

Pesticide residues in food 2008

**Joint FAO/WHO Meeting
on Pesticide Residues**

**FAO
PLANT
PRODUCTION
AND PROTECTION
PAPER**

193

REPORT 2008



**World Health
Organization**



**Food and Agriculture
Organization of
the United Nations**

Pesticide residues in food 2008

Joint FAO/WHO Meeting
on Pesticide Residues

FAO
PLANT
PRODUCTION
AND PROTECTION
PAPER

193

Report of the Joint Meeting of the FAO Panel of Experts
on Pesticide Residues in Food and the Environment and
the WHO Core Assessment Group on Pesticide Residues
Rome, Italy, 9–18 September 2008

The designations employed and the presentation of material in this information product do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of the Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (FAO) concerning the legal or development status of any country, territory, city or area or of its authorities, or concerning the delimitation of its frontiers or boundaries. The mention of specific companies or products of manufacturers, whether or not these have been patented, does not imply that these have been endorsed or recommended by FAO in preference to others of a similar nature that are not mentioned.

ISBN 978-92-5-106113-8

All rights reserved. Reproduction and dissemination of material in this information product for educational or other non-commercial purposes are authorized without any prior written permission from the copyright holders provided the source is fully acknowledged. Reproduction of material in this information product for resale or other commercial purposes is prohibited without written permission of the copyright holders. Applications for such permission should be addressed to:

Chief

Electronic Publishing Policy and Support Branch

Communication Division

FAO

Viale delle Terme di Caracalla, 00153 Rome, Italy

or by e-mail to:

copyright@fao.org

© FAO 2009

CONTENTS

List of participants	iii
Abbreviations	ix
Use of JMPR reports and evaluations by registration authorities	xi
1. Introduction	1
1.1 Declaration of interest.....	2
2. General considerations	3
2.1 Comments from JMPR on a pilot process for JMPR to recommend maximum residue levels prior to national government registration	3
2.2 Comments on the “global assessment” of chlorantraniliprole in terms of its usefulness as a work-sharing tool for JMPR.....	4
2.3 A process to ensure the scientific robustness and transparency of retrospective analyses of toxicity data on pesticide chemicals	5
2.4 Comments on OECD Draft Guidance Document for Derivation of an Acute Reference Dose.....	6
2.5 Cumulative risk assessment for pesticide residues in food: activities of the European Food Safety Authority.....	7
2.6 Safety factors for acute C_{max} -dependent effects: specific considerations with respect to carbamates such as carbofuran.....	7
2.7 Transparency in the maximum residue level estimation process of the JMPR	11
2.8 Nature of residue data populations and methods for combining residue trial data sets....	29
2.9 Evaluation for follow-up crops	41
2.10 Selection of representative commodities when establishing commodity group MRLs	42
2.11 Proportionality of pesticide residue concentrations and application rates in supervised trials.....	43
3. Responses to specific concerns raised by the Codex Committee on Pesticide Residues (CCPR)	45
3.1 Carbaryl (008)	45
3.2 Lambda-Cyhalothrin (146).....	46
3.3 Flusilazole (165).....	47
3.4 Oxamyl 126).....	48
4. Dietary risk assessment for pesticide residues in foods	51
5. Evaluation of data for acceptable daily intake and acute dietary intake for humans, maximum residue levels and supervised trial median residue values	55
5.1 Azoxystrobin (229) (T, R)*.....	55
5.2 Bifenazate (219) (R).....	97
5.3 Boscalid (219) (R)	99
5.4 Buprofezin (173) (T, R)**	101
5.5 Carbofuran (096) (T).....	123
5.6 Chlorantraniliprole (230) (T, R)*	127
5.7 Chlorpropham (201) (R).....	145
5.8 Lambda-Cyhalothrin (146) (R)**	147
5.9 Cypermethrins (118) (R)**	169
5.10 Dimethoate (027) (R)	209
5.11 Diphenylamine (030) (R)	213

