

codex alimentarius commission



FOOD AND AGRICULTURE
ORGANIZATION
OF THE UNITED NATIONS

WORLD
HEALTH
ORGANIZATION



JOINT OFFICE: Viale delle Terme di Caracalla 00153 ROME Tel: 39 06 57051 www.codexalimentarius.net Email: codex@fao.org Facsimile: 39 06 5705 4593

Agenda Item 7

CX/PFV 10/25/8-Add.1
September 2010

JOINT FAO/WHO FOOD STANDARDS PROGRAMME CODEX COMMITTEE ON PROCESSED FRUITS AND VEGETABLES

25th Session
Bali, Indonesia,
25 – 29 October 2010

FOOD ADDITIVE PROVISIONS FOR PROCESSED FRUITS AND VEGETABLES: *Additional provisions in selected adopted standards*

**Additional comments in reply to CL 2008/31-PFV : Part B
from Kenya and the United States of America**

KENYA

Comments in reply to CL 2008/31-PFV : Part B

Therefore Kenya recommends that the committee adheres to the recommended limits stipulated in *General Standard for Food Additives* as laid out in the Procedural Manual. CCFA is recognised as the committee with the responsibility and scientific expertise to assess individual additives and their levels in line with its risk assessment principles and the Preamble of the GSFA.

UNITED STATES

The United States welcomes the opportunity to comment on *Food Additive Provisions for Processed Fruits and Vegetables: Additional Provisions in Selected Standards* (CL 2008/31-PFV: Part B) (Alinorm 09/32/27, Appendix VII) that will be considered at the 25th Session of the Codex Committee on Processed Fruits and Vegetables (CCPFV).

General Comments

We refer to the three food additive sections currently being revised by the CCPFV:

- Table Olives (CX/PFV 10/25/4);
- Canned Mushrooms (CX/PFV 10/25/5); and
- Canned Bamboo Shoots (CX/PFV 10/25/6).

We note that in the food additive sections in all three standards, certain food additives were selectively omitted without the technological justification.

The U.S. seeks a comprehensive solution for the proposed food additive provisions by for Codex standardized processed fruits and vegetables. According to the *Procedural Manual Section II: Elaboration of Codex Standards and Related Texts-Relations between Commodity Committees and General Subject Committees*, the food additive section of a commodity standard should make reference to relevant food additive functional classes and the corresponding food category of the General Standards for Food Additives (GSFA; CODEX STAN 192-1995). Exceptions from, or additions to, such a general reference should be fully justified based upon the criteria for the use of food additives as established in Section 3 of the GSFA Preamble.¹

¹ "Commodity committees shall examine the General Standard for Food Additives (*CODEX STAN 192-1995*) with a view toward incorporating a reference to the General Standard. All proposals for additions or amendments to the General Standard for Food Additives shall be referred to the Committee on Food Additives. The Committee on Food Additives shall consider such proposals for endorsement."

During the elaboration of CCPFV standards, references to general standards for labeling of prepackaged foods, hygiene, pesticide residues, and contaminants were accepted without reservations, consistent with the Procedural Manual.

Therefore, the U.S. strongly recommends that the CCPFV take a similar approach when elaborating the food additive section of standards and strive to reference the GSFA.

Specific Comments

The details pertaining to each of these standards are:

The scope of the Standard for Table Olives (CX/PFV 10/25/4) is within the scope of GSFA food category 04.2.2.3 (*Vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds in vinegar, oil, brine, or soybean sauce*).

- The U.S. recommends that a single provision for all tartrates (INS 334, 335(i), 335(ii), 336(i), 336(ii) and 337) with a single acceptable maximum use level (expressed as tartaric acid) be included in this standard.

Rationale: The scope of this food category is broad, and includes many standardized as well as non-standardized foods. The draft food additive provisions for table olives only lists tartaric acid (L(+)-) (INS 334) for use as an acidity regulator. However, tartrates share a common JECFA ADI (as tartaric acid). Furthermore, all of the tartrates are listed as acidity regulators in the INS list (CAC/GL 36-1989). For these reasons, the GSFA allows the use of all tartrates as acidity regulators and groups all tartrates together under a single food additive provision in food category 04.2.2.3.

