**Rural migration, agriculture and rural development**

**Collection of contributions received**

Table of Contents

Topic note 4

Contributions received 5

1. Bruno Dorin, CIRAD, France 5

2. Olamiju Olayinka, Nigeria 5

3. Laura Schenck, FAO, Italy 5

4. Catherine Marquette, IFAD, Italy 6

5. Flavio Bolliger, FAO, Italy 6

6. John Weatherhogg, FAO (retired), Italy 6

7. Kuruppacharil V. Peter, World Noni Research Foundation, India 7

8. Carlos Granado Fernandez, Universidad Politécnica de las Fuerzas Armadas, Venezuela 7

9. Abass Amina, Niger 7

10. Marie Leroy, CARE, France 8

11. Shiela Chikulo, Wageningen University and Research, Netherlands 9

12. Nitya Rao, School of International Development and LANSA, India 9

13. David Michael, Wondu Business & Technology Services, Australia 10

14. Lal Manavado, University of Oslo affiliate, Norway 10

15. Eileen Omosa, We Grow Ideas, Canada 15

16. Emile Houngbo, National University of Agriculture, Porto-Novo (UNA), Benin 16

17. Stanley Weeraratna, Rain Water Harvesting Forum, Sri Lanka 16

18. Philipp Arni, Center for Corporate Responsibility and Sustainability at the University of Zurich, Switzerland 18

19. Simeon Onya, Michael Okpara University of Agriculture, Umudike, Nigeria 19

20. Alexander Sagaydak, State University of Land Use Planning, Russian Federation 19

21. Jeeyon Janet Kim, Feinstein International Center, Tufts University, United States of America 20

22. Vethaiya Balasubramanian, Freelance consultant, India 21

23. Andrea Magarini, Milan Municipality, Italy 21

24. Amanullah, The University of Agriculture Peshawar, Pakistan 23

25. Andrea Cattaneo, facilitator of the online consultation 23

26. Kuruppacharil V. Peter, World Noni Research Foundation, India (second contribution) 24

27. Sophia Davidova, University of Kent, United Kingdom 24

28. Astghik Sahakyan, ICARE Foundation, Armenia 25

29. Manuel Castrillo, Proyecto Camino Verde, Costa Rica 25

30. Philipp Heinrigs, OECD, France 26

31. Valentine Gandhi, The Development CAFE, Indonesia 27

32. Jean Marius d’Alexandris, Lyseconcept, France 28

33. Binod ChapAgain, The Center for People and Forests, Thailand 30

34. Gerhard Flachowsky, Federal Research Institute for Animal Health, Germany 30

35. Bhubaneswor Dhakal, Nepal 31

36. Adebayo Depo, IADR, Togo 31

37. Muraleedhar Prasad, Farm Care Foundation, India 32

38. Catherine Marquette, IFAD, Italy 33

39. Andrea Cattaneo, facilitator of the consultation 35

40. Ricardo Safra de Campos, University of Exeter, United Kingdom 35

41. Rejaul Karin, South Asian Association for Regional Cooperation, Nepal 36

42. Mylene Rodríguez Leyton, Universidad Metropolitana de Barranquilla, Colombia 42

43. Ogunbande Joseph, University of Agriculture, Abeokuta, Nigera 44

44. Binni Azad, National Forum for Women’s Rights, India 44

45. Laura L. Dawson, Food Physics & Body Dynamics LLC, United States of America 44

46. Dineshkumar Singh, TATA Consultancy Services, India 47

47. Eri Uchimura, ILO, Switzerland 47

48. Luis Antonio Hualda, University of the Philippines Mindanao, Philippines 48

49. Andrea Cattaneo, facilitator of the consultation 48

50. Roberto Sensi, ActionAid, Italy 49

# Topic note

Dear Members,

The 2018 edition of *the State of Food and Agriculture (SOFA),* one of FAO’s annual flagship publications, will focus on migration and the challenges it poses to food security as well as to peace and stability.

Today there is growing international attention to the phenomenon of migration, its causes, its effects and the way in which it occurs. To open up the drafting of *the State of Food and Agriculture (SOFA),* we would like to invite you to share inputs and consideration on the [draft annotated outline of the report](http://www.fao.org/fsnforum/sites/default/files/files/143_SOFA_migration/SOFA_2018_Annotated_outline_FSN_Forum.docx).

Migration, both through its drivers and its impacts, is closely linked to FAO’s goals of fighting hunger, achieving food security and promoting the sustainable use of natural resources. While much of the international attention is on international migration, migration between countries is part of a bigger picture that includes both international and domestic migration flows. Migration to, from and between rural areas (rural migration) is an important component of these migration flows. Rural migration is closely linked with agricultural and rural development in a bidirectional relationship: agricultural and rural development affects migration and is itself affected by migration.

The 2018 edition of *the State of Food and Agriculture (SOFA)* will explore these linkages. It will analyze rural migration flows as well as their determinants and impacts. It will look at the factors in rural areas, and more specifically in agriculture, which contribute to determining migration decisions and will analyze the relationship between agricultural and rural development and migration decisions. The report will also look at the ways in which migration affects rural areas and agricultural and rural development.

You may want to consider the following questions:

1) Does the [outline](http://www.fao.org/fsnforum/sites/default/files/files/143_SOFA_migration/SOFA_2018_Annotated_outline_FSN_Forum.docx) focus on the most relevant issues concerning the links between migration, agriculture and rural development or are there important dimensions that have been left out?

2) Do you have individual experiences or are you aware of case studies that are useful for informing parts of the report?

3) Are you aware of important sources of information that could be useful for the preparation of the report?

If you are interested in earlier editions of the SOFA reports, you can find them here: <http://www.fao.org/publications/sofa/en/>

We thank you for your valuable contribution to this exchange and for helping us prepare a better and more relevant report.

Andrea Cattaneo

Team Leader of The State of Food and Agriculture

# Contributions received

## Bruno Dorin, CIRAD, France

Dear Colleagues, I enclosed 2 papers (a short one in English published resently in the Indian journal EPW, and a longer one published in 2016 in the French journal "Economie Rurale") that may be useful for the preparation of the report. They illustrate how what you call "successful economic development and structural transformation of economies" may be questioned in a country like India due to land constraints and jobless growth that are disregarded by current theories of economic development and rural-urban migrations. Best regards, Bruno Dorin (CSH/CIRAD/CIRED, New Delhi, India)

## Olamiju Olayinka, Nigeria

Challenges posed to food security are the methods used to reduce poverty, enhance stability, promote growth in partner countries, education and health. Boost incomes and increase economic security (Agriculture, fisheries and water) through development assistance with effective governance that will lead to standard infrastructure and will facilitate trade and international competitiveness.

## Laura Schenck, FAO, Italy

Dear FSN Forum members,

Hand-in-hand with the 2018 edition of the State of Food and Agriculture (SOFA), FAO headquarters in Rome will be hosting a technical workshop on the 1st of December 2017 on:  
  
**The drivers and impacts of migration and labor mobility in origins and destinations: Building the evidence base for policies that promote safe, orderly and regular people’s and labor mobility for poverty reduction and sustainable development**The workshop will bring together researchers and policymakers from around the world to discuss and understand the diverse patterns, drivers and impacts of migration and labor mobility as well as to enhance the dialogue to promote rural-urban linkages for achieving sustainable livelihoods transformation, food security and nutrition and poverty reduction.

In the context of the program, FAO invites the submission of papers to be presented at the workshop. You are welcome to send your extended abstracts explaining the core question(s), data and methods used, and (anticipated) findings, or complete papers, to [rural-transformation@fao.org](mailto:%20rural-transformation@fao.or) by 29 September 2017.

For further information on the call, the aims of the workshop and the programme of work, please visit: [www.fao.org/economic/esa/esa-events/migration/en](http://www.fao.org/economic/esa/esa-events/migration/en)

Laura  
  
Laura Schenck  
Small Family Farms Team  
FAO

## Catherine Marquette, IFAD, Italy

Dear Moderator,

Just an initial reaction to the outline --- It is not the case as stated that “knowledge of the exact relationship between agricultural and rural development and migration is limited due to relative scarcity both of statistical data and empirical analysis.”

Demographers --- including those working in the UN Population Division and New York (which has a Population and Development section) have been looking at and collecting data on this for the last several decades --- this encompasses several expert group meetings over the last decades. This topic has been a key area of research including work I believe previously done under the auspices of FAO (see Richard Bilsborrow’s body of work) as well as my own.

I strongly suggest you consult the UN Population Division resources and personnel in drafting this outline, I believe they will prove a valuable resource to this end.

I will review the outline as well to provide more specific comments as well.

Yours,

Catherine M. Marquette

## Flavio Bolliger, FAO, Italy

There is no internationally accepted definition of ‘rural areas’. Heterogeneity in the characteristics of rural areas across countries complicates attempts to reduce the differences in national definitions and to harness them to some common criteria. In most cases rural areas are set as equivalent to non-urban areas. A lack of consistency in definition hinders comparability of rural indicators across countries and reduces usefulness of indicators for national governments.  
  
The outline don't adress this problem.  
  
I refer to the on going research topic of the Global Strategy improving Agricultural and Rural Statistics - GSARS entitled "Improving Rural Statistics". The objective of this research topic is to develop a framework and cost-effective methods to help countries produce rural statistics, including a proposal for an international definition of rural areas and degrees of rurality for statistical purposes. (see <http://gsars.org/en/tag/ruralstatistic/>)

The project has been collaborating with other international institutions (WB, OECD, JRC, and EUROSTAT) that are working on a degree of urbanization (<http://ec.europa.eu/eurostat/web/degree-of-urbanisation>) to ensure a consistent definition of urban and rural areas. (See also <http://ghsl.jrc.ec.europa.eu/>).

## John Weatherhogg, FAO (retired), Italy

Chapter 4, para 4.1 talks about "changes toward less labour intensive practices" but important to recognise that this often results in changes in cropping pattern. For example, in the Delta of Egypt farmers are being encouraged to conserve water by growing less rice. There is supposed to be a quota on how much area can be sown to paddy. Despite this there are large areas of so called "illegal" paddy. Most farmers in this area are in fact part time and and paddy is the ideal crop which requires minimum attention from planting to harvest so that they can work off farm,

The same situation is noticeable in South-East and South Asia where farmers are often being encouraged to grow non-paddy crops in order to save water, but often with rather limited success.

## Kuruppacharil V. Peter, World Noni Research Foundation, India

With prospects for higher income earning jobs in urban and peri-urban areas there are major migration from rural areas in Kerala one of the most literate state of India. The migration to middle east, Canada, USA, Australia and Europe from rural and urban Kerala are noteworthy. The shortage in farm and plantation labour are met by immigration from Bihar, West Bengal, UP and North Eastern States. Occurence of marriages among immigrant labour and locals are becoming prevalent. Many commercial banks open during sundays for the service of immigrants. Even church services are held in Hindi in cities like Perumbavoor in Kerala. In construction industries especially national highways, the immigrants play a vital role. In hospitality industry, immigrants from North Eastern states are much visible. Now political parties have come forth to organize the unorganized labours. Despite all the measures taken by the Labour department of the Government,the conditions especially housing are very pathetic.

## Carlos Granado Fernandez, Universidad Politécnica de las Fuerzas Armadas, Venezuela

In my country***Venezuela***for several years is occurring this situation, rural workers migrate to the city seeking better living conditions, which generally do not find and increase the belts of urban poverty and marginality. This situation is mainly due to two reasons:

1. **The lack of inputs for the producer**to work obsolete agricultural machinery, lack of irrigation systems, lack of certified seed, fertilizers and chemicals to control pests.

2.**Legal Insecurity**: The agricultural producer must sell the crop to the government which is paid as and when he wants.

The costs of production do not even cover the payment of labor for the workers. At the moment it is very common to see many rural workers selling their harvest as informal merchants without any type of regulation which distorts the prices of the products generating inflation and shortage by the game of supply and demand. In addition, rural workers state that they can not work for a minimum wage in the countryside because it is not enough to cover their basic needs.

Finally we must conclude that this situation is a direct responsibility of the bad economic policies of the government that when it had the price of a barrel of oil in more than 100 $ did not invest in infrastructure and production of agroinsumos but that is dedicated to import food from producers of other countries to the detriment of domestic producers and now are paying the consequences of these wrong policies ...

## Abass Amina, Niger

**Original contribution in French**

Je me présente Mme Amina ABASS, Ministère de l'Agriculture et de l'Elevage/Niger:

Oui la question de la migration rurale constitue un véritable défi dans les questions de sécurité alimentaire, de paix ... surtout dans les pays de l'Afrique subsaharienne. La migration surtout rural impacte négativement sur la quantité/qualité des aliments à produire car les bras valides ou actifs agricoles qui constituent les seules forces productives abandonnent les exploitations agricoles et cela engendre du coût un problème de main d'oeuvre qualifiée. La majorité des exploitations agricoles n'ont pas encore les moyens d’accéder aux nouvelles technologies et deviennent ainsi vulnérables à l'insécurité alimentaire surtout dans ce contexte de changement climatique.

Les exploitations sont laissées aux femmes et aux enfants qui constituent les seuls maîtres des exploitations avec un accès limité aux financements agricoles, aux formations professionnelles, aux structures organisées.....Par ce biais, la majorité des enfants qui sont censés être à l'école se retrouvent dans le travail des enfants et pire encore la majorité d'entre ces enfants exerce une des pires formes de travail d'enfant dans le secteur ou leur santé, sécurité et leur bon développement sont menacés.

**English translation**

I am Mrs. Amina ABASS, Ministry of Agriculture and Livestock/Niger:

Yes, the issue of rural migration is a real challenge in matters of food security, peace... especially in sub-Saharan Africa. Migration, especially rural migration, has a negative impact on the quantity/quality of food to be produced, since the valid or active agricultural labourers who constitute the only productive forces are abandoning farms and this leads to a problem of skilled labour. The majority of farms do not yet have the means to access new technologies and thus become vulnerable to food insecurity, especially in the context of climate change.

The farms are left to women and children who are the sole owners of the farms, with limited access to agricultural finance, vocational training and organised structures... In this way, the majority of children who are supposed to be in school end up in child labour, and even worse, the majority of these children are engaged in one of the worst forms of child labour in the sector, where their health, safety and development are threatened.

## Marie Leroy, CARE, France

Dear FNS Forum readers,

It is great that FAO is conducting a consultation on this important topic. As rightly highlighted in the proposed outline (section 5.4), with increasingly frequent and dramatic climate change impacts striking the most vulnerable people, climate change is one of the main drivers of rural migrations, and will be even more so in the years to come.

As part of the *Where the Rain Falls* project,  CARE France in collaboration with the United Nations University conducted a few years ago a **multi-country research project on the links between climate change, rainfall patterns and migrations.**

The central focus of the initiative was to explore the circumstances under which households in selected case study sites in rural areas in Guatemala, Peru, Ghana, Tanzania, India, Bangladesh, Thailand, and Vietnam use migration as a risk management strategy when faced with rainfall variability and food and livelihood insecurity.

Several reports were produced and disseminated (global report attached here). Following this research phase, pilot projects were launched in 2013 in Bangladesh, India and Thailand and are still ongoing. As part of these projects, CARE is supporting vulnerable farmers to adapt to climate change and develop alternative livelihoods in order to reduce forced migrations. The impact of project activities on rural migrations is assessed through the project's monitoring and evaluation process.

