



**JOINT FAO/WHO FOOD STANDARDS PROGRAMME
EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE OF THE CODEX ALIMENTARIUS COMMISSION**

Eighty-sixth Session

FAO headquarters, Rome, Italy

1 – 5 July 2024

CRITICAL REVIEW - PART I¹

1. Procedural background for the Critical Review

1.1 According to the *Procedures for the elaboration of Codex standards and related texts, Part 2, Critical review*, in the Codex Procedural Manual, “An ongoing critical review shall ensure that proposals for new work and draft standards submitted to the Commission for adoption continue to meet the strategic priorities of the Commission and can be developed within a reasonable period of time, taking into account the requirements and availability of scientific expert advice”. Furthermore, “The Commission decides, taking into account the outcome of the ongoing critical review conducted by the Executive Committee, that a standard should be elaborated and also which subsidiary body or other body should undertake the work”.

1.2 In line with this, CCEXEC is invited to critically review the work of the committees, taking into account the recommendations of the Secretariat and the comments of the Chairpersons to:

- review standards and related texts submitted to the Commission for adoption;
- monitor the progress of standards development; and
- review proposals for new work or revision of standards.

2. Examining proposed standards before submission to the Commission for adoption

2.1 The critical review process shall ensure that draft standards submitted to the Commission for adoption have been fully considered at committee level. The Executive Committee examines proposed standards from Codex committees before they are submitted to the Commission for adoption:

- for consistency with the mandate of Codex, the decisions of the Commission, and existing Codex texts;
- to ensure that the requirements of the endorsement procedure have been fulfilled, where appropriate;
- for format and presentation; and
- for linguistic consistency.

3. Monitoring progress of standards development

3.1 The Executive Committee reviews the status of development of draft standards against the timeframe agreed by the Commission and shall report its findings to the Commission. CCEXEC may propose an extension of the timeframe; cancellation of work; or propose that the work be undertaken by a committee other than the one to which it was originally entrusted, including via the establishment of a limited number of subsidiary bodies, if appropriate.

3.2 *Criteria to facilitate the conduct of monitoring progress of standards development²*

¹ This document addresses the Codex committees that held sessions during January-March 2024

² CCEXEC58 (2006)

3.2.1 When progress on a standard is delayed due to the need for scientific advice, the Executive Committee could encourage FAO and WHO to schedule an expert consultation to provide such advice in a timely manner, and recommend suspension of work until such time as scientific advice became available;

3.2.2 When scientific advice has been provided and a standard has been under consideration for more than five years, the Executive Committee should urge the committee concerned to take action within a specified timeframe;

3.2.3 When an item has been considered for several sessions without any progress and there is no prospect of reaching consensus, the Executive Committee could propose suspension of work at a particular step in the elaboration procedure for a specified period of time or discontinuation of work, or corrective action to be taken to achieve progress, fully taking into consideration the information provided by the subsidiary body concerned.

3.3 Discussion papers³

Discussion papers contribute to the workload of a committee and are important discussion tools for committees before requesting new work. A list of discussion papers is included for information purposes only, in order to present a complete view of the workload of each committee, but will not be discussed as such.

4. Proposals to undertake new work or to revise a standard

4.1 Prior to approval for development, each proposal for new work or revision of a standard shall be accompanied by a project document, prepared by the Committee or Member proposing new work or revision of a standard. The decision to undertake new work or to revise standards shall be taken by the Commission taking into account a critical review conducted by CCEXEC.

4.2 The critical review includes:

- Examination of proposals for development/revisions of standards, taking into account the “*Criteria for the establishment of work priorities*”, the strategic plan of the Commission, and the required supporting work of independent risk assessment;
- Identifying the standard setting needs of developing countries;
- Advice on the need for coordination of work between relevant Codex subsidiary bodies;
- Advice on establishment and dissolution of committees and task forces, including *ad hoc* cross-committee task forces (in areas where work falls within several committees); and
- Preliminary assessment of the need for expert scientific advice and the availability of such advice from FAO, WHO or other relevant expert bodies, and the prioritization of that advice.

4.3 The decision to undertake new work or revision of individual maximum residue limits for pesticides or veterinary drugs, or the maintenance of the *General Standard on Food Additives* (including methods of analysis and sampling), the *General Standard on Contaminants and Toxins in Food and Feed* (including methods of analysis and sampling), the Food Categorization System and the International Numbering System, shall follow the procedures established by the committees concerned and endorsed by the Commission.

5. Further development of the critical review

5.1 CCEXEC72⁴ welcomed a new structure for the critical review which consisted of one document instead of three documents and also agreed for the information to be delivered in instalments to ensure timely availability. CCEXEC72 also indicated that it would be useful to have more information and insights from the Chairpersons on committee work and that the Secretariat give more guidance to the Chairpersons as to the inputs needed to allow CCEXEC to be more effective in the critical review. The importance of maintaining a horizontal view of the work of committees and the interactions between committees was highlighted.

5.2 A slightly revised structure for the critical review of the work in Codex committees was piloted for the review undertaken by CCEXEC77 (2019). The revised structure aimed at improving readability and giving more prominence and emphasis on information and insights from the Chairpersons. As the feedback on the revised structure has been positive, this structure is being maintained.

5.3 The Codex Secretariat also examined the critical review as part of the regular review of Codex work management as presented to CCEXEC77 (2019) and CCEXEC78 (2020)⁵.

6. Structure of appendices

6.1 The work of the different committees is addressed in separate appendices.

³ CCEXEC63 (2009)

⁴ CCEXEC72 (2016), REP17/EXEC1, paragraphs 7-14

⁵ CX/EXEC 19/77/5; CX/EXEC 20/78/4

6.2 The structure of the appendices for each committee is as follows:

1. General information on the committee and session
2. Overall comments (Secretariat/Chairperson)
3. Status of work items (Overview)
4. Specific comments on individual work items (Secretariat/Chairperson)

7. List of appendices

Appendix 1: Codex Committee on Spices and Culinary Herbs, 7th Session (CCSCH7)

Appendix 2: Codex Committee on Fats and Oils, 28th Session (CCFO28)

Appendix 3: Codex Committee on Food Hygiene, 54th Session (CCFH54)

Appendix 1

1. General

Committee	Codex Committee on Spices and Culinary Herbs (CCSCH)		
Host	India	Chairperson	Dr Sudharshan
Session reported on	CCSCH7	29 January-2 February 2024	
Next Session	CCSCH8	TBC	
Report	<u>REP24/SCH</u>		

2. Overall comments

Secretariat's comments:

CCSCH7 was successfully convened as a physical session, the first time since the COVID-19 pandemic started. The session was well attended, with 31 Members present actively contributing to fruitful discussions and constructive decisions. The session was broadcast to increase accessibility.

The session was very productive. CCSCH7 consensually agreed to forward to CAC47 three standards, out of which one is a group standard (composed of three commodities under the broad group of dried or dehydrated fruits and berries), for final adoption, one standard for adoption at Step 5, and four new work proposals for approval. It is to be acknowledged that the originating countries of the new work proposals were well distributed and that seven countries and three regions will be represented as chairs and co-chairs of the proposed EWGs.

CCSCH7 responded to questions from CCMAS and CCFL regarding outstanding endorsement for some previous standards already adopted.

United States of America agreed to prepare a discussion paper for CCSCH8 on with availability of trade data for spices and culinary herbs, which causes the challenges in regard to development of new work proposals.

CCSCH will continue to work on the template for SCH standards. CCSCH7 deferred its consideration on this to CCSCH8 and encouraged active participation of Members and Observers.

Chairperson's comments:

CCSCH7 was successfully convened as a physical session after two successive virtual sessions due to the COVID-19 pandemic. The session was well attended and Members actively contributed to fruitful discussions and constructive decisions. Participation of many delegations from the LAC region has been the highlight of this session. The session was webcast for the first time to increase accessibility.

The session was very productive. CCSCH7 consensually agreed to forward to CAC47 three standards, out of which one is a group standard (comprising of three commodities under the broad group of dried or dehydrated fruits and berries) for final adoption. This is for the first time a group standard is elaborated by the Committee. Further, one standard is recommended for adoption at Step 5, and four new work proposals for approval. The new work proposals have come from Members of different regions of the world and seven countries and three regions will be represented as chairs and co-chairs of the proposed EWGs, which is in line with the principles of Codex- inclusiveness.

CCMAS and CCFL had raised some questions regarding endorsement for some previous standards already adopted. CCSCH7 prepared responses with the active participation of Members.

Availability of trade data for some spices and culinary herbs is sketchy, scanty or sometimes lacking, which causes challenges in the development of new work proposals. CCSCH7 discussed this, and United States of America agreed to prepare a discussion paper for CCSCH8 on this issue to facilitate further discussion and find way forward. CCSCH will continue to work on the template for SCH standards. CCSCH7 deferred its consideration on this to CCSCH8 and encouraged active participation of Members and Observers.

