

CODEX ALIMENTARIUS COMMISSION



Food and Agriculture
Organization of the
United Nations



World Health
Organization

E

Viale delle Terme di Caracalla, 00153 Rome, Italy - Tel: (+39) 06 57051 - E-mail: codex@fao.org - www.codexalimentarius.org

Agenda Item 2.2

CX/EXEC 24/87/2 Add.1
October 2024

JOINT FAO/WHO FOOD STANDARDS PROGRAMME EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE OF THE CODEX ALIMENTARIUS COMMISSION

Eighty-seventh Session

FAO Headquarters, Rome, Italy

18-22 November 2024

CRITICAL REVIEW - PART II¹

Note: For general information about the critical review and the critical review for CCPR54 and CCLAC23, please see CX/EXEC 24/87/2. For the critical review for CCRVDF27 and CCFL48, please see CX/EXEC 24/87/2 Add.2.

1. Structure of appendices

The work of the different committees is addressed in separate appendices. The structure of the appendices for each committee is as follows:

1. General information on the committee and session
2. Overall comments (Codex Secretariat/Chairperson)
3. Status of work items (Overview)
4. Specific comments on individual work items (Codex Secretariat/Chairperson)

2. List of appendices

Appendix 1: Codex Committee on Food Import and Export Inspection and Certification Systems, 27th Session (CCFICS27)

Appendix 2: Codex Committee on Nutrition and Foods for Special Dietary uses, 44th Session (CCNFSDU44)

Appendix 3: Codex Committee on Fish and Fishery Products, 36th Session (CCFFP36)

¹ This document addresses CCFICS27, CCNFSDU44 and CCFFP36

Appendix 1

1. General

Committee	Codex Committee on Food Imports and Exports Inspection and Certification Systems (CCFICS)		
Host	Australia	Chairperson	Mr Tom Black
Session reported on	CCFICS27	16-20 September 2024	
Next Session	CCFICS28	October 2026	
Report	<u>REP24/FICS</u>		

2. Overall comments

<p>Secretariat's comments:</p> <p>CCFICS27 was successfully convened as a physical session with the possibility of remote participation. The attendance was very good with 71 Members and 11 Observer organizations and United Nations agencies attending.</p> <p>A physical working group (PWG) was held the day prior to the start of the session to prepare for the plenary discussions on the consolidation of the equivalence guidelines.</p> <p>CCFICS27 had a full agenda with good and constructive discussions. CCFICS consensually agreed to forward to CAC47 for adoption at Step 5 the draft guidelines on the prevention and control of food fraud.</p> <p>Following thorough deliberations and despite the progress made on the draft texts, CCFICS27 agreed to return the draft consolidated guidelines related to equivalence as well as the draft revision and updating of the <i>Principles for Traceability/Product Tracing as a Tool Within a Food Inspection and Certification System</i> (CXG 60-2006) for further redrafting.</p> <p>CCFICS27 also considered four proposals for new work, of which two will be amendments and/or revision to existing guidelines leading to new annexes. After careful considerations with some edits being introduced, and taking into account the fact that CCFICS28 will be held more than two years following CCFICS27, CCFICS27 consensually agreed to forward all four proposals to CAC47 for approval.</p> <p>In light of CCFICS's relatively heavy workload, the importance of organizing virtual working group meetings between CCFICS27 and CCFICS28 on the various topic in the step process was emphasized. The possibility of adding one day of plenary discussion at CCFICS28 will be considered.</p> <p>Chairperson's comments:</p> <p>The Chairperson concurs with the Secretariat's comments. CCFICS27 held highly collaborative and inclusive discussions. The committee made good progress on the guidelines in the step process, even if two did not move forward. For the two guidelines that were returned to Step 2 for redrafting, discussions at CCFICS27 (text revisions undertaken in the plenary and drafting instructions/considerations) will be very useful for the electronic working groups (EWGs), and I expect CCFICS28 will be in a good position to consider moving both guidelines forward in the step process. The willingness of parties to compromise on key issues allowed the committee to have very productive discussions on the Food Fraud guidance. The outstanding issues to be resolved are manageable and CCFICS28 should be in a good position to consider finalising this guideline too.</p> <p>Noting the level of advancement of these 3 pieces of work, it is timely to see CCFICS27 agree to a range of new projects that will address important emerging issues, and some which are revisiting existing guidance to make improvements to assist countries with current issues. A wide range of Members have stepped forward to take leadership of the new work. The intent of having a greater focus on the Emerging Issues process between CCFICS26 and CCFICS27 was to place CCFICS in a better position to make holistic decisions about what new work to take on. This was successful and CCFICS27 was able to make very deliberate decisions about its new work program.</p>
--

