INTRODUCTION

1. The Codex Committee on Spices and Culinary Herbs (CCSCH) held its sixth session virtually, on 26, 27, 28, 29, 30 September and 3 October 2022, at the kind invitation of the Government of India. Dr M. R. Sudharshan, former Research Director, Spices Board India, Ministry of Commerce and Industry, Government of India, chaired the session, which had registrants representing Member Countries, one Member Organization (European Union) and Observers of international governmental (IGOs) and non-governmental organizations (NGOs) and United Nations agencies. The full list of participants is contained in Appendix I.

OPENING OF THE SESSION

2. Mr. Rajesh Bhushan IAS, Secretary, Ministry of Health and Family Welfare, Government of India and Chairperson, Food Safety and Standards Authority of India, opened the meeting, welcoming the participants and congratulating the great achievements of the Committee since its establishment. He noted that the development of harmonized worldwide standards for spices and culinary herbs not only protect public health but also promote economic development globally and emphasized that the work of the Committee had already acted as a trigger leading to positive changes including establishing a quality culture for both consumers and industries.

3. Mr. D Sathiyan IFS, Secretary, Spices Board India, Mr. Konda Reddy Chavva, Officer in charge, the Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (FAO) in India, Dr. A.B. Rema Shree, Director, Spices Board India, and Mr. Steve Wearne, Chairperson of the Codex Alimentarius Commission (CAC) also addressed the Committee.

Division of Competence

4. CCSSCH6 noted the division of competence between the European Union (EU) and its Member States, in accordance with paragraph 5, Rule II, of the Rules of Procedure of CAC.

ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA (Agenda item 1)

5. CCSSCH6 adopted the Provisional Agenda as its agenda for the meeting.

6. CCSSCH6 agreed to establish an In-session Working Group (IWG), chaired by the United States of America, working in English only, to consider the update to the template for the spices and culinary herbs standards (Agenda Item 7.2), taking into account relevant comments submitted to the different virtual Working Group Meetings (vWG) held prior to the session, and prepare recommendations for the plenary.

MATTERS REFERRED BY THE CODEX ALIMENTARIUS COMMISSION AND ITS SUBSIDIARY BODIES (Agenda item 2)

7. CCSSCH6 noted the information provided and encouraged Members and Observers on occasion of the 60th anniversary of Codex in 2023, to plan and implement activities to build awareness of Codex and engage high level political support for Codex work, including the work of CCSSCH.

8. CCSSCH6 noted the following issues brought to its attention for action.

Adoption of the General Standard for the Labelling of Non-retail Containers of Foods (CXS 346-2021) and consequential amendments to the Procedural Manual

9. CCSSCH6 noted that CAC44, following its adoption of CXS 346-2021 and the consequential amendment to the Procedural Manual i.e. the Format for Codex Commodity Standards, section on labelling, had requested Commodity Committees to review the labelling provisions for non-retail containers in existing and draft standards in light of the new General Standard for the Labelling of Non-Retail Containers (CXS 346-2021).

10. The Codex Secretariat presented a proposal for amendment of the labelling provisions for non-retail containers in the eight existing Spices and Culinary Herbs (SCH) standards as well as the SCH template as contained in CRD17 Rev.

Conclusion

11. CCSSCH6 agreed to forward for adoption by CAC45, the proposed amendments to the labelling provisions of non-retail containers in the eight existing SCH standards (Appendix II Part A); and inform the Codex Committee on Food Labelling (CCFL) accordingly.

---

1 CRD24 (Opening remarks)  
2 CRD1 (Annotated Agenda – Division of competence between the European Union and its Member States)  
3 CX/SCH 22/6/1  
4 CX/SCH 22/6/2: CRD17 Rev. (Codex Secretariat)  
5 REP21/CAC, Paragraphs 83 and 86
Endorsement of the pertinent labelling provisions in the *Standard for Dried or Dehydrated Garlic* (CXS 347-2019)

12. The Codex Secretariat brought to CCSCH6’s attention that at CCSCH5, the conclusions regarding the actions taken by the Committee in respect to the questions raised by CCFL44 in relation to the labelling provisions under sections 8.3, 8.3.1 and 8.5 (in the draft standard for dried or dehydrated garlic). It was explained that clear recommendations in relation to these specific labelling provisions for dried or dehydrated garlic had been inadvertently omitted in the in the Report of the Committee (REP21/SCH), and thus the following revised provisions in this standard had not been endorsed by CCFL46 (2021) i.e.

8.3 Country of origin and country of harvest
8.3.1 Country of origin shall be declared
8.3.2 Country of harvest (optional)
8.3.3 Region of harvest and year of harvest (optional)

13. Nevertheless, the Codex Secretariat had revised the provisions based on the decisions at CCSCH5 and published the standard.

14. CCSCH6 confirmed that the labelling provisions in paragraph 12 applied to CXS 347-2019 and that the provision for inspection mark had been deleted.

**Conclusion**

15. CCSCH6 agreed to forward the revised labelling provisions for sections 8.3, 8.3.1, 8.3.2 and 8.3.3 of the *Standard for dried or dehydrated garlic* (CXS 347-2019) to CCFL for endorsement (Appendix II Part B).

**Other matters - Information on the activities of ISO**

16. In view of the fact that many of the draft standards under discussion by the Committee had referenced various ISO standards, CCSCH6 agreed to request ISO to present their information document after the completion of discussion of Agenda item 2.

17. CCSCH6 noted the information provided by ISO on its activities related to spices, culinary herbs and condiments and expressed appreciation for the valuable work which had been widely cross-referenced by the Committee.

**DRAFT STANDARD FOR DRIED SAFFRON (Agenda item 3)**

18. Iran (Islamic Republic of), as Chair of the Electronic Working Group (EWG), speaking also on behalf of the co-Chair Greece, introduced the Agenda item and recalled that work had focused mainly on the unresolved provisions under Sections 3.2.2 Chemical and Physical Characteristics (Annex I: Table 1 – Chemical characteristics) and (Annex II: Table 2 – Physical Characteristics); and 8.3 – Country of Origin and Country of Harvest as well as comments submitted at Step 6 following the adoption of draft standard at Step 5 by CAC44 (2021).