Participation of Members and Observers in the eWGs is still a matter of concern as very few Members take active part. Virtual meetings of eWGs have been more productive. CCSCH was established a decade back and the first session was held in February 2014. Overall accomplishment of CCSCH in the past decade (7 sessions) is very good. CCSCH has been learning from session to session and has capacity in solving problems and reaching compromises. CCSCH is relevant and has working relationship with the general subject committees as per the Procedural Manual.

3. Status of work items

Topic	Job Number	Target year	Recommendation of the Committee
For decision by the Commission			
1. Standard for spices derived from dried or dehydrated fruits and berries - small cardamom	N01-2021	CCSCH8	Adoption at Step 8
2. Standard for spices derived from dried or dehydrated fruits and berries - allspice, juniper berry, and star anise	N03-2021	CCSCH8	Adoption at Step 5/8
3. Standard for spices derived from dried or dehydrated roots, rhizomes and bulbs - turmeric	N02-2021	CCSCH8	Adoption at Step 5/8
4. Draft standard for spices derived from dried or dehydrated fruits and berries - vanilla	N03-2021	CCSCH8	Adoption at Step 5
5. New work proposal on a standard for sweet marjoram	-	CCSCH10	Approval
6. New work proposal on a standard for dried seeds-coriander	-	CCSCH10	Approval
7. New work proposal on a standard for large cardamon	-	CCSCH10	Approval
8. New work proposal on a standard for cinnamon	-	CCSCH10	Approval
For information			
9. Trade data availability for spices and culinary herbs	For consideration by CCSCH8		
10. Update to the template for SCH standards	For consideration by CCSCH8		
11. Endorsement by CCFL of the labelling provisions for country of origin and country of harvest in the Standard for Dried Floral Parts – Saffron, Paragraphs 10-11, Appendix II Part A	For consideration by CCFL48		

4. Specific comments

<p>1. Standard for spices derived from dried or dehydrated fruits and berries - small cardamom, Paragraph 30(i), Appendix III</p>
<p>Status and Secretariat's comments:</p> <p>The draft standard was adopted at Step 5 by CAC44 (2022). CCSCH7 focussed the discussions on outstanding issues and updated the draft standard accordingly. As cardamom is classified under the group dried fruits and berries in the grouping concept for SCH, the title was amended to: "Draft Standard for Spices in the Form of Dried or Dehydrated Fruits and Berries – Small Cardamom".</p> <p>The provisions for food additives and food labelling had been endorsed by CCFA53 and CCFL47, respectively. CCMAS42 had requested further information from CCSCH regarding methods of analysis. The updated methods of analysis together with the answers to CCMAS have been submitted for endorsement.</p> <p>Following a constructive discussion, CCSCH7 consensually agreed to forward the draft standard to CAC47 for final adoption at Step 8.</p> <p>The work is according to the envisaged timeframe and the format and presentation as well as language is according to Codex style.</p>
<p>Chairperson's comments:</p> <p>CCSCH is moving from elaborating individual standards to group standards and hence the group standards format is being applied for the small cardamom standard too. This work is well within the prescribed timeframe, and there were no major impediments or consensus issues.</p> <p>Participation of Members and Observers in the eWGs is still a matter of concern as very few Members take active part. Virtual meetings of eWGs have been productive. Active participation of Members from developing countries at CCSCH7 was the highlight of standard setting work for this standard.</p> <p>Following a constructive discussion, CCSCH7 consensually agreed to forward the draft standard to CAC47 for final adoption at Step 8.</p>
<p>2. Standard for spices derived from dried or dehydrated fruits and berries - allspice, juniper berry, and star anise, Paragraph 48(i), Appendix IV</p>
<p>Status and Secretariat's comments:</p> <p>The draft group standard had been adopted at Step 5 by CAC44 (2022). CCSCH7 focussed the discussions on outstanding issues and updated the draft standard accordingly.</p> <p>The provisions for food additives and food labelling had been endorsed by CCFA53 and CCFL47, respectively. CCMAS42 had requested further information from CCSCH regarding methods of analysis. The updated methods of analysis together with the answers to CCMAS have been submitted for endorsement.</p> <p>Following a constructive discussion, CCSCH7 consensually agreed to forward the draft group standard to CAC47 for final adoption at Step 8.</p> <p>The work is according to the envisaged timeframe and the format and presentation as well as language is according to Codex style.</p>
<p>Chairperson's comments:</p> <p>CCSCH is moving from elaborating individual standards to group standards and this is the first group standard that is elaborated by CCSCH. This work is well within the prescribed timeframe, and there were no major impediments or consensus issues.</p> <p>Participation of Members and Observers in the eWGs is still a matter of concern as very few Members take active part. Virtual meetings of eWGs have been productive.</p> <p>Following a constructive discussion, CCSCH7 consensually agreed to forward the draft group standard to CAC47 for final adoption at Step 8.</p>
<p>3. Standard for spices derived from dried or dehydrated roots, rhizomes and bulbs - turmeric, Paragraph 85(i), Appendix VI</p>
<p>Status and Secretariat's comments:</p> <p>CCSCH6 (2022) had returned the draft standard for turmeric to Step 2/3 for redrafting. The EWG had conducted three rounds of consultations, and an in-session working group (IWG) session was convened</p>

<p>during CCSCH7 to review all the comments received. CCSCH7 endorsed most of the proposed revisions and resolved the outstanding issues.</p> <p>Following a constructive discussion, CCSCH7 consensually agreed to forward the draft standard to CAC47 for final adoption at Step 5/8.</p> <p>The work is according to the envisaged timeframe and the format and presentation as well as language is according to Codex style.</p>
<p>Chairperson's comments:</p> <p>The draft standard for turmeric was revised twice and the EWG/IWG sessions were helpful in resolving all outstanding issues, and CCSCH7 consensually agreed to forward the draft standard for turmeric to CAC47 for final adoption at Step 5/8.</p> <p>CCSCH is moving from elaborating individual standards to group standards and hence the group standards format is being applied for this standard too. This work is well within the prescribed timeframe, and there were no major impediments or consensus issues.</p>
<p>4. Draft standard for spices derived from dried or dehydrated fruits and berries – vanilla, Paragraph 70(i), Appendix V</p>
<p>Status and Secretariat's comments:</p> <p>CCSCH6 (2022) had returned the draft standard to Step 2/3 for redrafting and separated it from the group standard⁶ for spices derived from dried or dehydrated fruits and berries - allspice, juniper berry, and star anise, which had been forwarded to CAC46 for adoption at Step 5.</p> <p>Following considerable discussion where most of the outstanding issues were resolved, CCSCH7 agreed to forward the draft standard for spices derived from dried or dehydrated fruits and berries - vanilla to CAC47 for adoption at Step 5.</p> <p>CCSCH7 furthermore agreed to establish an EWG to consider the outstanding items which include an alternate term for vanilla-caviar; provisions for food additives; labelling requirements for country of harvest; and which option to be used for the table on chemical characteristics in Annex I.</p> <p>In view of the complexity of this topic, CCSCH7 acknowledged the possibility of organizing a virtual working group meeting prior to CCSCH8 to facilitate extensive communication on the outstanding issues.</p> <p>The work is expected to be finalized on time (by CCSCH8).</p>
<p>Chairperson's comments:</p> <p>This is part of CCSCH's efforts to elaborate group standards. CCSCH6 (2022) had returned the draft standard to Step 2/3 for redrafting and separated it from the group standard for spices derived from dried or dehydrated fruits and berries - allspice, juniper berry, and star anise, which had been forwarded to CAC46 for adoption at Step 5.</p> <p>Following considerable discussion where most of the outstanding issues were resolved, CCSCH7 agreed to forward the draft standard for spices derived from dried or dehydrated fruits and berries - vanilla to CAC47 for adoption at Step 5.</p> <p>Labelling provisions for the country of harvest is still an unresolved issue, however, active participation of Members from developing countries in the physical meeting was the highlight of standard setting work for this standard.</p> <p>Participation of Members and Observers in the eWGs is still a matter of concern as very few Members take active part. Virtual meetings of eWGs have been productive.</p> <p>In view of the complexity of this topic, CCSCH7 acknowledged the possibility of organizing a virtual working group meeting prior to CCSCH8 to facilitate extensive discussion and resolving the outstanding issues.</p>
<p>5. New work proposal on a standard for sweet marjoram, Paragraph 93(i), Appendix VII</p>
<p>Status and Secretariat's comments:</p>

⁶ CCSCH5 (2021) agreed to submit for approval by CAC44 the proposal for new work for a Group standard for spices derived from dried or dehydrated fruits and berries focusing on the following four spices - allspice, juniper berry, star anise, and vanilla. This proposal was approved by CAC44 (2021).

