

# CODEx ALIMENTARIUS COMMISSION



Food and Agriculture  
Organization of the  
United Nations



World Health  
Organization

Viale delle Terme di Caracalla, 00153 Rome, Italy - Tel: (+39) 06 57051 - E-mail: [codex@fao.org](mailto:codex@fao.org) - [www.codexalimentarius.org](http://www.codexalimentarius.org)

**Agenda Item 4**

**CX/FFP 21/35/4 Add.3**

**September 2021**

**Original language only**

## JOINT FAO/WHO FOOD STANDARDS PROGRAMME CODEX COMMITTEE ON FISH AND FISHERY PRODUCTS

Thirty-fifth Session

Virtual

20 September – 25 October 2021

**Proposed amendment of the *Standard for Canned Sardines and Sardine-Type Products* (CXS 94-1981)**

Comments from: *Australia, Canada, Egypt, European Union, Iran, Iraq, Kenya, Mauritius, Morocco, Norway, Panama, Peru, USA*

### **Background**

1. This document compiles comments received through the Codex Online Commenting System (OCS) in response to CL 2021/67-FFP issued in August 2021. Under the OCS, comments are compiled in the following order: general comments are listed first, followed by comments on specific paragraphs.
2. The comments submitted through the OCS are, hereby attached as an Annex and are presented in table format.

**ANNEX****GENERAL COMMENTS**

<b>COMMENT</b>	<b>MEMBER/OBSERVER</b>
Australia supports progress of this work and submits the following responses to the three specific items for comment.	<b>Australia</b>
No comments.	<b>Iraq</b>
Le Maroc réitère sa demande et insiste sur le respect strict de la procédure d'inclusion de nouvelles espèces dans les normes pour les poissons et les produits de la pêche, telle qu'elle est décrite dans la section II du manuel de procédure de la Commission du Codex Alimentarius (page 76 de la vingt-septième édition).	<b>Morocco</b>
We agree with the proposals and recommendations. We recommend your advance. Estamos de acuerdo con las propuestas y recomendaciones. Recomendamos su avance	<b>Panama</b>
The United States supports inclusion of Sardinella lemuru in the Standard for Canned Sardines and Sardine-Type Products (CXS 94-1981) and suggests that the 35th Session of the Codex Committee on Fish and Fishery Products (CCFFP35) consider whether sensory evaluation is necessary based on the information provided by the Philippines.	<b>USA</b>

**SPECIFIC COMMENTS**

- a. Laboratories to be selected to perform the sensory evaluation including the leading laboratory to be in charge of coordinating the assessment and preparing the final report.**

Australia does not have a preference for the testing laboratories.	<b>Australia</b>
In order to facilitate a Committee decision on which three laboratories will be selected to perform the sensory evaluation and which laboratory will be designated to lead, Canada suggests that further background information be provided in advance of CCFFP35 on the proposed list of six laboratories, particularly facts relating to their suitability or relevant expertise in sensory evaluation of fish and fishery products, and how this selection meets the criteria laid out in section 3.3. of the "Procedure for the Inclusion of Additional Species in Codex Standards for Fish and Fishery Products".	<b>Canada</b>
Egypt requests more information for clarification about the proposed laboratories to select on clear criteria.	<b>Egypt</b>
In relation with the suggested laboratories, it is essential that similar protocols are used in line with section 3.3 of the Procedure for the Inclusion of Additional Species in Codex Standards for Fish and Fishery Products in the Procedural Manual. The laboratories should also apply accredited sensorial techniques. The EU requests adding Portuguese Institute for the Sea and Atmosphere (IPMA) to the list of laboratories proposed to perform the sensory evaluation in section 3 of CX/FFP 21/35/4 Add.1 Rev.1.  Special attention must be paid to standardise the samples. It is important to homogenize to the maximum the original raw materials that must be in the same condition and of the same quality (time from catch, cold preservation, packaging quality etc.). Also the heat treatment	<b>European Union</b>

