

# codex alimentarius commission



FOOD AND AGRICULTURE  
ORGANIZATION  
OF THE UNITED NATIONS

WORLD  
HEALTH  
ORGANIZATION



JOINT OFFICE: Viale delle Terme di Caracalla 00153 ROME Tel: 39 06 57051 www.codexalimentarius.net Email: codex@fao.org Facsimile: 39 06 5705 4593

Agenda Item 6(b)

CX/FA 07/39/9-Add. 2

April 2007

Original Language Only

## JOINT FAO/WHO FOOD STANDARDS PROGRAMME

### CODEX COMMITTEE ON FOOD ADDITIVES

Thirty-ninth Session

Beijing, China, 24-28 April 2007

#### COMMENTS ON REPORT OF THE ELECTRONIC WORKING GROUP ON THE GSFA

The following comments have been received from the following Codex Members and observers:  
European Community, Republic of Korea and Norway

This document contains late submissions of comments received after the deadline, but those were submitted before 12 April 2007.

#### European Community

The European Community (EC) would like to thank the United States for the onerous task of the elaboration of this comprehensive report. The EC would also like to express its support to the horizontal approach for the discussion of the provisions for the use of sweeteners and colours. However, the EC does not agree in all cases with the recommendations of this report and would like to offer the following comments:

#### Miscellaneous food additives

#### BENZOATES (INS 210, 211, 212, 213)

1. JECFA has assigned a group ADI of 5 mg/kg bw for benzoates as benzoic acid, and has stated that there is no safety concern at current levels of intake when used as a flavoring agent.

<b>Recommendation 1 - Benzoates, INS 210, 211, 212, 213</b> The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>discontinue</b> further work on the following food additive provisions for benzoates in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max	Level	Comments	Step	Justification Provided

[The European Community agrees to discontinue work on the provisions under recommendation 1](#)

#### BENZOYL PEROXIDE, INS 928

<b>Recommendation 1 – Benzoyl Peroxide, INS 928</b> The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>discontinue</b> further work on the following food additive provisions for benzoyl peroxide in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level	Comments	Step	Justification	

[The European Community agrees to discontinue work on the provisions under recommendation 1](#)

<b>Recommendation 2 - Benzoyl Peroxide, INS 928</b> The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>adopt</b> the following food additive provisions for benzoyl peroxide in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max	Level	Comments	EC comments	
01.8.1	liquid whey	100	mg/kg	Note A <sup>1</sup>	<a href="#">The EC does not support this provision. The use of</a>	

<sup>1</sup> **Note A:** Excluding liquid whey and whey products used as an ingredient in infant formula

<b>Recommendation 2 - Benzoyl Peroxide, INS 928</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>adopt</b> the following food additive provisions for benzoyl peroxide in the GSFA.					
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max	Level	Comments	EC comments
	and whey products, excluding whey cheeses				bleaching agents has the potential to alter the nature of the raw material or the quality of foodstuff and in such a way that it could deceive the consumer.
06.2.1	flours	75	mg/kg		The EC does not support this provision. The use of bleaching agents has the potential to alter the nature of the raw material or the quality of foodstuff and in such a way that it could deceive the consumer.

### The European Community opposes recommendation 2

#### BUTYLATED HYDROXYANISOLE (BHA) (INS 320)

2. The 51<sup>st</sup> JECFA's exposure assessment identified the following food category for closer scrutiny by the CCFAC.

- 05.2 confectionery including hard and soft candy, nougat, etc. other than food categories 05.1, 05.3 and 05.4

3. JECFA has assigned an ADI of 0-0.5 mg/kg bw for BHA.

<b>Recommendation 1 – Butylated Hydroxyanisole (BHA), INS 320</b>						
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>discontinue</b> further work on the following food additive provisions for BHA in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level	Level	Comments	Step	Justification
02.2.1.2	margarine and similar products	175	mg/kg	Notes 15 & 133 <sup>2</sup>	6	Pending decision by CCFO on the draft standard for fat spreads and blends of fat spreads

**The European Community agrees to discontinue work on the provisions under recommendation 1. These provisions should be aligned with the provisions contained within the fat spreads standard. The EC however notes that this additive is not needed in products within Europe as they are refrigerated thus providing a suitable shelf life.**

<b>Recommendation 2 - Butylated Hydroxyanisole (BHA), INS 320</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>adopt</b> the following food additive provisions for BHA in the GSFA.					
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level	Level	Comments	EC Comments
01.3.2	beverage whiteners	100	mg/kg	Notes 15 <sup>3</sup> & 133	
05.2	confectionery including hard and soft candy, nougat, etc. other than food categories 05.1, 05.3 and 05.4	200	mg/kg	Notes 15 & 130	The EC opposes to this provision.
05.4	decorations (e.g., for fine bakery wares), toppings (non-fruit) and sweet sauces	200	mg/kg	Notes 15 & 130	The EC opposes to this provision
07.0	bakery wares	200	mg/kg	Notes 15 & 130	The presence of this additive in products within this category would be acceptable as a result of carryover from products used in their manufacture.

#### BUTYLATED HYDROXYTOLUENE (BHT) (INS 321)

4. The 51<sup>st</sup> JECFA's exposure assessment identified the following for closer scrutiny by the CCFAC.

- 02.0 fats and oils, and fat emulsions (type water-in-oil)

<sup>2</sup> **Note 133:** Any combination of Butylated Hydroxyanisole (BHA, INS 320), Butylated Hydroxytoluene (BHT, INS 321), and Propyl Gallate (INS 310) at 200 mg/kg, provided that single use limits are not exceeded.

<sup>3</sup> **Note 15:** Fat or oil basis.

- 05.3 chewing gum
- 09.2 Processed fish and fish products, including molluscs, crustaceans and echinoderms

5. JECFA has assigned an ADI of 0-0.3 mg/kg bw for BHT.

<b>Recommendation 1 – Butylated Hydroxytoluene (BHT), INS 321</b>						
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>discontinue</b> further work on the following food additive provisions for BHT in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step	Justification
02.2.1.2	margarine and similar products	75	mg/kg	Notes 15 & 133 <sup>4</sup>	3	Pending decision by CCFO on the draft standard for fat spreads and blends of fat spreads. The maximum The use level of BHT at 75 mg/kg is insufficient to function as an antioxidant in foods covered by this food category.

**The European Community agrees to discontinue work on the provisions under recommendation 1. These provisions should be aligned with the provisions contained within the fat spreads standard. The EC however notes that this additive is not needed in products within Europe as they are refrigerated thus providing a suitable shelf life.**

<b>Recommendation 2 - Butylated Hydroxytoluene (BHT), INS 321</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>adopt</b> the following food additive provisions for BHT in the GSFA.					
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	EC Comments
01.3.2	beverage whiteners	100	mg/kg	Notes 15 <sup>5</sup>	
02.2.1.2	margarine and similar products	<b>200</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Notes 15 & 130 <sup>6</sup>	EC agrees that this should be aligned to the fat spread standard under development. The EC however notes that this additive is not needed in products within Europe as they are refrigerated thus providing a suitable shelf life.
05.2	confectionery including hard and soft candy, nougat, etc. other than food categories 05.1, 05.3 and 05.4	200	mg/kg	Notes 15 & 130	The EC opposes to this provision.
05.4	decorations (e.g., for fine bakery wares), toppings (non-fruit) and sweet sauces	200	mg/kg	Notes 15 & 130	The EC opposes to this provision.
07.0	bakery wares	200	mg/kg	Notes 15 & 130	The presence of this additive in products within this category would be acceptable as a result of carryover from products used in their manufacture.
08.2	processed meat, poultry, and game products in whole pieces or cuts	100	mg/kg	Notes 15 & 130	The EC only supports the use of this additive in dehydrated products falling within the category. Note <b>B</b> should therefore be added. Use in other products is unnecessary and would mislead the consumer.
08.3	processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	100	mg/kg	Notes 15 & 130 <b>Note B</b> <sup>7</sup>	The EC only supports the use of this additive in <b>dehydrated products</b> falling within the category. Use in other products is unnecessary and would mislead the consumer.

<sup>4</sup> **Note 133:** Any combination of Butylated Hydroxyanisole (BHA, INS 320), Butylated Hydroxytoluene (BHT, INS 321), and Propyl Gallate (INS 310) at 200 mg/kg, provided that single use limits are not exceeded.

<sup>5</sup> **Note 15:** Fat or oil basis.

<sup>6</sup> **Note 130:** Singly or in combination: Butylated Hydroxyanisole (BHA, INS 320), Butylated Hydroxytoluene (BHT, INS 321), Tertiary Butylated Hydroquinone (TBHQ, INS 319), and Propyl Gallate (INS 310).

<sup>7</sup> **Note B:** For dehydrated products only

**POLYDIMETHYLSILOXANE (INS 900A)**

6. The 23<sup>rd</sup> JECFA (1979) assigned an ADI of 1.5 mg/kg bw for polydimethylsiloxane.

<b>Recommendation - Polydimethylsiloxane, INS 900a</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>adopt</b> the following food additive provisions for polydimethylsiloxane in the GSFA.					
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	EC comments
02.2.2	emulsions containing less than 80% fat	10	mg/kg	Note 152 <sup>8</sup>	EC allows the use in oils and fats for frying only
06.4.3	pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products	50	mg/kg		EC does not support this provision for pre-cooked pastas, however could accept the use in instant noodles only
12.9.1.3	other soybean products (including non-fermented soy sauce)	10	mg/kg		

**CASTOR OIL (INS 1503)**

7. The 23<sup>rd</sup> JECFA (1983) assigned an ADI of 0.7 mg/kg bw/d for castor oil (1503).

<b>Recommendation 1 – Castor Oil, INS 1503</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>discontinue</b> further work on the following food additive provisions for castor oil in the GSFA.					

**EC can agree with recommendation 1**

<b>Recommendation 2 - Castor Oil, INS 1503</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>adopt</b> the following food additive provisions for castor oil in the GSFA.					
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	Step
05.1.4	<b>Cocoa and chocolate products</b>	350	mg/kg		
05.2	confectionery including hard and soft candy, nougat, etc. other than food categories 05.1, 05.3 and 05.4	500	mg/kg	6	
05.3	chewing gum	2100	mg/kg	6	
13.6	food supplements	1000	mg/kg	6	

**Castor oil is not currently regulated as food additive within the European Community and therefore the EC has no comment to offer with regard to recommendation 2.**

**DIACETYLTARTARIC AND FATTY ACID ESTERS OF GLYCEROL (DATEM) (INS 472E)**

8. The 61<sup>st</sup> JECFA (2003) assigned an ADI of 50 mg/kg for INS 472e.

<b>Recommendation 1 – Diacetyltartaric and Fatty Acid Esters of Glycerol (DATEM), INS 472e</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>discontinue</b> further work on the following food additive provisions for DATEM in the GSFA.					
13.1.2	follow-up formulae	5000	mg/kg		3

**EC agrees with recommendation 1**

<b>Recommendation 2 - Diacetyltartaric and Fatty Acid Esters of Glycerol (DATEM), INS 472e</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>adopt</b> the following food additive provisions for DATEM in the GSFA.					
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	EC comments
01.4.2	<b>Sterilized and UHT creams, whipping and whipped creams, and reduced fat creams (plain</b>	6000	mg/kg		
01.4.4	<b>Cream analogues</b>	6000	mg/kg		
06.2	flours and starches (including soybean powder)	3000	mg/kg		EC does not support the use of DATEM in unprocessed food.

<sup>8</sup> **Note 152:** For frying purposes only.

<b>Recommendation 2 - Diacetyltartaric and Fatty Acid Esters of Glycerol (DATEM), INS 472e</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>adopt</b> the following food additive provisions for DATEM in the GSFA.					
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	EC comments
06.4.2	dried pastas and noodles and like products	5000	mg/kg		<b>EC does not support the use in this basic staple food.</b>

### **CALCIUM DISODIUM ETHYLENE DIAMINE TETRA-ACETATE & DISODIUM ETHYLENE DIAMINE TETRA-ACETATE (EDTAs), (INS 385 AND 386)**

9. The 17<sup>th</sup> JECFA (1973) assigned a group ADI of 2.5 mg/kg bw for calcium disodium ethylene diamine tetra-acetate (385) and disodium ethylene diamine tetra acetate (386) with a note stating “As calcium disodium EDTA; no excess disodium EDTA to remain in foods.”

<b>Recommendation - EDTAs, INS 385,386</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>adopt</b> the following food additive provisions for EDTAs in the GSFA.					
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max	Level	Comments	EC comments
14.2.7	aromatized alcoholic beverages (e.g., beer, wine and spirituous cooler-type beverages, low alcoholic refreshers)	25	mg/kg	Note 21 <sup>9</sup>	

### **POLYSORBATES (INS 432, 433, 434, 435, 436)**

10. The 28<sup>th</sup> CAC has adopted several provisions in the GSFA for the use of polysorbates.

11. The 17<sup>th</sup> JECFA (1973) assigned a group ADI for polysorbates (Polyoxyethylene (20) Sorbitan Monolaurate (432), Polyoxyethylene (20) Sorbitan Monooleate (433), Polyoxyethylene (20) Sorbitan Monopalmitate (434), Polyoxyethylene (20) Sorbitan Monostearate (435), and Polyoxyethylene (20) Sorbitan Tristearate (436)) of 25 mg/kg bw/d.

<b>Recommendation 1 – Polysorbates, INS 432, 433, 434, 435, 436</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>discontinue</b> further work on the following food additive provisions for polysorbates in the GSFA.					

### **[The European Community agrees to discontinue work on the provisions under Recommendation 1](#)**

<b>Recommendation 2 - Polysorbates, INS 432, 433, 434, 435, 436</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>adopt</b> the following food additive provisions for polysorbates in the GSFA.					
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max	Level	Comments	EC comments
01.1.2	dairy-based drinks, flavoured and/or fermented (e.g., chocolate milk, cocoa, eggnog, drinking yoghurt, whey-based drinks)	5000	mg/kg		<b>With the proposed level, a child of 15 kg b.w. would reach the ADI of 25 mg/kg b.w. consuming 100 ml of the product. Moreover, EC questions the technological need of this additive in this category. EC doesn't support this provision.</b>
01.3.2	beverage whiteners	<b>4000</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		
01.5.2	milk and cream powder analogues	4000	mg/kg		
01.6.1	unripened cheese	80	mg/kg	Note 38 <sup>10</sup>	<b>The carry over should be enough. EC doesn't support this provision.</b>
01.7	dairy-based desserts (e.g., pudding, fruit or flavoured yoghurt)	<b>3000</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note MM<sup>11</sup></b>	<b>Note MM not relevant should be deleted</b>
02.1.2	vegetable oils and fats	<b>5000</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note MM</b>	
02.1.3	lard, tallow, fish oil, and other animal fats	<b>5000</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note MM</b>	
02.2.1.3	blends of butter and margarine	<b>5000</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note MM</b>	
02.2.2	emulsions containing	<b>5000</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note</b>	

<sup>9</sup> **Note 21:** As anhydrous calcium disodium EDTA.

<sup>10</sup> **Note 38:** Level in creaming mixture.

<sup>11</sup> **Note MM:** For use in fat emulsions for baking purposes only.

<b>Recommendation 2 - Polysorbates, INS 432, 433, 434, 435, 436</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>adopt</b> the following food additive provisions for polysorbates in the GSFA.					
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max</b>	<b>Level</b>	<b>Comments</b>	<b>EC comments</b>
	less than 80% fat			<b>MM</b>	
02.3	fat emulsions mainly of type oil-in-water, including mixed and/or flavoured products based on fat emulsions	<b>5000</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note MM</b>	
02.4	fat-based desserts excluding dairy-based dessert products of food category 01.7	<b>5000</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note MM</b>	<b>The level should be lowered to 3000 mg/kg</b>
04.1.2.8	fruit preparations, including pulp, purees, fruit toppings and coconut milk	<b>5000</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		<b>EC questions the need of this additive in the category. Moreover, with the proposed level, a child of 15 kg b.w. would reach the ADI of 25 mg/kg b.w. consuming 100 ml of the product.</b>
04.1.2.9	fruit-based desserts, including fruit-flavoured water-based desserts	3000	mg/kg		
04.1.2.11	fruit fillings for pastries	<b>3000</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		
04.2.2.3	vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and seaweeds in vinegar, oil, brine, or soy sauce	500	mg/kg		<b>EC questions the technological need of this additive in this category.</b>
04.2.2.4	canned or bottled (pasteurized) or retort pouch vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds	30	mg/kg	Notes 7 <sup>12</sup> & 100 <sup>13</sup>	<b>The carry over should be enough. EC doesn't support this provision.</b>
04.2.2.6	vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed pulps and preparations (e.g., vegetable desserts and sauces, candied vegetables) other than food category 04.2.2.5	3000	mg/kg		
05.1.2	cocoa mixes (syrops)	500	mg/kg		
05.1.3	cocoa-based spreads, including fillings	<b>1000</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		
05.1.4	cocoa and chocolate products	<b>5000</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note XX<sup>14</sup></b>	
05.1.5	imitation chocolate, chocolate substitute products	5000	mg/kg		
05.2	confectionery including hard and soft candy, nougat, etc. other than food categories 05.1, 05.3 and 05.4	<b>1000</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		
05.3	chewing gum	<b>5000</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		

<sup>12</sup> **Note 7:** Use level not in finished food.

<sup>13</sup> **Note 100:** For use as a dispersing agent in dill oil used in the final food.

<sup>14</sup> Use level singly, not to exceed 15,000 mg/kg in combination

<b>Recommendation 2 - Polysorbates, INS 432, 433, 434, 435, 436</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>adopt</b> the following food additive provisions for polysorbates in the GSFA.					
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max</b>	<b>Level</b>	<b>Comments</b>	<b>EC comments</b>
05.4	decorations (e.g., for fine bakery wares), toppings (non-fruit) and sweet sauces	<b>3000</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		
06.4.2	dried pastas and noodles and like products	<b>5000</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		<b>EC questions the technological need of this additive in dried pastas and doesn't support this use.</b>
06.4.3	pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products	<b>5000</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		<b>EC questions the technological need of this additive in pre-cooked pastas and doesn't support this use. EC could accept the use in instant noodles only in accordance with CODEX STAN 249-2006</b>
06.6	batters (e.g., for breading or batters for fish or poultry)	5000	mg/kg	Note 2 <sup>15</sup>	
<b>07.0</b>	<b>Bakery wares</b>	<b>3000</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note 11<sup>16</sup></b>	<b>EC doesn't support the use of this additive in particular in the category 7.1 for ordinary bakery wares as the use in these basic foods with wide consumption would increase the intake of this additive</b> <b>EC can accept the use in category 7.2.</b>
08.2	processed meat, poultry, and game products in whole pieces or cuts	<b>5000</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		<b>The technological need in this category is questioned</b>
08.3	processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	<b>5000</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		<b>The technological need in this category is questioned</b>
08.4	edible casings (e.g., sausage casings)	1500	mg/kg		
10.4	egg-based desserts (e.g., custard)	<b>3000</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		
12.2.1	herbs and spices	2000	mg/kg		<b>The technological need in this category is questioned</b>
12.2.2	seasonings and condiments	<b>5000</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		
12.6.1	emulsified sauces (e.g., mayonnaise, salad dressing)	<b>3000</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		
12.6.2	non-emulsified sauces (e.g., ketchup, cheese sauce, cream sauce, brown gravy)	<b>5000</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		
12.6.3	mixes for sauces and gravies	5000	mg/kg	<b>Note 127<sup>17</sup></b>	
12.6.4	clear sauces (e.g., fish sauce)	<b>5000</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		
12.7	salads (e.g., macaroni salad, potato salad) and sandwich spreads excluding cocoa- and nut-based spreads of food categories 04.2.2.5 and 05.1.3	2000	mg/kg		
12.9.5	other protein products	4000	mg/kg	Note 15 <sup>18</sup>	
13.6	food supplements	<b>25,000</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		
<b>14.1.4</b>	<b>water-based flavoured drinks, including "sport," "energy" or "electrolyte"</b>	<b>500</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note 127<sup>19</sup></b>	<b>The technological need of this additive in the category is questioned.</b> <b>Moreover, with the proposed level, a child of</b>

<sup>15</sup> **Note 2:** On dry ingredient, dry weight, dry mix or concentrate basis.

<sup>16</sup> **Note 11** Flour basis.

<sup>17</sup> **Note 127:** As served to the consumer

<sup>18</sup> **Note 15:** Fat or oil basis.

<b>Recommendation 2 - Polysorbates, INS 432, 433, 434, 435, 436</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>adopt</b> the following food additive provisions for polysorbates in the GSFA.					
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max	Level	Comments	EC comments
	drinks and particulated drinks				15 kg b.w. would reach the ADI of 25 mg/kg b.w. consuming 600 ml of the product.
14.2.6	distilled spirituous beverages containing more than 15% alcohol	120	mg/kg		
14.2.7	aromatized alcoholic beverages (e.g., beer, wine and spirituous cooler-type beverages, low alcoholic refreshers)	120	mg/kg		
16.0	composite foods - foods that could not be placed in categories 01 - 15	1000	mg/kg		The technological need of this additive in the category is questioned. The carry over should be enough.

### POLYVINYL ALCOHOL (INS 1203)

12. The 61<sup>st</sup> JECFA (2003) assigned an ADI of 50 mg/kg bw/d for polyvinyl alcohol.

<b>Recommendation 1 - Polyvinyl Alcohol, INS 1203</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>adopt</b> the following food additive provisions for polyvinyl alcohol in the GSFA.					
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max	Level	Comments	EC comments
13.6	food supplements	45000	mg/kg		This substance is not yet authorized within the EU as a food additive. However the EC recognizes the technological need as glazing agent on food supplements. ML should be reduced to <u>20000 mg/kg</u>

<b>Recommendation 2 - Polyvinyl Alcohol, INS 1203</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>discontinue</b> on the following adopted food additive provisions for polyvinyl alcohol in the GSFA.					

### EC agrees with recommendation 2

### PROPYLENE GLYCOL ESTERS OF FATTY ACIDS (INS 477).

13. The JECFA has assigned an ADI of 25 mg/kg bw for propylene glycol esters of fatty acids.

<b>Recommendation - Propylene Glycol Esters of Fatty Acids, INS 477</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>adopt</b> the following food additive provisions for propylene glycol esters of fatty acids in the GSFA.					
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max	Level	Comments	EC comments
05.1.1	cocoa mixes (powders) and cocoa mass/cake	5000	mg/kg	Note 97 <sup>20</sup>	EC does not support. E477 is not authorized in Cocoa and chocolate products in the EU. Technological need questioned
06.4.3	pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products	5000	mg/kg	Note 2 <sup>21</sup>	EC does not support the use in pre-cooked pastas but could agree to the use for instant noodles only (addition of footnote)

### QUILLAIA EXTRACTS (INS 999)

<b>Recommendation 1 – Quillaia Extract, INS 999</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>revoke</b> the following food additive provision for quillaia extract in the GSFA.					

### The EC agrees with recommendation 1

<b>Recommendation 2 - Quillaia Extract, INS 999</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>adopt</b> the following food additive provision for quillaia extract in the GSFA.					

<sup>19</sup> Note 127 As served to the consumer.

<sup>20</sup> Note 97: In the finished product/final cocoa and chocolate products.

<sup>21</sup> Note 2: On dry ingredient, dry weight, dry mix, or concentrate basis.



Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	EC comments
14.1.4	Water-based flavoured drinks, including "sport" "energy" or "electrolyte" drinks and particulated drinks	50	mg/kg	Note 132 <sup>22</sup> , Note C <sup>23</sup>	

#### SULPHITES (INS 220, 221, 222, 223, 224, 225, 227, 228, 539)

14. The 28<sup>th</sup> CAC has adopted several provisions in the GSFA for the use of sulfites.

15. The 22<sup>nd</sup> JECFA (1978) assigned a group ADI of 0.7 mg/kg bw/d for sulfites (Sulfur Dioxide (220), Sodium Sulfite (221), Sodium Hydrogen Sulfite (222), Sodium Metabisulfite (223), Potassium Metabisulfite (224), Potassium Sulfite (225), Calcium Hydrogen Sulfite (227), Potassium Hydrogen Sulfite (228), and Sodium Thiosulfate (539).

#### Recommendation 1

Revise the GSFA listings for sulphites to associate the food additive functional classes of preservative, antioxidant, and bleaching agent to make the GSFA consistent with the Codex International Numbering System.

#### [The European community agrees with recommendation 1.](#)

#### Recommendation 2 – Sulphites, INS 220, 221, 222, 223, 224, 225, 227, 228, 539

The eWG recommends that the 39<sup>th</sup> CCFA **discontinue** further work on the following food additive provisions for sulphites in the GSFA.

#### [The European community agrees with recommendation 2.](#)

#### Recommendation 3 - Sulphites, INS 220, 221, 222, 223, 224, 225, 227, 228, 539

The eWG recommends that the 39<sup>th</sup> CCFA **adopt** the following food additive provisions for sulphites in the GSFA.

Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	EC COMMENTS
04.1.2.1	frozen fruit	500	mg/kg	Note 44 <sup>24</sup>	EC doesn't support this use ; Commodity standards do not allow this use.
04.1.2.5	jams, jellies and marmelades	500	mg/kg	Note 44	The maximum level is too high ; EC supports 100 mg/kg  CODEX STAN 79-1981 allows for sulphites only as a carryover from raw material at a level of 100 mg/kg
04.1.2.9	fruit-based desserts, including fruit-flavoured water-based desserts	750	mg/kg	Note 44	The maximum level is too high ; EC supports 100 mg/kg Moreover, with the proposed level, a child of 15 kg b.w. would exceed the ADI consuming 100 mg of the product
09.2.4.2	cooked mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	30	mg/kg	Note 44	EC supports the level of <b>150 mg/kg</b> in cooked mollusks, crustaceans and echinoderms and sees the need for adapting also the level in categories 9.1.2 fresh molluscs, crustaceans and echinoderms and 9.2.1 frozen molluscs, crustaceans and echinoderms
09.2.5	smoked, dried, fermented, and/or salted fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	30	mg/kg	Note 44	

<sup>22</sup> **Note 132:** Except for use at **130 mg/kg** (dried basis) in semi-frozen beverages.

<sup>23</sup> **Note C:** Quillaia Extract Type 1 (INS 999(i) only. Acceptable maximum use level is expressed on saponin basis

<sup>24</sup> **Note 44:** As residual SO<sub>2</sub>.

<b>Recommendation 3 - Sulphites, INS 220, 221, 222, 223, 224, 225, 227, 228, 539</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>adopt</b> the following food additive provisions for sulphites in the GSFA.					
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>EC COMMENTS</b>
09.4	fully preserved, including canned or fermented fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	300	mg/kg	Notes 44 & 140 <sup>25</sup>	<b>EC would support a maximum level of 150mg/kg.</b>
11.3	sugar solutions and syrups, also (partially) inverted, including treacle and molasses, excluding products of food category 11.1.3	70	mg/kg	Note 44	<b>EC supports this provision.</b>
12.4	mustards	250	mg/kg	Notes 44 & 106 <sup>26</sup>	<b>EC supports this provision.</b>
12.5	soups and broths	100 0	mg/kg	Note 44	<b>The maximum level is too high and the ADI should be exceeded with a portion.</b>  <b>Moreover, there is no technological need in the whole category, especially there is no need in sterilised and frozen soups and broths.</b>
12.6	sauces and like products	300	mg/kg	Note 44	<b>It should be verified if the carry over from ingredients is sufficient.</b>
14.2.7	aromatized alcoholic beverages (e.g., beer, wine and spirituous cooler-type beverages, low alcoholic refreshers)	350	mg/kg	Note 44 & X <sup>27</sup>	<b>EC does not support this provision except when sulphites are present from carry over.</b>

### **TERTIARY BUTYLHYDROXYQUINONE (TBHQ) (INS 319)**

<b>Recommendation - Tertiary Butylhydroxyquinone (TBHQ), INS 319</b>					
The eWG <b>recommends</b> that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>adopt</b> the following food additive provisions for TBHQ in the GSFA					

01.3.2	beverage whiteners	100	mg/kg	Notes 15 <sup>28</sup> & 130	
08.2	processed meat, poultry, and game products in whole pieces or cuts	100	mg/kg	Notes 15 & 130	<b>The EC only supports the use of this additive in dehydrated products falling within the category. Note B should therefore be added. Use in other products is unnecessary and would mislead the consumer.</b>
08.3	processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	100	mg/kg	Notes 15 & 130 <b>Note B<sup>29</sup></b>	<b>The EC only supports the use of this additive in dehydrated products falling within the category. Use in other products is unnecessary and would mislead the consumer.</b>

<sup>25</sup> **Note 140:** Except for use in canned abalone (PAUA) at 1000 mg/kg.

<sup>26</sup> **Note 106:** Except for use in Dijon mustard at 500 mg/kg.

<sup>27</sup> **Note X:** Acceptable maximum level based on combined state of total sulphites, this is equivalent to 70 mg/kg in the free state.

<sup>28</sup> **Note 15:** Fat or oil basis.

<sup>29</sup> **Note B:** For dehydrated products only

**PART II - SWEETENERS****Recommendation 1 - Sweeteners**

The eWG **recommends** that the 39<sup>th</sup> CCFA discuss the list of food categories for which the use of food additive sweeteners is justified (Appendix II), with a view toward reaching consensus and using the list as a working document in its future discussion of food additive sweeteners.