The new work proposal which had been developed by Egypt, was discussed and slightly amended in an IWG. CCSCH7 was in agreement that the new work proposal on a standard for sweet marjoram should be forwarded to CAC47 for approval. An EWG chaired by Egypt will take on the new work.

The project document is according to the procedures and criteria outlined in the Codex Procedural Manual: Procedures for the elaboration of Codex standards and related texts, paragraph 12; Criteria for the establishment of work priorities; and Guideline on the application of the criteria for the establishment of work priorities (criteria applicable to commodities).

Chairperson's comments:

The project document on sweet marjoram was evaluated by an IWG against procedures and prioritization criteria outlined in the Codex Procedural Manual and after minor modifications, CCSCH7 was in agreement that the new work proposal on a standard for sweet marjoram should be forwarded to CAC47 for approval. An EWG chaired by Egypt will take on the new work.

6. New work proposal on a standard for dried seeds-coriander, Paragraph 93(ii), Appendix VIII

Secretariat's comments:

The new work proposal which had been developed by India, was discussed and slightly amended in an IWG. CCSCH7 was in agreement that the new work proposal on a standard for dried seeds-coriander should be forwarded to CAC47 for approval. An EWG chaired by India and co-chaired by Iran will take on the new work.

The project document is according to the procedures and criteria outlined in the Codex Procedural Manual: Procedures for the elaboration of Codex standards and related texts, paragraph 12; Criteria for the establishment of work priorities; and Guideline on the application of the criteria for the establishment of work priorities (criteria applicable to commodities).

Chairperson's comments:

The project document on coriander was evaluated by an IWG against procedures and prioritization criteria outlined in the Codex Procedural Manual and after minor modifications, CCSCH7 was in agreement that the new work proposal on a standard for coriander should be forwarded to CAC47 for approval. An EWG chaired by India and co-chaired by Iran will take on the new work.

7. New work proposal on a standard for large cardamon, Paragraph 93(iii), Appendix IX

Status and Secretariat's comments:

The new work proposal which had been developed jointly by Bhutan and Nepal, was discussed and slightly amended in an IWG. CCSCH7 was in agreement that the new work proposal on a standard for large cardamon should be forwarded to CAC47 for approval. An EWG chaired by Bhutan and co-chaired by Nepal and India will take on the new work.

The project document is according to the procedures and criteria outlined in the Codex Procedural Manual: Procedures for the elaboration of Codex standards and related texts, paragraph 12; Criteria for the establishment of work priorities; and Guideline on the application of the criteria for the establishment of work priorities (criteria applicable to commodities).

Chairperson's comments:

The project document on large cardamom was evaluated by an IWG against procedures and prioritization criteria outlined in the Codex Procedural Manual and after minor modifications, CCSCH7 was in agreement that the new work proposal on a standard for large cardamom should be forwarded to CAC47 for approval. An EWG chaired by Bhutan and co-chaired by Nepal and India will take on the new work.

8. New work proposal on a standard for cinnamon, Paragraph 93(iv), Appendix X

Status and Secretariat's comments:

The new work proposal which had been developed by Brazil, was discussed and slightly amended in an IWG. CCSCH7 was in agreement that the new work proposal on a standard for cinnamon should be forwarded to CAC47 for approval. An EWG chaired by Brazil and co-chaired by Indonesia, Iran, and Mexico will take on the new work.

The project document is according to the procedures and criteria outlined in the Codex Procedural Manual: Procedures for the elaboration of Codex standards and related texts, paragraph 12; Criteria for the establishment of work priorities; and Guideline on the application of the criteria for the establishment of work priorities (criteria applicable to commodities).

<p>Chairperson's comments:</p> <p>The project document was evaluated by an IWG against procedures and prioritization criteria outlined in the Codex Procedural Manual and after minor modifications, CCSC7 was in agreement that the new work proposal on a standard for cinnamon should be forwarded to CAC47 for approval. An EWG chaired by Brazil and co-chaired by Indonesia, Iran, and Mexico will take on the new work.</p>
<p>9. Trade data availability for spices and culinary herbs, Paragraph 92</p>
<p>Status and Secretariat's comments:</p> <p>CCSC7 recognizing the difficulty in obtaining sufficient disaggregated trade data for individual spices and culinary herbs to support new work proposals in this area, and agreed to discuss this matter further at CCSC8. The United States of America volunteered to prepare a discussion paper on this topic.</p>
<p>Chairperson's comments:</p> <p>CCSCH has compiled a non-exhaustive list of 130 spices and culinary herbs and availability of trade data for some of the spices and culinary herbs is sketchy, scanty or sometimes lacking, which causes challenges in the development of new work proposals. CCSC7 discussed this, and United States of America agreed to prepare a discussion paper for CCSC8 on this issue to facilitate further discussion and find a way forward.</p>
<p>10. Update to the template for SCH standards, Paragraphs 101(ii)</p>
<p>Status and Secretariat's comments:</p> <p>Due to time constraints, CCSC7 deferred its deliberations on the template to CCSC8. It was recognized that the template serve as a guidance document for use by EWGs, that it is a dynamic document, and that modifications could be made based on the unique nature of individual spices and culinary herbs characteristics. CCSC7 encouraged active participation of in all discussions of the template and urged timely provision of comments.</p>
<p>Chairperson's comments:</p> <p>The template for SCH standards serves as a guidance document for use by EWGs. It is a dynamic document, and modifications could be made based on the unique nature of individual spices and culinary herbs characteristics. Development of this document is important for the uniformity of reporting of standards developed by CCSC.</p>
<p>11. Endorsement by CCFL of the labelling provisions for country of origin and country of harvest in the Standard for Dried Floral Parts – Saffron, Paragraphs 10-11, Appendix II Part A</p>
<p>Status and Secretariat's comments:</p> <p>CCFL47 (2023) agreed to endorse all the labelling provisions in the Standard for Dried Floral Parts – Saffron except the country of origin (8.3.1) and the country of harvest (8.3.2) and refer the above two provisions to CCSC for reconsideration, and to request CCSC to clarify the distinction between country of origin and country of harvest, and provide the rationale why the provision for country of harvest should be mandatory and how such a declaration would be beneficial for fraud prevention. CCEXEC84 (2023) in its critical review encouraged CCSC7 to provide, as requested by CCFL, a clear rationale and robust justification for why the provision for country of harvest should be mandatory as this clarification was important in relation to the application of the <i>General Standard for the Labelling of Pre-packaged Foods</i> (CXS 1-1985) and should then be discussed at CCFL48.</p> <p>CCSC7 noted the definition for "country of origin" as contained in the <i>General Standard for the Labelling of Pre-packaged Foods</i> (CXS 1-1985) was generally broad and therefore applicable to all foods. CCSC7 further noted that there was no definition in Codex for "country of harvest". However, in the glossary of terms that CCSC had developed to facilitate its work, "harvest" is defined as the act or process of gathering agricultural crops. Based on this, the "country of harvest" is the country in which the gathering of the crops takes place. Even though the "country of origin" and the "country of harvest" may be the same for many herbs and spices, these are two different terms. CCSC7 agreed to forward the reply as contained in Appendix II Part A to CCFL.</p>
<p>Chairperson's comments:</p> <p>Spices and culinary herbs are a distinct group of plant products which are highly heterogeneous and cultivated under varied agro-climatic conditions across the globe. Some are cultivated in very specific agro-climatic conditions and this plays a major role in the unique chemical characteristics of these spices, thus</p>

country of harvest becomes important to some of these products. It may be necessary to consider some of these spices differently from others.

Even though the "country of origin" and the "country of harvest" may be the same for many herbs and spices, these are two different terms. CCSCH7 noted the definition for "country of origin" as contained in the *General Standard for the Labelling of Pre-packaged Foods* (CXS 1-1985) was generally broad and therefore applicable to all foods. CCSCH7 further noted that there was no definition in Codex for "country of harvest". After detailed discussion, CCSCH7 agreed to forward the reply as contained in Appendix II Part A to CCFL.

Appendix 2

1. General

Committee	Codex Committee on Fats and Oils (CCFO)		
Host	Malaysia	Chairperson	Dr Norrani Eksan
Session reported on	CCFO28	19-23 February 2024	
Next Session	CCFO29	February 2026	
Report	<u>REP24/FO</u>		

2. Overall comments

Secretariat's comments:

CCFO28 was successfully convened as a physical session, the first time since the COVID-19 pandemic started. The session was well attended, with 37 Members and 10 Observer Organizations present actively contributing to fruitful discussions and constructive decisions. The session was webcast to increase accessibility.