5.12	Ethoxyquin (035) (R)	215
5.13	Imidacloprid (206) (R)	217
5.14	Hexythiazox (176) (T)**	225
5.15	Malathion (049) (R)	231
5.16	Mandipropamid (231) (T, R)*	231
5.17	Methomyl (094) (R)	251
5.18	Profenofos (171) (T, R)**	255
5.19	Prothioconazole (232) (T, R)*	265
5.20	Spinetoram (233) (T, R)*	293
5.21	Spinosad (203) (R)	313
5.22	Spirotetramat (234) (T, R)*	315
5.23	Tebuconazole (189) (R)	341
5.24	Triazole fungicide metabolites (T).....	355
	1, 2, 4-Triazole.....	356
	Triazole alanine and triazole acetic acid.....	360
6.	Recommendations.....	365
6.1	General considerations	365
6.2	Evaluation of data for acceptable daily intake and acute dietary intake for humans, maximum residue levels and supervised trial median residue values	366
7.	Future work	367
Annex 1:	Acceptable daily intakes, short-term dietary intakes, acute reference doses, recommended maximum residue limits and supervised trials median residue values recorded by the 2008 Meeting	369
Annex 2:	Index of reports and evaluations of pesticides by the JMPR.....	383
Annex 3:	International estimated daily intakes of pesticide residues	395
Annex 4:	International estimates of short-term dietary intakes of pesticide residues	445
Annex 5:	Reports and other documents resulting from previous Joint Meetings of the FAO Panel of Experts on Pesticide Residues in Food and the Environment and the WHO Expert Groups on Pesticide Residues	489
Annex 6:	Livestock dietary burden.....	497
Annex 7:	Corrections to the Report of the 2007 Meeting	521
FAO Technical Papers	525

D, dietary risk assessment; R, residue and analytical aspects; T, toxicological evaluation.

* New compound

** Evaluated within the periodic review programme of the Code Committee on Pesticide Residues

LIST OF PARTICIPANTS**2008 JOINT FAO/WHO MEETING ON PESTICIDE RESIDUES****ROME, 9–18 SEPTEMBER 2008****FAO Members**

Dr Ursula Banasiak, Federal Institute for Risk Assessment, Thielallee 88-92, D-14195 Berlin, Germany

Tel.: (+49 30) 8412 3337; Fax: (+49 30) 8412 3008; E-mail: u.banasiak@bfr.bund.de

Professor Eloisa Dutra Caldas, University of Brasilia, College of Health Sciences, Pharmaceutical Sciences Department, Campus Universitário Darci Ribeiro, 70919-970 Brasília/DF, Brazil

Tel.: (+55 61) 3307 3671; Fax: (+55 61) 3273 0105; E-mail: eloisa@unb.br

Mr Stephen Funk, Health Effects Division (7509P), United States Environmental Protection Agency, 1200 Pennsylvania Avenue NW, Washington DC 20460, USA (*FAO Chairman*)

Tel.: (1 703) 305 5430; Fax: (1 703) 305 0871; E-mail: funk.steve@epa.gov

Mr Denis J. Hamilton, Principal Scientific Officer, Biosecurity Queensland, Department of Primary Industries and Fisheries, PO Box 46, Brisbane, QLD 4001, Australia

Tel.: (+61 7) 3239 3409; Fax: (+61 7) 3211 3293; E-mail: denis.hamilton@dpi.qld.gov.au

Mr David Lunn, Senior Programme Manager (Residues–Plants), Export Standards Group, New Zealand Food Safety Authority, PO Box 2835, Wellington, New Zealand (*FAO Rapporteur*)

Tel.: (+644) 463 2654; Fax: (+644) 463 2675; E-mail: dave.lunn@nzfsa.govt.nz

Dr Yukiko Yamada, Deputy Director-General, Food Safety and Consumer Affairs Bureau, Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries, 1-2-1 Kasumigaseki, Tokyo 100-8950, Japan

Tel.: (+81) 3 3502 8111 (ext. 4409), (+81) 3 3502 8095 (direct); Fax: (+81) 3 3502 0389; E-mail: yukiko_yamada@nm.maff.go.jp

WHO Members

Professor Alan R. Boobis, Experimental Medicine & Toxicology, Division of Investigative Science, Faculty of Medicine, Imperial College London, Hammersmith Campus, Ducane Road, London W12 0NN, England

Tel.: (+44 20) 7594 8605; Fax: (+44 20) 7594 7393; E-mail: a.boobis@imperial.ac.uk

Dr Les Davies, Chemical Review, Australian Pesticides & Veterinary Medicines Authority, PO Box E240, Kingston ACT 2604, Australia

Tel.: (+61 2) 6210 4765; Fax: (+61 2) 6210 4776; E-mail: les.davies@apvma.gov.au

Dr Vicki L. Dellarco, Health Effects Division, Office of Pesticide Programs (7501P), United States Environmental Protection Agency, 1200 Pennsylvania Avenue NW, Washington, DC 20460, USA (*WHO Rapporteur*)

