

Development of Sustainable Agricultural Livelihoods in Eastern Hazarajat (SALEH)
GCP/AFG/029/UK

Format for Management response to recommendations							
Recommendations	Acceptance by Management			Comment on the Recommendation	Action to be taken		
	Accept	Partially Accept	Reject		Action	Timing	Un
Recommendation 1 Provided there is no further substantial expansion, geographically or in terms of number of FBOs, the present pilot project phase should be extended on a no-cost basis by an additional eighteen months until the end of 2008.	X			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 18 month no-cost extension approved subject to budget availability further expansion to other FBOs (Farmer Based Organisations) not necessary 	Budget Revision required	Nov/Dec 06	FAI
Recommendation 2 In connection with a possible no-cost extension, the donor should continue its flexible administration of the grant and allow the project to reallocate funds between budget lines in order to set up a workable budget.	X			Agreed but before funds are reallocated between budget lines, prior approval must be obtained from DFID	Approval from DFID (KBL)	See above	DF
Recommendation 3 Given the novelty of the SALEH project approach, in line with its pilot status, and the prospect of achieving interesting results in rural community and agricultural development worthy of further dissemination, a study of experiences and lessons learned should be undertaken by the appropriate department(s) of the FAO headquarters in Rome in collaboration with the GoA.	X			Lessons learned and successes achieved should be fed back to the Ministry of Agriculture and Irrigation (MAI) and to look at the applicability of the project in other provinces, particularly poppy producing ones.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> SALEH to begin detailed documentation of processes and results. Results to be shared and exchanged with other Livelihoods projects and MAI SALEH to approach LTU on formal documentation within FAO 	June 2007	SAI & F
Recommendation 4 Serious consideration should be			X	- DFID does not agree to the recommendation for a second phase of the project to be considered. DFID recommends	- SALEH to utilise 18 month period to up-scale development	July 07 - Dec 08	•

<p>given to following up the present pilot project with a second phase of four to five years in which the role of the government would continue to be strengthened. If such a second phase is agreed and donor(s) found to support the idea, activities should be scaled up and the geographical coverage expanded to include districts with substantial Hazara population not covered in the first phase (e.g. Bamyan Centre and districts in neighbouring Ghor and Wardak province) as suggested in the original Project Document</p>				<p>that the project team should focus on working with the Ministry of Agriculture and Irrigation to develop the project into a “national programme” under the Ministry over the remaining life of the project, rather than developing a second phase.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - SALEH considers the “institutionalisation” of the process model will require extensive field-testing in different contexts. DFID proposed SALEH work in partnership with FAO Project 036/UK- Agricultural Alternative Livelihoods Project (AALP) and their targeted communities. 	<p>process model (community empowerment interventions linked to local government planning) and NPPS</p>		
<p>Recommendation 5 Should a second phase of the project be approved and funded, the further development of project concepts, particularly related to the role of the FBOs, should be considered, promoting the development towards more formalised institutions at community level. This should be closely related to the experience gained from the NSP concerning the establishment of formalised and sustainable institutions at community level.</p>			X	<p>Taking the refusal of funding for a second phase of the Project (comments on Recommendation 5) into account, institutional connection between NSP (National Solidarity Programme) and other NPPs (National Priority Programmes) would be further strengthened.</p>	<p>- SALEH to utilise 18 month period to up-scale development process model (community empowerment interventions linked to local government planning) and NPPS</p>	Dec 08	SA Te
<p>Recommendation 6 In connection with a possible second phase of the project in which the role of the government will continue to be strengthened, it should be considered (in the Hazarajat) to coordinate more activities under the umbrella of SALEH so that it may change its status from being a project to</p>		X		<p>Taking comments on Recommendation 5 into account, SALEH will need to gear up to national programme status by adapting the project to a drugs environment through institutionalisation of the Project based upon findings drawn from AALP</p>	<p>- SALEH to utilise 18 month period to up-scale development process model (community empowerment interventions linked to local government planning) and NPPS</p>	Dec 08	SA Te