The session was highly productive. CCFO28 consensually agreed to forward to CAC47 for final adoption the revision of three standards, which include five new oils (avocado oil, camellia seed oil, sacha inchi oil, and high oleic acid soya bean oil in the *Standard for Named Vegetable Oils* (CXS 210-1999), and Calanus oil in the *Standard for Fish Oils* (CXS 329-2017) as well as the longstanding work on revision of the *Standard for Olive Oils and Olive Pomace Oils* (CXS 33-1981). CCFO28 also agreed to submit to CAC47 for adoption the amendments/revisions to the *Code of Practice for the Storage and Transport of Edible Fats and Oils in Bulk* (CXC 36-1987). Furthermore CCFO28 agreed to forward for approval by CAC46 two new work proposals; one to address ways of reducing industrial trans fatty acids (TFAs) and eliminating partially hydrogenated oils (PHOs) from foods, respectively, substances which can contribute to noncommunicable diseases (NCDs), and the second one to develop a standard for microbial omega-3 oils, which is the first time an oil of microbial source has been considered and contributes to the CAC deliberations on new food sources and production systems.

Chairperson's comments:

CCFO28 was held 28 months after its previous session and came with a heavy agenda including 3 works which were due for completion, i.e. inclusion of avocado oil and high oleic acid soya bean oil (HOSO) in CXS 210-1999 as well as revision of the *Standard for Olive Oils and Olive Pomace Oils* (CXS 33-1981), which had been ongoing since 2017. While HOSO is new work, the other two are works for which the timeline had been extended and which have undergone extensive discussion, which triggered an urgency to bring them to conclusion.

Tremendous effort has been placed by the Chairperson, Codex Secretariat, CCFO Secretariat and the EWG Chairs intersessionally to ensure significant progress was made and work could advance at CCFO28.

CCFO28 was one of the most productive sessions where six works were concluded and forwarded to CAC47 for final adoption i.e. inclusion of new oils or revision of avocado oil, HOSO, sacha inchi oil, camellia seed oils (all to be included in the the *Standard for Named Vegetable Oils* [CXS 210-1999]), calanus oil (to be included in *Standard for Fish Oils* (CXS 329-2017) and olive oils and olive pomace oils (*Standard for Olive Oils and Olive Pomace Oils* [CXS 33-1981]) into their respective standards. Two new work proposals were agreed and submitted to CAC47 for approval.

CCFO28 back in physical mode, I believe was a great factor that enabled active and continuous discussions among Members and Observers, also for the top table to analyse the situation in real time. I personally appreciated the efforts made by Members and Observers in having discussion, after discussions, on issues of interest and using all possible means to encourage consensus building during the session. At the same time, the options to follow webstreaming (listening mode only) allowed interested parties to listen to the plenary. The acknowledgement that Members may propose revisions to be considered at future sessions of CCFO as new data becomes available, has enabled CCFO28 to conclude work based on what is at hand.

For the first time, CCFO28 was able to implement fully its better management approach for new work proposals for which an IWG was held to review the new work proposals received. This IWG task had been undertaken by the CCFO Secretariat at CCFO27 due to the virtual mode of CCFO27.

3. Status of work items

Topic	Job number	Target year	Recommendation of the Committee
For decision by the Commission			
1. Revision to the <i>Standard for Named Vegetable Oils</i> (CXS 210-1999): Inclusion of avocado oil	N12-2017	CCFO28	Adoption at Step 8
2. Amendment/revision of the <i>Standard for Named Vegetable Oils</i> (CXS 210-1999): <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Inclusion of camellia seed oil - Inclusion of sacha inchi oil - Inclusion of high oleic acid soya bean oil 	N01-2022 N02-2022 N03-2022	CCFO29 CCFO29 CCFO29	Adoption at Step 5/8
3. Revision to the <i>Standard for Olive Oils and Olive Pomace Oils</i> (CXS 33-1981): Revision of Sections 3, 8 and Appendix	N11-2022	CCFO28	Adoption at Step 5/8
4. Amendment/revision to the <i>Standard for Fish Oils</i> (CXS 329-2017): Inclusion of Calanus oil	N04-2022	CCFO29	Adoption at Step 5/8
5. Amendments to the labelling provisions for non-retail containers in the six existing fats and oils standards (CXS 19-1981; CXS 33-1981; CXS 210-1999; CXS 211-1999; CXS 256-1999; and CXS 329-2017)	-	-	Adoption
6. Amendments/Revisions to the <i>Code of Practice for the Storage and Transport of Edible Fats and Oils in Bulk</i> (CXC 36-1987) and associated data needs	-	-	Adoption
7. New work on the proposed revision to Codex standards on fats and oils to reduce trans-fatty acid intake	-	-	Approval
8. New work on a standard for microbial omega-3 oils	-	-	Approval

4. Specific comments

<p>1. Revision to the <i>Standard for Named Vegetable Oils (CXS 210-1999)</i>: Inclusion of avocado oil, Paragraph 44, Appendix V</p>
<p>Status and Secretariat's comments:</p> <p>CAC45 (2022) adopted the draft standard at Step 5 and approved the extension of the the timeline of the work to CCFO28. CCFO28 focussed the discussions on outstanding issues and updated the draft standard accordingly.</p> <p>Several Members noted that new data were emerging to indicate that further changes to some provisions may be needed in future sessions of CCFO, to better reflect the composition of authentic avocado oil from new growing regions.</p> <p>Following a constructive discussion, CCFO28 consensually agreed to forward the draft standard to CAC47 for final adoption at Step 8.</p> <p>The work was completed within the envisaged timeframe and the format and presentation as well as language is according to Codex style.</p>
<p>Chairperson's comments:</p> <p>CCFO28 had resolved all the outstanding issues and successfully concluded the draft standard for avocado oil. Noting that new data on avocado oil will become available from time to time as well as potential unique parameter that could be used to authenticate avocado oil, CCFO28 agreed that Members should continue to collect data and may propose revisions to be considered at future sessions of CCFO.</p>
<p>2. Amendment/revision of the <i>Standard for Named Vegetable Oils (CXS 210-1999)</i>: Inclusion of camellia seed oil, sacha inchi oil, and high oleic acid soya bean oil, Paragraphs 51, 55 and 62, Appendices VI, VII and VIII</p>
<p>Status and Secretariat's comments:</p> <p>The inclusion of these three (3) oils in CXS 210-1999 was approved as new work by CAC45 (2022). EWGs were established to prepare the proposed draft provisions for comments and consideration by CCFO28. CCFO28 endorsed most of the proposals by the respective EWGs, and made a minor change to include <i>C. japonica</i> in the definition of camellia seed oil as raised during the plenary.</p> <p>Following constructive discussions, CCFO28 consensually agreed to forward the proposed draft provisions for the three (3) oils to CAC47 for final adoption at Step 5/8.</p> <p>The work was completed within the envisaged timeframe and the format and presentation as well as language is according to Codex style.</p>
<p>Chairperson's comments:</p> <p>These three vegetable oils are produced in a limited number of countries. However, data have shown that they are traded internationally. A series of discussions held with the EWG Chair of all the three works enabled exchange with the Chair on concerns or proposals raised by Members and consideration on how work could be advanced. The EWG Chairs took into consideration Members' inputs during the EWG discussions as well as written comments as appropriate.</p> <p>For camellia seed oil, CCFO28 agreed to the addition of <i>C. japonica</i> as one of the sources of camellia seed oil noting that data on essential composition and quality factors from this source could be provided in the future.</p> <p>CCFO28 managed to conclude these three works in one CCFO session and forward the amendment/revision to CAC47 for final adoption.</p>
<p>3. Revision to the <i>Standard for Olive Oils and Olive Pomace Oils (CXS 33-1981)</i>: Revision of Sections 3, 8 and Appendix I, Paragraph 85(i), Appendix IX</p>
<p>Status and Secretariat's comments:</p> <p>CCFO27 (2021) had retained all provisions in Sections 3, 8 and Appendix I at Step 4, for which CCFO and the EWG had reached consensus for consideration by CCFO28.</p> <p>This was a complex topic which attracted considerable discussion. Several outstanding issues were discussed and resolved with consensus reached through compromise. CCFO28 agreed to forward the <i>Standard for Olive Oils and Olive Pomace Oils (CXS 33-1981)</i> with revisions to Sections 3, 8 and Appendix I</p>

to CAC47 for adoption at Step 5/8, and seek endorsement from CCMAS43 on the revised methods of analysis for olive oils and olive pomace oils.

There was however a lack of consensus on the provisions related to 1,2-diglycerides (DAGs) and Pyropheophytin "a" (PPP), which were proposed to be included as additional Sections 1.5 and 1.6 under Section 1 (Quality characteristics) of Appendix I on Other quality and composition factors. Therefore, CCFO28 agreed to delete these provisions from the revised Appendix, but establish an EWG to collect and assess global scientific data and information for olive oil on individual samples, and to recommend to CCFO29 on the need and process for further analysis of the data. However the methods for the analysis of DAGs and PPP were retained in Section 8 and the Appendix, noting that these would support the generation of data for olive oil and olive pomace oil produced in different geographical and climatic regions that would support the further consideration of these parameters by CCFO30. While CCFO acknowledged that methods should only be forwarded to CCMAS when there was an associated provision, Members strongly recommended that these methods be included in the standard to promote the use of these specific methods in generating comparative data.