Tel.: (+1 703) 305 1803; Fax: (+1 703) 308 4776; E-mail: Dellarco.Vicki@epa.gov

Professor Angelo Moretto, Department of Environmental and Occupational Health, University of Milan, International Centre for Pesticides and Health Risk Prevention, Luigi Sacco Hospital, Via Stephenson 94, 20157 Milan, Italy (*WHO Chairman*)

Tel.: (+39 02) 3568661; Fax: (+39 02) 38203163; E-mail: angelo_moretto@fastwebnet.it

Dr David Ray, Biomedical Sciences, University of Nottingham, Queens Medical Centre, Nottingham NG7 2UH, England

Tel.: (+44 115) 82 30138; Fax: (+44 115) 823 0142; E-mail: David.Ray@nottingham.ac.uk

Dr Roland Solecki, Chemical Safety Division, Management and Overall Assessment, Federal Institute for Risk Assessment, Thielallee 88-92, D-14195 Berlin, Germany

Tel.: (+49 188) 8412 3232; Fax: (+49 188) 8412 3894; E-mail: Roland.Solecki@bfr.bund.de

Dr Maria Tasheva, Consultant, National Service for Plant Protection, Ministry of Agriculture and Food, 17 Hristo Botev Bul. 1040 Sofia, Bulgaria

Tel.: (+359) 897 246 797; E-mail: maria.tasheva@doctor.bg

Secretariat

Mr Árpád Ambrus, Hungarian Food Safety Office, Gyali ut 2-6, 1097 Budapest, Hungary

(*FAO Temporary Adviser*)

Tel.: (+36 20) 209 6785; E-mail: ambrusadr@yahoo.co.uk, arpad.ambrus@mebih.gov.hu

Ms Catherine Adcock, Toxicological Evaluation Section 2, Health Effects Division II, Health Evaluation Directorate, Pest Management Regulatory Agency, 2720 Riverside Drive, AL 6605E Ottawa, Ontario K1A 0K9, Canada (*WHO Temporary Adviser*)

Tel.: (+1 613) 736-3547; Fax: (+1 613) 736 3489

Mr Kevin Bodnaruk, 26/12 Phillip Mall, West Pymble, NSW 2073, Australia (*FAO Editor*)

Tel: (+61 2) 94993833; Fax: (+61 2) 94996055; E-mail: akc_con@zip.com.au

Professor Zongmao Chen, Chairman of Codex Committee on Pesticide Residues, Academician, Chinese Academy of Engineering, Chinese Academy of Agricultural Sciences, No.9, Meilin Road, Hangzhou/Zhejiang 310008, P.R. China (*CCPR Chairman*)

Tel.: (+86 10) 64194246; Fax: (+86 571) 8665 0056; Email: zmchen2006@163.com

Dr Myoengsin Choi, International Programme on Chemical Safety, World Health Organization, 1211 Geneva 27, Switzerland (*WHO Staff Member*)

Tel.: (+41 22) 791 1523; Fax: (+41 22) 791 4848; E-mail: choim@who.int

Dr Ian Dewhurst, Pesticides Safety Directorate, Mallard House, King's Pool, 3 Peasholme Green, York YO1 7PX, England (*WHO Temporary Adviser*)

Tel.: (+44 1904) 455 890; Fax: (+44 1904) 455 711; E-mail: ian.dewhurst@psd.hse.gsi.gov.uk

Dr Ronald D. Eichner, 13 Cruikshank Street, Wanniasa ACT 2903, Australia (*FAO Temporary Adviser*)

Tel.: (+61 2) 629 62118; E-mail: eichners@internode.on.anet

Dr Yibing He, Department of Science and Education, Ministry of Agriculture, No. 11 Nong Zhan Guan Nanli, Chaoyang District, Beijing 100125, P.R. China (*FAO Temporary Adviser*)

Tel.: (+86 10) 641 92916; E-mail: heyibing@agri.gov.cn

Mr George Herndon, Deputy Director, Health Effects Division, Office of Pesticide Programs (7501P), US Environmental Protection Agency, 1200 Pennsylvania Avenue NW, Washington, DC 20460, USA (*FAO Temporary Adviser*)

