

codex alimentarius commission



FOOD AND AGRICULTURE
ORGANIZATION
OF THE UNITED NATIONS

WORLD
HEALTH
ORGANIZATION



JOINT OFFICE: Viale delle Terme di Caracalla 00100 ROME Tel: 39 06 57051 www.codexalimentarius.net Email: codex@fao.org Facsimile: 39 06 5705 4593

Agenda Item 4

CX/FL 06/34/4

JOINT FAO/WHO FOOD STANDARDS PROGRAMME

CODEX COMMITTEE ON FOOD LABELLING

Thirty-fourth Session
Ottawa, Canada, 1 – 5 May 2006

Guidelines for the Production, Processing, Labelling and Marketing of Organically Produced Foods:

Draft Revised Annex 2: Table 3

The last session of the Committee agreed to return the Draft Table to Step 6. Due to late reception of the document no comments were requested and document CX/FL 06/34/4-Add.1 will not be prepared.

I. Background

At the 49th (Extraordinary) Session of the Executive Committee, the Committee approved new work to review the criteria in Section 5 of the Guidelines to ensure that future inputs would be supported by technical submissions and to revise Annex 2 (Permitted Substances).

Prior to the 30th Session of the Codex Committee on Food Labelling (CCFL), member countries were invited to provide comments in response to CL 2001/48-FL to be considered by the *Ad hoc* Working Group. At the 30th Session, the Committee agreed to advance Proposed Draft Amendments to Section 5 for adoption at Step 5 and return Annex 2 to Step 3. In order to further its work on Annex 2, the Committee agreed that an electronic drafting group would convene to review comments and proposals for amendments to the lists.

Prior to the 31st Session of the CCFL, the *Ad hoc* Working Group met to further its work on Section 5 and Annex 2. At the 31st Session, the Committee agreed to advance the proposed draft amendments to Section 5 for adoption at Step 8 and Annex 2 for adoption at Step 5 by the 26th Session of the Codex Alimentarius Commission.

Prior to the 32nd Session of the CCFL, the *Ad hoc* Working Group met again to complete its work on Annex 2. Although some progress was made by the Working Group (i.e. forward Tables 1 and 2 to Step 8) several areas of concern could not be resolved. For example, several items remained in square brackets in Annex 2. The Working Group recommended to the CCFL that an electronic group, hosted by Canada, be established to reformat Table 3 and 4. The Committee endorsed this recommendation.

In the summer of 2004, the Office of the Codex Contact Point for Canada invited members of the CCFL to participate in the electronic working group (E-WG). In response to this request, twelve member countries, one member organization (EC) and four international organizations accepted the invitation. In November 2004, Canada contacted the participants of the E-WG and invited them to provide their comments on the updated Table 3 (Food Additives, including carriers) and Table 4 (Processing Aids).

After much discussion, the E-WG made the following recommendations to the CCFL concerning Table 3:

- The E-WG continue its work electronically to complete the reformatted Table 3.
- The CCFL expand the terms of reference of this E-WG to analyse appropriate functional

uses and food categories for each food additive that would be appropriate for organically produced foods in order to complete the table.

- Table 3 remain at its current step (Step 6).
- The working group has a physical meeting prior to the 34th Session of the CCFL to finalize recommendations to the Committee.

Due to the work being undertaken by Codex Committee on Food Additives and Contaminants (CCFAC) in the area of processing aids, the E-WG suggested to the CCFL that Table 4 remain status quo. There was general consensus among the E-WG supporting this option.

At the 33rd Session, the E-WG Chairperson (Canada) reported on the progress, but also highlighted the difficulties in completing the task assigned to the E-WG. The Chairperson recommended that the E-WG continue its work to complete the reformatted Table 3: Ingredients of Non-Agricultural Origin at Step 6 but discontinue revision of Table 4. The Committee agreed and noted the following terms of reference for the E-WG:

- a. To complete the reformatted Table 3 for those food additives already in the General Standard for Food Additives.
- b. To develop a recommendation as to how to proceed with those food additives that are at Step 3 and Step 6.
- c. To develop a recommendation as to how to proceed with those food additives not already on the GSFA or not in the approval process.
- d. The working group, chaired by Canada will work electronically. An invitation will be extended, through Codex Canada for participation in the E-WG. The language of the E-WG will be English.
- e. The E-WG will prepare a document by November 30, 2005 for circulation to CCFL.
- f. The document will be discussed at the next meeting of the *Ad hoc* working group on the Draft Guidelines to be held immediately prior to the next CCFL meeting. The *Ad Hoc* working group will work in English, French and Spanish.

In June 2005, the Office of the Codex Contact Point for Canada invited all those members of CCFL interested in participating in the E-WG to provide contact information by June 30, 2005. The invitation was accepted by 20 member countries, 1 member organization, and 4 non-government organizations¹.

Canada reformatted Table 3 to include those food additives already in the General Standard for Food Additives and in the format agreed to at the 32nd Session of the CCFL. Canada, as part of the reformatting exercise, ensured that the terminology when referring to food categories or functions was consistent with the GSFA. It was noted that those food categories which were presently at either Step 3 or 6 in Table 1 of the General Standard for Food Additives (GSFA) would remain in square brackets and their use as indicated would not be permitted until the specific additive/use is endorsed by CCFAC and adopted by the Commission. Canada circulated the reformatted Table 3 to the E-WG for their consideration and comment by September, 30th 2005.

The invitation for comments was accepted by 7 member countries, 1 member organization, and 2 non-government organizations. Canada rolled up all the comments received. The roll-up and a proposal, that the E-WG engage in a focused approach and review only food categories and subcategories within the table, was circulated to the E-WG for their consideration and comment by December 16th, 2005. The invitation for comments was accepted by 2 countries, 1 member organization, and 1 non-government organization. Canada again rolled up the comments. The roll up and reformatted Table 3 was circulated for consideration and comments by March 3rd, 2006. The E-WG was asked to focus their analysis and comments on only the food categories/subcategories. To help guide the discussion, Canada prepared a list of questions for consideration by the E-WG. Canada has completed the roll-up and updated the reformatted Table. This invitation was accepted by 5 member countries, 1 member organization and 1 non-government organization. The attached

¹ Australia, Austria, Brazil, Canada, Denmark, European Community, France, Guyana, Indonesia, Ireland, Japan, Korea, Netherlands, New Zealand, Norway, Poland, Sweden, Switzerland, Thailand, United Kingdom, United States of America, 49th Parallel Biotechnology Consortium (49P), International Associations of Consumer Food Organizations (IACFO), International Dairy Federation (IDF), and International Federation of Organic Agriculture Movements (IFOAM).

table (Attachment 1) will be the basis for discussion at the *Ad Hoc* Working Group meeting prior to the 34th Session of the CCFL.

II. Observations

a. Comments on Reformatted Table

Under the directive of the 33rd Session of the CCFL Committee, Canada undertook the task of updating Table 3 as recommended and agreed to by the Committee. Again this table was meant to be a starting point for discussion and it was forwarded to the electronic working group for comments.

Several members questioned the feasibility and user-friendliness. There was concern that the table had become too detailed and complicated and the members questioned whether it was possible to regulate this indicative list in such detail, as Table 3 resides in Guidelines. A few members suggested that due to the nature of the table, it would require continuous update to reflect any amendments to the GSFA by CCFAC. And finally, one member suggested that the two columns under “Permitted for Use in Food Categories” could be combined into one column.

However, there was general consensus among the members that the new Table 3 should list restricted functional uses and be a positive list of food categories for each food additive. In addition, there was agreement that Table 3 should include a statement which refers to the GSFA as a primary condition for the use of food additives. The E-WG generally agreed that the reformatted Table 3 was an adequate starting point.

b. Food Additives Permitted for use in Food Categories

Several members agreed that the “food categories” columns were too detailed if all the different subcategories and individual food items were included in the table. It was recommended that the list of additives and food categories should be as short and restrictive as possible. One member suggested that the food categories and sub-categories should be replaced by “Permitted, although exclusions of the GSFA still apply”. Other members agreed that in some cases for certain additives where there is a need for severe restrictions of use in organic products a more detailed list would be appropriate. However, if this was not the case then this column should refer to the main food categories. This approach was further clarified and agreed to by members of the E-WG.

A few members highlighted that the E-WG, when reformatting this table and undertaking changes to these columns, should be cognizant of the restrictions of use imposed by Section 5 (Criteria for inclusion of substances).

There was general agreement among E-WG that the reformatted Table 3 should only include those food additives that have been reviewed by Joint FAO/WHO Expert Committee on Food Additives (JECFA) and endorsed by CCFAC for the inclusion in the GSFA. One delegation suggested that those additives which were currently at Step 3 and 6 should be included in Table 3 in the interim on the same basis as the old Table 3 (or as close to it as possible). The table could then be revised when CCFAC has completed its work.