On the same topic, a report was also developed and published recently by CARE Nederland: "[Fleeing Climate Change: Impacts on Migrations and Displacement](http://careclimatechange.org/publications/fleeing-climate-change-impacts-migration-displacement/)", which provides additonal interesting insight.

I remain at your disposal for additional information.

Best regards,

Marie

## Shiela Chikulo, Wageningen University and Research, Netherlands

**Outline focus**: relevant issues for this report are highlighted in the outline .

Chapter 1: section 1.2 could also include a brief definition of what encompasses 'rural' in this report...as highlighted in earlier comments (see comment by Flavio Bolliger) the inconsistencies in definitions may compromise comparability of cases (across various indicators such as physiological charactersitics, proximity to urban centres, infrastructure development, access to markets, etc).

Chapter 4 could be strengthened by including more examples of rural migration impacts (I see two for now - labour markets and remittances). Perhaps more contributions from country experiences can build on this chapter.

Chapter 4 - Section 4.2 - 4.4 is on the impact of remittances on migration and agricultural development. The title of section 4.2 can be revised to reflect this.

Chapter 5: some sub-sections tend to emphasise one aspect over others e.g. section 5 focuses on impact of protracted crisis on rural migration, then section 5.4 introduces slow-onset crises, climate change. It would be good to bring to the fore the implications of climate change adversities on migration especially for rural communities that are increasingly succumbing to repetitive cycles of extreme weather events. Through specific cases, climate change impact on migration can be analysed in greater detail while questions of how these communities can diversify beyond agriculture to adapt and strengthen their resilience.

**Case studies**: southern Africa may offer insights into rural migration dynamics in relation to climate change on families relying on agricultural and natural resource based livelihoods.

**Information Sources:** it would be interesting to see if it is possible to collate information on rural migration trends (where available) from agencies such as IOM, ILO, UN Population Division and country-specific reports to feed into the section on trends.

Attached, a few comments on the outline.

Attachment:

<http://www.fao.org/fsnforum/sites/default/files/discussions/contributions/SOFA_2018_Annotated_outline_FSN_Forum_shiela%20chikulo26-09-2017.docx>

## Nitya Rao, School of International Development and LANSA, India

This is really an important issue and I congratulate FAO for making it the theme for the next SOFA. I have a few specific comments. In section 3.3, drivers of migration, apart from poverty, employment opportunities etc, a major reason is the changes in land use patterns due to global and national business investments in agricultural land. Within academic debates, this has been called 'land grabs', 'green grabs' amongst others. Seccondly, in section 4.2, on migration impacts, while nutrition is important, the entire field of health, nutrition and wellbeing, of both migrants and those left-behind needs to be emphasised. In fact, for Scheduled Tribes in India, over a period of two decades, men (seasonal migrants) show a declining diet diversity, with implications for nutrition. In parts of western India, during peak agricultural seasons, often coinciding with male migration, women lack the time to cook and feed, themselves or their children. These insights on nutrition are emerging from research we have conducted as part of the consortium Leveraging Agriculture for Nutrition in South Asia (LANSA). Third, an important use of remittances is for consumption and class mobility, apart from survival, and not necessarily for investing in agricultural productivity (section 4.3). I have case studies of this from Eastern and Northern India as well as Bangladesh, which I am happy to provide. Finally, and somewhat contradictory to the previous point, we find that certain sectors such as fisheries in India are being rapidly capitalised in a context of climate change and resource depletion (section 5.1). In order to survive in such a capitalised sector, migration becomes the only way of raising the required capital. Fisheries in particular requires substantial investments, and this scale of lending is not provided by the public sector banks. Private capital would be too expensive to make the venture viable. We have generated evidence from research based on a grant from the Norwegian Research Council, which we would be happy to share.

## David Michael, Wondu Business & Technology Services, Australia

A key issue to be examined here should be that of productivity and growth in productivity and the impact on migration, agriculture and rural development. We would expect low productivity in agriculture to accelerate migration away from agriculture, assuming higher income are possible in other sectors.

The research would also benefit from an examination of urbanization and the impact on migration, agriculture and rural development.

## Lal Manavado, University of Oslo affiliate, Norway

Comments on the draft Report on Migration, Agriculture and Rural Development

These comments represent a holistic approach to rural development with the emphasis on channelling migration to enhance food production and security with a view to improving public nutrition and quality of life. Improved public nutrition and food security can enable some potential and actual migrants to earn a decent income and ameliorate to a certain extent the undesirable consequences of migration.

The draft is very comprehensive with respect to the nomenclature of migration with reference to its specific motivators. As it is a piece of purposive behaviour, one would prefer to call what triggers it as a motivator rather than a driver, because the latter technically does not require an intentional decision from the object that changes its location.

I think it would be very useful if the report mentions at the outset i.e., in 1.1, its purpose. For instance, as migration results in a demographic depletion in one area while it increases the population density in another, it would inevitably have a sudden or gradual impact on food production and demand in the areas involved. Moreover, it places an increased strain on health, education, social and public security services, etc. Therefore, managing migration so as to enhance nutrition (agriculture and disposal of food) and food security in a manner that would ensure a decent livelihood particularly to the rural populations would amply repay the effort. Achieving this objective requires a holistic analysis of the problem with a view to designing a pragmatic means of its amelioration.

Before I go over to the other chapters of the draft, may I say that I feel the proposed format is a little top-heavy on the characterisation of migration, and I think while the remittances from the migrants may improve certain aspects of life of those who they leave behind and even some sectors of local economy, their impact on food production is negligible. There is no reliable data on this I know, and I also know that it is impossible to gather this information unless one is able and willing to spend an enormous amount of time and resources for obvious reasons. In connection with another enquiry, I became convinced of the dictum, the actual state of rural food production and nutrition can never be ascertained from cities nor can it be generalised on the basis of some chosen samples’.

In the ‘way forward’, I would suggest a clearer annunciation of our principal objective, and then the other objectives whose prior achievement is a necessary condition for attaining the former. These latter includes rural health care, education and training, etc., which in turn depend on there being an adequate access to appropriate irrigation, energy, water, rail and road transport, etc.

Once this is clearly presented, then we can proceed with ways and means. I advocated a layered approach to policy design and implementation so that they become increasingly less general and more specific with respect to the actual needs of their domain. Thus, at the village level, a village policy will be tailored to meet village specific issues within the framework of an integrated policy and implementational hierarchy, where each makes decisions on matters within one’s own experience and competence.

I know it would be impossible to revise the definition of migration as currently accepted, but it depends so heavily on enumeration and indefinable (objectively speaking) terms like ‘rural’ etc., it is liable to lead to hours of fruitless discussion. Therefore, I wish it is possible to talk about migration in generic terms referring to its motives and palpable results, i.e., ‘it represents the movement of one or more persons from one location to another motivated by the belief that one’s new location is more desirable than the former for some reason’. Please note that such a belief may not be not justifiable, based on misinformation, immediate threat to life, etc. This movement of people would necessarily deplete the stock of available labour in one place while increasing the need for various items and services in another.

1.3. Seems to expand in identifying the two principal reasons that makes migration to another location desirable, viz., economic or professional self-betterment and to escape some form of danger like physical violence, robbery, natural or man-made disasters, etc. Armed conflicts and break-down of law and order are undesirable primarily because of the physical violence and robbery, etc., that often accompany them. Next in importance is their impact on the necessary amenities and economy.

I would suggest reconsideration of 1.4., because the contextual framework it seems to offer has several flaws. Starting with its main thesis, the kind of ‘development’ that considers migration to be a necessary ingredient is the traditional view that is under attack for its cavalier attitude to the environment and failure to acknowledge that our quality of life cannot be sustained by technical innovations unless we strive towards a stable global population. Here, quality of life of the individual is to be ascertained with reference to the cultural norms to which one subscribes. This includes one’s food culture. After all, culture is recognised as an individual right.

Even though the question of population is politically sensitive, its resolution is vital. What constitutes environmentally benign ‘development’ is still debated. So, a pragmatic approach could be found if one’s level of ambition is limited to sustainable agriculture and ensuring food security as an environmentally benign way to retain people in situ and to attract recent migrants back home by making those activities a source of a decent livelihood. I think this is still feasible but there is not much time left, and we already have the know-how and the necessary resources to begin.

I think scope of the report in 1.5., ought to specify identifying what is needed to mitigate the burdens migration places on source and destination of migrants as its frame of reference. The suggested means of its mitigation is the use of sustainable wholesome food production and its fair distribution in ways that enable some potential and actual migrants earn a decent livelihood with a view to enhancing public nutrition and food security.

I think chapter two is open to the same set of objections with respect to our environment and population growth embodied in traditional notion of development. There is no justifiable reason support the view that development entails less and less labour intensive work to sustain development, for simple arithmetic is enough to show in that case, there should be a comparable decrease in population. Otherwise, it would inevitably result in massive unemployment or creation of paid non-jobs. Moreover, I plead for the deprived millions of migrants who live in abject misery around every large city in the world, their needs are not captured by macro-economic indicators, nor yet the micro ones.

I have some difficulties with chapter 3, which arise from the epistemological basis of its ‘theoretical part’. Starting with a terminological quibble, I am very wary of using the term ‘theory’ about an explanatory tool, or model if you will which attempts to capture various manifestations of a piece of intentional behaviour. I would use the term ‘theory’ only to describe a hypothesis intended to describe a gnomic phenomenon where intention plays absolutely no part.

When a person strongly believes (justifiably or otherwise) that some other location is more desirable than the present one, that belief motivates a person to migrate. This requires that belief to be strong enough to overcome the potential migrant’s emotional, legal or material ties to his/her present location.

In every instance of migration, its motivating belief exerts a push and a pull; while whether the push or pull dominates depend on one’s circumstances. Perhaps it would be better to describe the effect of that belief as simultaneously eliciting an evasive and gain-seeking response. For instance, ’brain drain’ represents an instance where the pull predominates while the push may be minimal, and flight from armed conflict may represent  an instance where desire to evade danger rather than material gain predominates. So, it will be reasonable to say that an instance of migration may occupy a place in the spectrum where at one end push or desire for undertaking evasive action predominates while possibility of making some greater material gain or increased social status dominates the other.

It is logically impossible to separate those two aspects of desirability of migration, but it is possible to see when one dominates the other. Generally speaking, desirability of changing one’s location is a combination of both. Please note that the believed desirability of migrating is a subjective value judgement that may be accepted by people, but actually believing it is up to the individual. Moreover, its justifiability is not guaranteed just by believing it.

So much for the generic description of migration. As you will see, it is easy to identify various members of the ‘push’ and ‘pull’ sets, but it is practically impossible to identify their overlap that is applicable to an individual case.  But that is unimportant, because it is easy to identify the limited number of generic members of push and pull sets, which is the crucial thing in deciding on how to mitigate its ill effect, especially with reference to nutrition and food security.

I suggest that in chapter 4, we take our point of departure in the simple non-controversial fact, viz., the kind of migration we are talking about entails a reduction in the population density in a predominantly agricultural or a pastoral area or a fishing settlement.

Other things being equal, achieving any SDG depends on using the relevant and appropriate means required to do so for as long as it is desirable. Its success depends on how skilfully that means is used.

The possibility of achieving this objective depends on a certain number of people with the requisite capability remaining at a given location during the period achieving that goal remains desirable. Therefore, the probability of achieving our present goal will be adversely affected by the kind of migration in question.

At this point, I can almost hear the cry, “you’ve forgotten what technology and innovation can do to fill the ‘labour gap’ with better results/higher yields and at lower costs, etc”. Ergo; achieve greater development!

But let us not forget a few other forgotten facts. What percentage of the millions of migrants around every big city in the world today is capable of gainfully using the proposed technologies and innovations? Precisely which ones and where? The fact remains that a majority of them require fairly long-term training before they are able to use the proposed new methods. This of course assumes that after their training, there will be employment opportunities open to them. How to feed, clothe, shelter and train them, and who foots the bill?

Meanwhile, what about those who remain? What technology and innovation will enable them to appease their hunger, clean drinking water etc.? They lack sufficient know-how or resources, and those needs are continuous and immediate just like those of the migrants. I think nothing short of an in situ inspection of migrant settlements around the big cities can provide one with bits of the big picture in all its horrid colours (a random inspection and not one organised by units that earn by ‘slum tourism’ which began in South Africa and now doing very well elsewhere also.).

It will be already qualified outsiders with sufficient resources that will dominate the use of technology and innovations in areas affected by migration. Such tools are capital-intensive and labour saving. In other words, they exclude the majority of migrants and the remaining villagers who will be reduced to earn a pittance by unskilled labour jobs of limited duration. This has been the constant sad result of many and many a loudly acclaimed ‘boom’. I do not think anybody has undertaken a survey to ascertain the origin and present day situation of the human ‘left overs’ of any recent boom that is very easy to encounter in most urban slums.

Another contributor has very cogently pointed out those remittances from migrant workers makes only an insignificant contribution to sustainable rural improvement. As he points out, much of that money is spent on housing, automobiles, consumer electronics, etc., but hardly on agriculture. I know of some instances where it is used to run a small transport or a catering unit, but this is seldom. I think that it should be clearly understood that ‘family reunification’ is designed to permanently move a group of people out of a country and not to invest in it in any way.

As for impact of those remittances on local nutrition in areas subjected to protracted crises, the difficulty is that there is no one to one correspondence between having money and getting enough wholesome food. Here, there are so many variables and possible combinations among them to defy any tenable evaluation of such an impact. Among those variables are what percentage of food is locally produced and imported, distribution of production units in the country, location of main storage and distribution facilities, transport network, distribution and type of food outlets, type and distribution of the conflict, ease of currency conversion, etc. Under the circumstances, it would surely benefit the people greatly if we did our utmost to open reliable channels to distribute food and help to resolve the crisis rather than speculate on an impossible calculation.

As outlined earlier, we have already established the variable ‘push-pull’ combination that makes a person’s present location less desirable, which motivates one to migrate for a certain length of time. But ascertaining its composition becomes relevant only insofar as it helps us to counter its adverse impact on the possibility of achieving say the SDG’s. Assuming their intent is to enhance everybody’s quality of life (with reference to one’s cultural norms), those adverse effects would impinge on a person’s capability to adequately satisfy one’s nutrition, health, education and security in their inclusive sense, procreation and non-material (aesthetic enjoyment, sports and games, entertainment, etc) needs.

I think here we must decide on what need we ought to concentrate on, and nutrition appears to be the most appropriate.

I am not quite convinced of the importance of chapter 5 in its present form. I would suggest that that emphasis is put on nutrition while constantly recalling that the possibility of enabling the people to adequately meet their nutritional needs depends on their ability to satisfy their health, education and security needs. Naturally, well-coordinated work with those involved with them would be an indispensible adjunct to our success.

Finally, a more diplomatic (!) as well as a more pragmatic goal with which to round up the paper would be ‘the sustainable management of migration’. Perhaps, it would not be amiss to add to the goal, ‘with a view to enhancing nutrition and food security’.

As for the causal link between migration and sustainable food production, I think it would be easy to identify its operating mechanism as it were, if we work back from what we want to achieve rather than the other way around.  The reason for this is quite simple. If we try to do it the opposite way, we have no point of reference other than some nebulous notion of agriculture and food security. Once we start with those, we have something concrete to work on.