Tel.: (+1 703)305-6362; Fax: (+1 703)305-5147; E-mail: Herndon.George@.epa.gov

Mr Makoto Irie, Plant Product Safety Division, Food Safety and Consumer Affairs Bureau, Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries, 1-2-1 Kasumigaseki, Chiyoda-ku, Tokyo 100-8950, Japan (*FAO Temporary Adviser*)

Tel.: (+81 3) 3502 5969; Fax: (+81 3) 3501 3774; E-mail: makoto_irie@nm.maff.go.jp

Dr D. Kanungo, Additional DG, Directorate General of Health Services, Ministry of Health and Family Welfare, West, Block No. 1, R.K. Puram, New Delhi, India (*WHO Temporary Adviser*)

Tel.: (91 11) 261 01 268; Fax: (91 11) 261 89 307; E-mail: dkanungo@nic.in

Dr Katerina Mastovska, Eastern Regional Research Center (ERRC), Agricultural Research Service (ARS), United States Department of Agriculture, 600 E. Mermaid Lane, Wyndmoor, PA 19038, USA (*FAO Temporary Adviser*)

Tel.: (1 215)233 6645; Fax:(1 215) 233 6642; E-mail: katerina.mastovska@ars.usda.gov

Dr Jeronimas Maskeliunas, Food Standards Officer, Joint FAO/WHO Food Standards Programme, Nutrition and Consumer Protection Division, Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations, Viale delle terme di Caracalla, 00153 Rome, Italy (*Codex Secretariat*)

Tel.: (+39 06) 57053967; Fax: (+39 06) 57034593; E-mail: Jeronimas.Maskeliunas@fao.org

Dr Heidi Mattock, 21 bis rue du Mont Ouest, 38230 Tignieu-Jamezieu, France (*WHO Editor*)

Tel.: (33) 4 7832 0758; E-mail: heidimattock@yahoo.com

Dr Douglas B. McGregor, Toxicity Evaluation Consultants, 38 Shore Road, Aberdour KY3 0TU, Scotland (*WHO Temporary Adviser*)

Tel.: (44 1383) 860901; E-mail: mcgregortec@btinternet.com

Dr Francesca Metruccio, Department of Environmental and Occupational Health, University of Milan, International Centre for Pesticides and Health Risk Prevention (ICPS), Luigi Sacco Hospital, Via Stephenson 94, 20157 Milan, Italy (*WHO Temporary Adviser*)

Tel.: (+39) 02 3568661; Fax: (+39) 02 38203163; E-mail: francesca.metruccio@icps.it

Dr Rudolf Pfeil, Toxicology of Pesticides and Biocides, Federal Institute for Risk Assessment, Thielallee 88-92, D-14195 Berlin, Germany (*WHO Temporary Adviser*)

Tel.: (+49 30) 8412 3828; Fax: (+49 30) 8412 3260; E-mail: rudolf.pfeil@bfr.bund.de

Dr Prakashchandra V. Shah, US Environmental Protection Agency (EPA), Mail Stop: 7505P, 1200 Pennsylvania Ave., N.W., Washington DC 20460, USA (*WHO Temporary Adviser*)

Tel.: (+1 703) 308 1846; E-mail: Shah.PV@epa.gov

Mr Christian Sieke, Federal Institute for Risk Assessment, Thielallee 88-92, D-14195 Berlin, Germany (*FAO Temporary Adviser*)

Tel.: (49 1) 88 8412 3336; Fax: (49 1) 88 8412 3008; E-mail: c.sieke@bfr.bund.de

Ms Yong Zhen Yang, FAO Joint Secretary, Plant Protection Service (AGPP), Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (FAO), Viale delle Terme di Caracalla, 00153 Rome, Italy (*FAO Joint Secretary*)

Tel.: (+39 06) 5705 4246; Fax: (+39 06) 5705 6347 / 3224; E-mail: YongZhen.Yang@fao.org

Dr. Midori Yoshida, Section Chief, Division of Pathology, Biological Safety Research Center, National Institute of Health Sciences, Ministry of Health, Labour and Welfare, 1-18-1 Kamiyoga, Setagaya-ku, Tokyo 158-8501 Japan (*WHO Temporary Adviser*)

Tel.: (+81) 3 3700 9821; Fax: (+81) 3 3700 1425; E-mail: midoriy@nihs.go.jp

Dr Angelika Tritscher, WHO Joint Secretary, International Programme on Chemical Safety, World Health Organization, 1211 Geneva 27, Switzerland (*WHO Joint Secretary; unable to attend*)