The EC would like to offer the following comments with regard to the list of food categories for which the use of sweeteners is proposed (Appendix II). The EC considers that it is appropriate to restrict the use of sweeteners, where necessary, to energy reduced foods or foods with no added sugars for the reasons described under Recommendation 2:

ERONAS = Energy reduced or with no added sugar

NAS = No added sugar

ER = Energy reduced

**EC comments on the Food Categories in which the Use of Sweeteners is Technologically Justified**

<b>Food Cat. No.</b>	<b>Food Category Title</b>	<b>Justification Provided to eWG</b>	<b>EC Comments</b>
01.1.2	Dairy-based drinks, flavoured and/or fermented (e.g., chocolate milk, cocoa, eggnog, drinking yoghurt, whey-based drinks)	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission.	ERONAS
01.3.2	Beverage whiteners	1) Use of sweeteners is not technologically justified.  2) Food products in this category containing intense sweeteners are already on the market. Analogues are processed foods and therefore sweeteners should be allowed to be included here. (e.g., coffee creamers).	Technological need questioned. The use could mislead the consumers.
01.4.4	Cream analogues	1) Use of sweeteners is not technologically justified.  2) Food products in this category containing intense sweeteners are already on the market. Analogues are processed foods and therefore sweeteners should be allowed to be included here. (e.g., coffee creamers).	Technological need questioned.
01.5.2	Milk and cream powder analogues	1) Use of sweeteners is not technologically justified.  2) Food products in this category containing intense sweeteners are already on the market. Analogues are processed foods and therefore sweeteners should be allowed to be included here.	Technological need questioned.
01.6.5	Cheese analogues	1) Use of sweeteners is not technologically justified.  2) Food products in this category containing intense sweeteners are already on the market. Analogues are processed foods and therefore sweeteners should be allowed to be included here.	Technological need questioned. Use could mislead the consumers
01.7	Dairy-based desserts (e.g., pudding, fruit or flavoured yoghurt)	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission.	ERONAS
02.3	Fat emulsions mainly of type oil-in-water, including mixed and/or flavoured products based on fat emulsions	1) Use of sweeteners is not technologically justified.  2) Use of intense sweeteners in fat emulsions allows for the manufacture of pre-sweetened, flavoured products, as this category includes products with added flavours. They have the same technological requirements as their dairy-based counterparts.	Technological need questioned. Use could mislead the consumers
02.4	Fat-based desserts excluding dairy-based dessert products of food category 01.7	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission.	ERONAS
3.0	Edible ices, including sherbet and	Include at request of Brazil and the European	ERONAS

EC comments on the Food Categories in which the Use of Sweeteners is Technologically Justified			
Food Cat. No.	Food Category Title	Justification Provided to eWG	EC Comments
	sorbet	Commission.	
04.1.2.3	Fruit in vinegar, oil, or brine	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission.	For use in sweet sour preserves
04.1.2.4	Canned or bottled (pasteurized) fruit	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission.	ERONAS
04.1.2.5	Jams, jellies, marmelades	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission.	ER
04.1.2.6	Fruit-based spreads (e.g., chutney) excluding products of food category 04.1.2.5	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission.	ER
04.1.2.7	Candied fruit	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission.	ER
04.1.2.8	Fruit preparations, including pulp, purees, fruit toppings and coconut milk	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission.	ER
04.1.2.9	Fruit-based desserts, incl. fruit-flavoured water-based desserts	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission.	ERONAS
04.1.2.10	Fermented fruit products	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission.	ER. If no other interest, EC does not support
04.1.2.11	Fruit fillings for pastries	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission.	ER
04.1.2.12	Cooked fruit	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission.	ER. If no other interest, EC does not support
04.2.2.3	Vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds in vinegar, oil, brine, or soy sauce	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission.	For use in sweet sour preserves only
04.2.2.5	Vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed purees and spreads (e.g., peanut butter)	1) Use of sweeteners is <u>not</u> technologically justified 2) Use of sweeteners is technologically justified	ER
04.2.2.6	Vegetable, (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed pulps and preparations (e.g., vegetable desserts and sauces, candied vegetables) other than food category 04.2.2.5	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission.	ERONAS
04.2.2.7	Fermented vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and seaweed products, excluding fermented soybean products of food category 12.10	Examples are requested	ER
05.1.2	Cocoa mixes (syrups)	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission.	ERONAS
05.1.3	Cocoa-based spreads, incl. fillings	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission.	ERONAS
05.1.4	Cocoa and chocolate products	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission.	ERONAS
05.1.5	Imitation chocolate, chocolate substitute products	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission.	ERONAS
05.2	Confectionery including hard and soft candy, nougats, etc. other than food categories 05.1, 05.3 and 05.4	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission.	ERONAS
05.2.1	Hard candy	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission.	ERONAS
05.2.2	Soft candy	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission.	ERONAS

EC comments on the Food Categories in which the Use of Sweeteners is Technologically Justified			
Food Cat. No.	Food Category Title	Justification Provided to eWG	EC Comments
05.2.3	Nougats and marzipans	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission.	ERONAS
05.3	Chewing gum	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission.	NAS
05.4	Decorations (e.g., for fine bakery wares), toppings (non-fruit), and sweet sauces	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission.	ERONAS
06.3	Breakfast cereals, including rolled oats	1) Use of sweeteners is <u>not</u> technologically justified 2) Use of sweeteners is technologically justified	ERONAS. For use in breakfast cereals with a determined fibre content.
06.5	Cereal and starch based desserts (e.g., rice pudding, tapioca pudding)	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission.	ERONAS
06.7	Pre-cooked or processed rice products, including rice cakes (Oriental type only)	1) Use of sweeteners is <u>not</u> technologically justified 2) Use of sweeteners is technologically justified	ERONAS
07.1	Bread and ordinary bakery wares		Technological need questioned. Basic food with wide consumption that would increase intake
07.2	Fine bakery wares (sweet, salty, savoury) and mixes	1) Use of sweeteners is <u>not</u> technologically justified 2) Use of sweeteners is technologically justified	If technological demonstrated, for use only in products for special nutritional purpose
09.3	Semi-preserved fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	Examples are requested	Only in sweet sour preserves
09.4	Fully preserved, including canned or fermented fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	Examples are requested	Only in sweet sour preserves
10.4	Egg-based desserts (e.g., custard)	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission.	ERONAS
11.4	Other sugars and syrups, xylose, maple sugar, sugar toppings	Examples are requested	Technological need questioned.
11.6	Table-top sweeteners, including those containing high-intensity sweeteners	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission.	Agree
12.2	Herbs, spices, seasonings and condiments (e.g., seasoning for instant noodles)	1) Use of sweeteners is <u>not</u> technologically justified 2) Use of sweeteners is technologically justified	Technological need questioned.
12.3	Vinegars	1) Use of sweeteners is not technologically justified. 2) Vinegar is rounded and mellowed by addition of sweet-tasting, flavour-enhancing products. Intense sweeteners balance acidity well.	Technological need questioned. The use could mislead the consumer.
12.4	Mustards	1) Include at the request of the European Commission. 2) Clarification is requested on whether this is a sweetener or flavor enhancer use?	Agree
12.5	Soups and broths	1) Include at the request of the European Commission. 2) Clarification is requested on whether this is a	ER

EC comments on the Food Categories in which the Use of Sweeteners is Technologically Justified			
Food Cat. No.	Food Category Title	Justification Provided to eWG	EC Comments
		sweetener or flavor enhancer use?	
12.6	Sauces and like products	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission.	Agree
12.7	Salads (e.g., macaroni salad, potato salad) and sandwich spreads excluding cocoa-and nut-based spreads of food categories 04.2.2.5 and 05.1.3	1) Include at the request of the European Commission. 2) Clarification is requested on whether this is a sweetener or flavor enhancer use?	ERONAS for the milk based sandwich spreads
13.3	Dietetic foods intended for special medical purposes (excluding products of food category 13.1)	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission.	Agree
13.4	Dietetic formulae for slimming purposes and weight reduction	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission.	Agree
13.5	Dietetic foods (e.g., supplementary foods for dietary use) excluding products of food categories 13.1- 13.4 and 13.6	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission.	Agree
13.6	Food supplements	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission.	Agree
14.1.2.2	Vegetable juice	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission.	ERONAS
14.1.2.4	Concentrates for vegetable juice	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission.	ERONAS
14.1.3.1	Fruit nectar	1) Include at the request of Brasil, EC, ICBA and IFAC. 2) Sweeteners are permitted for use in fruit nectars in many countries and adopted provisions for sweeteners exist in the Codex General Standard for Food Additives.	ERONAS
14.1.3.2	Vegetable nectar	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission.	ERONAS
14.1.3.3	Concentrates for fruit nectar	1) Include at the request of Brazil. 2) Sweeteners are permitted for use in fruit nectars in many countries and adopted provisions for sweeteners exist in the Codex General Standard for Food Additives.	ERONAS
14.1.3.4	Concentrates for vegetable nectar	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission.	ERONAS
14.1.4	Water-based flavoured drinks, including "sport," "energy," or "electrolyte" drinks and particulated drinks	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission.	ERONAS
14.1.5	Coffee, coffee substitutes, tea, herbal infusions, and other hot cereal and grain beverages, excluding cocoa	Intense sweeteners are widely used in these beverages (ready-to-drink as well as concentrates), owing to their relative stability in liquids. Sweeteners are already used in this category in Japan and several other countries in water and milk-based malted beverages.	Should be limited to milk-based malted beverages
14.2.1	Beer and malt beverages	1) Use of sweeteners is <u>not</u> technologically justified 2) Use of sweeteners is technologically justified	For use only in energy reduced and alcohol-free beer
14.2.2	Cider and perry	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission	Agree
14.2.4	Wines (other than grapes)	1) Use of sweeteners is <u>not</u> technologically justified 2) Use of sweeteners is <u>technologically justified</u>	Technological need questioned.
14.2.7	Aromatized alcoholic beverages (e.g., beer, wine and spirituous cooler-type beverages, low-alcoholic refreshers)	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission	Agree
15.0	Ready-to-eat savouries	Include at request of Brazil and the European Commission	Agree for certain flavours only and coated

EC comments on the Food Categories in which the Use of Sweeteners is Technologically Justified			
Food Cat. No.	Food Category Title	Justification Provided to eWG	EC Comments
			nuts

#### Recommendation 2 – Sweeteners

The eWG recommends that the 39<sup>th</sup> CCFA consider whether additional notes restricting the use of food additive sweeteners to energy reduced products etc (i.e., Notes 68,4413845. 14446, 14547, , D48, E49, F50, G51, H52, J53, K54, L55, M56, N57) should be included in the GSFA.

Sweeteners are an important class of food additives within the EU, however in addition to the need to control the intake of these additives the use of sweeteners is also limited as a result of the potential to mislead the consumer. The general criteria for the use of sweeteners are: to replace sugar for the production of energy reduced foods, non-cariogenic foods, or foods with no added sugars.

If we accept that the use of sweeteners would contribute to the control of caloric intake through the manufacture of energy reduced food, such reduction of energy should be appreciable in order on the one hand not to deceive the consumer and on the other to truthfully contribute to the objective of reducing energy intake. In the EC energy reduction is set at 30%. The Codex **Guidelines For Use Of Nutrition And Health Claims (CAC/GL 23-1997, Rev. 1-20041)** sets a relative difference of at least 25% in the energy value for a food to be claimed as energy reduced.

The EC therefore supports the inclusion of the additional notes in the GSFA.

#### ACESULFAME POTASSIUM (INS 950)

16. The 37<sup>th</sup> JECFA (1990) assigned an ADI of 15 mg/kg bw/d for acesulfame potassium.

#### Recommendation 1 – Acesulfame Potassium, INS 950

The eWG recommends that the 39<sup>th</sup> CCFA **discontinue** further work on the following food additive provisions for acesulfame potassium in the GSFA.

#### EC agrees with recommendation 1

#### Recommendation 2 - Acesulfame Potassium, INS 950

The eWG recommends that the 39<sup>th</sup> CCFA **adopt** the following food additive provisions for acesulfame potassium in the GSFA.

Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max	Level	Comments	EC Comments
01.1.2	dairy-based drinks, flavoured and/or fermented (e.g., chocolate milk, cocoa, eggnog, drinking yoghurt, whey-based drinks)	350	mg/kg	[Note 145 <sup>30</sup> ]	Support provision with the exception of chocolate milk.
01.7	dairy-based desserts (e.g., pudding, fruit or flavoured yoghurt)	350	mg/kg	[Note 145]	
02.4	fat-based desserts excluding dairy-based dessert products of food category 01.7	350	mg/kg	[Note 145]	
03.0	edible ices, including sherbet and sorbet	800	mg/kg	[Note 145]	
04.1.2.3	fruit in vinegar, oil, or brine	200	mg/kg	[Note 145]	
04.1.2.4	canned or bottled (pasteurized) fruit	350	mg/kg	[Note 145]	
04.1.2.5	jams, jellies and marmelades	1000	mg/kg	[Note 138 <sup>31</sup> ]	
04.1.2.6	fruit-based spreads (e.g., chutney) excluding products of food category 04.1.2.5	1000	mg/kg	[Note 138]	
04.1.2.7	candied fruit	500	mg/kg	[Note 145]	
04.1.2.8	fruit preparations, including pulp,	350	mg/kg	[Note 138]	

<sup>30</sup> **Note 145:** Products are energy reduced or with no added sugar.

<sup>31</sup> **Note 138:** For use in energy-reduced products only.

<b>Recommendation 2 - Acesulfame Potassium, INS 950</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <u>adopt</u> the following food additive provisions for acesulfame potassium in the GSFA.					
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max</b>	<b>Level</b>	<b>Comments</b>	<b>EC Comments</b>
	purees, fruit toppings and coconut milk				
04.1.2.9	fruit-based desserts, including fruit-flavoured water-based desserts	350	mg/kg	[Note 138]	
04.1.2.10	fermented fruit products	350	mg/kg	[Note 138]	
04.1.2.11	fruit fillings for pastries	350	mg/kg	[Note 138]	
04.2.2.3	vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and seaweeds in vinegar, oil, brine, or soy sauce	200	mg/kg	[Note 144 <sup>32</sup> ]	
04.2.2.6	vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed pulps and preparations (e.g., vegetable desserts and sauces, candied vegetables) other than food category 04.2.2.5	350	mg/kg	[Note 138]	
05.1.1	cocoa mixes (powders) and cocoa mass/cake	350	mg/kg	Note 97 <sup>33</sup>	[Note 145]
05.1.2	cocoa mixes (syrups)	350	mg/kg	[Note 145] Note 97	
05.1.3	<b>COCOA-BASED SPREADS, INCLUDING FILLINGS</b>	1000	mg/kg	[Note 145]	
05.1.4	<b>COCOA AND CHOCOLATE PRODUCTS</b>	500	mg/kg		[Note 145]
05.1.5	<b>IMITATION CHOCOLATE, CHOCOLATE SUBSTITUTE PRODUCTS</b>	500	mg/kg	[Note 145]	
05.2.1	hard candy	500	mg/kg	[Note 145]	
05.2.2	soft candy	1000	mg/kg	[Note 145]	
05.2.3	nougats and marzipans	1000	mg/kg	[Note 145]	
05.4	decorations (e.g., for fine bakery wares), toppings (non-fruit) and sweet sauces	500	mg/kg	[Note 145]	
06.3	breakfast cereals, including rolled oats	1200	mg/kg	[Note 145] & Note N <sup>34</sup>	
06.4.2	dried pastas and noodles and like products	200	mg/kg		EC does not support the provision. Use could mislead consumers. Not permitted in CODEX STAN 249-2006
06.5	cereal and starch based desserts (e.g., rice pudding, tapioca pudding)	350	mg/kg	[Note 145]	
07.1	bread and ordinary bakery wares	1000	mg/kg		EC does not support the provision Extending use to bread could possibly lead to high sweetener consumption and ADI being exceeded.
<b>07.2</b>	<b>Fine bakery wares (sweet, salty,</b>	<b>1000</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>[Note D<sup>35</sup>]</b>	

<sup>32</sup> **Note 144:** For use in sweet and sour products only

<sup>33</sup> **Note 97:** In the finished product/final cocoa and chocolate products

<sup>34</sup> **Note N:** For use in breakfast cereals with a fibre content of more than 15% and containing at least 20% bran only.



<b>Recommendation 2 - Acesulfame Potassium, INS 950</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>adopt</b> the following food additive provisions for acesulfame potassium in the GSFA.					
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max</b>	<b>Level</b>	<b>Comments</b>	<b>EC Comments</b>
	<b>savory) and mixes</b>				
09.3	semi-preserved fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	200	mg/kg	[Note 144]	
09.4	fully preserved, including canned or fermented fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	200	mg/kg	[Note 144]	
10.4	egg-based desserts (e.g., custard)	350	mg/kg	[Note 145]	
11.4	other sugars and syrups (e.g., xylitol, maple syrup, sugar toppings)	1000	mg/kg		EC does not support the provision. Use could mislead consumers
11.6	table-top sweeteners, including those containing high-intensity sweeteners		GMP		
12.4	mustards	350	mg/kg		
12.5	soups and broths	110	mg/kg	[Note 138]	
<b>12.6</b>	<b>saucers and like products</b>	<b>1000</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		Lower to 350 mg/kg
12.7	salads (e.g., macaroni salad, potato salad) and sandwich spreads excluding cocoa- and nut-based spreads of food categories 04.2.2.5 and 05.1.3	1000	mg/kg	[Note 145]	Lower to 350 mg/kg
13.3	dietetic foods intended for special medical purposes (excluding products of food category 13.1)	500	mg/kg		Lower to 450 mg/kg
13.4	dietetic formulae for slimming purposes and weight reduction	450	mg/kg		
13.5	dietetic foods (e.g., supplementary foods for dietary use) excluding products of food categories 13.1 - 13.4 and 13.6	450	mg/kg		
13.6	food supplements	350	mg/kg	[Note E <sup>36</sup> ]	In addition to Note E, 2000 mg/kg for food supplements in syrup-type or chewable form.
14.1.2.2	vegetable juice	350	mg/kg	[Note 145]	
14.1.2.4	concentrates for vegetable juice	350	mg/kg	Note 127, [145]	
14.1.3.4	concentrates for vegetable nectar	350	mg/kg	Note, 127, [145]	
14.1.4	water-based flavoured drinks, including "sport," "energy," or "electrolyte" drinks and particulated drinks	350	mg/kg	[Note 145]	
14.2.1	beer and malt beverages	350	mg/kg		For use in energy reduced beer and alcohol-free beer only. Add Note H
14.2.2	cider and perry	350	mg/kg		
14.2.7	aromatized alcoholic beverages (e.g., beer, wine and spirituous cooler-type beverages, low alcoholic refreshers)	350	mg/kg		
<b>15.0</b>	<b>Ready-to-eat savouries</b>	<b>350</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		

#### ALITAME (INS 956)

17. The 46<sup>th</sup> JECFA (1996) assigned an ADI of 1 mg/kg bw/d for alitame

**Within in the EU alitame is not currently permitted for use as a sweetener and therefore the European Community are not able to suggest levels of use.** However, when considering the low ADI which has been assigned by JECFA the levels and range of categories should be examined closely. **As a general rule**

<sup>35</sup> **Note D:** For use in products for special nutritional purposes only.

<sup>36</sup> **Note E:** For use in products in liquid form; 500 mg/kg for use in products in solid form.

sweeteners should be restricted to Energy reduced or with no added sugar products unless there are specific exemptions required.

<b>Recommendation 1 - Alitame, INS 956</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>discontinue</b> work on the following food additive provisions for alitame in the GSFA.					
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level	Comments	EC comments	Justification provided to eWG

### EC agrees with recommendation 1

<b>Recommendation 2 - Alitame, INS 956</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>adopt</b> the following food additive provisions for alitame in the GSFA.					
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level	Comments	EC comments	
01.1.2	dairy-based drinks, flavoured and/or fermented (e.g., chocolate milk, cocoa, eggnog, drinking yoghurt, whey-based drinks)	100	mg/kg	[Note 145]	
01.7	dairy-based desserts (e.g., pudding, fruit or flavoured yoghurt)	100	mg/kg	[Note 145]	
03.0	edible ices, including sherbet and sorbet	100	mg/kg	[Note 145]	
04.1.2.5	jams, jellies and marmelades	100	mg/kg	[Note 138]	
05.1.2	cocoa mixes (syrops)	300	mg/kg		Note 145
05.1.3	cocoa-based spreads, including fillings	300	mg/kg		Note 145
05.1.4	cocoa and chocolate products	300	mg/kg		Note 145
05.1.5	imitation chocolate, chocolate substitute products	300	mg/kg		Note 145
05.2	confectionery including hard and soft candy, nougats, etc. other than food categories 05.1, 05.3 and 05.4	300	mg/kg		Note 138
05.3	chewing gum	300	mg/kg		Note 138
05.4	decorations (e.g., for fine bakery wares), toppings (non-fruit), and sweet sauces	300	mg/kg		Note 138
07.1	Bread and ordinary bakery wares	200	mg/kg		Discontinue Basic foods with wide consumption that would increase intake
11.4	other sugars and syrups (e.g., xylose, maple syrup, sugar toppings)	200	mg/kg		EC does not support the provision. Use could mislead consumers
11.6	table-top sweeteners, including those containing high-intensity sweeteners		GMP		
12.5	soups and broths	40	mg/kg	[Note 145]	
13.5	dietetic foods (e.g., supplementary foods for dietary use) excluding products of food categories 13.1 - 13.4 and 13.6	300	mg/kg		
14.1.4	water-based flavoured drinks, including "sport," "energy," or "electrolyte" drinks and particulated drinks	40	mg/kg	[Note 145]	

<b>Recommendation 3 - Alitame, INS 956</b>					
Comments are requested on the following food additive provisions for alitame in the GSFA.					
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level	Comments	EC comments	Justification provided to eWG
01.4.4	Cream analogues	100	mg/kg	Technological need	1) Proposed new use 2) Alitame allows for the

<b>Recommendation 3 - Alitame, INS 956</b>						
<b>Comments are requested</b> on the following food additive provisions for alitame in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	EC comments	Justification provided to eWG
					<b>questioned</b>	manufacture of pre-sweetened cream analogues with no added carbohydrates, no added flavours and no added other foods.
12.2	herbs, spices, seasonings, and condiments (e.g., seasoning for instant noodles)	100	mg/kg		<b>Technological need questioned</b>	Herbs, spices, seasoning and condiments are sometimes rounded by the addition of sweet-tasting and flavour-enhancing products such as alitame and other intense sweeteners.

**ASPARTAME, INS 951**

<b>Recommendation 1 – Aspartame, INS 951</b> The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>discontinue</b> further work on the following food additive provisions for aspartame in the GSFA.
--

**EC agrees with recommendation 1**

<b>Recommendation 2 - Aspartame, INS 951</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>adopt</b> the following food additive provisions for aspartame in the GSFA.					
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	EC Comments
01.1.2	dairy-based drinks, flavoured and/or fermented (e.g., chocolate milk, cocoa, eggnog, drinking yoghurt, whey-based drinks)	600	mg/kg	[Note 145]	
01.4.2	sterilized and UHT creams, whipping and whipped creams, and reduced fat creams (plain)	6000	mg/kg		Does not support.
01.5.2	milk and cream powder analogues	2000	mg/kg		Does not support.
01.7	dairy-based desserts (e.g., pudding, fruit or flavoured yoghurt)	1000	mg/kg	[Note 145]	
02.4	fat-based desserts excluding dairy-based dessert products of food category 01.7	1000	mg/kg	[Note 145]	
03.0	edible ices, including sherbet and sorbet	1000	mg/kg	[Note 145]	EC Regulations permit and hence the technological effect can be achieved with 800 mg/kg
04.1.2.3	fruit in vinegar, oil, or brine	300	mg/kg	[Note 144]	
04.1.2.4	canned or bottled (pasteurized) fruit	1000	mg/kg	[Note 145]	
04.1.2.5	jams, jellies and marmelades	1000	mg/kg	[Note 138]	
04.1.2.6	fruit-based spreads (e.g., chutney) excluding products of food category 04.1.2.5	1000	mg/kg	[Note 138]	
04.1.2.7	candied fruit	2000	mg/kg	[Note 145]	
04.1.2.8	fruit preparations, including pulp, purees, fruit toppings and coconut milk	1000	mg/kg	[Note 138]	
04.1.2.9	fruit-based desserts, including fruit-flavoured water-based desserts	1000	mg/kg	[Note 145]	
04.1.2.10	fermented fruit products	1000	mg/kg	[Note 138]	
04.1.2.11	fruit fillings for pastries	1000	mg/kg	[Note 138]	
04.1.2.12	cooked fruit	1000	mg/kg	[Note 145]	
04.2.2.3	vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots)	300	mg/kg	[Note 144]	

<b>Recommendation 2 - Aspartame, INS 951</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>adopt</b> the following food additive provisions for aspartame in the GSFA.					
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>EC Comments</b>
	and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and seaweeds in vinegar, oil, brine, or soy sauce				
04.2.2.6	vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed pulps and preparations (e.g., vegetable desserts and sauces, candied vegetables) other than food category 04.2.2.5	1000	mg/kg	[Note 138]	
04.2.2.7	fermented vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweed products, excluding fermented soybean products of food category 12.10	1000	mg/kg	[Note 138]	
05.1.1	cocoa mixes (powders) and cocoa mass/cake	3000	mg/kg	Note 97	Lower to 1000 mg/kg
05.1.2	cocoa mixes (syrups)	1000	mg/kg	[Note 145]	
05.3	chewing gum	10000	mg/kg	[Note 68 <sup>37</sup> ]	Lower to 5500 mg/kg
05.4	decorations (e.g., for fine bakery wares), toppings (non-fruit) and sweet sauces	1000	mg/kg	[Note 145]	
06.3	breakfast cereals, including rolled oats	1000	mg/kg	[Note 145, & N <sup>38</sup> ]	
06.5	cereal and starch based desserts (e.g., rice pudding, tapioca pudding)	1000	mg/kg	[Note 145]	
07.1	bread and ordinary bakery wares	4000	mg/kg		EC does not support the provision. Extending use to bread could possibly lead to high sweetener consumption and ADI being exceeded.
07.2	fine bakery wares (sweet, salty, savoury) and mixes	1700	mg/kg	[Note D]	
09.2	processed fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	300	mg/kg	[Note 144]	
09.3	semi-preserved fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	300	mg/kg	[Note 144]	
09.4	fully preserved, including canned or fermented fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	300	mg/kg	[Note 144]	
10.4	egg-based desserts (e.g., custard)	1000	mg/kg	[Note 145]	
11.4	other sugars and syrups (e.g., xylose, maple syrup, sugar toppings)	3000	mg/kg		EC does not support the provision. Use could mislead consumers
11.6	table-top sweeteners, including those containing		GMP		

<sup>37</sup> **Note 68** For use in products with no added sugar only.

<sup>38</sup> **Note N:** For use in breakfast cereals with a fibre content of more than 15% and containing at least 20% bran only

<b>Recommendation 2 - Aspartame, INS 951</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>adopt</b> the following food additive provisions for aspartame in the GSFA.					
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>EC Comments</b>
	high-intensity sweeteners				
12.4	mustards	350	mg/kg		
<b>12.6</b>	<b>Sauces and like products</b>	<b>350</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		
12.7	salads (e.g., macaroni salad, potato salad) and sandwich spreads excluding cocoa- and nut-based spreads of food categories 04.2.2.5 and 05.1.3	<b>350</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	[Note 145, F <sup>39</sup> ]	
13.3	dietetic foods intended for special medical purposes (excluding products of food category 13.1)	1000	mg/kg		
13.4	dietetic formulae for slimming purposes and weight reduction	800	mg/kg		
13.5	dietetic foods (e.g., supplementary foods for dietary use) excluding products of food categories 13.1 - 13.4 and 13.6	<b>1000</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		
13.6	food supplements	<b>600</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	[Note G <sup>40</sup> ]	In addition to Footnote G, 5500 mg/kg for food supplements in syrup-type or chewable form.
14.1.2.2	vegetable juice	<b>600</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	[Note 145]	
14.1.2.4	concentrates for vegetable juice	<b>600</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Note 127, [Note 145]	
14.1.3.2	vegetable nectar	<b>600</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	[Note 145]	
14.1.3.4	concentrates for vegetable nectar	<b>600</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Note 127, [Note 145]	
14.1.4	water-based flavoured drinks, including "sport," "energy," or "electrolyte" drinks and particulated drinks	<b>600</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	[Note 145]	
14.2.1	beer and malt beverages	600	mg/kg	[Note H <sup>41</sup> ]	
14.2.2	cider and perry	600	mg/kg		
14.2.7	aromatized alcoholic beverages (e.g., beer, wine and spirituous cooler-type beverages, low alcoholic refreshers)	<b>600</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		

<b>Recommendation 3 - Aspartame, INS 951</b>					
<b>Comments are requested</b> on the following food additive provisions for aspartame in the GSFA.					
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>EC comments</b>
01.3.2	beverage whiteners	6000	mg/kg		Does not support. Use could mislead consumer
01.4.4	cream analogues	1000	mg/kg		Does not support.
01.5.1	milk powder and cream powder (plain)	5000	mg/kg		Does not support.
01.6.1	unripened cheese	1000	mg/kg		Does not support. Use could mislead consumer
01.6.5	cheese analogues	1000	mg/kg		Does not support. Use could mislead consumer
02.3	fat emulsions mainly of type oil-in-water, including mixed and/or flavoured products based on fat emulsions	1000	mg/kg		Does not support. Use could mislead consumer

<sup>39</sup> **Note F:** For milk-based sandwich spreads only.

<sup>40</sup> **Note G:** For use in products in liquid form; 2000 mg/kg for products in solid form.