Several E-WG members provided, in their comments, suggestions on amending Table 3 to include new food additives or to delete an existing food additive. As these suggested changes went beyond the mandate of the E-WG, they were noted but were not considered.

c. Functional Uses

There was general agreement among several E-WG members that the inclusion of functional uses was useful information to be included in the table. It was felt that this information would contribute to providing more clarity to the user as to the appropriate use.

However, one delegation, though they were supportive of this inclusion, cautioned the E-WG members that to include a food additive and link it to a specific function could be misused, thereby misleading consumers.

The member provided the following example: the legal use of nitrate and nitrite in organic production is as a preservative, however, these food additives can contribute to flavour and colour of productions. The question raised by this member was how will the “functional use” categories be aligned with organic principles.

d. Recommendation on how to proceed with those food additives not included in the GSFA or in the approval process.

Again, there was general agreement that Table 3 should include only those food additives which have been endorsed by CCFAC for inclusion in the GSFA. Several delegations supported the removal of those non-permitted food additives until they have been reviewed by JECFA and endorsed by CCFAC. One delegation suggested that those country(ies) that supported the inclusion of the non-permitted food additives prepare a dossier for consideration and review by JECFA.

Finally, one E-WG member suggested that the Codex Committee on Food Labelling request that an “organic expert group”, who is responsible for evaluating food additives specific for organic products, evaluate and provide recommendations on the inclusions of those additives to the CCFL.

Conclusion:

The chair recommends that this reformatting exercise is further discussed and finalized at the next *Ad hoc* Working Group meeting, prior to the 34th Session of the CCFL. The chair would like to thank the E-WG members for their participation in this working group.

Table 3: Ingredients of Non Agricultural Origin Referred to in Section 3 of These Guidelines**3.1 [Additives Permitted For Use Under Specified Conditions in Certain Organic Food Categories or Individual Food Items]**

[The following table provides a list of those food additives including carriers which are allowed for use in organic food production. The functional uses and food categories and individual food items for each additive in the following table is governed by the provisions in Tables 1-3 of the General Standard for Food Additives.]

The table is an indicative list for the purpose of processing organic food only. Countries may develop a list of substances for national purposes that satisfy the requirements as recommended in Section 5.2 of these Guidelines]

Food additives in this Table can be used to perform the function indicated in the specified food products.

INS No.	Additive Name	Functional Use Allowed in Organic Production	Permitted for Use In Food Categories		Comments to e-WG
			Food of Plant Origin	Food of Animal Origin	
[153]	[Wood Ash]			[Traditional cheeses Specified traditional cheeses as recognized by the certification body or authority]	
170[i]	Calcium Carbonate*	[Anticaking Agent Acidity Regulator Emulsifier Stabilizer]	[Permitted, although exclusions of the GSFA still apply.]	Milk products 01.1.2 Dairy-based drinks, flavoured and/or fermented	Food Category Comment: IDF comment on “Milk products”:

* Additives permitted for use in food in general, unless otherwise specified. Note the food items that are excluded from the General Conditions of Table 3. The exclusions can be found in the Annex to Table 3 of the GSFA.

♦ Currently this food category is at either Step 3 or 6 in Table 1 of the GSFA, and therefore remains in square brackets. Its use as indicated would not be permitted until the specific additive/use is endorsed by CCFAC and adopted by the Commission.

INS No.	Additive Name	Functional Use Allowed in Organic Production	Permitted for Use In Food Categories		Comments to e-WG
			Food of Plant Origin	Food of Animal Origin	
				(e.g. chocolate milk, cocoa, eggnog, drinking yoghurt, whey-based drinks) [0.1.2.2 Renneted milk (plain)] [♦] 01.3 Condensed milk and analogues (plain) [01.4.1 Pasteurized cream (plain)] [♦] [01.4.2 Sterilized and UHT creams, whipping and whipped creams, and reduced fat creams (plain)] [♦] 01.4.3 Clotted cream (plain) 01.4.4 Cream analogues 01.5 Milk powder and cream powder and powder analogues (plain) 01.6 cheese and analogues 01.7 Dairy-based desserts (e.g. pudding, fruit or flavoured yoghurt) 01.8 Whey and whey products, excluding whey cheeses	Recommends changes in the food categories to align with the GSFA with previous terms listed in table 3 for the previous term "milk products." The comments listed below reflect the food categories that should be included under the term "milk products" (along with notes the recommended deleted terms are stuck and added terms are underlined). Milk products 01.1.2 Dairy-based drinks, flavoured and/or fermented (e.g. chocolate

INS No.	Additive Name	Functional Use Allowed in Organic Production	Permitted for Use In Food Categories		Comments to e-WG
			Food of Plant Origin	Food of Animal Origin	
					milk, cocoa, eggnog, drinking yoghurt, whey-based drinks) [0.1.2.2 Renneted milk (plain)] [♦] 01.3 Condensed milk and analogues (plain) (IDF Note: this category included beverage whiteners which are not considered milk products) 01.3.1 Condensed milk (plain) [01.4.1 Pasteurized cream (plain)] [♦] [01.4.2 Sterilized and UHT creams, whipping and whipped creams, and reduced fat creams (plain)] [♦] 01.4.3 Clotted cream (plain) 01.4.4 Cream analogues (IDF

INS No.	Additive Name	Functional Use Allowed in Organic Production	Permitted for Use In Food Categories		Comments to e-WG
			Food of Plant Origin	Food of Animal Origin	
					<p><i>note: this category should be removed it describes a food that contains vegetable oils)</i></p> <p>01.5 Milk powder and cream powder and powder analogues (plain)</p> <p><i>(IDF note: This category also includes milk and cream powder analogues, only 01.5.1 should be included) <u>01.5.1 Milk and cream powder (plain)</u></i></p> <p>01.6 cheese and analogues (IDF note: this category should also include cheese analogues (01.6.5) only specified cheese should be listed for this category) <u>01.6.1</u></p>

INS No.	Additive Name	Functional Use Allowed in Organic Production	Permitted for Use In Food Categories		Comments to e-WG
			Food of Plant Origin	Food of Animal Origin	
					<p><u>Unripened cheese, 01.6.2 Ripened cheese, 01.6.3 Whey cheese, 01.6.4 Processed cheese, 01.6.5. Whey Protein Cheese</u></p> <p>01.7 Dairy-based desserts (e.g. pudding, fruit or flavoured yoghurt)</p> <p>01.8 Whey and whey products, excluding whey cheeses</p> <p><i>(IDF note: Additional food categories should be included under milk products)</i></p> <p><u>2.2.1 Butter oil, anhydrous milk fat, ghee</u></p> <p><u>2.2.1.2 Butter and concentrated butter</u></p> <p><u>12.9.5 Other</u></p>

INS No.	Additive Name	Functional Use Allowed in Organic Production	Permitted for Use In Food Categories		Comments to e-WG
			Food of Plant Origin	Food of Animal Origin	
					<u>protein products</u> <i>(Note this should be limited to milk protein products only)</i>
220	Sulphur Dioxide	[<u>Acidity Regulator</u> <u>Adjuvant</u> <u>Antioxidant</u> <u>Bleaching Agent</u> (Not for Flour) <u>Flour Treatment Agent</u> <u>Firming Agent</u> <u>Preservative</u> <u>Sequestrant</u> <u>Stabilizer</u>]	Wine Products [14.2.3 Grape wines] ♦ [14.2.4 Wines (other than grapes)] ♦	[Not permitted.]	
[250]	[Sodium Nitrite]	[<u>Colour Retention Agent</u> <u>Preservative</u>]	[Not permitted.]	[Meat products except sausages for frying Minceed meat products Products made of fish, crustaceans and molluses] [<u>When no alternative technology exists for certain products, may be used for the following, except in sausages for frying:</u>] [08.2.1.1Cured (including	

INS No.	Additive Name	Functional Use Allowed in Organic Production	Permitted for Use In Food Categories		Comments to e-WG
			Food of Plant Origin	Food of Animal Origin	
				salted) non-heated treated processed meat, poultry, and game products in whole pieces or cuts 08.2.1.2 Cured (including salted) and dried non-heat treated processed meat, poultry, and game products in whole pieces or cuts 08.2.1.3 Fermented non-heat treated processed meat, poultry, and game products in whole pieces or cuts 08.2.2 Heat-treated processed meat, poultry and game products in whole pieces or cuts 08.2.3 Frozen processed meat, poultry, and game products in whole pieces or cuts. 08.3 Processed comminuted meat, poultry and game products [09.2.4.1 Cooked fish and fish products]♦ [09.2.5 Smoked, dried, fermented, and/or salted fish	

