



JOINT FAO/WHO FOOD STANDARDS PROGRAMME

CODEX COMMITTEE ON PROCESSED FRUITS AND VEGETABLES

working by correspondence through the Codex online-platform

REPORT OF THE ELECTRONIC WORKING GROUP ON THE CONVERSION OF THE REGIONAL STANDARD FOR CHILI SAUCE INTO A WORLDWIDE STANDARD

Prepared by the Electronic Working Group chaired by India

Codex members and observers wishing to submit comments at Step 3 on this proposed draft should do so as instructed in CL 2019/88-PFV available on the Codex webpage/Circular letters 2019:

<http://www.fao.org/fao-who-codexalimentarius/circular-letters/en/>

BACKGROUND

1. At the 28th session of Codex Committee on Processed Fruits and Vegetables (CCPFV)¹, India proposed to initiate a new work on the conversion of the Asian *Regional Standard for Chili Sauce* (CXS 306R-2011) into a worldwide standard. The objective of proposing new work on the conversion of the Asian *Regional Standard for Chili Sauce* (CXS 306R-2011) into a worldwide standard is to provide an international coverage to this existing regional standard for chili sauce in order to facilitate international trade and also to protect consumer interests globally. CCPFV28 acknowledged the commitment to lead work on the proposal and noted the support of several delegations in relation to pursuing work in this direction. CCPFV28 agreed that the proposal for new work be submitted directly to CCEXEC for critical review.
2. CCEXEC73 (2017)² noted that the project documents were complete and met the criteria for critical review and therefore approved the proposal as new work for CCPFV.
3. CAC40 (2017)³ agreed that CCPFV would work by correspondence until CAC41 (2018) to: (i) prioritize its work on the proposals for new work and pending work on the review of the existing standards; (ii) prepare a work plan to address its overall work; and (iii) prepare recommendations for CAC41 on the establishment of EWGs to carry out standard-development work, as prioritized in the work plan, for consideration by a physical meeting of CCPFV to be held in 2019.
4. CAC41 (2018)⁴ endorsed the recommendations of the CCPFV to establish seven EWGs including EWG for Chili Sauce to be chaired by India to prepare the proposed drafts for comments and consideration by CCPFV.
5. Subsequently, an EWG was established with India as Chair and the list of participants to EWG is provided at Appendix IV.

SUMMARY OF DISCUSSION

First round of consultation

6. A first draft proposal was prepared by India and posted on EWG online forum for comments. The EWG members were invited mainly to consider the draft codex standard for chilli sauce, to consider further elaboration on quality parameters of chili sauce by including parameters such as Total Soluble Solids (TSS), acidity and chili content and also to consider some proposals with respect to food additive provisions in order to make the *General Standard for Food Additives* (GSFA, CXS 192-1995) as single reference point. The specific proposal were as under:

¹ REP17/PFV, paras. 107-112

² REP17/EXEC2, para. 49

³ REP17/CAC, paras. 95-96

⁴ REP18/CAC, para. 88

- i. Deleting specific provisions of food additive (strikethrough) as the same shall be governed by GSFA in order to make GSFA as single reference point for food additive provisions.
- ii. Requesting Codex Committee on Food Additive (CCFA) for inclusion and appropriate alignment of those provisions of food additives which are put in square brackets [] with GSFA.
- iii. Requesting CCFA for inclusion of notes to GSFA for allowance of specific levels of those food additives which are put in curly bracket { } under section 4.

7. In the first round of consultation, comments were received from 4 member countries *viz* Iran, Jamaica, Mexico and Thailand. Most of the comments were on the sections “Essential Composition and Quality Factors” and “Food Additive”. The comments were analysed and accordingly the draft was modified as appropriate. The analysis of the comments received in first round of consultation is provided at Appendix II.

Second round of consultation

8. Since specific comments were not received on majority of the recommendations mentioned in first round of consultation, EWG members were requested to consider the revised draft with the same recommendations in the second round of consultation also.

9. In the second round of consultation, comments were received from 4 member countries *viz* Iran, Mexico, Thailand and USA. The comments were received on various sections i.e. “Description”, “Essential Composition and Quality Factors”, “Food Additives” and “Labelling”. Comments were analysed following second round of consultation (provided at Appendix III) and the final revised draft has been prepared after incorporating changes as suggested by members, as appropriate, and the same is attached as Appendix I.

CONCLUSION

10. In the final revised draft, some modifications have been incorporated in the sections on Description”, “Essential Composition and Quality Factors”, “Food Additives” and “Contaminants”.

11. Certain additional provisions incorporated (pH, Ash, TSS, acidity and declaration of the percentage of total soluble solids) in the final revised draft have been kept in square brackets for further discussions in the Committee meeting as there was no consensus on the same.

12. Table 4.2 to table 4.9 are proposed to be deleted after endorsement/appropriate alignment by CCFA and only those classes of food additives specified in section 4.1 will be used in accordance with Tables 1 and 2 of the General Standard of Food Additives in food category 12.6.2 (Non-emulsified sauces e.g. ketchup, cheese sauce, cream sauce, brown gravy) or listed in Table 3 of the General Standard for Food Additives are acceptable for use in foods conforming to this standard.