Every food production area (be it a village, district, province, etc) has an optimal qualitative and a quantitative output. Here, the term ‘quality’ represents type of food and not to quality used when referring to a single type. So, it could be a kind of cereal, vegetable, fruit, fish etc.

Now, the purpose of achieving this optimal output is ---

1. Meeting some portion of producer’s (and family’s) own nutritional needs;
2. Exchanging any surplus output for a fair amount of money to procure what is needed to meet the producer’s other fundamental needs like health, implements and tools needed to generate that output, etc.

Its achievement requires that each food producer possesses the requisite know-how and suitable tools as well as the skill to use them with sufficient skill. The capacity to acquire that know-how and skill varies greatly, while the need for nutrition is constant and continuous.

Hence, attempts to impart new know-how and skill to use new tools in order to enable a group of people to produce food have to be undertaken gradually with extreme care if they are to succeed to any significant degree.

The exchange involved in II above may involve local intermediaries like those who engage in food preservation and storage, cleaning and packing, carrying, selling and catering. It is crucial that these intermediaries do not unfairly profit at the expense of food producers and the end-users. Otherwise, it would inevitably lead to poverty among food producers and thus lowering of their productivity, and to malnutrition among the end-users due to unfairly high cost of wholesome food. This is the evil circle competitive food trade for profit creates and sustains. So, it is both rational and reasonable to move towards a humane and cooperative food production and trade.

When emphasis is thus put on nutrition, it will be clear that design and successful implementation of a policy to achieve that end will depend on its internal harmony as well as its harmony with other policies and implementational strategies in its policy ambience. Naturally, they all are subject to a considerable local variation.

All policies shall derive from the political decision taken at the global, regional or local level that every policy and its implementation shall contribute to enhancing the quality of life of each individual with reference to one’s chosen cultural framework without harming or causing deprivation to the others. This requires a comprehensive and an appropriate employment policy whose implementation will enable the people to earn in situ the necessary means sufficient to adequately satisfy their fundamental needs.

Its successful implementation with the emphasis on food production and fair use depends on the appropriateness of the policies and the skill with which they are implemented. Their appropriateness depends on how general or specific they are at the political level on which they are decided, and how suitable they are with respect to the needs they are intended to address, and what resources are available for their implementation.

For instance, at the global level, a helpful policy will limit itself to the provision of know-how and material resources concerned with meeting a fundamental need in a way appropriate to a region or a country. It will catalyse the evolution of the regional or national approaches, but will refrain from imposing those foreign to, or beyond their current training or ability to afford.

At regional level, policies will be less general and more specific, and leave the local level some strategic alternatives from which to select the mode of implementation best suited to the local conditions. For example, at regional level, the policy on food production might specify that the local authorities in somewhat arid areas may select from production of pulses, raising goats, etc., as always, the optimal is to arrive at those solutions by joint consultation with respect to the main goal.

Finally, local people could then identify the nuts and bolts of their choice and proceed with the last step in the chain of policy implementation. These embrace production, storage, processing as required, packing and a fair exchange of the surplus for cash. Rhetoric and jargon-free inter- and inter level consultation is essential to ensure the relevance and appropriateness of every policy. Such inter-level consultations across the design of different policies are essential to achieve an inter-policy harmony.

In addition to this summary of sound policy design and implementation, for more a detailed discussion of the issue as it pertains to nutrition and food security, please see: <http://www.fao.org/fsnforum/comment/7788>

Best wishes!

Lal Manavado.

## Eileen Omosa, We Grow Ideas, Canada

Thank you for the timely topic of rural migration, agriculture and rural development.

I have read the outline and suggest the following issues to enrich discussions towards the 2018 SOFA report.

1. The nature and type of educational curricular and how they prepare students to vacate or stay and invest in rural areas (Section 1.3). Do educational institutions prepare students for office jobs, thus making agriculture (rural life) be perceived as a lifestyle to fall back to only when everything else has failed?

2. What is the central focus of national and international policies on rural, and subsequently agricultural development? (Section 1.5) Related to 1 above, to what extent the policies pull or push people out of rural areas through their focus on large scale agricultural development at the expense of family farms? The result in many areas being that those who cannot produce enough for the market consider their land-based activities as a failure, they pack and move to urban areas. What would happen if agricultural and other rural development policies put emphasis on agricultural production for household food security/rural development, not always as a business?

3. Prices for agricultural commodities at urban, national and international markets. Hard to discuss push and pull factors in rural migration without emphasis on what keeps many rural dwellers in poverty, yet they cultivate crops every growing season. The discussion will also focus on issues of the price of agricultural inputs Vs the price of agricultural produce, thus, what are the chances of us achieving rural development if the price of farm produce is way below the expensive farm inputs?

4. The current issue of international migrants as farm workers from the Global South to large scale farms in the Global North (Chapter 6). What policies are in place to enable rural immigrants to return, rather than making them permanent farm workers for industry. Case studies and discussions can focus on labour drain, household set-up and strategic decision-making in rural households. If those with an education migrate, what are the chances that the uneducated left behind will be equipped to negotiate well with middlemen and international investors on price for their agricultural produce, crops to cultivate, etc.

5. Uniformity required in the definition of the main concepts in the report. For example, section 1.2, does the use of city imply urban areas? Use urban which encompasses cities, towns and other urban centers.

6. What length of time qualifies one as a migrant? In many countries of the Global South, individuals are known to travel to a residence in urban areas on Monday morning, work in an office and travel back on Friday evening. They tend to their rural farm endeavours before they travel to town on Monday. Where will such individuals fall in the rural-urban divide of migrants?

7. Will be interesting to include findings from qualitative studies. For example, what factors attract and retain people in urban areas/slums where they lack necessities and infrastructure? What factors make people to leave behind land and some clean air in rural areas for urban areas where they lack the bare minimum?

Thank you. I look forward to read future drafts for further input.

Eileen

## Emile Houngbo, National University of Agriculture, Porto-Novo (UNA), Benin

**Original contribution in French**

La migration rurale est presque toujours la manifestation de l'échec de la politique agricole nationale. Il s'agit de la politique de l'Etat en termes de création et d'amélioration de l'environnement dans lequel les producteurs doivent exercer l'activité agricole. Cet environnement favorable à l'activité agricole concerne notamment l'atténuation des divers risques encourus par l'agriculteur. Les mesures assurantielles et la création de banques agricoles sont des instruments déterminants en la matière. L'Etat doit prendre aussi des mesures pour garantir à chaque région agricole le développement de ses cultures de base, la protection des producteurs contre les chocs idiosyncrasiques et covariants pouvant les entraîner dans la faim et la pauvreté. Des appuis ciblés, adaptés et donc efficaces de promotion des cultures de base et de renforcement de la situation économique des producteurs sont à notre avis les grands déterminants de la migration rurale.  Il faut donc consacrer dans le rapport une place suffisante à l'effet des politiques agricoles de l'Etat sur les migrations rurales.

**English translation**

Rural migration is almost always a manifestation of the failure of national agricultural policy. This refers to the State's policy in terms of creating and improving the environment in which producers must carry out agricultural activity. This favourable environment for agricultural activity involves in particular the mitigation of the various risks incurred by the farmer. Insurance measures and the creation of agricultural banks are crucial instruments in this area. The State must also take measures to ensure that each agricultural region develops its basic crops, protecting producers from idiosyncratic and covariate shocks that could lead to hunger and poverty. In our view, targeted, appropriate and hence effective support for the promotion of staple crops and the strengthening of producers' economic situation are the main determinants of rural migration. Therefore, this report should devote sufficient attention to the effect of the State's agricultural policies on rural migration.

## Stanley Weeraratna, Rain Water Harvesting Forum, Sri Lanka

Rural migration has important repercussions on agriculture and development of rural areas. It  is opportune that FAO decided to make it the theme for the next SOFA. My thoughts on chapter 4 of the [draft outline](http://www.fao.org/fsnforum/sites/default/files/files/143_SOFA_migration/SOFA_2018_Annotated_outline_FSN_Forum.docx) are given below.

**Chapter 4**

**4.1 Migration and Labour Markets**In most of the developing countries where there is a high degree of migration, around 75% of the population lives in rural areas. For example in India nearly 70% of the people live in rural areas.  It is around 65% in Bangladesh. In Sri Lanka too nearly 70% of the people live in rural areas. Livelihoods of most of the inhabitants of rural areas is related to agriculture. For example, nearly two-thirds in rural areas of Bangladesh and Sri Lanka are directly involved in agriculture related activities such as land preparation, transplanting, harvesting etc.

A large percentage of the inhabitants of rural areas are becoming increasingly divorced from farming. This is attributable to declining per hectare yields due to land degradation, high cost of inputs such as labour, fertilizers, marketing problems etc. Climate change causing long periods of drought, floods also cause people to abandon livelihoods based on agriculture. For example in Sri Lanka, a large % of farmers have been affected by the drought which prevailed for three cropping seasons. **All these factors cause a shift on the pattern of labour market from agricultural to non-agricultural.**

**4.2 Migration on Livelihood**

According to several studies, livelihoods of most of the inhabitants of rural areas is related to agriculture. For example, nearly two-thirds in rural areas of Bangladesh are directly employed in agriculture. Migration is a major coping strategy for poor people to earn a livelihood causing a change in livelihood patterns.  Studies have shown that displaced people initially try to relocate themselves within the village, then in neighboring villages and gradually move to urban areas or to another country when no other livelihood option is available in their known rural surroundings..

In the agriculture sector there are categories of people such as farmers who are directly  involved in crop production. There is also a category of people such as farm laborers , tractor operators, pesticide applicators, harvesters  etc. who are indirectly  related to crop production. When those in the former category are affected by migration, those in the other category will also be affected due to non-availability of agriculture related activities. However, livelihood of those who are involved in activities such masonry, carpentry etc. are improved as the monies remitted by those who have migrated tend to be spent on activities indicated above. No studies appear to have been carried out to look into this aspect of migration.   
  
**4.3 Remittances for agriculture and Rural Development.**Rural migration has positive and negative effects on agriculture.  
  
**Positive effects:**According to a number of studies, remittances from migrants to cities is made use to invest on agriculture causing an increase on agricultural productivity. For example Singh et al. (2012) observed that in Bihar, the efficiencies of human labour and irrigation in rice production were higher among migrant households than non-migrant households, indicating rational use of these two critical inputs on migrant households in Bihar.  
  
**Negative effects:**Reduction of people in rural areas tends to have negative effect on agric. productivity. In Sri Lanka for example, many people, especially young adults in rural areas have migrated to cities to work in garment factories, offices etc, causing a dearth of people to work in the land. As a result large extents of paddy lands in Sri Lanka remain uncultivated. Harvesting of plantation crops such as tea, rubber, coconut, and sugarcane has become a problem due to non-availability of adequate labour.  
  
**Development:** Development is a broad term. We can talk about economic development, and social development. In many developing countries, migration has resulted in economic development.  Remittances by migrants are an important source of income to many rural families in developing nations. It also directly contributes to household income, allowing households to purchase more assets; enables higher investment in business; and facilitate buying more goods, and spending more on education and health inputs.  A cross-country study of 71 developing countries found that a 10 per cent increase in official remittances per capita will lead to a 3.5 per cent decline in the share of people living in poverty (Adams and Page 2005). Thus migration tends to have a positive impact on economic development of rural areas.

Although migration has positive effects on economic development, it tends to negatively affect social development in rural areas. In many developing countries such as Bangladesh, India and Sri Lanka, women migrate to cities to work in factories, and the husbands are left to look after the children. In such situations children are neglected,  and men tend to get involved in activities such as illicit affairs, getting used to drink illicit alcohol etc. All this cause social problems. This aspect of migration on social factors has to be looked into.  
  
In view of what has been said I would like to suggest that the topic of the consultation be slightly changed to [**Rural migration, its effect on agriculture and socio-economic factors in rural areas.**](http://www.fao.org/fsnforum/activities/discussions/SOFA_migration)It will focus more on the issues related to rural migration.  
  
Stanley Weera-ratna  
  
**References:**Singh, R.K.P., K.M. Singh & A.K. Jha( 2012) Effect of Migration on Agricultural Productivity and Women Empowerment in Bihar Electronic copy available at: <http://ssrn.com/abstract=2111155>

Adams, R., and J. Page (2005). ‘Do International Migration and Remittances Reduce Poverty in Developing Countries

## Philipp Arni, Center for Corporate Responsibility and Sustainability at the University of Zurich, Switzerland

I very much agree with David Michael: the report would greatly benefit from more urbanization experts with a background in the history of rural-urban linkages. The process of urbanization has always been shaped by rural migration. In this context, I miss the seminal work of Jane Jacobs (e.g. economies of cities, cities and the wealth of nations, systems of survival).

Another issue that many rural development experts tend to ignore is the fact that in LDCs, and in East and West Africa in particular, average farm sizes are currently shrinking (in many rural regions the average is 0.4 hectares) rather than increasing. A farmer at lake Victoria in Kenya told me a few years ago that foreign NGOs help him to increase soil fertility and adopt sustainable agricultural practices. Even though it helps to improve farm productivity, these outsiders would not realize that he will be doomed on the long run since his farm size is less than 0.4 hectares and likely to shrink in the next generation to level that will lead to hunger and malnutrition on the farm.

Why? Because he has six children and only one managed to get a job in the city Kisumu. This one daughter helps them to survive through her remittances. However, if the other five kids fail to obtain off-farm employment, he will have to further subdivide his land. So the average farm size in the next generation is likely to fall below 0.1 hectares. One of the survival options his kids have is to cut forest to extend the cultivated land. But that is not allowed anymore in Kenya. So the other option to escape hunger and misery is more likely, namely to migrate to urban areas where the likelihood of obtaining a job or investment for a business is higher

Europe faced the same problem with its small-scale farmers in the 19th century. 'Realteilung' (dividing property among the numerous offspring) forced millions of Europeans to leave their family farm to migrate to domestic cities and overseas. Alas, people in affluent Europe today have been taught in school that small is beautiful and sustainable in farming.  this This popular view then leads to wrong priorities in development assistance (often preventing rather than enabling structural change in agriculture). I discuss this issue in my paper on migration-induced urban growth (<http://www.mdpi.com/2071-1050/8/8/800>). I hope the SOFA report will address this issue even if some donors may not want to hear it.

## Simeon Onya, Michael Okpara University of Agriculture, Umudike, Nigeria

In 1.4 of chapter one, migration should not be only seen in the context of economic development alone, it should encompass economic and human capital development since migration has been found to affect human capital development of both migrants and their left behind households. I propose 1.4 should incorporate human capita development.