19. CCSCH6 agreed to the proposal of the Chairperson, to focus the discussion on outstanding issues under Sections 3.2.2 and 8.3 and then considered the draft standard section by section. CCSCH6 also agreed to use CRD2 as the basis for the discussion.

**3.2.2 Chemical and physical characteristics**

*Annex I – Table 1: Chemical characteristics of dried floral parts - Saffron “Extra Class”*

20. CCSCH6 considered the proposal of the EWG to include the requirements for “Extra Class” in Table 1 and in Section 3.2.3 – Classification.

21. Delegations in support of including “Extra Class” expressed the following views;

- The draft standard addressed the needs of all stakeholders including producers, buyers and consumers, and that such a comprehensive standard would facilitate fair trade practices as well as ensure that consumers are protected.

- The quality of saffron was closely linked to colour, which is determined by crocin content, therefore a solid scientific basis existed between the different classes based on crocin content.

---

6 SCH/6 INF/02
7 CX/SCH 22/6/3; CX/SCH 22/6/3 Add.1; CRD2 (Report of the virtual Working Group); CRD7 (Chile, Kenya, Malaysia, Morocco, Saudi Arabia, Tanzania, Uganda); CRD16 (Thailand); CRD21 (AIDSMO)
- “Extra Class” already existed in other SCH standards and according to section 3.2.3 of the draft standard for saffron, having Extra class was optional and subject to meeting the requirements as set out in Annex I and Annex II.

- One of the criteria for this work, as set out in the project document, was to promote consumer protection and fair food trade practices especially for developing countries who were the major producers and exporters.

- While in some parts of the world there could be less trade for saffron classified as “Extra Class”, in other regions there was a demand for it and such trade existed.

- Saffron was a very important spice, being very expensive and much prone to adulteration.

22. Delegations opposed to the inclusion of “Extra Class” expressed the following views;

- Saffron in “Extra class” was not commonly traded in international market.

- Grades and classes are usually established between buyers and sellers and that these should not be part of Codex standards; however, if included they should specify the minimum requirements only.

- Codex standards were developed to protect the health of consumers and promote fair trade practices and It was therefore not the role of Codex to promote competitive advantages of the highest quality products.

23. It was noted that the draft standard was comprehensive taking into account the requirements of a whole range of products on the global market with a view to facilitate fair trade practices and that a market for products falling under “Extra Class” existed in many parts of the world. There was support for inclusion of “Extra Class”.

**Conclusion on ‘Extra class’**

24. CCSCH6 agreed to retain “Extra Class” in the standard by deleting all the square brackets on the relevant parameters (Annex I - Table 1 and Section 3.2.3).

25. The United States of America expressed its reservation to the inclusion of “Extra class” in this standard noting that in their view this provision was neither science based nor included in major published international or national standards that provided a reference basis. Furthermore, “Extra class” was not universally/internationally implemented and/or recognized and therefore the United States of America believed its inclusion would lead to confusion in trade.

**Artificial colourants**

26. CCSCH6 endorsed the proposal of the EWG to delete the provision for artificial colourants from Table 1, noting that the standard did not permit the use of food additives in this product.

**Safranal**

27. CCSCH6 agreed to increase the minimum value of safranal (aroma strength) from 20 to 30 in “Extra Class” noting the explanation that the aroma strength was the main component of saffron which impacted flavour thus it was important to distinguish “Extra Class” from other classes.

**Annex II – Table 2: Physical characteristics for dried floral parts - Saffron**

28. CCSCH6 agreed to delete the requirements for saffron powder since no minimum or maximum values had been set; and to insert a general provision in Section 3.2.2 to provide for quality and safety of the product i.e.

“Saffron powder shall be safe and suitable for human consumption and free from living insects and practically free from extraneous and foreign matter in amounts which may represent a hazard to human health.”

**Section 8.3 Country of origin and country of harvest**

29. The Chairperson recalled the decision of CCSCH5 to keep both provisions in the SCH standards by splitting “Country of Origin/Country of Harvest” into two independent and clear provisions, with the provision on “Country of Origin” be mandatory and the provision on “Country of Harvest” being optional; and that these provisions would be reconsidered in individual standards should the need arise. Based on the above decisions, the Chairperson requested the Committee to consider whether the above decision should also apply to the labelling provisions for saffron.

30. CCSCH6 exchanged views on whether the two labelling provisions should be mandatory or country of origin only, with country of harvest being optional. In this respect, the following general views were noted:

A mandatory declaration of the country of harvest for dried saffron was intended for the protection of the true origin and authenticity of the product. Labelling of the country of harvest would provide the consumer the information on its originality including the type and nature of the plant and thus empower them to make an informed choice. This also prevented fraud.

The draft provision was optional, and this would not prevent any country from indicating the country or region of harvest on the label.

One delegation expressed the view that mandatory declaration of the country of harvest would impose extra burden and risk to food businesses and pointed out that only the Country of Origin could be verified based on legal documents accompanying a given consignment. In their view, the country of harvest cannot be scientifically verified by inspectors and thus mandatory labelling would not help in preventing food fraud. Furthermore, the country of harvest was not defined according to CCFL and there was no precedent for this in any previous Codex commodity standard. Finally, this mandatory provision would reverse the customary practice in the SCH trade for large companies that normally imported product in bulk product and further processed them before offering for sale on their own labels as the product of the country of processing without indication of the country of harvest. This view was supported by two other delegations also.

CCSCH6 further considered a proposal by a delegation to retain only the provision “The country of origin shall be declared”, while the provision “Country of Harvest (optional)” be removed, and added a footnote reading “This shall be the country of harvest unless the saffron has been subject to significant processing that results in a new product” with country of origin. Recalling that in the glossary of terms for spice and culinary herb (SCH), the definition for processing as it relates to SCH industry, included only sorting, cleaning, shifting, grinding, grading, or packing into consumer-ready packages or bulk containers; and that these physical processes do not result in a new product, the proposal was not endorsed.

Noting the divergent views expressed by delegations, and recalling the Committee’s previous decisions, the Chairperson proposed that labelling provisions under sections 8.3, 8.3.1, 8.3.2 and 8.3.3 should remain as proposed by the EWG, and therefore the country of harvest shall be declared (mandatory) (section 8.2).

**Conclusion on mandatory declaration of country of harvest**

CCSCH6 endorsed the proposal noting that there was general support for the mandatory declaration of country of harvest.