INS No.	Additive Name	Functional Use Allowed in Organic Production	Permitted for Use In Food Categories		Comments to e-WG
			Food of Plant Origin	Food of Animal Origin	
				and fish products, including mollusks, crustaceans, and echinoderms]♦ [09.3.3 Salmon substitutes, caviar, and other fish roe products]♦	
[252]	[Potassium Nitrate]	[Colour Retention Agent Preservative]	[Not permitted.]	[Raw pickled products Raw cured meat products] [When no alternative technology exists for certain products, may be used for:] [08.2.1.1 Cured (including salt) non-heated treated processed meat, poultry, and game products in whole pieces or cuts]♦ [08.2.1.2 Cured (including salted) and dried non-heat treated processed meat, poultry, and game products in whole pieces or cuts]♦ [08.2.1.3 Fermented non-heat treated processed meat, poultry, and game products in whole pieces or cuts]♦ [08.3.1.1 Cured (including	

INS No.	Additive Name	Functional Use Allowed in Organic Production	Permitted for Use In Food Categories		Comments to e-WG
			Food of Plant Origin	Food of Animal Origin	
				salted) non-heat treated processed comminuted meat, poultry and game products] ♦ [08.3.1.2 Cured (including salted) and dried non-heat treated processed comminuted meat, poultry and game products] ♦	
270	Lactic Acid (L- D- and DI-)*	[Acidity Regulator]	Fermented vegetable products [04.2.2.7 Fermented vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes [(including soybeans)] and aloe vera), and seaweed products] ♦	Sausage casings Milk products 01.1.2 Dairy-based drinks, flavoured and/or fermented (e.g. chocolate milk, cocoa, eggnog, drinking yoghurt, whey-based drinks) [01.2.1 Fermented milks (plain)] ♦ 01.3 Condensed milk and analogues (plain) 01.4.3 Clotted cream (plain) 01.4.4 Cream analogues 01.5 Milk powder and cream powder and powder analogues (plain) 01.6 Cheese and analogues 01.7 Dairy-based desserts (e.g. pudding, fruit or	

April 10, 2006

INS No.	Additive Name	Functional Use Allowed in Organic Production	Permitted for Use In Food Categories		Comments to e-WG
			Food of Plant Origin	Food of Animal Origin	
				flavoured yoghurt) 01.8 Whey and whey products, excluding whey cheeses 08.4 Edible casings (e.g. sausage casings)	
290	Carbon Dioxide*	[<u>Adjuvant Carbonating Agent Packing Gas</u>]	[<u>Permitted, although exclusions of the GSFA still apply.</u>]	[<u>Permitted, although exclusions of the GSFA still apply.</u>]	
296	Malic Acid (DL-)*	[<u>Acidity Regulator Sequestrant</u>]	[<u>Permitted, although exclusions of the GSFA still apply.</u>]	[<u>Not permitted.</u>]	
300	Ascorbic Acid *	[<u>Antioxidant Colour Retention Agent</u>]	[Provided insufficient natural sources are available.] [<u>Permitted, although exclusions of the GSFA still apply.</u>]	In meat products. [Provided insufficient natural sources are available.] [08.1 Fresh meat , poultry and game] ♦ 08.2 Processed meat, poultry, and game products in whole pieces or cuts 08.3 Processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products 08.4 Edible casings (e.g., sausage casings)	Is fresh meat considered a meat product in organic production?

April 10, 2006

INS No.	Additive Name	Functional Use Allowed in Organic Production	Permitted for Use In Food Categories		Comments to e-WG
			Food of Plant Origin	Food of Animal Origin	
[301]	[Sodium Ascorbate] *	[Antioxidant Colour Retention Agent]	[Not permitted.]	[Meat products] [Provided insufficient natural sources are available.] [08.1 Fresh meat , poultry and game] ♦ 08.2 Processed meat, poultry, and game products in whole pieces or cuts 08.3 Processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products 08.4 Edible casings (e.g., sausage casings)	Is fresh meat considered a meat product in organic production?
[302]	[Calcium Ascorbate] *	[Antioxidant]	[Not permitted.]	[Meat products] [Provided insufficient natural sources are available.] [08.1.2 Fresh meat, poultry and game, comminuted] ♦ 08.2 Processed meat, poultry, and game products in whole pieces or cuts 08.3 Processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game	

INS No.	Additive Name	Functional Use Allowed in Organic Production	Permitted for Use In Food Categories		Comments to e-WG
			Food of Plant Origin	Food of Animal Origin	
				products 08.4 Edible casings (e.g. sausage casings)]	
[303]	[Potassium Ascorbate] *	[Antioxidant]	[Not permitted.]	[Meat products] [Provided insufficient natural sources are available.] [08.2 Processed meat, poultry, and game products in whole pieces or cuts 08.3 Processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products 08.4 Edible casings (e.g. sausage casings)]	
306	Tocopherols (mixed natural concentrates) *	Anti-oxidant	[Permitted, although <u>exclusions of the GSFA still apply.</u>]	Mixed products	What is meant by mixed products? Please see GSFA Table 1 to determine which food categories and individual food items are to be permitted in organic production.

INS No.	Additive Name	Functional Use Allowed in Organic Production	Permitted for Use In Food Categories		Comments to e-WG
			Food of Plant Origin	Food of Animal Origin	
322	Lecithin * (Obtained without bleaches and organic solvents.)	[<u>Antioxidant</u> <u>Emulsifier</u> <u>Stabilizer</u>]	[Permitted, although <u>exclusions of the GSFA still apply.</u>]	<p>Milk products Milk-based infant food Fat products Mayonnaise</p> <p>[01.1.1.2 Buttermilk (plain)] ♦</p> <p>01.1.2 Dairy-based drinks, flavours and/or fermented (e.g. chocolate milk, cocoa, eggnog, drinking yoghurt, whey-based drinks)</p> <p>[01.2.1.2 Fermented milks (plain), heat-treated after fermentation] ♦</p> <p>[01.2.2 Renneted milk] ♦</p> <p>01.3 Condensed milk and analogues (plain)</p> <p>[01.4.1 Pasteurized cream (plain)] ♦</p> <p>[01.4.2 Sterilized and UHT creams, whipping and whipped creams, and reduced fat creams (plain)] ♦</p> <p>01.4.3 Clotted cream (plain)</p> <p>01.4.4 Cream analogues</p> <p>01.5 Milk powder and cream powder and powder</p>	

INS No.	Additive Name	Functional Use Allowed in Organic Production	Permitted for Use In Food Categories		Comments to e-WG
			Food of Plant Origin	Food of Animal Origin	
				analogues (plain) 01.6 Cheese and analogues 01.7 Dairy-based desserts (e.g. pudding, fruit or flavoured yoghurt) 01.8 Whey and whey products, excluding whey cheese [02.1 Fats and oils essentially free from water]♦ [02.2.1.1 Butter and concentrated butter] ♦ 02.2.1.2 Margarine and similar products 02.2.1.3 Blends of butter and margarine 02.2.2 Emulsion containing less than 80% fat 02.3 Fat emulsions mainly of type oil-in-water, including milk and/or flavoured products based on fat emulsions 02.4 Fat-based desserts excluding dairy-based dessert products of food category 01.7 12.6.1 Emulsified sauces	

INS No.	Additive Name	Functional Use Allowed in Organic Production	Permitted for Use In Food Categories		Comments to e-WG
			Food of Plant Origin	Food of Animal Origin	
				(e.g. mayonnaise, salad dressing) [13.1 Infant formulae and follow-on formulae] ♦ [13.2 Complementary foods for infants and young children] ♦	
327	Calcium Lactate *	[Stabilizer Acidity Regulator]	[Not permitted.]	Pasteurized milk and cream products 01.1.2 Dairy-based drinks, flavoured and/or fermented (e.g., chocolate milk, cocoa, eggnog, drinking yoghurt, whey-based drinks) [01.2.1.2 Fermented milks (plain), heat-treated after fermentation] 01.3 Condensed milk and analogues (plain) [01.4 Cream] [01.4.1 Pasteurized cream] ♦ 01.5 Milk powder and cream powder and powder analogues (plain) 01.6 Cheese analogues (01.6.4 would be included in this category)	Pasteurized milk is not in the list of food categories in GSFA. Are there any foods in category 01.0 which should be permitted in organic production? The foods listed here are currently allowed by GSFA.

April 10, 2006

INS No.	Additive Name	Functional Use Allowed in Organic Production	Permitted for Use In Food Categories		Comments to e-WG
			Food of Plant Origin	Food of Animal Origin	
				01.7 Dairy based desserts (e.g. pudding, fruit or flavoured yoghurt) 01.8 Whey and whey products, excluding whey cheeses	
330	Citric Acid *	Coagulant [Acidity Regulator <u>Antioxidant</u> <u>Sequestrant</u>]	Fruit and vegetable products 04.1.2 Processed fruit [04.2.1 Fresh vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes [(including soybeans)], and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds]♦ [04.2.2 Processed vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds]♦ [04.2.2.1 Frozen vegetables, (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds and nuts and seeds]♦	Cheese products Cooked eggs As a coagulation agent for specific cheese products and for cooked eggs 01.6 Cheese and analogues 02.1 Fats and oils essentially free from water (Sweden suggested this be included, E-WG any comments?) 10.0 Egg and egg products (Norway has suggested this be included, E-WG any comments? – Food Category comments: Norway: Reaffirmed their original	What is meant by cooked eggs? Please see Section 10 of the food category system in the GSFA to provide the food categories that should be included in this table.

