Hundred and Seventy-second Session

Rome, 24-28 April 2023

Report of the 118th Session of the Committee on Constitutional and Legal Matters (Rome, 6-8 March 2023)

Executive summary

In its Report of its 118th Session, the Committee on Constitutional and Legal Matters (CCLM):

1) makes specific recommendations for decision by the Council on: the restoration by the Conference of the voting rights of Member Nations in arrears in the payment of their financial contributions to the Organization; the proposal to amend the Statute of the International Civil Service Commission (ICSC); and the Draft Voluntary Code of Conduct for Voting procedures under Rule XII of the General Rules of the Organization as referred to in the Conference and Council reports;

2) brings to the attention of the Council for its endorsement its conclusions regarding the process of election of the Chairperson of the Committee on Forestry (COFO); and

3) informs the Council of CCLM’s considerations related to the updates it received on: the review of the jurisdictional set-up of the United Nations common system; the participation of private sector as observers at the FAO Governing Body sessions; the status of recommendations presented in the JIU Report Review of the State of the Investigation Function: Progress made in the United Nations System Organizations in Strengthening the Investigation Function (JIU/REP/2020/1).
Suggested action by the Council

The Council is invited to:

1) **endorse** the recommendations of the Committee on:
   a) the restoration by the Conference of the voting rights of Member Nations in arrears in the payment of their financial contributions to the Organization;
   b) the proposal to amend the Statute of the International Civil Service Commission (ICSC); and

2) **endorse** the conclusions of the Committee on the process of election of the Chairperson of the Committee on Forestry (COFO).

3) **note** the Committee’s considerations on:
   a) the review of the jurisdictional set-up of the United Nations common system;
   b) the participation of private sector as observers at the FAO Governing Body sessions; and

Queries on the substantive content of this document may be addressed to:

Annick VanHoutte  
Secretary, Committee on Constitutional and Legal Matters  
Tel: +39 06570 54287  
Email: Annick.Vanhoutte@fao.org
I. Introduction

1. The Hundred and Eighteenth Session of the Committee on Constitutional and Legal Matters (CCLM) was held from 6 to 8 March 2023.

2. The Session, open to silent observers, was chaired by Ms Alison Storsve, who welcomed all the participants.

3. The following Members joined the Session:
   - Ms Lamia Ben Redouane (Algeria)
   - Ms Julie Émond (Canada)
   - Mr Shanil Dayal (Fiji)
   - H.E. Mónica Robelo Raffone (Nicaragua)
   - Ms Nina P. Cainglet (Philippines)
   - Ms Zora Weberová (Slovakia)

4. The Committee was informed that, for this Session, Mr Esala Nayasi (Fiji) had been replaced by Mr Shanil Dayal. H.E. Mr Khaled Ahmad Zekriya (Afghanistan) did not join the Session.

5. The Session was convened in hybrid modality, with some Members participating in person at FAO headquarters (Algeria, Canada, Nicaragua, Philippines and Slovakia) and others participating virtually (Fiji) on an exceptional basis due to the COVID-19 pandemic in Italy and worldwide.

6. The Committee followed the modalities applied to the 110th Session of CCLM, as reflected in the Note from the Chair (Annex 1 to CL 164/2) and agreed to suspend the rules that may be incompatible with the hybrid session, in accordance with Rule VII of the Rules of Procedure.

II. Item 1: Adoption of the agenda and arrangements for the Session (CCLM 118/1 Rev.1)

7. The CCLM Members took note of the exceptional arrangements for the Session and approved its Agenda.

III. Item 2: Restoration by the Conference of the voting rights of Member Nations in arrears in the payment of their financial contributions to the Organization (CCLM 118/2)

8. The Committee considered document CCLM 118/2 “Restoration by the Conference of the voting rights of Member Nations in arrears in the payment of their financial contributions to the Organization” and the draft Conference Resolution in Annex to the document, within the context of its mandate.

9. In line with the recommendations contained in document CCLM 118/2, the Committee made a number of technical adjustments to the text as reflected in Annex I to this Report. The Committee observed inconsistencies between the various language versions of the text and recommended that they be reviewed and checked for consistency with the English version of the draft Resolution, as revised, in Annex I to this Report.