The United States of America expressed its reservation due to the reasons stated in paragraph 31.

Jamaica and Mexico, in support for the United States of America’s position, also expressed their reservation.

Other aspects

CCSCH6 reviewed the different sections of the standard, made editorial corrections in the various parts and aligned the title of the standard to the product definition by inserting the words “dried floral parts” in the title.

CCSCH6 also noted the Procedural Manual’s requirement on Section 9.1 Methods of analysis that all the identified analytical methods would be transferred to General Standard on Methods of Analysis and Sampling (CXS 234-1999) after their endorsement by the Codex Committee on Methods of Analysis and Sampling (CCMAS) and instead the following standardised text would be inserted in the standard:

“For checking the compliance with this standard, the methods of analysis and sampling contained in the Recommended Methods of Analysis and Sampling (CXS 234-1999) relevant to the provisions in this standard, shall be used.”

**Final Conclusion**

CCSCH6 agreed to forward:

- the draft Standard for dried floral part - saffron to CAC45 for adoption at Step 8 (Appendix III); and

- the provisions on labelling and methods of analysis to CCFL and CCMAS, respectively, for endorsement.
DRAFT STANDARD FOR DRIED SEEDS - NUTMEG (Agenda item 4.1)\(^8\)

40. Indonesia, as the EWG Chair, speaking also on behalf of the co-Chair India, introduced the item, noting that the EWG had conducted two rounds of consultations and a VWG meeting was held prior to the plenary session to consider the comments received in response to Circular Letter (CL) (CL 2022/26/OCS-SCH). It was informed that all the comments raised during the discussions had been addressed with the exception of the three new added parameters in Table 3\(^9\) Physical characteristics for Nutmeg (i.e. “Shell fragments”, “Off size, when sized” and “Broken/damaged among whole only”), which were retained in square brackets for further consideration by the plenary. The Chair explained that all these issues had been incorporated in CRD3.

41. CC SCH6 considered the draft standard contained in CRD3 section by section, endorsed most of the revisions, made some further editorial corrections, and took the following additional decisions. Some translation errors in Spanish were also pointed out and CC SCH6 noted that these would be addressed by the Host Secretariat and the Codex Secretariat when finalising the standard.

**Section 1 Scope**

42. A delegation proposed realigning the scope with the title of the standard (Standard for dried seeds) by excluding nutmeg in ground/powdered form from the scope, as nutmeg in this form was no longer a seed and that ground/powdered product could be developed as a different standard covering both wholesale and industrial processing.

43. The Chairperson clarified that the scope of the standard was well aligned to the Terms of Reference (TORs) of the Committee (i.e. “to elaborate worldwide standards for spices and culinary herbs in their dried and dehydrated state in whole, ground, and cracked or crushed form”); and that according to the definition for Industrial processing agreed by the CCSCH, (i.e. “The application of physical or chemical processes that substantially modifies or transforms a product from its original state into other products such as the extraction of essential oils or other usable component from the spice”); products targeted towards such industrial processes were excluded from the scope of work of CCSCH.

44. CC SCH6 agreed to insert the word “powder” in the last sentence of the scope to read “It excludes dried seeds and powder for industrial processing” in order to bring clarity to the scope.

**Section 2.1 Product definitions**

45. CC SCH6 endorsed:

- the insertion of a footnote 1 (i.e. having the mature pericarp opened naturally (not opened manually or mechanically) and the red aril known as mace is clearly visible and formed) with a view to clarify the words “appropriate degree of development”.

- the deletion of size ranges for nutmeg from the standard, noting that these were governed by trading practices, and the retention of Table 1 as it was consistent with the template for SCH group standards, and that its inclusion would facilitate the insertion of more products under the same group in the future.

**Section 2.2 Styles**

46. For the purpose of clarity, CC SCH6 noted the clarification that styles “broken seed” and “Ground/powdered seed” should be obtained from seed only and therefore inserted the words “obtained from the seed only” in Sections 2.2.3 and 2.2.4.

**Section 3.2.2. Chemical and physical characteristics**

47. A delegation raised a concern regarding the safety of nutmeg and mace and stated that, these products contained chemical substances “myristicin and methoxysafrole” which could have detrimental effect on health. The delegation further proposed that CCSCH request JECFA to evaluate the safety of these components as well as the use of nutmeg as a flavouring agent with a view to set a maximum level for its use in food.

48. The Codex Secretariat explained that this matter was under the purview of Codex Committee on Contaminants in Food (CCCF) and that prior to each session of CCCF, a CL requesting comments on the priority list of contaminants for evaluation or re-evaluation by JECFA was issued. Thus, Members should reply to the CL to propose inclusion of the concerned substances in the JECFA priority list.

---

\(^8\) CX/SCH 22/6/4; CX/SCH 22/6/4 Add.1 (Canada, Cuba, Egypt, European Union, India, Kenya, Philippines, Saudi Arabia, Syrian Arab Republic, Uganda, The United States of America, Venezuela (Bolivarian Republic of) and ICUMSA, IOSTA); CRD3 (Report of the virtual Working Group on the draft standard for dried seeds - nutmeg); CRD8 (Grenada, Saudi Arabia, Tanzania and Uganda); CRD16 (Thailand); CRD21 (AIDSMO)

\(^9\) Table numbers reflect table numbers in CRD3
CCSCH6 noted that nutmeg and mace were already in use and freely traded across the globe, and that no specific trade and safety concern had been raised.

**Annex I – Chemical characteristics for nutmeg**

CCSCH6 agreed to:
- specify that the provisions for “Total ash”, “Acid-insoluble ash”, “Water-insoluble ash” and “Volatile oil content” should be expressed on dry basis.
- delete the provision on “Calcium content expressed as CaO”.

**Annex II - Physical characteristics for nutmeg**

Mould visible, insect defiled/infested % w/w (max)

CCSCH6 recalled that all the parameters under this provision had been discussed and agreed upon at CCSCH5; however, several written comments had thereafter been submitted. CCSCH6 noted the following views expressed by delegations:

- a new parameter should be introduced for “mould visible” with a value of 0 in all styles based on ISO 6577:1990 Standard;
- since the provisions for “mould visible” and “insect defiled/infested” were measured at the same time, these should be combined or merged into one, and furthermore the pertinent footnote had already provided a clear description;
- visible mould could generate aflatoxins and other toxins, and
- “mould visible” and “insect defiled/infested” did not belong to the same category and this parameter could lead to misunderstanding and cause confusion during the enforcement at the import and export port.