INS No.	Additive Name	Functional Use Allowed in Organic Production	Permitted for Use In Food Categories		Comments to e-WG
			Food of Plant Origin	Food of Animal Origin	
			[04.2.2.7 Fermented vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and seaweed products, excluding fermented soybean products of food category 12.10]♦	comment concerning egg products Sweden: Category 10.2 could be used.	
[331] [331i]	[Sodium citrate] [Sodium Dihydrogen Citrate] *	Stabilizer Emulsifier	[Not permitted.]	Sausage Pasteurization of egg whites Milk products Emulsified sausage Melted cheese Pasteurized milk and cream products Processed cheese [01.1.1.2 Butter milk (plain) (Stabilizer only)] ♦ 01.1.2 Dairy-based drinks, flavoured and/or fermented (e.g., chocolate milk, cocoa, eggnog, drinking yoghurt, whey-based drinks) [01.2.1.2 Fermented milks (plain), heat-treated after fermentation (Stabilizer only)]♦	Pasteurized milk is not in the list of food categories in GSFA. Are there any foods in category 01.0 which should be permitted for organic production? The foods listed here are the foods currently allowed by GSFA. There is no food category under GSFA for sausage or emulsified sausage. We could list 8.3 (Processed

INS No.	Additive Name	Functional Use Allowed in Organic Production	Permitted for Use In Food Categories		Comments to e-WG
			Food of Plant Origin	Food of Animal Origin	
				[01.2.2 Renneted milk (Stabilizer only)] ♦ [01.3 Condensed milk and analogues (plain) (Stablizer only)] [01.4 Cream (plain) and the like (Stabilizer only)] ♦ 01.4.3 Clotted cream (plain) 01.4.4 Cream analogues [01.5.1 Milk powder and cream powder (Stablizer only)] [01.6.1 Unripened cheese (Stabilizer only)] 01.6.4 Processed cheese (Emulsifier only) [01.8.2 Whey powder] [08.3 Processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game products, restricted to sausages [To be used in pasteurization of egg whites only in the following]: [10.2.1 Liquid egg products] ♦ [10.2.2 Frozen egg products] ♦ 10.2.3 Dried and/or heat	comminuted meat, poultry, and game products) with a note indicating it is restricted to sausages for organic production. Melted cheese does not appear in the GSFA food categories. Food Category Comment Norway: Suggests that “melted cheese” be included under 01.6.4 Processed Cheese Sweden: Confirms category 01.6.4 Processed Cheese includes “melted cheese”.

April 10, 2006

INS No.	Additive Name	Functional Use Allowed in Organic Production	Permitted for Use In Food Categories		Comments to e-WG
			Food of Plant Origin	Food of Animal Origin	
				coagulated egg products	<p>IDF: IDF recommends the term "melted cheese" is synonymous with processed cheese, therefore the food category listed in the GSFA is "01.6.4 Processed cheese"</p> <p>Please confirm which of the food items in 10.2 are to be allowed for organic production.</p>
332	Potassium citrate	<u>[Acidity Regulator Antioxidant Emulsifier Sequestrant Stabilizer]</u>	<u>[Not permitted.]</u>	<u>[Permitted, although exclusions of the GSFA still apply.]</u>	
333	Calcium Citrate *	Stabilizer Dispersing Agent Acid Regulator	<u>[Permitted, although exclusions of the GSFA still apply.]</u>	Pasteurized milk and cream products	Pasteurized milk is not in the list of food categories in

April 10, 2006

INS No.	Additive Name	Functional Use Allowed in Organic Production	Permitted for Use In Food Categories		Comments to e-WG
			Food of Plant Origin	Food of Animal Origin	
		Antioxidant Stabilizer		01.1.2 Dairy-based drinks, flavoured and/or fermented (e.g. chocolate milk, cocoa, eggnog, drinking yoghurt, whey-based drinks) 01.3 Condensed milk and analogues 01.4 Cream (plain) and the like (not to be used as a Stabilizer) [01.4.1 Pasteurized cream (plain)] ♦ [01.4.2 Sterilized and UHT creams, whipping and whipped creams, and reduced fat creams (plain)] ♦ 01.4.3 Clotted cream (plain) 01.4.4 Cream analogues 01.6.1 Unripened cheese	GSFA. Which foods in category 01.0 should be permitted?
334	Tartaric Acid	<u>Anticaking Agent</u> <u>Acidity Regulator</u> <u>Adjuvant</u> <u>Antioxidant</u> <u>Bulking Agent</u> <u>Emulsifier</u> <u>Flour Treatment Agent</u>	<u>[Permitted, although exclusions of the GSFA still apply.]</u>	<u>[Not permitted.]</u>	

April 10, 2006

INS No.	Additive Name	Functional Use Allowed in Organic Production	Permitted for Use In Food Categories		Comments to e-WG
			Food of Plant Origin	Food of Animal Origin	
		<u>Humectant</u> <u>Preservative</u> <u>Raising Agent</u> <u>Sequestrant</u> <u>Stabilizer</u> <u>Thickener</u>			
[335]	[Sodium Tartrate]	[<u>Anticaking Agent</u> <u>Acidity Regulator</u>	<u>Cakes</u> <u>Confectionary</u>	[<u>Not permitted.</u>]	
[335i]	[<u>Monosodium Tartrate</u>]	[<u>Adjuvant</u> <u>Antioxidant</u> <u>Bulking Agent</u>	[05.1.1 Cocoa mixes (powders) and cocoa mass/cake] ♦		
[335ii]	[<u>Disodium Tartrate</u>]	[<u>Emulsifier</u> <u>Flour Treatment Agent</u> <u>Humectant</u> <u>Preservative</u> <u>Raising Agent</u> <u>Sequestrant</u> <u>Stabilizer</u> <u>Thickener</u>]	[05.1.2 Cocoa mixes (syrops)] ♦ [05.1.3 Cocoa-based spreads, including fillings] ♦ [05.1.4 Cocoa and chocolate products] ♦ [05.1.5 Imitation chocolate, chocolate substitute products] ♦ [05.2 Confectionary including hard and soft candy, nougat, etc. other than food categories 05.1, 05.3 and 05.4] ♦ [05.3 Chewing gum] ♦ [05.4 Decorations (e.g. for find bakery wares), toppings		

INS No.	Additive Name	Functional Use Allowed in Organic Production	Permitted for Use In Food Categories		Comments to e-WG
			Food of Plant Origin	Food of Animal Origin	
			(non-fruit) and sweet sauces] ♦ 07.2.1 Cakes		
[336]	[Potassium Tartrate]	[Anticaking Agent Acidity Regulator Adjuvant Antioxidant Bulking Agent Emulsifier Flour Treatment Agent Humectant Preservative Raising Agent Sequestrant Stabilizer Thickener]	Cereals Cakes Confectionary	[Not permitted.]	
[336i]	[Monopotassium Tartrate]		[05.1.1 Cocoa mixes (powders) and cocoa mass/cake] ♦		
[336ii]	[Dipotassium Tartrate]		[05.1.2 Cocoa mixes (syrups)] ♦ [05.1.3 Cocoa-based spreads, including fillings] ♦ [05.1.4 Cocoa and chocolate products] ♦ [05.1.5 Imitation chocolate, chocolate substitute products] ♦ [05.2 Confectionary including hard and soft candy, nougat, etc. other than food categories 05.1, 05.3 and 05.4] ♦ [05.3 Chewing gum] ♦ [05.4 Decorations (e.g. for find bakery wares), toppings (non-fruit) and sweet sauces] ♦ 06.2 Flours and starches (including soybean powder)] ♦		

April 10, 2006

INS No.	Additive Name	Functional Use Allowed in Organic Production	Permitted for Use In Food Categories		Comments to e-WG
			Food of Plant Origin	Food of Animal Origin	
			07.2.1 Cakes		
[339]	[Sodium phosphate]	[Stabilizer]	[Not permitted.]	[Pasteurized milk and cream products]	Pasteurized milk is not in the list of food categories in GSFA. Are there any foods in category 01.0 which should be permitted?
[339i]	[Monosodium Orthophosphate]			[01.0 Dairy products and analogues, excluding products of food category 02.0 ♦]	
[339ii]	[Disodium orthophosphate]				
[339iii]	[Trisodium Orthophosphate]				
[340]	[Potassium phosphate]	[Emulsifier Stabilizer]	[Not permitted.]	[Melted cheese Processed cheese Pasteurized creams]	Melted cheese does not appear in the GSFA food categories.
[340i]	[Monopotassium Orthophosphate]			[01.6.4 Processed cheese (Emulsifier only) ¹ ♦	
[340ii]	[Diphosphate Orthophosphate]			[01.4.1 Pasteurized cream (plain) (Stabilizer only)] ♦	
[340iii]	[Tripotassium Orthophosphate]				
341i	Monocalcium Orthophosphate	[Raising Agent]	Only for raising flour 06.2.1 Flours ♦	[Not permitted.]	
400	Alginic Acid *	Bulking Agent	[Permitted, although	Milk based products	What is meant by

