

Can “Success” of “Failure” be Designed in?: Reflections and Lessons

by

Javed Hussain Mir

Presentation Outline

- Project: Designed outcomes and outputs
 - Bangladesh Forestry Sector Project (FSP)
 - Bangladesh Sundarbans Biodiversity Conservation Project
 - Viet Nam Forestry Sector Project (FSP)
- Assessments in brief.
- A few reflections, questions for discussion.

Bangladesh FSP (1998-2006);

\$58 million:

- Planned Outcome:
 - Social forestry through community participation
- Planned Outputs:
 - Afforestation/reforestation/woodlots (46,000 ha)
 - Conservation of sal forests
 - Strip plantations (24,000 kilometers?)
 - Forest extension nurseries
 - Professional/staff strengthening
- Implementing Agency: Forest Dept./NGOs/Beneficiaries?

BAN: Sundarbans Biodiversity Conservation Project 1999-2006, ADB \$37 million; Total \$82 million

- Planned Outcome:
 - Securing the integrity (environment and biodiversity) of Sundarbans Reserve Forest (in 1997, 140,000 ha)
- Planned Outputs:
 - Effective organization of the SRF
 - Biodiversity conservation and sustainable resource mgmt
 - Socioeconomic development of the impact zone
 - Ecotourism and environmental awareness
 - Technical advice, monitoring and research
- Implementing Agency: Forest Departments???

Viet Nam Forestry Sector Project 1997-2006: ADB \$32 million, Revised \$11 million

- Planned Outcome:
 - Restore the vegetative cover of the hilly and mountain areas in Than Hoa, Quang Tri, Gia Lai and Phu Yen
- Planned Outputs:
 - Resource inventory of over 1 million ha
 - Capacity building (Govt. staff and beneficiaries)
 - Commune development plans/village infrastructure
 - Strengthening of forest policy framework
- Implementation: MARD, Forestry Management Board with provincial authorities.

“Results” in Brief (1): Bangladesh

	BAN: Forestry Sector Project (Successful)	BAN: Sundarbans Biodiversity Conservation Project (Unsuccessful)
1) Relevance	Relevant	Partly relevant
2) Effectiveness in Achieving Outcomes	Effective	Less Effective
3) Efficiency in Achieving Outcomes and Outputs	Efficient	Inefficient
4) Preliminary Sustainability rating	Most Likely	Unlikely
5) Impact	- \$15.4 Million to 68,000 beneficiaries	Negligible/Negative

“Results” in Brief (2): Viet Nam FSP

Rating Criterion	Rating (Successful)
1) Relevance	Highly Relevant
2) Effectiveness in Achieving Outcome	Effective
3) Efficiency	Efficient
4) Preliminary Assessment of Sustainability	Likely
5) Impact	Positive (Environmental and social impact)

Reflections/Questions

- A few reflections
 - History/context of institutions and actors matters.
 - Fads and flavors of the month, helpful or harmful?
 - Short-termism?
- A few questions:
 - Bangladesh: Same institutions, why different results?
 - Bangladesh and Viet Nam: Different countries and systems, similar results, why?



Thank You