13. Although the current work pertains to conversion of regional standard for chili sauce into global standards, it is noted that the comments provided by EWG members also included technical aspects of the standards which would needs further deliberations at committee level for finalisation.

RECOMMENDATION

14. CCPFV is invited to consider following:
- i. Proposed changes as highlighted in bold/underline and strikethrough in the revised draft Codex Standard for Chili Sauce as attached at Appendix I ;
 - ii. Provisions put under square brackets.
 - iii. Proposed deletion of food additives under section 4.1 shown as strikethrough as the same shall be governed by GSFA in order to make GSFA as single reference point for food additive provisions.
 - iv. Requesting CCFA for inclusion and appropriate alignment of those provisions of food additives which are put in square brackets [] under Section 4 (Table 4.2 to Table 4.9) with GSFA.
 - v. Requesting CCFA for inclusion of notes to GSFA for allowance of specific levels of those food additives which are put in curly bracket { } under Section 4.

Proposed Draft Codex Standard for Chili Sauce

1. SCOPE

This standard applies to chili sauce, as defined in Section 2 below, and offered for direct consumption, including for catering purposes or for repacking if required. It does not apply to the product when indicated as being intended for further processing.

2. DESCRIPTION

2.1 Product definition

Chili sauce is the product:

- (a) intended for use as seasoning and condiment;
- (b) prepared from the edible portion of sound, ~~and clean~~ **and fresh chili (*Capsicum spp.*) or processed chili and** raw materials referred to in Section 3.1 below which are mixed and prepared to obtain the desired quality and characteristics;
- (c) intended for use as seasoning and condiment;
- (d) processed by heat, in an appropriate manner, before or after being hermetically sealed in a container, so as to prevent spoilage.

2.2 Styles

2.2.1 *Chili sauce can be of the following styles:*

- (a) ~~Chili sauce with pulp and seeds homogeneously ground together.~~
- (b) ~~Chili sauce with pulp and seeds homogeneously ground together with the addition of particles of chili pulp, flakes and pieces and seeds distributed in the sauce.~~
- (c) ~~Chili sauce with crushed pulp and seeds as separate layers or distributed in the sauce.~~
- (d) ~~Chili sauce with only pulp or crushed pulp or both.~~

2.2.2 *Other styles*

Any other presentation of the product should be permitted provided that the product:

- (a) is sufficiently distinctive from other forms of presentation laid down in the Standard;
- (b) meets all other requirements of the Standard, as applicable; and
- (c) is adequately described on the label to avoid confusing or misleading the consumer.

3. ESSENTIAL COMPOSITION AND QUALITY FACTORS

3.1 Composition

3.1.1 *Basic Ingredients*

Product covered by this standard shall consist of the following ingredients:

- (a) fresh chili (*Capsicum spp.*) or processed chili such as chili powder ground from dried chili, roasted chili, ground chili, chili preserved in vinegar or in brine **or frozen**;
- (b) **fresh chili/peppers (*Capsicum spp.*) whole or pieces or pepper mash**
- (c) vinegar or other permitted acid;
- (d) **edible** salt;
- (e) water.

3.1.2 *Other Permitted Ingredients*

The following optional ingredients may also be used in certain product:

- (a) **Fresh or process, whole, pieces or pulp of fruits such as** mango, papaya, tamarind and/or others fruits;
- (b) **Fresh or process, whole, pieces or pulp of vegetables such as** tomato, garlic, onion, carrot, sweet potato, yellow pumpkin and/or others vegetables;
- (c) spices and herbs;

- (d) sugars and/or other foodstuffs with sweetening properties such as honey;
- (e) chili extract;
- (f) other edible ingredients as appropriate to the product.

3.2 Quality criteria

3.2.1 General Requirements

(a) Colour, Flavour, Odour and Texture

Chili sauce should have normal colour, flavour, and odour, corresponding to the type of raw materials used and should possess texture characteristic of the product.

(b) [Ash

The total ash shall not exceed 3.5 % m/m.]

(c) [pH

The pH of the product shall not exceed 4.]

Or

[Acidity % Not less than 1.0 percent]

(d) [Total Soluble Solids

Chili Sauce shall contain a minimum of [25%] or [15%] or [8%] total soluble solids]

3.2.2 Definition of Defects

Foreign vegetal matter means any vegetable part (such as, but not limited to, chili pedicels, leaves, calyxes and garlic stems) that does not pose any hazard to human health but affects the overall appearance of the final product.

3.2.3 Defects and Allowances

The product shall be practically free from dark specks or scale-like particles, discoloured seeds or pieces of abnormally discoloured ingredients and foreign vegetal matter excluding the dark specks or dark particles that are obtained from the natural process of the sauce, for example in the roasting process.

3.3 Classification of "defectives"

A container that fails to meet one or more of the applicable quality requirements, as set out in Section 3.2 should be considered as a "defective".

3.4 Lot acceptance

A lot should be considered as meeting the applicable quality requirements referred to in Section 3.2 when the number of "defectives" as defined in Section 3.3 does not exceed the acceptance number (c) of the appropriate sampling plan with an Acceptable Quality Level (AQL) of 6.5.