INS No.	Additive Name	Functional Use Allowed in Organic Production	Permitted for Use In Food Categories		Comments to e-WG
			Food of Plant Origin	Food of Animal Origin	
		Emulsifier Stabilizer Thickener	<u>exclusions of the GSFA still apply.]</u>	<p>Mixed products (May be used as a Thickener only)</p> <p>[01.1.1.2 Buttermilk (plain)] ♦</p> <p>01.1.2 Dairy-based drinks, flavoured and/or fermented (e.g., chocolate milk, cocoa, eggnog, drinking yoghurt, whey-based drinks)</p> <p>[01.2.1.2 Fermented milk (plain), heat-treated after fermentation] ♦</p> <p>01.3 Condensed milk and analogues (plain)</p> <p>[01.4.1 Pasteurized cream (plain)] ♦</p> <p>[01.4.2 Sterilized and UHT creams, whipping and whipped creams, and reduced fat creams (plain)] ♦</p> <p>01.4.3 Clotted cream (plain)</p> <p>01.4.4 Cream analogues</p> <p>01.5 Milk powder and cream powder and powder analogues (plain)</p> <p>01.6 Cheese and analogues</p>	<p>mixed products? Please see GSFA Table 1 to identify which food categories and individual food items are to be allowed for organic production.</p>

INS No.	Additive Name	Functional Use Allowed in Organic Production	Permitted for Use In Food Categories		Comments to e-WG
			Food of Plant Origin	Food of Animal Origin	
				01.7 Dairy-based desserts (e.g. pudding, fruit or flavoured yoghurt) 01.8 Whey and whey products, excluding whey cheese	
401	Sodium Alginate *	Bulking Agent Emulsifier Stabilizer Thickener	<u>[Permitted, although exclusions of the GSFA still apply.]</u>	Milk-based products Mixed products [01.0 Dairy products and analogues, excluding products of food category 02.0] ♦ [01.1.1.1 Milk (plain)] ♦ [01.1.1.2 Buttermilk (plain)] ♦ 01.1.2 Dairy-based drinks, flavoured and/or fermented (e.g., chocolate milk, cocoa, eggnog, drinking yoghurt, whey-based drinks) 01.2 Fermented and renneted milk products (plain), excluding food category [01.1.2 (dairy-based drinks)] ♦ 01.3 Condensed milk and analogues (plain)	What is meant by mixed products? Please see GSFA Table 1 to determine which food categories and individual food items are to apply for organic production.

INS No.	Additive Name	Functional Use Allowed in Organic Production	Permitted for Use In Food Categories		Comments to e-WG
			Food of Plant Origin	Food of Animal Origin	
				[01.4.1 Pasteurized cream (plain)] ♦ [01.4.2 Sterilized and UHT creams, whipping and whipped creams, and reduced fat creams (plain)] ♦ 01.4.3 Clotted cream (plain) 01.4.4 Cream analogues 01.5 Milk powder and cream powder and powder analogues (plain) 01.6 Cheese and analogues 01.7 Dairy-based desserts (e.g. pudding, fruit or flavoured yoghurt) 01.8 Whey and whey products, excluding whey cheese	
402	Potassium Alginate*	Bulking Agent Emulsifier Stabilizer Thickener	<u>[Permitted, although exclusions of the GSFA still apply.]</u>	Milk-based products Mixed products [01.1.1.2 Buttermilk (plain)] ♦ 01.1.2 Dairy-based drinks, flavoured and/or fermented (e.g. chocolate milk, cocoa, eggnog, drinking yoghurt, whey-based drinks)	What is meant by mixed products? Please see GSFA Table 1 to determine which food categories and individual food items are to be allowed for organic production.

INS No.	Additive Name	Functional Use Allowed in Organic Production	Permitted for Use In Food Categories		Comments to e-WG
			Food of Plant Origin	Food of Animal Origin	
				[01.2.1.2 Fermented milks (plain), heat-treated after fermentation] ♦ 01.3 Condensed milk and analogues (plain) [01.4.1 Pasteurized cream (plain)] ♦ [01.4.2 Sterilized and UHT creams, whipping and whipped creams, and reduced fat creams (plain)] ♦ 01.4.3 Clotted cream (plain) 01.4.4 Cream analogues 01.5 Milk powder and cream powder and powder analogues (plain) 01.6 Cheese and analogues 01.7 Dairy-based desserts (e.g. pudding, fruit or flavoured yoghurt) 01.8 Whey and whey products, excluding whey cheese	
406	Agar*	<u>[Bulking Agent</u> <u>Emulsifier</u> <u>Filler</u> <u>Stabilizer</u> <u>Thickener]</u>	<u>[Permitted, although</u> <u>exclusions of the GSFA still</u> <u>apply.]</u>	<u>[Permitted, although</u> <u>exclusions of the GSFA still</u> <u>apply.]</u>	

INS No.	Additive Name	Functional Use Allowed in Organic Production	Permitted for Use In Food Categories		Comments to e-WG
			Food of Plant Origin	Food of Animal Origin	
407	Carrageenan *	[<u>Emulsifier</u> <u>Filler</u> <u>Stabilizer</u> <u>Thickener</u>]	[<u>Permitted, although exclusions of the GSFA still apply.</u>]	<p>Milk products</p> <p>[01.0 Dairy products and analogues, excluding products of food category 02.0] ♦</p> <p>[01.1.1 Milk and buttermilk (plain)] ♦</p> <p>01.1.2 Dairy-based drinks, flavoured and/or fermented (e.g., chocolate milk, cocoa, eggnog, drinking yoghurt, whey-based drinks)</p> <p>01.2 Fermented and renneted milk products (plain), excluding food category [01.1.2 (dairy-based drinks)] ♦</p> <p>01.3 Condensed milk and analogues (plain)</p> <p>[01.4.1 Pasteurized cream (plain)] ♦</p> <p>[01.4.2 Sterilized and UHT creams, whipping and whipped creams, and reduced fat creams (plain)] ♦</p> <p>01.4.3 Clotted cream (plain)</p> <p>01.4.4 Cream analogues</p>	

INS No.	Additive Name	Functional Use Allowed in Organic Production	Permitted for Use In Food Categories		Comments to e-WG
			Food of Plant Origin	Food of Animal Origin	
				01.5 Milk powder and cream powder and powder analogues (plain) 01.6 Cheese and analogues 01.7 Dairy-based desserts (e.g. pudding, fruit or flavoured yoghurt) 01.8 Whey and whey products, excluding whey cheese	
410	Locust bean [<u>Carob bean gum</u>] *	[<u>Emulsifier</u> <u>Stabilizer</u> <u>Thickener</u>]	[<u>Permitted, although exclusions of the GSFA still apply.</u>]	Milk products Meat products [01.0 Dairy products and analogues, excluding products of food category 02.0]♦ [01.1.1 Milk and buttermilk (plain)]♦ 01.1.2 Dairy-based drinks, flavoured and/or fermented (e.g., chocolate milk, cocoa, eggnog, drinking yoghurt, whey-based drinks) 01.2 Fermented and renneted milk products (plain), excluding food category [01.1.2 (dairy-based drinks)]	

INS No.	Additive Name	Functional Use Allowed in Organic Production	Permitted for Use In Food Categories		Comments to e-WG
			Food of Plant Origin	Food of Animal Origin	
				♦ 01.3 Condensed milk and analogues (plain) [01.4.1 Pasteurized cream (plain)] ♦ [01.4.2 Sterilized and UHT creams, whipping and whipped creams, and reduced fat creams (plain)] ♦ 01.4.3 Clotted cream (plain) 01.4.4 Cream analogues 01.5 Milk powder and cream powder and powder analogues (plain) 01.6 Cheese and analogues 01.7 Dairy-based desserts (e.g. pudding, fruit or flavoured yoghurt) 01.8 Whey and whey products, excluding whey cheese [08.1.2 Fresh meat, poultry and game, comminuted] ♦ 08.2 Processed melted, poultry, game products in whole pieces or cuts 08.3 Processed comminuted meat, poultry, and game	

INS No.	Additive Name	Functional Use Allowed in Organic Production	Permitted for Use In Food Categories		Comments to e-WG
			Food of Plant Origin	Food of Animal Origin	
				products 08.4 Edible casings (e.g. sausage casings)	
412	Guar Gum *	[<u>Bulking Agent</u> <u>Emulsifier</u> <u>Stabilizer</u> <u>Thickener</u>]	[<u>Permitted, although exclusions of the GSFA still apply.</u>]	Milk products Canned meat Egg products [01.0 Dairy products and analogues, excluding products of food category 02.0]♦ 01.1.1 Milk and buttermilk (plain) ♦ 01.1.2 Dairy-based drinks, flavoured and/or fermented (e.g., chocolate milk, cocoa, eggnog, drinking yoghurt, whey-based drinks) 01.2 Fermented and renneted milk products (plain), excluding food category [01.1.2 (dairy-based drinks)] ♦ 01.3 Condensed milk and analogues (plain) [01.4.1 Pasteurized cream (plain)]♦ [01.4.2 Sterilized and UHT	What is meant by canned meat? Please see the food category system in the GSFA to determine which food categories and or food items should be allowed for organic production.