In light of the need to elaborate a standard that embraces olive oils and olive pomace oils produced in different geographical areas and taking into account the impact of climate change on the composition of olive oil produced in different geographical regions, CCFO28 agreed to request an extension of the project timeline to CCFO30 to complete the further work relating to ordinary olive oils (as agreed at CCFO27), and DAGs and PPP (as agreed at CCFO28).

Chairperson's comments:

This was one of the toughest agenda items at CCFO28. The revision was approved as new work in 2017, and the work was scheduled to be completed by CCFO27 (2021). However, due to its complexity and views expressed on this significant work i.e to consider compositional differences of olive oil coming from geographically different regions and grown under different climatic conditions, while at the same time not compromising its authenticity and ensuring the standard adequately reflected all genuine olive oil, CAC44 (2021) agreed to CCFO27's proposal to extend the timeline for another CCFO session (i.e. CCFO28).

An EWG had been established, chaired by Spain and co-chaired by Argentina to review and revise pending items in Section 3, Section 8, and the Appendix. Since there was no consensus in the EWG on several items, an IWG was held at CCFO28 as an attempt to reach a decision on these items. However, not much progress was made in the IWG. Interested countries showed willingness to conclude the work when informal meetings of interested countries were held after the IWG to further negotiate and allow for compromise. CCFO28 allocated sufficient time for discussion on this agenda item including discussions at the margins of the plenary, and these efforts finally resulted in agreement during the plenary.

I am honoured to have witnessed the process and its success, as an outcome from compromises shown by Codex Members. However, one Member country expressed its reservation to the decision on the decision tree (footnote c) related to delta-7-stigmastenol level and might raise this concern at CAC47.

CCFO28 also identified the need for collection and analysis of data for assessment of the suitability of some parameters in CXS 33-1981, and as such, extension of the project timeline to CCFO30 is requested from CCEXEC. CCFO will continue to consider the proposal for inclusion of DAGs and PPP as well as the status for ordinary virgin olive oil, which will be decided during CCFO30. Reference to ordinary olive oil remains in the standard until further discussion at CCFO30 and are clearly identifiable with associated footnotes.

4. Amendment/revision to the *Standard for Fish Oils (CXS 329-2017)* - Inclusion of Calanus oil, Paragraph 103, Appendix X

Status and Secretariat's comments:

The inclusion of Calanus oil in the standard was approved as new work by CAC45 (2022). An EWG was established to prepare the draft revision of the standard for comments and consideration by CCFO28.

CCFO28 endorsed most of the proposed draft revisions, with the addition of safety-related provisions and labelling provisions on astaxanthin. Following a constructive discussion, CCFO28 consensually agreed to forward the revised standard to CAC47 for final adoption at Step 5/8, and to forward the methods of analysis (for determination of wax content in calanus oil) and labelling provision related to astaxanthin for endorsement by CCMAS and CCFL, respectively.

The work was completed within the envisaged timeframe and the format and presentation as well as language is according to Codex style.

This agenda item discussion as well as that on new work did lead to one Member highlighting the need for Codex to have a process in place for undertaking a safety assessment of new foods (see item 8 below).

<p>Chairperson's comments:</p> <p>Calanus oil is an oil that is new in many countries and thus data was provided by a limited number of Member countries. Concerns and proposals on an inclusion of safety-related provisions on astaxanthin and related labelling provisions when used as supplements, were raised at the plenary. CCFO28 noted that the standard applies to fish oils that are used in food and food supplements where those are regulated as foods, and it does not apply to foods or food supplements themselves.</p> <p>Nevertheless, to move forward after a constructive discussion on the scope of the standard, CCFO28 agreed to the inclusion of the related provisions, in which the maximum level and labelling provisions related to astaxanthin is in accordance with regulations of the country of retail sale.</p>
<p>5. Amendments to the labelling provisions for non-retail containers in the six existing fats and oils standards (CXS 19-1981; CXS 33-1981; CXS 210-1999; CXS 211-1999; CXS 256-1999; and CXS 329-2017), Paragraph 15(i), Appendix II</p>
<p>Status and Secretariat's comments:</p> <p>CAC44 (2021) adopted the <i>General Standard for the Labelling of Non-retail Containers of Foods</i> (CXS 346-2021) and the consequential amendment to the Procedural Manual. Further, commodity committees were requested to review the labelling provisions for non-retail containers in existing standards.</p> <p>CCFO28 considered the request and agreed to forward the amendments to the labelling provisions of non-retail containers in the six existing fats and oils standards to CAC47 for adoption, and inform CCFL accordingly.</p>
<p>Chairperson's comments:</p> <p>Consequential to the adoption of CXS 346-2021 and to align the provisions on non-retail containers in the commodity standards with this new relevant standard and related amendment to the Procedural Manual, CCFO28 agreed to the adoption of the draft amended text for provisions of labeling of non-retail containers in the six existing CCFO standards, while retaining some specific non-retail containers provision for crude fish oils and crude fish liver oils in the standard.</p>
<p>6. Amendments/Revisions to the Code of Practice for the Storage and Transport of Edible Fats and Oils in Bulk (CXC 36-1987) and associated data needs, Paragraphs 33(vi), 33(vii) and 118, Appendix III (Parts A and B)</p>
<p>Secretariat's comments:</p> <p>Discussions in CCFO28 covered two aspects; i) consideration of the outcome of the FAO/WHO JECFA90 and JECFA91 evaluations of 23 substances submitted by CCFO to JECFA for evaluation in 2015, and ii) the work of the EWG in relation to the review of Appendix 2 of CXC 36-1987 (List of Acceptable Previous Cargoes).</p> <p>Following a constructive discussion, CCFO28 took the following decisions:</p> <p>i) The outcome of the FAO/WHO JECFA90 and JECFA91</p> <p>As part of JECFA's evaluation outcomes, CCFO28 agreed to maintain 21 substances, delete one substance (Montan wax) and add one new substance from the list; revised criterion 2 (used for the determination if the substance is acceptable as an immediate previous cargo); and confirmed non-food-grade calcium lignosulfonate as the highest priority for re-evaluation by JECFA.</p> <p>ii) Review of Appendix 2 of CXC 36-1987 (List of Acceptable Previous Cargoes)</p> <p>CCFO28:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - agreed that foodstuffs should not need to be included in the List of Acceptable Previous Cargoes. - assigned CAS number to three substances: a) Fructose: 57-48-7; b) Hydrogen peroxide: 7722-84-1; and c) Urea ammonium nitrate solution (UAN): 15978- 77-5. - amended CXC 36-1987 to enhance understanding and the application of Appendices 2 and 3. <p>CCFO28 agreed to forward the the draft amendments to the <i>Code of Practice for the Storage and Transport of Edible Fats and Oils in Bulk</i> (CXC 36-1987) to CAC47 for adoption; and to request JECFA to undertake a re-evaluation of the acceptability of non-food-grade calcium lignosulfonate as a previous cargo noting that the necessary data were already available.</p> <p>CCFO28 also encouraged Members and Observers to collect data on impurities associated with acetic anhydride and cyclohexane for JECFA evaluation to facilitate review of the priority list, and on ammonium sulphate solution, wine iodine and urea for future consideration as previous cargoes.</p>

Chairperson's comments:

As CCFO does not always deal with JECFA assessments, the support from the JECFA Secretariat as well as the Representative of FAO at CCFO28 in providing clarification on the outcome of JECFA evaluation during CCFO28 was highly appreciated.

Out of the four substances that did not meet the criteria for acceptability as previous cargoes, CCFO28 agreed to request JECFA to undertake a re-evaluation on non-food-grade calcium lignosulfonate (highest priority) for its acceptability as a previous cargo, noting Member commitments on readily available data. Members were also encouraged to collect data indicated by JECFA as necessary to complete the assessment of acetic anhydride and cyclohexane and provide updates to future CCFO sessions to facilitate the revision of the priority list. In relation to Amendments/ Revisions to the *Code of Practice for the Storage and Transport of Edible Fats and Oils in Bulk* (CXC 36-1987), availability of necessary data is of particular importance to enable assessment on whether a substance is acceptable as previous cargo by CCFO or JECFA. Therefore, with regard to the other work on proposals on substances to be added to or removed from Appendix 2: List of Acceptable Previous Cargoes, CCFO28 agreed that the proposal for inclusion of new substances would only be considered after adequate and relevant information had been provided by Members. Hence, CCFO28 encouraged Members to start collecting required data as necessary on acetic anhydride and cyclohexane impurities, and provide updated data and information to future sessions of CCFO to facilitate the revision of the priority list. JECFA could not reach a conclusion on the safety of transporting these substances as a previous cargo until the nature and quantities of the impurities have been clarified.