4. FOOD ADDITIVES

~~Only those food additive classes listed below are technologically justified and may be used in products covered by this Standard. Within each additive class, only those food additives listed below, or referred to, may be used and only for the functions, and within limits, specified.~~

~~4.1 Acidity regulators, antioxidants, colours, flavour enhancers, preservatives, sweeteners and thickeners listed in Table 3 of the General Standard for Food Additives (CODEX STAN 192-1995) are acceptable for use in food conforming to this standard.~~

4.1 Acidity regulators, antioxidants, colours, flavour enhancers, preservatives, sweeteners, **emulsifier, stabilizer** and thickeners **used in accordance with Tables 1 and 2 of the General Standard of Food Additives in food category 12.6.2 (Non-emulsified sauces e.g. ketchup, cheese sauce, cream sauce, brown gravy) or listed in Table 3 of the General Standard for Food Additives are acceptable for use in foods conforming to this standard.**

4.2 Acidity regulators

INS No.	Food Additive	Maximum level
[334	L(+)-Tartaric acid	5000 mg/kg (as tartrate)
[335(i)	Monosodium tartrate	

		(singly or in combination)
[335(ii)]	Sodium L(+)-tartrate	
[336(i)]	Monopotassium tartrate	
[336(ii)]	Dipotassium tartrate	
[337]	Potassium sodium L(+)-tartrate	
{452(i)}	Sodium polyphosphate	1000 mg/kg} (as phosphorus)

4.3 Antioxidants

INS No.	Food Additive	Maximum level
307a	Tocopherol, d-alpha-	600 mg/kg
307b	Tocopherol concentrate, mixed	(singly or in combination)
307c	Tocopherol, dl-alpha-	
{320	Butylated hydroxyanisole	100 mg/kg}
321	Butylated hydroxytoluene	100 mg/kg}
386	Disodium ethylene diamine tetra acetate	75 mg/kg}

4.4 Colours

INS No.	Food Additive	Maximum level
400(i)	Curcumin	GMP
401(i)	Riboflavin, synthetic	350 mg/kg
401(ii)	Riboflavin, 5'-phosphate sodium	(singly or in combination)
[102	Tartrazine	100 mg/kg]
410	Sunset yellow FCF	300 mg/kg}
{120	Carmines	50 mg/kg}
424	Ponceau (4R) (cochineal red A)	50 mg/kg}
[127	Erythrosine	50 mg/kg]
429	Allura Red AC	300 mg/kg}
433	Brilliant blue, FCF	100 mg/kg}
{141(i)	Chlorophylls, copper complexes	30 mg/kg (as Cu)}
{150c	Caramel III – ammonia process	1500 mg/kg}
{150d	Caramel IV – sulphite ammonia process	1500 mg/kg}
[155	Brown HT	50 mg/kg]
160a (ii)	Carotenes, beta (vegetable)	2000 mg/kg}
[160b(i)	Annatto extracts, bixin based	10 mg/kg]
{160d(i)	Lycopene (synthetic)	390 mg/kg}

4.5 Preservatives

INS No.	Food Additive	Maximum level
---------	---------------	---------------

210	Benzoic acid	1000 mg/kg (as benzoic acid) (singly or in combination)
211	Sodium benzoate	
212	Potassium benzoate	
213	Calcium benzoate	
200	Sorbic acid	1000 mg/kg (as sorbic acid) (singly or in combination)
201	Sodium sorbate	
202	Potassium sorbate	
203	Calcium sorbate	
220	Sulfur dioxide	300 mg/kg (as residual SO ₂) (singly or in combination)
221	Sodium sulfite	
222	Sodium hydrogen sulfite	
223	Sodium metabisulfite	
224	Potassium metabisulfite	
225	Potassium sulfite	
539	Sodium thiosulfate	1000 mg/kg
214	Ethyl parahydroxybenzoates	
218	Methyl para-hydroxybenzoates	

4.6 Emulsifiers

INS No.	Food Additive	Maximum level
432	Polyoxyethylene (20) sorbitan monolaurate	5 000 mg/kg (singly or in combination)
433	Polyoxyethylene (20) sorbitan monooleate	
434	Polyoxyethylene (20) sorbitan monopalmitate	
435	Polyoxyethylene (20) sorbitan monoesterate	
{473	Sucrose esters of fatty acids	5 000 mg/kg}
{475	Polyglycerol esters of fatty acids	10 000 mg/kg}
[477	Propylene glycol esters of fatty acids	20 000 mg/kg]

4.7 Sweeteners

INS No.	Food Additive	Maximum level
951	Aspartame	350 mg/kg
950	Acesulfame potassium	1000 mg/kg
955	Sucralose	450 mg/kg
{954(i)	Saccharin	150 mg/kg}

{954(ii)}	Calcium saccharin	(singly or in combination)
{954(iii)}	Potassium saccharin	
{954(iv)}	Sodium saccharin	

4.8 Stabilizers

INS No.	Food Additive	Maximum level
472e	Diacetyltartaric and fatty acid esters of glycerol	10 000 mg/kg

4.9 Thickeners

INS No.	Food Additive	Maximum level
[405]	Propylene glycol alginate	8 000 mg/kg]

4.10 Flavourings

The flavourings used in products covered by this standard ~~shall~~ **should** comply with the *Guidelines for the Use of Flavourings* (CXG 66-2008).