Following a brief discussion, CCSCH6 agreed to:
- separate the provision "mould visible, insect defiled/infested % w/w (max) " into two i.e., “Mould visible % w/w (max)” and “Insect defiled/infested % w/w (max)”;
- assign the value of 5 to both of the above-mentioned provisions; and
- revise footnote 3 to reflect the fact that naked eyes included eyes whose abnormal vision has been corrected.

Shell fragments % w/w (max)

CCSCH6 agreed to delete this provision as it was already included in the provision “Extraneous matter”.

“Off size, when sized, %w/w (max)” and “Broken/damaged among whole only % w/w (max)”

CCSCH6 noted that these two were new provisions and exchanged views on their significance:

- the provision “Off size, when sized, % w/w (max)” should not be included as Section 2.3 - Sizing (optional) had covered all the requirements in this regard and the parameter could be decided by the agreement between buyer and seller;
- the parameter “Off size, when sized, % w/w (max)” could provide further clarification and guidance in situations when products had been sized;
- these two provisions had been well defined and reflected in food trade; and
- the values for these two provisions should be circulated for further consultations.

CCSCH6 agreed to retain these two provisions as well as the assigned values noting they only applied to styles for whole (with shell) and whole (shelled seed), and that for other styles no value would apply.

“Insect fragments, count/10g (max)”, “Mammalian and or other excreta, mg/kg (max)” and others

CCSCH6 noted the view that (i) the values for both “insect fragments” (100/10g) and “mammalian and or other excreta” (11mg/kg) in the style “broken” were too high; (ii) the value for “insect fragments” was not consistent with the ISO 6577:1990 standard; (iii) the parameters related to insect should be grouped together; and (iv) the table should be reordered to present the parameters related to dead and live insects and insect fragments side by side.

CCSCH6 agreed to retain these provisions unchanged as they had been thoroughly discussed and agreed upon at CCSCH5.
Annex III – Methods of analysis

58. CCSCH6 agreed:
   - that the method “ISO 939” was also applicable to the provisions on “Total ash”, “Acid-insoluble ash”, “Water-insoluble ash” and “Volatile oil content”; also to update the principle of the methods accordingly.
   - to insert a method of analysis as well as its principle and type for the provision on “Insect defiled/infested % w/w (max)”; and
   - to include an explanatory footnote indicating that “the method of analysis for the provisions “off size, when sized” and “broken/damaged among the style whole” to be developed.

Conclusion

59. Noting that all outstanding issues had been resolved, CCSCH6 agreed to:
   - forward the draft standard for dried seeds - nutmeg to CAC45 for adoption at Step 8 (Appendix IV);
   - and
   - re-submit the methods of analysis to CCMAS for endorsement considering the changes that had been introduced.

PROPOSED DRAFT STANDARD FOR DRIED OR DEHYDRATED CHILLI PEPPERS AND PAPRIKA (Agenda item 5.1)¹⁰

60. India as the Chair of the EWG introduced the item informing that there had been two rounds of consultation obtaining comments which had been taken into account in the proposed draft standards as contained in document CX/SCH 22/6/5. Afterwards, two VWG meetings had been held prior to CCSCH6 resulting in the revised version as contained in CRD4. However, there were still unresolved issues in Annexes I and II.

61. CCSCH6 recalled that this work had been approved by CAC40 in 2017 as proposed by CCSCH3 (2017), which also established an EWG to further this work. A proposed draft standard was presented at Step 3 to CCSCH4 (2019) and again to CCSCH5 (2021), both which returned the work to step 2/3 for redrafting. CAC44 (2021) endorsed the recommendation of CCEXEC81 to extend the timeline for completion of work on the standard for dried chili peppers and paprika to CCSCH6. It was recognized that chilli peppers and paprika were produced in many parts of the world under diverse agro-climatic conditions resulting in differences in chemical and physical characteristics and that its popularity around the world created diverse expectations.

62. CCSCH6 agreed to use CRD4 as a basis for its discussion and considered the proposed draft standard section by section, endorsed most of the proposed revisions, made some further editorial corrections, and resolved outstanding issues by taking the following additional decisions.

2.1 Product Definition

63. It was specified that dried or dehydrated chilli pepper and paprika come from Capsicum species of the family Solanaceae.

Table 1

64. CCSCH6 observed that globally many names were used for dried or dehydrated chilli pepper and paprika. For dried or dehydrated chilli pepper, there was need to create a broad non-exhaustive list that would encompass all the varieties. In light of this, the following changes to Table 1 were endorsed:
   - The distinction between Common name and Trade name;
   - Common name will include only two broad categories i.e. 1) Chilli pepper or hot pepper, and 2) Paprika;
   - The creation of a new column for trade names with a non-exhaustive list of varietal names for chilli pepper or hot pepper (such as Ancho, Pasilla, Habanero, Serrano, Piquin, Manzano), and naming of Paprika or Hot paprika as trade names for paprika; and
   - Deletion of the trade name “pablano” for chilli pepper or hot pepper as it applied to fresh chilli, which is outside the scope of the standard.

¹⁰ CX/SCH 22/6/5; CX/SCH 22/06/5 Add.1 (Canada, Colombia, Egypt, European Union, India, Peru, Philippines, Saudi Arabia, Syrian Arab Republic, Uganda, The United States of America, ICUMSA, and IOSTA); CRD4 (Report of the virtual working group); CRD9 (Chile, Kenya, Mexico, Morocco, Rwanda, Saudi Arabia, Syria, Tanzania and Uganda); CRD16 (Thailand); CRD20 (Korea); CRD21 (AIDSMO)
2.2 Styles

65. The definitions for ground chilli pepper and ground paprika were amended, in order to ensure clarity, as follows:
   - Ground chilli pepper is the product obtained by grinding whole dried chilli with or without the placenta, seeds, calyx and stalk, and without any other added matter.
   - Ground paprika is the product obtained by grinding whole dried paprika excluding the placenta, seeds, calyx and stalk, and without any other added matter.

66. The colour of ground paprika was elaborated to include yellowish and brownish red to pale reddish brown in addition to variations from orange to red.

