

A review of experiences of establishing emerging farmers in South Africa

Case lessons and implications for farmer support
within land reform programmes



A review of experiences of establishing emerging farmers in South Africa

Case lessons and implications for farmer support within land reform programmes

Prepared by:

Umhlaba in association with: **ARDRI** and **Phuhlisami**

The designations employed and the presentation of material in this information product do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of the Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (FAO) concerning the legal or development status of any country, territory, city or area or of its authorities, or concerning the delimitation of its frontiers or boundaries. The mention of specific companies or products of manufacturers, whether or not these have been patented, does not imply that these have been endorsed or recommended by FAO in preference to others of a similar nature that are not mentioned.

The views expressed in this information product are those of the author(s) and do not necessarily reflect the views of FAO.

ISBN 978-92-5-106490-0

All rights reserved. Reproduction and dissemination of material in this information product for educational or other non-commercial purposes are authorized without any prior written permission from the copyright holders provided the source is fully acknowledged. Reproduction of material in this information product for resale or other commercial purposes is prohibited without written permission of the copyright holders. Applications for such permission should be addressed to:

Chief

Publishing Policy and Support Branch

Office of Knowledge, Research and Extension

FAO

Viale delle Terme di Caracalla, 00153 Rome, Italy

or by e-mail to:

copyright@fao.org

© FAO 2010

FOREWORD

The Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (FAO) provides assistance to member countries in the formulation and analysis of their agricultural and rural development policies and related capacity building. In recognition of this role, the South African Department of Agriculture (DoA), signed a cooperation agreement with FAO in 2007. One of the two components of the project agreement (GCP/RAF/412/SAF) is designed to build Government capacity in providing effective support to emerging farmers. The second component intends to create a capacity for aid management in the Department of Agriculture.

At the end of Apartheid in 1994, eighty-six percent of South Africa's farmland was in the hands of the white minority, while over thirteen million black people lived in crowded former homelands under extreme poverty. Since 1994, the Government has embarked on a comprehensive land reform programme to address the racial imbalance in land holding and secure the land rights of the historically disadvantaged. The project is designed to assist the government in achieving its target of transferring 30 percent of the white commercial farms to formerly disadvantaged people by 2014 in an effective and sustainable manner.

The project agreement envisages a set of normative activities as part of the capacity building effort at provincial and national levels for effective service delivery in support of the emerging farmers who have benefited from the land reform programme. In this context, FAO contracted the Umhlaba Consulting Group (Pty) Ltd. to undertake a review of experiences of emerging farmers and associated support programmes. The study, which was based on literature review and case studies of six farms, assessed land reform policy, examined the support programmes and their implementation, and documented experiences of the emerging case farms. Programmes reviewed included the Settlement Land Acquisition Grant (SLAG), the Land Re-distribution for Agricultural Development (LRAD) instrument, Farm Equity Schemes, Municipal Commonage Programmes, Land Restitution and the Comprehensive Agricultural Support Programme (CASP). Existing practices were reviewed and then compared with international best practice practices.

The findings of the review indicate that land and agrarian reform programmes demand a high degree of capacity among implementing and overseeing agencies. The report proposes a wide range of measures to improve the delivery of support services including: (i) rigorous selection of beneficiary farmers; (ii) design of appropriate policy incentives; (iii) improved coordination mechanisms among service providers; and (iv) enhanced access to technology, finance, farm management skills and market information.

It is hoped that the publication will provide valuable information to policy makers, service providers, farmers' organization and other stakeholders towards improving their contributions in the realization of the government's land reform objective.



Richard China
Director

Agriculture Policy and Resource Mobilization Division
Technical Cooperation Department

AUTHOR OUTLINES

Umhlaba Consulting Group:

Jonathan Denison	An agricultural water expert with a background in smallholder irrigation, rainwater harvesting and rural development research. Project Director for the study.
Larry Field	Institutional and policy specialist with a background in land reform and integrated development planning. Director of the Umhlaba Group and responsible for case studies, analysis and recommendations.
Dr Luvuyo Wotshela	Environmental historian with specialization in South African land tenure and reform. Director of the Umhlaba Group and reviewer.
Prof Wim van Averbek	Professor in the Department of Crop Sciences and leader of the Centre for Organic and Smallholder Agriculture at the Tshwane University of Technology. Responsible for literature review, international comparison, analysis and recommendations.