## Alexander Sagaydak, State University of Land Use Planning, Russian Federation

The use of labor force in agriculture derives from the nature of the agricultural production and characterizes as follows: unevenness in the use of labor related to the seasonality of agricultural production; heavy working conditions determined by the unfavorable impact of climatic factors; lack of adequate social infrastructure in rural areas; the necessity of high qualification, since the agricultural workers are dealing with biological objects (plants, animals) that makes high demands on the quality of work; the demand for timely implementation of technological operations which is determined by the cycles of development of plants and animals; low social valuation of agricultural labor; extensive use of low paid labor of women and pensioners as well as teenagers; low level of mechanization and automation of agricultural production; relatively low labor productivity in agriculture compared to other branches of the national economy; the demand to attract significant numbers of seasonal and temporary workers in the rush periods; low prestige of labor in agricultural production among young people due to the lack of 8-hours working day and high volume of unskilled work as well as low wage. Heavy working conditions in agriculture and relatively low pay compared to other sectors of the economy as well as lack of adequate social infrastructure in countryside leads to migration of rural population to cities. We can treat migration of rural population to cities is a process of movement of large groups of rural inhabitants into urban settlements due to political, financial, economic and environmental as well as social factors. Migration of the rural population and especially young people to cities has negative socio-economic consequences, which should include the following: exacerbating the shortage of labor force in agriculture; in the absence of administrative restrictions leads to uncontrolled growth of cities; causes the appearance of illegal, spontaneous settlements within the boundaries of the cities; leads to aggravation of environmental situation in cities; leads to aggravation of traffic and transportation problems in cities; leads to increased tension in the social, racial and ethnic relations in cities;stimulates the growth of unemployment in the cities; leads to aggravation of criminal situation in cities. Migration is also influenced by the land and agricultural policy and, above all, the consolidation of agricultural land. Agricultural Land Consolidation is a merging, enlargement, eliminating of mosaic land ownership and improvement of configuration as well as optimization of size of land plots in order to increase the efficiency of agricultural production via rational use of scare resources: land, labor and capital based on reduction of transaction costs. However, land consolidation in agriculture has both positive and negative consequences. The positive side of consolidation of agricultural land includes improving the efficiency of agricultural production, effective use of modern, highly productive agricultural machinery, rational use of scare land, labor and financial resources. Negative effect of land consolidation in agriculture includes the reduction of the demand of the agrarian sector in the labor force that acts as one of the reasons for migration of rural population to cities as well as the degradation of social infrastructure in rural areas.

## Jeeyon Janet Kim, Feinstein International Center, Tufts University, United States of America

Thank you for a timely and important report. Some comments/considerations by sections below.

**Section 1.1**

Define the term and scope of "food security"  which will help add the necessary nuance to the discussion of the multi-level bi-directional linkages between migration flows and food security.  In defining food security, some considerations to take note are:

* Food security at what level? Global, national, household, or individual?
* Which domains of food security? For example, Coates et al. 2006 breaks down household experiential domains of food insecurity as 1. insufficient quantity; 2. inadequate quality; 3. social unacceptability; and 4. uncertainty/worry.
* Which duration of food security? Chronic vs. transitory vs. seasonal?

It would be immensely helpful to provide an overview of the conceptual *and*empirical linkages between migration and these different levels, time frames, and domains of food security.

**Section 1.2/1.3**

Include a discussion of the *transnational* migration experience (ex. some household members remaining behind in 'origin' rural areas) and discuss the legal and cultural context which underlie a household's 'decision' to migrate. Report should explicitly  note that migration is not just about those who go but also those who do not/cannot and the political, social, and economic context (see UN-INSTRAW's conceptual framework on gender, remittances, and development) of the migration experience.

**General**

* Include gender- and age-specific (and other demographic chracteristics ex. caste/ethnicity) discussions throughout the report. For example, in Far West Nepal where male labor out-migration is a key livelihood strategy, our qualitative work has shown that the elderly population dependended heavily on the remittances sent back by their adult children to make ends meet. When remittances did not come (which was often the case), these respondents were unable to take up alternative casual labour opportunities (given their physical conditions) and had to rely on loans/credit and handouts from their neighbours. In failing to discuss the demographic groups which may be differently affected by the migration experience, their differential vulnerabilities and the policy/programmatic implications to support such groups may be overlooked.
* There is a tendency to focus on the *economic*effects of migration experience, it would strengthen the report to include a thorough discussion the *non-economic* effects of migration on rural development (ex. social remittances; women's status/decision-making roles; children's educational attainment etc).
* Please include findings and conclusions from quanititative, mixed methods, and qualitative studies
* Vignetts/case studies in different contexts would be helpful to illustrate the report's major points and could help highlight specific examples.

Thank you and I look forward to reading the report.

## Vethaiya Balasubramanian, Freelance consultant, India

The drivers of rural to urban migration are: poor rural infrastructure (health, education, transport, services & entertainment, etc.); lack of employment opportunities; growing agrarian crisis and indebtedness; climate change and natural disasters. If we allow free flow of able bodied, but not fully trained and equipped people to urban areas, the productivity, economy, environment, housing, and health problems will mount in both rural areas and urban centers. We need a complete paradigm shift in national development:

(1) What we need urgently is to build **smart villages** rather than smart cities. This will help improve the rural infrastructure which in turn will help distribute the population evenly over the entire country, avoiding over crowded slums and the related problems in cities.

(2) In population-dense countries like India, the economic growth must be decentralized with labor intensive micro-small-medium enterprises and distributed components manufacturing at homes and assembly units at strategic locations will help generate the much needed jobs in the rural and urban sectors and will help reduce the overall poverty in any country. Jobless growth is the curse of the modern economy producing billionaires and a decent national GDP, but increasing rural and urban poverty and disempowering hundreds of millions of people.

(3) Farming and the related processing and value addition industries must be developed fully in rural areas to enhance the rural economy, REDUCE RURAL POVERTY AND TO MITIGATE THE AGRARIAN CRISIS and reduce the rural indebtedness, reduce rural to urban migration, and to build the national economy in a sustainable manner.

## Andrea Magarini, Milan Municipality, Italy

**MANAGING THE ROOT CAUSES OF MIGRATIONS FROM AFRICA THROUGH THE COHESION OF CITY-REGION FOOD SYSTEMS**

**The phenomenon of migration**

With the increase of the migratory phenomena since 2014 on the all coasts of the Mediterranean Sea, migrations appear to be a destabilizing element both in the whole European context and in Italy, that is the first landing place. In fact in 2014 in Lampedusa (the first Italian island) landed 170,000 people, compared to the 25,000/year from 1997 to 2013. This unexpected growth has brought an unprecedented media coverage, which has fostered the perception of migrations as a threat. The public's attention results in a general mood of confusion and concern.

These elements make the efforts to be focused only on the final effects of the migratory process, i.e. when migrants have already abandoned the African coasts. Little has been done to fully understand the phenomenon, to observe its deep causes, and to outline a medium-long term trajectory.

From several European and African research centers are emerging a smart contribution to take action on migrations through the nexus among climate change, food security, rural-urban and intra-Africa and international migrations towards Europe. The initiative seeks to provide original interpretations, that is to say a bridge between disciplines, themes, geographies, actors and tools to act in the African context towards a greater territorial cohesion, considered as the key to re-balancing African territories between cities and countries. There is indeed more and more convergence on the dynamics that act on this Nexus: a dynamics that will always tend to grow due to the overpopulation of the African continent.

**Nexus among climate change - food security - urban growth – migration**

The model want to simplifies the complexity of the phenomena that act on this Nexus, wishing to be merely a starting point that is useful for the emerging of the main drivers. The first environmental causes appear to be the overpopulation of the African continent and its vulnerability to climate changes: these two factors increase the distance between the two food security flows (rising demand and deceasing supply) and push towards the scarcity of natural resources that causes, in addition to food insecurity, also strong social tensions. The mixture of these dynamics, linked with psychological factors, lifestyles and personal aspirations, first generates a large internal migratory flow from rural areas to cities (both major and secondary cities), then international intra-African migratory flows and, in the end, towards European countries.

The basic drivers (overpopulation, climate change, social tensions) are growing ever more, and along with them, migratory flows too. This is a highly complex challenge that requires the activation of resources: relational, economic and cognitive resources.

**Good practices and knowledge emerging from African cities**

Looking at African cities with the lens of the food system, a range of themes emerges concerning the existing local debates and policy initiatives. The Milan Urban Food Policy Pact, with 152 cities globally and 23 in Africa, can support this framework with local solutions. These include urban farming programs developed in dozens of cities across the continent, climate change adaptation and/or mitigation actions, activities to ensure access to land, actions on migratory flows from rural areas to cities, access to water for urban nutrition and agriculture, urban planning that can affect food production issues and other themes. All these elements of urban interest could be managed at sectorial level by specific policies and institutional departments, but can also strongly increase their impacts if gathered within a single strategy that acts in an integrated way on the city's food system.

Acting on these levers will help to rebalance the territorial dynamics that got into crisis due to overpopulation and climate changes, trying to ensure food security and, consequently, to limit social tensions. This will address the deep and long-lasting causes of migrations, by integrating the efforts to manage the effects of this territorial unbalances and migrations in Europe with the aim of supporting a more sustainable development of African countries as a key for limiting migration flows.

The picture that emerges is extremely stimulating: from these first wide analyses that need further insights and interpretations, it can be observed how cities are, more or less explicitly, already taking political and programming actions on some parts of their city-region food system.

From this point of view, it would be possible to test some actions aimed to increase the territorial cohesion through linking rural-urban areas, rural areas, secondary cities and major cities, within a territorial armor able to specialize territories and to create opportunities for local development within the frame of a wider strategy. In this territorial tension, actions should be taken to intervene directly and/or indirectly on the three typology of economy of the African continent: the traditional, the informal and the formal one. Obviously, acting on the formal economy to access the other two, that are often usually excluded from international cooperation processes.

[www.foodcities.org](http://www.foodcities.org/)

## Amanullah, The University of Agriculture Peshawar, Pakistan

I want to share the experience of my rural area (upper swat) which is well known as peach producing area. The prices of agricultural products are minimum in rural area, and are too low in our country e.g equal to cheating poor farmers. The example of peaches produced in rural areas indicates that the farmers in rural areas sell their products at one USD (100 PKR) to the rich people outside (middle men). The middlemen then sell that product at 50 USD in the fruit market of big cities of Lahore and Karachi to rich men. The peaches are processed in big cities and the products of peaches (jam and juice, etc.) are sold back in rural areas at very high prices, which poor people cannot afford to buy.

This is the cheating of rural people (80% to 90 % smallholders). This is because of the weak policies of our government which give no attention to rural people. This is the major cause of rural people i.e. agriculture people migration to big cities. This has a negative impact on agriculture development in rural areas. The government, FAO and other donor agencies must concentrate on rural development in Pakistan. The very bad political system is responsible for non development of rural areas.

Installing processing units for vegetables and fruits in rural areas can make the rural area highly developed and will significantly stop rural migration to cities. I am ready to help free of cost FAO if FAO is interested in rural area development in our country.

I will write more in detail. But at the moment I don't have access to a computer.

Dr. Amanullah  
Associate Professor of Agronomy  
The University of Agriculture Peshawar

## Andrea Cattaneo, facilitator of the online consultation

Dear all,

I want to thank all the contributors for the thoughtful and constructive interventions so far. They will certainly be of great help to us in preparing a better report.

It is difficult to summarize and cover the richness and variety of the interventions received. I would like to just mention a few significant areas. Several contributions highlight the challenges involved in defining and empirically assessing rural migration due to heterogeneity in definitions and measurements. Others highlight the complexity of impacts of migration both on rural labour markets and livelihoods. Important insights were also presented concerning the challenge of structural transformation, in particular in relation to dwindling farm sizes and poor agricultural labour productivity resulting from demographic pressures in rural areas. Gender issues were also prominent, as well as reminders to go beyond mere economic impacts of migration and include broader social impacts.

I would also like to thank those who have made specific suggestions for improvements to the contents and outline of our report, as well as those who have provided specific references to literature and ongoing work or concrete country examples from your own experience examples. We are very much interested in concrete country cases, and I would like to encourage further contributions in this direction.

I look forward to the continuation of an interesting discussion.

Andrea

## Kuruppacharil V. Peter, World Noni Research Foundation, India (second contribution)

Migration for better quality of life is a part of history and the new world -present Americas- is the resultant of such human venture. Migration needs to be encouraged in highly populated countries to lowly populated areas where human resource is the limiting factor. Per capita income from agriculture is declining compared to other avenues of employment. Space, water, energy and human labour are getting limited. The great migration of human labour from India to South Africa primarily to meet the labour requirement in sugar cane fields is history. Mechanization became a necessity once labour became costly and scarce. Only 3-5 % of working labour are employed for agricultural production in USA while 35-40% are used in India and in real numbers the figures will be quite astonoshing.

I am editing a book "ZERO HUNGER INDIA: POLICIES AND PERSPECTIVES". Any one interested to contribute chapters are welcome.

## Sophia Davidova, University of Kent, United Kingdom

This is a submission under’ **Do you have individual experiences or are you aware of case studies that are useful for informing parts of the report?’**

Micro level evidence: the case of Kosovo in Western Balkans

We have undertaken a detailed analysis of agricultural household survey data for Kosovo. Kosovo is an interesting case study for studying rural migration given the sustained and high levels of out-migration from a traditionally, rural society. The key findings are:

* Migration has, overall, a negative effect on farm technical efficiency which is amplified when migrants from farm households are better educated workers.
* Regarding who migrates, household and family connections matter enormously. For instance, having another household member as a migrant in 2008 had a significant, positive effect on both propensity to migrate and the length of migration of another household members in 2012.
* Regarding the relationship between the likelihood of a household member migrating and household income we find a non-linear pattern. Individuals from poorer and richer households have a higher propensity to migrate – ones pushed by poverty, others pulled by the expectations to achieve better returns to their skills in more developed labor markets and have the financial means to migrate.
* Despite a priori expectations, differences in the drivers of male and female migration are, overall, fairly minor. One notable exception is the role of education. Whilst males with better education are less likely to migrate or stay longer away from the household, females with better education are more likely to migrate. This most likely reflects gender divisions in the nature of labor market opportunities.
* Rural migration is more likely where farmers stop working the land because they face a lack of inputs, manpower and equipment, and farm profitability is poor. However, some security concerns may keep family members on their land to protect loved ones, homes and other property.
* Overall, the results suggest that policies seeking to decrease rural out-migration should include initiatives to develop market institutions in rural areas, as well as stimulating competitive input markets and outlets for the sale of farm produce.

Sources:  
Sauer, J., Gorton, M. and Davidova, S. (2015) 'Migration and farm technical efficiency: evidence from Kosovo', Agricultural Economics, 46(5), pp. 629-641.  
Sauer, J., Gorton, M. and Davidova, S. (2017) Security and rural out-migration: Insights from Kosovo, working paper.

In case of interest, we can submit more detailed report on analysis in this post-conflict country.  
S Davidova

Attachments:

<http://www.fao.org/fsnforum/sites/default/files/discussions/contributions/Propensity%20to%20migrate_Sauer_Gorton_Davidova.pdf>

<http://www.fao.org/fsnforum/sites/default/files/discussions/contributions/Published%20agec_Sauer_Gorton_Davidova.pdf>

## Astghik Sahakyan, ICARE Foundation, Armenia

My contribution for the question: **Are you aware of important sources of information that could be useful for the preparation of the report?**

While developing my paper ''Forced migration: Case of Syrian-Armenian Refugees'' I came across with a very good study developed by Migration and Remittances Unit & Poverty Reduction and Economic Management Network of the World Bank Group **''Impact of Migration on Economic and Social Development: A Review of Evidence and Emerging Issues''**

The paper provides valuable insights into economic and social impacts of migration for origin and destination countries and most importantly it concludes with arising immigration issues covering environment and climate change, demographic trends, democratic processes and national security questions.

Although concentration is not on rural migration, the paper discusses challenges that arise as a result of rural migration and presents the information as case studies sharing the experience of different countries in the world.