5. CONTAMINANTS

5.1 ~~Pesticides Residues~~

5.1 The product covered by this Standard shall comply with the maximum residue limits for pesticides established by the Codex Alimentarius Commission.

5.2 ~~Other contaminants~~

5.2 The product covered by this Standard shall comply with the Maximum Levels of the *General Standard for Contaminants and Toxins in Food and Feed* (CXS 193-1995).

6. HYGIENE

6.1 It is recommended that the products covered by the provisions of this Standard be prepared and handled in accordance with the appropriate sections of the *General Principles of Food Hygiene* (CXCP 1-1969), the *Code of Hygienic Practice for Low and Acidified Low Acid Canned Foods* (CXC 23-1979) and other relevant Codex texts such as Codes of Hygienic Practice and Codes of Practice.

6.2 The product should comply with any microbiological criteria established in accordance with the *Principles and Guidelines for the Establishment and Application of Microbiological Criteria related to Foods* (CXG 21-1997)⁵.

7. WEIGHTS AND MEASURES

7.1 Fill of container

7.1.1 Minimum Fill

(a) The container should be well filled with the product which should occupy not less than 90% (minus any necessary head space according to good manufacturing practices) of the water capacity of the container. The water capacity of the container is the volume of distilled water at 20°C which the sealed container will hold when completely filled.

(b) Flexible containers should be filled as full as commercially practicable.

7.1.2 Classification of "Defectives"

⁵ For products that are rendered commercially sterile in accordance with the *Code of Hygienic Practice for Low and Acidified Low Acid Canned Foods* (CXC 23-1979), microbiological criteria are not recommended as they do not offer benefit in providing the consumer with a food that is safe and suitable for consumption.

A container that fails to meet the requirement for minimum fill of Section 7.1.1 should be considered as a “defective”.

7.1.3 Lot Acceptance

A lot shall be considered as meeting the requirement of Section 7.1.1 when the number of “defectives”, as defined in Section 7.1.2, does not exceed the acceptance number (c) of the appropriate sampling plan with an AQL of 6.5.

8. LABELLING

The product covered by the provisions of this Standard shall be labelled in accordance with the latest edition of the *General Standard for the Labelling of Prepackaged Foods* (CXS 1-1985). In addition, the following specific provisions apply:

8.1 Name of the product

8.1.1 The name of the product shall be “Chili sauce”, “Sweet chili sauce” or other names in accordance with the composition and the law and custom of the country in which the product is sold and in the manner not to mislead the consumer.

8.1.2 The level of chili pungency (heat value) may be declared in conjunction with, or in close proximity to, the name of the product in a manner not to mislead the consumer, and must be accepted by or be acceptable to competent authorities of the country where the product is sold.

8.1.3 If other permitted ingredients, as defined in Section 3.1.2, alters the flavour characteristic of the product, the name of the product shall be accompanied by the term “flavoured with X” or X flavoured” as appropriate.

8.1 bis DECLARATION OF THE PERCENTAGE OF NATURAL TOTAL SOLUBLE SOLIDS

The percentage solids may be included on the label in either of the following manners:

(a) The minimum percentage of natural total soluble solids (example: “Minimum Solids - 20%”).

(b) A range within 2% of the natural total soluble solids (example: “Solids - 20% to 22%”).

8.2 Labelling of non-retail containers

Information for non-retail containers shall be given either on the container or in accompanying documents, except that the name of the product, lot identification, and the name and address of the manufacturer, packer, distributor or importer, as well as storage instructions shall appear on the container. However, lot identification, and the name and address of the manufacturer, packer, distributor or importer may be replaced by an identification mark, provided that such a mark is clearly identifiable with the accompanying documents.

9. METHODS OF ANALYSIS AND SAMPLING⁶

For checking the compliance with this standard, the methods of analysis and sampling contained in the Recommended Methods of Analysis and Sampling (CXS 234-1999) relevant to the provisions in this standard, shall be used.⁷

Provision	Method	Principle	Type
pH	AOAC 981.12 Codex General Method for processed fruits and vegetables)	Potentiometry	III
Fill of containers	CAC/RM 46-1972 (Codex General Method for processed fruits and vegetables)	Weighing	I

⁶ The listing of methods of analysis and sampling will be removed when the standard is adopted by CAC and included in CXS 234-1999.

⁷ The Codex Secretariat proposed to insert the texts and footnote 6 according to the Procedural Manual. This note will be removed when the standard is adopted.