3. Status of work items

Topic	Job number	Target year	Recommendation of CCFICS27
For decision by the Commission			
1. Draft guidelines on the prevention and control of food fraud	N06-2021	CCFICS28	Adoption at Step 5
2. New work on developing guidance on appeals mechanism in the context of rejection of imported food	-	-	Approval
3. New work on developing guidance on standardization of the representation of sanitary requirements	-	-	Approval
4. New work on revising the <i>Principles and guidelines for the exchange of information between importing and exporting countries to support the trade in food</i> (CXG 89-2016)	-	-	Approval
5. New work on developing high-level guiding principles for the digitalisation of National Food Control Systems (NFCSSs)	-	-	Approval
For monitoring			
6. Draft consolidated guidelines related to equivalence	N01-2019	CCFICS28	Step 2/3
7. Draft revision and updating of the <i>Principles for Traceability/Product Tracing as a Tool Within a Food Inspection and Certification System</i> (CXG 60-2006)	N05-2023	CCFICS28	Step 2/3
For information			
8. Review and update of the list of emerging global issues	Ongoing		

4. Specific comments

1. Draft guidelines on the prevention and control of food fraud, Paragraph 61, Appendix II
<p>Status and Secretariat's comments:</p> <p>CCFICS27 made significant progress in building consensus on sections 1, 2, 4, and 5 and resolved the substantial issues. Following a constructive discussion, and in the spirit of compromise, CCFICS27 recognized that matters related to intellectual property were outside the scope of guidelines. As a result, the following statement was inserted at the end of paragraph 3 of the Scope: "Issues related to intellectual property are not included in this document".</p> <p>CCFICS27 hence agreed to forward the draft guidelines on the prevention and control of food fraud to CAC47 for adoption at Step 5.</p> <p>CFICS27 also agreed to establish an EWG to further the work until CCFICS28. The EWG will also consider how feed for food producing animals is reflected and referenced throughout the guideline, taking into account other relevant Codex guidance.</p>
<p>Chairperson's comments:</p> <p>The Chairperson concurs with the Secretariat's comments. Key sticking points about the scope of the guidelines (intellectual property) were resolved quickly, which allowed the committee to work through the rest of the text. Outstanding parts of the guideline that were not completely resolved during plenary due to time, can all feasibly be resolved.</p>
2. New work on developing guidance on appeals mechanism in the context of rejection of imported food, Paragraph 86, Appendix III
<p>Status and Secretariat's comments:</p> <p>CCFICS27 noted a general support for a new work proposal on developing guidance on appeals mechanism in the context of rejection of imported food.</p> <p>It was agreed that the work would be an amendment and/or an annex to either the existing <i>Guidelines for the Exchange of Information between Countries on Rejections of Imported Foods</i> (CXG 25-1997) or the <i>Guidelines for Food Import Control Systems</i> (CXG 47-2003).</p> <p>It was proposed that the new work not only addresses an appeals mechanism, but also the opportunity for review of official decisions on consignments as mentioned in CXG 47-2003.</p> <p>CCFICS27 agreed to forward the new work proposal on developing guidance on appeals mechanism in the context of rejection of imported food to CAC47 for approval.</p>
<p>Chairperson's comments:</p> <p>The Chairperson concurs with the Secretariat's comments. There was consensus in the committee that this new work proposal, which had been updated since it was considered at CCFICS26, was in a good state and there was a need to update an existing text to provide more useful guidance to importing and exporting countries.</p>
3. New work on developing guidance on the standardization of the representation of sanitary requirements, Paragraph 91, Appendix IV
<p>Status and Secretariat's comments:</p> <p>Members expressed support for a new work on developing guidance on the standardization of the representation of sanitary requirements noting that it would help countries transition to the use of electronic certificates, which can simplify clearance processes and thereby promote food safety.</p> <p>CCFICS27 agreed to forward the new work proposal on developing guidance on the standardisation of representation of sanitary requirements to CAC47 for approval as new work.</p>
<p>Chairperson's comments:</p> <p>The Chairperson concurs with the Secretariat's comments. There was consensus in the committee to take forward this new work proposal, which had undergone significant recasting since CCFICS26, following a pilot project to demonstrate the feasibility of developing such guidance.</p>

4. New work on revising the *Principles and guidelines for the exchange of information between importing and exporting countries to support the trade in food* (CXG 89-2016), Paragraph 100, Appendix V

Status and Secretariat's comments:

CCFICS27 expressed support for the new work proposal on revising the *Principles and guidelines for the exchange of information between importing and exporting countries to support the trade in food* (CXG 89-2016) to develop principles and guidelines to harmonize the use (the drivers), development (content and format) and implementation (mechanisms including digitalization) of establishment listings, which could be annexed to CXG 89-2016. It was emphasised that this work should not result in increased requirements for such lists. Rather, the work should simplify and lessen the burden of establishment lists in order to decrease the requirements for data gathering.