3.1 Composition

67. The provision was aligned with the layout of the SCH standards and the sentence “shall conform to requirements set in Annexes I and II” was deleted.

3.2.4 Sizing (Optional)

68. It was agreed to retain this paragraph and hence the square brackets were removed.

ANNEX I Chemical requirements of dried or dehydrated Chilli Pepper and Paprika

69. CCSCH6 endorsed the proposed changes to the Table and made the following additional changes and clarifications to the respective provisions below:

Moisture % w/w (max)

70. The moisture content (was agreed at 11% w/w, (max) across all products and styles. However, a footnote was inserted to inform that some varieties of dried or dehydrated chilli peppers and paprika had a moisture content of up to 15% in all styles.

Pungency

71. The pungency levels (SHU) were endorsed as proposed i.e. ≥900 for all styles of chilli peppers, ≤ 480 for all styles of paprika, and 480<900 for all styles of hot paprika. However, the symbol “greater than” (>) was inserted in front of the minimum values for hot paprika (> 480 <900) in order to create a clear distinction between the maximum values for paprika (≤ 480) and minimum values for hot paprika (> 480).

Acid insoluble ash

72. A footnote was inserted to indicate that for ground/powdered products containing anticaking agents (2% w/w max), the values for acid insoluble ash (% w/w) might go up to 3.0% in paprika and 3.6% in hot paprika.

ANNEX II . Physical requirements of dried or dehydrated Chilli Pepper and Paprika

73. All the proposed changes to the Table were endorsed, and the following additional changes and clarifications made to the Table.

- Renamed the provision “insect defiled/infested” to “insect damage”.
- Agreed that the combined maximum value for mould damage and insect damage for whole chilli peppers be set at 3 % (w/w).
- Included a column for “other factors”.

74. It was agreed to include as other factors “5% off size max., 10% other similar varieties max, and 10% broken max” for whole chilli peppers and whole paprika and hot paprika.

75. CCSCH6 considered a proposal by a delegation to include the provisions for “rodent hair” and “insect fragment” under “mammalian excreta” instead of listing them under “other factors” in the product style for “ground/powdered chilli peppers” and “ground/powdered paprika and hot paprika”. During the discussion it was highlighted that the analytical results for rodent hair and insect fragments were expressed in count per gram while those for mammalian excreta in mg/kg, therefore combining these provisions would potentially cause confusion in the interpretation of the analytical results. The Committee agreed to include the provisions for “rodent hair (i.e. 6 count /25 g (max.)) and insect fragments (50 count /25 g (max.))” under “other factors” for these two product styles.

76. A footnote was included to explain that N/A did not refer to zero, but referred to “Not applicable”, which meant that this form of the above product had not been evaluated for this provision, and currently we did not have values.
ANNEX III – Methods of analysis

77. CCSCH6 took the following decisions:
   - included ASTA 21.3 (A chromatographic type IV method) as the method of analysis for the provision Pungency Scoville Heat units
   - included AOAC 945.94 (A visual examination type I method) for the provision mould damage.

78. With the above-mentioned changes to the the proposed draft standard, there was general consensus to forward it for final adoption by CAC45. Syrian Arab Republic expressed its reservation to this decision as in their view more work was needed.

Conclusion

79. CCSCH6 agreed to forward
   - the proposed draft standard for dried or dehydrated chilli pepper and paprika for adoption by CAC45 at Step 5/8 (Appendix V);
   - the provisions for labelling and methods of analysis to CCFL and CCMAS, respectively, for endorsement.

PROPOSED DRAFT STANDARD FOR SMALL CARDAMOM (Agenda item 5.2)\(^{11}\)

80. India, as the EWG Chair, speaking also on behalf of the co-chair Iran (Islamic Republic of), introduced the item, summarizing the work conducted by the EWG. Two rounds of consultation had been held and while the EWG in principle agreed on the proposed draft standard, there were some outstanding issues that needed further discussion. The attention of CCSCH was drawn to the revised proposed standard as contained in CRD6 in which further comments had been taken into account.

81. CCSCH6 agreed to use CRD6 as a basis for its discussion.

Title

82. CCSCH6 agreed to revise the title to “dried small cardamom” in order to be consistent with the scope.

Section 1 Scope

83. To ensure consistency with the title of the standard and the product definition, the term “dehydrated” was deleted from the scope.

Section 2.1 Product definition

84. CCSCH6 agreed to:
   - insert the scientific name of small cardamom together with its plant family name, namely *Elettaria cardamomum* (L.) Maton of Zingiberaceae family, in the product definition to indicate the plant from which small cardamom derived; and
   - add a column, in Table 1, for trade name “cardamom” noting that the word “cardamom” was normally used in trade to refer to small cardamom; and that this would differentiate it from large cardamom which was normally referred to as “black cardamom” in trade.

Section 2.2 Styles

85. CCSCH6 considered the proposals to change the style “whole” to include opened capsules, and style “seed powder” to include whole capsule powder/dried whole capsule, and noted the following views as expressed by delegations:
   - Opened capsules should be included under “whole” style. In addition, powders obtained by grinding whole capsules or pods should be included under “seed powder” since powdered capsules or pods in some countries were sold in markets as seed powder of small cardamom.
   - Seed powder should be obtained exclusively from seeds, and powders obtained from pods or capsules should not be treated as seed powder of small cardamom. To ensure compliance with the style of seed powder, microscopic analysis would be used to distinguish cells from seeds and those from capsules or pods.
   - Open capsules and powdered capsules or pods should be placed as independent styles separate from the original styles (whole, seeds, and seed powder).

\(^{11}\) CX/ SCH 22/6/6; CX/ SCH 22/6/6 Add.1; CRD6 (Revised proposed draft standard for small cardamom); CRD10 (Chile, Kenya, Malaysia, Saudi Arabia, Tanzania, Uganda); CRD16 (Thailand); CRD21 (AIDSMO)
Rather than categorizing a small cardamom by styles in detail, a comprehensive definition for small cardamom should be provided.

- Opened capsules as well as powdered capsules or pods were already captured as other styles distinctly different from the originally proposed styles, and thus there was no need to include them in the styles of whole or powdered forms nor create new categories for them.

86. CCSCH6 agreed to put the following words/phrases in square brackets: “opened capsules” under the style whole and “whole capsule powder” under the style seed powder, pending possible submission of data for chemical and physical characteristics for opened capsules and whole capsule powder.