<sup>41</sup> **Note H:** For use in energy-reduced or alcohol-free beer only

<b>Recommendation 3 - Aspartame, INS 951</b>					
<b>Comments are requested</b> on the following food additive provisions for aspartame in the GSFA.					
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>EC comments</b>
04.1.2.1	frozen fruit	2000	mg/kg		Does not support. Use could mislead consumer
04.1.2.2	dried fruit	3000	mg/kg		Does not support. Use could mislead consumer
04.2.2.1	frozen vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds	1000	mg/kg		Does not support. Use could mislead consumer
04.2.2.2	dried vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds	1000	mg/kg		Does not support. Use could mislead consumer
04.2.2.4	canned or bottled (pasteurized) or retort pouch vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds	1000	mg/kg		EC allows for use in sweet-sour preserves only and at 300 mg/kg only
04.2.2.5	vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed purees and spreads (e.g., peanut butter)	3000	mg/kg		EC allows use in ERONAS and at 1000 mg/kg
04.2.2.8	cooked or fried vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds	1000	mg/kg		EC allows for use in sweet-sour preserves only and at 300 mg/kg only
05.1.3	cocoa-based spreads, including fillings	3000	mg/kg		EC allows in ERONAS only and at 1000 mg/kg
05.1.4	cocoa and chocolate products	2500	mg/kg		EC allows in ERONAS only and at 2000 mg/kg
05.1.5	imitation chocolate, chocolate substitute products	3000	mg/kg		EC allows in ERONAS only and at 2000 mg/kg
05.2.1	hard candy	10000	mg/kg		EC allows in ERONAS only and at 1000 mg/kg
05.2.2	soft candy	3000	mg/kg		EC allows in ERONAS only and at 1000 mg/kg
05.2.3	nougats and marzipans	3000	mg/kg		EC allows in ERONAS only and at 1000 mg/kg
08.2	processed meat, poultry, and game products in whole pieces or cuts	300	mg/kg		Does not support. Use could mislead consumer
08.3	processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	300	mg/kg		Does not support. Use could mislead consumer
12.2.2	seasonings and condiments	2000	mg/kg		Does not support. Use could mislead consumer
12.3	vinegars		GMP		Does not support. Use could mislead consumer
12.5	soups and broths	600	mg/kg		EC permits in ER only at 110 mg/kg
14.1.5	coffee, coffee substitutes, tea, herbal infusions, and other hot cereal and grain beverages, excluding cocoa	5000	mg/kg		Does not support. Use could mislead consumer
14.2.4	wines (other than grape)	700	mg/kg		Technological need is questioned

<b>Recommendation 3 - Aspartame, INS 951</b>					
<b>Comments are requested</b> on the following food additive provisions for aspartame in the GSFA.					
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>EC comments</b>
14.2.5	mead	700	mg/kg		Technological need is questioned
14.2.6	distilled spirituous beverages containing more than 15% alcohol	700	mg/kg		
15.0	ready-to-eat savouries	500	mg/kg		certain flavours only

### ASPARTAME-ACESULFAME, (INS 962)

The 55<sup>th</sup> JECFA (2000) concluded that the aspartame and acesulfame moieties of the salt would be covered by the ADI for aspartame (40 mg/kg bw) and acesulfame potassium (15 mg/kg bw).

#### Recommendation 1 - Aspartame-Acesulfame, INS 962

#### EC disagrees with recommendation 1

#### Recommendation 2 – Aspartame-Acesulfame, INS 962

The eWG recommends that the 39<sup>th</sup> CCFA **discontinue** further work on the following food additive provisions for aspartame-acesulfame in the GSFA.

#### EC agrees with recommendation 2

#### Recommendation 3 – Aspartame-Acesulfame, INS 962

The eWG recommends that the 39<sup>th</sup> CCFA **adopt** the following food additive provisions for aspartame-acesulfame in the GSFA.

<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>EC Comments</b>
01.1.2	dairy-based drinks, flavoured and/or fermented (e.g., chocolate milk, cocoa, eggnog, drinking yoghurt, whey-based drinks)	<b>800</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Notes 113 <sup>42</sup> & 145 <sup>43</sup>	Lower to 350 mg/l
01.3.2	beverage whiteners	<b>4545</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Note 113	Does not support. Use could mislead the consumer.
01.4.4	cream analogues	1550	mg/kg	Note 119 <sup>44</sup>	Lower to 1000 mg/kg
01.5.2	milk and cream powder analogues	3100	mg/kg	Note 119	Does not support
01.6.5	cheese analogues	<b>800</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Note 113	Justification of technological need is requested. Use could mislead consumers
01.7	dairy-based desserts (e.g., pudding, fruit or flavoured yoghurt)	<b>1150</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Notes 113 & 145	Lower to 350 mg/kg
02.3	fat emulsions mainly of type oil-in-water, including mixed and/or flavoured products based on fat emulsions	1550	mg/kg	Note 119	Does not support. Use could mislead consumers
02.4	fat-based desserts excluding dairy-based dessert products of food category 01.7	<b>1150</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Notes 113 & 145	Lower to 350 mg/kg
03.0	edible ices, including sherbet and sorbet	1550	mg/kg	Notes 119 & 145	Lower to 800 mg/kg
04.1.2.1	frozen fruit	<b>1150</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Note 113	Justification of technological need is requested. Use could mislead consumers
04.1.2.2	dried fruit	<b>1150</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Note 113	Justification of technological need is requested. Use could mislead consumers
04.1.2.3	fruit in vinegar, oil, or brine	<b>1150</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Notes 113 & 144 <sup>45</sup>	Lower to 200 mg/kg
04.1.2.4	canned or bottled (pasteurized) fruit	<b>450</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Notes 113 & 145	Lower to 350 mg/kg
04.1.2.5	jams, jellies and marmelades	<b>550</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Notes 119 & 138 <sup>46</sup>	Maximum permitted level is 1000 mg/kg

<sup>42</sup> **Note 113:** Use level reported as acesulfame potassium equivalents.

<sup>43</sup> **Note 145:** Products are energy reduced or with no added sugar.

<sup>44</sup> **Note 119:** Use level reported as aspartame equivalents.

<sup>45</sup> **Note 144:** For use in sweet and sour products only

<b>Recommendation 3 – Aspartame-Acesulfame, INS 962</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <u>adopt</u> the following food additive provisions for aspartame-acesulfame in the GSFA.					
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>EC Comments</b>
04.1.2.6	fruit-based spreads (e.g., chutney) excluding products of food category 04.1.2.5	<b>2250</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Notes 113 & 138	Maximum permitted level is 1000 mg/kg
04.1.2.7	candied fruit	<b>1150</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Note 113	Lower to 500 mg/kg
04.1.2.8	fruit preparations, including pulp, purees, fruit toppings, and coconut milk	<b>800</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Notes 113 & 138	Lower to 350 mg/kg
04.1.2.9	fruit-based desserts, incl. fruit-flavoured water-based desserts	<b>800</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Notes 113 & 145	Lower to 350 mg/kg
04.1.2.10	fermented fruit products	<b>800</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Note 113	Lower to 350 mg/kg
04.1.2.11	fruit fillings for pastries	<b>800</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Note 113	Lower to 350 mg/kg
04.1.2.12	cooked fruit	<b>1150</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Note 113	Justification of technological need is not provided.
04.2.2.3	vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and seaweeds in vinegar, oil, brine, or soy sauce	<b>450</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Note 119 & 144	Lower to 300 mg/kg
04.2.2.4	canned or bottles (pasteurized ) or retort pouch vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and seaweeds	<b>800</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Note 113	Justification of technological need is requested. Use could mislead consumers
04.2.2.5	vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed purees and spreads (e.g., peanut butter)	<b>4650</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Note 119	Lower level to 350 mg/kg as acesulfame-K equivalents. Add note 138
04.2.2.6	vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed pulps and preparations (e.g., vegetable desserts and sauces, candied vegetables) other than food category 04.2.2.5	<b>800</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Notes 113 & 145	Lower to 350 mg/kg
04.2.2.7	fermented vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed products, excluding fermented soybean products of food category 12.10	<b>2250</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Note 113	Lower to 1000 mg/kg
05.1.2	cocoa mixes (syrops)	<b>1150</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Note 113	Lower to 350 mg/kg
05.1.3	cocoa-based spreads, incl. fillings	<b>4550</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Notes 113 & 145	Lower to 1000 mg/kg
05.1.4	cocoa and chocolate products	<b>2250</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Notes 113 & 145	Lower to 500 mg/kg
05.1.5	cocoa and chocolate products	<b>2250</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Notes 113 & 145	Lower to 500 mg/kg
<b>05.2</b>	<b>Confectionery</b>	<b>5700</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Notes 113 &amp; 145</b>	
05.3	chewing gum	<b>4550</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Notes 68 &	Lower to 2000 mg/kg

<sup>46</sup> **Note 138:** For use in energy-reduced products only.



<b>Recommendation 3 – Aspartame-Acesulfame, INS 962</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>adopt</b> the following food additive provisions for aspartame-acesulfame in the GSFA.					
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>EC Comments</b>
				113	
05.4	decorations (e.g., for fine bakery wares), toppings (non-fruit) and sweet sauces	<b>1150</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Note 113	Lower to 500 mg/kg
06.3	breakfast cereals, including rolled oats	1550	mg/kg	Notes 119 & 145	Lower to 1000 mg/kg
06.5	cereal and starch based desserts (e.g., rice pudding, tapioca pudding)	<b>800</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Notes 113 & 145	Lower to 350 mg/kg
07.1	bread and ordinary bakery wares	<b>2250</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Note 113	Justification of technological need is requested. Extending use to bread could possibly lead to high sweetener consumption and ADI being exceeded for either sweetener.
07.2	fine bakery wares (sweet, salty, savoury) and mixes	<b>2250</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Notes 77 <sup>47</sup> & 113	Lower to 1000 mg/kg
09.3	semi-preserved fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	450	mg/kg	Note 113	Lower to 200 mg/kg
09.4	fully preserved, including canned or fermented fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	450	mg/kg	Note 113	Lower to 200 mg/kg
10.4	egg-based desserts (e.g., custard)	<b>800</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Notes 113 & 145	Lower to 350 mg/kg
11.4	other sugars and syrups (e.g., xylose, maple syrup, sugar toppings)	<b>2250</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Note 113	Does not support. Use could mislead consumer
11.6	table-top sweeteners, including those containing high-intensity sweeteners		GMP	Note 113	
12.2.2	seasonings and condiments	3100	mg/kg	Note 113	Does not support. Use could mislead consumer
12.3	vinegars	<b>4550</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Note 113	Does not support. Use could mislead consumer
12.4	mustards	<b>550</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Note 119	Lower to 350 mg/kg
12.5	soups and broths	250	mg/kg	Notes 113 & 138	Lower to 110 mg/kg
<b>12.6</b>	<b>sauces and like products</b>	<b>750</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note 119</b>	<b>Lower to 350 mg/kg</b>
12.7	salads (e.g., macaroni salad, potato salad), and sandwich spreads excluding cocoa and nut-based spreads of food categories 04.2.2.5 and 05.1.3	1550	mg/kg	Notes 113 & 145	Lower to 350 mg/kg
13.3	dietetic foods intended for special medical purposes (excluding products of food category 13.1)	<b>1000</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Note 113	Lower to 450 mg/kg
13.4	dietetic formulae for slimming purposes and weight reduction	<b>1000</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Note 113	Lower to 450 mg/kg
13.5	dietetic foods (e.g., supplementary foods for dietary use) excluding products of food categories 13.1 - 13.4 and 13.6	<b>1150</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Note 113	Lower to 450 mg/kg
13.6	food supplements	2000	mg/kg	Note 113	Lower to 350 mg/kg*
14.1.2.2	vegetable juice	<b>1350</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Note 113	Lower to 350 mg/kg
14.1.2.4	concentrates for vegetable	<b>1350</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Note 113 &	Lower to 350 mg/kg

<sup>47</sup> **Note 77:** For special nutritional uses only.

<b>Recommendation 3 – Aspartame-Acesulfame, INS 962</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>adopt</b> the following food additive provisions for aspartame-acesulfame in the GSFA.					
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	EC Comments
	juice			127 <sup>48</sup>	
14.1.3.2	<b>Vegetable nectar</b>	<b>1350</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Note 113	<b>Lower to 350 mg/kg</b>
14.1.3.4	concentrates for vegetable nectar	<b>1350</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Note 113 & 127	<b>Lower to 350 mg/kg</b>
14.1.4	water-based flavoured drinks, including "sport," "energy," or "electrolyte" drinks and particulated drinks	<b>950</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Notes 119 & 145	<b>Lower to 600 mg/kg</b>
14.1.5	coffee, coffee substitutes, tea, herbal infusions, and other hot cereal and grain beverages, excluding cocoa	<b>1350</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Note 113	<b>Does not support. Use could mislead consumer .</b>
14.2.1	beer and malt beverages	<b>800</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Notes 113 & 138	<b>Lower to 350 mg/kg. Note H</b>
14.2.2	cider and perry	<b>800</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Note 113	<b>Lower to 350 mg/kg</b>
14.2.4	wines (other than grape)	<b>1200</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Note 113	<b>Does not support technological need is requested.</b>
14.2.7	aromatized alcoholic beverages (e.g., beer, wine and spirituous cooler-type beverages, low alcoholic refreshers)	<b>950</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Note 119	<b>Lower to 600 mg/kg</b>
15.0	ready-to-eat savouries	<b>750</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Notes 113 & 144	<b>Lower to 350 mg/kg</b>

\*SUPPLIED IN A LIQUID FORM, 500 MG/KG IN A SOLID FORM, 2000 MG/KG IN SYRUP OR CHEWABLE FORM

### CYCLAMATES (INS 952)

18. The 26<sup>th</sup> JECFA (1982) assigned a group ADI of 11 mg/kg bw/d for calcium cyclamate, cyclohexylsulfamic acid, and sodium cyclamate all expressed as cyclamic acid

<p><b>Recommendation 1 – Cyclamates, INS 952</b> The eWG recommends that the 39<sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>discontinue</b> further work on the following food additive provisions for cyclamates in the GSFA.</p>
---

### [The European Community agrees to discontinue work on the provisions under Recommendation 1.](#)

<b>Recommendation 2 - Cyclamates, INS 952</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>adopt</b> the following food additive provisions for cyclamates in the GSFA.					
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	EC Comments
01.1.2	dairy-based drinks, flavoured and/or fermented (e.g., chocolate milk, cocoa, eggnog, drinking yoghurt, whey-based drinks)	<b>250</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Note 17 <sup>49</sup> [Note 145] <sup>50</sup>	<b>EC supports this provision</b>
01.7	dairy-based desserts (e.g., pudding, fruit or flavoured yoghurt)	250	mg/kg	Note 17 [Note 145]	<b>EC supports this provision</b>
02.4	fat-based desserts excluding dairy-based dessert products of food category 01.7	250	mg/kg	Note 17 [Note 145]	<b>EC supports this provision</b>
03.0	edible ices, including sherbet and sorbet	250	mg/kg	Note 17 [Note 145]	<b>EC supports this provision</b>
04.	canned or bottled	100	mg/kg	Note 17 [Note 145]	<b>EC supports this provision</b>

<sup>48</sup> **Note 127:** As served to the consumer

<sup>49</sup> **Note 17:** As cyclamic acid.

<sup>50</sup> **Note 145:** For use only in energy-reduced products or products with no added sugar.

<b>Recommendation 2 - Cyclamates, INS 952</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>adopt</b> the following food additive provisions for cyclamates in the GSFA.					
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>EC Comments</b>
1.2.4	(pasteurized) fruit	0		145]	
04.1.2.5	jams, jellies and marmelades	100 0	mg/kg	Note 17 [Note 145]	EC supports this provision. Note 138
04.1.2.6	fruit-based spreads (e.g., chutney) excluding products of food category 04.1.2.5	200 0	mg/kg	Note 17 [Note 145]	EC supports this provision but the level is too high. EC supports 1000.
04.1.2.8	fruit preparations, including pulp, purees, fruit toppings and coconut milk	250	mg/kg	Note 17 [Note 138]	EC supports this provision with note 145
04.1.2.9	fruit-based desserts, including fruit-flavoured water-based desserts	250	mg/kg	Note 17 [Note 138]	EC supports this provision with note 145
05.1.2	<b>Cocoa mixes (syrops)</b>	<b>250</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note 17 127<sup>51</sup> [Note145]</b>	EC supports this provision
05.1.3	<b>Cocoa-based spreads, incl. fillings</b>	<b>500</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note 17 [Note145]</b>	EC supports this provision
05.1.4	<b>Cocoa and chocolate products</b>	<b>500</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note 17</b>	EC supports this provision with note 145
05.1.5	<b>Imitation chocolate, chocolate substitute products</b>	<b>500</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note 17 [Note145]</b>	EC supports this provision
05.2	<b>Confectionery including hard and soft candy, nougats, etc. other than food categories 05.1, 05.3, and 05.4</b>	<b>500</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note 17 [Note145]</b>	<b>EC supports this provision</b>
05.3	chewing gum	300 0	mg/kg	Note 17 [Note 138]	EC doesn't support this level and supports this provision with a maximum level of 1500
05.4	decorations (e.g., for fine bakery wares), toppings (non-fruit) and sweet sauces	500	mg/kg	Note 17 [Note 145]	EC supports this provision
06.5	cereal and starch based desserts (e.g., rice pudding, tapioca pudding)	250	mg/kg	Note 17 [Note 145]	EC supports this provision
07.2	<b>Fine bakery wares (sweet, salty, savoury) and mixes</b>	<b>160 0</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note 17 [Note D<sup>52</sup>]</b>	EC supports this provision
10.4	egg-based desserts (e.g., custard)	250	mg/kg	Note 17 [Note 145]	EC supports this provision
11.4	other sugars and syrups (e.g., xylose, maple syrup, sugar toppings)	500	mg/kg	Note 17	<b>Does not support. Use could mislead consumer</b>
11.6	table-top sweeteners, including those containing high-intensity sweeteners		GMP	Note 17	EC supports this provision
13.3	dietetic foods intended for special medical purposes (excluding products of food category 13.1)	400	mg/kg	Note 17	EC supports this provision
13.4	dietetic formulae for slimming purposes and weight reduction	<b>400</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Note 17	EC supports this provision
13.	dietetic foods (e.g.,	<b>400</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Note 17	EC supports this provision

<sup>51</sup> **Note 127:** As served to the consumer

<sup>52</sup> **Note D:** For use in products for special nutritional purposes only.

<b>Recommendation 2 - Cyclamates, INS 952</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>adopt</b> the following food additive provisions for cyclamates in the GSFA.					
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>EC Comments</b>
5	supplementary foods for dietary use) excluding products of food categories 13.1 - 13.4 and 13.6		<b>g</b>		
13.6	food supplements	<b>400</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Note 17 [ <b>Note J<sup>53</sup></b> ]	EC supports this provision
14.1.3.2	vegetable nectar	<b>250</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Note 17 [ <b>Note 145</b> ]	EC supports this provision
14.1.3.4	concentrates for vegetable nectar	<b>250</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Notes 17 & 127 <sup>54</sup> [ <b>Note 145</b> ]	EC supports this provision
14.2.7	aromatized alcoholic beverages (e.g., beer, wine and spirituous cooler-type beverages, low alcoholic refreshers)	250	mg/kg	Note 17	EC supports this provision

<b>Recommendation 3 - Cyclamates, INS 952</b>					
<b>Comments are requested</b> on the following food additive provisions for cyclamates in the GSFA.					
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>EC comments</b>
12.6.1	emulsified sauces (e.g., mayonnaise, salad dressing)	500	mg/kg	Note 17	Doesn't support
12.7	salads (e.g., macaroni salad, potato salad) and sandwich spreads excluding cocoa- and nut-based spreads of food categories 04.2.2.5 and 05.1.3	500	mg/kg	Note 17	Doesn't support
14.1.4.1	carbonated water-based flavoured drinks	1500	mg/kg	Note 17	EC considers that the ADI doesn't permit this provision at the proposed level ; the maximal level acceptable on this point of view is not higher than 250 mg/gk with notes 17 and [145]
14.1.4.2	non-carbonated water-based flavoured drinks, including punches and ades	1500	mg/kg	Note 17	EC considers that the ADI doesn't permit this provision at the proposed level ; the maximal level acceptable on this point of view is not higher than 250 mg/gk with notes 17 and [145]

**The European Community agrees to request comments on the provisions under Recommendation 3.**

**NEOTAME (INS 961)**

19. The 61<sup>st</sup> JECFA (2003) assigned an ADI of 2 mg/kg bw/d for neotame.

<b>Recommendation 1 – Neotame, INS 961</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>discontinue</b> further work on the following food additive provisions for neotame in the GSFA.					

**The European community agrees with recommendation 1.**

<b>Recommendation 2 - Neotame, INS 961</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>adopt</b> the following food additive provisions for neotame in the GSFA.					
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>EC comments</b>
01.1.2	dairy-based drinks,	20	mg/kg	[ <b>Note</b>	

<sup>53</sup> **Note J:** For use in products in liquid form; 500 mg/kg for products in solid form.

<sup>54</sup> **Note 127:** As served to the consumer.

<b>Recommendation 2 - Neotame, INS 961</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>adopt</b> the following food additive provisions for neotame in the GSFA.					
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>EC comments</b>
	flavoured and/or fermented (e.g., chocolate milk, cocoa, eggnog, drinking yoghurt, whey-based drinks)			[145]	
01.7	dairy-based desserts (e.g., pudding, fruit or flavoured yoghurt)	100	mg/kg	[Note 145]	
02.4	fat-based desserts excluding dairy-based dessert products of food category 01.7	100	mg/kg	[Note 145]	
03.0	edible ices, including sherbet and sorbet	100	mg/kg	[Note 145]	
04.1.2.3	fruit in vinegar, oil, or brine	100	mg/kg	[Note 138]	
04.1.2.4	canned or bottled (pasteurized) fruit	33	mg/kg	[Note 145]	
04.1.2.5	jams, jellies and marmelades	70	mg/kg	[Note 138]	
04.1.2.6	fruit-based spreads (e.g., chutney) excluding products of food category 04.1.2.5	70	mg/kg	[Note 138]	
04.1.2.7	candied fruit	65	mg/kg	[Note 145]	
04.1.2.8	fruit preparations, including pulp, purees, fruit toppings and coconut milk	100	mg/kg	[Note 138]	
04.1.2.9	fruit-based desserts, including fruit-flavoured water-based desserts	100	mg/kg	[Note 145]	
04.1.2.10	fermented fruit products	65	mg/kg	[Note 138]	
04.1.2.11	fruit fillings for pastries	100	mg/kg	[Note 138]	
04.1.2.12	cooked fruit	65	mg/kg	[Note 138]	No justification is provided
04.2.2.3	vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and seaweeds in vinegar, oil, brine, or soy sauce	10	mg/kg	[Note 144]	
04.2.2.6	vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed pulps and preparations (e.g., vegetable desserts and sauces, candied vegetables) other than food category 04.2.2.5	33	mg/kg	[Note 138]	
04.2.2.7	fermented vegetable (including mushrooms	33	mg/kg	[Note 138]	

<b>Recommendation 2 - Neotame, INS 961</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>adopt</b> the following food additive provisions for neotame in the GSFA.					
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>EC comments</b>
	and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweed products, excluding fermented soybean products of food category 12.10				
05.1.2	cocoa mixes (syrups)	33	mg/kg	<b>Note 97<sup>55</sup></b> <b>[Note 145]</b>	
05.1.3	cocoa-based spreads, including fillings	100	mg/kg	<b>[Note 145]</b>	
05.1.4	cocoa and chocolate products	80	mg/kg	<b>[Note 145]</b>	
05.1.5	imitation chocolate, chocolate substitute products	100	mg/kg	<b>[Note 145]</b>	
05.2	confectionery including hard and soft candy, nougat, etc. other than food categories 05.1, 05.3 and 05.4	1000	mg/kg	<b>[Note 145]</b>	Neotame is 7.000 – 13.000 times as sweet as sugar and 30-60 times as sweet as aspartame. EC considers the proposed level for this category is very high.
05.3	chewing gum	1000	mg/kg	<b>[Note 145]</b>	Neotame is 7.000 – 13.000 times as sweet as sugar and 30-60 times as sweet as aspartame. EC considers the proposed level for this category is very high.
05.4	decorations (e.g., for fine bakery wares), toppings (non-fruit) and sweet sauces	<b>100</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		
06.3	breakfast cereals, including rolled oats	<b>160</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>[Note 145 &amp; Note N<sup>56</sup></b>	
06.5	cereal and starch based desserts (e.g., rice pudding, tapioca pudding)	33	mg/kg	<b>[Note 145]</b>	
07.1	bread and ordinary bakery wares	70	mg/kg		Does not support use in such staple food category.
07.2	Fine bakery wares (sweet, salty, savoury) and mixes	130	mg/kg	<b>[Note D<sup>57</sup></b>	
10.4	egg-based desserts (e.g., custard)	<b>100</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>[Note 145]</b>	
11.4	other sugars and syrups (e.g., xylose, maple syrup, sugar toppings)	<b>70</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		Doesn't support. Use could mislead the consumer.
11.6	table-top sweeteners, including those containing high-intensity sweeteners		<b>GMP</b>		
12.4	mustards	12	mg/kg		
12.5	soups and broths	20	mg/kg	<b>[Note 138]</b>	
12.6.1	emulsified sauces (e.g., mayonnaise, salad	65	mg/kg		

<sup>55</sup> **Note 97:** In the finished product/final cocoa and chocolate products

<sup>56</sup> **Note N** For use in breakfast cereals with a fibre content of more than 15% and containing at least 20% bran only.

<sup>57</sup> **Note D** For use in products for special nutritional purposes only

<b>Recommendation 2 - Neotame, INS 961</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>adopt</b> the following food additive provisions for neotame in the GSFA.					
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>EC comments</b>
	dressing)				
12.6.2	non-emulsified sauces (e.g., ketchup, cheese sauce, cream sauce, brown gravy)	70	mg/kg		
12.6.3	mixes for sauces and gravies	12	mg/kg		
12.6.4	clear sauces (e.g., fish sauce)	12	mg/kg		
12.7	salads (e.g., macaroni salad, potato salad) and sandwich spreads excluding cocoa- and nut-based spreads of food categories 04.2.2.5 and 05.1.3	33	mg/kg	<b>[Note 145 &amp; F<sup>58</sup>]</b>	
13.3	dietetic foods intended for special medical purposes (excluding products of food category 13.1)	33	mg/kg		
13.4	dietetic formulae for slimming purposes and weight reduction	33	mg/kg		
13.5	dietetic foods (e.g., supplementary foods for dietary use) excluding products of food categories 13.1 - 13.4 and 13.6	65	mg/kg		
13.6	food supplements	90	mg/kg		
14.1.2.2	vegetable juice	65	mg/kg	<b>[Note 145]</b>	
14.1.2.4	concentrates for vegetable juice	65	mg/kg	<b>[Note 145] Note 127</b>	
14.1.3.2	vegetable nectar	65	mg/kg	<b>[Note 145]</b>	
14.1.3.4	concentrates for vegetable nectar	65	mg/kg	<b>[Note 145] Note 127</b>	
14.1.4	water-based flavoured drinks, including "sport," "energy" or "electrolyte" drinks and particulated drinks	33	mg/kg	<b>Note 145]</b>	
14.2.1	beer and malt beverages	20	mg/kg	<b>[Note H<sup>59</sup>]</b>	
14.2.2	cider and perry	20	mg/kg		
14.2.7	aromatized alcoholic beverages (e.g., beer, wine and spirituous cooler-type beverages, low alcoholic refreshers)	33	mg/kg		
15.0	ready-to-eat savouries	<b>32</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		

**Recommendation 3 - Neotame, INS 961**  
**Comments are requested** on the following food additive provisions for neotame in the GSFA.

<sup>58</sup> **Note F:** For milk-based sandwich spreads only.

<sup>59</sup> **Note H:** For use in energy-reduced or alcohol free beer only

Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		EC Comments
01.2	fermented and renneted milk products (plain), excluding food category 01.1.2 (dairy based drinks)	65	mg/kg	Doesn't support.
01.3.2	beverage whiteners		GMP	Technological need is questioned. Use could mislead the consumer.
01.4.4	cream analogues	33	mg/kg	Doesn't support.
01.5.2	milk and cream powder analogues	65	mg/kg	Technological need is questioned
01.6.5	cheese analogues	33	mg/kg	Technological need is questioned
02.3	fat emulsions mainly of type oil-in-water, including mixed and/or flavoured products based on fat emulsions	10	mg/kg	Technological need is questioned
04.1.2.1	frozen fruit	100	mg/kg	Technological need is questioned
04.1.2.2	dried fruit	100	mg/kg	Technological need is questioned
04.2.2.1	frozen vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds	33	mg/kg	Technological need is questioned
04.2.2.2	dried vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds	33	mg/kg	Technological need is questioned
04.2.2.4	canned or bottled (pasteurized) or retort pouch vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds	33	mg/kg	Technological need is questioned
04.2.2.5	vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed purees and spreads (e.g., peanut butter)	33	mg/kg	For energy reduced products only
04.2.2.8	cooked or fried vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds	33	mg/kg	Technological need is questioned
07.2	fine bakery wares (sweet, salty, savoury) and mixes	80	mg/kg	
09.3	semi-preserved fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	10	mg/kg	Technological need is questioned
09.4	fully preserved, including canned or fermented fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	10	mg/kg	Technological need is questioned
12.2	herbs, spices, seasonings, and condiments (e.g., seasoning for instant noodles)	65	mg/kg	Doesn't support.
12.3	vinegars	12	mg/kg	Doesn't support.
14.1.5	coffee, coffee substitutes, tea, herbal infusions, and other hot cereal and grain beverages, excluding cocoa	50	mg/kg	Doesn't support.
14.2.4	wines (other than grape)	23	mg/kg	Doesn't support.
14.2.5	mead	23	mg/kg	Doesn't support.



<b>Recommendation 3 - Neotame, INS 961</b>				
<b>Comments are requested</b> on the following food additive provisions for neotame in the GSFA.				
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		EC Comments
14.2.6	distilled spirituous beverages containing more than 15% alcohol	23	mg/kg	Technological need is questioned

[The European Community agrees to request comments on the provisions under Recommendation 3 but can agree to discontinue work on them.](#)

#### SACCHARIN (INS 954)

20. The 41st JECFA (1993) assigned a group ADI of 5 mg/kg bw/d for calcium saccharin, potassium saccharin, sodium saccharin and saccharin.

<b>Recommendation 1 – Saccharin, INS 954</b>
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>discontinue</b> further work on the following food additive provisions for saccharin in the GSFA.