Authors: Dilip Ratha, Sanket Mohapatra, Elina Scheja  
Link: <http://documents.worldbank.org/curated/en/617151468332982240/pdf/WPS5558.pdf>

## Manuel Castrillo, Proyecto Camino Verde, Costa Rica

**Spanish version**

¿Está la Ética contemplada como elemento de valor inherente en las acciones y/o factores que se ejecutan en las diversas circunstancias del fenómeno migratorio ? ¿ El componente de la cultura está dimensionado en el contexto particular de los migrantes - y de sus país destino -, dada sus costumbres, creencias religiosas y políticas ? Esto desde la situación de migración por crisis, de la índole que sea, política, religiosa o ambiental. El abordaje me parece, casi siempre se da en la óptica de la afectación comercial y de recursos implicados, dejando en cierto grado el carácter de el impacto a nivel personal, humano, cultural o espiritual con poca atención.

Las estructuras sociales, políticas y económicas según los enfoques de desarrollo por nación o región, tienen particularidades que siempre estarán sujetas a acciones con carácter ético o moral y que tendrán un efecto mayor o menor en la sensibilización hacia el migrante, sobre todo en la población rural, llena de tradiciones, supersticiones y hábitos característicos. La “ ruralidad “, viene aparejada de condiciones de por sí ya difíciles en muchos casos – generalmente en países pobres y propensos a migraciones constantes -, y por ello, a sus prácticas agrícolas y concepción de desarrollo. La comprensión de esas realidades nos dará mejores insumos para la atención de los migrantes, y una mejor identificación de las herramientas y recursos para generar estrategias adecuadas, con ese elemento humanitario, lo ético y moral, que haga diferencia en una relación de mutuo beneficio, ante las relaciones de intercambio entre pueblos.

Dependiendo de los contextos, y el origen de la migración, será la capacidad de amalgamar diversos factores, los que permitan asentar condiciones de “ tolerancia y disponibilidad “para la incorporación de las `poblaciones o individuos en las actividades económicas, en cuyo caso, identificar con claridad la condición cultural de los migrantes será determinante en su incorporación, en este caso, a las actividades agrícolas. En el caso de migraciones transfornterizas, las destrezas y habilidades compartidas en común, serán factor determinante para una incorporación y asimilación del sector productivo agrícola positiva, brindando mayores oportunidades al migrante, aunado a otros factores. La diferenciación de los aspectos de identidad cultural, se dan en diferentes escenarios en los ámbitos nacionales también, por tanto, ese valor cultural es elemento a profundizar en toda migración, para establecer los parámetros de convivencia y oportunidad, sobre todo en la vida rural.

**English version**

Is the Ethics contemplated as an element of inherent value in the actions and / or factors that are implemented in the various circumstances of the migratory phenomenon? Is the cultural component dimensioned in the particular context of migrants - and their destination country - given their customs, religious and political beliefs? This from the situation of migration by crisis, of whatever nature, political, religious or environmental. The approach seems to me, almost always occurs in the perspective of the commercial affectation and resources involved, leaving to a certain degree the character of the impact on a personal, human, cultural or spiritual level with little attention.

Social, political and economic structures according to development approaches by nation or region have particularities that will always be subject to actions of an ethical or moral character and that will have a greater or lesser effect on the sensitization towards the migrant, especially in the population rural, full of traditions, superstitions and characteristic habits. "Rurality" is accompanied by conditions that are already difficult in many cases - generally in poor countries and prone to constant migration - and thus to their agricultural practices and conception of development. Understanding these realities will give us better inputs for the attention of migrants, and a better identification of the tools and resources to generate adequate strategies, with that humanitarian, ethical and moral element that makes a difference in a mutually beneficial relationship, to the relations of exchange between peoples.

Depending on the contexts, and the origin of the migration, it will be the capacity to amalgamate diverse factors, that allow to establish conditions of "tolerance and availability" for the incorporation of the populations or individuals in the economic activities, in which case, to identify clearly the cultural condition of the migrants will be decisive in their incorporation, in this case, to agricultural activities. In the case of transformer migrations, shared skills and abilities will be a determining factor for the incorporation and assimilation of the positive agricultural productive sector, giving greater opportunities to the migrant, along with other factors. The differentiation of aspects of cultural identity, occur in different scenarios in the national areas also, therefore, that cultural value is an element to deepen in all migration, to establish the parameters of coexistence and opportunity, especially in rural life.

## Philipp Heinrigs, OECD, France

I would like to share the working paper: "Cities and Spatial Interactions in West Africa”, published in the OECD West African Paper series, which can be downloaded at: <http://dx.doi.org/10.1787/57b30601-en>.

The paper presents a geo-spatial analysis of urbanisation dynamics in West Africa based on Africapolis data (<http://www.oecd.org/swac/topics/africapolis/>) and may be useful for the preparation of the SOFA report.

## Valentine Gandhi, The Development CAFE, Indonesia

Dear Dr Cattaneo,

Firstly let me congratulate FAO on bringing out a SOFA on such an important topic such as Migration, and specifically its dynamics in Rural development issues. I have read through the draft outline and the following are my comments/responses to your guiding questions:

**Does the outline focus on the most relevant issues concerning the links between migration, agriculture and rural development or are there important dimensions that have been left out?**

The outline does capture the principle elements of Migration, the theories as well as practical issues. However, I would like to add perhaps a section on Health issues relating to migrants as well a a bit about their conditions in destination areas, (which is often overlooked) as opposed to only the source can also be discussed. Additionally, when I did my PhD on Rural to Urban Migration nearly 10 years ago, migration was always seen as a negative aspect, and rarely as something pro economic growth or individual growth, etc. Many of the rural economic guarantee schemes of that time and in a larger even at present operated with a 'migration is bad' kind of a mindset so they were designed to keep migrants in their villages. A comprehensive approach that looks at migration both in their source or origin and destination site would be beneficial for all parties.

**Do you have individual experiences or are you aware of case studies that are useful for informing parts of the report?**

My PhD thesis focused on livelihood insecurities in the semi arid tropics, specifically on rural poverty dynamics from rural to urban migration. It was one of the earlier studies to look at the health aspect of migration, particularly on HIV/AIDS.  I looked at rural urban migration in Andhra Pradesh, India. I found that while migration was indeed a result of the so called 'push' factors of drought and absence of safety nets in home villages. It resulted a great deal of good for the migrants to repay their debts, build assets and most important as a majority of the migrants were from the supposed lower caste, they felt a sense of freedom when they were in the city even in harsh conditions, that they did not feel in their villages due to the institutionalized social barriers.  "No matter how rich I am in my village, I will always be low, I am better of lifting stones in the city, where I am just a worker and accepted as one" - VK, Age 28, Migrant (One of my study respondents actual quote). Despite giving them economic and social freedom, because of the lack of ability to track migrants and what happens to them on a larger scale at the destination, interventions often fail. So in the case of my respondents, a significant number were involved in unsafe multiple partner sexual behavior which resulted in contracting HIV/AIDS, which pushed them further into poverty. So while migration can be positive, if not handled comprehensively it can fail like in any economic movement. I called this the 'Risk to Risk Framework". You can read a bit about this in this paper:

[https://www.wider.unu.edu/publication/livelihood-risk-hiv-semi-arid-trop...](https://www.wider.unu.edu/publication/livelihood-risk-hiv-semi-arid-tropics-rural-andhra-pradesh)

and a bit more in detail in this book chapter (the only PhD thesis to be part of this book on Vulnerability)

<https://www.wider.unu.edu/publication/vulnerability-developing-countries>

(Mine is chapter 6)

While these have been quite a while since I published and a lot of improvements have been happening, some of the elements I have raised have still not been addressed, Migration is still seen as a negative aspect by many governments, Still source and destination are not seen together, multiple agencies such as Departments of Health, Rural Development etc. are still working in silos and a whole more more that this space is not enough to discuss.

**Are you aware of important sources of information that could be useful for the preparation of the report?**

It was a migrant worker who made me move from IT to Development so both my Masters and PhD both focused on Migration and since then I have focused mostly on livelihoods and reducing vulnerability in general. However currently I am developing project where migrants can be given sensor based wearable tech to track their progress as well as send info in things like, their contract location, price, safety issues, awareness campaigns. It’s in the beginning stages. Partners welcome.

Kudos again for a SOFA on migration!

Best regards,

Valentine Gandhi

## Jean Marius d’Alexandris, Lyseconcept, France

**Original contribution in French**

Bonjour

Vous allez perdre encore des mois des années pour étudier, parler, écouter ce qui se passe sans que rien ne soit fait pour arranger les choses.

Il n'y a pas besoin de faire cette étude quand elle existe déjà là sous vos yeux et que vous avez la solution.

En France tous les petits commerces de proximité ferment. Au Sénégal c'est le contraire tous les jours s'ouvrent des petits commerces de proximité.

Déjà vous avez une réponse rapide à savoir comment doit se développer le modèle économique de la société civile. Laisser la liberté de travail à l'économie de marché.

Sauf qu'aujourd'hui cette économie de marché est bridée par l'intelligence artificielle qui veut tout gérér et surtout qui ponctionne financièrement cette économie de marché au point de la mettre en danger tous les jours. Au Sénégal beaucoup de petits commerces fonctionnent tous les jours. S'ils fonctionent tous les jours c'est parce qu'un seul jour de non fonctionnement leur enlève le gain financier pour vivre le lendemain. Voilà la situation précaire que vous avez créé et que vous n'arrivez plus à gérer. L'économie de marché est dans une situtation de précarité permanente ce qui est à l'origine de conflits et autres incidents.

Au Sénégal j'installe une économie de marché biologique et économique. Sauf que la majorité de l'argent investie par vers les à coté de la vie de mon représentant. Si vous voulez une vraie photo de cette problématique, écoutez cette personne et vous verrez ou sont les vrais problèmes de la vie économiques actuelle.

Sa femme travaille tous les jours en petite restauration de rue qui lui permet de renouveler son produit du lendemain et faire vivre sa famille le jour même.

Lui il retire l'argent de l'investissement agricole pour payer l'école, les transports, le logement, la nourriture des ouvriers, de lui même. Cela sous entend qu'il travaille à perte.

Vous avez mis en place une économie de marché boiteuse immorale. Comment voulez vous résoudre la problématique en faisant des études sur les flux migratoires.

Mille fois il a voulu arrêter l'exploitation, mille fois il a fallu avancer la perte d'exploitation/investissement. C'est sans fin.

Arrêtez vos recherches libérez le travail, rendez le productif productif,  laisser surtout l'intelligence économique travailler. Elle sait comment faire elle n'a pas besoin de vous pour celà.

Ci dessous vous avez le parfait exemple de mon précédent post.

Des milliers de gens (intelligence artificielle) discourent sur ce genre de sujet mais combien comme moi mettent en pratique une solution?

Ma solution touche tous les pans de la société civile: santé, alimentaire, productivité, agriculture, salubrité publique, protection des réserves d'eaux souterraines, emplois, création d'entreprise, évonomie de marché, richesse du travail, arret des flux migratoires, arrêt de l'exode rural,  fixation de la jeunesse au pays etc.

**English translation**

Good day!

You will waste months and years studying, talking and listening about what is happening without anything being done to improve the situation.

There is no need to have this study when it is already there before your eyes and you have the solution.

In France all the small local shops are closing down.  In Senegal it is the opposite, small local shops open every day.

You already have a quick answer for how the economic model for civil society should be developed. Give the market economy freedom to work.

Except that today this market economy is hemmed in by artificial intelligence which seeks to manage everything and, above all, financially draining this market economy to the point of putting it daily in danger. In Senegal many small shops are open every day. If they open every day it is because not opening just one day removes the financial profit needed to live the next day. This is the precarious situation that you have created and that you can no longer manage. The market economy is in a permanently precarious situation which is the cause of conflicts and other incidents.

In Senegal, I would set up a biological and economic market economy. Except that most of the capital invested towards it has marginalized the life of the typical individual.  If you want a true picture of this problem, listen to this person and you will see what the real economic problems of life are today.

His wife works every day in a little street-food stall which allows her to restock her products for the next day and support her family for a day.

He takes money out of his agricultural investment to pay for school, transport, accommodation, and to feed his workers and himself. This means that he is working at a loss.

You have implemented a flawed immoral market economy. How can you solve the problem by studying migration flows?

A thousand times he has wanted to stop operating; a thousand times he has rolled over the loss on operating /investment. It is without end.

Stop your research, free work, make the producer productive, and above all allow economic intelligence to work. It does know what to do; it does not need you for that.

Here below you have the perfect example of my foregoing post.

Thousands of people (artificial intelligence) discourse on this topic but how many like me put a solution into practice?

My solution touches all areas of civil society: health, food, productivity, agriculture, public health, protection of underground water reserves, employment, setting up businesses, market economy, quality of work, control of migration flows, ending rural exodus, keeping the youth in the country, etc.

## Binod ChapAgain, The Center for People and Forests, Thailand

Hello Andrea,

This looks very interesting intiative - congrats in advance.

It looks migration and innovation could be an interesting area to consider. There is an example of meaningful use of technology/social media by youth migrants to benefit local people at their origin from mega projects, which could be of your interest:

I recently conducted a study in two Thailand villages, where they have a huge flow of youth out-migration to towns and cities. These migrants are connected to their villages and have been contributing to conserve the natural diversity and secure the customary rights of local people over forests and wetlands which are important sources of food (fish, crabs, herbs, fruits, edible plants, rice etc.).

Frist, the youth migrants have used the technology and updated information online about two megha projects - the special economic zones (SEZ) and One Belt One Road (OBOR) initiatives. The online database is in Thai language and includes information like advantages and challenges of the projects to local agriculture and livelihoods, cultural practices and economic  development etc.

Second, the migrants have successfully connected to local vilalgers, school students, social leaders and local government representatives with the help of social media, mainly through Line and Facebook.  These platforms are instrumental to share information about these two major development projects which are likely to bring  major changes to agriculture and forestry practices in the villages.

The sharing of information with the rural people and local government authorities has already started giving some fruits. One example includes ontinuing with natural diversity in the wetlands and preventing them from development of warehouse.

The updating of OBOR information is still in-progress.

Cheers,   
Binod

## Gerhard Flachowsky, Federal Research Institute for Animal Health, Germany

Dear Colleagues,

Some comments to „Rural migration, agriculture and rural development“

Sustainability of food production is one of the most important challenge for all those working in or dealing wirh agriculture. I have some doubts, if the present social-economic system „to make Profit on the costs of Population and Planet“ (incl. ressources and environment; so-called 3 P- concept) is able to solve the global problems according your topic.

For more details and some ideas to this topic see attached contribution.

With best regards

Gerhard Flachowsky (Braunschweig, Germany)

Attachment:

<http://www.fao.org/fsnforum/sites/default/files/discussions/contributions/Flachowsky_ECNU-09-00318.pdf>

## Bhubaneswor Dhakal, Nepal

I saw considerable weaknesses in your outlined report. The report would be more interesting to the targeted readers if you provided compelling pieces of evidence. I would like to point two issues.

1. Pull factors of the rural immigration are poorly accounted. I partially agree your statement that the migration trend reverses once socioeconomic conditions improve in the rural areas. In some cases, people return in the areas in status quo condition. Based on my experiences in Nepal, some people from cities or aboard return to rural communities once they retire from their jobs. Migration from one rural area to another rural area is another case. Some people cannot manage satisfactory living of their families in urban areas, aboard or other migrated area. In that condition too, they return to their original communities where they can do at least by their social capital.
2. I would like to remind you that many agro-biodiversities are outcomes of socio-ecological processes which requires inputs of the human. Rural out-migration has a big adverse impact on degraded of regional agro-biodiversities especially to those developed by socioecological processes. This case is very serious in remote mountain areas in Nepal.