Amendments to CXC 36-1987 were also made to enhance the understanding that Appendices 2 and 3 should always be read together as part of this COP when considering previous cargoes for the storage and transport of edible fats and oils in bulk.

7. New work on the proposed revision to Codex standards on fats and oils to reduce trans-fatty acid intake, Paragraph 124(i), Appendix XI

Status and Secretariat's comments:

The new work proposal, which had been prepared by Canada, was discussed and updated by the IWG before consideration by CCFO. CCFO28 was in agreement that the new work proposal on proposed revisions to Codex standards on fats and oils to reduce Trans-Fatty Acid intake should be forwarded to CAC47 for approval. An EWG chaired by Canada and co-chaired by Saudi Arabia will take on the new work.

The project document is according to the procedures and criteria outlined in the Codex Procedural Manual: Procedures for the elaboration of Codex standards and related texts, paragraph 12; Criteria for the establishment of work priorities; and Guideline on the application of the criteria for the establishment of work priorities (criteria applicable to commodities).

Chairperson's comments:

CCFO28 was able to implement fully its better work management approach for new work proposal as agreed at CCFO26 for the first time in which an IWG, chaired by the United Kingdom, was held to review the new work proposals.

Given the recommendation from the IWG that the proposal was complete and suitable for further consideration by the plenary and acknowledging the importance of reducing industrially produced TFAs (iTfAs) intake, CCFO28 agreed to forward to CAC47 for approval, the new work proposal as revised by CCFO28 to enable the new work to consider possible approaches to reduce iTfAs, referring to either prohibition of PHOs or limits on TFAs, or both.

8. New work on a standard for microbial omega-3 oils, Paragraph 132(i), Appendix XII

Status and Secretariat's comments:

The new work proposal which had been prepared by the Global Organisation for EPA and DHA omega3s (GOED), was discussed and slightly amended in an IWG. CCFO28 was in agreement that the new work proposal on a standard for microbial omega-3 oils should be forwarded to CAC47 for approval. An EWG chaired by the United States of America and co-chaired by China will take on the new work. However, concerns were raised on the need for Codex to put in place a mechanism to deal with requests for new work related to novel foods and production systems that address safety aspects and include necessary risk assessment.

The project document is according to the procedures and criteria outlined in the Codex Procedural Manual: Procedures for the elaboration of Codex standards and related texts, paragraph 12; Criteria for the

establishment of work priorities; and Guideline on the application of the criteria for the establishment of work priorities (criteria applicable to commodities).

Chairperson's comments:

The IWG concluded the proposal was complete and suitable for further consideration by the plenary with a note that the issue of a safety assessment of the microbial omega-3 oils raised in the IWG was referred to the plenary as it was not within the terms of reference of the IWG.

CCFO28 noted that microbial oil is considered a new commodity or novel food in some countries, and different countries have different authorization processes for these oils. Since there were some concerns voiced by some Members on the safety aspects of this new commodity, CCFO28 agreed that should there be a need for scientific advice on safety aspects, this could be identified in the course of elaborating the standard. This is reflected in the revised *Section 1 Purpose and the scope of the standard*, as well as the inclusion for potential need for expert advice in *Section 7* of the agreed project document.

Appendix 3

1. General

Committee	Codex Committee on Food Hygiene (CCFH)		
Host	USA	Chairperson	Dr Evelyne Mbandi
Co-host	Kenya	Co-Chairperson	Prof George Ooko Abong
Session reported on	CCFH54	11-15 March 2024	
Next Session	CCFH55	8-12 December 2025	
Report	<u>REP24/FH54</u>		

2. Overall comments

Status and Secretariat's comments:

CCFH54 was convened as a physical session, with webcast, in Nairobi, Kenya hosted by the USA and co-hosted by Kenya. The session was attended by 56 Member Countries, one Member Organization and 11 Observer Organizations. In order to facilitate the work of the plenary session, three physical working group meetings (PWGs) were held (with webcast) in conjunction with CCFH54. A virtual working group meeting on one of the agenda items had also been convened several weeks in advance of the session.

CCFH54 agreed to forward to CAC47 for final adoption: Annex II on Fresh Leafy Vegetables and Annex IV on Sprouts of the *Guidelines for the Control of Shiga Toxin-Producing Escherichia coli (STEC) in Raw Beef, Fresh Leafy Vegetables, Raw Milk and Raw Milk Cheeses, and Sprouts* (CXG 99-2023); Annex II on Milk and Milk Products of the *Guidelines for the Safe Use and Reuse of Water in Food Production and Processing* (CXG 100-2023); and the draft Guidelines for Food Hygiene Control Measures in Traditional Markets for Food. CCFH54 also agreed to forward to CAC47 for adoption at Step 5 the revision of the *Guidelines on the Application of the General Principles of Food Hygiene to the control of Pathogenic Vibrio Species in Seafood* (CXG 73-2010). Annex II on Fish and Fishery Products of CXG 100-2023 was returned to Step 2/3.

CCFH54 agreed to prioritize the work on alignment and integrate it into its work plan considering the CCFH53 agreed approach to initiate alignment of food hygiene texts with the revised *General Principles of Food Hygiene* (CXC 1-1969) following the recommendation of CAC45 (2022). CCFH54 also proposed as new work revision of three existing guidelines to make sure they are up-to-date with the latest scientific advice from JEMRA and aligned with CXC1-1969.

CCFH54 had an extensive agenda as two new work items were approved by CAC46 and it continued to work on some outstanding annexes to Guidelines it had developed at CCFH53 and which were adopted by CAC46. As a result, it was an intense session, but productive and benefitted from both the virtual and physical working groups convened in advance of the session as well as the opportunities for informal discussions afforded by an in-person meeting.

This session was co-hosted by Kenya and as a result convened in Nairobi. The session also had a new Chairperson, Dr Evelyne Mbandi, who on this occasion was supported by Co-Chairperson Professor George Ooko Abong. These changes brought some new energy to CCFH, while it continued to maintain its collaborative and productive approach. It is also noteworthy that there were numerous new delegates, including heads of delegations, and some long time delegates that indicated this was likely their last session. This highlights the importance of both Members and the Codex Secretariat continuing to make efforts to ensure that new delegates are well informed and are in a position to actively engage and support the work of CCFH. Notably, Members that had not led EWGs in the past stepped forward to act as Co-Chairs of newly established working groups.

The overall work in CCFH is generally on track, but an extension to the timeline to complete the annexes to the *Guidelines for the Safe Use and Reuse of Water in Food Production and Processing* (CXG 100-2023) will be required. CCFH continues to manage its workload through its forward work plan. The new work proposals considered by CCFH54 focussed on revision of existing texts based on scientific advice provided by JEMRA. This is important to ensure that Codex texts remain relevant to the current food hygiene challenges.

Chairperson's comments:

Great progress was made at CCFH54 in advancing documents for final adoption to CAC47. The commitment and collaboration of the delegates was evident by the outcome of the meeting as indicated above, and it is commendable. The assistance from the Codex Secretariat, CCFH Secretariat, leadership of the working group chairs, collaboration of the delegates, and scientific support of JEMRA in advancing the work of the Committee is greatly appreciated.

I am particularly pleased that Annex II on Fresh Leafy Vegetables and Annex IV on Sprouts of the *Guidelines for the Control of Shiga Toxin-Producing Escherichia coli (STEC) in Raw Beef, Fresh Leafy Vegetables, Raw Milk and Raw Milk Cheeses, and Sprouts* (CXG 99-2023) will go for final adoption, thereby completing the work on STEC.

I am also pleased that CCFH54 also recommended final adoption of Annex III on Milk and Milk Products of the *Guidelines for the Safe Use and Reuse of Water in Food Production and Processing* (CXG 100-2023). Although CCFH54 has requested an extension to complete Annex II on Fish and Fishery Products and Annex IV related to water fit-for-purpose of the CXG 100-2023, I am confident the Committee will continue the work in an EWG to address the concerns raised by Members at CCFH54 with the goal to advance the documents for final adoption by CCFH55.

Also of particular note are the Draft Guidelines for Food Hygiene Control Measures in Traditional Markets for Food that was recommended for adoption at Step 5/8. The work of the EWG is commendable, since it was the first time the draft guidelines were being reviewed and discussed in plenary by the Committee. These Guidelines are of great relevance to the local, regional and international communities.

Significant progress was also made in aligning the *Guidelines on the Application of the General Principles of Food Hygiene to the control of Pathogenic Vibrio Species in Seafood* (CXG 73-2010) text with the revised *General Principles of Food Hygiene* (CXC 1-1969).