[The EC agrees with recommendation 1](#)

<b>Recommendation 2 - Saccharin, INS 954</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>adopt</b> the following food additive provisions for saccharin in the GSFA.					
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	EC comments
01.1.2	dairy-based drinks, flavoured and/or fermented (e.g., chocolate milk, cocoa, eggnog, drinking yoghurt, whey-based drinks)	80	mg/kg	[Note 145] <sup>60</sup>	
01.7	dairy-based desserts (e.g., pudding, fruit or flavoured yoghurt)	100	mg/kg	[Note 145]	
02.4	fat-based desserts excluding dairy-based dessert products of food category 01.7	100	mg/kg	[Note 145]	
03.0	edible ices, including sherbet and sorbet	100	mg/kg	[Note 145]	
04.1.2.3	fruit in vinegar, oil, or brine	160	mg/kg	[Note 144] <sup>61</sup>	
04.1.2.4	canned or bottled (pasteurized) fruit	200	mg/kg	[Note 145]	
04.1.2.5	jams, jellies and marmelades	200	mg/kg	[Note 138] <sup>62</sup>	
04.1.2.6	fruit-based spreads (e.g., chutney) excluding products of food category 04.1.2.5	200	mg/kg	[Note 138]	
04.1.2.7	candied fruit	5000	mg/kg	[Note 138]	Level is very high
04.1.2.8	fruit preparations, including pulp, purees, fruit toppings and coconut milk	200	mg/kg	[Note 138]	
04.1.2.9	fruit-based desserts, including fruit-flavoured water-based desserts	100	mg/kg	[Note 138]	Note 145 instead
04.2.2.3	vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and seaweeds in vinegar, oil, brine, or soy sauce	160	mg/kg	[Note 144]	
04.2.2.6	vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed	200	mg/kg	[Note 138]	

<sup>60</sup> **Note 145:** For use only in energy reduced products or products with no added sugar

<sup>61</sup> **Note 144:** For use in sweet and sour products only

<sup>62</sup> **Note 138:** For use only in energy reduced products or products

<b>Recommendation 2 - Saccharin, INS 954</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>adopt</b> the following food additive provisions for saccharin in the GSFA.					
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>EC comments</b>
	pulps and preparations (e.g., vegetable desserts and sauces, candied vegetables) other than food category 04.2.2.5				
04.2.2.7	fermented vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweed products, excluding fermented soybean products of food category 12.10	<b>200</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>[Note 138]</b>	
<b>05.1.2</b>	<b>Cocoa mixes (syrops)</b>	<b>80</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>[Note 145]</b>	
<b>05.1.3</b>	<b>Cocoa-based spreads, incl. fillings</b>	<b>200</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>[Note 145]</b>	
<b>05.1.4</b>	<b>Cocoa and chocolate products</b>	<b>500</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		<b>Note 145</b>
<b>05.1.5</b>	<b>Imitation chocolate, chocolate substitute products</b>	<b>500</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>[Note 145]</b>	
<b>05.2</b>	<b>Confectionery including hard and soft candy, nougats, etc. other than food categories 05.1, 05.3, and 05.4</b>	<b>500</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>[Note 145]</b>	
05.4	decorations (e.g., for fine bakery wares), toppings (non-fruit) and sweet sauces	500	mg/kg		<b>Note 145</b>
06.3	breakfast cereals, including rolled oats	100	mg/kg	<b>[Notes 145 &amp; N<sup>63</sup></b>	
06.5	cereal and starch based desserts (e.g., rice pudding, tapioca pudding)	100	mg/kg	<b>[Note 145]</b>	
07.2	fine bakery wares (sweet, salty, savoury) and mixes	<b>170</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>[Note D]<sup>64</sup></b>	
09.3.1	fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms, marinated and/or in jelly	160	mg/kg	<b>[Note 144]<sup>65</sup></b>	
09.3.2	fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms, pickled and/or in brine	160	mg/kg	<b>[Note 144]</b>	
09.3.4	semi-preserved fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms (e.g., fish paste), excluding products of food categories 09.3.1 - 09.3.3	<b>160</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>[Note 144]</b>	
09.4	fully preserved, including canned or fermented fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	200	mg/kg	<b>[Note 144]</b>	
10.4	egg-based desserts (e.g., custard)	100	mg/kg	<b>[Note 144]</b>	
11.6	table-top sweeteners, including		GMP		

<sup>63</sup> **Note N** For use in breakfast cereals with a fibre content of more than 15% and containing at least 20% bran only.

<sup>64</sup> **Note D:** For use in products for special nutritional purposes only.

<sup>65</sup> **Note 144:** For use in sweet and sour products only.

<b>Recommendation 2 - Saccharin, INS 954</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>adopt</b> the following food additive provisions for saccharin in the GSFA.					
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>EC comments</b>
	those containing high-intensity sweeteners				
12.4	mustards	320	mg/kg		
12.5	soups and broths	110	mg/kg	[Note 138]	
12.6	sauces and like products	<b>160</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		
12.7	salads (e.g., macaroni salad, potato salad) and sandwich spreads excluding cocoa- and nut-based spreads of food categories 04.2.2.5 and 05.1.3	200	mg/kg	[Note 145, F <sup>66</sup> ]	Discontinue Technological need questioned
13.3	dietetic foods intended for special medical purposes (excluding products of food category 13.1)	<b>200</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		
13.4	dietetic formulae for slimming purposes and weight reduction	300	mg/kg		Lower level to 240mg/kg
13.5	dietetic foods (e.g., supplementary foods for dietary use) excluding products of food categories 13.1 - 13.4 and 13.6	<b>200</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		
13.6	food supplements	1200	mg/kg	[Note K <sup>67</sup> ]	
<b>14.1.2.2</b>	<b>vegetable juice</b>	<b>80</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	[Note 145]	
14.1.2.4	concentrates for vegetable juice	<b>80</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Note 127 [Note 145]	
14.1.3.4	concentrates for vegetable nectar	300	mg/kg	Note 127 & [Note 145] <sup>68</sup>	
14.2.1	beer and malt beverages	80	mg/kg	[Note H <sup>69</sup> ]	
14.2.2	cider and perry	80	mg/kg		
14.2.7	aromatized alcoholic beverages (e.g., beer, wine and spirituous cooler-type beverages, low alcoholic refreshers)	80	mg/kg		
15.0	ready-to-eat savouries	100	mg/kg		For certain flavours only and coated nuts

<b>Recommendation 3 - Saccharin, INS 954</b>					
<b>Comments are requested</b> on the following food additive provisions for saccharin in the GSFA					
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>EC comments</b>
<b>01.6.5</b>	<b>Cheese analogues</b>	<b>100</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		Does not support Technological need questioned
04.2.2.1	frozen vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds	500	mg/kg		Does not support
04.2.2.2	dried vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds	500	mg/kg		Does not support
04.2.2.4	canned or bottled (pasteurized) or retort pouch vegetables	500	mg/kg		For use in sweet-sour preserves only at 160 mg/kg

<sup>66</sup> **Note F:** For milk-based sandwich spreads only.

<sup>67</sup> **Note K:** For use in syrup-type or chewable products; 500 mg/kg for in products in solid form; 80 mg/kg in products in liquid form.

<sup>68</sup> **Note 145:** For use only in energy reduced products or products with no added sugar

<sup>69</sup> **Note H:** For use in energy-reduced or alcohol-free beer only

<b>Recommendation 3 - Saccharin, INS 954</b>					
<b>Comments are requested</b> on the following food additive provisions for saccharin in the GSFA					
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>EC comments</b>
	(including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds				
04.2.2.5	vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed purees and spreads (e.g., peanut butter)	<b>160</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		For energy reduced products only
04.2.2.8	cooked or fried vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds	500	mg/kg		Only used in sweet sour products at 160 mg/kg
05.3	chewing gum	3000	mg/kg		Suggested level 1200 mg/kg Note 138
07.1.3	other ordinary bakery products (e.g., bagels, pita, English muffins)	15	mg/kg		Does not support use in Basic foods with wide consumption that would increase intake
08.2.2	heat-treated processed meat, poultry, and game products in whole pieces or cuts	500	mg/kg		Does not support use
08.3.2	heat-treated processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	500	mg/kg		Does not support use
09.2.4.1	cooked fish and fish products	500	mg/kg		Does not support use Technological need questioned
09.2.5	smoked, dried, fermented, and/or salted fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	1200	mg/kg		Does not support use Technological need questioned
09.3.3	salmon substitutes, caviar, and other fish roe products	160	mg/kg		Does not support use Technological need questioned
11.4	other sugars and syrups (e.g., xylose, maple syrup, sugar toppings)	300	mg/kg		Does not support use could mislead consumer
<b>12.2.2</b>	<b>Seasonings and condiments</b>	<b>1500</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		Does not support use could mislead consumer
12.3	vinegars	300	mg/kg		Does not support use could mislead consumer
14.1.4.1	carbonated water-based flavoured drinks	500	mg/kg		Suggested level 80 mg/l Note 145
14.1.4.2	non-carbonated water-based flavoured drinks, including punches and ades	500	mg/kg		Suggested level 80 mg/l Note 145
14.1.4.3	concentrates (liquid or solid) for water-based flavoured drinks	2000	mg/kg		Suggested level 80 mg/l Note 145
14.1.5	coffee, coffee substitutes, tea, herbal infusions, and other hot cereal and grain beverages, excluding cocoa	200	mg/kg		Technological need questioned

### SUCRALOSE, INS 955

21. The 37<sup>th</sup> JECFA (1990) assigned a group ADI of 15 mg/kg bw/d for sucralose.

**Recommendation 1 – Sucralose, INS 955**

The eWG recommends that the 39<sup>th</sup> CCFA **discontinue** further work on the following food additive provisions for sucralose in the GSFA.

**EC agrees with recommendation 1****Recommendation 2 - Sucralose, INS 955**

The eWG recommends that the 39<sup>th</sup> CCFA **adopt** the following food additive provisions for sucralose in the GSFA.

Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	EC comments
01.1.2	dairy-based drinks, flavoured and/or fermented (e.g., chocolate milk, cocoa, eggnog, drinking yoghurt, whey-based drinks)	300	mg/kg	[Note 145]	
01.7	dairy-based desserts (e.g., pudding, fruit or flavoured yoghurt)	400	mg/kg	[Note 145]	
02.4	fat-based desserts excluding dairy-based dessert products of food category 01.7	400	mg/kg	[Note 145]	
03.0	edible ices, including sherbet and sorbet	320	mg/kg	[Note 145]	
04.1.2.3	fruit in vinegar, oil, or brine	180	mg/kg	[Note 144]	
04.1.2.4	canned or bottled (pasteurized) fruit	400	mg/kg	[Note 145]	
04.1.2.5	jams, jellies and marmelades	400	mg/kg	[Note 138]	
04.1.2.6	fruit-based spreads (e.g., chutney) excluding products of food category 04.1.2.5	400	mg/kg	[Note 145]	
04.1.2.7	candied fruit	800	mg/kg	[Note 145]	Lower to 400 mg/kg
04.1.2.8	fruit preparations, including pulp, purees, fruit toppings and coconut milk	400	mg/kg	[Note 145]	
04.1.2.9	fruit-based desserts, including fruit-flavoured water-based desserts	400	mg/kg	[Note 145]	
04.1.2.10	fermented fruit products	150	mg/kg	[Note 138]	
04.1.2.11	fruit fillings for pastries	400	mg/kg	[Note 138]	
04.2.2.3	vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and seaweeds in vinegar, oil, brine, or soy sauce	400	mg/kg		Note 145
04.2.2.5	vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed purees and spreads (e.g., peanut butter)	400	mg/kg	[Note 145, L <sup>70</sup> ]	For energy reduced products only
04.2.2.6	vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed pulps and preparations (e.g., vegetable desserts and sauces, candied vegetables) other than food category 04.2.2.5	400	mg/kg	[Note 145]	
05.1.1	cocoa mixes (powders) and cocoa mass/cake	580	mg/kg	Note 97 <sup>71</sup>	Note 145

<sup>70</sup> **Note L:** Fat-based sandwich spreads only

<sup>71</sup> **Note 97:** In the finished product/final cocoa and chocolate products.

<b>Recommendation 2 - Sucralose, INS 955</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>adopt</b> the following food additive provisions for sucralose in the GSFA.					
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>EC comments</b>
05.1.2	cocoa mixes (syrups)	<b>400</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note 97</b> <b>[Note 145]</b>	
05.1.3	cocoa-based spreads, including fillings	<b>400</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>[Note 145, L]</b>	
05.1.4	cocoa and chocolate products	<b>800</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>[Note 145]</b>	
05.1.5	imitation chocolate, chocolate substitute products	<b>800</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>[Note 145]</b>	
05.2	confectionery including hard and soft candy, nougat, etc. other than food categories 05.1, 05.3 and 05.4	<b>1000</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>[Note 68]</b>	
06.3	breakfast cereals, including rolled oats	<b>1000</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>[Note 145, N<sup>72</sup>]</b>	Lower to 400 mg/kg
06.5	cereal and starch based desserts (e.g., rice pudding, tapioca pudding)	<b>400</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>[Note 145]</b>	
06.7	pre-cooked or processed rice products, including rice cakes (Oriental type only)	<b>200</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note 72</b>	
07.1	bread and ordinary bakery wares	<b>650</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		Discontinue Technological need questioned These products are broadly consumed
09.3	semi-preserved fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	120	mg/kg	<b>[Note 144]</b>	
09.4	fully preserved, including canned or fermented fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans and echinoderms	120	mg/kg	<b>[Note 144]</b>	
10.4	egg-based desserts (e.g., custard)	400	mg/kg	<b>[Note 145]</b>	
11.6	table-top sweeteners, including those containing high-intensity sweeteners		<b>GMP</b>		
12.4	mustards	<b>140</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		
12.5	soups and broths	<b>600</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>[Note 138]</b>	lower level 45 mg/kg
<b>12.6</b>	<b>Sauces and like products</b>	<b>450</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note 127</b>	
12.7	salads (e.g., macaroni salad, potato salad) and sandwich spreads excluding cocoa- and nut-based spreads of food categories 04.2.2.5 and 05.1.3	1250	mg/kg	<b>[Note 138, L]</b>	Discontinue Technological need questioned Carry over sufficient
13.3	dietetic foods intended for special medical purposes (excluding products of food category 13.1)	400	mg/kg		
13.4	dietetic formulae for slimming purposes and weight reduction	<b>320</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		
13.5	dietetic foods (e.g., supplementary foods for dietary use) excluding products of food categories 13.1 - 13.4 and 13.6	<b>400</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		
13.6	food supplements	2400	mg/kg	<b>[Note M<sup>73</sup>]</b>	
14.1.3.2	vegetable nectar	300	mg/kg	<b>[Note 145]</b>	
14.1.3.4	concentrates for vegetable	<b>300</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note 127</b>	

<sup>72</sup> **Note N:** For use in breakfast cereals with a fibre content of more than 15% and containing at least 20% bran only.

<sup>73</sup> **Note M:** 240 mg/kg for liquid forms, 800 mg/kg for solid forms, 2400 mg/kg for syrup-type or chewable forms

<b>Recommendation 2 - Sucralose, INS 955</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>adopt</b> the following food additive provisions for sucralose in the GSFA.					
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	EC comments
	nectar			[Note 145]	
14.1.4	<b>Water-based flavoured drinks, including "sport," "energy," or "electrolyte" drinks and particulated drinks</b>	300	mg/kg	Note 127 [Note 145]	
14.1.5	coffee, coffee substitutes, tea, herbal infusions, and other hot cereal and grain beverages, excluding cocoa	300	mg/kg	[Note 145]	<b>Does not support Technological need questioned</b>
15.0	ready-to-eat savouries	1000	mg/kg		Discontinue Suggested level 200 mg/kg for certain flavours and coated nuts

<b>Recommendation 3 - Sucralose, INS 955</b>					
<b>Comments are requested</b> on the following food additive provisions for sucralose in the GSFA.					
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	EC comments
01.3.2	beverage whiteners	580	mg/kg		<b>Technological need questioned. Use could mislead the consumer.</b>
01.4	cream (plain) and the like	580	mg/kg		<b>Technological need questioned</b>
01.6.5	cheese analogues		GMP		<b>Technological need questioned</b>
04.1.2.1	frozen fruit	400	mg/kg		Does not support
04.1.2.2	dried fruit	1500	mg/kg		Does not support
04.1.2.12	cooked fruit	150	mg/kg		For use only in energy reduced products or products with no added sugar
04.2.2.1	frozen vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds	150	mg/kg		Does not support
04.2.2.2	dried vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds	150	mg/kg		Does not support
04.2.2.4	canned or bottled (pasteurized) or retort pouch vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds	150	mg/kg		For use in energy reduced products only
04.2.2.7	fermented vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweed products, excluding fermented soybean products of food category 12.10	150	mg/kg		For use in sweet sour products only
04.2.2.8	cooked or fried vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds	150	mg/kg		For use in sweet sour products only
05.3	chewing gum	5000	mg/kg		Suggested level 3000 mg/kg
05.4	decorations (e.g., for fine bakery wares), toppings (non-fruit) and sweet	1000	mg/kg		Only with no added sugar

<b>Recommendation 3 - Sucralose, INS 955</b>					
<b>Comments are requested</b> on the following food additive provisions for sucralose in the GSFA.					
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>EC comments</b>
	sauces				
<b>07.2</b>	<b>Fine bakery wares (sweet, salty, savoury) and mixes</b>	<b>700</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>[Note D]</b>	
11.3	sugar solutions and syrups, also (partially) inverted, including treacle and molasses, excluding products of food category 11.1.3	1500	mg/kg		Technological need questioned
11.4	other sugars and syrups (e.g., xylose, maple syrup, sugar toppings)	1500	mg/kg		Technological need questioned
12.2.1	herbs and spices	400	mg/kg		Technological need questioned
12.2.2	seasonings and condiments	700	mg/kg		Technological need questioned
12.3	vinegars		GMP		Technological need questioned
14.1.2.2	vegetable juice	300	mg/kg		Energy reduced or no added sugar
14.1.2.4	concentrates for vegetable juice	1500	mg/kg		Suggested level 300 mg/kg as consumed Energy reduced or no added sugar
14.2	alcoholic beverages, including alcohol-free and low-alcoholic counterparts	700	mg/kg		Suggested level 250 mg/kg
14.2.1	Beer and malt beverages	250	mg/kg		Add note H
14.2.2	Cider and perry	50	mg/kg		OK
14.2.4	Concentrates for vegetable juice	700	mg/kg		Suggested level 300 mg/kg Energy reduced or no added sugar
14.2.7	Aromatized alcoholic beverages (e.g., beer, wine and spirituous cooler-type beverages, low-alcoholic refreshers)	700	mg/kg		Suggested level 250 mg/kg

### PART III COLOURS

#### **Recommendation 1 - Food Categories in Which the Use of Colours is Technologically Justified**

The eWG recommends that the CCFA discuss the list of food categories for which the use of colours is justified (Appendix III), with a view toward reaching consensus and using the list as a working document in its future discussion of food additive sweeteners.

The European Community (EC) agrees with the “horizontal approach to be taken with regard to the GSFA provisions for colours. However, The EC is of the opinion that there is a significant number of food categories to which colours are proposed to be used. In some cases the EC questions the need for the use of colours and in some cases the use could mislead the consumer. Therefore in these cases we suggest a more restricted use of food colours. In particular, EC questions the use of colours in basic foods, such as Bread-type products, pasta etc which are widely consumed and therefore could contribute significantly to the intake of colours.

<b>APPENDIX III</b>			
<b>GSFA Categories in which the use of one or more colours is justified</b>			
<b>FCS No.</b>	<b>Title</b>	<b>Justification</b>	<b>European Commission comments</b>
01.1.2	Dairy-based drinks, flavoured and/or fermented (e.g., chocolate milk, cocoa, eggnog, drinking yoghurt, whey-based drinks)	Include because the CCMMP is revising the standard for fermented milk drinks that will likely contain provisions for colors.	Support the recommendation, but excluding chocolate milk. Need for chocolate milk is questioned; This use could mislead the consumer.
01.3.2	Beverage whiteners	Include because there are adopted provisions for colors in these GSFA food categories	Need questioned
01.4.4	Cream analogues		Need questioned
01.5.2	Milk and cream powder analogues		Need questioned
01.6.1	Unripened cheese	Include because CX STANS C-31, A6, 221 and the draft	Need questioned in particular because rind is not expected to be formed in unripened



<b>APPENDIX III</b>			
<b>GSFA Categories in which the use of one or more colours is justified</b>			
01.6.2	Ripened cheese	mozzarella standard contain provisions for colors	cheese The use of colours in ripened cheese should be limited to a few colours only and for specific types of ripened cheese e.g. <a href="#">INS 121 for red marbled cheese</a>
01.6.2.1	Ripened cheese, includes rind		The use of colours in ripened cheese should be limited to a few colours only and for specific types of ripened cheese e.g. <a href="#">INS 121 for red marbled cheese</a>
01.6.2.2	Rind of ripened cheese		Agree
01.6.2.3	Cheese powder (for reconstitution; e.g., for cheese sauces)	Include because there are adopted provisions for colors in this GSFA food category	Agree
01.6.4	Processed cheese	Include because CX STANs A8a, b & c contains provisions for colors that apply to these food categories	
01.6.4.1	Plain processed cheese		Agree with limited use of colours
01.6.4.2	Flavoured processed cheese, including containing fruit, vegetables, meat, etc.		Agree
01.6.5	Cheese analogues		Agree
01.7	Dairy-based desserts (e.g., pudding, fruit or flavoured yoghurt)	Include because there are provisions for colors adopted for this GSFA food category	Agree
02.1.3	Lard, tallow, fish oil, and other animal fats	Include because CX STAN 19 contains provisions for colors that apply to this food category	Technological need questioned. This use could mislead the consumer.
02.2.1	Emulsions containing at least 80% fat	Add at request of European Commission	Only limited use to vegetable carotenes ( <a href="#">INS 160aii</a> ) of the proposed colours above
02.2.1.1	Butter and concentrated butter	Include because CX Stan 01 contains provisions for colors that apply to this food category	Only limited use to vegetable carotenes ( <a href="#">INS 160aii</a> ) of the proposed colours above
02.2.1.2	Margarine and similar products	Include because CX STAN 32 contains provisions for colors and there are adopted provisions for colors in these GSFA food categories	Only limited use to vegetable carotenes ( <a href="#">INS 160aii</a> ) of the proposed colours above
02.2.1.3	Blends of butter and margarine		Only limited use to vegetable carotenes ( <a href="#">INS 160aii</a> ) of the proposed colours above
02.2.2	Emulsions containing less than 80% fat		Only limited use to vegetable carotenes ( <a href="#">INS 160aii</a> ) of the proposed colours above
02.3	Fat emulsions mainly of type oil-in-water, including mixed and/or flavoured products based on fat emulsions		Only limited use to vegetable carotenes ( <a href="#">INS 160aii</a> ) of the proposed colours above
02.4	Fat-based desserts excluding dairy-based dessert products of food category 01.7		Agree
03.0	Edible ices, including sherbet and sorbet		Agree
04.1.1.2	Surface-treated fresh fruit	Include with Note 4 <sup>74</sup> and 16 <sup>75</sup>	Technological need questioned. This use could mislead the consumer.
04.1.2.2	Dried fruit	Include because of the following justification: due to the effect of temperature during processing and storage affecting the discoloration of the dried fruit. Dried fruit will loose original natural flesh color in processing and aging	Technological need questioned as well the justification provided. SO <sub>2</sub> is already permitted on dried fruit and can stabilise colours.
04.1.2.3	Fruit in vinegar, oil, or brine	Include because there are adopted provisions for colors in this GSFA food category	Agree
04.1.2.4	Canned or bottled (pasteurized) fruit	Include because CX STANs 60, 61, 61, 78, 99, 159, 242 all contain provisions for colors that apply to this food category	Need questioned. This use could mislead the consumer.
04.1.2.5	Jams, jellies, marmelades	Include because CX STANs 79 and 80 contain provisions for colors and there are adopted	Agree, but only certain colours
04.1.2.6	Fruit-based spreads (e.g., chutney) excluding products of food category		Agree

<sup>74</sup> **Note 4** For decoration, stamping, marking or branding the product.

<sup>75</sup> **Note 16** For use in glaze, coatings or decorations for fruit, vegetables, meat or fish.

<b>APPENDIX III</b>			
<b>GSFA Categories in which the use of one or more colours is justified</b>			
	04.1.2.5	provisions for colors in these GSFA food categories	
04.1.2.7	Candied fruit		Agree
04.1.2.8	Fruit preparations, including pulp, purees, fruit toppings and coconut milk		Agree
04.1.2.9	Fruit-based desserts, incl. fruit-flavoured water-based desserts		Agree
04.1.2.10	Fermented fruit products		Agree
04.1.2.11	Fruit fillings for pastries		Agree
04.1.2.12	Cooked fruit		Technological need questioned.
04.2.1.2	Surface-treated fresh vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds	Include with Note 4 and 16	Question the practical application of this on these vegetables. The use should be limited to the coating for vegetables only
04.2.2.2	Dried vegetables, (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds	Include because of the following justification: due to the effect of temperature during processing and storage affecting the discoloration of the dried fruit. Dried fruit will lose original natural flesh color in processing and aging	Only dried potato granules and flakes Question the justification provided, many of these are basic foods, and some are already permitted SO2 on them, which can stabilise the colour.
04.2.2.3	Vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds in vinegar, oil, brine, or soy sauce	Include because CX STANs 55, 58, 81, and 115 contains provisions for colors and here are adopted provisions for colors in these GSFA food categories	Agree, but certain colours only
04.2.2.4	Canned or bottled (pasteurized) or retort pouch vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds		Agree for processed mushy and garden peas (canned only)
04.2.2.5	Vegetable, (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed purees and spreads (e.g., peanut butter)		Technological need questioned.
04.2.2.6	Vegetable, (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed pulps and preparations (e.g., vegetable desserts and sauces, candied vegetables) other than food category 04.2.2.5		Agree with the exception of tomato paste and tomato-based sauces (see also codex standard for processed tomato concentrates codex STAN 57-1981)
04.2.2.7	Fermented vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and seaweed products, excluding fermented soybean products of food category 12.10		Agree
04.2.2.8	Cooked or fried vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds		Technological need questioned. The use could mislead the consumer.
05.1.2	Cocoa mixes (syrups)		Technological need questioned. The use could mislead the consumer.
05.1.3	Cocoa-based spreads, incl. fillings		Technological need questioned. The use could mislead the consumer.
05.1.4	Cocoa and chocolate products		Technological need questioned. The use could mislead the consumer.
05.1.5	Imitation chocolate, chocolate substitute products		Agree

<b>APPENDIX III</b>			
<b>GSFA Categories in which the use of one or more colours is justified</b>			
05.2	Confectionery including hard and soft candy, nougats, etc. other than food categories 05.1, 05.3, and 05.4		Agree
05.2.1	Hard candy		Agree
05.2.2	Soft candy		Agree
05.2.3	Nougats and marzipans		Agree
05.3	Chewing gum		Agree
05.4	Decorations (e.g., for fine bakery wares), toppings (non-fruit), and sweet sauces		Agree
06.3	Breakfast cereals, including rolled oats		Rolled oats are a basic food. Technological need questioned. Basic food with wide consumption that would increase intake of colours
06.4.3	Pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products	Include because CX STAN 249 (Instant Noodles) contains color provisions	EC does not agree with the use of colours in pre-cooked pastas. However, could agree with the use <u>in instant noodles only</u> , if this is in accordance with CODEX STAN 249-2006
06.5	Cereal and starch based desserts (e.g., rice pudding, tapioca pudding)	Include because there are adopted provisions for colors in these GSFA food categories	Agree
06.6	Batters (e.g., for breading or batters for fish or poultry)		Agree
06.7	Pre-cooked or processed rice products, including rice cakes (Oriental type only)	Include at request of the European Commission	If no other interest, EC does not support
06.8	Soybean products (excluding soybean products of food category 12.9 and fermented soybean products of food category 12.10)		If no other interest, EC does not support
07.1.2	Crackers, excluding sweet crackers	Include because there are adopted provisions for colors in these GSFA food categories	Technological need questioned. Basic food with wide consumption that would increase intake of colours
07.1.4	Bread-type products, including bread stuffing and bread crumbs		Technological need questioned. Basic food with wide consumption that would increase intake of colours
07.2	Fine bakery wares (sweet, salty, savoury) and mixes		Agree
07.2.1	Cakes, cookies and pies (e.g., fruit-filled or custard types)		Agree
07.2.2	Other fine bakery products (e.g., doughnuts, sweet rolls, scones, and muffins)		Agree
07.2.3	Mixes for fine bakery wares (e.g., cakes, pancakes)		Agree
08.1	Fresh meat, poultry and game		Include with Note 4
08.1.1	Fresh meat, poultry and game, whole pieces or cuts	Include with Note 4	The use should be limited in glaze, coatings or decorations or surface treatment only
08.1.2	Fresh meat, poultry and game, comminuted	Include with Note 16	The use should be limited in glaze, coatings or decorations or surface treatment only
08.2	Processed meat, poultry, and game products in whole pieces or cuts	Include with Note 16	The use should be limited in glaze, coatings or decorations or surface treatment only
08.2.1	Non-heat treated processed meat, poultry, and game products in whole pieces or cuts	Include with Note 16	The use should be limited in glaze, coatings or decorations or surface treatment only
08.2.1.1	Cured (including salted) non-heat treated processed meat, poultry, and game products in whole pieces or cuts	Include with Note 16	The use should be limited in glaze, coatings or decorations or surface treatment only

<b>APPENDIX III</b>			
<b>GSFA Categories in which the use of one or more colours is justified</b>			
08.2.1.2	Cured (including salted) and dried non-heat treated processed meat, poultry, and game products in whole pieces or cuts	Include with Note 16	The use should be limited in glaze, coatings or decorations or surface treatment only
08.2.1.3	Fermented non-heat treated processed meat, poultry, and game products in whole pieces or cuts	Include with Note 16	The use should be limited in glaze, coatings or decorations or surface treatment only
08.2.2	Heat-treated processed meat, poultry, and game products in whole pieces or cuts	Include with Note 16	The use should be limited in glaze, coatings or decorations or surface treatment only
08.2.3	Frozen processed meat, poultry, and game products in whole pieces or cuts	Include with Note 16	The use should be limited in glaze, coatings or decorations or surface treatment only
08.3	Processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	Include with Note 16	Agree, but only certain colours
08.3.1	Non-heat treated processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	Include with Note 16	Agree, but only certain colours
08.3.1.1	Cured (including salted) non-heat treated processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	Include with Note 16	Agree, but only certain colours
08.3.1.2	Cured (including salted) and dried non-heat treated processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	Include with Note 16	Agree, but only certain colours
08.3.1.3	Fermented non-heat treated processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	Include with Note 16	Agree, but only certain colours
08.3.2	Heat-treated processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	Include with Note 16	Agree, but only certain colours
08.3.3	Frozen processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	Include with Note 16	Agree, but only certain colours
08.4	Edible casings (e.g., sausage casings)	Include with Note 16	Agree, but only certain colours
09.1	Fresh fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	Include with Note 16	Technological need questioned for the broad food category of fresh untreated fish. Such use could mislead the consumer. It should therefore be limited as specified in the sub-categories below.
09.1.1	Fresh fish	Include with Note 16	The use should be limited to "fish roe only"
09.1.2	Fresh mollusks, crustaceans and echinoderms	Include with Note 16	Technological need questioned for these products. The use could mislead the consumer.
09.2	Processed fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	Include because there are adopted provisions for colors in this GSFA food category	The use should be limited to certain products only as specified in the subcategories below
09.2.1	Frozen fish, fish fillets, and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	Include with Note 95 <sup>76</sup>	Agree
09.2.2	Frozen battered fish, fish fillets and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	Include with Note 16	The use should be limited to batter/coating only and to certain colours only. Codex Standard CX/STAN 166-1989 also provides for limited use of colours
09.2.3	Frozen minced and creamed fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	Include with Note X <sup>77</sup>	The use should be limited to "fish roe" and "surimi" only.
09.2.4	Cooked and/or fried fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	Include because there are adopted provisions for colors in this GSFA food category	Agree, but for limited use in certain products only
09.2.4.1	Cooked fish and fish products	Include with Note 95	Agree
09.2.4.2	Cooked mollusks, crustaceans, and	Include because there are	Agree

<sup>76</sup> **Note 95** For use in surimi and fish roe products only

<sup>77</sup> **Note X** For use in surimi only.