10. The Committee confirmed to the Council that the draft Conference Resolution, as revised and set out in Annex I to this Report, is consistent with the Basic Texts and, from the perspective of its mandate, is ready for Finance Committee and Council consideration and for Conference decision.

11. In this regard, the Committee requested the Secretariat to ensure that the Finance Committee (FC) at its 195th Session be provided with the revised version of the draft Resolution set out in Annex I to this Report, for its consideration.
IV. Item 3: International Civil Service Commission (ICSC) – Proposal to amend the ICSC Statute (CCLM 118/3)

12. The Committee reviewed document CCLM 118/3 “International Civil Service Commission (ICSC) – Proposal to amend the ICSC Statute” and the amendments proposed to the Statute of the ICSC.

13. The Committee observed that the proposed amendments contribute to clarifying the authority and competence of the ICSC to establish the post adjustment multipliers under Article 11 of its Statute.

14. Noting that the proposed amendments to the ICSC Statute do not entail any changes to the legal framework of the Organization, the Committee invited the Council to recommend to the Conference to accept the amendments proposed to the ICSC Statute as set out at paragraph 18 of document CCLM 118/3.

V. Item 4: Review of the jurisdictional set-up of the United Nations common system – Update (CCLM 118/4)

15. The Committee welcomed the update on the “Review of the jurisdictional set-up of the United Nations common system” provided by the Legal Office, noting that there continues to be significant divergence of views, and discussions are ongoing.

16. The Committee looked forward to receiving an update at a future session on the outcomes from the consultations through the Legal Advisers Network of the UN system, including the FAO Legal Office’s engagement in this process as well as the progress being made in the review.

17. The Committee noted that changes to the jurisdictional set-up of the United Nations common system could require decision-making by the FAO Governing Bodies in due course.

VI. Item 5: Participation of private sector as observers at the FAO Governing Bodies sessions

18. The Committee welcomed the oral update provided by the Independent Chairperson of the Council (ICC) on his consultations with the Membership and the preparation of a Note for Members on the participation of private sector as observers at the sessions of the FAO Governing Bodies.

19. The Committee appreciated the ICC’s efforts and looked forward to an update at a future session of CCLM.


20. The Committee welcomed the oral update by the Legal Counsel, including on the consultations with other UN specialized agencies.

21. The Committee, recalling the recommendations on this matter by CCLM and Finance Committee at their Autumn 2022 Sessions which were endorsed by the Council at its 171st Session, looked forward to considering preliminary procedures at its Autumn 2023 Session, noting that these should be developed in consultation with other UN specialized agencies and taking into account the legal framework of the Organization.

1 CL 171/REP, paragraphs 32(b) and 35(c).
VIII. Item 7: Process of election of the Chairperson of the Committee on Forestry (CCLM 118/5)

22. The Committee considered document CCLM 118/5 “Process of election of the Chairperson of the Committee on Forestry”.

23. The Committee confirmed that the rules governing the election of Chairpersons of Technical Committees are similar and consistent and, in particular, the legal framework governing the process of election of the Chairperson of the Committee on Forestry (COFO) was consistent with the General Rules of the Organization.

24. The Committee observed that, with respect to the rotation of the office of the Chairperson among regions, the Rules of Procedure of the Technical Committees are equally similar as they all provide for such rotation. While acknowledging that the manner in which these rules have been applied by COFO differs from the practice applied by the other Technical Committees in that the “regions” are aligned with the membership of the FAO Regional Forestry Commissions (RFCs), the Committee confirmed that the authority to apply the principle of rotation in this way lies with COFO.

25. The Committee further confirmed that the authority to amend its Rules of Procedure lies with each Technical Committee, in accordance with its distinct nature and functional requirements.

26. The Committee invited the Council to endorse these conclusions.

IX. Item 8: Draft Voluntary Code of Conduct for Voting procedures under Rule XII of the General Rules of the Organization as referred to in the Conference and Council Reports\(^2\) (CCLM 118/6)


28. The Committee commended the ICC for his transparent and inclusive informal consultations with Members.

29. The Committee reviewed and made technical adjustments, within the context of its mandate, to the Draft Voluntary Code of Conduct as set out in Annex II to this Report, including the deletion of “informally agreed ad ref” from each paragraph.

