briefs based on these articles and other work to be released
 - Strengthen web-presence with evaluation tools, data
 - Ongoing assistance to country programs
 - Baselines in Ethiopia, Malawi, Zimbabwe
 - Follow ups in Ghana, Zambia
 - PtoP project meeting



- Medium term (12 months)
 - Second implementers conference (UNICEF)
 - Seek funding for other thematic research to make maximum use of existing data
 - Cross cutting, thematic and comparative work badly needed but yet to be funded
 - Gender, OVC welfare and HIV risk, young child nutrition
- Long term (18 months)
 - Major conference on ‘State of evidence on Cash Transfers in Africa’
 - Present accumulated evidence of six years of research
 - 3rd annual meeting of research network
- Ongoing
 - Need to expand beyond UNICEF and unconditional cash transfers
 - World Bank, IFPR; public works....

