**Call for experiences in the use and application of three sets of CFS policy recommendations on smallholder agriculture in the context of food security and nutrition**

**Template for submissions**

**Please use this**[submission form](http://bit.ly/2nAitb1)**to share your experience in the use and application of three interconnected sets of CFS policy recommendations on smallholder agriculture in the context of food security and nutrition.   
  
For the necessary background and guidance, please refer to the topic note:** <http://www.fao.org/fsnforum/activities/discussions/CFS-smallholders-fsn>**.**  
**You can upload the completed form to the** FSN Forum **(**[www.fao.org/fsnforum](http://www.fao.org/fsnforum)) **or send it via email to** [fsn-moderator@fao.org](mailto:fsn-moderator@fao.org)**.**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Title of your submission\*** | **Raw milk supplies through territorial markets.** |
| **Geographical coverage**  *Indicate if your submission covers several levels, e.g. national level and regional level* | *National example with potential global relevance* |
| **Country(ies)/ Region(s) covered by your submission** | *Tanzania* |
| **Contact person** | Name: Dr. Marc C.A. Wegerif  Email address: marc.wegerif@up.ac.za |
| **Affiliation (indicate your affiliation)** | Government  UN organization  Civil Society / NGO  Private Sector  X Academia  Donor  Other ………………………………………………………… |

*\*Please choose a title for your submission, referring e.g. to your organization or/ and geographical coverage*