30. The Committee recommended that the various language versions be reviewed and checked for consistency with the English version set out in Annex II to this Report. In this regard, the Committee requested the Secretariat to ensure that the Council at its next Session be provided with the revised version of the Draft Voluntary Code of Conduct, set out in Annex II to this Report, for its consideration.

31. The Committee concluded that, as revised, the Draft Voluntary Code of Conduct, set out in Annex II to this Report, was consistent with the Basic Texts and invited the Council to endorse and transmit it to the Conference for approval.

X. Item 9: Any other matters

32. No other matter was raised under this item.

\(^2\) CL 162/REP, paragraph 7; CL 163/2 paragraphs 6-8; CL 163/REP, paragraph 12; CL 164/2 paragraphs 8-11; CL 164/REP, paragraph 20 (a); CL 165/REP, paragraph 23 (a); CL 166/REP, paragraph 42; C 2021/REP, paragraph 71; CL 167/REP, paragraph 11 (b); CL 168/REP, paragraph 34; CL 170/REP, paragraph 49; CL 171/REP, paragraphs 46 and 47.
Annex I

[Deletions are indicated using strikethrough text and insertions are indicated using underlined italics.]

Draft Conference Resolution

Procedures for the restoration by the Conference of the voting rights of Member Nations in arrears in the payment of their financial contributions to the Organization

THE CONFERENCE,

Reaffirming Article III, paragraph 4 and Article XVIII of the Constitution and the obligation of each Member Nation and Associate Member to contribute annually to the Organization its share of the budget, as apportioned by the Conference, and urging all Member Nations and Associate Members to pay their assessed contributions in full, on time and without conditions;

Noting the critical liquidity situation of the Regular Programme in 2018 as a result of delays in the payment of contributions and the continued high level of contributions that remained unpaid from prior years, in particular by major contributors;

Noting that Member Nations are quarterly informed about Member Nations in arrears and that every Member in arrears will be notified two months in advance of the Conference, in accordance with Rule XXXVIII, paragraph 2(j) of the General Rules of the Organization;

Acknowledging the necessity of maintaining sufficient cash flow to cover obligations and ensure implementation of the approved Programme of Work;

Acknowledging the need for a more specific procedure for the payment of arrears in relation to restoration of voting rights of Member Nations in arrears in the payment of their financial contributions to the Organization in accordance with Article III, paragraph 4, of the Constitution;

Recalling that the Committee on Constitutional and Legal Matters, at its 115th Session, and the Finance Committee, at its 191st Session, convened in March and May 2022, respectively, examined and recommended to the Council at its Hundred and Seventieth Session, to endorse the proposal to complement the General Rules of the Organization in order to strengthen the measures imposed for the non-payment of contributions;

1. Decides to adopt the procedures as outlined in this Resolution for the restoration of voting rights under Article III, paragraph 4 of the FAO Constitution:

a) Member Nations in arrears requesting the restoration of voting rights under Article III, paragraph 4 of the FAO Constitution should provide an explanation of the nature of the conditions beyond the Member Nation’s control leading to the failure to pay, and are encouraged to provide:

i. the fullest possible supporting information, which may include, where possible, information on economic aggregates, government revenues, and expenditure, foreign exchange resources, indebtedness, difficulties in meeting domestic or international financial obligations;

ii. an indication of the measures which will be taken in order to settle the arrears; and
any other information that might support the claim that failure to make necessary payments had been attributable to conditions beyond the control of the Member Nations.

b) Requests applications for the restoration of voting rights under Article III, paragraph 4 of the Constitution to be submitted by Member Nations in writing to the Secretary-General of the Conference preferably two weeks ahead of the session of the Conference concerned, to ensure a complete review of the requests by the General Committee.

c) Requests applications for the restoration of voting rights under Article III, paragraph 4 of the Constitution to be submitted in writing by the Permanent Representative of the Member Nation, or the designated chargé d’affaires, or the responsible minister of the government of the Member Nation as defined by Rule III, paragraph 2 of the General Rules of the Organization.

d) Member Nations in arrears who wish to reschedule the payment of their arrears as part of an arrangement to have their voting rights restored should submit with their request in writing to the Director-General a written payment plan.

e) The payment plan as referred to in sub-paragraph 5. d) should include the following information:

   i. the total amount due, including the current year’s assessment;
   ii. the period over which payment is proposed;
   iii. the minimum amount of payment that the Member Nation intends to make each year;
   iv. the date and the amount of the first payment;
   v. an indication of whether the Member Nation expects to request approval from the Director-General to make the payment in local currency, in accordance with the Financial Regulations and rules, and with relevant resolutions of the Conference; and
   vi. a commitment from the Member Nation to pay its future assessed contributions in full and on time and in accordance with the Financial Regulations.