April 10, 2006

INS No.	Additive Name	Functional Use Allowed in Organic Production	Permitted for Use In Food Categories		Comments to e-WG
			Food of Plant Origin	Food of Animal Origin	
				creams, whipping and whipped creams, and reduced fat creams (plain)] ♦ 01.4.3 Clotted cream (plain) 01.4.4 Cream analogues 01.5 Milk powder and cream powder and powder analogues (plain) 01.6 Cheese and analogues 01.7 Dairy-based desserts (e.g. pudding, fruit or flavoured yoghurt) 01.8 Whey and whey products, excluding whey cheese [10.2 Egg products]♦ [10.2.1 Liquid egg products] ♦ [10.2.2 Frozen egg products] ♦ 10.2.3 Dried and/or heated coagulated egg products	
413	Tragacanth Gum*	[<u>Bulking Agent</u> <u>Emulsifier</u> <u>Stabilizer</u> <u>Thickener</u>]	[<u>Permitted, although exclusions of the GSFA still apply.</u>]	[<u>Permitted, although exclusions of the GSFA still apply.</u>]	
414	Gum Arabic *	[<u>Bulking Agent</u>	Fat	Milk products	

INS No.	Additive Name	Functional Use Allowed in Organic Production	Permitted for Use In Food Categories		Comments to e-WG
			Food of Plant Origin	Food of Animal Origin	
		<u>Emulsifier</u> <u>Filler</u> <u>Stabilizer</u> <u>Thickener</u>	<p>Confectionary products</p> <p>[02.1 Fats and oils essentially free from water][♦]</p> <p>02.2.1.2 Margarine and similar products</p> <p>02.2.2 Emulsions containing less than 80% fat</p> <p>02.3 Fat emulsions mainly of type oil-in-water, including mixed and/or flavoured products based on fat emulsions</p> <p>02.4 Fat-based desserts</p> <p>05.0 Confectionary</p>	<p>Fat products</p> <p>Confectionary</p> <p>Glazing agent</p> <p>[01.1.1.2 Buttermilk (plain)][♦]</p> <p>[01.1.2 Dairy-based drinks, flavoured and/or fermented (e.g. chocolate milk, cocoa, eggnog, drinking yoghurt, whey-based drinks)</p> <p>01.2.1.2 Fermented milks (plain), heat-treated after fermentation][♦]</p> <p>[01.2.2 Renneted milk (plain)][♦]</p> <p>01.3 Condensed milk and analogues (plain)</p> <p>[01.4.1 Pasteurized cream (plain)][♦]</p> <p>[01.4.2 Sterilized and UHT creams, whipping and whipped creams, and reduced fat creams (plain)][♦]</p> <p>01.4.3 Clotted cream (plain)</p> <p>01.4.4 Cream analogues</p> <p>01.5 Milk powder and cream powder and powder</p>	

INS No.	Additive Name	Functional Use Allowed in Organic Production	Permitted for Use In Food Categories		Comments to e-WG
			Food of Plant Origin	Food of Animal Origin	
				analogues (plain) 01.6 Cheese and analogues 01.7 Dairy-based desserts (e.g. pudding, fruit or flavoured yoghurt) 01.8 Whey and whey products, excluding whey cheese) [02.1 Fats and oils essentially free from water]♦ [02.2.1.1 Butter and concentrated butter]♦ 02.2.1.3 Blends of butter and margarine 02.2.2 Emulsions containing less than 80% fat 02.3 Fat emulsions mainly of type oil-in-water, including mixed and/or flavoured products based on fat emulsions 02.4 Fat-based desserts 05.0 Confectionary	
415	Xanthan Gum *	[Stabilizer Thickener]	Fat products Fruit and vegetables Cakes and biscuits Salads	[Not Permitted.]	

INS No.	Additive Name	Functional Use Allowed in Organic Production	Permitted for Use In Food Categories		Comments to e-WG
			Food of Plant Origin	Food of Animal Origin	
			[02.1 Fats and oils essentially free from water] [♦] 02.2.2 Emulsions containing less than 80% fat 02.3 Fat emulsions mainly of type of oil-in-water, including mixed and/or flavoured products based on fat emulsions 02.4 Fat based desserts excluding dairy-based dessert products of food category 01.7 [04.1.1.2 Surface-treated fresh fruit] [♦] [04.1.1.3 Peeled or cut fresh fruit] [♦] 04.1.2 Processed fruit [04.2.1.2 Surface-treated fresh vegetables, (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes (including soybeans), and aloe vera), seaweeds and nuts and seeds] [♦] [04.2.1.3 Peeled, cut or shredded fresh vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses		

April 10, 2006

INS No.	Additive Name	Functional Use Allowed in Organic Production	Permitted for Use In Food Categories		Comments to e-WG
			Food of Plant Origin	Food of Animal Origin	
			<p>and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds and nuts and seeds] ♦</p> <p>[04.2.2 Processed vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds] ♦</p> <p>[04.2.2.1 Frozen vegetables, (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds and nuts and seeds] ♦</p> <p>[04.2.2.7 Fermented vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and seaweed products, excluding fermented soybean products of food category 12.10] ♦</p> <p>07.2.1 Cakes and cookies</p> <p>12.7 Salads (e.g. macaroni salad, potato salad)</p>		
416	Karaya Gum*	<u>[Bulking Agent Emulsifier</u>	<u>[Permitted, although exclusions of the GSFA still</u>	<u>[Not Permitted.]</u>	

April 10, 2006

INS No.	Additive Name	Functional Use Allowed in Organic Production	Permitted for Use In Food Categories		Comments to e-WG
			Food of Plant Origin	Food of Animal Origin	
		<u>Stabilizer</u> <u>Thickener</u>	<u>apply.]</u>		
{422}	{Glycerol}	<u>[Emulsifier</u> <u>Humectant</u> <u>Stabilizer</u> <u>Thickener]</u>	<u>[From plant extracts.]</u> <u>Obtained from plant origin;</u> <u>used as a carrier for plant</u> <u>extracts</u> <u>[Permitted, although</u> <u>exclusions of the GSFA still</u> <u>apply.]</u>	<u>[Not Permitted.]</u>	
440	Pectins (Amidated and non-amidated)*	<u>[Emulsifier</u> <u>Stabilizer</u> <u>Thickener]</u>	<u>[Permitted, although</u> <u>exclusions of the GSFA still</u> <u>apply.]</u>	<u>Milk products</u> [01.0 Dairy products and analogues, excluding products of food category 02.0]♦ [01.1.1 Milk and buttermilk (plain)]♦ 01.1.2 Dairy-based drinks, flavoured and/or fermented (e.g. chocolate milk, cocoa, eggnog, drinking yoghurt, whey-based drinks) [01.2.1.1 Fermented milks (plain), not heat-treated after fermentation ♦ 01.2.1.2 Fermented milks (plain), heat-treated after	

INS No.	Additive Name	Functional Use Allowed in Organic Production	Permitted for Use In Food Categories		Comments to e-WG
			Food of Plant Origin	Food of Animal Origin	
				fermentation] ♦ [01.2.2 Renneted milk (plain)] ♦ 01.3 Condensed milk and analogues (plain) [01.4.1 Pasteurized cream (plain)] ♦ [01.4.2 Sterilized and UHT creams, whipping and whipped creams, and reduced fat creams (plain)] ♦ 01.4.3 Clotted cream (plain) 01.4.4 Cream analogues 01.5 Milk powder and cream powder and powder analogues (plain) 01.6 Cheese and analogues 01.7 Dairy-based desserts (e.g. pudding, fruit or flavoured yoghurt) 01.8 Whey and whey products, excluding whey cheese)	
[450] [450i]	[Diphosphate] [Disodium diphosphate]	[Emulsifier Stabilizer]	[Not permitted.]	[Melted cheese Processed cheese Pasteurized creams] [01.4.1 Pasteurized cream	Melted cheese does not appear in the GSFA food categories.