--	--	--	--

Sampling Plans

The appropriate inspection level is selected as follows:

Inspection level I – Normal sampling

Inspection level II – Dispute (Codex referee purpose sample size), enforcement or need for better lot estimate

SAMPLING PLAN 1
(Inspection Level I, AQL = 6.5)

NET WEIGHT IS EQUAL TO OR LESS THAN 1 KG (2.2 LB)		
Lot Size (N)	Sample Size (n)	Acceptance Number (c)
4,800 or less	6	1
4,801 – 24,000	13	2
24,001– 48,000	21	3
48,001- 84,000	29	4
84,001 – 144,000	38	5
144,001– 240,000	48	6
more than 240,000	60	7
NET WEIGHT IS GREATER THAN 1 KG (2.2 LB) BUT NOT MORE THAN 4.5 KG (10 LB)		
Lot Size (N)	Sample Size (n)	Acceptance Number (c)
2,400 or less	6	1
2,401 – 15,000	13	2
15,001– 24,000	21	3
24,001– 42,000	29	4
42,001– 72,000	38	5
72,001 – 120,000	48	6
more than 120,000	60	7
NET WEIGHT GREATER THAN 4.5 KG (10 LB)		
Lot Size (N)	Sample Size (n)	Acceptance Number (c)
600 or less	6	1
601 – 2,000	13	2
2,001– 7,200	21	3
7,201 – 15,000	29	4
15,001– 24,000	38	5
24,001– 42,000	48	6

more than 42,000	60	7
------------------	----	---

SAMPLING PLAN 2
(Inspection Level II, AQL = 6.5)

NET WEIGHT IS EQUAL TO OR LESS THAN 1 KG (2.2 LB)		
Lot Size (N)	Sample Size (n)	Acceptance Number (c)
4,800 or less	13	2
4,801 – 24,000	21	3
24,001– 48,000	29	4
48,001- 84,000	38	5
84,001 – 144,000	48	6
144,001– 240,000	60	7
more than 240,000	72	8
NET WEIGHT IS GREATER THAN 1 KG (2.2 LB) BUT NOT MORE THAN 4.5 KG (10 LB)		
Lot Size (N)	Sample Size (n)	Acceptance Number (c)
2,400 or less	13	2
2,401 – 15,000	21	3
15,001– 24,000	29	4
24,001– 42,000	38	5
42,001– 72,000	48	6
72,001 – 120,000	60	7
more than 120,000	72	8
NET WEIGHT GREATER THAN 4.5 KG (10 LB)		
Lot Size (N)	Sample Size (n)	Acceptance Number (c)
600 or less	13	2
601 – 2,000	21	3
2,001– 7,200	29	4
7,201 – 15,000	38	5
15,001– 24,000	48	6
24,001– 42,000	60	7
more than 42,000	72	8

Analysis of Comments received on the First Draft

Table 1: Comments on Proposed Draft Codex Standard for Chili Sauce
(First Round of Consultation)

Section	Country Name	Comments	Remarks/Justification
Introduction- Para 5	Mexico	Use of chilli sauce examples should be named, because it can be the hot sauce that it's <i>added</i> to food (the main ingredients described at the document , seems to be this kind) or chilli sauce used as <i>ingredient</i> of the food such as "enchiladas" (Mexico); or even define if it's going to be used for both.	As mentioned in section 2.1: "product definition", chili sauce is the product intended for use as seasoning and condiment. And it will cover all chili sauces which are prepared from <i>capsicum spp.</i>
3.1.2 Other Permitted Ingredients (d) sugars;	Thailand	Thailand proposes to consider using the standardized text applying to Codex standards for canned fruits and vegetables (e.g. Codex Standard for Certain Canned Vegetables) CXS 297 – 2009, Rev 2011, 2015(.as follows: “(d) sugars and/or other foodstuffs with sweetening properties such as honey;”	Included in the revised draft in order to make the document consistent with standardized text applying to Codex standards for canned fruits and vegetables.
Section 4: Food Additive	Thailand	According to the format for Codex commodity standards and in particular for the standards for processed fruits and vegetables, Thailand proposes to amend the text to read as follows: “ <i>Only those food additive classes listed below are technically justified and may be used in products covered by this Standard. Within each additive class, and where permitted according to the Table 1,2 and 3 of the General Standard for Food Additives(CODEX STAN 192-1995), only those food additives listed below, or referred to, may be used and only for the functions, and within limits, specified therein.</i> 4.1 <i>Acidity regulators, antioxidants, colours, flavour enhancers, preservatives, sweeteners, <u>emulsifier, stabilizer</u> and thickeners used in accordance with Tables 1 and 2 of the General Standard of Food Additives in food category 12.6.2 Non-emulsified sauces) e.g . ketchup, cheese sauce, cream sauce, brown gravy (or listed in Table 3 of the General Standard for Food Additives are acceptable for use in foods conforming to this standard’.</i>	Included in the revised draft with some modification as mentioned below to align with layout followed in the latest adopted standard in CCPFV. <u>4.1 Only those food additive classes listed below are technically justified and may be used in products covered by this Standard.</u> <u>4.2 Acidity regulators, antioxidants, colours, flavour enhancers, preservatives, sweeteners, emulsifier, stabilizer and thickeners used in accordance with Tables 1 and 2 of the General Standard of Food Additives in food category 12.6.2 Non-emulsified sauces)e.g .ketchup, cheese sauce, cream sauce, brown gravy (or listed in Table 3 of the General Standard for Food Additives are acceptable for use in foods</u>