CCFICS27 agreed to forward to CAC47 for approval the proposal for new work on revising the *Principles and guidelines for the exchange of information between importing and exporting countries to support the trade in food* (CXG 89-2016) to develop principles and guidelines to harmonize the use, development and implementation of establishment listings.

Chairperson's comments:

The Chairperson concurs with the Secretariat's comments. There was consensus in the committee that this new work proposal would fill a gap in the CCFICS texts to address a current issue being faced by exporting and importing countries.

5. New work on the development of high-level guiding principles for the digitalisation of National Food Control Systems (NFCSS), Paragraph 103, Appendix VI

Status and Secretariat's comments:

CCFICS27 expressed support for the new work proposal on the development of high-level guiding principles for the digitalisation of national food control systems (NFCSS) as it was timely and addressed both current and future needs of NFCSS.

CCFICS27 agreed to forward the project document on the development of high-level guiding principles for the digitalisation of NFCSS to CAC47 for approval as new work.

Chairperson's comments:

The Chairperson concurs with the Secretariat's comments. There was consensus in the committee that high-level guiding principles would provide a useful framework now and for future work related to digitalising parts of national food controls systems, and it was timely as some countries were already undergoing this digital change.

6. Draft consolidated guidelines related to equivalence, Paragraph 35

Status and Secretariat's comments:

The topic was extensively discussed, first in the PWG and then in plenary, and good progress was made with the draft text. In light of the extensive discussions and comments made and the need for outstanding issues to be resolved, CCFICS27 agreed to return the draft consolidated guidelines related to equivalence at Step 2 for redrafting, and circulation for comments at Step 3.

CCFICS27 agreed to establish an EWG to consider the outstanding issues, taking into account the comments and drafting changes made during the plenary discussions, the written comments contained in CX/FICS 24/27/4 Add.1, and the relevant CRDs.

Chairperson's comments:

The Chairperson concurs with the Secretariat's comments. The Committee was able to make good progress in revising the draft text during plenary and the committee provided clear drafting instructions/considerations for the EWG to take forward.

7. Draft revision and updating of the *Principles for Traceability/Product Tracing as a Tool Within a Food Inspection and Certification System* (CXG 60-2006), Paragraph 79

Status and Secretariat's comments:

The draft text was thoroughly discussed in plenary and improvements made. Considering the need for further work, CCFICS27 agreed to return the draft principles and guidelines on traceability/product tracing as a tool within a NFCS to Step 2 for redrafting, using the edited text from CCFICS27 as a basis, and for circulation for comments at Step 3.

CCFICS27 agreed to establish an EWG to continue the revision of the guidelines, taking into account the discussions and comments made during CCFICS27.

Chairperson's comments:

The Chairperson concurs with the Secretariat comments. Discussions were very productive, improvements were made to the draft text, and outstanding issues raised in plenary are all surmountable.

8. Review and update of the list of emerging global issues, Paragraph 96

Status and Secretariat's comments:

CCFICS27 agreed to the list of emerging issues as identified in Appendix A of CX/FICS 24/27/9 and that the list of emerging issues continues to be a standing agenda item for future CCFICS sessions, with the custodianship rotating among Members on a meeting-by-meeting basis. It was agreed that the European Union (EU) with the support of Australia be the next custodian of Appendix A to be prepared for CCFICS28The identification.

Chairperson's comments:

The Chairperson concurs with the Secretariat's comments.

Appendix 2

1. General

Committee	Codex Committee on Nutrition and Foods for Special Dietary Uses (CCNFSDU)		
Host	Germany	Chairperson	Ms Martine Püster Dr Carolin Bendadani
Session reported on	CCNFSDU44	2-6 October 2024	
Next Session	CCNFSDU45	November 2026	
Report	<u>REP24/NFSDU</u>		

2. Overall comments

Codex Secretariat's comments:

CCNFSDU44 was successfully convened as a physical session and attended by 52 Members and 29 Observer organizations. Two physical working group (PWG) meetings were held just prior to the session supporting progress on the work on general principles for the establishment of Nutrient Reference Values – Requirements (NRVs-R) for persons aged 6 – 36 months, and on prioritization mechanism/emerging issues or new work proposals.