It was good to see more Members volunteer to chair and/or co-chair the working groups. My hope is that their dedication will facilitate the completion of the current work and the development of the new work proposals for updating the existing guidelines. Although the Committee will need an extension to complete the annexes to the *Guidelines for the Safe Use and Reuse of Water in Food Production and Processing* (CXG 100-2023), the Committee is on track in taking on all the new work being proposed.

3. Status of work items

Topic	Job Number	Target year	Recommendation of the Committee
For decision by the Commission			
1. Annex II on Fresh Leafy Vegetables and Annex IV on Sprouts of the <i>Guidelines for the Control of Shiga Toxin-Producing Escherichia coli (STEC) in Raw Beef, Fresh Leafy Vegetables, Raw Milk and Raw Milk Cheeses, and Sprouts</i> (CXG 99-2023)	N02-2019	2024	Adoption at Step 5/8
2. Annex III on Milk and Milk Products of the <i>Guidelines for the Safe Use and Reuse of Water in Food Production and Processing</i> (CXG 100-2023)	N05-2020	2024	Adoption at Step 5/8
3. Draft Guidelines for Food Hygiene Control Measures in Traditional Markets for Food	N01-2023	2026	Adoption at Step 5/8
4. Revision of the <i>Guidelines on the Application of the General Principles of Food Hygiene to the control of Pathogenic Vibrio Species in Seafood</i> (CXG 73-2010)	N02- 2023	2025	Adoption at Step 5
5. New work proposal on the revision of the <i>Guidelines on the Application of General Principles of Food Hygiene to the Control of Viruses in Food</i> (CXG 79-2012)	-	-	Approval
6. New work proposal on the revision of the <i>Guidelines for the Control of Campylobacter and Salmonella in Chicken Meat</i> (CXG 78-2011)	-	-	Approval
7. New work proposal on the revision of the <i>Guidelines on the Application of General Principles of Food Hygiene to the Control of Listeria monocytogenes in Foods</i> (CXG 61-2007)	-	-	Approval
For monitoring			
8. Annex II on Fish and Fishery Products and Annex IV related to water fit-for-purpose assessment, safety management, and technologies for recovery and treatment of water for reuse of the <i>Guidelines for the Safe Use and Reuse of Water in Food Production and Processing</i> (CXG 100-2023)			Step 2/3
For information			
9. Alignment of Codex texts with the revised <i>General Principles of Food Hygiene</i> (CXC 1-1969)	For consideration by CCFH55		

4. Specific comments

1. Annex II on Fresh Leafy Vegetables and Annex IV on Sprouts of the *Guidelines for the Control of Shiga Toxin-Producing Escherichia coli (STEC) in Raw Beef, Fresh Leafy Vegetables, Raw Milk and Raw Milk Cheeses, and Sprouts (CXG 99-2023)*, Paragraph 52, Appendices II and III

Status and Secretariat's comments:

The work on the *Guidelines for the Control of Shiga Toxin-Producing Escherichia coli (STEC) in Raw Beef, Fresh Leafy Vegetables, Raw Milk and Raw Milk Cheeses, and Sprouts*, which was approved by CAC42 (2019), is on track with the General Section, Annex I (raw beef) and Annex III (raw milk and raw milk cheeses) already completed and adopted by CAC46 (2023). CCFH53 (2022) agreed to redraft the annexes on fresh leafy vegetables (Annex II) and on sprouts (Annex IV) and further the work in an EWG.

A PWG which was held just prior to the plenary session of CCFH54 reviewed all comments received on the draft Annexes II and IV, and made further revisions.

CCFH54 following constructive discussions finalised the annexes and consensually agreed to forward the draft Annex II on Fresh Leafy Vegetables and the draft Annex IV on Sprouts for adoption by CAC47 at Step 5/8 and subsequent inclusion in CXG 99-2023.

This completes a very comprehensive and extensive piece of work by CCFH and appreciation in particular to the Chair and Co-Chairs of the working group.

The overall work has been completed within the envisaged timeframe and the format and presentation as well as language is according to Codex style.

Chairperson's comments:

I am particularly pleased that Annex II on Fresh Leafy Vegetables and Annex IV on Sprouts of the *Guidelines for the Control of Shiga Toxin-Producing Escherichia coli (STEC) in Raw Beef, Fresh Leafy Vegetables, Raw Milk and Raw Milk Cheeses, and Sprouts (CXG 99-2023)* will go for final adoption by CAC47. Significant time was spent in previous CCFH sessions and the pre-CCFH54 PWG discussing the cross-cutting issues and alignment with multiple Codex documents, and in the end this led to a strong consensus and great progress of this document to completion.

2. and 8. Annex III on Milk and Milk products, Paragraph 89(i), Appendix IV and Annex II on Fish and Fishery Products and Annex IV related to water fit-for-purpose assessment of the *Guidelines for the Safe Use and Reuse of Water in Food Production and Processing (CXG 100-2023)*, Paragraphs 88 and 89(ii and iii)

Status and Secretariat's comments:

The work on the General Section and Annex I of the *Guidelines for the Safe Use and Reuse of Water in Food Production and Processing*, which was approved by CAC43 (2020) was completed and adopted by CAC46 (2023). CCFH53 (2022) agreed to redraft the annexes on fish and fish products (Annex II) and on milk and milk products (Annex III). CCFH53 also agreed that the International Dairy Federation (IDF) would be a Co-Chair of the EWG on Annex III.

In the course of the work on the development of Annex III in particular, it was recognized that many aspects therein, particularly related to technologies, were relevant to all sectors and not just the dairy sector. Hence it was proposed to separate out that information into a separate Annex IV. This was agreed in the EWG and put forward as a proposal for CCFH54.

A PWG which was held just prior to the plenary session of CCFH54 reviewed all comments received on the draft Annexes II, III and IV.

Annex III on Milk and Milk Products:

Following a constructive discussion, CCFH54 consensually agreed to forward the draft Annex III to CAC47 for adoption at step 5/8 and subsequent inclusion in CXG 100-2023.

The format and presentation of Annex III as well as language is according to Codex style.

Annex II on fish and fishery products:

While good progress was made on Annex II, in particular with regard to decision support tools, which were revised extensively in the course of the session with the support of the JEMRA Secretariat, Members needed more time to consider the revised tools in particular. Therefore, CCFH54 agreed to return Annex II to Step 2/3.

Annex IV related to water fit-for-purpose assessment:

CCFH54 agreed with the proposal to develop a fourth annex to capture overarching information on new technologies (previously included in Annex III) as well as information related to water fit-for-purpose assessment and water safety management, relevant to all commodity-focused annexes as well as the general guidelines.

With work outstanding on Annexes II and IV, as requested by CCFH54, this work will need an extension beyond its original timeline in order to be completed. Given the level of commitment to the work and the progress made at CCFH54, the Codex Secretariat considers that an extension until CCFH55 should be viewed positively as it will result in a more comprehensive and user-friendly guidelines.

CCFH54 agreed to establish an EWG chaired by the EU and co-chaired by Morocco, Honduras, Mauritania, India and IDF to revise Annex II and further develop Annex IV related to water fit-for-purpose assessment, safety management, and technologies for recovery and treatment of water for reuse.

Chairperson's comments:

I am pleased that CCFH54 recommended final adoption of Annex III on Milk and Milk Products of the *Guidelines for the Safe Use and Reuse of Water in Food Production and Processing* (CXG 100-2023). The collaboration of IDF in co-chairing Annex III on Milk and Milk Products: was fundamental in completing the work and is greatly appreciated.

The working group chairs worked tirelessly with support from the JEMRA Secretariat during the session to improve the decision trees of the Annex II on Fish and Fishery Products, which were generally well received by CCFH54 but understandably required more time for consideration by the Committee. Although Annex II on Fish and Fishery Products was returned to Step 2/3 for redrafting, I am confident the Committee will continue the momentum in an EWG to address the concerns raised by Members at CCFH54 with the goal to advance these Annexes for review and final agreement by CCFH55.

CCFH54's agreement to develop an Annex IV related to water fit-for-purpose as a new Annex is a productive decision which will ensure that information related to water fit-for-purpose assessment is broadly applicable across all other annexes and the guidelines. I fully support the Committee's decision and feel an extension to complete Annexes II and IV is appropriate to ensure the optimal utility of the text.

The commitment of additional Members to Co-Chair the EWG to revise and further develop the Annexes should facilitate the progress to be made in advancing the annexes to completion.

3. Draft Guidelines for Food Hygiene Control Measures in Traditional Markets for Food, Paragraphs 169-170, Appendix VI

Status and Secretariat's comments:

CAC46 (2023) had approved the new work proposal from CCFH53 (2023) on developing guidelines for food hygiene control measures in traditional markets.