Thanks.

B. Dhakal

## Adebayo Depo, IADR, Togo

**Original contribution in French**

La migration entre deux zones rurales doit être vue sue le plan positif comme négatif. Elle peut être perçue aussi comme un moyen d’échange. La communauté A qui se déplace vers celle de B, va laisser le village A, et peut revenir avec les compétences du village B pour développer son village.

C’est vrai que la distinction entre la migration forcée et la migration volontaire peut ne pas être nette mais à long terme ceux de la migration volontaire peuvent avoir facilement la volonté de rentrer ou de revenir investir chez eux.

Même si les politiques de développement agricole et rural affectent les moteurs de la migration il faudra aussi prendre en compte le milieu, ses caractéristiques et les moyens naturels dont il dispose pour son développement. Il est a noté que pour une zone rurale peu propice aux développements, il va falloir mettre l’accent sur d’autres moyens ou infrastructures qui peuvent créer de l’emploi et donc réduire le taux de migration.

Les questions de migrations, développement rural et agriculture doivent prendre en compte le niveau de développement du pays, ses moyens, ses forces et faiblesses. Notons aussi que la situation politique du pays est aussi un facteur important qui peut influences ces trois paramètres.

La délimitation des frontières, la devises, la productivité des pays sont des paramètres à prendre en compte dans les flux migratoires rurales. Comme pour exemple il est difficile de comprendre que des paysans producteurs de piments quittent le plateau Adja (Mono/Couffo au Bénin) pour se diriger dans des villages au Nigéria pour louer des terres et produire du piment.

**English translation**

Migration between two rural areas must be seen from both the possitive and negative sides. It can also be seen as a means of exchange. The A community that moves towards the B, will leave the village A, and could return with the competences learnt from village B to develop its village.

It is true that the distinction between forced migration and voluntary migration may not be clear cut but in the long term those who voluntarily migrate can without hindrance exercise the wish to return home or to come back and invest there.

Even if agricultural and rural development policies impact the drivers of migration it is necessary to take into account the environment, its characteristics and the natural means available for it to develop.  It is important to note that for a rural area unattractive for development, it will be necessary to put emphasis on other methods or infrastructures that could create employment and therefore reduce the migration rate.

The questions of migration, rural development and agriculture, must take into account the level of a country’s development, its capabilities, its strengths and weaknesses. Likewise, we note that the political situation is also an important factor that could influence these three parameters.

The position of frontiers, the currency and the country´s productivity are parameters to be taken into account in the rural migration flows. For example, it is difficult to understand why farmers producing chilies leave the high plains of Adja (Mono/Couffo in Benin) to go to villages in Nigeria to rent land and produce chilies.

## Muraleedhar Prasad, Farm Care Foundation, India

Migration in the Indian context mainly occurs under two major situations-

a) impact of climate change on water availability resulting in drying up of wetlands and increased drought situation which force the farmers to migrate to other areas, particularly urban areas in search of employment (climate refugees)

b) Farmers are also forced to migrate when 'land grabbing' by the corporates become increasingly common and when forced eviction is enforced in the pretext of infrastructure development..

People without agricultural land find it difficult to sustain as there are hardly any other economic activity. The exploitation of natural resources further aggravate the situation.

While discussing about the types of migration, seasonal migration and chain migration are more conspicuous and relevant in Kerala, the southern most state in India, which is internationally known for the "Kerala model of development" There are many migrants from North India and North East working as labour force in Kerala. An interesting phenomenon is that while large number of youth from Kerala migrate to Gulf countries for employment (out migration), considerable number of youth from North Indian states migrate to Kerala for livelihoods (in migration), which is an interesting area worth for research

The two possible strategies for addressing migration issues in India could be:

- Encouraging 'reverse migration' - by shifting focus on development of 'smart villages' in the place of 'smart cities'

- Skilling Rural India- developing skilled rural workforce by providing employable skills

Prof. R. M. Prasad  
Former Associate Director of Extension, Kerala Agricultural University  
Former Senior Fellow, National Institute of Rural Development, Hyderabad

## Catherine Marquette, IFAD, Italy

Clearly a chapter on rural migration as a way in to looking at agricultural and rural development is a welcome focus in the report.  In that context, there seems to be fertile scope for integrating the long history of theoretical and empirical work in this area carried out by demographers ---which was set in motion by Boserup among others decades ago.  This body of research may significantly contribute to the present outline while providing important empirical and policy direction as well. I consider this in relation to the key questions raised by the forum.

**1. Does the outline focus on the most relevant issues concerning the links between migration, agriculture and rural development or are there important dimensions that have been left out?**

I would point to a few significant existing demographic literatures for inclusion not yet reflected in the outline with regard to theoretical approaches for looking at migration in general.

This includes integrating at least the more state-of-the-art dynamic network approaches to looking at migration pioneered by Doug Massey and others. Also relevant is the work of Alejandro Portes tackling the sociology of migration and the transnationalisation of poverty.  Boserup pays revisiting as well particular with regard to the role technological change and Africa (as well as more current reiterations based on for example, the so-called population/agricultural/environmental nexus that seems to be referred to in the outline (?) -- but as originally defined by Cleaver and Shreiber in the 1990s) .

In this context, remittance dynamics as financial capital for migration and a driver of continuing migration networks comes into play.  Again their has been extensive analysis of remittances in this context by Massey and others to consider.

However, social capital and networks develop alongside financial flows as well in driving continuing migration flows---So it is not just about remittances but also the way remittances affect the social fabric, how they enable (or marginalise) groups in relation to migration and development across both social and economic fields.

These are just some of the approaches to looking at migration and development that go far beyond the push/pull framework referred to in the outline.  Demographic theory has evolved far beyond that dichotomous approach as I try to point to above.

Indeed, rather than emphasise rural-urban dichotomies as the outline seems to do at the moment, it is the dynamic connections between rural and urban migration flows and spaces, the creation of periurban areas and the rural-urban continuum that seems key in relation to looking at the impacts of migration dynamics on agricultural and rural development.  In this context, Timmer's concepts of rural and agricultural transformation and the role of migration within it are relevant to take on board as well.

Also useful from current demographic theory ---demographers focus more and more on the  interrelatedness and transformation of flows over time rather than defining ideal typologies (labour migration, environmental migration, refugee migration). For example, focusing on looking at how refugees integrate and become permanent migrants over time as opposed to concentrating on identifiying categories of refugee or permanent migration flows.

Rather than creating static categories or typologies to consider (which do not really exist), it seems important to consider how flows transform over time as part of social and development process of integration, marginalisation etc...  Additionally, demographers generally break down migration phenomena to focus on considering one of its moments or aspects in terms of:  (a) determinants, (b) flow characteristics (age, sex, income, size, direction) or (c) consequences/impacts.  Normally geographic level of analysis or social unit involved  (individuals, couples, households/families, ethnic groups, communities etc..) as well as scale of flows (occurring at local, community,  state, international, regional level) is also important to take into account.

More and more demographers do not focus on the divide between internal and international flows but the connections between them which really drive economic welfare over time and development  (e.g. prevalence of step migration-- moving from rural area to periurban area, to city and eventual migration internationally). Again it is the interconnection that matters not the category. Finally, the time dimension is also important to consider when looking at and defining migration phenomena ---precisely since flows transform over time (e.g. refugee migrants become permanent migrants or not, labour migrants naturalise in their country of destination, temporary/seasonal/ migrants return home etc..).

These conceptual cuts may be useful organising points for discussion as well.

**2. Do you have individual experiences or are you aware of case studies that are useful for informing parts of the report?**

Given the differing profiles played by key migration dynamics (refugee migration, female migration, youth migration, seasonal migration etc.) across different world regions, it would seem important to look at case studies regionally.  Having said that, their are important international and internal flows connecting regions to consider (e.g. female labour migration flows from Latin America to Europe, youth flows within Africa, refugee flows from Africa to Europe, internal flows in Asian countries, special situations affecting SIS (small island states) ).

Also, seasonal migrants, however, seems be an especially important group in terms of rural development in many countries that often fall through the net-- because of difficulties in identifying them.

**3. Are you aware of important sources of information that could be useful for the preparation of the report?**

In an empirical context,  I would start by drawing on the databases and research of the UN Population Division (on migration, on migration policy, on migration and development, on special topics in migration). Particularly important for gaining larger empirical evidence and case studies---- is also to review the expert group meetings the UN Population Division has organised on migration and development over at least the last several decades.  The Division is also a valuable resource in terms of tracking the policy dimensions of migration and rural development.

## Andrea Cattaneo, facilitator of the consultation

Dear all,

I want to thank again the contributors who have continued to ensure a lively and interesting discussion as well as really useful and important comments and suggestions. A special thank you to those of you who have suggested specific cases and sources of information. Please keep it up.

I would also like to recognize the many suggestions for improvements to the contents that have continued to arrive. Let me just mention suggestions to look at conditions of migrants in locations of both origin and destination and to consider both the positive dimensions of migration and the risks involved. The suggestion to look more carefully at innovation and migration, especially in relation to youth, is also an interesting one. I have also taken note of the call to go beyond the push-pull framework and bring in additional elements from the demographic literature as well as de-emphasizing the rural-urban dichotomy and rather considering the rural-urban continuum.

I look forward to a continued interesting discussion during the last days of this online consultation.

Andrea

## Ricardo Safra de Campos, University of Exeter, United Kingdom

Dear authors and colleagues,

Many thanks for the opportunity to provide comments to the draft outline as a way to improve the content of the publication. Please see my key comments bellow:

1. In addition to the range of movements included in the IOM definition of migration, it's relevant to consider planned relocation of households or entire communities. With increasing environmental risks through global change processes such as climate change, relocation is now widely discussed as a necessary or potentially effective intervention for vulnerable communities in marginal rural areas. There's a growing body of literature on this topic (see Cernea 2000, Bronin 2013 and others).

2. As pointed by other contributors, a more comprehensive overview of mobility theories (I.E Mobility Transition by Zelinsky) and demographic theories (Demographic transition) beyond push-pull, NELM and neoclassical frameworks would produce a significantly more robust theoretical underpinning.

3. Careful inclusion of gender analysis to help explore the different impacts and outcomes associated with migration, agriculture and rural developement.

4. Careful choice of empirical evidence can provide significant evidence on the drivers or migration as well as the impacts of remittances on adaptive capacity and resilience of rural households. The current research undertaken by the DECCMA project (Deltas, Vulnerability & Climate Change: Migration & Adaptation)funded by IDRC-DIFD has assembled large datasets of migrant sending (6000 household in rural and peri-urban areas) and destination areas (3000 migrants in urban areas) in low-lying regions of Bangladesh, Ghana and India.  These rich quantitative datasets are being analysed. Forthcoming planned outputs include peer-reviewed manuscripts on *Perceived environmental risks and expected outcomes as motivations for migration decisions; Investment in adaptive capacity enhances resilience in high migration intensity households; and Household composition, migration, and remittances: evidence from Deltas.*

I look forward to continuing this rich discussion and reading the report, Additionaly, please do not hesitate to contact me should you wish to further discuss DECCMA's empirical findings and analysis.

Best wishes,

Ricardo

## Rejaul Karin, South Asian Association for Regional Cooperation, Nepal

**Rural migration paradox**

Rejaul Karim[[1]](http://www.fao.org/fsnforum/activities/discussions/SOFA_migration" \l "_ftn1" \o ")

**Introduction**

Rural Migration is a paradox to the urban areas as well to the high income countries at the same time it is necessity for maintaining low input- high output-labour intensive sectors. Even though mechanization is preferred and focused in many ways and sectors automation becomes priority to the high income Western Europe, America and developing nations like China, still requirement of non-skilled and half skilled labour from Asia and Africa is high. Everyday thousands of mostly rural no-skilled labours are migrating earn more money than they can in their locality fulfilling the necessity of the said countries’ low paid labour. At the same time, possibly, in way to respond to the local talks over competition between the low paid migrated labour and high paid native labour and sort of situation created in connection with the additional human influx from foreign culture. Thus, it is now we are focusing on rural migration possibly for outlining the other ways to address the concerns of the city dwellers and western citizens. Obviously, the outcome could be beneficial for policy making from national, regional and global perspective. It is believed that the exercise would also provide justification to the backlashes are being seen on migrants.

**Background**

Migration is a natural phenomenon that even was existed during the prehistoric era. Since the very beginning people liked to live near to the water sources. The practice became more important with cultivation of agricultural produces. It is believed that prehistoric Horoppa-Mohenjodaro civilization was destroyed in a clash related to control of water. In the era of industrialization as well water flow proved to be important and early industries were set on the back of the rivers or near to the water sources. And for employment people again would concentrate around the industries cum urban areas. But those were in the proximity. The advent of colonization and slave business introduced new shape of migration that is in cases trans-continental. For example, importing Indian labour to South Africa and movement of African diaspora to America, West India engaged huge migration to those areas and obviously mush of it was rural migration. At present, if we look at the diaspora population in the erstwhile colonial countries, most of it is originated from their erstwhile colonies. Likewise, Muslim and jews population is most in France among European countries. African and South Asian diaspora are significant in UK. The reason could easily be assumed that France was the colonial power of MENA and UK was of Africa and South Asia. The Portuguese didn’t only make their language official in Brazil, Brazilians are also happened to be significant in Portugal. Similarly, people of Spanish Colonies are very much present in Spain. Subsequently, emergence of USA as the global power centre and advent of European Union pushed the surge of migration in the areas with flexibility and connection.

Now, once the colony is over, exploitation of the developing countries is over, cost-benefit ratio of exploitation of the poor rural people comes at the front, there are schools of thoughts criminalizing the rural migration and blaming the migrants for their misfortune related to employment, accommodation, social security and so on which could be identified as the results of capitalization cycle.

**Where is the focus now?**

In recent times, migration is increasingly becoming an issue in national politics in many countries. Most notably the Brexit and election of US president were proved to be overwhelmingly on anti-migration movement. Globally, emergence of right wing politics is also seen as anti-migration or anti-migrant political phenomena. Though globally we are talking about food security, social security and national security issues regarding migration, locally they are related to employment of native people, shrinking facilities for social security affected by the migrants, incidents of social unrest and intolerance among the communities, increasing rate of terrorist attacks in which either migrant people of migrant origin people are found to be guilty and moreover, these migrants, who once were dominated and ruled by the people of migrated countries, are becoming if not majority then important political and social change maker which is seen as intolerable. Protesters are also pointing towards the changing social structures and demography of the countries and the danger to their cultural heritages and social values in connection with the migration.

It is observed that so far critical analysis was not done on the issue and general people are not well aware of different dimensions like-

1. Natural immigrants;
2. People of foreign origin working in their countries either as technical expert or daily labour;
3. Floating displaced people for various reasons for which migrated countries were involved or not
4. Economic and technical aspects of employing high paying native and low paying foreigners
5. Dilemma between requirement of cheap foreign labours and demographic changes

Though focus is on International development, as such international migration is nothing but the rural migration. However, if the international movement of unskilled labour is considered that is more beneficial to the recipient countries/areas for using the low cost labour.