Tel.: (41 22) 791 3569; Fax: (41 22) 791 4848; E-mail: tritschera@who.int

Dr Gerrit Wolterink, Centre for Substances & Integrated Risk Assessment, National Institute of Public Health and the Environment (RIVM), Antonie van Leeuwenhoeklaan 9, PO Box 1, 3720 BA Bilthoven, Netherlands (*WHO Temporary Adviser*)

Tel.: (+31 30) 274 4531; Fax: (+31 30) 274 4475; E-mail: Gerrit.Wolterink@rivm.nl

Dr Jürg Zarn, Swiss Federal Office of Public Health, Food Toxicology Section, Stauffacherstrasse 101, CH-8004 Zurich, Switzerland (*WHO Temporary Adviser*)

Tel.: (41 43) 322 21 93; Fax: (41 43) 322 21 99; E-mail: Juerg.Zarn@bag.admin.ch

ABBREVIATIONS

ADI	acceptable daily intake
ai	active ingredient
ALP	alkaline phosphatase
ALT	alanine aminotransferase
ARfD	acute reference dose
AST	aspartate aminotransferase
AUC	area under the curve for concentration–time
BBCH	derives from B iologische B undesanstalt, B undessortenamt and C hemical industry
BMDL ₁₀	benchmark-dose lower 95% confidence level
bw	body weight
CAS	Chemical Abstracts Service
CCFAC	Codex Committee on Food Additives and Contaminants
CCN	Codex classification number (for compounds or commodities)
CCPR	Codex Committee on Pesticide Residues
C _{max}	maximum concentration
CV	co-efficient of variation
dw	dry weight
EC ₅₀	the concentration of agonist that elicits a response that is 50% of the possible maximum
F ₀	parental generation
F ₁	first filial generation
F ₂	second filial generation
FAO	Food and Agricultural Organization of the United Nations
FOB	functional observational battery
GAP	good agricultural practice
GC	gas chromatography
GC-NPD	gas chromatography coupled with Nitrogen-Phosphorous detector
GGT	gamma-glutamyltransferase
GEMS/Food	Global Environment Monitoring System–Food Contamination Monitoring and Assessment Programme
GPC	gel permeation chromatography
HR	highest residue in the edible portion of a commodity found in trials used to estimate a maximum residue level in the commodity
HR-P	highest residue in a processed commodity calculated by multiplying the HR of the raw commodity by the corresponding processing factor
IC ₅₀	concentration required to inhibit activity by 50%
IEDI	international estimated daily intake
IESTI	international estimate of short-term dietary intake
ISO	International Organization for Standardization

IUPAC	International Union of Pure and Applied Chemistry
JECFA	Joint Expert Committee on Food Additives
JMPR	Joint Meeting on Pesticide Residues
JMPS	Joint FAO/WHO Meeting on Pesticide Specifications
LC	liquid chromatography
LC ₅₀	median lethal concentration
LD ₅₀	median lethal dose
LOAEL	lowest-observed-adverse-effect level
LOAEC	lowest-observed-adverse-effect concentration
LOD	limit of detection
LOQ	limit of quantification
MCH	mean corpuscular haemoglobin
MCV	mean corpuscular volume
MEQ	methylethoxyquin
mrl	maximum residue level
MRL	maximum residue limit
MS	mass spectrometry
MS/MS	tandem mass spectrometry
NAFTA	North American Free Trade Agreement
NOAEL	no-observed-adverse-effect level
OECD	Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development
PPAR α	peroxisome proliferator-induced receptor alpha
PHI	pre-harvest interval
ppm	parts per million
SPE	solid phase extraction
STMR	supervised trials median residue
STMR-P	supervised trials median residue in a processed commodity calculated by multiplying the STMR of the raw commodity by the corresponding processing factor
T3	triiodothyronine
T4	thyroxine
TRR	total radiolabelled residue
TSH	thyroid stimulating hormone
TMDI	theoretical maximum daily intake
WHO	World Health Organization

USE OF JMPR REPORTS AND EVALUATIONS BY REGISTRATION AUTHORITIES

Most of the summaries and evaluations contained in this report are based on unpublished proprietary data submitted for use by JMPR in making its assessments. A registration authority should not grant a registration on the basis of an evaluation unless it has first received authorization for such use from the owner of the data submitted for the JMPR review or has received the data on which the summaries are based, either from the owner of the data or from a second party that has obtained permission from the owner of the data for this purpose.