Section 3.1 Composition

87. CCSCH6 agreed to align the provision with the layout of SCH standards to read “Product as described in Section 2.”

Annex I - Chemical characteristics for dried small cardamom

Total ash

88. CCSCH6 agreed to adopt the value of 9.5% for total ash for the style seeds noting that this would align with the reference value in ISO 882-2.

Acid insoluble ash

89. One delegation expressed support for the value of 2.5% for the style whole, referring to the European Spice Association’s Quality Minima Document Rev. 5.

90. One delegation proposed the value of 2-3% for style seeds instead of N/A. The EWG Chair explained that N/A had been inserted in the initial stage of drafting, however the rationale was the need to adopt specific and justified values such as 2 or 3.

91. Support was expressed for the value of 2% for the style seeds to differentiate from the value of 3% for powdered seeds where the use of anticaking agents was a normal practice and thus could lead to a higher value of acid insoluble ash. It was noted that the proposed value of 3% for seeds was as a maximum requirement and thus also included 2%.

92. CCSCH6 agreed to set the value of 2.5% for the style whole, and 3% for the style seeds.

Volatile oil

93. CCSCH6 agreed to change the unit for expressing values for volatile from % v/w (min.) to mL/100g (min.) on a dry basis, and considered whether to adopt:

- The value of 1 mL/100g for the style powdered seeds as a minimum requirement noting that the grinding process for seeds tended to reduce the amount of volatile oil in powdered seeds. Moreover, the proposed value of 1 mL/100g for style powdered seeds was a minimum requirement which also covered the higher values proposed such as 3 mL/100g.

- The value of 3 mL/100g for the style powdered seeds which was based on both trade practices as well as industry standards.

94. CCSCH6 agreed to keep both the values of 1 and 3 mL/100g for the style powdered seeds and added a footnote to the value of 1 mL/100g stating “for steam treated seeds”, as it was almost impossible to achieve a value as high as 3 mL/100g for powdered seeds in steam sterilized seeds.

Annex II - Physical characteristics for dried small cardamom

Empty and malformed capsules

95. CCSCH6 agreed to modify the unit to read “count/100 capsule”, in line with ISO 882-1.

Insect defiled/infested

96. One delegation stated that the value of 1% for this provision for the style seeds was not applicable and thus should be replaced with N/A, and further pointed out that the ASTA specification was only applicable to whole dried cardamom supporting the view that N/A was appropriate for seeds.

97. CCSCH6 agreed to replace the value of 1% for the style seeds with N/A.

Extraneous/ foreign matter

98. One delegation proposed that extraneous matter and foreign matter be separated across all styles to ensure a better understanding.
It was pointed out that the definition of extraneous matter was slightly different from that in the relevant ISO standard and other trade-related standards, thus leading to the integrated values for extraneous matter and foreign matter. If extraneous matter and foreign matter should be separated, new values for seeds and powdered seeds should be submitted.

The Chairperson pointed out that the definitions should be aligned with those in the SCH glossary of terms and CCSCH should consider separating extraneous matter and foreign matter and propose corresponding values for each style.

Whole insects, dead; Mammalian excreta; Other excreta; and Mould visible

CCSCH6 amended the unit for expressing whole dead insects to "count/100g".

CCSCH6 discussed these provisions and noted the following views as expressed by delegations;

- For whole style, the value of 4/100g for whole dead insects was too high and should be lowered to 1/100g.
- For seeds, the values for whole dead insects and mould visible should be 4 and 1, respectively rather than N/A. According to ISO 882-1 (whole capsules) and ISO 882-2 (seeds), small cardamom should be almost free from moulds, insects, insect fragments and rodent contamination. Hence it was necessary to determine the acceptable values for whole dead insects and mould visible.
- For seeds, whole dead insects, mammalian excreta, other excreta and mould visible should be N/A since powdered seeds had N/A for these parameters, which was also in accordance with ASTA specifications.
- For whole and seeds, the values for mammalian excreta were too high compared to other relevant standards.
- The use of N/A was not appropriate as it was subject to interpretation. Thus, certain values should be agreed for each provision.
- Whole dead insects could be identified by a visual check and thus a method of analysis for whole dead insects was not needed. Therefore, the value of 4 count/100g should be endorsed rather than leaving it as N/A.
- Even visual inspections required authorized methods of analysis, otherwise potentially leading to international trade disputes. In that sense, N/A should be adopted for provisions where methods of analysis were not available, such as for whole dead insects.
- ISPM 3 guidelines of International Plant Protection Convention (IPPC) can be used for visual inspection to determine the dead and live insects, and mammalian excreta. Thus, leaving N/A for whole dead insects for seeds was not appropriate.

CCSCH6 agreed with the value of 4 count/100g for whole dead insects for whole dried small cardamom, but the requirements for whole dead insects, mammalian excreta, other excreta and mould visible for other styles remained unresolved and were thus kept in square brackets for further consideration.

Live insects

CCSCH6 agreed with the proposal of a delegation to include a new provision for live insects with the value of zero for all styles, noting that this would be consistent with other SCH standards like the Standard for Dried Basil (CXS 345-2021) and the Standard for Dried or Dehydrated Garlic (CXS 347-2019), and it would also harmonise the requirement to those of ISO 882-1 and ISO 882-2 which prescribed that cardamom should be free from live insects.

Methods of analysis

One delegation expressed a concern that there was lack of designated methods for the determination of light seeds, live insects and whole dead insects. It was clarified that ISO 927 was the applicable method for light seeds.

Conclusion

CCSCH6 agreed to:

i. forward the proposed draft standard for dried small cardamom to CAC45 for adoption at Step 5 (Appendix VI);
ii. forward the provisions on labelling and methods of analysis to CCFL and CCMAS, respectively, for endorsement; and
iii. establish an EWG, chaired by India and co-chaired by Guatemala, Iran (Islamic republic of) and the United States of America, working in English only, to consider the outstanding parameters or values, taking into account the comments submitted at Step 6 as well as discussions at CCSCH6.