<b>APPENDIX III</b>			
<b>GSFA Categories in which the use of one or more colours is justified</b>			
	echinoderms	adopted provisions for colors in this GSFA food category	
09.2.4.3	Fried fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	Include with Note 16	The use should be limited to "fish roe" and "surimi" only.
09.2.5	Smoked, dried, fermented, and/or salted fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	Include because there are adopted provisions for colors in these GSFA food categories	Agree
09.3	Semi-preserved fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms		The use should be limited to certain products only (see below)
09.3.1	Fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms, marinated and/or in jelly	Include with Note 16	The use should be limited in glaze and coatings.
09.3.2	Fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms, pickled and/or in brine		The use should be limited in glaze and coatings.
09.3.3	Salmon substitutes, caviar, and other fish roe products	Include because there are adopted provisions for colors in this GSFA food category	Agree
09.3.4	Semi-preserved fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms (e.g., fish paste), excluding products of food categories 09.3.1 - 09.3.3	Include because there are adopted provisions for colors in this GSFA food category	Agree
09.4	Fully preserved, including canned or fermented fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	Include with Note 95	Agree
10.1	Fresh eggs	Include with Note 4	Agree
10.2	Egg products	Include because there are adopted provisions for colors in these GSFA food categories	These are basic foods. Technological need questioned.
10.2.1	Liquid egg products		These are basic foods. Technological need questioned.
10.2.2	Frozen egg products		These are basic foods. Technological need questioned.
10.2.3	Dried and/or heat coagulated egg products		These are basic foods. Technological need questioned.
10.3	Preserved eggs, including alkaline, salted, and canned eggs	Include with Note 4 (For decoration stamping, marking or branding the product)	Agree
10.4	Egg-based desserts (e.g., custard)	Include because there are adopted provisions for colors in this GSFA food category	Agree
11.3	Sugar solutions and syrups, also (partially) inverted, including treacle and molasses, excluding products of food category 11.1.3		Technological need questioned.
11.4	Other sugars and syrups (e.g., xylose, maple syrup, sugar toppings)		Technological need questioned.
12.2.2	Seasonings and condiments	Include because CS STAN 117 contains provisions for colors and there are adopted provisions for colors in this GSFA food category	Agree
12.3	Vinegars		Agree, but certain colours only
12.4	Mustards		Agree
12.5	Soups and broths		Agree
12.5.1	Ready-to-eat soups and broths, including canned, bottled, and frozen		Agree
12.5.2	Mixes for soups and broths		Agree
12.6	Sauces and like products		Agree
12.6.1	Emulsified sauces (e.g., mayonnaise, salad dressing)		Agree
12.6.2	Non-emulsified sauces (e.g., ketchup, cheese sauce, cream		Agree

<b>APPENDIX III</b>		
<b>GSFA Categories in which the use of one or more colours is justified</b>		
	sauce, brown gravy)	
12.6.3	Mixes for sauces and gravies	Agree
12.6.4	Clear sauces (e.g., fish sauce)	Agree
12.7	Salads (e.g., macaroni salad, potato salad) and sandwich spreads excluding cocoa-and nut-based spreads of food categories 04.2.2.5 and 05.1.3	Agree
12.9	Protein products	If no other interest, EC does not support
12.9.1	Soybean protein products	If no other interest, EC does not support
12.9.1.1	Soybean beverage	If no other interest, EC does not support
12.9.1.2	Soybean milk film	If no other interest, EC does not support
12.9.1.3	Other soybean protein products (including non-fermented soy sauce)_	If no other interest, EC does not support
12.9.2	Fresh bean curd (tofu)	If no other interest, EC does not support
12.9.3	Semi-dehydrated bean curd	If no other interest, EC does not support
12.9.3.1	Thick gravy-stewed semi-dehydrated bean curd	If no other interest, EC does not support
12.9.3.2	Deep fried semi-dehydrated bean curd	If no other interest, EC does not support
12.9.3.3	Semi-dehydrated bean curd, other than food categories 12.9.3.1 and 12.9.3.2	If no other interest, EC does not support
12.9.4	Dehydrated bean curd (kori tofu)	If no other interest, EC does not support
12.9.5	Other protein products	If no other interest, EC does not support
12.10	Fermented soybean products	If no other interest, EC does not support
12.10.1	Fermented soybeans (e.g., natto)	If no other interest, EC does not support
12.10.2	Fermented soybean curd (soybean cheese)	If no other interest, EC does not support
12.10.3	Fermented soybean paste (e.g., miso)–	If no other interest, EC does not support
12.10.4	Fermented soy sauce	If no other interest, EC does not support
13.3	Dietetic foods intended for special medical purposes (excluding products of food category 13.1)	Agree
13.4	Dietetic formulae for slimming purposes and weight reduction	Agree
13.5	Dietetic foods (e.g., supplementary foods for dietary use) excluding products of food categories 13.1-13.4 and 13.6	Agree
13.6	Food supplements	Agree
14.1.4	Water-based flavoured drinks, including "sport," "energy," or "electrolyte" drinks and particulated drinks	Agree
14.1.4.1	Carbonated water-based flavoured drinks	Agree
14.1.4.2	Non-carbonated water-based flavoured drinks, including punches and ades	Agree
14.1.4.3	Concentrates (liquid or solid) for water-based flavoured drinks	Agree
14.1.5	Coffee, coffee substitutes, tea, herbal infusions, and other hot cereal and grain beverages, excluding cocoa	<p>Include upon request of European Commission and New Zealand</p> <p>Include based on the following justifications.            1) Caramel colour, flavours and caffeine are dried on maltodextrin, which is added to dried coffee, in order to make an extended mix which is used as a coffee substitute in Russia (e.g. by the Russian military).            2) This category includes canned coffees that are served</p>

<b>APPENDIX III</b>			
<b>GSFA Categories in which the use of one or more colours is justified</b>			
		hot. The use of caramel color is technologically justified in such products due to a specific manufacturing method (retort sterilization) that may change the color during processing. Caramel color is added to provide a consistent color of the product that is expected by consumers. Such coffees are widely marketed in Japan.	
14.2.1	Beer and malt beverages	Include because there are adopted provisions for colors in this GSFA food category	Agree, but certain colours only
14.2.2	Cider and perry		Agree, but certain colours only
14.2.3.3	Fortified grape wine, grape liquor wine, and sweet grape wine		The technological need is questioned. The use could mislead the consumer
14.2.4	Wines (other than grape)		Agree
14.2.6	Distilled spirituous beverages containing more than 15% alcohol		Agree
14.2.7	Aromatized alcoholic beverages (e.g., beer, wine and spirituous cooler-type beverages, low-alcoholic refreshers)		Agree
15.0	Ready-to-eat savouries		Agree
15.1	Snacks - potato, cereal, flour or starch based (from roots and tubers, pulses and legumes)		Agree
15.2	Processed nuts, including coated nuts and nut mixtures (with e.g., dried fruit)		Agree
15.3	Snacks - fish based		Agree
16.0	Composite foods - foods that could not be placed in categories 01 - 15		The technological need is questioned. Justification should be provided why the carry over wouldn't be sufficient

**Recommendation 2 - Food Categories in Which the Use of Colors is Technologically Justified**  
 The eWG recommends that the CCFA establish as a principle that all provisions for the use of colours in GSFA food categories 04.1.1, 04.2.1, 08.1, 09.1 et. seq. should include Notes 4 and 16.

The EC agrees with this recommendation 2. However, the EC considers that the use of colours and food additives in general for marking, stamping, decoration, glazes or coatings should be considered separately for these applications. In this regard, the EC would support consideration of the options for listing food additives in such applications, as suggested in the discussion paper submitted by Canada last year.

**ALLURA RED AC (INS 129)**

22. The 25<sup>th</sup> JECFA (1981) assigned an ADI of 7 mg/kg bw/d for allura red AC.

**Recommendation 1 – Allura Red AC, INS 129**  
 The eWG recommends that the 39<sup>th</sup> CCFA **discontinue** further work on the following food additive provisions for allura red AC in the GSFA.

**EC agrees with recommendation 1**

**Recommendation 2 - Allura Red AC, INS 129**  
 The eWG recommends that the 39<sup>th</sup> CCFA **adopt** the following food additive provisions for allura red AC in the GSFA.

Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level	Comments	EC comments
01.6.2.2	rind of ripened cheese	100 mg/kg		Agree
01.6.4	processed cheese	200 mg/kg		Lower to 100 mg/kg
01.7	dairy-based desserts (e.g., pudding, fruit or flavoured yoghurt)	300 mg/kg		Support at 150 mg/kg.
02.3	fat emulsions mainly of type oil-in-water, including mixed and/or flavoured products based on fat emulsions	300 mg/kg		EC opposes such use could mislead the consumer

<b>Recommendation 2 - Allura Red AC, INS 129</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>adopt</b> the following food additive provisions for allura red AC in the GSFA.					
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>EC comments</b>
02.4	fat-based desserts excluding dairy-based dessert products of food category 01.7	300	mg/kg		Support at 150 mg/kg. ADI
03.0	edible ices, including sherbet and sorbet	300	mg/kg		Support at 150 mg/kg.
04.1.2.4	canned or bottled (pasteurized) fruit	200	mg/kg		
04.1.2.5	jams, jellies and marmelades	300	mg/kg		The Codex standard on jam and jellies contains the use of several colours but no the use of Allure Red AC. Discontinue
04.1.2.7	candied fruit	300	mg/kg		Suggested 200 mg/kg
04.1.2.8	fruit preparations, including pulp, purees, fruit toppings and coconut milk	300	mg/kg		
04.1.2.9	fruit-based desserts, including fruit-flavoured water-based desserts	300	mg/kg		Suggested 150 mg/kg
04.1.2.11	fruit fillings for pastries	<b>300</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		Suggested 200 mg/kg
04.2.2.3	vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and seaweeds in vinegar, oil, brine, or soy sauce	<b>300</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		Technological need questioned discontinue
04.2.2.4	canned or bottled (pasteurized) or retort pouch vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds	200	mg/kg		The Codex standard on this category contains no use of colours Technological need questioned Discontinue
04.2.2.6	vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed pulps and preparations (e.g., vegetable desserts and sauces, candied vegetables) other than food category 04.2.2.5	200	mg/kg		Support with the exception of tomato paste and tomato-based sauces
05.1.3	cocoa-based spreads, including fillings	300	mg/kg		The Codex standard on this category contains no use of colours. Additionally technological need is questioned. This use could mislead the consumer. Discontinue
05.1.4	cocoa and chocolate products	300	mg/kg		The Codex standard on this category contains no use of colours Additionally technological need is questioned. This use could mislead the consumer. Discontinue
05.1.5	imitation chocolate, chocolate substitute products	300	mg/kg		
05.2	confectionery including hard and soft candy, nougat, etc. other than food categories 05.1, 05.3 and 05.4	<b>300</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		
05.3	chewing gum	<b>300</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		
05.4	decorations (e.g., for fine bakery wares), toppings (non-fruit) and sweet sauces	<b>300</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		
06.2	flours and starches (including soybean powder)	<b>300</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		Discontinue Moreover, the use in this category is



<b>Recommendation 2 - Allura Red AC, INS 129</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>adopt</b> the following food additive provisions for allura red AC in the GSFA.					
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>EC comments</b>
					not compatible with several Codex Standards on flours (e.g. wheat flour, whole maize (corn) meal, pearl millet flour, sorghum flour) which do not contain any use of colours.
06.5	cereal and starch based desserts (e.g., rice pudding, tapioca pudding)	300	mg/kg		Suggested 150 mg/kg
07.1.2	crackers, excluding sweet crackers	300	mg/kg		Discontinue Basic food with wide consumption which would increase intake
07.1.3	other ordinary bakery products (e.g., bagels, pita, English muffins)	300	mg/kg		Discontinue Basic food with wide consumption which would increase intake
07.2.1	cakes, cookies and pies (e.g., fruit-filled or custard types)	<b>300</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		Suggested 200 mg/kg
07.2.2	other fine bakery products (e.g., doughnuts, sweet rolls, scones, and muffins)	300	mg/kg		Suggested 200 mg/kg
07.2.3	mixes for fine bakery wares (e.g., cakes, pancakes)	300	mg/kg		Suggested 200 mg/kg
08.4	edible casings (e.g., sausage casings)	<b>300</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Note 16	
09.2.1	frozen fish, fish fillets, and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	<b>300</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Note 95	
09.2.4.1	cooked fish and fish products	<b>300</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		With Note 95
09.2.4.2	cooked mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	250	mg/kg		
09.2.5	smoked, dried, fermented, and/or salted fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	<b>300</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Note 22	
09.3.3	salmon substitutes, caviar, and other fish roe products	<b>300</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		
09.3.4	semi-preserved fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms (e.g., fish paste), excluding products of food categories 09.3.1 - 09.3.3	<b>300</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		Suggested 100 mg
10.1	fresh eggs	100	mg/kg	Note 4	
10.4	egg-based desserts (e.g., custard)	300	mg/kg		Suggested 150 mg
11.4	other sugars and syrups (e.g., xylose, maple syrup, sugar toppings)	300	mg/kg		
12.2.2	seasonings and condiments	<b>300</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		
12.4	mustards	300	mg/kg		
12.5	soups and broths	300	mg/kg		Suggested 50 mg/kg
12.6	sauces and like products	<b>300</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		Should not be used in tomato based sauces
12.9.5	other protein products	100	mg/kg		
13.3	dietetic foods intended for special medical purposes (excluding products of food category 13.1)	50	mg/kg		
13.4	dietetic formulae for slimming purposes and weight reduction	50	mg/kg		
13.5	dietetic foods (e.g., supplementary foods for dietary use) excluding products of food categories 13.1 - 13.4	300	mg/kg		

<b>Recommendation 2 - Allura Red AC, INS 129</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>adopt</b> the following food additive provisions for allura red AC in the GSFA.					
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	EC comments
	and 13.6				
13.6	food supplements	300	mg/kg		
14.1.4	<b>Water-based flavoured drinks, including "sport," "energy," or "electrolyte" drinks and particulated drinks</b>	<b>100</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note 127<sup>78</sup></b>	
14.2.2	cider and perry	200	mg/kg		
14.2.4	wines (other than grape)	200	mg/kg		
14.2.6	distilled spirituous beverages containing more than 15% alcohol	300	mg/kg		Suggested 200 mg
14.2.7	aromatized alcoholic beverages (e.g., beer, wine and spirituous cooler-type beverages, low alcoholic refreshers)	200	mg/kg		
15.1	snacks - potato, cereal, flour or starch based (from roots and tubers, pulses and legumes)	200	mg/kg		Suggested 100 mg
15.2	processed nuts, including covered nuts and nut mixtures (with e.g., dried fruit)	100	mg/kg		
16.0	composite foods - foods that could not be placed in categories 01 - 15	<b>300</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		Discontinue The technological need is questioned. Justification must be provided why the carry over wouldn't be sufficient

<b>Recommendation 3 - Allura Red AC, INS 129</b>					
<b>Comments are requested</b> on the following food additive provisions for allura red AC in the GSFA.					
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max	Level	Comments	EC comments
01.6.1	unripened cheese	200	mg/kg	Note 3 <sup>79</sup>	Technological need questioned. Rind is not expected to be formed in unripened cheese
01.6.5	cheese analogues	300	mg/kg	Note 3	Suggested 100 mg/kg except when rind is not expected to be formed
08.3.2	heat-treated processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	25	mg/kg		Ok for use only in burger meat with a minimum vegetable and/or cereal content of 4 %
14.1.5	<b>Coffee, coffee substitutes, tea, herbal infusions, and other hot cereal and grain beverages, excluding cocoa</b>	<b>100</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		Technological need questioned

### BRILLIANT BLUE FCF (INS 133)

<b>Recommendation 1 – Brilliant Blue FCF, INS 133</b>						
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>discontinue</b> further work on the following food additive provisions for brilliant blue FCF in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	EC Comments	Justification provided to eWG
04.1.1.2	surface-treated fresh fruit	500	mg/kg	Note 16 <sup>80</sup>	EC agrees with recommendation 1	

### EC agrees with recommendation 1

<sup>78</sup> **Note 127:** As served to the consumer

<sup>79</sup> **Note 3:** Surface treatment.

<sup>80</sup> **Note 16:** For use in glaze, coatings or decorations for fruit, vegetables, meat or fish.

<b>Recommendation 2 - Brilliant Blue FCF, INS 133</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <u>adopt</u> the following food additive provisions for brilliant blue FCF in the GSFA.					
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>EC Comments</b>
01.6.5	cheese analogues	100	mg/kg	Note 3	
04.1.2.6	fruit-based spreads (e.g., chutney) excluding products of food category 04.1.2.5	100	mg/kg		
04.1.2.7	candied fruit	100	mg/kg		
04.1.2.8	fruit preparations, including pulp, purees, fruit toppings and coconut milk	100	mg/kg		
04.2.2.6	vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed pulps and preparations (e.g., vegetable desserts and sauces, candied vegetables) other than food category 04.2.2.5	100	mg/kg		Agree except for tomato sauce. Add note 92
04.2.2.7	fermented vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweed products, excluding fermented soybean products of food category 12.10	100	mg/kg	Note 92 <sup>81</sup>	
05.1.5	imitation chocolate, chocolate substitute products	100	mg/kg		
08.0	meat and meat products, including poultry and game	100	mg/kg	Note 4 <sup>82</sup> 16	
09.2.4.1	cooked fish and fish products	100	mg/kg	Note 95 <sup>83</sup> ,	
09.2.4.2	cooked mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	100	mg/kg		
09.2.5	smoked, dried, fermented, and/or salted fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	100	mg/kg	Note 22 <sup>84</sup>	
12.2.2	seasonings and condiments	100	mg/kg		
12.4	mustards	100	mg/kg		
12.5	soups and broths	50	mg/kg		
12.6	sauces and like products	100	mg/kg		
12.9.5	other protein products	100	mg/kg		

### CANTHAXANTHIN (INS 161G)

The EC considers that the use of Canthaxanthin should be further restricted because of the very low ADI of this substance.

The European Scientific Committee on Food has allocated the same ADI to canthaxantin (0.03 mg/kg b.w) as JECFA. The major concern the Committee has on the use of canthaxantin is the formation of retinal crystalline deposit (Report of the Scientific Committee for Food. 43rd series). Due to this safety concern, the only permitted use in the EC is in *traditional French sausage (Saucisse de Strasbourg)* and therefore the European Community supports discontinuation of the work on all specific provisions.

<sup>81</sup> **Note 92:** Excluding tomato-based sauces

<sup>82</sup> **Note 4:** For decoration, stamping, marking or branding the product.

<sup>83</sup> **Note 95:** For use in surimi and fish roe products only

<sup>84</sup> **Note 22:** For use in smoked fish products only.

**CARAMEL COLOUR, CLASS III (INS 150C)**

23. The 29th JECFA (1985) assigned an ADI of 200 mg/kg bw/d for caramel colour class III.

**Recommendation 1 – Caramel Colour Class III, INS 150c**

The eWG recommends that the 39<sup>th</sup> CCFA **discontinue** further work on the following food additive provisions for caramel colour class III in the GSFA.

**The European community agrees with recommendation 1.****Recommendation 2 - Caramel Colour Class III, INS 150c**

The eWG recommends that the 39<sup>th</sup> CCFA **revoke** the following adopted food additive provisions for caramel colour class III in the GSFA.

**The European community agrees with recommendation 2.****Recommendation 3 - Caramel Colour Class III, INS 150c**

The eWG recommends that the 39<sup>th</sup> CCFA **adopt** the following food additive provisions for caramel colour class III in the GSFA.

<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>EC Comments</b>
01.1.2	dairy-based drinks, flavoured and/or fermented (e.g., chocolate milk, cocoa, eggnog, drinking yoghurt, whey-based drinks)	50000	mg/kg	Note 52 <sup>85</sup>	The maximum level seems to be high for a drink. (a child of 20 kg b.w. would reach the ADI of 200 mg/kg b.w. consuming 100 ml of the product).
01.3.2	beverage whiteners	1000	mg/kg		EC does not support. Need questioned
01.4.3	clotted cream (plain)	5000	mg/kg		
01.5.2	milk and cream powder analogues	5000	mg/kg		EC does not support
01.6.1	unripened cheese	50000	mg/kg		Need questioned rind is not expected to be formed in unripened cheese.
01.6.2	ripened cheese	50000	mg/kg		
01.6.4	processed cheese	50000	mg/kg		
01.6.5	cheese analogues	50000	mg/kg		
01.7	dairy-based desserts (e.g., pudding, fruit or flavoured yoghurt)	50000	mg/kg		The maximum level seems to be high. (a child of 20 kg b.w. would reach the ADI of 200 mg/kg b.w. consuming 100 g of the product)
01.8.1	whey and whey products, excluding whey cheeses	50000	mg/kg		The maximum level seems to be high. (a child of 20 kg b.w. would reach the ADI of 200 mg/kg b.w. consuming 100 g of the product) Moreover, the technological need is questioned.
02.1.2	vegetable oils and fats	20000	mg/kg		EC doesn't agree with this provision because CX STAN 19 prohibits the use of colors in vegetable oils.
02.1.3	lard, tallow, fish oil, and other animal fats	20000	mg/kg		EC does not support. The use could mislead the consumer.
02.2.1	blends of butter and margarine	20000	mg/kg		EC does not support
02.2.2	emulsions containing less than 80% fat	500	mg/kg		EC does not support
02.3	fat emulsions mainly of type oil-in-water, including mixed and/or flavoured products based on fat emulsions	20000	mg/kg		EC does not support
02.4	fat-based desserts excluding dairy-based dessert products of food category 01.7	20000	mg/kg		
03.0	edible ices, including sherbet and sorbet	30000	mg/kg		
04.1.2	processed fruit	50,000	mg/kg		EC doesn't agree because some subcategories (as 4.1.2.1) are not expected to contain colours.

<sup>85</sup> **Note 52:** Excluding chocolate milk

<b>Recommendation 3 - Caramel Colour Class III, INS 150c</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>adopt</b> the following food additive provisions for caramel colour class III in the GSFA.					
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>EC Comments</b>
					Moreover, the maximal level seems to be too high in this large category.
04.2.2	processed vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds	<b>50,000</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		EC doesn't agree because some subcategories (4.2.2.1) are not expected to contain colours. Moreover, the maximal level seems to be too high in this large category.
05.1.5	imitation chocolate, chocolate substitute products	<b>50,000</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		
06.3	breakfast cereals, including rolled oats	50000	mg/kg	<b>Note AA</b> <sup>86</sup>	The maximal level is high
06.4.2	dried pastas and noodles and like products	50000	mg/kg		EC doesn't agree because there is no technological need in pastas. A note excluding pastas is required.
06.4.3	pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products	50000	mg/kg		EC does not agree with the use of colours in pre-cooked pastas. However, could agree with the use <u>in instant noodles only</u> , if this is in accordance with CODEX STAN 249-2006
06.5	cereal and starch based desserts (e.g., rice pudding, tapioca pudding)	50000	mg/kg		
06.6	batters (e.g., for breading or batters for fish or poultry)	50000	mg/kg		
06.7	pre-cooked or processed rice products, including rice cakes (Oriental type only)	50000	mg/kg		
07.1.2	crackers, excluding sweet crackers	50000	mg/kg		EC disagrees. This is a basic foodstuff with wide consumption that would increase intake. The use could mislead the consumer.
07.1.3	other ordinary bakery products (e.g., bagels, pita, English muffins)	50000	mg/kg		EC disagrees. This is a basic foodstuff with wide consumption that would increase intake. The use could mislead the consumer.
07.1.4	bread-type products, including bread stuffing and bread crumbs	50000	mg/kg		EC disagrees. This is a basic foodstuff with wide consumption that would increase intake. The use could mislead the consumer.
07.1.5	steamed breads and buns	50000	mg/kg		EC doesn't agree with this provision.
07.1.6	mixes for breads and ordinary bakery wares	50000	mg/kg		EC doesn't agree with this provision and a note excluding the mixes for breads of the category 7.1.1 is required.
07.2	fine bakery wares (sweet, salty, savoury) and mixes	50000	mg/kg		
08.0	meat and meat products, including poultry and game		GMP	Note 3 <sup>87</sup> Note 4 <sup>88</sup> 16 <sup>89</sup>	
09.1	fresh fish and fish products, including	30000	mg/kg	<b>Note 4 &amp; 16</b>	

<sup>86</sup> **Note AA:** Excluding rolled oats.

<sup>87</sup> **Note 3:** Surface treatment.

<sup>88</sup> **Note 4:** For decoration, stamping, marking or branding the product.

<sup>89</sup> **Note 16:** For use in glaze, coatings or decorations for fruit, vegetables, meat or fish.

<b>Recommendation 3 - Caramel Colour Class III, INS 150c</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>adopt</b> the following food additive provisions for caramel colour class III in the GSFA.					
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>EC Comments</b>
	mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms				
09.2	processed fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	30000	mg/kg		
09.3	semi-preserved fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	30000	mg/kg		EC wants to add note 95.
09.4	fully preserved, including canned or fermented fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	30000	mg/kg	<b>Note 95<sup>90</sup></b>	
10.1	fresh eggs	20000	mg/kg	Note 4 <sup>91</sup>	
10.2	egg products	20000	mg/kg		EC doesn't agree the use could mislead the consumer. Egg soups would be covered by category 12.5
10.3	dried and/or heat coagulated egg products	20000	mg/kg		EC wants to add note 4.
10.4	egg-based desserts (e.g., custard)	20000	mg/kg		
11.4	other sugars and syrups (e.g., xylose, maple syrup, sugar toppings)	50000	mg/kg		EC doesn't agree
11.6	table-top sweeteners, including those containing high-intensity sweeteners	50000	mg/kg		The technological need is questioned.
<b>12.2.2</b>	<b>seasonings and condiments</b>	<b>50000</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		
12.3	vinegars	10000	mg/kg		
12.4	mustards	10000	mg/kg		
12.5	soups and broths	10000	mg/kg		
12.6	sauces and like products	10000	mg/kg		
12.7	salads (e.g., macaroni salad, potato salad) and sandwich spreads excluding cocoa- and nut-based spreads of food categories 04.2.2.5 and 05.1.3	10000	mg/kg		
12.9.1	soybean protein products	10000	mg/kg		
12.9.3	semi-dehydrated bean curd	80000	mg/kg		
12.9.5	other protein products	10000	mg/kg		
12.10	fermented soybean products	10000	mg/kg		
13.3	dietetic foods intended	20000	mg/kg		

<sup>90</sup> **Note 95** For use in surimi and fish roe products only.

<sup>91</sup> **Note 4:** For decoration, stamping, marking or branding the product.

<b>Recommendation 3 - Caramel Colour Class III, INS 150c</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>adopt</b> the following food additive provisions for caramel colour class III in the GSFA.					
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>EC Comments</b>
	for special medical purposes (excluding products of food category 13.1)				
13.4	dietetic formulae for slimming purposes and weight reduction	20000	mg/kg		
13.5	dietetic foods (e.g., supplementary foods for dietary use) excluding products of food categories 13.1 - 13.4 and 13.6	20000	mg/kg		
13.6	food supplements	20000	mg/kg		
14.1.3.2	vegetable nectar	50000	mg/kg		EC considers that these products are very similar to fruit nectars and doesn't support this provision.
14.1.3.4	concentrates for vegetable nectar	50000	mg/kg	Note 127 <sup>92</sup>	EC considers that these products are very similar to fruit nectars and doesn't support this provision.
14.1.4	water-based flavoured drinks, including "sport," "energy" or "electrolyte" drinks and particulated drinks	50000	mg/kg		The maximal level seems to be high for a drink. (A child of 20 kg b.w. would reach the ADI consuming 100 ml of the product).
14.1.5	coffee, coffee substitutes, tea, herbal infusions, and other hot cereal and grain beverages, excluding cocoa	10000	mg/kg		Technological need in coffee, tea and herbal infusion is questioned Moreover, technological need of this maximum level in the other products is also questioned..
14.2.2	cider and perry	1000	mg/kg		
14.2.4	wines (other than grape)	1000	mg/kg		
14.2.5	mead	1000	mg/kg		
15.0	ready-to-eat savouries	10000	mg/kg		

<b>Recommendation 4 - Caramel Colour Class III, INS 150c</b>					
<b>Comments are requested</b> on the following food additive provisions for caramel colour class III in the GSFA.					
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>Step</b>
01.4.4	cream analogues	5000	mg/kg		3
05.1.2	cocoa mixes (syrops)		GMP		6
05.1.4	cocoa and chocolate products		GMP		
16.0	composite foods - foods that could not be placed in categories 01 - 15	20000	mg/kg		3

**EC supports Recommendation 4 to request more info on technological need.**

#### **CARAMEL COLOUR, CLASS IV (INS 150D)**

24. The 29<sup>th</sup> JECFA (1985) assigned an ADI of 200 mg/kg bw/d for caramel colour class IV.

<sup>92</sup> **Note 127:** As served to the consumer.