Although divergent opinions were expressed on some issues, all items on the agenda were discussed and consensually concluded. CCNFSDU44 consensually agreed to forward to CAC47 for adoption at Step 8, the General principles for the establishment of NRVs-R for persons aged 6 – 36 months (Annex 1, Part B of CXG 2-1985) and NRVs-R for several nutrients. CCNFSDU44 followed an agreed stepwise process to ensure a consistent approach to deriving NRVs-R for this age group. The stepwise process will be published as an information document for use in the ongoing work on this subject.

CCNFSDU44 also considered four proposals for new work. After careful consideration and extensive discussions, CCNFSDU44 agreed to forward one proposal to CAC47 for approval; on developing a new standard for foods for older infants and young children.

CCNFSDU has been able to overcome the challenge of a heavy agenda by implementing good work management practices, for example, by establishing internal guidelines to identify and prioritise new work. These guidelines were developed in response to a request from CCEXEC75 (2018). Following a paper by the Codex Secretariat on the review of standards under the purview of CCNFSDU, CCNFSDU will keep all existing standards requiring future review as part of an inventory list and the new work proposal agreed by CCNFSDU already takes into account the need to keep CCNFSDU standards up to date and current.

CCNFSDU44 continues to work on batches of food additives appraising their technological justification in infant formulas. This work stems from a request from CCFA to ensure that only food additives that are technologically justified for use in infant formulas are put on the JECFA priority list. CCNFSDU is following a systematic approach to this work, and will continue working on additional food additives for the foreseeable future.

In addition, to better manage its work, CCNFSDU has decided to use a more systematic approach to considering methods of analysis for provisions in standards under its purview. This approach will avoid ad hoc consideration of methods of analysis and complement the work currently ongoing in the Codex Committee on Methods of Analysis and Sampling (CCMAS).

Chairperson's comments:

CCNFSDU44 was well attended, and discussions were consensus-oriented. The Committee benefitted from guidance and technical input by WHO and FAO.

Thanks to considerable advancement in working groups since the last meeting, CCNFSDU44 was able to finalize both the General principles and stepwise process on NRVs-R for persons aged 6-36 months, and agree on NRVs-R for several nutrients. CCNFSDU44 also agreed on a Guideline for new work including an inventory list to keep track of new work, emerging issues and existing standards in need for a review. While this new procedure complements the Procedural Manual, gives guidance and improves transparency, prioritization as such is currently of less relevance to the Committee due to a lighter agenda than before. Despite significant progress in its EWGs, challenges in written exchange regarding consensus building and inclusiveness of recommendations were revealed, thus highlighting the need for guidance on work in EWGs.

With all items on track, it is timely to take on board new work and review outdated standards, and thus CCNFSDU44 forwarded one proposal on developing a new standard for foods for older infants and young children to CAC47 for approval. Discussions on further new work proposals highlighted the need for more practical guidance on how to develop a clear scope and rationale of new work, and how to ensure an up-to-date science-based approach when starting new work.

With CCNFSDU45 programmed in two years' time, the Chairpersons, with the help of the Secretariat and EWG Chairs, are determined to identify ways to advance discussions in the meantime.

3. Status of work items

Topic	Job number	Target year	Recommendation of the Committee
For decision by the Commission			
1. General principles for establishing Nutrient Reference Values – Requirements (NRVs-R) for persons aged 6 – 36 months (Annex 1, Part B of CXG 2-1985)	N06-2008	2025	Adoption at Step 8
2. NRVs-R for persons aged 6 – 36 months: Vitamins A, B6, and E, thiamin, riboflavin, niacin, pantothenic acid, copper, iodine, potassium, zinc and protein	N06-2008	2025	Adoption at Step 5/8
3. Amendments to the <i>Standard for infant formula and formulas for special medical purposes intended for infants</i> (CXS 72-1981)	-	-	Adoption
4. Inclusion of the nitrogen to protein conversion factor for follow-up formula for older infants and products for young children in CXS 234-1999	-	-	Adoption
5. New work proposal to develop a standard for foods for older infants and young children	-	-	Approval
For monitoring			
6. NRVs-R for persons aged 6 – 36 months: Vitamins C, B12, and K, folate, biotin, selenium, manganese, magnesium, phosphorous and iron; extension of timeline of completion of work to 2026	N06-2008	2026 (subject to CAC47 approval)	Step 2/3
For information			
7. Technological justification for several food additives	For CCFA consideration		
8. Management of new work proposals	Ongoing work		