April 10, 2006

INS No.	Additive Name	Functional Use Allowed in Organic Production	Permitted for Use In Food Categories		Comments to e-WG
			Food of Plant Origin	Food of Animal Origin	
[450iii]	[<u>Tetrasodium diphosphate</u>]			(plain) (Stabilizer only) ♦ [01.6.4 Processed cheese (Emulsifier only)]	
[450v]	[<u>Tetrapotassium diphosphate</u>]				
[450vi]	[<u>Dicalcium diphosphate</u>]				
{452}	{ <u>Polyphosphate</u> }				
[452i]	[Sodium Polyphosphate]				
[452ii]	[Potassium polyphosphate]				
[452iv]	[Calcium polyphosphate]				
[452v]	[Ammonium polyphosphate]				
500	(unmodified) Sodium carbonate	[<u>Acidity Regulator</u>]	Cakes and biscuits 05.0 Confectionery 07.2.1 Cakes and cookies	Milk products. Traditional cheese varieties prepared out of sour milk. 01.1.2 Dairy-based drinks, flavoured and/or fermented	Check GSFA food category 07.2 to confirm limitation to 07.2.1
[500ii]	Sodium hydrogen carbonate				

April 10, 2006

INS No.	Additive Name	Functional Use Allowed in Organic Production	Permitted for Use In Food Categories		Comments to e-WG
			Food of Plant Origin	Food of Animal Origin	
[500iii]	Sodium Sesquicarbonate			(e.g. chocolate milk, cocoa, eggnog, drinking yoghurt, whey-based drinks) 01.3 Condensed milk and analogues (plain) [01.4.1 Pasteurized cream (plain)] ^{1♦} [01.4.2 Sterilized and UHT creams, whipping and whipped creams, and reduced fat creams (plain)] [♦] 01.4.3 Clotted cream (plain) 01.4.4 Cream analogues 01.5 Milk powder and cream powder and powder analogues (plain) 01.6 Cheese and analogues (Only for traditional cheese varieties prepared out of sour milk) 01.7 Dairy-based desserts (e.g. pudding, fruit and flavoured yoghurt) 01.8 Whey and whey products, excluding whey cheeses	
501i	Potassium Carbonate *	[Acidity Regulator Stabilizer]	Cereals Cakes and biscuits	[Not permitted.]	Note pastas are considered a cereal

April 10, 2006

INS No.	Additive Name	Functional Use Allowed in Organic Production	Permitted for Use In Food Categories		Comments to e-WG
			Food of Plant Origin	Food of Animal Origin	
			05.0 Confectionary 06.3 Breakfast cereals, including rolled oats [06.4 Pastas and noodles and like products (e.g. rice paper, rice vermicelli, soybean pastas and noodles)] ♦ [06.4.1 Fresh pastas and noodles and like products] ♦ [06.4.2 Dried pastas and noodles and like products] ♦ 06.4.3 Pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products 06.5 Cereal and starch based desserts (e.g., rice pudding, tapioca pudding) 06.6 Batters (e.g., for breading or batters for fish or poultry) 06.7 Pre-cooked or processed rice products, including rice cakes (Oriental type only) 06.8 Soybean products (excluding soybean products of food category 12.9 and fermented soybean products of food category 12.10) 07.2.1 Cakes and cookies		in GSFA confirm 6.4 to 6.8 to be used for organic production. Food Category Comment – EC: supports the inclusion of 6.4-6.8. Norway supports the same inclusion. Sweden: Confirms that categories 6.4-6.8 should be included. Check GSFA food category 07.2 to confirm limitation to 07.2.1

April 10, 2006

INS No.	Additive Name	Functional Use Allowed in Organic Production	Permitted for Use In Food Categories		Comments to e-WG
			Food of Plant Origin	Food of Animal Origin	
503	Ammonium carbonates*	[<u>Acidity Regulator</u> <u>Raising Agent</u> <u>Stabilizer</u>]	[Permitted, although exclusions of the GSFA still apply.]	[Not Permitted.]	
504	Magnesium carbonates*	[<u>Colour Retention Agent</u> <u>Firming Agent</u>]	[Permitted, although exclusions of the GSFA still apply.]	[Not Permitted.]	
508	Potassium Chloride*	[<u>Stabilizer</u> <u>Thickener</u>]	<p>Frozen fruit and vegetables Canned fruit and vegetables Vegetable sauces Ketchup Mustards</p> <p>04.1.2.1 Frozen fruit 04.1.2.4 Canned or bottled (pasteurized) fruit 04.2.3.3 Vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds in vinegar, oil, brine, or soy sauce 04.2.2.4 Canned or bottled (pasteurized) or retort pouch vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes and aloe vera) and seaweeds 04.2.2.5 Vegetable, (including</p>	[Not permitted.]	<p>Check GSFA food category 04.1.2 to confirm exclusions of the rest for organic production.</p> <p>Food Category Comment –</p> <p>Norway: Confirms 04.1.2 and sub categories should not be included in this table.</p> <p>Sweden: Not allowed by the GSFA should not be allowed in the organic production either.</p>

INS No.	Additive Name	Functional Use Allowed in Organic Production	Permitted for Use In Food Categories		Comments to e-WG
			Food of Plant Origin	Food of Animal Origin	
			mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed purees and spreads (e.g., peanut butter) 04.2.2.6 Vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweed, and nut and seed pulps and preparations (e.g., vegetable desserts and sauces, candied vegetables) other than food category 04.2.2.5 [04.2.2.7 Fermented vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and seaweed products, excluding fermented soybean products of food category 12.10]♦ 12.4 Mustards 12.6.2 Non-emulsified sauces (e.g. ketchup, cheese sauces, cream sauces, brown gravy)		Note 4.2.2.1 Frozen vegetables not allowed by GSFA – Norway suggests this should not be included in the table, does the E-WG agree? Food Category Comment – Norway: Reaffirmed the above comment. Sweden: Not allowed by the GSFA should not be allowed in the organic production either. Should 12.6.2 be restricted to ketchup only or does the whole list apply?

April 10, 2006

INS No.	Additive Name	Functional Use Allowed in Organic Production	Permitted for Use In Food Categories		Comments to e-WG
			Food of Plant Origin	Food of Animal Origin	
					<p>Food Category Comment –</p> <p>Norway: Commented that 12.6.2 should be included in Table. Does the Ad Hoc Working Group agree?</p> <p>Sweden: Can be allowed for all products in 12.6.2</p>
509	Calcium chloride *	<u>[Firming Agent Stabilizer Thickener]</u>	<p>Fruits and vegetable products Soybean products</p> <p>04.1.2 Processed Fruit [04.2.1.2 Surface-treated fresh vegetables, (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds and nuts and seeds] ♦ [04.2.1.3 Peeled, cut or shredded fresh vegetables</p>	<p>Milk products Meat products</p> <p>01.1.2 Dairy-based drinks, flavoured and/or fermented (e.g. chocolate milk, cocoa, eggnog, drinking yoghurt, whey-based drinks) 01.3 Condensed milk and analogues (plain) [01.4.1 Pasteurized cream (plain)] ♦ [01.4.2 Sterilized and UHT</p>	<p>Should 04.2.2.7 fermented vegetable products be included?</p> <p>Food Category Comment –</p> <p>Norway: Agrees that it should be included in this Table. Does the Ad Hoc Working</p>

April 10, 2006

INS No.	Additive Name	Functional Use Allowed in Organic Production	Permitted for Use In Food Categories		Comments to e-WG
			Food of Plant Origin	Food of Animal Origin	
			(including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds and nuts and seeds] ♦ [04.2.2 Processed vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds] ♦ [04.2.2.1 Frozen vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), seaweeds, and nuts and seeds] ♦ [04.2.2.7 Fermented vegetable (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera) and seaweed products, excluding fermented soybean products of food category 12.10] ♦ 06.8 Soybean products (excluding soybean products of food category 12.9 and	creams, whipping and whipped creams, and reduced fat creams (plain)] ♦ 01.4.3 Clotted cream (plain) 01.4.4 Cream analogues 01.5 Milk powder and cream powder and powder analogues (plain) 01.6 Cheese and analogues 01.7 Dairy-based desserts (e.g. pudding, fruit or flavoured yoghurt) 01.8 Whey and whey products, excluding whey cheeses 08.2 Processed meat, poultry, and game products in whole pieces or cuts 08.3 Processed comminuted meat, poultry and game products 08.4 Edible casings (e.g. sausage casings)	Group agree? Sweden: Allowed by GSFA it could be permitted for organic production too.