27. Requests FAO to establish and continue to maintain a publicly accessible, exhaustive and up-to-date information section on the FAO website reflecting the status of payment of assessed contributions.

38. Requests the Director-General to include the present Resolution in the notification which is sent to Member Nations in arrears two months in advance of the Conference, as well as published it on the relevant website of FAO and in an Information Note for the Conference.
Annex II

[Deletions are indicated using strikethrough text and insertions are indicated using underlined italics.]


I. INTRODUCTION

1. This Voluntary Code of Conduct for voting procedures under Rule XII of the General Rules of the Organization (the “Code”) aims at promoting open, fair, equitable, and transparent voting procedures during the election for the office of Director-General of the Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (“FAO” or “the Organization”) in accordance with the Basic Texts of the Organization (“the Basic Texts”), including the General Rules of the Organization (“GRO”). *(Informally agreed ad ref)*

II. STATUS AND SCOPE OF THE CODE

2. The Code is an understanding reached by the Member Nations of FAO. It recommends desirable behaviour by Member Nations and candidates nominated by the Member Nations regarding the election of the Director-General of the Organization in order to increase the fairness, credibility, openness, and transparency of the process. Consequently, this Code is of a voluntary nature and is not legally binding. Member Nations and candidates are nevertheless expected to honour its contents. *(Informally agreed ad ref)*

3. The Code does not amend the Basic Texts and, in case of any ambiguity or inconsistency, the Basic Texts prevail. *(Informally agreed ad ref)*

III. GENERAL PRINCIPLES

4. The entire election process, including electoral campaign activities, should be guided by the Basic Texts, relevant decisions of the Conference, and the following principles:

- fairness,
- equity,
- openness and transparency,
- sovereignty,
- good faith,
- dignity, mutual respect, and moderation,
- non-discrimination, and
- merit. *(Informally agreed ad ref)*

---

1 CL 162/REP, paragraph 7; CL 163/2 paragraphs 6-8; CL 163/REP, paragraph 12; CL 164/2 paragraphs 8-11; CL 164/REP, paragraph 20 (a); CL 165/REP, paragraph 23 (a); CL 166/REP, paragraph 42; C 2021/REP, paragraph 71; CL 167/REP, paragraph 11 (b); CL 168/REP, paragraph 34; CL 170/REP, paragraph 49; CL 171/REP, paragraphs 46 and 47.
5. Member Nations and the FAO Secretariat should make this Code publicly known and easily accessible, including through relevant channels of communication of the Organization, such as the FAO Members Gateway. (Informally agreed ad ref)

IV. RIGHTS, OBLIGATIONS AND RESPONSIBILITIES

6. Member Nations recognize the rights, obligations, and authorities established in the Basic Texts and decisions of the Conference. (Informally agreed ad ref)

7. The Code does not amend the Basic Texts that constitute the sole references governing election processes at FAO. (Informally agreed ad ref)

8. The Code applies to the voting procedures or proceedings during the election of the FAO Director-General. (Informally agreed ad ref)

   A. Members and Candidates

9. Member Nations acknowledge that the process for the election of the Director-General, more specifically with regard to the voting procedure, should be fair, open, transparent, and equitable. (Informally agreed ad ref)

   B. Employees of FAO

10. Employees of FAO, especially those involved in supporting the voting procedures, have the duties and obligations under Article VIII of the Constitution, to respect the principles of integrity, impartiality, and independence with respect to all candidates for the post of Director-General of FAO. (Informally agreed ad ref)

11. The same employees of FAO are also subject to obligations under the Staff Regulations and the Standards of Conduct for the International Civil Service, including obligations of confidentiality. (Informally agreed ad ref)