**Recommendation 1 – Caramel Colour Class IV, INS 150d**

The eWG recommends that the 39<sup>th</sup> CCFA **discontinue** further work on the following food additive provisions for caramel colour class IV in the GSFA.

**The European community agrees with Recommendation 1.****Recommendation 2 - Caramel Colour Class IV, INS 150d**

The eWG recommends that the 39<sup>th</sup> CCFA **revoke** the following adopted food additive provisions for caramel colour class IV in the GSFA.

**The European community agrees with Recommendation 2.****Recommendation 3 - Caramel Colour Class IV, INS 150d**

The eWG recommends that the 39<sup>th</sup> CCFA **adopt** the following food additive provisions for caramel colour class IV in the GSFA.

<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>EC Comments</b>
01.1.2	dairy-based drinks, flavoured and/or fermented (e.g., chocolate milk, cocoa, eggnog, drinking yoghurt, whey-based drinks)	50000	mg/kg	<b>Note 52</b> <sup>93</sup>	The maximal level seems to be high for a drink. (A child of 20 kg b.w. would reach the ADI consuming 100 ml of the product).
01.3.2	beverage whiteners	1000	mg/kg		EC does not support. Need questioned
01.4.4	cream analogues	5000	mg/kg		EC does not support
01.5.2	milk and cream powder analogues	5000	mg/kg		EC does not support
01.6.1	unripened cheese	50000	mg/kg		Need questioned rind is not expected to be formed in unripened cheese.
01.6.2	ripened cheese	50000	mg/kg		
01.6.4	processed cheese	50000	mg/kg		
01.6.5	cheese analogues	50000	mg/kg		
01.7	dairy-based desserts (e.g., pudding, fruit or flavoured yoghurt)	50000	mg/kg		The maximal level seems to be high for a drink. (A child of 20 kg b.w. would reach the ADI consuming 100 g of the product).
02.4	fat-based desserts excluding dairy-based dessert products of food category 01.7	20000	mg/kg		
03.0	edible ices, including sherbet and sorbet	30000	mg/kg		
04.2.2	processed vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds	<b>50,000</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note 92</b> <sup>94</sup>	EC doesn't agree because some subcategories (4.2.2.1) are not expected to contain colours. Moreover, the maximal level is high for this large category.
05.1.5	imitation chocolate, chocolate substitute products	<b>50,000</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		The maximal level is high.
06.3	breakfast cereals, including rolled oats	50000	mg/kg	<b>Note AA</b> <sup>95</sup>	
06.4.3	pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products	50000	mg/kg		EC does not agree with the use of colours in pre-cooked pastas. However, could agree with the use <u>in instant noodles only</u> , if this is in accordance with CODEX STAN 249-2006
06.5	cereal and starch based desserts (e.g., rice pudding, tapioca pudding)	50000	mg/kg		
06.6	batters (e.g., for	50000	mg/kg		

<sup>93</sup> **Note 52:** Excluding chocolate milk

<sup>94</sup> **Note 92:** Excluding tomato-based sauces

<sup>95</sup> **Note AA:** Excluding rolled oats.



<b>Recommendation 3 - Caramel Colour Class IV, INS 150d</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>adopt</b> the following food additive provisions for caramel colour class IV in the GSFA.					
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>EC Comments</b>
	breeding or batters for fish or poultry)				
06.7	pre-cooked or processed rice products, including rice cakes (Oriental type only)	50000	mg/kg		
07.1.3	other ordinary bakery products (e.g., bagels, pita, English muffins)	50000	mg/kg		EC disagrees, staple food with high consumption.
07.1.6	mixes for breads and ordinary bakery wares	50000	mg/kg		Ec doesn't agree with this provision and a note excluding the mixes for breads of the category 7.1.1 is required.
07.2	fine bakery wares (sweet, salty, savoury) and mixes	50000	mg/kg		
08.0	meat and meat products, including poultry and game		GMP	<b>Notes 3<sup>96</sup> 4<sup>97</sup> &amp; 16<sup>98</sup></b>	
09.2	processed fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	30000	mg/kg	<b>Note 95<sup>99</sup></b>	
09.3	semi-preserved fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	30000	mg/kg	<b>Note 95</b>	
10.1	fresh eggs	20000	mg/kg	Note 4 <sup>100</sup>	
10.4	egg-based desserts (e.g., custard)	20000	mg/kg		
<b>12.2.2</b>	<b>seasonings and condiments</b>	<b>10000</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		
12.3	vinegars	10000	mg/kg		
12.4	mustards	10000	mg/kg		
12.5	soups and broths	10000	mg/kg		Proposed level is high. A 60kg person would reach the ADI with 120 g of soup.
12.6	sauces and like products	10000	mg/kg		
12.7	salads (e.g., macaroni salad, potato salad) and sandwich spreads excluding cocoa- and nut-based spreads of food categories 04.2.2.5 and 05.1.3	10000	mg/kg		
12.9.1	soybean protein products	10000	mg/kg		
12.9.3	semi-dehydrated	80000	mg/kg		

<sup>96</sup> **Note 3:** Surface treatment.

<sup>97</sup> **Note 4:** For decoration, stamping, marking or branding the product.

<sup>98</sup> **Note 16:** For use in glaze, coatings or decorations for fruit, vegetables, meat or fish.

<sup>99</sup> **Note 95:** For use in surimi and fish roe products only.

<sup>100</sup> **Note 4:** For decoration, stamping, marking or branding the product.

<b>Recommendation 3 - Caramel Colour Class IV, INS 150d</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>adopt</b> the following food additive provisions for caramel colour class IV in the GSFA.					
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>EC Comments</b>
	bean curd				
12.9.5	other protein products	10000 0	mg/kg		
12.10	fermented soybean products	10000 0	mg/kg		
13.3	dietetic foods intended for special medical purposes (excluding products of food category 13.1)	20000	mg/kg		
13.4	dietetic formulae for slimming purposes and weight reduction	20000	mg/kg		
13.5	dietetic foods (e.g., supplementary foods for dietary use) excluding products of food categories 13.1 - 13.4 and 13.6	20000	mg/kg		
13.6	food supplements	20000	mg/kg		
14.1.4	water-based flavoured drinks, including "sport," "energy" or "electrolyte" drinks and particulated drinks	50000	mg/kg		The maximal level seems to be high for a drink. (A child of 20 kg b.w. would reach the ADI consuming 100 ml of the product).
14.2.2	<b>cider and perry</b>	<b>1000</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		
14.2.4	<b>wines (other than grape)</b>	<b>1000</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		
14.2.5	<b>mead</b>	<b>1000</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		
15.0	ready-to-eat savouries	10,00 0	mg/kg		
16.0	composite foods - foods that could not be placed in categories 01 - 15	20000	mg/kg		EC opposes. Foodstuffs should be always clearly defined.

<b>Recommendation 4 - Caramel Colour Class IV, INS 150c</b>					
<b>Comments are requested</b> on the following food additive provisions for caramel colour class IV in the GSFA.					
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>Step</b>
04.1.2	processed fruit	80000	mg/kg		3
05.1.2	cocoa mixes (syrups)		GMP		6
05.1.3	cocoa-based spreads, including fillings		GMP		adopted
05.1.4	cocoa and chocolate products		GMP		6
06.4.2	dried pastas and noodles and like products	50000	mg/kg		3
07.1.2	crackers, excluding sweet crackers	50000	mg/kg		3
07.1.4	bread-type products, including bread stuffing and bread crumbs	50000	mg/kg		3
07.1.5	steamed breads and buns	50000	mg/kg		3
09.4	fully preserved, including canned or fermented fish and	30000	mg/kg		3

<b>Recommendation 4 - Caramel Colour Class IV, INS 150c</b>					
<b>Comments are requested</b> on the following food additive provisions for caramel colour class IV in the GSFA.					
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>Step</b>
	fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms				
10.2	egg products	20000	mg/kg		3
10.3	dried and/or heat coagulated egg products	20000	mg/kg		3
11.4	other sugars and syrups (e.g., xylose, maple syrup, sugar toppings)	50000	mg/kg		3
11.6	table-top sweeteners, including those containing high-intensity sweeteners	50000	mg/kg		3
14.1.2.2	vegetable juice	50000	mg/kg		3
14.1.2.4	concentrates for vegetable juice	50000	mg/kg		3
14.1.3.2	vegetable nectar	50000	mg/kg		3
14.1.3.2	vegetable nectar	50000	mg/kg		3
14.1.3.4	concentrates for vegetable nectar	50000	mg/kg	Justification of technological need is requested. Use could mislead consumers	3
14.1.5	coffee, coffee substitutes, tea, herbal infusions, and other hot cereal and grain beverages, excluding cocoa	100000	mg/kg		3

**EC supports Recommendation 4 for request of additional information.**

**CARMINES (INS 120)**

25. The 28<sup>th</sup> CAC has adopted several provisions in the GSFA for the use of carmines.

26. At the 55<sup>th</sup> meeting of the JECFA, (2000), the 1982 ADI of 0-5 mg/kg bw/d for carmines, as ammonium carmine or the equivalent of calcium, potassium and sodium salts was maintained.

<b>Recommendation 1 – Carmines, INS 120</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>discontinue</b> further work on the following food additive provisions for carmines in the GSFA.					
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>	<b>Comments</b>	<b>EC Comments</b>	<b>Justification provided to eWG</b>

**EC agrees with recommendation 1**

<b>Recommendation 2 - Carmines, INS 120</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>adopt</b> the following food additive provisions for carmines in the GSFA.					
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>EC Comments</b>
01.6.5	cheese analogues	<b>100</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Note 3 <sup>101</sup> , & BB <sup>102</sup>	EC agrees
02.2.1.3	blends of butter and margarine	500	mg/kg	<b>Note BB</b>	EC doesn't agree
02.2.2	emulsions containing less than 80% fat	500	mg/kg	<b>Note BB</b>	EC doesn't agree
02.3	fat emulsions mainly of type oil-in-water, including mixed and/or flavoured products based on fat emulsions	500	mg/kg	<b>Note BB</b>	EC doesn't agree

<sup>101</sup> **Note 3:** Surface treatment.

<sup>102</sup> **Note BB:** Expressed as carminic acid.

<b>Recommendation 2 - Carmines, INS 120</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>adopt</b> the following food additive provisions for carmines in the GSFA.					
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>EC Comments</b>
04.2.2.3	vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and seaweeds in vinegar, oil, brine, or soy sauce	500	mg/kg	<b>Note BB</b>	<a href="#">EC doesn't agree</a>
05.3	chewing gum	<b>500</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note BB</b>	<a href="#">Support at a level of 300 mg/kg</a>
06.4.2	dried pastas and noodles and like products	100	mg/kg		<a href="#">The technological need is questioned. Dried pasta is a basic food and this use could mislead the consumer</a>
06.4.3	pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products	100	mg/kg		<a href="#">EC does not agree</a> with the use of colours in pre-cooked pastas. However, could agree with the use <a href="#">in instant noodles only</a> , if this is in accordance with CODEX STAN 249-2006
07.1	bread and ordinary bakery wares	<b>500</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		<a href="#">Use in bread could mislead the consumer. Basic foods, such as bread, with wide consumption could increase significantly the intake of this colour</a>
09.2.1	frozen fish, fish fillets, and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	100	mg/kg	<del>Note 85</del> <sup>103</sup> <b>Note 95</b> <sup>104</sup>	
09.2.2	frozen battered fish, fish fillets, and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	500	mg/kg	Note 16 <sup>105</sup> & 95	
09.2.4.3	fried fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	500	mg/kg	Note 16 & 95	
14.1.4	water-based flavoured drinks, including "sport," "energy," or "electrolyte" drinks and particulated drinks	<b>100</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note BB</b>	
14.2.7	aromatized alcoholic beverages (e.g., beer, wine and spirituous cooler-type beverages, low alcoholic refreshers)	200	mg/kg	<b>Note BB</b>	<a href="#">Use in beer may mislead the consumer.</a>

### CAROTENES, VEGETABLE (INS 160aii)

27. The 28<sup>th</sup> CAC has adopted several provisions in the GSFA for the use of vegetable carotenes.

28. The 41<sup>st</sup> JECFA (1993) determined vegetable carotenes to be acceptable for use as a colour, provided the level of use does not exceed the level normally found in vegetables.

<b>Recommendation 1 – Carotenes, Vegetable, INS 160aii</b>	
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>discontinue</b> further work on the following food additive provisions for vegetable carotenes in the GSFA.	

### [EC agrees with recommendation 1](#)

<b>Recommendation 2 - Carotenes, Vegetable, INS 160aii</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>revoke</b> the following adopted food additive provisions for vegetable carotenes in the GSFA.					
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>Justification provided to eWG</b>
02.2.1.2	margarine and similar products	25	mg/kg		See recommendation 3

<sup>103</sup> **Note 85:** Excluding use in surimi and fish roe products at 500 mg/kg.

<sup>104</sup> **Note 95:** For use in surimi and fish roe products only.

<sup>105</sup> **Note 16:** For use in glaze, coatings or decorations for fruit, vegetables, meat or fish.

**EC agrees with recommendation 2**

<b>Recommendation 3 - Carotenes, Vegetable, INS 160aii</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <u>adopt</u> the following food additive provisions for vegetable carotenes in the GSFA.					
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>EC comments</b>
02.2.1.2	margarine and similar products	<b>30</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note CC</b> <sup>106</sup>	
04.1.2.8	fruit preparations, including pulp, purees, fruit toppings and coconut milk	100	mg/kg	<b>Note CC</b>	
04.1.2.11	fruit fillings for pastries	100	mg/kg	<b>Note CC</b>	
05.1.3	cocoa-based spreads, including fillings	<b>100</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note CC</b>	The Codex standard on this category contains no use of colours. Additionally technological need is questioned. This use could mislead the consumer. <u>Discontinue</u>
05.1.4	cocoa and chocolate products	<b>100</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note CC</b>	The Codex standard on this category contains no use of colours. Additionally technological need is questioned. This use could mislead the consumer. <u>Discontinue</u>
06.4.3	pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products	1000	mg/kg		<u>EC does not agree</u> with the use of colours in pre-cooked pastas. However, could agree with the use <u>in instant noodles only</u> , if this is in accordance with CODEX STAN 249-2006
09.1.1	fresh fish	<b>100</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Note 4 <sup>107</sup> <b>16</b> <sup>108</sup> , 50 <sup>109</sup> <b>Note CC</b>	
09.2.4.1	cooked fish and fish products	1000	mg/kg	<b>Note 95</b>	
12.2.2	seasoning and condiments	500	mg/kg		
12.10.3	fermented soybean paste (e.g., miso)	<b>1000</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		
14.1.2.2	vegetable juice	2000	mg/kg		<u>Discontinue</u> Technological need is questioned. This use could mislead the consumer.
14.1.2.4	concentrates for vegetable juice	2000	mg/kg	<b>Note 127</b> <sup>110</sup>	<u>Discontinue</u> Technological need is questioned. This use could mislead the consumer.
15.1	snacks - potato, cereal, flour or starch based (from roots and tubers, pulses and legumes)	<b>100</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note CC</b>	
15.2	processed nuts, including covered nuts and nut mixtures (with e.g., dried fruit)	20000	mg/kg		
16.0	composite foods - foods that could not be placed in categories 01 - 15	1000	mg/kg		<u>Discontinue</u> The technological need is questioned. Justification should be provided why the carry over wouldn't be sufficient. In addition foodstuffs should be clearly described.

<sup>106</sup> **Note CC:** Expressed as beta-carotene.

<sup>107</sup> **Note 4:** For decoration, stamping, marking or branding the product.

<sup>108</sup> **Note 16:** For use in glaze, coatings or decorations for fruit, vegetables, meat or fish.

<sup>109</sup> **Note 50:** For use in fish roe only.

<sup>110</sup> **Note 127:** As served to the consumer

<b>Recommendation 4 – Carotenes, Vegetable, INS 160aii</b>					
<b>Comments are requested</b> on the following food additive provisions for carotenes in the GSFA.					
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max</b>	<b>Level</b>	<b>Comments</b>	<b>EC comments</b>
<b>01.4.4</b>	<b>Cream analogues</b>	<b>20</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note CC</b>	<b>Technological need questioned</b>
04.2.2.2	dried vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds	200	mg/kg		Technological need questioned only dried potato granules and flakes
04.2.2.3	vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and seaweeds in vinegar, oil, brine, or soy sauce	1320	mg/kg		In line with EC
04.2.2.4	canned or bottled (pasteurized) or retort pouch vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds	200	mg/kg		Technological need questioned The Codex standard on this category contains no use of colours processed mushy and garden peas only
05.1.2	Cocoa mixes (syrops)	100	mg/kg	<b>Note CC</b>	Technological need is questioned. This use could mislead the consumer.
05.1.5	Imitation chocolate, chocolate substitute products	100	mg/kg	<b>Note CC</b>	The EC could support this provision.
06.4.2	dried pastas and noodles and like products	1000	mg/kg		Technological need is questioned. This is a basic food with wide consumption.
07.1.6	mixes for breads and ordinary bakery wares	<b>100</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note CC</b>	Technological need is questioned. This is a basic food with wide consumption
08.1.2	fresh meat, poultry, and game, comminuted	20	mg/kg	Note 4 <sup>111</sup> , 16 <sup>112</sup> & 117 <sup>113</sup>	
<b>11.3</b>	<b>Sugar solutions and syrups, also (partially) inverted, including treacle and molasses, excluding products of food category 11.1.3</b>	<b>50</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note CC</b>	<b>Doesn't support. Use could mislead the consumer</b>
14.1.3.2	vegetable nectar	2000	mg/kg		Justification of technological need is requested. Use could mislead consumers
14.1.3.4	concentrates for vegetable nectar	1000	mg/kg		Justification of technological need is requested. Use could mislead consumers
<b>15.3</b>	<b>Snacks - fish based</b>	<b>100</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		<b>EC could support this provision</b>

#### **CAROTENOIDS ((INS 160AI, 160AII, 160E, 160F)**

<b>Recommendation 1 – Carotenoids, INS 160ai, 160aii, 160e, 160f</b> The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>discontinue</b> further work on the following food additive provisions for carotenoids in the GSFA.
--

#### **EC agrees with recommendation 1**

<b>Recommendation 2 - Carotenoids, INS 160ai, 160aii, 160e, 160f</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>adopt</b> the following food additive provisions for carotenoids in the GSFA.					
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max</b>	<b>Level</b>	<b>Comments</b>	<b>EC comments</b>
01.1.2	dairy-based drinks, flavoured and/or fermented (e.g., chocolate milk, cocoa, eggnog, drinking yoghurt, whey-based	150	mg/kg	<b>Note 52<sup>114</sup></b>	

<sup>111</sup> **Note 4:** For decoration, stamping, marking or branding the product.

<sup>112</sup> **Note 16:** For use in glaze, coatings or decorations for fruit, vegetables, meat or fish.

<sup>113</sup> **Note 117:** Except for use in loganiza (fresh, uncured sausage) at 1000 mg/kg.

<b>Recommendation 2 - Carotenoids, INS 160ai, 160aii, 160e, 160f</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>adopt</b> the following food additive provisions for carotenoids in the GSFA.					
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>EC comments</b>
	drinks)				
01.3.2	beverage whiteners	<b>100</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note CC<sup>115</sup></b>	Discontinue Technological need is questioned
01.4	cream (plain) and the like	<b>20</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note CC</b>	Discontinue Technological need questioned
01.5.2	milk and cream powder analogues	<b>100</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note CC</b>	Discontinue Technological need is questioned
01.6.1	unripened cheese	<b>100</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note CC</b>	Discontinue Technological need is questioned in particular because rind is not expected to be formed in unripened cheese
01.6.2.1	ripened cheese, includes rind	100	mg/kg	<b>Note CC</b>	
01.6.2.2	rind of ripened cheese	<b>500</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note CC</b>	
01.6.2.3	cheese powder (for reconstitution; e.g., for cheese sauces)	<b>100</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note CC</b>	
01.6.4	processed cheese	<b>100</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note CC</b>	
01.6.5	cheese analogues	<b>200</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note CC</b>	
01.7	dairy-based desserts (e.g., pudding, fruit or flavoured yoghurt)	<b>50</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note CC</b>	
02.2.1.2	margarine and similar products	25	mg/kg	<b>Note CC</b>	
02.2.1.3	blends of butter and margarine	<b>100</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note CC</b>	
02.2.2	emulsions containing less than 80% fat	<b>25</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note CC</b>	
02.3	fat emulsions mainly of type oil-in-water, including mixed and/or flavoured products based on fat emulsions	<b>200</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note CC</b>	
02.4	fat-based desserts excluding dairy-based dessert products of food category 01.7	150	mg/kg	<b>Note CC</b>	
03.0	edible ices, including sherbet and sorbet	200	mg/kg	<b>Note CC</b>	
04.1.2.3	fruit in vinegar, oil, or brine	1000	mg/kg		
04.1.2.5	jams, jellies and marmelades	<b>200</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		
04.1.2.6	fruit-based spreads (e.g., chutney) excluding products of food category 04.1.2.5	500	mg/kg		
04.1.2.7	candied fruit	200	mg/kg		
04.1.2.8	fruit preparations, including pulp, purees, fruit toppings and coconut milk	<b>100</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note CC</b>	
04.1.2.9	fruit-based desserts, including fruit-flavoured water-based desserts	150	mg/kg		
04.1.2.11	fruit fillings for pastries	<b>100</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note CC</b>	
04.2.1.2	surface-treated fresh vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds	500	mg/kg	<b>Note 4<sup>116</sup>, &amp;16117</b>	
04.2.2.3	vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and	<b>50</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note CC</b>	

<sup>114</sup> **Note 52:** Excluding chocolate milk

<sup>115</sup> **Note CC:** Expressed as beta-carotene.

<sup>116</sup> **Note 4:** For decoration, stamping, marking or branding the product.

<sup>117</sup> **Note 16:** For use in glaze, coatings or decorations for fruit, vegetables, meat or fish.

<b>Recommendation 2 - Carotenoids, INS 160ai, 160aii, 160e, 160f</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>adopt</b> the following food additive provisions for carotenoids in the GSFA.					
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>EC comments</b>
	seaweeds in vinegar, oil, brine, or soy sauce				
05.1.2	cocoa mixes (syrops)	<b>100</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note CC</b>	Technological need questioned. The use could mislead the consumer
05.1.3	cocoa-based spreads, including fillings	<b>100</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note CC</b>	Technological need questioned. The use could mislead the consumer
05.1.4	cocoa and chocolate products	<b>100</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note CC</b>	Technological need questioned. The use could mislead the consumer
05.1.5	imitation chocolate, chocolate substitute products	<b>100</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note CC</b>	
05.2	confectionery including hard and soft candy, nougat, etc. other than food categories 05.1, 05.3 and 05.4	<b>100</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note CC</b>	
05.3	chewing gum	<b>100</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note CC</b>	
05.4	decorations (e.g., for fine bakery wares), toppings (non-fruit) and sweet sauces	<b>100</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note CC</b>	
06.3	breakfast cereals, including rolled oats	200	mg/kg		
06.4.3	pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products	1200	mg/kg	<b>Note CC</b>	EC does not agree with the use of colours in pre-cooked pastas. However, could agree with the use <u>in instant noodles only</u> , if this is in accordance with CODEX STAN 249-2006
06.5	cereal and starch based desserts (e.g., rice pudding, tapioca pudding)	150	mg/kg	<b>Note CC</b>	
06.6	batters (e.g., for breading or batters for fish or poultry)	500	mg/kg		
07.2	fine bakery wares (sweet, salty, savoury) and mixes	<b>100</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note CC</b>	
08.3.1.1	cured (including salted) non-heat treated processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	100	mg/kg	<del>Note 118</del> <sup>118</sup>	Glazes and coatings only.
08.3.1.2	cured (including salted) and dried non-heat treated processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	20	mg/kg		Glazes and coatings only.
08.3.1.3	fermented non-heat treated processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	20	mg/kg		Glazes and coatings only.
08.3.2	heat-treated processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	20	mg/kg		Glazes and coatings only.
09.1.1	Fresh fish	300	mg/kg	<b>Notes 50</b> <sup>119</sup>	
09.2	processed fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	<b>100</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note 95</b> <sup>120</sup> & <b>CC</b>	
09.3	semi-preserved fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	<b>100</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note 95, &amp; CC</b>	
09.4	fully preserved, including	<b>100</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note 95, &amp; CC</b>	

<sup>118</sup> **Note 118:** Except for use in tocino (fresh, cured sausage) at 1000 mg/kg.

<sup>119</sup> **Note 50:** For use in fish roe only

<sup>120</sup> **Note 95:** For use in surimi and fish roe products only.



<b>Recommendation 2 - Carotenoids, INS 160ai, 160aii, 160e, 160f</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>adopt</b> the following food additive provisions for carotenoids in the GSFA.					
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>EC comments</b>
	canned or fermented fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms				
10.1	fresh eggs	1000	mg/kg	Note 4 <sup>121</sup>	
10.2	egg products	1000	mg/kg		Discontinue Technological need questioned
10.4	egg-based desserts (e.g., custard)	150	mg/kg		
12.2.2	seasonings and condiments	500	mg/kg		
12.4	mustards	300	mg/kg		
12.5	soups and broths	300	mg/kg		
12.6	sauces and like products	500	mg/kg		
12.7	salads (e.g., macaroni salad, potato salad) and sandwich spreads excluding cocoa- and nut-based spreads of food categories 04.2.2.5 and 05.1.3	<b>50</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note CC</b>	
12.9.5	other protein products	100	mg/kg		
13.3	dietetic foods intended for special medical purposes (excluding products of food category 13.1)	50	mg/kg	<b>Note CC</b>	
13.4	dietetic formulae for slimming purposes and weight reduction	50	mg/kg	<b>Note CC</b>	
13.5	dietetic foods (e.g., supplementary foods for dietary use) excluding products of food categories 13.1 - 13.4 and 13.6	300	mg/kg	<b>Note CC</b>	
13.6	food supplements	300	mg/kg	<b>Note CC</b>	
14.1.3.2	vegetable nectar	100	mg/kg	<b>Note CC</b>	Doesn't support the use could mislead the consumer
14.1.3.4	concentrates for vegetable nectar	100	mg/kg	<b>Note CC &amp; 127<sup>122</sup></b>	Doesn't support the use could mislead the consumer
14.1.4	water-based flavoured drinks, including "sport," "energy," or "electrolyte" drinks and particulated drinks	100	mg/kg		
14.2.2	cider and perry	200	mg/kg	<b>Note CC</b>	
14.2.4	wines (other than grape)	200	mg/kg		
14.2.6	distilled spirituous beverages containing more than 15% alcohol	200	mg/kg		
14.2.7	aromatized alcoholic beverages (e.g., beer, wine and spirituous cooler-type beverages, low alcoholic refreshers)	200	mg/kg		
15.1	snacks - potato, cereal, flour or starch based (from roots and tubers, pulses and legumes)	100	mg/kg	<b>Note CC</b>	
15.2	processed nuts, including covered nuts and nut mixtures (with e.g., dried fruit)	100	mg/kg	<b>Note CC</b>	

**Recommendation 3 - Carotenoids, INS 160ai, 160aii, 160e, 160f**  
**Comments are requested** on the following food additive provisions for carotenoids in the GSFA.

<sup>121</sup> **Note 4:** For decoration, stamping, marking or branding the product.

<sup>122</sup> **Note 127:** As served to the consumer

Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max Level		Comments	EC comments
01.4.4	<b>Cream analogues</b>	<b>20</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		Technological need questioned
02.1.2	vegetable oils and fats	1000	mg/kg		Technological need questioned. The use could mislead the consumer
02.1.3	lard, tallow, fish oil, and other animal fats	1000	mg/kg		Technological need questioned. The use could mislead the consumer
04.1.2.4	canned or bottled (pasteurized) fruit	200	mg/kg		Technological need questioned. The use could mislead the consumer Only for red fruits preserves
04.2.2.2	dried vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds	1000	mg/kg		Technological need questioned this use could mislead the consumer only dried potato granules and flakes
04.2.2.4	canned or bottled (pasteurized) or retort pouch vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds	<b>50</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note CC</b>	Technological need questioned this use could mislead the consumer Most Codex standards on canned vegetables contain no use of colours only processed mushy and garden peas
04.2.2.5	vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed purees and spreads (e.g., peanut butter)	<b>50</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note CC</b>	Technological need questioned this use could mislead the consumer
04.2.2.6	vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed pulps and preparations (e.g., vegetable desserts and sauces, candied vegetables) other than food category 04.2.2.5	<b>50</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note CC</b>	
04.2.2.7	fermented vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweed products, excluding fermented soybean products of food category 12.10	<b>50</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note CC</b>	
07.1.1	bread and rolls	35	mg/kg		Doesn't support. Technological need questioned These products are broadly consumed
07.1.2	crackers, excluding sweet crackers	1000	mg/kg		Doesn't support. Technological need questioned These products are broadly consumed
07.1.3	other ordinary bakery products (e.g., bagels, pita, English muffins)	1000	mg/kg		Doesn't support. Technological need questioned These products are broadly consumed
07.1.4	bread-type products, including bread stuffing and bread crumbs	1000	mg/kg	Note 116 <sup>123</sup>	Doesn't support. Technological need questioned These products are broadly consumed
07.1.5	steamed breads and buns	1000	mg/kg		Doesn't support. Technological need questioned These products are broadly consumed

<sup>123</sup> **Note 116:** For use in doughs only.