becoming a programme.							
Recommendation 7 A third level of the LFA matrix should be developed by the project to cater for the need for detailed indicators referring to specific activities or types of activities developed as a result of the community action plans (CAPs) of the farmer-based organisations (FBOs) and detailed in the letters of agreements made with implementing partners.	X			To be undertaken if this is not a burden to the SALEH Project Team	Third level of indicators to be developed by SALEH Project team.	Jan 07	SA LTU
Recommendation 8 There is a considerable demand from the FBOs that the literacy and agricultural training programme be expanded and strengthened to include vocational training. Within its funding and manpower capacity, the project should respond positively to this demand. This will also fit in very well with the proposed NZAID-funded Women's Empowerment Project (WEP). No doubt, successful vocational training will lead to additional demands for developing market outlets and linkages.	X			- DFID views this a complimentary activity but will not be directly involved in channelling NZAID funds or subsequent monitoring and evaluation. - NZAID have requested SALEH to assist in submitting proposal though FAO	WEP proposal to developed and submitted by SALEH/LTU as an addendum to exist\sing Project design document.	DEC 06	SA FAI
Recommendation 9 The project needs to analyse the reasons why former NGO initiatives in vegetable production do not appear to have had a lasting impact. Note is, however, taken of the fact that vegetable cultivation where it is being			X	Vegetable production was undertaken on demand from FBOs and approached from the nutrition perspective, This recommendation was rejected by the donor because the recommendation is already being carried out though a joint activity between SALEH and 039/GER.	Broad analysis ongoing with results to be finalised at the end of agricultural year 2007	Nov 07	SA 039

supported by the project is at the direct request of the FBO CAP and therefore has a greater likelihood of being accepted							
Recommendation 10 While the SALEH project is excluded by its mandate from establishing its own micro-finance services, it must continue to pursue the issue with MISFA and other organisations to encourage them to establish micro-finance services in the project areas to cater for the needs of poor farmers.	X			The Project needs to define what is needed so that DFID can then help lever support from MISFA (Microfinance Investment Support for Afghanistan) to consider increased outreach in a specific geographical location	SALEH & LTU to follow up with DFID and MISFA	March 07	SA D/A
Recommendation 11 The project should consider the need to fill vacancies during the time remaining to the project. Some of these vacancies may be filled on a short-term basis, only.	X			The Project will continue to recruit staff as required.			
Recommendation 12 The SALEH project is already working in close collaboration with the local departments of agriculture in Bamyan province and the MAAHF was an integral part of this MTR, but nonetheless project management must ensure that the experiences, lessons learned and successes achieved by the project in the course of its various activities should be fed up to the relevant departments in the MAAHF in Kabul.	X			Learning to be documented and inculcated into proposed SALEH Project Communication Strategy	SALEH & LTU to finalise Communication Strategy	Feb 07	SA
Recommendation 13 No geographical expansion should take place within the life of this pilot project. The project should consolidate work with the existing 68 FBOs and only allow for limited expansion to	X			The Project may consider additional FBOs providing they are contiguous and have existing linkages to existing SALEH FBOs	Ongoing		SA

neighbouring communities on unsolicited requests – maybe to the level of around 75 FBOs. Such an expansion will require fewer resources from the project because farmer-to-farmer exchange is already taking place							
Recommendation 14 The project should consider fielding a consultant experienced in the cropping systems and use of natural and cultivated plants to make a study of this subject preferably with a Central Asian/Near East highland experience. The SALEH project provides an ideal platform in which to base such a study in dialogue with established FBOs.	X			Consultant to be recruited to undertake cropping analysis viewed from an economic/labour perspective	SALEH/LTU to draft ToRs and recruit in a timely manner	Mar 07	SA (Af)
Recommendation 15 Although it is not envisaged that the SALEH project should assume responsibility for veterinary matters in the Hazarajat, as this is outside its ToR, the project should, however, endeavour to help establish linkages between the FBOs and whatever livestock health programmes are being managed or are developed in the region. However, the project might consider acquiring technical capacity on issues relating to livestock husbandry and nutrition. These issues are already included in the project's farmer and extension training / literacy programme. The project should consider engaging a	X			Consultant to be recruited to undertake assessment and recommend appropriate animal health related activities in line with remaining life of Project.	SALEH/LTU to draft ToRs and recruit in a timely manner	Mar 07	SA TU
Recommendation 16 The project should consider	X			Consultant to be recruited to undertake work linking up with current community-based pasture management work of	SALEH/LTU to draft ToRs and recruit in a timely manner	Mar 07	SA TU

engaging a consultant specialist in pasture and rangeland management, experienced in the pastoral management customs, issues, ecologies and botany of highland Central Asia and the Near East of which Afghanistan is a part (e.g. Turkey, Iran, and Central Asia), to study the situation and develop a set of recommendations for meaningful and practical interventions.				Project			
Recommendation 17 Close collaboration should be maintained between the SALEH project and next phase of the FAO poultry project after the new USAID funding comes on stream.	X			The Project will continue to employ the Bamyan-based poultry team in order to further expand beneficiaries and geographical coverage in line with FBO CAPs (Community Action Plans)	Ongoing		SA
Recommendation 18 To meet the justifiable priorities of FBO CAPs, close collaboration should be maintained between the SALEH project and the major infrastructure programmes whether focused on irrigation and water issues, roads or other forms of infrastructure, whether they be under National Priority Programmes (NPPs) such as NSP, NEEP, NADP etc or others funded under WB, USAID or other bilateral donors.	X			The project will continue to strengthen linkages with NPPs at district and provincial levels	Ongoing		SA
Recommendation 19 Results and lessons learned through the SALEH project should be disseminated through a series of workshops at national level once the time is			X	Workshops are not the best way to disseminate the lessons learned from the project. Dissemination should be on-going and part of the proposed SALEH Project Communication Strategy.	SALEH & LTU to finalise Communication Strategy	Feb 07	SA