**Food security versus peace and stability**

It is assumed that we are talking about peace and stability of the urban areas, city dwellers and migrant recipient countries and as those people came for food we are absolutely talking of food security of the beggars. Before going further let’s have an anecdote from a renowned Bangladeshi satirist. In his column in the most published daily years back he noted/shared his real life story from Europe tour-“once when he was traveling by taxi, the taxi driver first asked his country of origin, then demonstrating ‘hand to mouth’ asked whether he came for food. The writer was hurt and humiliated and simply replied that the driver’s forefathers were asked with same question about two hundred years back when they went to Bengal.

In between one more aspect we could read that is ethics of global community and colonial powers. These poor people and their forefathers and their resources were used for making the economy of colonial powers as it is today. Even these days day to business, many technical and logistical services are supported by the people migrated from erstwhile colonies. Their tears, blood, sweat are mixed with the prosperity of the developed nations/urban economy. Thus, not only the citizens of developed countries/urban areas deserve the social security, the rural poor also deserve food security and has right to share dream of better livelihood as well as peace as the colonial/urban people do.

Though extracting low cost rural resources like human resource is one of the benefiting ways of urban based economy and to some extent it is also benefiting the rural area resolving food security concerns, increasing the rural income with inflow of remittance, the real income is much lower as much of it is being spent for their more expensive living outside of the rural area and little of it is being used for constructive, development purpose.

**Trends**

Globally there are various kind of migration. With the changes taking place every day, reasons are also changing, motives are also being created for migration. Traditionally, there are couple trends are visible, such as-

a. Natural migration

These are determined migrants. Whenever they move, the take appropriate preparations for migration. This section of the society normally doesn’t include rural population. Mostly, the urban resourceful persons/families make such migration what is happened to be international migration. Also there are instances of natural migration among the rural people, in which for various reasons they move normally from one village to another or one district to another or one state to another within the country.

b. Infrastructural migration

This is also kind of permanent migration. For joining families, education of minor kids, addressing health issues of family members, for employment for which there is no infrastructure in the rural area (even in some cases urban area) people move to the areas where their perceived cervices are available. This is major trend for permanent rural migration emanated from aspirations created by enhanced education, financial capabilities, awareness and rural-urban connectivity

c. Job related migration

This is neither permanent nor seasonal migration. But in many cases, the reason emanates from lack of adequate infrastructure and suitable job opportunities in the locality. Many rural people works far from their villages long time, can’t visit rural place so regularly or stay with other family members for not having same opportunity and infrastructure at rural place. These could be international or national or rural or urban. Some of them turn to be as permanent migrants in their place of posting for long time. In the current world most of the migrant labours be it in Europe, Middile East, Malyasia, Singapore, Hongkong or elsewhere are job related temporary migrants. So as the most of labour intensive industries e.g. garments of the developing countries like China, Vietnam, Bangladesh, India, Indonesia.

d. Seasonal migration in particular is common phenomenon in rural areas

This kind of migration could only take place anywhere. There are many professions that could only be available in particular season. Out of the season such jobs are scarce. Most of these labour is unskilled takes temporary jobs in agricultural or service sector like agricultural labour, rickshaw puller, real state labour and so on. Another aspect could also be noted that there are seasonal beggars in South Asia who mostly moves in certain season to certain places most of whom are not actually beggar but takes the opportunity of certain religious group, to earn more.

It is good for the high income areas where additional jobs could be done with these temporary migrants paying little but without having additional responsibilities. However, though it something better than nothing, can’t be taken as rural development activities as such because human resource development and employment diversification is neither focused nor considered in the focus areas.

e. Migration of rural women

Obviously migration is gender neutral subject. But in recent time, increased outward migration of rural women has to be recognized what is leading us to have more women engaged in paid works and enhanced women participation as regular workforce.

**Determinants**

There is wide range of determinants of rural migration. Generally rural people conserve huge family feeling or family bondage. Therefore, outward migration creating detachment is not a natural phenomenon. Thus, rural migration is actually impacts of infrastructural and institutional limitations coupled with lack of capital (financial and technical) resources. The determinants could be listed as follows-

1. High concentration of population itself a determinant for outward rural migration that make the people unable to reside together
2. Lack of adequate employment or suitable employment/employment diversity in the locality or proximity
3. Lack of infrastructure for education, health, connectivity, electricity, internet
4. Individual aspiration that does not fit in rural set up, even sometime district or national set up.
5. Also there could be constant feeling for what every community believes that the other communities or places are better to live in.
6. In many South Asian places particularly, Hilly/Mountainous people are migrating for difficulties with drinkable water/farming/trade and other difficulties with disparaged settlements
7. Particularly for women, there is quite little opportunities of employment. They are mainly considered as disguised labour for agriculture sector which affects the Total Productivity Ratio. For ensuring minimum paid work, outward migration of many rural women is a growing reality in the rural areas.

**Impacts**

Rural migration has bi-directional linkages or dimensions. Rural development is negatively affected by rural migration with little exception of inward remittance. Whenrural development takes place with regard to energy supply, infrastructure for education and health and enough working space is created, outward rural migration could be slowed down.

As always impacts are not of single kind. There are merits and demerits-

1. Merits-
   1. Utilization of available human resource
   2. Balance of settlements/population concentration
   3. Availing better infrastructure for education, health and so on
   4. Urbanization increases
   5. Financial resources are created in rural areas for formation of capital
   6. Good ideas for better society reaching to all the quarters.
   7. Technical know-how expands
   8. Connectivity and social bonding among different societies strengthened
   9. Gender equality occurred due enhanced women participation in paid works and transfer of social norms and education.
   10. Outward migration removes the additional/disguised employment in agriculture
   11. Leads to lack of agricultural labour which in turn would lead to farm mechanization and resulted in high productivity
   12. Leads towards feminization of agriculture which is helping for identification of the women labour employed for agriculture previously which was considered as disguised labour
   13. Maximum use of human resources are increasing the productivity

2.  Demerits-

1. Capacitated human resources are migrating;
2. Again migration of educated people creates vacuum in the rural areas; this happens because
3. Focus on rural development loose momentum and
4. Infrastructure development in rural area gets late/slowed
5. Entrepreneurshipare not developed in rural areas
6. Being unable to entrepreneur, the financial resources obtained from exploiting labour elsewhere, is wasted or used in non-productive sectors.
7. Rural people carry their rural culture wherever they go. Thus the influx create unrest in the migrated areas as they either try to follow their own culture or being significant diaspora try to impose upon the native community. Therefore,
8. Peace and stability of the recipient community is endangered; and
9. Security concerns increase

Impacts should not also ignore the loss of rural middle class and service sector because whoever moves that does not always represent the working class but also the ones who has enhanced capacity to serve the rurality in different capacities required.

**Rural migration- agriculture-rural development nexus**

labour market effects, impact of remittances, transfer of social norms and know-how for different activities, including agricultural

There could be a vicious circle detected in the nexus between rural development, agriculture and migration as follows:

Rural area has population more than it needs engaged in agriculture and service sector-that leads to low production and pseudo employed agriculture-that to low investment for capacity/infrastructure development-these lack of investment in rural infrastructure both for service sector and capacity building leads to outward migration for both non-skilled labour and skilled service sector population-again that creates vacuum for rural capacity building and human resource for rural development for non-skilled, aged, under-aged rural population.

The vicious circle could be broken with commercial agriculture led by women with focused investment for infrastructure for education, health and ICT so that skilled service sector could sustain in the rurality and agriculture could be profitable to retain the existing population which could help promoting safe and healthy migration

Impacts of remittance only have two dimensions-

1. Creation of financial resource; and
2. Aspirationof livelihood changes.

But both fail if enough space is not created for human resource development or entrepreneurship development along with physical facilities like infrastructure lacks.

Transfer of social changes and technical know-how could be in both ways like spread of democracy, gender equalities, women empowerment, and commercial farming/agriculture mechanization along with what we call as sky culture that is not accepted in many other cultures.Labour market/migration could prompt agriculture mechanization or minimum expedite which could positively affect agriculture for cost-benefit ratio and productivity that would again turn for sectoral/local income status. However, rural migration is not only labour migration it is also about migration of the middle class, educated service sector people who could make the social changes/rural development meaningful, it is their migration as well. It is also raising the question ‘who is gonna going to cultivate my land?’. Those who are considering the question as fallacy should hear to …

That means we should not only think about subsistence rurality with food security programme and peace and stability with imported poor labours who don’t require anything other than food. We have to consider the perspective is missing for the rural places where the outward migration is taking place. That is evacuation, of educated, service sector people and middle class aspiring to harness their dream of better job better life, leading towards reduction of rural population which is again leading to fallow land with the school drop outs and aged population not favourable to productivity.

It could be major concern/challenge for retaining the educated and industrious entrepreneurs and capable hands who could possibly contribute to rural development.

Rural Migration is also affecting the slower infrastructure development in the rural area as the conscious quarters are actually trying to migrate elsewhere where the facilities like advance connectivity, schooling, energy supply, working options are available, which again affecting the rural efficiency and capacity in a negative way because of migration of enhanced human resources whatever amount they have.

Rural migration is off course affecting the rural service sector as technicians, doctors, teachers are migrating for again better income, schooling of their children and so on what is essentially creating further vacuum in the rurality.

affect agricultural production

Off course it does! As-

1. Rural migration on first hand removes the minimum human resource required;

2. the second one is also crucial that it shifts the priority given for food production and agriculture which is partially linked with (i) direct involvement with the land management and production system and (ii) lessening dependency on agriculture.

3. Also the shift happens because of accommodating new challenges faced by the families outside village related to their various issues that consumes the additional income they make

**Way forward**

how can agriculture and rural development contribute to facilitating orderly, safe, regular and responsible migration and mobility of people?; ii) how will migration affect livelihoods in rural areas both in terms of constraints, such as labor shortages, and opportunities, through remittances to sending households?

1. Rural biased development policy should be in place instead of existing urban biased development policy at the national level
2. When rural development takes place with regard to energy supply, infrastructure for education and health and enough working space is created, outward rural migration could be slowed down. This would also help for quality migration and migration of skilled human force instead of existing trend of non-skilled and semi-skilled labour movement;
3. Additional job has to be created in non-farm sector proportionate with the increasing rural workforce;
4. We have to recognize the opportunity to feminize the agriculture and maximize the usage of pseudo employed labour in the rurality. However, little may be contributing to technological and enhanced capacity of agriculture development because in case the stated facts are happening those mostly helping out the subsistence agriculture for fulfilling the food requirement. Therefore, mechanized and commercial agriculture led by women would definitely resolve the challenge of under employed women workforce;
5. More particularly, commercial agriculture would reduce the outward migration and outward migration negatively affects possibility of commercial agriculture but paradoxically helps maximum utilization of female labour or maximum inclusion of the gender dimension.
6. Sectoral rural policies particularly for infrastructure like road connectivity, electricity, enhanced/high speed Internet connectivity with quality education and health system at per with the urban area are must for controlling the rural migration and also to enhance the capacity of the rurality
7. Feminized agriculture would for sure increase the rural productivity that would led to enhanced rural income and can create financial resources for necessary capital development for entrepreneurship in rural areas.
8. These changes would lead to gender equality and social stability with realization of the workforce potentials and women empowerment for decision making and for making the choice.

[[1]](http://www.fao.org/fsnforum/activities/discussions/SOFA_migration#_ftnref1) Rejaul Karim completed his Master of Arts in Rural Development from Tribhuban University and serving as Desk Offer for Rural Development at the Secretariat of the South Asian Association for Regional Cooperation (SAARC). The piece indicates his personal view to the issue.

## Mylene Rodríguez Leyton, Universidad Metropolitana de Barranquilla, Colombia

Dear colleagues and coordinator of the Forum, I would like to greet you from Colombia and particularly from the Metropolitan University of Barraqnuilla. I am a nutritionist-dietitian and I am a researcher in the area of ​​public nutrition.

Here are my contributions to this forum:

**Does the draft focus on the most relevant issues relating to the links between migration, agriculture and rural development, or are there important dimensions left out?**

The draft of the report focuses on relevant aspects of migrations on agriculture, I perceive that it is properly structured.

I recommend that figures be included that illustrate the state of rural migration in the world by region, depending on the availability of information, as well as other information that will help to illustrate the magnitude of the problem and if possible illustrate some relevant case studies such as the case of Colombia, where for many years the armed conflict caused displacement from the countryside to the city and this affected agri-food production and its quality of life, now with the peace process the situation is changing and peasants have begun to return to their lands but all this has to be a process led and accompanied by the government, also planned in agricultural policies.

The case of Venezuela our brother and neighbor, as it affects the current situation of the country to the peasants and in general as it is affecting the current situation of conflict and migrations the food and nutritional security of its inhabitants.

These are cases in the context of Latin America and the Caribbean that can help analyze the issue of migration and its relationship with agriculture and food and nutritional security.

Therefore, I suggest including some analysis of the relationship of migration with other variables, such as food systems and how food security is affected by urbanization processes.

The processes of urbanization generate transformation of agro-food value chains generating impacts on nutrition; when an agro-food system is supplied from local production, local collection centers are established, with flexible prices for consumers, product volumes and quality standards, availability to consumers through stores where traders and small farmers directly access Although these value chains can be affected by seasonal production, they encourage the consumption of healthy foodstuffs such as low-cost fruits and vegetables, livestock products and staple foods, particularly in rural areas and in urban poor neighborhoods reduce micronutrient deficiencies and malnutrition (Gómez et al, 2017).

Likewise, I suggest revising some approach to migration from human development where migrants are established as the cause of migration from the point of view of the migrants as human beings who seek when they leave their environments and the migrant as an individual with capacities, aspirations and expectations, not just as a producer agent in the agri-food system. This type of analysis helps to define policies for social protection, education and health, among others that must accompany agrifood policies and to analyze the phenomenon of migration as a complex and systemic phenomenon but seen in an integral way.

Migration from the countryside to the city generates consequences on food security affecting their incomes and living conditions by undertaking migration processes towards cities, where they enter to perpetuate the circle of poverty and food insecurity.

**Do you have individual experience or do you know of case studies that are useful to help lay the foundations for particular parts of the report?**

I have been doing bibliographic research on the subject from the invitations for World Food Day and the call for presentations made by FAO.

**Do you know key sources of information that may be useful for the preparation of the report?**

Please see the documents attached.

Attachments:

<http://www.fao.org/fsnforum/sites/default/files/discussions/contributions/chapter6%20Food%20Value%20Chain_0.pdf>

<http://www.fao.org/fsnforum/sites/default/files/discussions/contributions/El%20proceso%20migratorio%20en%20Colombia%20Determinantes%20y%20consecuencias_0.pdf>

<http://www.fao.org/fsnforum/sites/default/files/discussions/contributions/Las%20migraciones%20forzadas-%20el%20desplazamiento%20interno%20en%20Colombia%20%281%29_0.pdf>

<http://www.fao.org/fsnforum/sites/default/files/discussions/contributions/Migraci%C3%B3n%20y%20SAN%20en%20Nicaragua_0.pdf>

<http://www.fao.org/fsnforum/sites/default/files/discussions/contributions/Migraci%C3%B3n%20y%20seguridad%20alimentaria_0.pdf>

<http://www.fao.org/fsnforum/sites/default/files/discussions/contributions/Partir%20para%20quedarse%20-%20Migraci%C3%B3n%20y%20seguridad%20alimentaria%20-%20Institut%20fran%C3%A7ais%20d%E2%80%99%C3%A9tudes%20andines_0.pdf>

## Ogunbande Joseph, University of Agriculture, Abeokuta, Nigera

My contributions go this way, the experience of rural migration is a global issue and I think it should be treated as such, the nonavailability of basic amenities in rural areas encourage the youth migration which reduces the workforce in the rural areas my Nigeria experience. We can reduce rural migration if social amenities are provided and equipment for mechanized farming are available which in turn increase food production.

