

codex alimentarius commission



FOOD AND AGRICULTURE
ORGANIZATION
OF THE UNITED NATIONS

WORLD
HEALTH
ORGANIZATION



JOINT OFFICE: Viale delle Terme di Caracalla 00153 ROME Tel: 39 06 57051 www.codexalimentarius.net Email: codex@fao.org Facsimile: 39 06 5705 4593

Agenda Item 3b)

CX/MAS 07/28/4-Add.2

JOINT FAO/WHO FOOD STANDARDS PROGRAMME

CODEX COMMITTEE ON METHODS OF ANALYSIS AND SAMPLING

Twenty-eighth Session

Budapest, Hungary, 5 – 9 March 2007

DRAFT GUIDELINES FOR SETTLING DISPUTES OVER ANALYTICAL (TEST) RESULTS

GOVERNMENT COMMENTS AT STEP 6

EUROPEAN COMMUNITY

The European Community and its 27 Member States (ECMS) appreciate the opportunity to address the Codex Alimentarius Commission's request for comments on the "Draft Guidelines for Settling Disputes over Analytical (Test) Results".

The proposed CODEX draft guidelines for settling disputes is split into several steps, step 1 being a comparison of the analytical results obtained in the two laboratories using the reproducibility limit. This approach did not take into account the current tendency towards using method uncertainty values. It is too orientated towards Horwitz values and reproducibility. Accreditation authorities were increasingly looking towards method uncertainty rather than repeatability/reproducibility as an assessment of laboratory quality performance. The approach based on Horwitz and reproducibility should be then given up, a simple definition of a dispute situation should be better. If the difference between the results obtained in the two laboratories is larger than the sum of their two method uncertainties the results are not in agreement. This could be refined further using a more accurate approach based on the geometric rather than arithmetic difference.

In addition, the flow chart adds nothing to the explanation given in the paper. It should be replaced by a flowchart showing that still choices have to be made. A new title is suggested to be in line with the scope of the paper: "*Proposed guidelines for settling disputes over analytical (test) results with respect to the compliance of a lot to a legal specification*".