4. Specific comments

<p>1. General principles for the establishment of Nutrient Reference Values - Requirements (NRVs-R) for persons aged 6 – 36 months (Annex 1, Part B of CXG 2-1985), Paragraph 38, Appendix II Parts A and C</p>
<p>Status:</p> <p>As all outstanding issues were resolved, CCNFSDU44 agreed to advance the General principles for the establishment of nutrient reference values for persons aged 6 to 36 months to Step 8 for adoption for inclusion in the <i>Guidelines on nutrition labelling</i> (CXG 2-1985) as Annex 1, Part B, including consequential amendments that would need to be made in CXG 2-1985.</p>
<p>Chairperson's comments:</p> <p>With submission of the General Principles for establishing Nutrient Reference Values (NRVs-R) for persons aged 6 to 36 months for adoption and agreement on the draft stepwise process for the derivation of nutrient reference values – requirements for this age group, CCNFSDU has a good basis for establishing values.</p>
<p>2. NRVs-R for persons aged 6 – 36 months: Vitamins A, B6, D and E, thiamin, riboflavin, niacin, pantothenic acid, calcium, copper, iodine, potassium, zinc and protein, Paragraph 67(i), Appendix II Part B</p>
<p>Status and Secretariat's comments:</p> <p>CCNFSDU44 agreed to forward the NRVs-R for Vitamins A, B6, D and E, thiamin, riboflavin, niacin, pantothenic acid, calcium, copper, iodine, potassium, zinc and protein to CAC47 for adoption at Step 5/8 and inclusion in CXG 2-1985 as recommended by the PWG.</p> <p>The work took into account the recent Joint FAO/WHO update of nutrient intake values for calcium, vitamin D and zinc in infants and young children from birth through 3 years of age.</p> <p>However, there are NRVs-R for other nutrients which require further development (see item 6). The Stepwise Process for establishing NRVs-R for persons aged 6 – 36 months was agreed by CCNFSDU and will be published as an information document.</p>
<p>Chairperson's comments:</p> <p>After completion of the work on the General principles, CCNFSDU44 consented on several NRVs-R for persons aged 6-36 months.</p>
<p>3. Consequential and editorial amendments to the <i>Standard for infant formula and formulas for special medical purposes intended for infants</i> (CXS 72-1981), Paragraph 141(iv), Appendix VI</p>
<p>Status and Secretariat's comments:</p> <p>CCNFSDU44 agreed to forward for adoption by CAC47 a consequential amendment and three editorial amendments to the <i>Standard for infant formula and formulas for special medical purposes intended for infants</i> (CXS 72-1981) to align with the corrections made in the <i>Standard for follow-up formula for older infants and product for young children</i> (CXS 156-1987). The consequential amendment would resolve inconsistencies in the conversion of essential compositional requirements from kcal to kJ.</p>
<p>Chairperson's comments:</p> <p>With work on follow-up formula completed, consequential amendments to the <i>Standard for infant formula and formulas for special medical purposes intended for infants</i> (CXS 72-1981) were proposed and swiftly agreed upon. This work is an example of the relevance of keeping existing texts under review.</p>
<p>4. Inclusion of the nitrogen to protein conversion factor for follow-up formula for older infants and products for young children in CXS 234-1999, Paragraph 190(i), Appendix VII, Part C</p>
<p>Status:</p> <p>CCNFSDU44 agreed to forward to CAC47 for adoption the nitrogen to protein conversion factor (Nx) value for follow-up formula for older infants and products for young children to be included in the Annex to the <i>Recommended Methods of Analysis and Sampling</i> (CXS 234-1999), as it had been omitted in the list forwarded by CCMAS to CAC47.</p>
<p>Chairperson's comments:</p>