## Binni Azad, National Forum for Women’s Rights, India

Migration in the Jharkhand context occurs mainly due to two major situations:

1. The impact of deforestation for widening roads for heavy rush of motor vehicle, used by not more than 8 to 10% of the population who live in urban areas. They are government servants, business class as well as corporators. As we all know, farming in Jharkhand depends on rain water and single paddy. There are few developed farmers where their few family members are in any job or own business. Due to deforestation on water availability and the deep ground water level farmers are unable to use it for farming. This results in the drying up of wells as well ponds and seasonal rivers, wetlands and increased drought, compelling the farmers to migrate to other areas, particularly urban areas in search of employment (climate refugees).

2. Literate or illiterate persons along with farmers are also forced to migrate when the government sanctions land for corporates in the name of development and large scale jobs for them, but all in vein. According to the Land Acquisition Act, the consent of 80% of the villagers is mandatory but forced eviction has been taking place for infrastructure development. But their is no benefit that goes to farmers or land owners.

As we know most of the rural population depends on work related to agriculture. Without agricultural land it seems difficult to sustain their life.

While discussing about the types of migration, seasonal migration and part time migration are more conspicuous and relevant in Jharkhand, as the other states in India. There are many migrants from Jharkhand working in Panjab, Gujrat, Kerala, Chenai, Mumbai, Surat working for their livelihoods.

## Laura L. Dawson, Food Physics & Body Dynamics LLC, United States of America

Laura L. Dawson, Dipl.Ac., L.Ac., CEO Food Physics And Body Dynamics LLC

Outline for response to the following items:

Does the outline focus on the most relevant issues concerning the links between migration, agriculture and rural development or are there important dimensions that have been left out? **See 1) Health**

Do you have individual experiences or are you aware of case studies that are useful for informing parts of the report? **See 2) World Health Organization**- health related to available sources of nutrients, Measurement changes by the WHO.int- health have evolved to QOL.

Are you aware of important sources of information that could be useful for the preparation of the report? **See 3) Food Physics & Body Dynamics™”**, a protocol which was developed in ancient China and recrafted for today’s challenges, can be taught and applied to daily life by observing simple patterns on the tongue and making choices

1. **Health** appears for the only one time in the entire SOFA 2018 Draft on Page 6, Section 3, and is not mentioned again. And yet, health is an essential component to life, through which we experience work, albeit in the case of rural Agriculture it is; planting, nurturing the crop, harvesting and taking to market, all of which relies on not only money, before that we rely on our health and wellbeing. [Wellbeing may be referred to as mental health, assurance of our personal worth and value, capabilities and strengths.] We believe just as Maslow, in his hierarchy of needs, stated; paraphrased from the Wikipedia pages [see footnote below 1)] .  The basis of which is the physiologic first, which is supported by having ample food, shelter and clothing. In other words;
   1. Clothing as it is used to protect our skin, hair, eyes, nose, mouth, sensory orifices and sensory systems, from extremes of temperature and to moderate our environment, wherever we live, work or play.
   2. Shelter to protect the body from the elements of nature such as extreme climatic temperatures, wind, fire, rain, snow, hurricane, tornado, and floods etc.
   3. Food would be the metabolic factors including air [clean], water [safe for drinking] and food [agriculture, aquaculture, animal husbandry which produce meats.]

So the lack of attention to the state of health in the migratory nature of our current rural evolutionary development it fool hardy. We would be wise acknowledge the resources produced in agriculture, aquaculture, etc., are only necessary when humans/populations are able to consume those foods for energy production; production then used to support dynamic body systems in action and rest before returning that changed energy back into the environment. This would be referred to a healthy food system.

  2. **World Health Organization [WHO]**thoughts on health, nutrition and Quality Of Life.

In a WHO in a paper published in 2006, Basic Epidemiology, 2nd Edition, regarding the definition of health agreed on in 1948, been quoted; “health is a state of complete physical, mental, and social well-being and not merely the absence of disease or infirmity.” [See footnote  2) below]

At the turn of the 21st Century and currently there is a significant shift in the measurement standard for health to involve a Quality Of Life set of criteria, as established by several WHO participating countries, one of which has been the USA.

This has led to a measure placed on the person who experiences health and what their own feelings of worth and value may be [See footnote 3) below]. In Seattle, WA, USA, one set of accepted QOL terms have been authorized and may be obtain under secure steps from the WHO [See footnote 4) below]. However there are areas throughout the world which have been generating terminology for those regions [See footnote 5) below].

As with everything, the WHOQOL standards are changing and evolving, yet if you would like to perform clinical research related to public health, migration, or rural development, this will be important as a starting point.

Here in the USA, we are in the midst of a massive opioid abuse epidemic, which lends itself to these QOL assessments. It is my hope that my Acupuncturist peer will look to these formats in their data collection and analysis, while employment may be an unknown and inconsistent quantifier.

Yet, there are other factors which I have observed in my clinical experience; different areas and geography have thermo-dynamics, unique soil components and plant diseases. As agriculture science takes this into consideration, there will also be the need to factor in the effects of amendments, treatments and development.

Migration also stimulates diversity and potential instability which can disturb some people, therefore an immune response may be triggered, while the threat may be in perception, not reality. We will need to build value systems, and economic structures which encourage new ideas and growth, deliberating and sharing, while retaining moral and ethical standards of society.

For instance, worldwide studies with health care peers have led me to believe the newest probiotics will help mediate these rapid changes, particularly for the elderly and the child who are on the end of the spectrum of changes; one at a point preparing to leave their physical body behind while the child is just beginning to enter society.

Currently health care professionals look at bacteria, viruses, blood serum, blood pressure, immune responses, auto-immune responses, and the internal mechanistic dynamics of whole systems as they interact for the benefit of the host human. I wonder how these measurements will hold up and appear to be of value or not, in the next decade.

One aspect which I personally noted, there is an adaptive period when a patient relocates. Sometimes it can take the full year of all four seasonal changes, while for others who are more susceptible to stress, it can take a much longer period of time and require coaching, counseling and/or comforting.

  3. **Food Physics & Body Dynamics™, [FPBD]** was developed to address to foreseen challenges of medical ignorance of the essential role proper nutrition and absorption play in health and wellness at the onset of the 21st Century. It has been certified to provide Nutrition continuing education credits to doctors, chiropractors, naturopaths, acupuncturist, and other allied health care professionals.

Designed and synthesized based on a combination of the 8 Principles of Traditional Chinese Medicine and the adjunctive nutritional texts, [Numerous text involved in academia may pre produced by author, Laura L. Dawson, upon request.] which have evolved over 2000 to 4000 years ago and the more modern, Latin-based so-called western food science and nutrition as recorded in text books such as Understanding Nutrition, Sixth Edition [by Whitney and Rolfes, Published by West Publishing Company, St. Paul, MN 1993, and varied coursework over academics in the US for more than a decade].

We have come to use one of the four primary diagnostics used by Acupuncturist, the tongue. Most, if not all, Acupuncturists know the impact of foods on each specific organ system. In fact, we have been trained to observe patterns on the tongue and formulate an understanding of the condition which host body is experiencing; in other words, their health status.

The good news is, that since we can assess the condition we likely can affect a significant change using the 8 Principle methods. Using a parallel between the color and flavor, and thermodynamics of the foods, we can apply these characteristics to the dis-ease pattern observed on the person’s tongue and reflective of the condition of the body. I personally have used this model to lower an adult male’s Prostate Antigen production, reduced cancer treatment side effects thereby increasing potential survivor rate significantly, assuaged symptoms generated in response to organ remove, treated MRSA fluid buildup and discharge to reduce the length of time to recovery, helped two young wives to become pregnant- one with food exclusively and in the other case with the assistance of herbal formulary. I have successfully treated a middle-aged woman with a diagnosis of Chronic Fatigue at a degenerative level of Stage 3 out of 4 stages. Her blood serum reflected the significant and somewhat unexpected change in her status which was reported to her physician and attorney.

In Section 6.4 of SOFA 2018, the discussion on Resilience is to be addressed. I feel this method of teaching and treating through the use of foods rather than a procedure, organ removal, or pharmaceutical may help to build resilience, more efficiently. This will be important. Rapid social and climatic changes may rely on such methods to management these changes, making change easier.

Footnotes-Bibliography-Links

1. Maslow’s Heierachy of Needs [[https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Maslow%27s\_hierarchy\_of\_needs]](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Maslow%27s_hierarchy_of_needs%5d)
2. WHO Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data Bonita, Ruth. Basic epidemiology / R. Bonita, R. Beaglehole, T. Kjellström. 2nd edition. 1.Epidemiology. 2.Manuals. I.Beaglehole, Robert. II.Kjellström, Tord. III.World Health Organization. ISBN 92 4 154707 3 (NLM classification: WA 105) ISBN 978 92 4 154707 9 © World Health Organization 2006, page 28
3. <http://www.who.int/healthinfo/survey/whoqol-qualityoflife/en/>
4. <http://www.who.int/healthinfo/survey/whoqol-qualityoflife/en/index4.html>
5. Principal Investigators and Field Sites Involved in the Development of the WHOQOL Instruments. <http://www.who.int/healthinfo/survey/whoqol-qualityoflife/en/index8.html>

## Dineshkumar Singh, TATA Consultancy Services, India

Find a brief write-up come case study on a drought induced rural migration.

**Does the outline focus on the most relevant issues concerning the links between migration, agriculture and rural development or are there important dimensions that have been left out?**

A simplified, comprehensive resolution framework is missing. It looks more theoretical.

**Do you have individual experiences or are you aware of case studies that are useful for informing parts of the report?**

Attaching the case study.

**Are you aware of important sources of information that could be useful for the preparation of the report?**

References and Down To Earth.

Attachment:

<http://www.fao.org/fsnforum/sites/default/files/discussions/contributions/Where%20to%20go%20-%20Drought%20led%20Migration.docx>

## Eri Uchimura, ILO, Switzerland

Dear Andrea,

Thank you for the opportunity to provide inputs to the 2018 SOFA .

Dear Colleagues,

Even though we are aware of that this is more relevant to the State of World Fisheries and Aquaculture (SOFIA), another flagship publication of the FAO, we would like to share below information since we believe that it could be useful as a reference.

In September 2017, the ILO held the Tripartite Meeting on Issues Relating to Migrant Fishers. The Meeting report which provides a basis for the discussion of the issues faced by migrant fishers and how to address those issues is available from here: <http://embargo.ilo.org/sector/Resources/publications/WCMS_569895/lang--en/index.htm>  
**The Meeting adopted Conclusions and Resolution**, which are available from below link:   
<http://www.ilo.org/sector/activities/sectoral-meetings/WCMS_552792/lang--en/index.htm>

According to recent ILO estimates, there are 150 million migrant workers worldwide, approximately 11.1 per cent of whom are engaged in agriculture, forestry and fishing. Migrant fishers look to benefit such as higher pay, gaining skills and experience, and better working conditions. Remittances sent back to families assist the alleviation of poverty, finance education for children and cover health care. However they are also vulnerable to various challenges, including unfair recruitment practices, discrimination and other decent work deficits. These characteristics, to a certain extent, overlap with those of agricultural and rural migration.

We look forward to seeing the contributions from this Forum in the SOFA 2018.

Best regards on behalf of the Sectoral Policies Department (SECTOR),

Eri Uchimura

## Luis Antonio Hualda, University of the Philippines Mindanao, Philippines

Just some thoughts on the annotated outline of the 2018 SOFA that I would like to share.

**On the bi-directional linkages of rural migration and agriculture and rural development:**

Rural migration can adversely affect agriculture and rural development due to declining availability of labour and productivity, and the lack of opportunities in agriculture and rural areas can drive migration as well. This may be viewed as a bi-directional linkage but perhaps this may be viewed as a reinforcing loop, wherein each intensifies the effects along the process. The effects of this loop create off-shoots of additional drivers such as conflict, which also creates an environment that drives rural migration. A holistic and systems perspective in viewing rural migration might be helpful in identifying key causes and formulation of key strategies for policies.

**On Moving Forward:**

There may be a need to explore the role of municipal and territorial planning in rural migration, agriculture and rural development. Economic opportunities, or lack thereof, can drive rural migration. The creation of economic opportunities in a specific jurisdiction and improving the welfare of its constituents are the responsibility of a city/municipal/territorial government. However, migration transcends boundaries and the adverse effects and benefits that come along with it are transferred to the jurisdiction of local or national governments. This can leave some jurisdictions as better off while others may be worse off. Developing policies to moving forward especially for safe, orderly and regular migration may have to consider this. This will require a change in the process of municipal and territorial planning adopted by governments.

## Andrea Cattaneo, facilitator of the consultation

Dear all,

Thank you again to all the contributors for the valuable input. The feedback received is clearly based on a wealth of experiences that contributors have gathered around the world, providing different perspectives on the theme of migration, agriculture, and rural development.

Some of the issues raised are very much in line with FAO’s approach to rural development as a way of providing a choice to people living in rural areas, on whether to migrate or not. [This year’s State of Food and Agriculture (SOFA)](http://www.fao.org/state-of-food-agriculture/en/), launched on October 9th, focused on territorial approaches to rural development, and the role of the food system in lifting people out of poverty in rural areas. Based on contributors’ comments, for SOFA 2018 we will try to build on this territorial approach and link it more directly to the drivers and impacts of rural migration. Another aspect that emerged from the discussion is the role of urban areas in providing employment, services and amenities. The report will try to capture the differentials between rural and urban areas as drivers of migration and policy implications.

We also received contributions highlighting work of which we were not aware, or pointing in directions that we had not considered. For example, the issue of migrant fishers is one that was not part of our initial outline, but one that we believe should be included. Another aspect to be considered is the health and nutritional status of both migrants and those left behind.

In the coming months we will be collecting further information and produce a report that is evidence-based, and hopefully provide new policy-relevant insights on the topic. Thank you to all of you for indicating ongoing empirical work of relevance to the publication, and the broader literature on migration dynamics, demography, and gender-related migration issues. The dialogue and input provided was very helpful in providing guidance to our team. I particularly appreciated the time taken by contributors on how to improve the report structure and provide a clearer rationale for the document.

The 2018 edition of the State of Food and Agriculture is scheduled to be launched in mid-September 2018. This leaves only a few months to prepare the report since we have to allow time for translation in the other 5 official UN languages and for the production process. In the coming days we will be receiving commissioned background papers on country case studies that we hope will enrich the report with different regional perspectives. We will also be incorporating your suggestions on the outline and exploring some of the information resources that emerged in the forum.

A big thank you to all who participated in this Forum!

Andrea

## Roberto Sensi, ActionAid, Italy

Italy

Dear all,

Please find attached an ActionAid Italy contribution on the topic you raised:

<http://www.fao.org/fsnforum/sites/default/files/discussions/contributions/MigrazioneFame_eng_web.pdf>

Best

Roberto Sensi