12. Any actions or behaviour inconsistent with the above-mentioned obligations should be addressed in accordance with the administrative rules and procedures, including disciplinary procedures, applicable to the employee concerned. (Informally agreed ad ref)

V. THE VOTE

13. Member Nations should abide strictly by the Basic Texts and should respect the integrity, legitimacy, and dignity of the voting proceedings. As such, delegates and candidates should avoid behaviours and actions, both inside and outside the plenary hall that could be perceived as aiming at influencing the outcome of the voting proceedings. (Informally agreed ad ref)

14. An Elections Officer will be appointed by the Director-General for the Conference Session who is responsible for ensuring adherence to the provisions of the Basic Texts during the voting and electoral procedure (GRO Rule XII, paragraph 16). (Informally agreed ad ref)

15. The Elections Officer and all FAO personnel involved in the voting procedure are subject to the obligations of impartiality, neutrality and confidentiality set out at paragraphs above. Any failure to adhere to these obligations will result in the initiation of administrative processes, which may include disciplinary processes. (Informally agreed ad ref)

   A. The complete Secrecy of the Ballot

16. Member Nations should respect the confidentiality of the proceedings and abide by the procedures to ensure the complete secrecy of the ballot. (Informally agreed ad ref)

17. They should refrain from communicating or broadcasting the proceedings during the conduct of the vote. (Informally agreed ad ref)
18. The Secretary-General should remind delegates of the importance of complete secrecy of the ballot and request them to refrain from any action which may tend to undermine the complete secrecy of the ballot, including the display of filled ballot papers during the conduct of the vote. The Secretary-General should also remind all those responsible for the supervision of any vote by complete secret ballot of the requirement not to disclose to any unauthorized person any information which might tend, or be presumed to tend, towards destroying the complete secrecy of the ballot. (Informally agreed ad ref)

19. Voters should best leave their recording devices, including but not limited to cameras, mobile phones, or smartwatches, outside of the voting area or in the room where counting is conducted. (Informally agreed ad ref)

20. Any delegate or Secretariat employee participating in the supervision of the count of the vote should leave any electronic record devices outside the room or area where the count is to take place. This requirement may be enforced by any means deemed appropriate by the Elections Officer. (Informally agreed ad ref)

21. The above measures are without prejudice to any further arrangements that the Conference may consider necessary to ensure that the results of ballots remain undisclosed until the formal announcement of the outcome of the ballot. (Informally agreed ad ref)

B. Arrangements for voting, transparency of the vote

22. Access to the voting area will be limited to tellers, scrutineers, electors, and Secretariat employees who are directly involved in supporting the electoral process. (Informally agreed ad ref)

1. Voting Booths

23. As provided in Rule XII, paragraph 10(e), one or more voting booths shall be set up, supervised in such a manner as to ensure complete secrecy of the ballot. (Informally agreed ad ref)

24. The voting area should be arranged, and be sufficiently separated from plenary or other accessible spaces so that observation of the votes being cast by those outside the voting area is prevented. (Informally agreed ad ref)

25. The booths in the voting area should be visible to representatives during the vote. (Informally agreed ad ref)

26. In accordance with established practice, and in light of its mandate to supervise and coordinate all preparatory work for Conference sessions under Rule XXIV, paragraph 5(c), the Council could make recommendations to the Conference on arrangements, including arrangements to ensure complete secrecy of the ballot, taking into consideration the other good practices and booths used in the broader UN System. (Informally agreed ad ref)

2. Tellers

27. The Chairperson of the Conference will appoint two tellers from among the delegates who are not parties directly interested in the election. The duties of the tellers are to supervise the balloting procedure, count the ballot papers, decide on the validity of a ballot paper in any case of doubt, and certify the result of each ballot (GRO Rule XII, paragraph 10(c). (Informally agreed ad ref)

28. The tellers should be chosen in a fair and impartial manner. Member Nations should not attempt to influence the teller selection. (Informally agreed ad ref)

29. The duties of the tellers should be considered independent and separate from their role as delegates or representatives, or their alternates. The tellers should perform their duties in a manner that is strictly impartial and neutral. They should refrain from any actions or behaviour which may influence electors to vote for or against a candidate. Tellers should not attempt to discover the intention or choice of an elector. (Informally agreed ad ref)
30. The tellers should have unimpeded access to the voting area and counting room at all times in order to visually confirm that proper procedures are followed. *(Informally agreed ad ref)*