CCNFSDU45 will have to consider whether to retain the conversion factors in the <i>Standard for infant formula and formulas for special medical purposes intended for infants</i> (CXS 72-1981) and the <i>Standard for follow-up formula for older infants and products for young children</i> (CXS 156-1987) or revoke them and centralize all information in CXS 234-1999.
5. New work proposal to develop a standard for foods for older infants and young children, Paragraph 128(i), Appendix V
Status: CCNFSDU44 agreed to start developing a standard for foods for older infants and young children and agreed to forward the project document to CAC47 for approval as new work. This work foresees the replacement of the <i>Standard for Canned Baby-Foods</i> (CXS 73-1981) and the <i>Standard for Processed Cereal Based Foods for Infants and Young Children</i> (CXS 74-1981), which need updating (identified in the Secretariat paper on the review of standards under the purview of CCNFSDU) and demonstrates CCNFSDU's responsiveness to keep its standards relevant and up to date. The work will establish science-based nutrition, quality, and safety provisions for the foods covered by the aforementioned standards and for complementary foods, for which there are no current Codex standards
Chairperson's comments: The screening exercise undertaken by the Codex Secretariat, showed that the two standards considered to be replaced in this proposal needed updating. The new work will also include other complementary foods marketed that have appeared around the globe. Thus, the work is timely and will address the aforementioned issues.
6. NRVs-R for persons aged 6 – 36 months: Vitamins C, B12 and K, folate, biotin, selenium, manganese, magnesium, phosphorous and iron, Paragraph 67(iii)
Status: CCNFSDU44 agreed to return the NRVs-R for Vitamins C, B12, and K, folate, biotin, selenium, manganese, magnesium, phosphorous and iron to Step 2/3 for further development through an EWG as no consensus was reached at this session. Since CCNFSDU will not meet in 2025, CCNFSDU44 agreed to request CCEXEC/CAC to extend the timeline to complete the work to 2026.
Chairperson's comments: With work on the General Principles for establishing Nutrient Reference Values (NRVs-R) for persons aged 6 to 36 months completed and a stepwise process agreed upon, CCNFSDU can now concentrate on determining the remaining ten NRVs-R and take the time for discussions to complete work on this item at the next session that is scheduled to take place in 2026.
7. Technological justification for several food additives, Paragraph 85
Status: Upon the request of CCFA, CCNFSDU44 discussed and agreed there is no technological need for the use of guar gum (INS 412), distarch phosphate (INS 1412), phosphated distarch phosphate (INS 1413), acetylated distarch phosphate (INS 1414) and hydroxypropyl starch (INS 1440) in foods conforming to the <i>Standard for infant formula and formulas for special medical purposes intended for infants</i> (CXS 72-1981). CCNFSDU44 agreed to the use of the food additives listed as nutrient carriers in the <i>Advisory lists of nutrient compounds for use in foods for special dietary uses intended for infants and young children</i> (CXG 10-1979) under the <i>Standard for canned baby foods</i> (CXS 73-1981). All these matters will be further considered by CCFA.
Chairperson's comments: It remains important to follow the agreed framework for the evaluation of the technological need of food additives in foods. Work on technical justification on use of food additives continues in batches as planned. Thus, this item will remain on CCNFSDU's agenda for the next couple of sessions.
8. Management of new work proposals, Paragraphs 99(i), 115 123, 130(i), Appendix IV

Status:

CCNFSDU44 agreed to publish the Guideline for the preliminary assessment to identify and prioritize new work for CCNFSDU as an information document on the Codex website and continue using it to evaluate and prioritize new work proposals as necessary, noting that the Guideline was a living document and could be amended in the future as experience was gained in its use.

The Guideline will be used for requesting proposals for new work / emerging issues and for the review and prioritization of these proposals.

The Guideline was successfully used for the evaluation and prioritization of new work proposals for CCNFSDU44.

Four new work proposals were considered of which two were prioritized, and one work proposal is being forwarded to CAC for approval (see item 5).

For the new work proposal on General guidelines and principles for the nutritional composition of foods formulated with protein from non-animal sources, outstanding questions and concerns remained over the new work proposal and the feasibility, usefulness and the added value of developing guidelines at this time. Noting the importance of having clear work objectives and that ambiguity could hinder progress and lead to inefficiencies, CCNFSDU44 agreed to return the proposal for further development and refinement, emphasizing the need to consider a forthcoming FAO publication.

In the case of the new work proposal for harmonized guidelines for use of probiotic guidelines for use in foods and food supplements, recognising that consensus was not reached on this proposal and there existed FAO/WHO guidelines and other scientific references to guide use of probiotics, CCNFSDU44 requested FAO and WHO to review the documents "Probiotics in Food" and "Guidelines for the Evaluation of Probiotics in Food" incorporating a literature review of scientific evidence on probiotics. After FAO and WHO has completed the review, a new work proposal on probiotics could be submitted and reconsidered by CCNFSDU through the established process of responding to the circular letter (CL) for new work proposals.

Chairperson's comments:

With the new Guideline published as an information document and the inventory list prepared by the CCNFSDU Secretariat, CCNFSDU has a tool at hand to structure the process for new work, identify and discuss emerging issues, and keep track of needs for updates of texts under its purview. This will enable the committee to take up larger pieces of new work and approach revision of existing texts, such as the proposed standard for foods for older infants and young children. In the future, the development of a more coherent approach across committees regarding new work and emerging issues could be beneficial to Codex.

Discussions on the four new work proposals showed that there is need for practical guidance and training on how to develop new work proposals that are clear in scope and rationale and scientifically mature as well as on how to steer and advance work in electronic working groups in the spirit of consensus.