			<u>conforming to this standard”.</u>
Section 4.3: Antioxidants	Mexico	The Tertiary Butylhydroquinone (TBHQ) can also be placed as an antioxidant in a proportion of 200 ppm (according to FDA), since some ingredients allowed in the chilli sauces (such as fruits, or oily extracts) can "oxidize" and change color, flavor or aroma to the sauce.	All food additive classes as described in section 4.1 of draft1 are allowed to be used in accordance with Tables 1 and 2 of the General Standard of Food Additives in food category 12.6.2 Non-emulsified sauces (e.g. ketchup, cheese sauce, cream sauce, brown gravy)or listed in Table 3 of the General Standard for Food Additives are acceptable for use in foods conforming to this standard.” Provisions of food additive which have been strikethrough shall be governed by GSFA in order to make GSFA as single reference point for food additive provisions.
Section 4.4: Colors	Mexico	It could be included and maintained some colours that other legislations have approved in similar products or that can be used as GMP for example according to FDA curcumin, yellow 6, b-carotene, paprika oleoresin, etc.	
Section 4.5: Preservatives	Mexico	Some processes can be in cold and when placing products such as fruit or vegetables in the sauces it is probable that some preservatives would be required, we suggest using the most common and with a maximum level of use. You can leave for example the first 12 or 13 of the list and choose the most convenient according to the product.	
Section 4.9: Thickeners	Mexico	Other thickeners can be added and can be used according to GMP, for example gums (Xanthan, guar,) and modified starches	
Section 4.7: Sweeteners	Thailand	Section 4.7 Sweeteners Editorial: INS No. of Saccharins should be 954 (i)-(iv)	
Section 4.10: Flavourings	Thailand	Section 4.10 Flavourings Thailand proposes to replace the word “shall” with “should” to be consistent with the statement recommended in the format for codex commodity standards as mentioned in Codex Alimentarius Commission- Procedural Manual)26 th edition(as follows: <i>“The flavourings used in products covered by this standard shall should comply with the Guidelines for the Use of Flavourings- CAC/GL 66-2008</i>	Included in the revised draft.
	Iran	1-In clause 5 it needs to mention the reference for maximum residue limits 2- Measuring total ash should be added as a factor for controlling external materials	Current language used in the draft is in alignment with layout followed in the latest adopted standard in CCPFV. Also, there is no reference codex document for maximum residue limits for pesticides; however, it is available as “pesticide database” in “codex online database”.
	Jamaica	Section Comment 4.8 Will a different stabilizer be allowed in the product? 7.1 Move up to section three to reduce repetition General comments:	All food additive classes including stabilizers as described in section 4.1 are allowed to be used in accordance with Tables 1 and 2 of the General Standard of Food Additives in food

		<p>Have the committee considered a general standard for hot sauce instead of one that is specific to chilli sauce? For example Jamaica produces hot pepper sauce?, for scotch bonnet peppers.</p>	<p>category 12.6.2 Non-emulsified sauces (e.g. ketchup, cheese sauce, cream sauce, brown gravy)or listed in Table 3 of the General Standard for Food Additives are acceptable for use in foods conforming to this standard.”</p> <p>Provisions of food additive which have been strikethrough shall be governed by GSFA in order to make GSFA as single reference point for food additive provisions.</p> <p>As per the proposed draft standard, Chili sauce prepared with capsicum spp. as basic ingredient and meeting other parameters of the standard will fall under this category.</p>
--	--	---	---

Analysis of Comments received on the Second DraftTable 2: Comments on Proposed Draft Codex Standard for Chili Sauce(2nd round of consultation)

Section	Country Name	Comments	Remarks/Justification
2.1 Product Definition	US	Chili sauce is the product: (e) Prepared from chili peppers (<i>Capsicum spp.</i>) fresh, or processed chili such as chili powder ground from dried chili, roasted chili, ground chili , chili preserved in vinegar or in brine (f) prepared from the edible portion of sound and clean raw materials referred to in Section 3.1 below which are mixed and prepared to obtain the desired quality and characteristics; (g) intended for use as seasoning and condiment;	Slightly modified text has been included appropriately in the final revised draft while ensuring there is no repetition.
		(h) processed by physical means or heat, in an appropriate manner, before or after being hermetically sealed in a container, so as to prevent spoilage.	The suggested insertion of the term physical means was to cover the process of pickling in the draft standard however, the process of pickling is not described under the food category 12.6.2 as per GSFA.
		Chili Sauce shall contain a minimum of [25%] natural total soluble solids	Included in square brackets in section 3.4- quality criteria
2.2 Styles	US	(e) Chili sauce with pulp and seeds homogeneously ground together. (f) Chili sauce with pulp and seeds homogeneously ground together pulp and seeds with the addition of particles of chili pulp, flakes and pieces and seeds distributed in the sauce. (g) Chili sauce with crushed pulp and seeds as separate layers or distributed in the sauce. (h) Chili sauce with only pulp or crushed or both <u>finely cut chiles or any combination thereof</u>	General: The term "chili sauce" is deleted as suggested. 2.2 (b)- The deletion of term homogeneously is not carried out since the pulp and seeds are required to be homogeneously ground to make a desirable sauce while adding any particles of chili pulp, flakes and pieces and seeds 2.2 (d)- finely cut chilies or any combination thereof is already