<b>Recommendation 3 - Carotenoids, INS 160ai, 160aii, 160e, 160f</b>					
<b>Comments are requested</b> on the following food additive provisions for carotenoids in the GSFA.					
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max Level</b>		<b>Comments</b>	<b>EC comments</b>
07.1.6	mixes for breads and ordinary bakery wares		GMP		Doesn't support. Technological need questioned These products are broadly consumed
08.1.2	fresh meat, poultry, and game, comminuted	100	mg/kg	Note 117 <sup>124</sup> & 4 <sup>125</sup> , 16 <sup>126</sup>	
08.4	<b>Edible casings (e.g., sausage casings)</b>	<b>100</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note CC</b>	
09.1.2	<b>Fresh mollusks, crustaceans and echinoderms</b>	<b>100</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note 4, 16 &amp; CC</b>	Doesn't support. Technological need questioned such use could mislead consumer
11.3	<b>Sugar solutions and syrups, also (partially) inverted, including treacle and molasses, excluding products of food category 11.1.3</b>	<b>50</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		Doesn't support. Technological need questioned
11.4	<b>Other sugars and syrups (e.g., xylose, maple syrup, sugar toppings)</b>	<b>50</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		Doesn't support. Technological need questioned
11.6	<b>table-top sweeteners, including those containing high-intensity sweeteners</b>	<b>300,</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		Doesn't support. The use could mislead the consumer.
14.2.1	<b>Beer and malt beverages</b>	<b>200</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		
16.0	composite foods - foods that could not be placed in categories 01 - 15	500	mg/kg		Justification should be provided why the carry over wouldn't be sufficient. In addition all foodstuffs should be clearly defined

### CHLOROPHYLL, COPPER COMPLEXES (INS 141i & 141ii)

29. The 28<sup>th</sup> CAC has adopted several provisions in the GSFA for the use of chlorophylls, copper complexes.

30. The 13<sup>th</sup> JECFA (1969) assigned an ADI of 15 mg/kg bw/d for chlorophylls, copper complexes (141i & 141ii).

<b>Recommendation 1 – Chlorophyll, Copper Complexes, INS 141i, 141ii</b>
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>discontinue</b> further work on the following food additive provisions for copper complexes of chlorophyll in the GSFA.

### The European Community agrees with Recommendation 1.

<b>Recommendation 2 - Chlorophyll, Copper Complexes, INS 141i, 141ii</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>adopt</b> the following food additive provisions for copper complexes of chlorophyll in the GSFA.					
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max</b>	<b>Level</b>	<b>Comments</b>	<b>EC COMMENTS</b>
01.1.2	dairy-based drinks, flavoured and/or fermented (e.g., chocolate milk, cocoa, eggnog, drinking yoghurt, whey-based drinks)	50	mg/kg	Note 52 <sup>127</sup>	
01.6.1	unripened cheese	50	mg/kg		Technological need is questioned in particular

<sup>124</sup> **Note 117:** Except for use in loganiza (fresh, uncured sausage) at 1000 mg/kg.

<sup>125</sup> **Note 4:** For decoration, stamping, marking or branding the product.

<sup>126</sup> **Note 16:** For use in glaze, coatings or decorations for fruit, vegetables, meat or fish.

<sup>127</sup> **Note 52:** Excluding chocolate milk

<b>Recommendation 2 - Chlorophyll, Copper Complexes, INS 141i, 141ii</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>adopt</b> the following food additive provisions for copper complexes of chlorophyll in the GSFA.					
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max</b>	<b>Level</b>	<b>Comments</b>	<b>EC COMMENTS</b>
					because rind is not expected to be formed in unripened cheese. The proposed level is higher than in STAN 221 (15 mg/kg)
01.6.2.1	ripened cheese, includes rind	15	mg/kg		EC supports the use of this colour only in Sage Derby Cheese and rind.
01.6.2.2	rind of ripened cheese	75	mg/kg		
01.6.2.3	cheese powder (for reconstitution; e.g., for cheese sauces)	50	mg/kg		
<b>01.6.4.2</b>	<b>Flavoured processed cheese, including containing fruit, vegetables, meat, etc.</b>	<b>50</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		EC supports this provision.
01.6.5	cheese analogues	50	mg/kg		
01.7	dairy-based desserts (e.g., pudding, fruit or flavoured yoghurt)	200	mg/kg		
02.4	fat-based desserts excluding dairy-based dessert products of food category 01.7	500	mg/kg		EC supports this provision.
03.0	edible ices, including sherbet and sorbet	500	mg/kg		EC supports this provision.
04.1.2.5	jams, jellies and marmelades	200	mg/kg		EC supports this provision.
04.1.2.6	fruit-based spreads (e.g., chutney) excluding products of food category 04.1.2.5	150	mg/kg		EC supports this provision.
04.1.2.7	candied fruit	250	mg/kg		EC supports this provision.
04.1.2.9	fruit-based desserts, including fruit-flavoured water-based desserts	150	mg/kg	Note 62 <sup>128</sup>	EC supports this provision.
05.2.1	hard candy	700	mg/kg		EC supports this provision.
05.2.2	soft candy	100	mg/kg		EC supports this provision.
05.2.3	nougats and marzipans	100	mg/kg		EC supports this provision.
05.3	chewing gum	700	mg/kg		EC supports this provision.
05.4	decorations (e.g., for fine bakery wares), toppings (non-fruit) and sweet sauces	100	mg/kg		EC supports this provision.
06.4.3	pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products	100	mg/kg		EC does not agree with the use of colours in pre-cooked pastas. However, could agree with the use <u>in instant noodles only</u> , if this is in accordance with CODEX STAN 249-2006
06.5	cereal and starch based desserts (e.g., rice pudding, tapioca pudding)	75	mg/kg		EC supports this provision.
07.2	fine bakery wares (sweet, salty, savoury) and mixes	75	mg/kg		EC supports this provision.

<sup>128</sup> **Note 62:** As copper.

<b>Recommendation 2 - Chlorophyll, Copper Complexes, INS 141i, 141ii</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>adopt</b> the following food additive provisions for copper complexes of chlorophyll in the GSFA.					
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max</b>	<b>Level</b>	<b>Comments</b>	<b>EC COMMENTS</b>
09.2.3	frozen minced and creamed fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	40	mg/kg	<b>Note 95</b> <sup>129</sup>	EC supports this provision.
09.2.4 .1	cooked fish and fish products	30	mg/kg	<b>Note 62 &amp; 95</b>	EC supports this provision.
09.2.4 .3	fried fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	40	mg/kg	<b>Note 62 &amp; 95</b>	EC supports this provision.
09.2.5	smoked, dried, fermented, and/or salted fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	200	mg/kg		
09.3.1	fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms, marinated and/or in jelly	40	mg/kg	<b>Note 16</b>	EC supports this provision.
09.3.2	fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms, pickled and/or in brine	40	mg/kg	<b>Note 16</b>	EC supports this provision.
09.3.3	salmon substitutes, caviar, and other fish roe products	200	mg/kg		EC supports this provision.
09.3.4	semi-preserved fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms (e.g., fish paste), excluding products of food categories 09.3.1 - 09.3.3	75	mg/kg	<b>Note 95</b>	EC supports this provision.
09.4	fully preserved, including canned or fermented fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	500	mg/kg	<b>Note 95</b>	EC supports this provision.
10.4	egg-based desserts (e.g., custard)	300	mg/kg	<b>Note 2</b> <sup>130</sup>	EC supports this provision.
12.2.2	seasonings and condiments	<b>500</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		EC supports this provision.
12.4	mustards	<b>500</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		EC supports this provision.
<b>12.5</b>	<b>soups and broths</b>	<b>400</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note 127</b> <sup>131</sup>	EC supports this provision.

<sup>129</sup> **Note 95:** For use in surimi and fish roe products only.

<sup>130</sup> **Note 2:** On dry ingredient, dry weight, dry mix or concentrate basis.

<b>Recommendation 2 - Chlorophyll, Copper Complexes, INS 141i, 141ii</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>adopt</b> the following food additive provisions for copper complexes of chlorophyll in the GSFA.					
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max</b>	<b>Level</b>	<b>Comments</b>	<b>EC COMMENTS</b>
12.6	sauces and like products	100	mg/kg		EC supports this provision.
13.6	food supplements	<b>500</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note 3<sup>132</sup></b>	EC supports this provision.
14.1.4	water-based flavoured drinks, including "sport," "energy," or "electrolyte" drinks and particulated drinks	300	mg/kg		EC supports this provision.
15.1	snacks - potato, cereal, flour or starch based (from roots and tubers, pulses and legumes)	350	mg/kg		EC supports this provision.
15.2	processed nuts, including covered nuts and nut mixtures (with e.g., dried fruit)	100	mg/kg		EC supports this provision.

<b>Recommendation 3 - Chlorophyll, Copper Complexes, INS 141i, 141ii</b>					
<b>Comments are requested</b> on the following food additive provisions for copper complexes of chlorophyll in the GSFA.					
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max</b>	<b>Level</b>	<b>Comments</b>	<b>EC comments</b>
<b>04.2.1.2</b>	<b>Surface-treated fresh vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds</b>		<b>GMP</b>	<b>Notes 4<sup>133</sup> &amp; 16<sup>134</sup></b>	
05.1.2	cocoa mixes (syrops)	6.4	mg/kg	Note 62	Doesn't support. The use could mislead the consumer.
05.1.3	cocoa-based spreads, including fillings	6.4	mg/kg	Note 62	Doesn't support. The use could mislead the consumer
05.1.4	cocoa and chocolate products	700	mg/kg		Doesn't support. The use could mislead the consumer
05.1.5	imitation chocolate, chocolate substitute products	700	mg/kg		6
07.1.4	bread-type products, including bread stuffing and bread crumbs	6.4	mg/kg	Note 62	This is a basic food and the use will increase the intake of the colour. Moreover, this use could mislead the consumer ----
<b>14.1.5</b>	<b>Coffee, coffee substitutes, tea, herbal infusions, and other hot cereal and grain beverages, excluding cocoa</b>				<b>Disagree.</b>
<b>15.3</b>	<b>Snacks –fish based</b>	<b>350</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		

<sup>131</sup> **Note 127** As served to the consumer.

<sup>132</sup> **Note 3:** Surface treatment

<sup>133</sup> **Note 4:** For decoration, stamping, marking or branding the product.

<sup>134</sup> **Note 16:** For use in glaze, coatings or decorations for fruit, vegetables, meat or fish.

**EC supports Recommendation 3 for request of information.****ERYTHROSINE (INS 127)**

**Due to the very low ADI, in the EC the permitted uses of erythrosine are restricted to cocktail cherries and candied cherries at 200 mg/kg and Bigarreaux cherries in syrup and in cocktails at 150 mg/kg. Therefore the EC supports discontinuation of the work on all specific provisions**

**FAST GREEN FCF (INS 143)**

31. The 30th JECFA (1986) assigned an ADI of 25 mg/kg bw/d for fast green FCF.

**Recommendation 1 – Fast Green FCF, INS 143**  
The eWG recommends that the 39<sup>th</sup> CCFA **discontinue** further work on the following food additive provisions for fast green FCF in the GSFA.

**The European Community agrees with Recommendation 1. However, EC opposes the use of Fast Green in the wider category 07.0, which covers highly consumed staple foods, but could support the use in category 7.2 fine bakery wares only**

<b>Recommendation 2 – Fast Green FCF, INS 143</b>						
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>revoke</b> the following food additive provisions for fast green FCF in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max	Level	Comments	EC comments	Justification provided to eWG
07.1.1	bread and rolls	100	mg/kg			Consequential effect if recommendation 3 for category 07.0 is endorsed.
07.2	fine bakery wares (sweet, salty, savoury) and mixes	100	mg/kg			

**EC opposes the use of Fast Green in the wider category 07.0, which covers highly consumed staple foods, but could support the use in category 7.2 fine bakery wares only**

<b>Recommendation 3 - Fast Green FCF, INS 143</b>						
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>adopt</b> the following food additive provisions for fast green FCF in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max	Level	Comments	EC comments	
02.4	fat-based desserts excluding dairy-based dessert products of food category 01.7	100	mg/kg		EC agree	
04.1.2.6	fruit-based spreads (e.g., chutney) excluding products of food category 04.1.2.5	100	mg/kg		EC agree	
04.1.2.7	candied fruit	100	mg/kg		EC agree	
04.1.2.8	fruit preparations, including pulp, purees, fruit toppings and coconut milk	100	mg/kg		EC agree	
04.1.2.9	fruit-based desserts, including fruit-flavoured water-based desserts	100	mg/kg		EC agree	
04.1.2.11	fruit fillings for pastries	100	mg/kg		EC agree	
04.2.2.7	fermented vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweed products, excluding fermented soybean products of food category 12.10	100	mg/kg			
05.2	confectionery including hard and soft candy, nougat, etc. other than food categories 05.1, 05.3 and 05.4	100	mg/kg		EC agree	
05.4	decorations (e.g., for fine bakery wares), toppings (non-fruit) and sweet sauces	100	mg/kg		EC agrees	
06.4.2	dried pastas and noodles and like products	100	mg/kg		<b>EC opposes the use in this staple food with high consumption.</b>	
06.4.3	pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products	300	mg/kg		EC does not agree with the use of colours in pre-cooked pastas. However, could agree with the use in instant noodles	

<b>Recommendation 3 - Fast Green FCF, INS 143</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>adopt</b> the following food additive provisions for fast green FCF in the GSFA.					
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max	Level	Comments	EC comments
					<a href="#">only</a> , if this is in accordance with CODEX STAN 249-2006
06.5	cereal and starch based desserts (e.g., rice pudding, tapioca pudding)	100	mg/kg		EC agrees
07.0	bakery wares	100	mg/kg		EC opposes in wider category could support in category 7.2 fine bakery wares only
08.1	fresh meat, poultry, and game	100	mg/kg	Notes 3 <sup>135</sup> , 4 <sup>136</sup> , & 16 <sup>137</sup>	Glazes and coatings only
08.2	processed meat, poultry, and game products in whole pieces or cuts	100	mg/kg	Notes 3 & 4	Glazes and coatings only
08.4	edible casings (e.g., sausage casings)	100	mg/kg	Notes 3 & 4	EC agrees
09.4	fully preserved, including canned or fermented fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	100	mg/kg	<b>Note 95</b> <sup>138</sup>	EC agrees
10.4	egg-based desserts (e.g., custard)	100	mg/kg		EC agrees
12.2.2	seasonings and condiments	100	mg/kg		EC agrees
12.6.1	emulsified sauces (e.g., mayonnaise, salad dressing)	100	mg/kg		EC agrees
13.6	food supplements	<b>600</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		EC agrees

### GRAPE SKIN EXTRACT (INS 163II)

32. The 26th JECFA (1982) assigned an ADI of 2.5 mg/kg bw/d for grape skin extract.

<b>Recommendation 1 – Grape Skin Extracts, INS 163ii</b>	
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>discontinue</b> further work on the following food additive provisions for grape skin extracts in the GSFA.	

#### [EC agrees with recommendation 1](#)

<b>Recommendation 2 - Grape Skin Extracts, INS 163ii</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>adopt</b> the following food additive provisions for grape skin extracts in the GSFA.					
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max	Level	Comments	EC Comments
01.1.2	dairy-based drinks, flavoured and/or fermented (e.g., chocolate milk, cocoa, eggnog, drinking yoghurt, whey-based drinks)	<b>150</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note 52</b> <sup>139</sup> , & <b>DD</b> <sup>140</sup>	
01.6.2.2	rind of ripened cheese	1000	mg/kg		
01.6.4.2	flavoured processed cheese, including containing fruit, vegetables, meat, etc.	1000	mg/kg		
01.6.5	cheese analogues	1000	mg/kg		
01.7	dairy-based desserts (e.g., pudding, fruit or flavoured yoghurt)	<b>200</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note DD</b>	
02.4	fat-based desserts excluding	<b>200</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note DD</b>	

<sup>135</sup> **Note 3:** Surface treatment.

<sup>136</sup> **Note 4:** For decoration, stamping, marking or branding the product.

<sup>137</sup> **Note 16:** For use in glaze, coatings or decorations for fruit, vegetables, meat or fish.

<sup>138</sup> **Note 95** For use in surimi and fish roe products only.

<sup>139</sup> **Note 52:** Excluding chocolate milk

<sup>140</sup> **Note DD:** Expressed as anthocyanin.



<b>Recommendation 2 - Grape Skin Extracts, INS 163ii</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>adopt</b> the following food additive provisions for grape skin extracts in the GSFA.					
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max</b>	<b>Level</b>	<b>Comments</b>	<b>EC Comments</b>
	dairy-based dessert products of food category 01.7				
03.0	edible ices, including sherbet and sorbet	<b>100</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note DD</b>	
04.1.1.2	surface-treated fresh fruit		GMP	Notes 4 <sup>141</sup> & 16 <sup>142</sup>	
04.1.2.3	fruit in vinegar, oil, or brine	1500	mg/kg		
04.1.2.5	jams, jellies and marmelades	<b>500</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note DD</b>	
04.1.2.6	fruit-based spreads (e.g., chutney) excluding products of food category 04.1.2.5	500	mg/kg	<b>Note DD</b>	
04.1.2.7	candied fruit	1500	mg/kg		
04.1.2.8	fruit preparations, including pulp, purees, fruit toppings and coconut milk	<b>500</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note DD</b>	
04.1.2.9	fruit-based desserts, including fruit-flavoured water-based desserts	<b>500</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note DD</b>	
04.1.2.10	fermented fruit products	<b>500</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note DD</b>	
04.1.2.11	fruit fillings for pastries	<b>500</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note DD</b>	
04.2.2.3	vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and seaweeds in vinegar, oil, brine, or soy sauce	<b>100</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note DD</b>	
04.2.2.5	vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed purees and spreads (e.g., peanut butter)	<b>100</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note DD</b>	
04.2.2.6	vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed pulps and preparations (e.g., vegetable desserts and sauces, candied vegetables) other than food category 04.2.2.5	<b>100</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note DD</b>	
04.2.2.7	fermented vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweed products, excluding fermented soybean products of food category 12.10	<b>100</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note DD</b>	
05.1.5	imitation chocolate, chocolate substitute products	<b>200</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note DD</b>	
05.2	confectionery including hard and soft candy, nougat, etc. other than food categories 05.1, 05.3 and 05.4	<b>500</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note DD</b>	
05.3	chewing gum	500	mg/kg	<b>Note DD</b>	
05.4	decorations (e.g., for fine	<b>500</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note DD</b>	

<sup>141</sup> **Note 4:** For decoration, stamping, marking or branding the product.

<sup>142</sup> **Note 16:** For use in glaze, coatings or decorations for fruit, vegetables, meat or fish.

<b>Recommendation 2 - Grape Skin Extracts, INS 163ii</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>adopt</b> the following food additive provisions for grape skin extracts in the GSFA.					
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max</b>	<b>Level</b>	<b>Comments</b>	<b>EC Comments</b>
	bakery wares), toppings (non-fruit) and sweet sauces				
06.5	cereal and starch based desserts (e.g., rice pudding, tapioca pudding)	<b>200</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note DD</b>	
08.2	processed meat, poultry, and game products in whole pieces or cuts	5000	mg/kg		Add note 16
08.3.1.1	cured (including salted) non-heat treated processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	5000	mg/kg		Glazes and coatings only.
08.4	edible casings (e.g., sausage casings)	5000	mg/kg		
09.2.2	frozen battered fish, fish fillets, and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	500	mg/kg	<b>Note 16</b>	Use in frozen battered fish and fish fillets may mislead the consumer
09.2.3	frozen minced and creamed fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms		GMP	Note 16 & <b>95</b> <sup>143</sup>	
09.2.4.1	cooked fish and fish products	500	mg/kg	<b>Note 95</b>	
09.2.4.2	cooked mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	1000	mg/kg		
09.2.4.3	fried fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	1000	mg/kg	Note 16 & <b>95</b>	
09.2.5	smoked, dried, fermented, and/or salted fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	1000	mg/kg	Note 22 <sup>144</sup>	
09.3.1	fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms, marinated and/or in jelly	500	mg/kg	Note 16	
09.3.2	fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms, pickled and/or in brine	1500	mg/kg	Note 16	
09.3.3	salmon substitutes, caviar, and other fish roe products	1500	mg/kg		
09.3.4	semi-preserved fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms (e.g., fish paste), excluding products of food categories 09.3.1 - 09.3.3	1500	mg/kg	Note 16	
09.4	fully preserved, including canned or fermented fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	1500	mg/kg	<b>Note 16</b>	
10.4	egg-based desserts (e.g.,	<b>200</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note DD</b>	

<sup>143</sup> **Note 95** For use in surimi and fish roe products only.

<sup>144</sup> **Note 22:** For use in smoked fish products only.

<b>Recommendation 2 - Grape Skin Extracts, INS 163ii</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <u>adopt</u> the following food additive provisions for grape skin extracts in the GSFA.					
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max</b>	<b>Level</b>	<b>Comments</b>	<b>EC Comments</b>
	custard)				
<b>12.2.2</b>	<b>Seasonings and condiments</b>	<b>1500</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		
12.4	mustards	<b>200</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note DD</b>	
12.5	soups and broths	<b>500</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note DD</b>	
12.6.1	emulsified sauces (e.g., mayonnaise, salad dressing)	<b>300</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note DD</b>	
12.6.2	non-emulsified sauces (e.g., ketchup, cheese sauce, cream sauce, brown gravy)	<b>300</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note DD</b>	
12.6.3	mixes for sauces and gravies	<b>300</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note DD</b>	
12.7	salads (e.g., macaroni salad, potato salad) and sandwich spreads excluding cocoa- and nut-based spreads of food categories 04.2.2.5 and 05.1.3	1500	mg/kg		
12.9.5	other protein products	500	mg/kg		
13.3	dietetic foods intended for special medical purposes (excluding products of food category 13.1)	<b>250</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note DD</b>	
13.4	dietetic formulae for slimming purposes and weight reduction	<b>250</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note DD</b>	
13.5	dietetic foods (e.g., supplementary foods for dietary use) excluding products of food categories 13.1 - 13.4 and 13.6	<b>250</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note DD</b>	
13.6	food supplements	<b>250</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note DD</b>	
14.1.4	water-based flavoured drinks, including "sport," "energy," or "electrolyte" drinks and particulated drinks	<b>300</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note DD</b>	
14.2.1	beer and malt beverages	<b>300</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note DD</b>	Justification of technological need is requested. Use could mislead consumers
14.2.2	cider and perry	<b>300</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note DD</b>	
14.2.4	wines (other than grape)	<b>300</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note DD</b>	
14.2.6	distilled spirituous beverages containing more than 15% alcohol	<b>300</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note DD</b>	Justification of technological need is requested. Use could mislead consumers
14.2.7	aromatized alcoholic beverages (e.g., beer, wine and spirituous cooler-type beverages, low alcoholic refreshers)	<b>300</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note DD</b>	
15.1	snacks - potato, cereal, flour or starch based (from roots and tubers, pulses and legumes)	<b>500</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note DD</b>	
15.2	processed nuts, including covered nuts and nut mixtures (with e.g., dried fruit)	<b>300</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note DD</b>	

**INDIGOTINE (INS 132)**

33. The 18th JECFA (1974) assigned an ADI of 5 mg/kg bw/d for indigotine.

**Recommendation 1 – Indigotine, INS 132**

The eWG recommends that the 39<sup>th</sup> CCFA **discontinue** further work on the following food additive provisions for indigotine in the GSFA.

**EC agrees with recommendation 1****Recommendation 2 - Indigotine, INS 132**

The eWG recommends that the 39<sup>th</sup> CCFA **adopt** the following food additive provisions for indigotine in the GSFA.

Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max	Level	Comments	EC comments
01.1.2	dairy-based drinks, flavoured and/or fermented (e.g., chocolate milk, cocoa, eggnog, drinking yoghurt, whey-based drinks)	300	mg/kg	Note 52 <sup>145</sup>	Suggested 100 mg. Level is sufficient
01.6.2.2	rind of ripened cheese	100	mg/kg		
01.6.5	cheese analogues	200	mg/kg	Note 3	100 mg/kg sufficient
01.7	dairy-based desserts (e.g., pudding, fruit or flavoured yoghurt)	150	mg/kg		
02.1.3	lard, tallow, fish oil, and other animal fats	300	mg/kg		Discontinue Technological need questioned. Use could mislead the consumer
02.3	fat emulsions mainly of type oil-in-water, including mixed and/or flavoured products based on fat emulsions	300	mg/kg		Doesn't support
02.4	fat-based desserts excluding dairy-based dessert products of food category 01.7	150	mg/kg		
03.0	edible ices, including sherbet and sorbet	150	mg/kg		
04.1.2.5	jams, jellies and marmelades	300	mg/kg		Does not support
04.1.2.6	fruit-based spreads (e.g., chutney) excluding products of food category 04.1.2.5	300	mg/kg		
04.1.2.7	candied fruit	200	mg/kg		
04.1.2.8	fruit preparations, including pulp, purees, fruit toppings and coconut milk	150	mg/kg		
04.1.2.9	fruit-based desserts, including fruit-flavoured water-based desserts	150	mg/kg		
04.1.2.11	fruit fillings for pastries	150	mg/kg		
04.2.2.3	vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and seaweeds in vinegar, oil, brine, or soy sauce	150	mg/kg		Does not support
04.2.2.6	vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed pulps and preparations (e.g., vegetable desserts and sauces, candied vegetables) other than food category 04.2.2.5	200	mg/kg	Note 92 <sup>146</sup>	
04.2.2.7	fermented vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and	300	mg/kg		

<sup>145</sup> Note 52: Excluding chocolate milk

<sup>146</sup> Note 92: Excluding tomato-based products

<b>Recommendation 2 - Indigotine, INS 132</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>adopt</b> the following food additive provisions for indigotine in the GSFA.					
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max</b>	<b>Level</b>	<b>Comments</b>	<b>EC comments</b>
	seaweed products, excluding fermented soybean products of food category 12.10				
05.1.5	imitation chocolate, chocolate substitute products	<b>300</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		
05.2	confectionery including hard and soft candy, nougat, etc. other than food categories 05.1, 05.3 and 05.4	<b>300</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		
05.3	chewing gum	300	mg/kg		
05.4	decorations (e.g., for fine bakery wares), toppings (non-fruit) and sweet sauces	<b>300</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		
06.5	cereal and starch based desserts (e.g., rice pudding, tapioca pudding)	<b>150</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		
<b>07.2</b>	<b>Fine bakery wares (sweet, salty, savoury) and mixes</b>	<b>200</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		
09.1.1	fresh fish	300	mg/kg	Note 50 <sup>147</sup> & 16 <sup>148</sup>	
09.2.1	frozen fish, fish fillets, and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	<b>300</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Note 95 <sup>149</sup>	
09.2.4.1	cooked fish and fish products	<b>300</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note 95</b>	
09.2.4.2	cooked mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	250	mg/kg	<b>Note 16</b>	
09.2.5	smoked, dried, fermented, and/or salted fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	<b>300</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Note 22 <sup>150</sup>	
09.3.3	salmon substitutes, caviar, and other fish roe products	<b>300</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		
09.3.4	semi-preserved fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms (e.g., fish paste), excluding products of food categories 09.3.1 - 09.3.3	<b>300</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		For fish roe and surimi only Suggested 100 mg
09.4	fully preserved, including canned or fermented fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	<b>300</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		For fish roe and surimi only
10.1	fresh eggs	300	mg/kg	Note 4 <sup>151</sup>	
10.4	egg-based desserts (e.g., custard)	300	mg/kg		Support at 150 mg/kg. Level sufficient for the technological need.
12.2.2	seasonings and condiments	<b>300</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		
12.4	mustards	300	mg/kg		
12.5	soups and broths	<b>50</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		
12.6	sauces and like products	<b>300</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		
12.9.5	other protein products	100	mg/kg		
13.3	dietetic foods intended for special medical purposes (excluding products of food category 13.1)	50	mg/kg		
13.4	dietetic formulae for slimming	50	mg/kg		

<sup>147</sup> **Note 50:** For use in fish roe only.

<sup>148</sup> **Note 16** For use in glaze, coatings or decorations for fruit, vegetables, meat or fish.

<sup>149</sup> **Note 95:** For use in surimi and fish roe products only.

<sup>150</sup> **Note 22:** For use in smoked fish products only.

<sup>151</sup> **Note 4:** For decoration, stamping, marking or branding the product.

<b>Recommendation 2 - Indigotine, INS 132</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>adopt</b> the following food additive provisions for indigotine in the GSFA.					
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max	Level	Comments	EC comments
	purposes and weight reduction				
13.5	dietetic foods (e.g., supplementary foods for dietary use) excluding products of food categories 13.1-13.4 and 13.6	300	mg/kg		
13.6	food supplements	300	mg/kg		
14.1.4	water-based flavoured drinks, including "sport," "energy," or "electrolyte" drinks and particulated drinks	<b>100</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		
14.2.2	cider and perry	200	mg/kg		
14.2.4	wines (other than grape)	200	mg/kg		
14.2.6	distilled spirituous beverages containing more than 15% alcohol	300	mg/kg		
14.2.7	aromatized alcoholic beverages (e.g., beer, wine and spirituous cooler-type beverages, low alcoholic refreshers)	200	mg/kg		
15.1	snacks - potato, cereal, flour or starch based (from roots and tubers, pulses and legumes)	<b>200</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		
15.2	processed nuts, including covered nuts and nut mixtures (with e.g., dried fruit)	100	mg/kg		

<b>Recommendation 3 - Indigotine, INS 132</b>					
<b>Comments are requested</b> on the following food additive provisions for indigotine in the GSFA.					
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max	Level	Comments	EC comments
<b>01.6.4.2</b>	<b>Flavoured processed cheese, including containing fruit, vegetables, meat, etc.</b>	<b>100</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		<b>In line with EC</b>
11.3	sugar solutions and syrups, also (partially) inverted, including treacle and molasses, excluding products of food category 11.1.3	300	mg/kg		Doesn't support. Use could mislead the consumer.
11.4	other sugars and syrups (e.g., xylose, maple syrup, sugar toppings)	300	mg/kg		Doesn't support. Use could mislead the consumer.
11.6	table-top sweeteners, including those containing high-intensity sweeteners	300	mg/kg		Doesn't support. Use could mislead the consumer.
<b>14.1.5</b>	<b>Coffee, coffee substitutes, tea, herbal infusions, and other hot cereal and grain beverages, excluding cocoa</b>				Doesn't support. Use could mislead the consumer.

### IRON OXIDES (INS 172I, 172II, 172III)

<b>Recommendation 1 – Iron Oxides, INS 172i, 172ii, 172iii</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>discontinue</b> further work on the following food additive provisions for iron oxides in the GSFA.					