Appendix 3

1. General

Committee	Codex Committee on Fish and Fishery Products (CCFFP)		
Host	Norway	Chairperson	Ms Vigdis Synnøve Veum
Session reported on	CCFFP36	7-11, 17 October 2024	
Next Session	CCFFP37	TBC	
Report	REP24/FFP		

2. Overall comments

Secretariat's comments:

CCFFP36 was successfully convened with discussions via correspondence on 7 – 11 October using the Codex online platform, and adoption of the report virtually on 17 October 2024. CCFFP36 was attended by 37 Member countries and one Member organization.

CCFFP had been reactivated by CAC43 (2020) to evaluate if the *Standard for canned sardines and sardine-type products* (CXS 94-1981) could be amended to include the fish species *Sardinella lemuru* (Bali Sardinella) in the list of sardine species under section 2.1 applying the Procedural Manual's "Procedure for the Inclusion of Additional Species in Codex Standards for Fish and Fishery Products".

Thanks to the excellent and thorough work done in the EWG overlooking the sensory evaluation of *S. lemuru*, CCFFP36 agreed to forward to CAC47 the inclusion of *S. lemuru* (Bali Sardinella) in the *Standard for canned sardines and sardine-type products* (CXS 94-1981).

CCFFP36 noted the previous decision of the Commission to include *Sardinella fimbriata* and *Sardinella sirm* (currently *Amblygaster sirm*) in CXS 94-1981 and that the Codex Secretariat would insert in the standard these two species, which had been accidentally omitted in the past, and inform CAC accordingly.

CCFFP36 also agreed to update some of the scientific names in the list of sardine species under section 2.1 to align with current scientific nomenclature

CCFFP36 furthermore agreed to forward to CAC47 for adoption the amendments to the labelling provisions for non-retail containers in the 24 fish and fishery products standards, and inform the Codex Committee on Food Labelling (CCFL) accordingly

CCFFP36 noted that CCFFP had completed the task as approved by CAC43 (2020). This means that CAC47 should consider adjourning CCFFP *sine die*. However, should there be a new work proposal that justifies work under the purview of CCFFP, CAC should consider re-activating CCFFP and also decide on the best mechanism to conduct the work.

CCFFP36 noted the considerable interest in future Codex work on seaweed and other algae and agreed to inform CAC accordingly. Such an interest should be considered should new work proposals on these topics be received. At the same time, an initial careful analysis of such proposals would be necessary to ensure that they are sent to the right committee in accordance with the purpose and scope of these proposals.

Chairperson's comments:

As mentioned by the Codex Secretariat, the session was completed successfully. Members were actively engaged. Thanks to the excellent and thorough work done in the EWG, CCFFP36 successfully concluded the key topic; the inclusion of a new species, *Sardinella lemuru*, in the *Standard for canned sardines and sardine-type products* (CXS 94 – 1981) and agreed to forward the inclusion of the species to CAC47 for adoption. There were some good exchanges of views regarding sustainability of fish stocks, finally clarified by FAO. Further on the "sardine standard", a discussion took place regarding whether the omitted species could be inserted without using the procedure for inclusion of new species or not, which was clarified as an issue to note as the decision had already been taken by previous sessions of CCFFP and CAC.

Members expressed considerable support for a proposal for amending the terms of reference of (TOR) CCFFO to include seaweed, however as there were no new work proposals presented, and CCFFP had finalized its task as approved by CAC43, this matter was not pursued by CCFFP36.

Finally, working by correspondence is a challenging exercise. The procedure was developed before the virtual meetings were considered a possibility, and with the technology today, I would for the future recommend thorough considerations of costs versus benefits related to the options of having work done by correspondence or virtual sessions.

3. Status of work items

Topic	Job number	Target year	Recommendation of the Committee
For decision by the Commission			
1. The inclusion of <i>Sardinella lemuru</i> in the list of sardine species under Section 2.1 in the <i>Standard for canned sardines and sardine-type products</i> (CXS 94-1981)	-	2024	Adoption
2. Editorial amendments of scientific names in Section 2.1 of CXS 94-1981	Adoption		
3. Consequential amendments to the labelling provisions for non-retail containers in fish and fishery products standards	Adoption		
For information			
4. The insertion of <i>Sardinella fimbriata</i> and <i>Amblygaster sirm</i> (formerly known as <i>Sardinella sirm</i>) in CXS 94-1981 based on previous CAC decisions			
5. The considerable interest in future Codex work on seaweed and other algae			