			captured appropriately in 2.2 (b)
3.1.1 Basic Ingredients	US	<p>3.1.1 Basic Ingredients</p> <p>Product covered by this standard shall consist of the following ingredients:</p> <p>(f) <u>chili/peppers (Capsicum spp.) freshwhole or pieces or pepper mash</u></p> <p>(g) <u>dried chili in whole pieces and powdered forms such as chili powder ground from dried chili, roasted chili, ground chili ,</u></p> <p>(h) chili preserved in vinegar or in brine <u>or frozen;</u></p> <p>(i) vinegar or other permitted acid <u>Food Additives</u></p> <p>(j) <u>edible</u> salt;</p> <p>(k) water.</p>	Slightly modified text has been included appropriately in the final revised draft while ensuring there is no repetition.
3.1.2 Other Permitted Ingredients		<p>3.1.2 Other Permitted Ingredients</p> <p>The following optional ingredients may also be used in certain product:</p> <p>(g) <u>Fresh or process, whole, pieces or pulp of fruits such as mango, papaya, tamarind and/or others</u> fruits;</p> <p>(h) <u>Fresh or process, whole, pieces or pulp of vegetables such as</u> tomato, garlic, onion, carrot, sweet potato, yellow pumpkin and others <u>vegetables</u></p> <p>(i) Spices and herbs;</p> <p>(j) Sugars <u>and/or other foodstuffs with sweetening properties such as honey; as defined in the Codex Standard for Sugars</u></p> <p>(k) chili extract;</p> <p>(l) other edible ingredients as appropriate to the product.</p>	Suggestions are included in the final revised draft standard.
3.2 Quality Criteria		<p>3.2 <u>Minimum Content of Fruit Ingredients</u></p> <p><u>The total soluble solids (Brix) shall be not less than 15 %.</u></p> <p><u>3.4 Quality criteria</u></p>	Included in square brackets as there is no consensus.

		<p>3.4.1 General Requirements</p> <p>3.4.1 Colour: <u>Chili sauce should have normal Colour, corresponding to the type of raw materials used.</u></p> <p>3.4.2 Flavour and odour: <u>Chili sauce should have a good distinct flavour and odour corresponding to the characteristic of the product.</u></p> <p>3.4.3 Consistency and texture: <u>The product shall possess good consistence and texture corresponding to the characteristic of the product. The chili sauce shall be easily poured from the container and when emptied form the container to a flat surface forms a moderately mounded mass and shows not more than a slight separation of free liquid at the edges of the mass.</u></p> <p>3.4.4 Ash <u>The total ash shall not exceed 3.5 % m/m.</u></p> <p>3.4.5 pH <u>The pH of the product shall not exceed 4.</u></p>	
3.2.2 Definition of Defects		Foreign—vegetal Extraneous matter means any vegetable part (such as, but not limited to, chili pedicels, leaves, calyxes and garlic stems) that does not pose any hazard to human health but affects the overall appearance of the final product.	Extraneous matter is broader term which may encompass vegetal and non-vegetal matters; however, here only vegetal matters are referred.
4. Food Additive		<p>4. FOOD ADDITIVES</p> <p>Only those food additive classes listed below are technologically justified and may be used in products covered by this Standard. Within each additive class, only those food additives listed below, or referred to, may be used and only for the functions, and within limits, specified.</p>	Text deleted in the final revised draft as suggested.
	Iran	Preservatives not to be allowed	Provision for preservatives is not deleted since preservatives are technologically justified to be added in the chili sauce.
8.1 Name of the product	US	8.1 Name of the product	The proposed additional text is

		<p>The name of the product shall be</p> <p>(a) “Chili sauce”, “Sweet chili sauce” or other names in accordance with the composition.</p> <p>(b) <u>Another denomination usually employed in the country</u></p> <p><u>(c) If an added ingredient, as defined in Section 3.1.2, alters the flavour characteristic of the product, the name of the food shall be accompanied by the term “flavoured with X” or “X flavoured” as appropriate.</u></p>	more or less already reflected in the section 8.1.1 to 8.1.3.
Addition of new provision	US	<p><u>8.3 DECLARATION OF THE PERCENTAGE OF NATURAL TOTAL SOLUBLE SOLIDS</u></p> <p><u>The percentage solids may be included on the label in either of the following manners:</u></p> <p><u>(a) The minimum percentage of natural total soluble solids (example: “Minimum Solids - 20%”).</u></p> <p><u>(b) A range within 2% of the natural total soluble solids (example: “Solids - 20% to 22%”).</u></p>	Section on declaration has been inserted in the final revised draft and put in square brackets for further discussion in the committee.
<u>Recommendation i: To consider the draft codex standard for chili sauce attached as Annex I</u>	Thailand	<p>Thailand would like to provide the following comments on Section 4. of the proposed draft standard.</p> <p>According to the template laid down in the Codex Procedural Manual, there are two possible options for the presentation of food additives provisions in commodity standard as follows:</p> <p>Option 1:</p> <p>[Food additive functional class]es [(used in accordance with Tables 1 and 2 of the <i>General Standard for Food Additives</i>) CODEX STAN 192-1995 (in food category)]ies ([number] [food category name]s [(or listed in Table 3 of the General Standard are acceptable for use in foods conforming to this Standard.</p> <p>Option 2:</p> <p>Only those food additive classes listed below are technologically justified and may be used in products covered by this Standard. Within each additive class only those food additives listed below, or referred to, may be used and only for the functions, and within limits,</p>	Included in the final revised draft appropriately while also considering comments received from other countries as well.