### [EC agrees with recommendation 1](#)

<b>Recommendation 2 - Iron Oxides, INS 172i, 172ii, 172iii</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>adopt</b> the following food additive provisions for iron oxides in the GSFA.					
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max	Level	Comments	EC comments

<b>Recommendation 2 - Iron Oxides, INS 172i, 172ii, 172iii</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>adopt</b> the following food additive provisions for iron oxides in the GSFA.					
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max</b>	<b>Level</b>	<b>Comments</b>	<b>EC comments</b>
01.6.1	unripened cheese		GMP		Need questioned rind is not expected to be formed in unripened cheese
04.2.2.6	vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed pulps and preparations (e.g., vegetable desserts and sauces, candied vegetables) other than food category 04.2.2.5	300	mg/kg	Note 92 <sup>152</sup>	Agree
05.3	chewing gum	10.000	mg/kg		
09.3.4	semi-preserved fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms (e.g., fish paste), excluding products of food categories 09.3.1 - 09.3.3	50	mg/kg		
09.4	fully preserved, including canned or fermented fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	50	mg/kg		
10.4	egg-based desserts (e.g., custard)		GMP		
12.4	mustards		GMP		
12.7	salads (e.g., macaroni salad, potato salad) and sandwich spreads excluding cocoa- and nut-based spreads of food categories 04.2.2.5 and 05.1.3		GMP		
12.9.5	other protein products		GMP		
13.3	dietetic foods intended for special medical purposes (excluding products of food category 13.1)		GMP		
13.4	dietetic formulae for slimming purposes and weight reduction		GMP		
13.5	dietetic foods (e.g., supplementary foods for dietary use) excluding products of food categories 13.1 - 13.4 and 13.6		GMP		
13.6	food supplements	7500	mg/kg	Note 3 <sup>153</sup>	
14.1.3.2	vegetable nectar	100	mg/kg		Justification of technological need is requested. Use could mislead consumers
14.1.3.4	concentrates for vegetable nectar	100	mg/kg	Note 127 <sup>154</sup>	Justification of technological need is requested. Use could mislead consumers

**PONCEAU 4R (INS 124)**

34. The 26th JECFA (1982) assigned an ADI of 4 mg/kg bw/d for ponceau 4R.

<b>Recommendation 1 – Ponceau 4R, INS 124</b>	
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>discontinue</b> further work on the following food additive provisions for ponceau 4R in the GSFA.	

<sup>152</sup> **Note 92:** Excluding tomato-based sauces

<sup>153</sup> **Note 3:** Surface treatment

<sup>154</sup> **Note 127:** As served to the consumer.

**The European Community agrees to discontinue work on the provisions under recommendation 1.**

<b>Recommendation 2 - Ponceau 4R, INS 124</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>adopt</b> the following food additive provisions for ponceau 4R in the GSFA.					
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max</b>	<b>Level</b>	<b>Comments</b>	<b>EC comments</b>
01.1.2	dairy-based drinks, flavoured and/or fermented (e.g., chocolate milk, cocoa, eggnog, drinking yoghurt, whey-based drinks)	150	mg/kg		EC support level of 50 mg/kg because of intake considerations*
01.6.2.2	rind of ripened cheese	100	mg/kg		EC agree
<b>01.6.4.2</b>	<b>Flavoured processed cheese, including containing fruit, vegetables, meat, etc.</b>	<b>100</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		<b>EC agree</b>
01.7	dairy-based desserts (e.g., pudding, fruit or flavoured yoghurt)	<b>50</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		EC agree
02.4	fat-based desserts excluding dairy-based dessert products of food category 01.7	<b>50</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		EC Agree
03.0	edible ices, including sherbet and sorbet	<b>50</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		EC agree
04.1.2.5	jams, jellies and marmelades	<b>100</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		EC agree
04.1.2.6	fruit-based spreads (e.g., chutney) excluding products of food category 04.1.2.5	500	mg/kg		
04.1.2.7	candied fruit	200	mg/kg		EC agree
04.1.2.8	fruit preparations, including pulp, purees, fruit toppings and coconut milk	<b>50</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		
04.1.2.9	fruit-based desserts, including fruit-flavoured water-based desserts	<b>50</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		EC agree
04.1.2.11	fruit fillings for pastries	<b>50</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		EC agrees
05.1.5	imitation chocolate, chocolate substitute products	<b>50</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		EC agree
05.2	confectionery including hard and soft candy, nougat, etc. other than food categories 05.1, 05.3 and 05.4	<b>50</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		EC agree
05.4	decorations (e.g., for fine bakery wares), toppings (non-fruit) and sweet sauces	<b>50</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		EC agree
06.5	cereal and starch based desserts (e.g., rice pudding, tapioca pudding)	<b>50</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		EC agree
08.4	edible casings (e.g., sausage casings)	500	mg/kg	Note 16 <sup>155</sup>	EC agree
09.2.2	frozen battered fish, fish fillets, and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	500	mg/kg	Note 16	Glazes and coatings only
09.2.3	frozen minced and creamed fish products, including mollusks,	500	mg/kg	Note 16 & 95 <sup>156</sup>	EC agree

<sup>155</sup> **Note 16:** For use in glaze, coatings or decorations for fruit, vegetables, meat or fish.



<b>Recommendation 2 - Ponceau 4R, INS 124</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>adopt</b> the following food additive provisions for ponceau 4R in the GSFA.					
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max</b>	<b>Level</b>	<b>Comments</b>	<b>EC comments</b>
	crustaceans, and echinoderms				
09.2.4.1	cooked fish and fish products	500	mg/kg	<b>Note 95</b>	EC agree
09.2.4.2	cooked mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	250	mg/kg		EC agree
09.2.5	smoked, dried, fermented, and/or salted fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	<b>100</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Note 22 <sup>157</sup>	EC agree
09.3.3	salmon substitutes, caviar, and other fish roe products	500	mg/kg		EC agree
09.3.4	semi-preserved fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms (e.g., fish paste), excluding products of food categories 09.3.1 - 09.3.3	<b>100</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		EC agree
09.4	fully preserved, including canned or fermented fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	500	mg/kg		EC agree
10.4	egg-based desserts (e.g., custard)	<b>50</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		EC agree
12.2.2	seasonings and condiments	500	mg/kg		EC agree
12.4	mustards	300	mg/kg		EC agree
12.5	soups and broths	<b>50</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		EC agree
12.6	sauces and like products	<b>50</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		EC agree
12.7	salads (e.g., macaroni salad, potato salad) and sandwich spreads excluding cocoa- and nut-based spreads of food categories 04.2.2.5 and 05.1.3	200	mg/kg		
12.9.5	other protein products	100	mg/kg		EC agree
13.4	dietetic formulae for slimming purposes and weight reduction	50	mg/kg		EC agree
13.5	dietetic foods (e.g., supplementary foods for dietary use) excluding products of food categories 13.1 - 13.4 and 13.6	300	mg/kg		EC agree
13.6	food supplements	300	mg/kg		EC agree
14.1.4	water-based flavoured drinks, including "sport," "energy," or "electrolyte" drinks and particulated drinks	<b>50</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		EC agree
14.2.2	cider and perry	200	mg/kg		EC agree
14.2.6	distilled spirituous beverages containing more than 15% alcohol	200	mg/kg		EC agree
14.2.7	aromatized alcoholic	200	mg/kg		EC agree

<sup>156</sup> **Note 95:** For use in surimi and fish roe products only

<sup>157</sup> **Note 22:** For use in smoked fish products only.

<b>Recommendation 2 - Ponceau 4R, INS 124</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>adopt</b> the following food additive provisions for ponceau 4R in the GSFA.					
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max</b>	<b>Level</b>	<b>Comments</b>	<b>EC comments</b>
	beverages (e.g., beer, wine and spirituous cooler-type beverages, low alcoholic refreshers)				
15.1	snacks - potato, cereal, flour or starch based (from roots and tubers, pulses and legumes)	200	mg/kg		EC agree
15.2	processed nuts, including covered nuts and nut mixtures (with e.g., dried fruit)	100	mg/kg		EC agree

<b>Recommendation 3 - Ponceau 4R, INS 124</b>					
<b>Comments are requested</b> on the following food additive provisions for ponceau 4R in the GSFA.					
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max</b>	<b>Level</b>	<b>Comments</b>	<b>EC comments</b>
01.6.1	unripened cheese	100	mg/kg	Note 3 <sup>158</sup>	Support request for technological justification
01.6.5	cheese analogues	100	mg/kg	Note 3	Support request for technological justification
04.1.2.4	canned or bottled (pasteurized) fruit	300	mg/kg		EC opposes
04.2.2.7	fermented vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweed products, excluding fermented soybean products of food category 12.10	500	mg/kg		EC opposes
05.3	chewing gum	300	mg/kg		
07.0	bakery wares	200	mg/kg		Oppose in wider category 07.2 would be acceptable
09.1.2	fresh mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	500	mg/kg	Notes 4 <sup>159</sup> & 16	Glazes and coatings only
10.1	fresh eggs	500	mg/kg	Note 4	EC supports
11.4	other sugars and syrups (e.g., xylose, maple syrup, sugar toppings)	200	mg/kg		EC opposes
11.6	table-top sweeteners, including those containing high-intensity sweeteners	200	mg/kg		EC opposes
13.3	dietetic foods intended for special medical purposes (excluding products of food category 13.1)	50	mg/kg		EC supports
14.2.4	wines (other than grape)	200	mg/kg		EC supports if needed in products within this category
16.0	composite foods - foods that could not be placed in categories 01 - 15	500	mg/kg		EC oppose – Foodstuffs should always be clearly defined

**\* For the higher use levels (150mg/kg) proposed in categories 1.1.2 the EC notes that a 15kg child would have to consume the following volumes of soft drink coloured at the corresponding level to reach the ADI:**

<b>Colour level mg/l</b>	<b>Volume soft drink consumed</b>
--------------------------	-----------------------------------

<sup>158</sup> **Note 3:** Surface treatment.

<sup>159</sup> **Note 4:** For decoration, stamping, marking or branding the product.

	<b>to reach ADI</b>
<b>300</b>	<b>200ml</b>
<b>200</b>	<b>300ml</b>
<b>100</b>	<b>600ml</b>
<b>50</b>	<b>1200ml</b>

### RIBOFLAVINS (INS 101I, 101II)

35. The 28th CAC has adopted several provisions in the GSFA for the use of riboflavins.

36. The 51st JECFA assigned a group ADI for synthetic riboflavin (101i) and riboflavin-5'-phosphate (101ii) of 0.5 mg/kg bw/d.

#### Recommendation 1 – Riboflavins, INS 101i, 101ii

The eWG recommends that the 39<sup>th</sup> CCFA **discontinue** further work on the following food additive provisions for riboflavins in the GSFA.

#### EC supports Recommendation 1.

#### Recommendation 2 - Riboflavins, INS 101i, 101ii

The eWG recommends that the 39<sup>th</sup> CCFA **revoke** the following food additive provisions for riboflavins in the GSFA.

Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max	Level	Comments	Justification provided to eWG
12.5.1	ready-to-eat soups and broths, including canned, bottled, and frozen	200	mg/kg		Superseded by 12.5 at 400 mg/kg from commodity standard. See recommendation 3
12.5.2	mixes for soups and broths	150	mg/kg		

#### EC supports Recommendation 2.

#### Recommendation 3 - Riboflavins, INS 101i, 101ii

The eWG recommends that the 39<sup>th</sup> CCFA **adopt** the following food additive provisions for riboflavins in the GSFA.

Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max	Level	Comments	EC COMMENTS
02.3	fat emulsions mainly of type oil-in-water, including mixed and/or flavoured products based on fat emulsions	300	mg/kg		EC supports this provision.
04.2.2.6	vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed pulps and preparations (e.g., vegetable desserts and sauces, candied vegetables) other than food category 04.2.2.5	300	mg/kg	<b>Note 92</b> <sup>160</sup>	
08.2	<b>Processed meat, poultry, and game products in whole pieces or cuts</b>	<b>1000</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		EC supports this provision. only with <b>note 16</b>
08.3	<b>Processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products</b>	<b>1000</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		EC supports this provision. only with <b>note 16</b>
08.4	<b>Edible casings (e.g., sausage casings)</b>	<b>1000</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		EC supports this provision. only with <b>note 16</b>
09.2.1	frozen fish, fish fillets, and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	<b>1000</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Note 95 <sup>161</sup>	EC supports this provision.
09.2.4.1	cooked fish and fish products	300	mg/kg	<b>Note 95</b>	EC supports this provision.

<sup>160</sup> **Note 92:** Excluding tomato-based sauces

<sup>161</sup> **Note 95:** For use in surimi and fish roe products only.

<b>Recommendation 3 - Riboflavins, INS 101i, 101ii</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>adopt</b> the following food additive provisions for riboflavins in the GSFA.					
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max	Level	Comments	EC COMMENTS
09.2.4.2	cooked mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	300	mg/kg		
09.4	fully preserved, including canned or fermented fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	500	mg/kg	<b>Note 95</b>	EC supports this provision.
14.1.3.2	vegetable nectar	300	mg/kg		EC doesn't support this provision and questions the technological need.
14.1.3.4	concentrates for vegetable nectar	300	mg/kg	<b>Note 127</b> <sup>162</sup>	EC doesn't support this provision and questions the technological need.

### SUNSET YELLOW FCF, INS 110

37. The 26th JECFA (1982) assigned a group ADI of 2.5 mg/kg bw/d for sunset yellow FCF.

<b>Recommendation 1 – Sunset Yellow FCF, INS 110</b>						
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>discontinue</b> further work on the following food additive provisions for sunset yellow FCF in the GSFA.						
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max	Level	Comments	EC Comments (Backup if needed)	Justification provided to eWG

### The European Community agrees to discontinue work on the provisions under recommendation 1.

<b>Recommendation 2 - Sunset Yellow FCF, INS 110</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <b>adopt</b> the following food additive provisions for sunset yellow FCF in the GSFA.					
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max	Level	Comments	EC Comments
01.1.2	dairy-based drinks, flavoured and/or fermented (e.g., chocolate milk, cocoa, eggnog, drinking yoghurt, whey-based drinks)	50	mg/kg	<b>Note 52</b> <sup>163</sup>	EC agree
01.6.1	unripened cheese	300	mg/kg	Note 3 <sup>164</sup>	EC oppose
01.6.2.2	rind of ripened cheese	100	mg/kg		EC agree
01.6.4.2	<b>Flavoured processed cheese, including containing fruit, vegetables, meat etc</b>	100	mg/kg		EC agree
01.6.5	cheese analogues	300	mg/kg	Note 3	EC agree
01.7	dairy-based desserts (e.g., pudding, fruit or flavoured yoghurt)	50	mg/kg		EC agree
02.1.3	lard, tallow, fish oil, and other animal fats	300	mg/kg		EC oppose as such use could mislead the consumer
02.4	fat-based desserts excluding dairy-based dessert products of food category 01.7	50	mg/kg		EC agree
03.0	edible ices, including sherbet and sorbet	50	mg/kg		EC agree
04.1.2.5	jams, jellies and marmelades	300	mg/kg		EC supports a level of 100 mg/kg (codex standard has a level of 200 mg/kg Eventually a footnote limiting to singly or

<sup>162</sup> **Note 127:** As served to the consumer

<sup>163</sup> **Note 52:** Excluding chocolate milk

<sup>164</sup> **Note 3:** Surface treatment.

<b>Recommendation 2 - Sunset Yellow FCF, INS 110</b>					
<b>The eWG recommends that the 39<sup>th</sup> CCFA <u>adopt</u> the following food additive provisions for sunset yellow FCF in the GSFA.</b>					
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max</b>	<b>Level</b>	<b>Comments</b>	<b>EC Comments</b>
					<a href="#">in combination needs to be added.</a>
04.1.2.6	fruit-based spreads (e.g., chutney) excluding products of food category 04.1.2.5	<b>300</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		
04.1.2.7	candied fruit	<b>200</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		<a href="#">EC agree</a>
04.1.2.8	fruit preparations, including pulp, purees, fruit toppings and coconut milk	<b>300</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		
04.1.2.9	fruit-based desserts, including fruit-flavoured water-based desserts	<b>50</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		<a href="#">EC agree</a>
04.1.2.11	fruit fillings for pastries	<b>300</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		<a href="#">Support at 200 mg/kg</a>
04.2.1.2	surface-treated fresh vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds	<b>300</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Note 4 <sup>165</sup> & 16	<a href="#">Glazes and coatings only</a>
04.2.2.6	vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed pulps and preparations (e.g., vegetable desserts and sauces, candied vegetables) other than food category 04.2.2.5	<b>50</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		
04.2.2.7	fermented vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweed products, excluding fermented soybean products of food category 12.10	200	mg/kg	Note 92 <sup>166</sup>	
05.1.5	imitation chocolate, chocolate substitute products	<b>300</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		<a href="#">EC supports a level of 50 mg/kg because of intake considerations</a>
05.2	confectionery including hard and soft candy, nougat, etc. other than food categories 05.1, 05.3 and 05.4	<b>300</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		<a href="#">EC supports a level of 50 mg/kg because of intake considerations</a>
05.3	chewing gum	300	mg/kg		<a href="#">EC supports a level of 50 mg/kg because of intake considerations</a>
05.4	decorations (e.g., for fine bakery wares), toppings (non-fruit) and sweet sauces	<b>300</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		<a href="#">EC support</a>
06.3	breakfast cereals, including rolled oats	<b>300</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		<a href="#">EC opposes</a>
06.4.3	pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products	300	mg/kg		<a href="#">EC does not agree with the use of colours in pre-cooked pastas. However, could agree with the use <u>in instant noodles only</u>, if this is in accordance with CODEX STAN 249-2006</a>

<sup>165</sup> **Note 4:** For decoration, stamping, marking or branding the product.

<sup>166</sup> **Note 92:** Excluding tomato-based products

<b>Recommendation 2 - Sunset Yellow FCF, INS 110</b>					
<b>The eWG recommends that the 39<sup>th</sup> CCFA <u>adopt</u> the following food additive provisions for sunset yellow FCF in the GSFA.</b>					
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max</b>	<b>Level</b>	<b>Comments</b>	<b>EC Comments</b>
06.5	cereal and starch based desserts (e.g., rice pudding, tapioca pudding)	<b>50</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		EC Agree
07.0	bakery wares	<b>200</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		EC opposes in wider category support in category 7.2 fine bakery wares only
08.1	fresh meat, poultry, and game	<b>300</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Notes 4 & 16 <sup>167</sup>	Glazes and coatings only
08.2	processed meat, poultry, and game products in whole pieces or cuts	<b>300</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Note 16	Glazes and coatings only
08.3.1.1	cured (including salted) non-heat treated processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	<b>300</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Note 16	Glazes and coatings only
08.3.1.2	cured (including salted) and dried non-heat treated processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	135	mg/kg		Glazes and coatings only add footnote
08.3.1.3	fermented non-heat treated processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	<b>300</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Note 16	Glazes and coatings only
08.3.2	heat-treated processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	<b>300</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Note 16	Glazes and coatings only
08.3.3	frozen processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products	<b>300</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Note 16	Glazes and coatings only
08.4	edible casings (e.g., sausage casings)	<b>300</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Note 16	EC agree
09.1.1	fresh fish	300	mg/kg	Notes 4, 16 & 50 <sup>168</sup>	Glazes and coatings only
09.1.2	fresh mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	<b>300</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Notes 4 & 16	Glazes and coatings only
09.2.1	frozen fish, fish fillets, and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	<b>300</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Note 95 <sup>169</sup>	Glazes and coatings only
09.2.2	frozen battered fish, fish fillets, and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	<b>300</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Note 16	Glazes and coatings only
09.2.3	frozen minced and creamed fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	<b>300</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Note 16 & 95	Glazes and coatings only
09.2.4.1	cooked fish and fish products	<b>300</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Note 95	EC agree
09.2.4.2	cooked mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	250	mg/kg		EC agree
09.2.4.3	fried fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	<b>300</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Note 16	Glazes and coatings only

<sup>167</sup> **Note 16:** For use in glaze, coatings or decorations for fruit, vegetables, meat or fish.

<sup>168</sup> **Note 50:** For use in fish roe only.

<sup>169</sup> **Note 95:** For use in surimi and fish roe products only.

<b>Recommendation 2 - Sunset Yellow FCF, INS 110</b>					
<b>The eWG recommends that the 39<sup>th</sup> CCFA <u>adopt</u> the following food additive provisions for sunset yellow FCF in the GSFA.</b>					
<b>Food Cat No.</b>	<b>Food Category</b>	<b>Max</b>	<b>Level</b>	<b>Comments</b>	<b>EC Comments</b>
09.2.5	smoked, dried, fermented, and/or salted fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	<b>100</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Note 22 <sup>170</sup>	EC agree
09.3.1	fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms, marinated and/or in jelly	<b>300</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Note 16	Glazes and coatings only
09.3.2	fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms, pickled and/or in brine	<b>300</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	Note 16	Glazes and coatings only
09.3.3	salmon substitutes, caviar, and other fish roe products	<b>300</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		Support
09.3.4	semi-preserved fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms (e.g., fish paste), excluding products of food categories 09.3.1 - 09.3.3	<b>300</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		Support at 100 mg/kg
09.4	fully preserved, including canned or fermented fish and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms	<b>300</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>	<b>Note 95</b>	EC agree
10.1	fresh eggs		GMP	Note 4 <sup>171</sup>	EC agrees
10.4	egg-based desserts (e.g., custard)	<b>50</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		EC agrees
12.2.2	seasonings and condiments	<b>300</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		EC agrees
12.4	mustards	300	mg/kg		EC agrees
12.5	soups and broths	<b>50</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		EC agrees
12.6	sauces and like products	<b>300</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		EC agrees although should not be used in tomato based sauces
12.9.5	other protein products	200	mg/kg		Support at 100 mg/kg
13.3	dietetic foods intended for special medical purposes (excluding products of food category 13.1)	50	mg/kg		EC agrees
13.4	dietetic formulae for slimming purposes and weight reduction	50	mg/kg		EC agrees
13.5	dietetic foods (e.g., supplementary foods for dietary use) excluding products of food categories 13.1 - 13.4 and 13.6	300	mg/kg		EC agrees
13.6	food supplements	300	mg/kg		EC agrees
14.2.2	cider and perry	200	mg/kg		EC agrees
14.2.4	wines (other than grape)	200	mg/kg		EC Agrees
14.2.6	distilled spirituous beverages containing more than 15% alcohol	<b>200</b>	<b>mg/kg</b>		EC agrees
14.2.7	aromatized alcoholic beverages (e.g., beer, wine and spirituous cooler-type	200	mg/kg		EC agrees

<sup>170</sup> **Note 22:** For use in smoked fish products only.

<sup>171</sup> **Note 4:** For decoration, stamping, marking or branding the product.

<b>Recommendation 2 - Sunset Yellow FCF, INS 110</b>					
The eWG recommends that the 39 <sup>th</sup> CCFA <u>adopt</u> the following food additive provisions for sunset yellow FCF in the GSFA.					
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max	Level	Comments	EC Comments
	beverages, low alcoholic refreshers)				
15.1	snacks - potato, cereal, flour or starch based (from roots and tubers, pulses and legumes)	200	mg/kg		EC agrees

<b>Recommendation 3 - Sunset Yellow FCF, INS 110</b>					
Comments are requested on the following food additive provisions for sunset yellow FCF in the GSFA.					
Food Cat No.	Food Category	Max	Level	Comments	EC comments
01.6.4.1	Plain processed cheese	200	mg/kg		
14.1.4.1	carbonated water-based flavoured drinks	300	mg/kg		EC considers the level of 50 ppm is appropriate because of intake considerations
14.1.4.2	non-carbonated water-based flavoured drinks, including punches and ades	300	mg/kg		EC considers the level of 50 ppm is appropriate because of intake considerations
14.1.4.3	concentrates (liquid or solid) for water-based flavoured drinks	391	mg/kg		EC considers the level of 300 ppm is appropriate because of intake considerations (assuming that this is based on a concentrate intended to be diluted 5:1)
16.0	composite foods - foods that could not be placed in categories 01 - 15	500	mg/kg		EC oppose – Foodstuffs should always be clearly defined

**For the higher use levels proposed in categories 14.1.4.1 and 14.1.4.2 the EC notes that a 15kg child would have to consume the following volumes of soft drink coloured at the corresponding level to reach the ADI**

Colour level mg/l	Volume soft drink consumed to reach ADI
300	125ml
200	187.5ml
100	375ml
50	750ml

### Republic of Korea

The Republic of Korea is pleased to provide the following comments on the food additive provision in GSFA food category 06.4.3(Pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products) that has a one-to-one correspondence with the CODEX Standard for Instant Noodles.

Republic of Korea would like to propose to delete Amaranth from the list of food additive provisions in GSFA food category 06.4.3. Also, we wish to suggest following comments to clarify this issue.

### General Comments

Draft maximum level for Amaranth in GSFA food category 06.4.3 is 100 mg/kg at step 7.

Amaranth was identified for safety assessment and assigned an ADI by JECFA. An ADI for Amaranth of 0 ~ 1.5 mg/kg bw/d was established at 1959, and then was reestablished to 0 ~0.75 mg/kg bw/d at 1964. Also, an ADI of 0 ~ 0.5 mg/kg bw/d was revised at 28<sup>th</sup> JECFA(1984). Now, the use of Amaranth is permitted in most of countries such as Canada, Japan, EU and CODEX. However, in some of countries such as USA, the use of Amaranth is not permitted because of safety.

Also, in Republic of Korea, as the low ADI established for Amaranth, the safety issue on Amaranth is consistently being arising from the National Assembly. So, this year, Republic of Korea is planning to make the legislation for limited use of Amaranth in the favorite foods of children. Especially, the Instant Noodle is very staple food for children.



Therefore, we consider that it would be difficult to accept the use of Amaranth in GSFA food category 06.4.3 that has a one-to-one correspondence with the CODEX Standard for Instant Noodles.

### **Norway**

Norway would like to thank the electronic Working Group and especially the US delegation the extensive work on the GSFA.

Our comments are organized by substance as organized in CX/FA 07/39/9. For simplicity we do not comment when we agree with the Working Groups proposal to delete, discontinue or adopt the said maximum level.

### **Benzyl peroxide (INS 928)**

- Norway would like to question the level of 75 mg/kg is proposed for flour, when JECFA has stated that 40 mg/kg flour is acceptable.

### **Sulphites**

- Norway does not support the level of 500 mg/kg in food category 4.1.2.1 frozen fruit and 4.1.2.5 jams, jellies and marmalade. 100 mg/kg is technologically sufficient.

Norwegian intake estimates (NORKOST and UNGKOST) show that the intake of jam among the high consumers (95<sup>th</sup> percentile) of 13 –year-olds and adults is 104 g/day and 85 g/day respectively.

With a maximum level of 500 mg sulphite per kg jam, an adult will reach ADI every day whilst the 13-year-old will exceed the ADI by 65 % - only from jam and not taking other sources into account. In our opinion the maximum level should be reduced to 100 mg/kg in both these categories. This is technologically sufficient without posing a health risk to the consumer.

- For food group 4.1.2.9 100 mg/kg is technologically sufficient.

### **Sweeteners**

Norway supports the proposal from the working group to first agree on the food categories where sweeteners are acceptable. We have a few comments in this matter. In those cases where we do not support the use of sweeteners in a category, we also propose to delete all proposals for adoption. This comment applies to every single sweetener and is not repeated for each sweetener:

<b>Food category</b>	<b>Comment</b>
1.3.2, 1.4.4, 1.5.2, 1.6.5	We question the technological purpose to add sweeteners in these analogues. If the purpose is to mimic the milk/cream/cheese and certain sweetness is necessary we believe the purpose is just.
4.2.2.5	We do not believe there is a need for sweeteners in vegetable, seaweed and nut and seed purees and spreads.
6.3	Sweeteners are used to replace sugar in breakfast cereals and there is a technological need.
7.1	The use of sweeteners in this category is not technologically justified. All proposals for sweeteners in this category should be deleted.
7.2	Sweeteners are used to reduce sugar content in fine bakery wares in order to produce products low in sugar for people suffering from diabetics.
9.3 and 9.4	Sweeteners are used in certain fish products in sweet/sour brine. Sweeteners such as saccharine have been used for many years. The sweetener is added to the brine. During the storage the sweetener will diffuse into the fish together with the vinegar and provide a distinct characteristic flavour.
11.4	We do not support the use of sweeteners in other sugars and syrups, xylose, maple sugar, and sugar toppings. These ingredients which are used to sweeten other food do not have a technological need for sweeteners.

12.3 and 12.4	The described use seems to be a flavour enhancer and should therefore be authorized as such.
---------------	--

### Footnotes

- Norway proposes that footnote 145 “energy reduced or without added sugar” replaces footnotes 138, 144, D, L and N in all the proposals for sweeteners.

Due to the extensive amount of footnotes we believe the use of footnotes should be minimized as much as possible.

The CCFA might want to consider to use footnote 145 “energy reduced or without added sugar” in all relevant food categories and delete footnote 138 and 145. This footnote is in our opinion a general requirement for the use of sweeteners that may replace other footnotes as well. For instance food category 4.2.2.3 mirrors food category 4.1.2.3 but the footnotes are different. It would make more sense to us if footnote 145 replaced footnote 144.

Footnote 144 restricts the use to “sweet/sour products only”. In our opinion this restriction may not be necessary.

Footnote D “for use in products for special nutritional purposes only” is only used in food category 7.2. The terms “special nutritional purposes” is a term which is quite difficult to define. For simplicity the use of sweeteners might in our opinion be allowed in all products in category 7.2 with footnote 145. Hence footnote D could be deleted.

Footnote N says “for use in breakfast cereals with a fibre content of more than 15 % and containing at least 20 % bran”. In our opinion it would be simpler to decide that given the product is energy reduced or without added sugar sweeteners is either allowed or not in this category. Hence footnote N could be deleted.

Footnote L “for use in fat-based sandwich spreads”: In our opinion it would be simpler to decide that given the product is energy reduced or without added sugar sweeteners is either allowed or not in this category. Hence footnote L could be deleted.