4. Specific comments

<p>1. The inclusion of <i>Sardinella lemuru</i> in the list of sardine species under Section 2.1 in the Standard for canned sardines and sardine-type products (CXS 94-1981), Paragraph 26, Appendix III</p>
<p>Status and Secretariat's comments:</p> <p>CCFFP36 expressed appreciation for the thorough work done by the EWG and noted that result of the sensory evaluation was favourable to the inclusion of the candidate species in CXS 94-1981.</p> <p>During the EWG discussions on sustainability, FAO had confirmed that <i>S. lemuru</i> stocks could not be considered of particular concern compared to other species listed in CXS 94-1981.</p> <p>CCFFP36 unanimously agreed to forward the inclusion of <i>S. lemuru</i> in the list of sardine species under Section 2.1 in the <i>Standard for canned sardines and sardine-type products</i> (CXS 94-1981) to CAC47.</p>
<p>Chairperson's comments:</p> <p>After 3 years of work in the EWG, the comprehensive EWG report provided a clear recommendation, and CCFFP36 agreed to the recommendation. No further discussion on this is foreseen.</p>
<p>2. Editorial amendments of scientific names in Section 2.1 of CXS 94-1981, Paragraph 45, Appendix III</p>
<p>Status and Secretariat's comments:</p> <p>A Member brought to the attention of CCFFP36 via a CRD the need to update some of the scientific names in Section 2.1 of CXS 94-281 to align with the current scientific nomenclature.</p> <p>CCFFP36 agreed to submit to CAC47 for adoption the editorial amendment of the following scientific names in Section 2.1 of CXS 94-281:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. <i>Sardinops neopilchardus</i> and <i>Sardinops caeruleus</i> replaced by <i>Sardinops sagax</i>; ii. <i>Clupea bentincki</i> replaced by <i>Strangomera bentincki</i>; and iii. <i>Etrumeus teres</i> replaced by <i>Etrumeus sadina</i> <p>The Codex Secretariat appreciates that Members inform about such issues with the view to keep standards current and correct.</p>
<p>Chairperson's comments:</p> <p>I appreciate that Members actively bring forward for CCFFP's attention the need for updating scientific names to align with current scientific nomenclature. This time it was in the list of sardine species in the <i>Standard for canned sardines and sardine-type products</i> (CXS 94-1981). This provides Codex with updated standards ready to use.</p>
<p>3. Consequential amendments to the labelling provisions for non-retail containers in fish and fishery products standards, Paragraph 19(i), Appendix II</p>
<p>Status and Secretariat's comments:</p> <p>In order to align with the <i>General standard for the labelling of non-retail containers of foods</i> (CXS 346-2021), the Codex Secretariat had proposed consequential amendments to the labelling provisions in the 24 fish and fishery products standards.</p> <p>CCFFP36 unanimously agreed to forward to CAC47 for adoption the consequential amendments as proposed by the Codex Secretariat and inform CCFL accordingly.</p>
<p>Chairperson's comments:</p> <p>None.</p>
<p>4. The insertion of <i>Sardinella fimbriata</i> and <i>Amblygaster sirm</i> (formerly known as <i>Sardinella sirm</i>) in CXS 94-1981 based on previous CAC decisions, Paragraph 18(ii), Appendix III</p>
<p>Status and Secretariat's comments:</p> <p>CCFFP36 noted the previous decision of CAC (adopted by CAC13 and confirmed by CAC15) to include <i>Sardinella sirm</i> in CXS 94-1981, and that the Codex Secretariat would take the necessary actions to insert <i>Sardinella fimbriata</i> and <i>Amblygaster sirm</i> (formerly known as <i>Sardinella sirm</i>) in CXS 94-1981 and inform CAC accordingly.</p>

Chairperson's comments:

It was not easy neither for the Chairperson nor the Secretariat to explain why this omission had happened. However, by focusing on previous decisions both by CCFFP and CAC, CCFFP36 agreed to rectify the omission.

5. The considerable interest in future Codex work on seaweed and other algae, Paragraph 41**Status and Secretariat's comments:**

A Member proposed in a CRD that "seaweed" be included in TOR of CCFFP.

CCFFP36 noted the considerable support for the future development of a Codex standard, code of practice, or related texts on seaweed and that CCFFP was the most suitable Codex subsidiary body to undertake this work.

CCFFP36 noted the considerable interest in future Codex work on seaweed and other algae and agreed to inform CAC47 accordingly. Such an interest should be considered should new work proposals on these topics be received. At the same time, an initial careful analysis of such proposals would be necessary to ensure that they are sent to the right committee in accordance with the purpose and scope of these proposals.

CCFFP36 noted that the need for Codex Members to submit proposals to undertake new work prior to amending and/or expanding the TOR of CCFFP to include these areas.

Chairperson's comments:

Members engaged themselves very much in discussing this proposal for amending the TOR to include seaweed. However, as no new work proposals were presented, and CCFFP had finalized its task as approved by CAC43, this matter unfortunately could not be pursued by CCFFP36 even though it had considerable support.