Without any discussion of the technological justification, monosodium tartrate (INS 335(i)), disodium tartrate (INS 335(ii)), monopotassium tartrate (INS 336(i)), dipotassium tartrate (INS 336(ii)), and potassium sodium tartrate (INS 337) were excluded from the table olives standard. In the absence of a justification consistent with Codex procedures, the U.S. recommends that a single provision for all tartrates (INS 334, 335(i), 335(ii), 336(i), 336(ii) and 337) with a single acceptable maximum use level (expressed as tartaric acid) be included in this standard.

The scope of the Standard for Canned Mushrooms (CX/PFV 10/25/5) is within the scope of GSFA food category 04.2.2.4 (*Canned or bottled (pasteurized) or retort pouch vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds*).

- The U.S. recommends that a single provision for both INS 385 and 386 with a single acceptable maximum use level expressed as anhydrous calcium disodium ethylenediaminetetraacetate (which is the basis of the JECFA ADI) be included in this standard.

Rationale: This food category is broad and includes many standardized as well as non-standardized foods. The draft food additive provisions currently being revised for canned mushrooms lists calcium disodium ethylenediaminetetraacetate (INS 385) for use as an antioxidant, preservative or sequestrant at a maximum level of 200 mg/kg but does not include disodium ethylenediaminetetraacetate (INS 386). However, as both salts of ethylenediaminetetraacetate (INS 385 and INS 386) share a common JECFA ADI, the GSFA groups them in a single provision for the use both in food category 04.2.2.4 at a maximum level of 365 mg/kg (as anhydrous calcium disodium ethylenediaminetetraacetate). ethylenediaminetetraacetate). If there is no technological justification for excluding disodium ethylenediaminetetraacetate (INS 386), then the U.S. recommends including single provision for both INS 385 and 386 with a single acceptable maximum use level expressed as anhydrous calcium disodium ethylenediaminetetraacetate (which is the basis of the JECFA ADI) in this standard.

The scope of the Standard for Canned Bamboo Shoots (CX/PFV 10/25/6) is within the scope of GSFA food category 04.2.2.4 (*Canned or bottled (pasteurized) or retort pouch vegetables (including mushrooms and fungi, roots and tubers, pulses and legumes, and aloe vera), and seaweeds*).

- The U.S. recommends that a single provision for all tartrates (INS 334, 335(i), 335(ii), 336(i), 336(ii) and 337) with a single acceptable maximum use level (expressed as tartaric acid) be included in this standard.

“Revisions of a substantive nature that are endorsed by the Committee on Food Additives will be referred back to the commodity committee in order to achieve consensus between both Committees at an early stage of the step procedure.”

“Should the commodity committee consider that a general reference to the General Standard for Food Additives does not serve its purpose; a proposal should be prepared and forwarded to the Committee on Food Additives for consideration and endorsement. The commodity committee shall provide a justification for why a general reference to the General Standard for Food Additives would not be appropriate in light of the criteria for the use of food additives established in the Preamble of the General Standard for Food Additive,.”in particular, Section 3.” *See Elaboration of Codex Standards,* “*Relations between Commodity Committees and the General Subject Committees,* Codex Procedural Manual 19th Ed. At pp.34-55)

Rationale: The scope of this food category is broad and includes both standardized and non-standardized foods. The draft food additive provisions for canned bamboo shoots only lists tartaric acid (L(+)-) (INS 334) for use as an acidity regulator. However, tartrates share a common JECFA ADI (as tartaric acid) and all of the tartrates are listed as acidity regulators in the INS list (CAC/GL 36-1989). For these reasons, the GSFA allows the use of all tartrates as acidity regulators and groups all tartrates together under a single food additive provision in food category 04.2.2.4.

Without any discussion of the technological justification for deviations from the Procedural Manual, monosodium tartrate (INS 335(i)), disodium tartrate (INS 335(ii)), monopotassium tartrate (INS 336(i)), dipotassium tartrate (INS 336(ii)), and potassium sodium tartrate (INS 337) were excluded from the canned bamboo shoots standard. In the absence of a justification consistent with Codex procedures, the U.S. recommends including a single provision for all tartrates (INS 334, 335(i), 335(ii), 336(i), 336(ii) and 337) with a single acceptable maximum use level (expressed as tartaric acid) in this standard.