April 10, 2006

INS No.	Additive Name	Functional Use Allowed in Organic Production	Permitted for Use In Food Categories		Comments to e-WG
			Food of Plant Origin	Food of Animal Origin	
			fermented soybean products of food category 12.10) 12.9.1 Soybean protein products 12.10 Fermented soybean products		
511	Magnesium chloride *	[<u>Colour Retention Agent</u> <u>Firming Agent</u>]	06.8 Soybean products (excluding soybean products of food category 12.9 and fermented soybean products of food category 12.10) 12.9.1 Soybean protein products 12.10 Fermented soybean products	[Not permitted.]	
516	Calcium sulphate *	[<u>Acidity Regulator</u> <u>Bulking Agent</u> <u>Firming Agent</u> <u>Flour Treatment Agent</u> <u>Sequestrant</u> <u>Stabilizer</u> <u>Thickener</u>]	Cakes and biscuits Bakery yeast 07.1.1.1 yeast-leavened breads and specialty breads 06.8 Soybean products (excluding soybean products of food category 12.9 and fermented soybean products of food category 12.10) 12.8 Yeast and like products 12.9.1 Soybean protein products	[Not permitted.]	There is no functional use as a Carrier. Confirm which functional uses are to be allowed. Confirm 07.1.1.1 Confirm 07.2.1

April 10, 2006

INS No.	Additive Name	Functional Use Allowed in Organic Production	Permitted for Use In Food Categories		Comments to e-WG
			Food of Plant Origin	Food of Animal Origin	
			12.10 Fermented soybean products		
524	Sodium Hydroxide*	[Acidity Regulator]	<p>Cereal products</p> <p>[06.2 Flours and starches (including soybean powder)] ♦ 06.3 Breakfast cereals, including rolled oats [06.4.1 Fresh pastas and noodles and like products] ♦ [06.4.2 Dried pastas and noodles and like products] ♦ 06.4.3 Pre-cooked pastas and noodles and like products 06.5 Cereal and starch based desserts (e.g. rice pudding, tapioca pudding) 06.6 Batters (e.g. for breading or batters for fish or poultry) 06.7 Pre-cooked or processed rice products, including rice cakes (Oriental type only) 06.8 Soybean products (excluding soybean products of food category 12.9 and fermented soybean products of food category 12.10)</p>	[Not permitted.]	Note: GSFA food category 06.0 Cereals and cereal products includes grain flours, pastas, etc. Which should be restricted for organic production?

April 10, 2006

INS No.	Additive Name	Functional Use Allowed in Organic Production	Permitted for Use In Food Categories		Comments to e-WG
			Food of Plant Origin	Food of Animal Origin	
551	Silicon Dioxide (Amorphous) *	Anticaking agent	Herbs and spices [12.2 Herbs, spices, seasonings, and condiments (e.g. seasonings for instant noodles)] [♦]	[Not permitted.]	
[942]	[Nitrous Oxide] *	[Propellant] [Packaging gas]	[Not permitted.]	[Whipped cream] [01.4.2 Sterilized, UHT, whipping or whipped, and reduced fat creams] [♦]	Should reduced fat creams be excluded?
938	Argon				
941	Nitrogen*	[Propellant]	[Permitted, although exclusions of the GSFA still apply.]	[Permitted, although exclusions of the GSFA still apply.]	
948	Oxygen				

INS	Name	Specific conditions
	<u>For plant products</u>	
170	Calcium carbonates	—
220	Sulfur dioxide	Wine products
270	Lactic acid	Fermented vegetable products
290	Carbon dioxide	—
296	Malic acid	—
300	Ascorbic acid	If not available in natural form
306	Tocopherols, mixed natural concentrates	—
322	Lecithin	Obtained without the use of bleaches and organic solvents
330	Citric acid	Fruit and vegetable products
333	Calcium citrate	Acidity regulator, stabilizer, dispersing agent, antioxidant
334	Tartaric acid	—
335	Sodium tartrate	Cakes/confectionary
336	Potassium tartrate	Cereal/cakes/confectionary
341i	Mono calcium phosphate	Only for raising flour
400	Alginic acid	—
401	Sodium alginate	—
402	Potassium alginate	—
406	Agar	—
407	Carageenan	—
410	Locust bean gum	—
412	Guar gum	—
413	Tragacanth gum	—
414	Gum arabic	Milk, fat and confectionary products
415	Xanthan gum	Fat products, fruit and vegetables, cakes & biscuits, salads
416	Karaya gum	—
440	Pectins	—
{442}	{Glycerol}	{From plant extracts.} Obtained from plant origin used as a carrier for plant extracts
500	(unmodified) Sodium carbonates	Cakes & biscuits, confectionary

501	Potassium carbonates	Cereals/cakes & biscuits/confectionary
503	Ammonium carbonates	—
504	Magnesium carbonates	—
508	Potassium chloride	Frozen fruit and vegetables/canned fruit and vegetables, vegetable sauces/ketchup and mustards
509	Calcium chloride	Milk products/fat products/fruits and vegetable/soybean products
511	Magnesium chloride	Soy bean products
516	Calcium sulphate	Cakes & biscuits/soy bean products/bakers yeast. Carrier
524	Sodium hydroxide	Cereal products
551	Silicon dioxide	Anti-caking agent for herbs and spices
938	Argon	—
941	Nitrogen	—
948	Oxygen	—
For Livestock and Bee Products		
The following is a provisional list for the purpose of processing livestock and bee products only. Countries may develop a list of substances for national purposes that satisfy the requirements of these Guidelines as recommended in Section 5.2.		
INS	Name	Specific conditions
153	Wood Ash	Traditional cheese
170	Calcium carbonates	Milk products. Not as colouring agent
{250}	{Sodium nitrite}	{Where no alternative technology exists for certain products, may be used for: pickling salt for meat products except sausage for frying, minced meat products, products made of fish, crustaceans and molluses.}
{252}	{Potassium nitrate}	{Where no alternative technology exists for certain products, may be used for: raw pickled products and raw cured meat products.}
270	Lactic acid	Sausage casing
290	Carbon dioxide	—
300	Ascorbic Acid	In meat [and dairy] products, provided insufficient natural sources are available
{301}	{Sodium ascorbate}	{In meat products, provided insufficient natural sources are available.}
{302}	{Calcium ascorbate}	{In meat products, provided insufficient natural sources are available.}
{303}	{Potassium ascorbate}	{In meat products, provided insufficient natural sources are available.}
306	Tocopherols, mixed natural concentrates	As an anti-oxidant in mixed products to prevent fat oxidation

322	Lecithin	Obtained without use of bleaches or organic solvents. Milk products/milk based infant food/fat products/mayonnaise
327	Calcium lactate	Stabilizer for thickening pasteurised milk and cream products
330	Citric acid	As a coagulation agent for specific cheese products and for cooked eggs
331	Sodium citrate	Sausages/pasteurisation of egg whites/milk products, emulsified sausage and melted cheese. Stabilizer for thickening pasteurized milk and cream products, and emulsifying salt for processed cheese.
332	Potassium citrate	—
333	Calcium citrate	Stabilizer for thickening of pasteurised milk and cream
{339}	{Sodium phosphate}	{Stabilizer for pasteurised milk and cream products}
{340}	{Potassium phosphate}	{Emulsifying salt for melted and processed cheese and stabilizer for pasteurised creams}
400	Alginic acid	As a thickener for milk based and mixed products
401	Sodium alginate	As a thickener for milk based and mixed products
402	Potassium alginate	As a thickener for milk based and mixed products
406	Agar	—
407	Carageenan	Milk products
410	Locust bean gum	Milk products/meat products
412	Guar gum	Milk products/canned meat/egg products
413	Traganth gum	—
414	Arabic gum	Milk products/fat/confectionary
440	Pectin (unmodified)	Milk products
{450}	{Diphosphate}	{Emulsifying salt for melted and processed cheese and stabilizer for pasteurised creams.}
{452}	{Polyphosphate}	{Emulsifying salt for melted and processed cheese and stabilizer for pasteurised creams.}
500	Sodium carbonates	Milk products for pH regulation in traditional cheese varieties prepared out of sour milk.
509	Calcium Chloride	Milk products/meat products
938	Argon	—
941	Nitrogen	—
{942}	{Nitrous Oxide}	{Packaging gas, propellant for whipped cream.}
948	Oxygen	—

3.2 Flavourings

Substances and products labelled as natural flavouring substances or natural flavouring preparations are defined in *General Requirements for Natural Flavourings* (CAC/GL 29-1987).

3.3 Water and Salts

Drinking water.

Salts (with sodium chloride or potassium chloride as basic components generally used in food processing).

3.4 Preparations of Microorganisms and Enzymes

Any preparation of microorganism and enzymes normally used in food processing, with the exception of microorganisms genetically engineered/modified or enzymes derived from genetic engineering.

3.5 Minerals (including trace elements), Vitamins, Essential Fatty and Amino Acids, And Other Nitrogen Compounds

Only approved in so far as their use is legally required in the food products in which they are incorporated.