**If the information provided in your submission results from a multistakeholder consultation, please also fill the table in annex.**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| 1. Awareness of CFS policy recommendations | * How have you heard of these policy recommendations (e.g. CFS meeting or event, internet, colleagues, government, civil society organization)?   *Through CFS event and literature.*   * Have you taken any actions to make these policy recommendations known to colleagues or other CFS stakeholders (Please tick the answer below)?   No  Yes  If yes, please explain:  *Research, publication and various presentations.*   * What would you recommend to CFS member states, Rome-based Agencies or/ and other stakeholders to make CFS policy products more widely known? Please explain:   *Support more documentation of people’s own grassroots solutions. Make easily available such as through supporting writing up and translating summaries. Support sharing at events. Engage some of the multilateral spaces that are discussing related issues to make them aware of these experiences and solutions form the ground.* |
| 1. Use of the three sets of policy recommendations | * Which set(s) of policy recommendations have been used at sub-national, national, regional or/ and global level to support smallholder agriculture (please tick the answer below)?   *I am sharing experiences that have not arisen through the promotion of the recommendations, but that reflect the importance of the recommendations and people’s practices that are in line with them and from which lessons can be learnt for the future implementation of the recommendations. This experience is of direct relevance to the connecting of smallholders to markets through local, national and regional (territorial) markets.*  Set 1: [Investing in Smallholder Agriculture for Food Security and Nutrition](http://www.fao.org/3/a-av034e.pdf)  Main purpose(s):  Set 2: [Connecting Smallholders to Markets](http://www.fao.org/3/a-bq853e.pdf)  Main purpose(s):  ☐ Set 3: [Sustainable Agricultural Development for Food Security and Nutrition: What Roles for Livestock?](http://www.fao.org/3/a-bq854e.pdf)  Main purpose(s):     * Which policy recommendations were found particularly useful to support smallholders and their food and nutrition security? Please explain:   *The recognition that: “Globally more than 80% of smallholders operate in local and domestic food markets… that the food concerned is produced, processed, and traded within these systems… They perform multiple functions beyond commodity exchange, acting as a space for social interaction and exchange of knowledge. Despite their importance, these markets are often overlooked in data collection systems”.*  *“Collect comprehensive data on markets linked to local, national and/or regional food systems– both rural and urban, formal and informal – to improve the evidence base for policies”*  *“Promote inclusive participation in local food systems by encouraging relevant authorities’ engagement with all interested actors, including smallholders”*  *“Promote integrated and balanced approaches between policies and broader national strategies, including gender targeted interventions, such as those on local economic development and rural-urban planning, to facilitate their support of markets linked to local, national, and regional food systems”* |
| 1. Present and expected benefits for smallholders   *Indicate the results obtained/ expected in the short term and in the medium-to-long term, with quantitative indications where feasible (i.e. estimate of the number of smallholders that have been or are expected to be affected)* | How have smallholders benefitted (or are expected to benefit) from the use of these policy recommendations for food security and nutrition in the short and medium to long-term? How have they contributed to the progressive realization of the right to food? *(please answer in the two boxes below)* |
| Results in the short term (qualitative and quantitative):  *Income for around tens of thousands of small-scale dairy farmers and their families. Income for thousands of traders and retailers. Milk made more accessible to urban residents.* |
| Results in the medium to long term (qualitative and quantitative):  As above. See below for explanation.  A study of two models of dairy production and distribution to the large city of Dar es Salaam found that the territorial (local) raw milk market outperformed a value chain supply system in that it gave better returns to the primary producers and lower prices to the milk drinkers. The raw milk system relies largely on small-scale dairy farmers in urban, peri urban and surrounding areas. They link with other local production activities, such as through the provision of manure for urban and peri-urban horticulture. The production and distribution takes place within a symbiotic food system with a multitude of small-scale actors from the producers to traders and retailers. These operate through a range of locally and socially embedded relations involving direct selling, local traders, and local markets.  The raw milk system is remarkably resilient having grown in the face of negative policies and with no support, but still comprising the largest single source of fresh milk in the city. The value chain initiative looked at benefitted from donor and development loan finance and does provide opportunities for some dairy farmers, but can’t compete with the raw milk system. It also favors larger corporate entities (such as supermarkets and some of the largest dairy producers) which are less aligned with the needs of the majority of small-scale farmers’ and city residents. Policy maker’s preference for value chain interventions appears to be ideological as it is not justified by the outcomes.  Raw milk is preferred by many people and usable for things like the making of sour milk at home in a way the pasteurized milk is not. The raw milk supply is supportive of a range of small enterprises, notably market women who use and sell the raw milk. |
| 1. Present and expected benefits for female smallholders | * Have any specific actions been taken (in line with these policy recommendations) topromote the realization of women’s empowerment, women’s rights and gender equality in the context of smallholder agriculture? Please explain:   *Women play a leading role in parts of the raw milks supply, some as dairy farmers, others as traders and street food vendors selling the milk and milky tea*.   * How have female smallholders benefitted (or are expected to benefit) from these actions in terms of food security and nutrition and the progressive realization of the right to food? Please explain:   *Women small-scale dairy farmers benefit from the sale of milk for a much better price per liter than the value chain or any corporate buyer provides. They also benefit from the social networks involved in the marketing and distribution.* |