		<p>specified.</p> <p>As EWG feels that it is necessary to explicit list food additives in the standard) i.e .list of Acidity regulators, Antioxidant, Colours, Preservatives, Emulsifiers, Sweeteners, Stabilizers and Thickeners(, therefore option 2 should be followed. In this case current list of all additives should be retained.</p> <p>In addition, the proposed revision list of Food Additives with associated functional classes and acceptable maximum use levels that would be forwarded to the Committee on Food Additives for consideration should not be included as part of the standard.The proposed revisions, once adopted by the Commission and incorporated into the General Standard for Food Additives, then option 1 would be appropriate.</p> <p>We, therefore propose to amend Section 4. to read as follows:</p> <p>4. FOOD ADDITIVES</p> <p>Only those food additive classes listed below are technologically justified and may be used in products covered by this Standard .Within each additive class, only those food additives listed below, or referred to, may be used and only for the functions, and within limits, specified</p> <p>4.1 Acidity regulators, antioxidants, colours, flavour enhancers, preservatives, sweeteners and thickeners listed in Table 3 of the General Standard for Food Additives (CODEX STAN 192-1995) are acceptable for use in food conforming to this standard.</p>	
<p>Recommendation ii:To consider further elaboration on quality parameters of chili sauce by including parameters such as TSS, acidity and Ash</p>	<p>Thailand</p>	<p>We would like to reiterate our previous comments that there is no need to further elaboration on quality parameters of chili sauce by including parameters such as TSS, acidity and Chili content .</p> <p><u>Rationale:</u></p> <p>The required characteristics of chili sauces and the combination of different types of acids are depending on consumer preference, therefore it is difficult to regulate TSS and acidity values in this product .</p> <p>Regarding chili content, there are many levels of</p>	<p>Parameters such as TSS, Acidity, Ash content have been put in square brackets for further discussions in the committee meeting.</p>

		<p>spiciness for chili sauce in trade depending on varieties of chili and consumer preference, so it is very difficult to specify chili content in this product .</p> <p>So far, we are not aware of international trade requirements for checking ash in the product. Thus, Thailand does not support to set the level of Ash. In addition, Ash analysis</p>	
Recommendation iii: To consider those provisions of food additive which have been strikethrough as the same shall be governed by GSFA in order to make GSFA as single reference point for food additive provisions.	Thailand	Please be informed that Curcumin 100)(has not yet been included in the GSFA.	
Recommendation iv : To consider requesting Codex Committee on Food Additive for inclusion and appropriate alignment of those provisions of food additives which are put in square brackets []with GSFA.	Thailand	<p>Food additives in square brackets are not used in Chili sauce production in Thailand.</p> <p>Please be noted that the request to CCFA should be accompanied with justification.</p>	
Recommendation v: To consider requesting Codex Committee on Food Additive for inclusion of notes to GSFA for allowance of specific levels of those food additives which are put in curly bracket { } under section 4 .	Thailand	<p>Food additives in curly brackets are not used in Chili sauce production in Thailand.</p> <p>Please be noted that the request to CCFA should be accompanied with justification .</p>	

Appendix IV

List of Participants

EWG Chair: Perumal Karthikeyan, Food Safety and Standards Authority of India, India

S.No.	Group Members	Organisation and Country
1.	Andre-bispo	Ministério da Agricultura, Brasil
2.	Tania Daniela fosado Soriano	Secretaría de Economía, México
3.	Nurul Syuhada	FSQD, MOH, Malaysia
4.	Zohre Pouretedal	Isiri, Iran
5.	Tafara Treshawna Smith	Bureau of Standards Jamaica, Jamaica
6.	Korwadee phonkliang	Ministry of Agriculture and Cooperatives, Thailand
7.	Susan Karin Dioses Cordova	Perú
8.	Yoye Yu	MAFRA, Republic of Korea
9.	Eun Mi, Park	Ministry of Food and Drug Safety, Republic of Korea
10.	Ah-Young Yoo	Ministry of Food and Drug Safety, Republic of Korea
11.	Jiyoun Jeong	Korea Food Research Institute, Republic of Korea
12.	Maria Theresa C. Cerbolles	Food and Drug Administration, Department of Health, Philippines
13.	Sophie Gallagher	Department Environment Food and Rural Affairs UK
14.	Michelle McQuillan	DEFRA , United Kingdom
15.	Dorian A. LaFond	International Standards Coordinator AMS Specialty Crops Program, USA
16.	Codex Contact Point of India	Food Safety and Standards Authority of India, India