appropriate, possibly during the last six months of the present phase.						
Recommendation 20 The project should continue to support the dissemination of tested improved varieties of wheat and other cereals and farmer seed production through the FBOs in close collaboration with the FAO seed programme (GCP/AFG/018/EC - in its final phase and the new programme GCP/AFG/045/EC expected to start in October 2005). This is essential to ensure that existing FBOs continue to receive regular inputs of small quantities of the latest appropriate varieties for multiplication by key farmers, technically supervised jointly by the district departments of agriculture and the SALEH technical staff.	X			The Project continues to disseminate information from 018/EC	Ongoing	SA
Recommendation 21 The project must continue to pay close attention to introducing improvements in cultural practice, potato seed production and introduction of high yielding varieties, taking due account of local preference in potato types and market demand. Close collaboration should be maintained with the new FAO seed programme in Bamyan under GCP/AFG/045/EC expected to start in October 2006 for five years, which will have a potato component	X			The Project has established links with potato producers and traders	Ongoing	SA
Recommendation 22	X			The Project is piloting potato storage facilities of appropriate	Ongoing	SA

<p>In view of the significance of post harvest potato losses whilst in store, particular attention must be paid to the introduction of improved storage designs that are within the capacity of village communities to construct with their own labour. The project should establish demonstrations to illustrate the benefit of improved storage designs for further expansion with those FBOs who show an interest in this matter. A number of storage models already exist in the area, introduced by various organisations, for assessment and consideration.</p>				<p>design</p>			
<p>Recommendation 23 In view of the importance of potatoes as one of the very few cash crops produced in certain districts of Bamyan province, the project should pay particular attention to assisting FBOs establish or improve market linkages for this crop.</p>	<p>X</p>			<p>The Project has established links with potato producers and traders</p>	<p>Ongoing</p>		<p>SA</p>
<p>Recommendation 24 The project should address the need for forward planning and expansion of fruit tree nurseries to accommodate a three to four year cycle of production. The fruit tree nursery activity will require close technical supervision through all its stages of development up to the end of the project. In view of the altitude and the incidence of late frost in many locations, care needs to be taken in the selection of the varieties of fruit for budding. It is</p>	<p>X</p>			<p>The Project will consider the use of rootstock recommended and continue to focus on best practices to ensure expansion of fruit nurseries is accommodated within the life of the Project</p>	<p>Ongoing</p>		<p>SA</p>

<p>known that apples do well in most of the villages where the nurseries have been established, it is less certain how almonds and apricots will perform in some locations. With respect to the apples, it is recommended that the project should consider procuring appropriate semi-dwarfing rootstocks (such as MM106) for local vegetative (layering) propagation rather than relying on seedling rootstocks. Experience elsewhere in Afghanistan has shown that there is no need for such work to be confined to government managed nurseries. If properly trained the techniques required for propagating 'Malling' rootstocks are well within the technical capacity of private nurserymen such as those being trained within the SALEH project as part of the FBOs.</p>						
<p>Recommendation 25 To follow up on a good start, the project has to provide close technical supervision of the model orchards until the end of the project through the various stages of the orchards' maturity.</p>	X			The Project will continue close technical supervision of model orchards	Ongoing	SA
<p>Recommendation 26 To follow up on a good start and important interest already generated, the project has to provide close technical supervision of the poplar woodlots until the end of the present project.</p>	X			The Project will continue close technical supervision of poplar woodlots	Ongoing	SA
<p>Recommendation 27 The project should take care that</p>	X			The Project continues to link theoretical and practical applications in tandem	Ongoing	SA

technical training in agriculture should not be provided in a void but should be combined wherever possible with practical application in order to reinforce the messages provided.						
Recommendation 28 In such situations where household food security and nutrition is the priority, rather than commercial vegetable production, only seed of open pollinated varieties of vegetable must be introduced (rather than hybrid seed). Wherever possible, emphasis should be placed on farmer / household based seed production in the interests of sustainability.	X			The Project is using a variety of hybrid and open pollinated vegetable varieties	Ongoing	SA
Recommendation 29 Bee keeping appears to be a successful project based on precedents elsewhere in Afghanistan and certainly should be continued. Any technical assessment would require a specialist in this subject to review this activity.	X			The Project has contracted national specialists in apiculture to assist in aspects of honey production and market linkages	Ongoing	SA