Following a constructive discussion and strong support for the need for such guidance in light of the role of traditional markets in providing access to food to billions of consumers worldwide, CCFH54 agreed to forward the draft guidelines for food hygiene control measures in traditional markets to CAC47 for adoption at Step 5/8.

The work was thus completed in one session, well within the envisaged timeframe. The format and presentation as well as language is according to Codex style.

CAC46 had requested CCFH to carefully consider the relationship between CXC 1-1969, the regional texts on street vended foods, and the new guideline. The feedback from Members suggested that all these texts be considered as complimentary. CCFH54 thus requested that, following adoption of the guideline by CAC47, and in light of the recent revision of CXC 1-1969, the relevant FAO/WHO Coordinating Committees to review their respective texts on street vended foods to ensure consistency with CXC 1-1969 and the guidelines for food hygiene control measures in traditional markets for foods, and consider the necessary follow-up action (e.g. revision).

Chairperson's comments:

This is a historical first for the CCFH in that in one committee session these guidelines were proposed and agreed upon as new work at CCFH53 (2022) and finalized and recommended for advancement to Step 5/8 for final adoption at CAC47 at CCFH54. Kenya, as Chair of the EWG, should be recognized in their efforts in making this possible. Further work in the future may be necessary once the regional committees have

<p>had the opportunity to review their respective regional texts to ensure consistency with the newly revised <i>General Principles of Food Hygiene</i> (CXC 1-1969).</p>
<p>4. Revision of the <i>Guidelines on the Application of the General Principles of Food Hygiene to the control of Pathogenic Vibrio Species in Seafood</i> (CXG 73-2010), Paragraphs 131-132, Appendix V</p>
<p>Status and Secretariat's comments:</p> <p>CCFH53 (2023) proposed the revision, subsequently approved by CAC46 (2023), of the <i>Guidelines on the Application of General Principles of Food Hygiene to the Control of Pathogenic Vibrio Species in Seafood</i> (CXG 73-2010) and established an EWG. The EWG conducted one round of consultation, followed by a virtual working group meeting.</p> <p>CCFH54 following a thorough discussion, agreed on all aspects of the revision except on the references to the types of water used at different stages of processing water. CCFH54 also noted that work was still ongoing in relation to water use and reuse in the fish and fishery products sector (see above), and thus it would be prudent to await the completion of that work so as to ensure alignment between texts. In this context, CCFH54 consensually agreed to forward the draft revision of the <i>Guidelines on the Application of General Principles of Food Hygiene to the Control of Pathogenic Vibrio Species in Seafood</i> (CXG 73-2010) to CAC47 for adoption at step 5, noting that all references to water remained in square brackets and that CCFH would revisit those as soon as Annex II on Fish and Fishery Products of the <i>Guidelines for the Safe Use and Reuse of Water in Food Production and Processing</i> (CXG 100-2023) was completed.</p> <p>The revised text has also been aligned with CXC 1-1969.</p> <p>The work is still on track in terms of the agreed timeline, but it should be noted that its completion is now also linked to the completion of annex II on Fish and Fishery Products of the <i>Guidelines for the Safe Use and Reuse of Water in Food Production and Processing</i> (CXG 100-2023) (see above).</p>
<p>Chairperson's comments:</p> <p>There was extensive discussion at CCFH54 on the types of water used at the different stages of processing and in the end, CCFH54 agreed that aligning the terminology around water with the text used in Annex II on Fish and Fishery Products of the <i>Guidelines for the Safe Use and Reuse of Water in Food Production and Processing</i> (CXG 100-2023) would be the most appropriate way forward. As such, CCFH54 agreed to forward the revision to Step 5 for interim adoption by CAC47 and to wait for Annex II to be completed, prior to finalizing this document.</p>
<p>5. New work proposal on the revision of the <i>Guidelines on the Application of General Principles of Food Hygiene to the control of viruses in food</i> (CXG 79-2012), Paragraph 185(i), Appendix VIII</p>
<p>Secretariat's comments:</p> <p>A new work proposal on the revision of the <i>Guidelines on the Application of General Principles of Food Hygiene to the control of viruses in food</i> (CXG 79-2012) was discussed in a PWG in conjunction with the plenary session and the project document was further revised by amongst other expanding the scope and aligning with the latest JEMRA scientific advice.</p> <p>CCFH54 supported the new work and agreed to forward the revised project document to CAC47 for approval as new work. There were no additional scientific advice requests at this time.</p> <p>CCFH54 also agreed to establish an EWG, chaired by Canada and co-chaired by the Netherlands, subject to approval by CAC, to prepare the draft revisions for circulation for comments at Step 3 and consideration by CCFH55 and undertake a full alignment of the text with CXC 1-1969.</p>
<p>Chairperson's comments:</p> <p>This revision is timely since JEMRA's scientific advice was recently provided and so it is necessary to update the <i>Guidelines on the Application of General Principles of Food Hygiene to the Control of Viruses in Food</i> (CXG 79-2012) to address virus-related issues globally. The revised text also has to align with the revised CXC 1-1969.</p>
<p>6. New work proposal on the revision of the <i>Guidelines for the Control of Campylobacter and Salmonella in Chicken Meat</i> (CXG 78-2011), Paragraph 188(i), Appendix IX</p>
<p>Status and Secretariat's comments:</p>

A new work proposal on the the revision of the *Guidelines for the Control of Campylobacter and Salmonella in Chicken Meat* (CXG 78-2011) was discussed in a PWG in conjunction with the plenary session and the project document was further revised.

CCFH54 supported the new work and agreed to forward the revised project document to CAC47 for approval as new work. It was noted that the scientific advice from JEMRA to support this work was already available and there were no further requests for scientific advice at this time

CFH54 also agreed to establish an EWG, chaired by the United States of America and co-chaired by Australia, Brazil, Denmark, Honduras, and India, subject to approval by CAC, to prepare the draft revisions for circulation for comments at Step 3 and consideration by CCFH55 and undertake a full alignment of the text with CXC1-1969.

Chairperson's comments:

This revision is also timely given that the two JEMRA documents needed for CCFH to begin work on this topic are available. It is necessary to update the *Guidelines for the Control of Campylobacter and Salmonella in Chicken Meat* (CXG 78-2011) given the global interest in controlling foodborne illnesses associated with these two pathogens. The revised text also has to align with the revised CXC 1-1969.

7. New work proposal on the revision of the *Guidelines on the Application of the General Principles of Food Hygiene to the Control of Listeria monocytogenes in Foods* (CXG 61-2007), Paragraph 192(i), Appendix X

Status and Secretariat's comments:

A new work proposal on the the revision of the *Guidelines on the Application of the General Principles of Food Hygiene to the Control of Listeria monocytogenes in Foods* (CXG 61-2007) was discussed in a PWG in conjunction with the plenary session and the project document was further revised.

CCFH54 supported the new work and agreed to forward the revised project document to CAC47 for approval as new work. It was noted that the scientific advice from JEMRA to support this work was already available and there were no further requests for scientific advice at this time.

CCFH54 also agreed to establish an EWG, chaired by the United States of America and co-chaired by Canada, China and France, subject to approval by CAC, to prepare the proposed draft revisions for circulation for comments at Step 3 and consideration by CCFH55 and undertake a full alignment of the text with CXC1-1969.

Chairperson's comments:

This revision is timely since JEMRA's scientific advice was recently provided, enabling the Committee to update the *Guidelines on the Application of the General Principles of Food Hygiene to the Control of Listeria monocytogenes in Foods* (CXG 61-2007). This is an important piece of work for CCFH given the new commodities attributed to listeriosis and commerce modalities for international trade. The revised text also has to align with the revised CXC 1-1969. I am satisfied that this will ensure the consistency and thoroughness of the resulting draft. Overall, I am pleased that CCFH54 agreed to forward all three new work proposals to CAC47 for approval and view this as evidence that this Committee continues to undertake timely, meaningful work of utmost relevance to food safety while enabling fair practices in the food trade.

9. Alignment of Codex texts with the revised *General Principles of Food Hygiene* (CXC 1-1969), Paragraph 177

Status and Secretariat's comments:

CCFH53 requested the preparation of a document for CCFH54 to initiate work and propose options for aligning Codex food hygiene texts with the revised *General Principles of Food Hygiene* (CXC 1-1969).

CCFH54 agreed to prioritize the work on alignment and integrate it into its work plan as well as adopt a hybrid approach to alignment. CCFH54 also agreed to establish an EWG on alignment chaired by China and co-chaired by the United Kingdom and the European Union.

Chairperson's comments:

There was extensive discussion on aligning CCFH texts with the revised *General Principles of Food Hygiene* (CXC 1-1969). The proposed hybrid approach agreed upon by CCFH54 is the best way forward, given the large number of documents that need alignment with the latest version of CXC 1-1969 and the need to balance the significant work required to align the documents with the Committee's ability to take on new work to address food safety issues of growing or significant public health concern.