Agricultural and Rural Development Research Institute (ARDRI)

Manyewu Mutamba	Agricultural economist and PhD fellow. Responsible for case studies, analysis and recommendations.
Dr Patrick Masika	Animal husbandry specialist and Director of the research institute.

Phuhlisani Solutions

David Mayson	Land reform and policy specialist. Partner of Phuhlisani Solutions. Responsible for case studies, analysis and recommendations.
--------------	---

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The project team that co-authored this report gratefully acknowledge FAO for funding the assignment and for guiding it through the consultation process. In particular, we thank Messrs Materne Maetz, Mulat Demeke, and Weldeghaber Kidane in Rome and the FAO Representative in South Africa, Ms Rosebud Kurwijila and the National Project Officer Ms Yolanda Ntlakaza. We are also grateful to Mr Brett Shapiro for his editorial work, and to Ms Ana Maria Galvan for formatting and finalizing the document for printing.

The National Department of Agriculture of the South African Government provided valuable policy direction from the start of the assignment under the energetic directorship of Messrs Mkhululi Mankazana and Joe Kgobokoe. The practical outcomes which are relevant to the Department's objectives in the future pilot phase of the assignment would not have been possible without their interest, wit and sharp critique.

Mr Chris Williams of the Non-governmental Organization, TRAC-MP, is thanked for his direct input to the Noku case study write-up.

The farmers and land reform beneficiaries of the six cases studies are gratefully acknowledged for their willingness to share their relevant knowledge and insights into how farmer support can be improved in the land reform context.

CONTENTS

FOREWORD	III
AUTHOR OUTLINES	IV
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	V
ACRONYMS	VIII
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	IX
1 Introduction	ix
2 Literature Review of Farmer Support Programmes	ix
3 Illustrative Case Studies	xi
4 Case Study Analysis	xiv
5 Recommendations for Best Practice	xvi
5.1 Beneficiary selection	xvi
5.2 Enterprise planning	xvi
5.3 Transfer planning and institutional design	xvii
5.4 Post-transfer service and support	xvii
5.5 International perspective on South African land reform and farmer support policy	xviii
6 Opportunities for the FAO-funded Pilot Programme	xviii
6.1 Current policy dynamics	xviii
6.2 Opportunity 1: Incubator approach using commonage, PLAS or communal land	xix
6.3 Opportunity 2: Identify and support farming project ‘Dynamizers’	xix
6.4 Opportunity 3: Agrarian Reform Coordinators	xix
6.5 Opportunity 4: Occupational training and accreditation for Agrarian Reform Coordinators	xx
6.6 Opportunity 5 : Development of the “One-stop Shop” concept	xx
MAIN REPORT	1
Main Report Contents	3
1 Introduction	5
2 Review of Farmer Support Programmes	7
3 Comparison of South African and International Land Reform Experiences	24
4 Case Summaries and Lessons	31
5 Case Analysis	59
6 Best practice findings	64
7 Opportunities for the FAO-supported Pilot Programme	75
REFERENCES	79

ACRONYMS

ABET	Adult Basic Education and Training
ABP	Area Based Planning
ARDRI	Fort Hare Rural Agricultural and Rural Development Research Institute
CASP	Comprehensive Agricultural Support Grant
CPA	Common Property Association
CPI	Communal Property Initiative
DALA	Department of Land Affairs - Mpumalanga Province
DLA	Department of Land Affairs
DoA	Department of Agriculture
EFA	Emerging Farmers Association
FES	Farm Equity Sharing
FAO	Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations
HDI	Historically Disadvantage Individuals
HOD	Head of Department
ICON	Iterative-Consultative Planning
IDP	Integrated Development Plan
LARP	Land and Agrarian Reform Project
LRAD	Land Re-distribution for Agricultural Development
MCP	Municipal Commonage Programme
MMMPP	Mpumalanga Management and Mentoring Pilot Programme
NGO	Non-governmental Organization
QCTO	Quality Council for Trades and Occupations
PDA	Provincial Department of Agriculture
PLAS	Pro-active Area-Based Planning
RDP	Rural Development Programme
SIS	Settlement and Implementation Support Strategy
SLAG	Settlement Land Acquisition Grant
SMME	Small and Medium Micro-enterprise
WESGRO	The Western Cape Investment and Trade Promotion Agency