31. Tellers should preserve the secrecy of the ballot and should not disclose the outcome of a ballot to any unauthorized person before the formal announcement of the results by the Chairperson. *(Informally agreed ad ref)*

32. At the beginning of the Conference, the tellers will be offered a briefing by the Secretariat on duties to be carried out. *(Informally agreed ad ref)*

### 3. Scrutineers

33. A candidate or a scrutineer appointed by a candidate may attend the count of the votes (GRO Rule XII, paragraph 10 (g)). Each candidate must provide the name of his/her scrutineer in advance of the Conference Session. *(Informally agreed ad ref)*

34. Candidates or scrutineers appointed by them may only observe the counting process. They do not take part in the count. *(Informally agreed ad ref)*

35. Candidates and scrutineers should preserve the secrecy of the ballot and should not disclose the outcome of the count to any unauthorized person before the formal announcement of the results by the Chairperson. *(Informally agreed ad ref)*

### C. Casting and counting of the vote

36. The Chairperson of the Conference and the tellers shall satisfy themselves that the ballot box is empty and, having locked it, the tellers shall hand the key to the Election Officer. *(Informally agreed ad ref)*

37. Delegations shall be called in turn to cast their vote by the Secretary of the Conference, in the *English* alphabetical order of the names of the Member Nations. *(Informally agreed ad ref)*

38. When their names are called, delegations shall proceed to the voting area, receive the ballot paper and put their ballot paper in the ballot box. *(Informally agreed ad ref)*

39. To indicate the recording of each Member's vote, the Secretary of the Conference and one of the tellers shall sign or initial the list in the margin opposite the name of the Member in question. *(Informally agreed ad ref)*

40. At the conclusion of the calling, the Chairperson of the Conference shall declare the ballot closed and announce that the votes are to be counted. *(Informally agreed ad ref)*

41. In accordance with GRO Rule XII.10 (g) the tellers count the votes in the meeting in the presence and under the gaze of Member Nations. Should the tellers withdraw from the presence of the delegates or representatives in order to carry out the count of the votes, only the candidates or scrutineers appointed by the candidates may attend the count, but they shall not take part in the count, and the Conference may decide that the representatives of the Member Nations have the possibility to witness the counting virtually. *(Informally agreed ad ref)*

42. When the Elections Officer has opened the ballot box, the tellers shall check the number of envelopes. If the number is greater or less than that of the voters, the Chairperson of the Conference shall be informed and shall then declare the vote invalid and announce that it is necessary to re-open the ballot. *(Informally agreed ad ref)*

43. One of the tellers shall read aloud what is written on the ballot paper, and pass it to the other teller. The votes inscribed on the ballot papers shall be entered on lists prepared for that purpose. *(Informally agreed ad ref)*

44. When the counting of the votes is completed, the Chairperson of the Conference shall announce the results of the ballot in the following order:
• number of Member Nations entitled to vote at the Session;
• number absent;
• number of abstentions;
• number of invalid ballot papers;
• number of votes recorded;
• number of votes constituting the required majority;
• number of votes for the candidates and number of votes secured by each of them, in descending order of the number of votes. *(Informally agreed ad ref)*

45. The Chairperson of the Conference shall announce the decision resulting from the vote. *(Informally agreed ad ref)*

46. The lists on which the tellers have recorded the results of the vote shall, after signature by the Chairperson of the Conference, the Election Officer, and by the tellers, constitute the official record of the ballot, and shall be deposited in the archives of the Organization. *(Informally agreed ad ref)*

VI. VOLUNTARY ADHERENCE TO THE CODE

47. Member Nations and candidates are encouraged to observe and respect this Code. Personnel of the Secretariat are obliged to adhere to their contractual obligations, as set out *herein* in paragraph 16 above. *(Informally agreed ad ref)*

VII. REVIEW OF THE CODE

48. The Code and Procedures outlined in this code, including its application to other secret ballot elections, may be reviewed by the Conference upon request of the Council. *(Informally agreed ad ref)*