| 1. Present and expected benefits for the youth | * Have any specific actions been taken (in line with these policy recommendations) to promote the involvement of youth in agriculture and related activities in the context of smallholder agriculture? Please explain:   *Youth are involved in parts of the raw milk supply, some as dairy farmers. Youth are particularly involved in the collection of feed for dairy cows and in the milk distribution. Young women play a large role in markets as food vendors selling milk.*   * How have youth benefitted (or are expected to benefit) from these actions in terms of food security and nutrition and the progressive realization of the right to food of youth? Please explain:   *Through earning income.* |
| 1. Contribution of the use of these policy recommendations to SDGs | * How has the use of these policy recommendations contributed (or is expected to contribute) to achieving the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs), in particular SDGs 1 & 2 and some of the SDGs targeted in the 2019 review, and to fostering policy coherence? (please tick the answer):   SDG 1 (no poverty)  Please explain: Large creation of income earning and ownership opportunities.  SDG 2 (zero hunger)  Please explain: Provides income to tens of thousands of small-scale farmers, traders, processors, transporters and retailers. Delivers milk in an accessible way to urban residents.  SDG 8 (decent work and economic growth)  Please explain: As above, tens of thousands of enterprises involved and production is growing.  SDG 10 (reduced inequalities)  Please explain: It is a highly equitable system with many actors owning their own enterprises.  SDG 13 (climate action)  Please explain: Low external input production practices, provision of manure for horticulture, and local low emission distribution (a lot on foot and bicycle). |
| 1. Relevance and expected benefits of the use of these policy recommendations to the [UN Decade of Family Farming](https://digitallibrary.un.org/record/1479766/files/A_RES_72_239-EN.pdf) and the [UN Decade of Action on Nutrition](http://www.un.org/en/ga/search/view_doc.asp?symbol=A/RES/70/259) | * How could these policy recommendations contribute to the UN Decade of Family Farming or (further) contribute to the UN Decade of Action on Nutrition for improving the food security and nutrition of smallholders? Please explain:   *These kind of experiences need to be put at the center of discussions on what family farming is and how it can be supported. What is happening within this raw milk supply and its territorial markets needs to be learnt from and built on.* |
| 1. Catalysts and constraints | * What were the key catalysts that influenced positively the use of these policy recommendations for improving the food security and nutrition of smallholders?   *Historical conditions that limited the possibilities for elite accumulation and encouraged local collaboration. Some improved cattle breeds and other technology, such as milk testing.*   * What were the main constraints and challenges in using these CFS policy recommendations for improving the food security and nutrition smallholders?   *The intransigence of policy makers and development practitioners who are locked into a particular modernization paradigm. They blindly promote value chains, ignore the preferences of local people and favor corporations, like foreign owned supermarkets, over local businesses. They do not understand or value such territorial and local systems because, although these work well for tens of thousands involved, they do not provide opportunities for large investors to profit, nor do they offer large scale corporate and government rent appropriation opportunities.* |
| 1. Good practices | * What good practices would you recommend for successful use of these policy recommendations?   This raw milk supply system is not the result of direct interventions by the state or other institutions. It has rather evolved I particular conditions, based on local people’s initiatives.  Allowing space (in planning and regulations) for urban and peri-urban dairy farming is important. Encouraging circular food systems that include the use of manure for farming and the waste from food processing (such as maize milling) as animal feed is important.  Find ways to enable such local practices. Seriously question, by taking a holistic view of what is going on and what other options there are, whether value chain interventions are the best option for development finance and programs. |
| 1. Lessons learned | * Do you have any suggestions to make to CFS in order to enhance the use of these policy recommendations for improving the food security and nutrition of smallholders?   See above |
| 1. Potential use of the policy recommendations for improving the food security and nutrition of smallholders | * If these policy recommendations have not been used (or not sufficiently used), how could they be (further) used in the future for improving the food security and nutrition of smallholders, advancing the progressive realization of the right to food, achieving SDGs or/ and fostering policy coherence? Please explain:   *Respect and learn from what the poorer eaters and food producers are doing. Create an enabling environment for the positive practices, such as collaboration in interdependent relations, to flourish. Avoid interventions, such as capital injections, that create greater inequality and destabilize the symbiotic relations that are central to such food systems working.*   * What actions could be taken (in line with these policy recommendations) to promote the realization of women’s empowerment, women’s rights and gender equality in the context of smallholder agriculture? Please explain:   *Greater attention in research and interventions to understanding the position of women. Build on the areas where women are already strong in the food system. Look to understand and overcome the constraints that are blocking women from playing a larger role in other areas.*   * What actions could be taken (in line with these policy recommendations) to promote the involvement of youth in agriculture and related activities in the context of smallholder agriculture? Please explain:   *Understand, support and enhance the apprenticeship arrangements that exist.* |
| 1. Link to additional information | Wegerif, M. C. A. and R. Martucci (2018). "Milk and the city: Raw milk challenging the value claims of value chains." Agroecology and Sustainable Food Systems 42(10).  <https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1080/21683565.2018.1530716> |