PROPOSED DRAFT STANDARD FOR SPICES DERIVED FROM DRIED FRUITS AND BERRIES (ALLSPICE, JUNIPER BERRY, STAR ANISE AND VANILLA) (Agenda item 5.3)12

107. The United States of America as Chair of the EWG, speaking also on behalf of the co-chair India, introduced the Agenda Item and explained that two rounds of consultations had been conducted; and a virtual working group session had been held prior to CCSCH6 with the outcome of the discussions compiled in CRD5. It was pointed out that the key outstanding issues related to Vanilla including the sizes; classification; some values in Annex II were in square brackets.

108. The Chairperson of CCSCH recalled that the concept of grouping standards has been under discussion in CCSCH since its second session and the elaboration of a group standard for dried fruits and berries was a pilot activity. Therefore, an active debate with a view to contribute this learning process was encouraged.

109. A delegation proposed to remove vanilla from the proposed draft group standard and rather develop a standalone separate and distinct standard for this spice. Justification for this was that vanilla was an important product for trade that had very distinct chemical and physical characteristics; and existed in very different forms including powder. This proposal was supported by several delegations.

110. CCSCH6 agreed to use CRD5 as the basis for its discussion and considered the proposed draft standard section by section, made editorial corrections, endorsed the different provisions, and reached the following decisions.

Section 1: Scope

111. In response to the proposal to reconsider the scope by clarifying the intended use of the products, viz-a-vis the use of the terms food processing and industrial processing, the CCSCH Chairperson explained that CCSCH3 had developed a glossary terms for SCH standards and that these two terms were defined therein. That document was as an internal reference document by the Committee and can be accessed from the report of CCSCH3. Based on the glossary of terms, the scope should be clear.

Section 2 Description

2.1 Product definition

112. CCSCH6 agreed to include in Table 1, the trade name “Vanilla Maya” i.e Vanilla Maya, Vanilla criibiana and put it in square brackets for further consideration.

2.2 Styles

113. A style “Seeds / vanilla caviar” was inserted and put in square brackets for further consideration.

8.3.2 Country of harvest (optional)

114. CCSCH6 noted a proposal to make labelling of country of harvest mandatory for vanilla, since this product was a high value product and buyers were influenced by the country and region of harvest. The provision was put in square brackets along with the words “mandatory for vanilla” pending further consideration.

Annex I. Methods of Analysis for spices derived from dried Fruits and Berries

115. CCSCH6 endorsed the proposed methods, and deleted the note associated with the methods in the Table.

Annex II. - Chemical Characteristics for dried Fruits and Berries

116. CCSCH6 considered the provisions for the different styles of the dried Fruits and Berries – Allspice, Juniper berry, Star Anise, and Vanilla, and took the follow decisions:

a) Endorsed the proposed values for the different styles (Whole, cut/broken, ground/powdered) for Allspice, Juniper berry, and Star anise.

b) Clarified that the provisions for total ash, acid insoluble ash and volatile were expressed on a dry basis.

c) For Allspice in the style ground/powdered, noted that the value of 8.5 % w/w under “other factors” needed to be further clarified in terms of whether it was a minimum or maximum level.

---

12CX/SCH 22/6/7; CX/SCH 22/6/7 Add1 (Canada, Cuba, Egypt, India, Madagascar, Philippines, Saudi Arabia, Syrian Arab Republic, Uganda, Venezuela (Bolivarian Republic of) and IOSTA); CRD5 (Report of the virtual Working Group on the proposed draft standards for spices derived from dried fruits and berries); CRD11 (Kenya, Madagascar, Mexico, Saudi Arabia, Syria, Uganda); CRD16 (Thailand); CRD21 (AIDSMO)
d) For Star anise, style cut/broken, put the provision for acid insoluble in square brackets for further consideration.

e) For Vanilla, endorsed all the proposed values for all provisions specified under different classes except for the vanillin content in the style whole, and these were put in square brackets for further consideration.

Annex II. - Physical Characteristics for dried fruits and berries

117. CCSCH6:
- endorsed all the proposed provisions for physical characteristics of the different styles for Allspice, Juniper berry, and Star anise except for the extraneous matter for: Juniper berry in styles cut/broken and ground/powdered and Star Anise in style ground/powdered; and these were put in square brackets for further consideration.
- Put the proposed combined provisions, for vanilla – style whole, (i.e. dead whole insect; excreta mammalian; mould damage; insect defiled) in square brackets for further consideration.

118. Several delegations noted that the provisions “other characteristics” specific to vanilla had not been included in the proposed draft standard and reaffirmed their desire to have a separate standard for this product.

119. The Chairperson noted that for the three spices Allspice Juniper berry, and Star anise, only a few technical issues were yet to be clarified and thus remained in square brackets. In the case of vanilla, a number of technical issues remained to be addressed and it should also be agreed whether a separate annex or standard should be elaborated by CCSCH. Considering these aspects, the Chairperson proposed that the provisions for Allspice, Juniper berry, and Star anise be forwarded to the Commission for adoption at Step 5, while the provisions for vanilla be returned to step 2 for redrafting and consideration of comments made on other parts of the proposed draft standard such as the scope.

Conclusion

120. CCSCH6 agreed to:

i. forward to CAC45 the provisions for the proposed draft group standard for spices derived from dried fruits and berries - Allspice, Juniper berry, and Star anise for adoption at Step 5 (Appendix VII Part A);

ii. forward to CCFL and CCMAS for endorsement the labelling provisions and methods of analysis respectively for the draft standard for spices derived from dried fruits and berries - Allspices, Juniper berry, and Star anise

iii. Return the provisions for vanilla in the proposed draft group standard for spices derived from dried fruits and berries to Step 2/3 for redrafting and circulation for comments (Appendix VII Part B)

iv. Establish an EWG, led by the United States of America, and Co-chaired by Madagascar, Mexico and India to further the work on this proposed draft group standard.

PROPOSED DRAFT STANDARD FOR DRIED ROOTS, RHIZOMES AND BULBS - TURMERIC (Agenda Item 6.1)13

121. Iran (Islamic Republic of), as Chair of the EWG, speaking also on behalf of co-Chair India, introduced the Agenda item and recalled that CCSCH5 had agreed to propose this new work and tasked the EWG to develop a proposed draft standard. Following the approval of the new work proposal by CAC44 (2021), the EWG had conducted one round of consultation. Based on comments received in response to CL 2033/30-OCS-SCH, the EWG Chair and co-Chair had further revised the proposed draft standard as presented in CRD19.