and the covering medium to be used, which must be neutral (avoiding sauces or olive oil), must be standardised. Other variability sources that can possibly hide sensory differences must be avoided as well.	
Kenya agrees with the proposed Laboratories recognizing the representation of the region by a Morocco based laboratory	<b>Kenya</b>
We agree that there is need to conduct sensory evaluation but do not have sufficient data on the proposed laboratories to back our choice of the laboratories. However, in our humble opinion, the leading laboratory to be in charge of coordinating the sensory assessment should have demonstrated competence in the sensory evaluation field and possess recognition, that is be accredited to ISO 17025, be working as per recognized principles for sensory laboratories (ISO standards, for example) or be deemed as a reference laboratory under a national/regional scheme. Moreover, the laboratories need to be fairly distributed geographically and meet any other criteria mentioned in the Codex Procedural Manual.	<b>Mauritius</b>
Le Maroc propose d'examiner au sein du GTE la documentation relative à chaque laboratoire proposé pour pouvoir décider si ce laboratoire possède l'expertise requise en matière d'évaluation organoleptique comme stipulé dans la procédure d'inclusion. Les critères de choix du laboratoire : - La compétence technique dans le domaine de l'évaluation organoleptique - L'accréditation du laboratoire selon la norme ISO/CEI 17025 « Exigences générales concernant la compétence des laboratoires d'étalonnages et d'essais », applicable depuis le 13 décembre 2017, la portée d'accréditation doit concerner l'évaluation organoleptique (les essais descriptifs, discriminatifs et les essais hédoniques ...) - L'indépendance du laboratoire ; - Idéalement, le choix des labos dans trois régions différentes du codex, en excluant de préférence le membre demandeur. - Si possible, le choix des labos dans les pays où les produits sont principalement consommés.	<b>Morocco</b>
No comments	<b>Norway</b>
Se considera que un criterio técnico para seleccionar los laboratorios podría ser el que sean acreditados con la norma ISO/IEC 17025 para el ensayo de evaluación sensorial y que se utilice un método normalizado. En tal sentido, en base a información contenida en sus páginas web, podrían realizar la evaluación sensorial:  1. Nombre del laboratorio: Sensory and Marketing Spain Dirección: C/ D'Ausias March 148-150, 08103 Barcelona (España)  2. Nombre del laboratorio: INTERTEK ITALIA SpA Dirección: Via Miglioli, 2/A – 20063 Cernusco sul Naviglio, Milán (Italia)  3. Nombre del laboratorio: AENOR Internacional Dirección: Calle Genova 6, 28004 Madrid (España).	<b>Peru</b>



**c. The draft Terms of Reference for the EWG, including the chair(s) and the language(s).**

Australia does not suggest any amendments to the draft Terms of Reference for the EWG.	<b>Australia</b>
Canada supports the draft Terms of Reference for the EWG, as presented.	<b>Canada</b>
Egypt agrees on this draft with no comments.	<b>Egypt</b>
The EU agrees with the proposed terms of reference for the EWG as proposed in Annex 1 of CX/FFP 21/35/4.  Furthermore, in order to assure the sustainability of the S. lemuru stocks, which could be affected by its inclusion in the suggested list, it would be important to know how the Philippines applies its Management Plan, and the results that are being obtained. It would also be desirable to have a scientific evaluation on how the stocks will be affected by the foreseen higher fishing pressure related to its inclusion in the list.	<b>European Union</b>
Kenya agrees to the ToRs for the EWG	<b>Kenya</b>
We welcome the establishment of the electronic group working in English, to be chaired by Philippines. For impartiality, would also extend our support to it being co-chaired by other sardines producing countries or any other country expressing its interest to do so; in addition, we are proposing a minor change to the proposed terms of reference, to consider French as a working language.	<b>Mauritius</b>
Le Maroc propose d'ajouter dans le mandat du Groupe de Travail Electronique (GTE) le point relatif à l'examen de la documentation fournie par le pays demandeur ainsi que celle relative aux dossiers techniques des laboratoires proposés.  La Commission, à sa quarante-troisième session, a approuvé la proposition de réactiver le CCFFP afin que celui-ci travaille par correspondance, conformément à la Procédure d'inclusion de nouvelles espèces dans les normes pour les poissons et les produits de la pêche, et qu'il évalue la possibilité d'amender la Norme pour les sardines et produits du type sardines en conserve (CXS 94-1981) afin d'y inclure l'espèce Sardinella lemuru (sardinelle de Bali) dans la section 2.1.  Le mandat du GTE doit être conforme aux dispositions de la procédure d'inclusion de nouvelles espèces dans les normes pour les poissons et les produits de la pêche (section II) du manuel de procédure du Codex Alimentarius, notamment le point 2.3 qui stipule que le GTE doit examiner la documentation fournie par le(s) membre(s) demandeur.  En ce qui concerne la présidence, pour une question d'impartialité et afin d'éviter toutes suspicions à posteriori, le Maroc suggère de confier à un pays neutre autre que le pays demandeur, le cas échéant, le pays demandeur peut assurer juste la co-présidence. Le Maroc propose d'ajouter le français comme langue de travail.	<b>Morocco</b>
Norway support the draft Terms of Reference.	<b>Norway</b>
Con respecto a esta consulta, se propone incorporar el siguiente texto como punto adicional:  "Informar al CCFFP acerca de si la especie candidata cumple los requisitos para ser incluidas en la norma CXS 94-1981".  Adicional a ello, cabe mencionar que, el equipo técnico brindará el apoyo necesario para la revisión y evaluación de la sustentación científica y el cumplimiento del análisis sensorial realizado por un laboratorio acreditado mundialmente, para que la especie Sardinella	<b>Peru</b>

tema pueda ser incluida cumpliendo con los requisitos establecidos en el Manual de Procedimiento del CODEX ALIMENTARIUS (Act. 2019).	
The draft Terms of Reference for the electronic working group, including the chair(s) and the language(s), are also acceptable to the United States.	<b>USA</b>