122. CCSCH6 agreed to consider CRD19 as the basis for its discussion.

123. CCSCH6 held a general discussion which mainly focused on the amended texts highlighted in CRD19 and made the following comments and/or decisions.

Section 2.1 Product Definition

124. With regard to the new text in Section 2.1.2, one delegation proposed to increase the quality tolerance for fingers from 7 % (min) of pieces (rhizomes of length less than 15 mm and screenings or fragments) to 10% (min).
125. CCSCH6 noted that this provision made reference to ISO 5562 and agreed to transfer the relevant requirements to the table on Physical Characteristics for Dried or Dehydrated Turmeric under a provision for “other factors” and made necessary corrections pertinent to it.

Section 3.1 Composition

126. Consistent with the decision made for other draft standards discussed at this session, CCSCH6 deleted the words “above shall conform to the requirements specified in Annexes I and II” from this provision.

Section 8.2 Name of the Product

127. Two delegations proposed to insert at the end of Section 8.2.1 the following wording: “To avoid confusion to the consumer, the scientific name of the product is optional.” They stressed that turmeric could be commercialized in international trade using misleading names, in order to confuse or mislead consumers about the true nature and characteristics of the product.

128. The Chairperson highlighted that as described in Table 1, the common name of the product was “turmeric” and not “saffron”, which should avoid any confusion. He further proposed to change the word in Section 8.2.3 “may” to “shall” to make the requirement relating to “trade name, variety or cultivar” on the label become mandatory so as to ensure the product was labelled correctly i.e.

8.2.3 Trade name, variety or cultivar shall be listed on the label.

Section 8.4 Labelling of non-retail containers

129. CCSCH6 agreed to replace this provision with the following standardized provision as requested by CAC44:

The labelling of non-retail containers should be in accordance with the General Standard for the Labelling of Non-Retail Containers of Foods (CXS 346-2021).

Annex II: Physical Characteristics for Dried or Dehydrated Turmeric

130. The following proposals were put forward:

- The provision “Mould visible//Insect defiled/Infested %w/w(max)” should be separated into two provisions i.e., “Mould visible %w/w(max)” and “Insect defiled/Infested %w/w (max)”;
- The value for “Mould visible %w/w(max)” cannot be set at zero or N/A;
- The provision “Insect fragments, count/10g (max)” was not applicable to turmeric presented in whole style or the value for this provision should be changed from 2.5 to 3 i.e. whole number and not fractions; and
- The value 2 for “Insect fragments, count/10g (max)” was set based on the ISO 5562, standard and should not be changed.
- Include a column on “Other factors” in Table 3 and transfer information from section 2.1.2 (i.e. 7 % (m/m) of pieces (rhizomes of length less than 15 mm and screenings or fragments); and 5 % (m/m) of bulbs) to this provision.

Conclusion

131. Noting that there was only one round of consultation conducted in the EWG and some provisions and associated values needed further verification, CCSCH6 agreed to:

- return the proposed draft standard for dried roots, rhizomes and bulbs- turmeric to Step 2/3; and
- establish an EWG, chaired by Iran (Islamic Republic of) and co-Chaired by India, working in English only, to redraft the document taking into comments submitted at the session.

132. It was emphasized that the report of the EWG should be made available to the Codex Secretariat at least three months before CCSCH7 for circulation for comments at Step 3.

CONSIDERATION OF THE PROPOSALS FOR NEW WORK (REPLIES TO CL 2022/03-SCH) (Agenda item 7.1)\textsuperscript{14}

133. As requested by CCSCH5 (2021), CL 2022/03-SCH seeking proposals for new work had been distributed in February 2022 with the deadline on 30 June 2022.

134. CCSCH6 noted that no proposals for new work had been submitted and agreed to request Codex Secretariat to issue a new CL calling for submission of proposals for new work.

\textsuperscript{14} CRD13 (Saudi Arabia)
The Chairperson of CCSCH appealed to Members and Observers to submit proposals for new work in reply to the forthcoming CL.

The delegation of United States of America informed the Committee that they would prepare and submit a proposal for new work for a group standard for dried roots, rhizomes and bulbs and called upon Members to provide relevant trade and scientific data to facilitate the work of CCSCH.

**UPDATE TO THE TEMPLATE FOR THE SPICES AND CULINARY HERBS (SCH) STANDARDS (Agenda item 7.2)**

The United States of America, as Chair of the Working Group on updating the Template for Spices and Culinary Herbs (SCH) Standards highlighted that all the updated sections of the template had been agreed upon during the VWG meeting held at the margin of CCSCH6 and that the outcome was contained in CRD23. It was pointed out that the Tables relating chemical and physical characteristics had been revised and/or rearranged as follows:

- Annex I- Table 1 - Chemical Characteristics. The maximum (max) or minimum (min) limits of the chemical parameters were indicated,
- Annex I-Table 2 - Physical Characteristics. The columns were rearranged, grouping similar type of defects next to each other for ease of use.

It was further pointed out that the title of Table 2 needed revision to reflect the fact that the provisions therein were limits for defects (e.g. foreign matter; mould damage; filth etc.) and not physical characteristics which related to the physical nature of a product such as shape; colour etc.

The Chairperson underlined that the template served as a basis for developing SCH standards that have a uniform layout and that the main reason for regularly updating the template was to ensure that it continued to meet the technical needs of CCSCH.

In response to the question by the Chairperson on how the Tables should be numbered, it was explained that the Tables in the standard and its corresponding annexes should be numbered serially starting with Table 1, and that numbering should restart for each Annex.

**Conclusion**

CCSCH6 agreed to:
- carefully review the updated SCH template (Appendix VIII) and that concerns should be submitted for consideration at CCSCH7.
- align the numbering of Tables in the draft and proposed draft standards discussed at CCSCH6 with the guidance provided in the updated SCH Template.

**OTHER BUSINESS (Agenda item 8)**

There were no issues to be discussed under this Agenda item.

**DATE AND PLACE OF THE NEXT SESSION (Agenda item 9)**

CCSCH6 noted that CCSCH7 was tentatively scheduled to be held in approximately 18 months' time subject to confirmation by the Host Secretariat in consultation with the Codex Secretariat.

---

15 CX/SCH 22/6/10; CRD14 (Kenya); CRD21 (AIDSMO); CRD23 (Updated Template)